



Comparison of the Primary School Turkish Program Implemented in Turkiye and the Primary School French Program Implemented in France

Gözde DEMİREL FAKİROĞLU* 



*(Dr.), Istanbul University, Faculty of Letters,
Department of Linguistics, Istanbul, Turkiye

ORCID: G.D.F. 0000-0003-4138-5528

Corresponding author:
Gözde DEMİREL FAKİROĞLU,
Istanbul University, Faculty of Letters,
Department of Linguistics, Istanbul, Turkiye
E-mail: demirelg@istanbul.edu.tr

Submitted: 30.06.2022

Accepted: 22.08.2022

Citation: Demirel Fakiroğlu, G (2022).
"Comparison of the primary school Turkish
program implemented in Turkiye and the
primary school French program implemented
in France". *Dilbilim Dergisi - Journal of Linguistics*,
38, 79-92.
<https://doi.org/10.26650/jol.2022.1137727>

ABSTRACT

Every country follows a different program for teaching the mother tongue. In some countries, states apply different programs for their students and in some the national education program is central and applied in the same way throughout the country. Turkiye and France apply the programs defined by their ministries of national education. In this study, the Turkish teaching program and French teaching program in primary schools have been analyzed and compared in terms of learning outcomes and program structure. The common points and differences between the programs have been identified. Students start systematic language learning in primary school. When students have proficiency in their mother language, they become successful learners in other fields of study. Thus, primary schools play a vital role in educating individuals by raising their awareness about the importance of using their mother language appropriately and effectively. In Turkiye, primary school is 4 years and it is not divided into parts. In France primary school is 5 years and it is divided into two parts in terms of students' skills development. Students' language development starts with the family and continues at school. The role of classroom teachers and mother language teachers cannot be overlooked.

Keywords: National Education Program, Mother Language, French Program, Turkish Program, Primary School

1. Introduction

Your native language can be defined as the language you first learned, the language of your family, the language of your identity, or the official language of your country of origin. The most common definition is the language learned in childhood, and it has important emotional, linguistic, cultural and social responsibilities. Your native language serves as the basis for building basic learning in life.

Mother language teaching is one of the most important roles of the family and school. Individuals discover the world around them with their mother language. They develop their language skills through their mother language and they gain perspective with their mother language. They understand and learn about other disciplines first with their mother language, if they are not bilingual. In addition, individuals develop their personal and cultural identity through their mother language. Inadequate mother language teaching leads to individuals who are unsuccessful both in daily life and in academic life.

According to Koç (2021), following similar educational programs makes international student evaluations more common and more objective, as similar programs target similar educational outcomes. With the applications of those programs, targeted skills and behaviors are evaluated according to international criteria and it is possible to deliver feedback about the educational progress of the countries comparatively (Koç, 2021).

The United Nations offers a language teaching model which is applicable for all languages taught. When defining language competence, it is necessary to have a common understanding of the functions of the language. According to the common language model, the key components are the evaluation of language competence, and construction and delivery of the content. When the United Nations language model was created, the nature of human communication and language users' role as individuals and social actors were taken into consideration. In this model, the learner is placed at the center and the action-oriented nature of human communication is emphasized. According to this model, the circles of language competence subcategories are as follows: the main sub-categories of language competence are pragmatic competence, linguistic competence, and sociocultural competence; the sub-categories of those competences are functional competence, grammatical competence, and cross-cultural competence (UN, 2018).

In teaching the native language of the country in a classroom, bilingual children with different linguistic backgrounds need to be considered. The home language and culture of students may vary. The schools and the teachers need to have awareness of multilingual and multicultural students while teaching the mainstream language of the society. Bilingual students may not be familiar with the mainstream language as much as their monolingual peers are. Helot and Young (2002) suggest the following regarding teaching the mother language in a multilingual class:

“Through language awareness activities, bilingual children can be given the opportunity to share with their peers and their teachers their personal experiences of speaking more than one

language and of belonging to more than one culture. Teachers can thus begin to understand not only what it means to hold more than one identity but to realise that we all have composite identities which reflect the multiplicity and diversity of our belongings” (p.110).

We frequently come across studies in the literature comparing the mother tongue teaching programs different of countries. As a result of these comparisons, which include Turkey, it has been revealed that the curricula of countries have common and different aspects in terms of approach and content. In their study, Erdoğan and Gök (2007) compared the mother tongue curricula in Turkey, Finland and Ireland, and found that all three countries adopted a constructivist approach as common points, and as for differences, they stated that the curricula of Ireland and Finland mostly address the emotional/affective domain and the curriculum of Turkey addresses the cognitive domain. (Erdoğan and Gök, 2011).

Teaching the mother tongue needs to be evaluated for bilingual children as well. For bilingual children, teaching the mother tongue is very important for teaching the mainstream language. Teaching Turkish to children living in France is important for their learning French and using it in academic contexts. The mainstream language and the children’s mother languages being different should not be recognized as a disadvantage but rather a richness for a child. For this reason, teaching Turkish first will help children learn French effectively. Turkish, which has a high vitality and is spoken by a large population in France, can be maintained through giving new generations a sound mother language education (Akıncı, 2017).

In this study, the Turkish teaching program applied in primary school in Turkey and the French teaching program implemented in primary school in France are compared by examining the reports and programs published by their ministries of national education.

Turkish and French Education Systems

Education trains individuals in different respects (academically, psychologically, and emotionally) by giving the knowledge in different disciplines of life. Since the foundation of the Turkish republic, not only social but also educational reforms have been introduced. Reforms in education can be done periodically to follow international developments in education. One of the most important reforms in national education in Turkey was the transition to 12 years of compulsory education (4 years of primary school, 4 years of middle school, and 4 years of high school) in 2012. Together with these modifications, the Turkish mother tongue teaching program, textbooks, and methods have also been revised. In 2005-2006 education year, the sentence-based teaching model was transformed into the phonetic-based teaching method, as sentence-based teaching was thought to be an obstacle to global and critical thinking. In the old method, students were more directed towards memorization. For mother tongue teaching, phonetic-based teaching, which is no longer practiced, was used in Europe as well. In Turkey, preschool education is not obligatory and the age of starting school is 6 (it was previously 7). As for the French education system, kindergartens are part of all primary schools and parents

are asked to actively participate in schooling. Kindergartens, which have existed since 1881 in France, have been compulsory since 2021 starting from the age of 3. In the French education system, preschool education is important for acquiring the basics of reading and writing. There is strong collaboration between kindergarten and first grade. However, in the Turkish system preschool education is not obligatory and children start learning the basics of reading and writing in the first grade of elementary school, which makes their skills acquisition one year behind in comparison to their French peers (Bozavlı, 2017).

Onan (2016) suggests effective methods which can be embedded in Turkish teaching programs. The suggested methods make the language learning process more meaningful and permanent. In Turkish programs, discussions, criticisms, using multiple sense-oriented activities, connecting the subjects to real life situations, pre-assumptions, verbal symbols, and associations can be utilized. Students have different learning styles and different language learning backgrounds. The communication skills of the teacher play an important role in the learning process. Communication is an important part of the learning and teaching process. In the learning process, the brain reaches meaning through examples. Exemplifying the content is highly important for comprehending the subject. Students should not be directed to memorization. For transferring information from short-term memory to long-term memory, predicting, reasoning, analysis, synthesis, criticizing, discussion, interpreting, and questioning methods should be used. Memory training in the early ages of children has a positive effect on their understanding, concentration, and short-long term memory capacity. To benefit from such an effective teaching model, the Turkish teaching programs should be revised from preschool education to train competent language users (Onan, 2016).

For mother tongue development, the first responsible stakeholder is the family. Children start using the language which is spoken around them. First teachers are the first caregivers in the family, who may be parents, grandparents, or babysitters. Systematic language learning starts in primary school and the teachers have the primary role in teaching the mother tongue systematically. In systematic language teaching, writing is taught together with verbal expression. Turkish education includes listening, verbal expression, reading, writing, and visual reading/perception. Turkish and French education differ in some respects in mother tongue education. In the French education system, preparation for learning the mother tongue (such as listening, reading, and writing) starts from preschool. Listening is the fundamental skill which is prioritized to be developed first. Teachers prepare classroom activities for developing listening skills and make seating arrangements accordingly. In addition, they teach how to open and hold books and pencils, regular linear writing, and other exercises to develop muscles. In this way, the children start school with basic skills for systematic language learning. In Turkey, as kindergarten is not so common, these authentic preparation activities are done in the first grade and teachers spend a lot of time on such activities. Another point is that classrooms are not homogenous in terms of students' background mother tongue development, as some of

them attend preschool education and some do not. Thus, it is inevitable that a primary school student in France has better language progress than their Turkish peers in terms of mother tongue development (Bozavlı, 2017).

Acquiring necessary competences in mother language ensures the acquisition of competences in other languages and other fields of study. Although there may be confusion about the effects of mother language, acquired proficiency in mother language contributes to learning the target languages (Giroux, 2016: 56).

The French primary school program consists of five years, which are named CP (Preparation class), CE1 (elementary class 1), CE2 (elementary class 2), CM1 (middle class 1), and CM2 (middle class 2). *College* continues with 6th, 5th, 4th, and 3rd classes/grades. In primary school the students have 10 hours of French lessons each week (Le Bulletin officiel de l'éducation nationale, 2018).

The Turkish school system consists of 3 cycles: the first cycle is primary school (4 years), the second cycle is secondary school (4 years), and the third cycle is high school (4 years). Obligatory education is 12 years in Turkey. In the first two years of primary school, Turkish lessons are 10 hours a week, and in the second two years of primary school Turkish lessons are 8 hours a week. As for secondary school, in the 5th and 6th grades Turkish lessons are 6 hours a week and in the 7th and 8th grades they are 5 hours a week (MEB, 2021).

Pattern of the Study

In this study, a descriptive model is used, as it aims to identify the differences and similarities between the Turkish teaching program and the French teaching program.

In this study, the mother tongue curricula of Turkey and France were examined using the document analysis method, one of the qualitative research methods. Document analysis is the examination of sources obtained on the researched subject in accordance with scientific principles (Kıral, 2020).

Turkish Teaching Program

The targeted skills defined in the Basic Law of National Education (No. 1739) for Turkish programs, which is prepared according to the aims and principles of Turkish National Education, are as follows (Milli Eğitim Temel Kanunu, 1973: 5101-5112):

“*Improving listening/monitoring, speaking, reading and writing.

*Using Turkish consciously, correctly, and carefully in line with the rules of Turkish writing and speaking.

*Helping students gain reading and writing habits.

*Improving the imaginary world, emotions and ideas, and vocabulary knowledge of students in relation with their reading and listening.

* Expressing ones' own opinion and feelings in a spoken or written discourse clearly.

*Improving research, discovery, and interpretation skills of students.

*Having access to different media (printed or virtual), arranging information, questioning, and using and producing information.

*By comprehending texts, having a questioning and criticizing perspective.

*Strengthening national feelings and ideas, placing importance on national, spiritual, ethical, historical, cultural, and social values.

*Realizing aesthetic and artistic values through Turkish and world culture and art works”.

Themes in the Turkish Program

In the Turkish program, the themes are recycled throughout the grades. They are “virtues, national culture awareness, national struggle and Atatürk, individuals and society, reading culture, communication, rights and freedoms, personal development, science and technology, health and sports, time and space, emotions, nature and universe, art, citizenship, and children’s imaginary world” (MEB, 2018).

8 themes are used at all grade levels and 4 texts are utilized for each theme. 3 of these texts are reading and 1 is a listening/watching text. Thus, a total of 32 reading and listening/watching texts are used throughout the books. Text types are grouped under 3 main forms: informative, narrative, and poetry.

The targeted gains for each skill area and for each grade are given in detail in the Turkish Teaching Program that was implemented in 2019. All schools apply this program and prepare teaching materials in line with the aims defined in the program (MEB, 2019). 1st grade, 2nd grade, 3rd grade, and 4th grade Turkish language teaching program target achievements (according to the “Primary Turkish language course teaching program” published by the Ministry of Education in 2019) are summarized as follows.

1st Grade Turkish Program

In grade 1, children learn to differentiate natural and non-natural sounds as they improve their listening skills. The students can differentiate the sounds which correspond to a letter. By looking at the visuals, the students can guess the meaning of the text that they are going to read or listen to. The students can determine the topic of the subjects that they are listening to and respond appropriately to questions. They can follow verbal instructions and listening strategies. They understand non-verbal messages. For speaking, they use words appropriately. They can produce spontaneous speech and can talk about subjects by applying speaking strategies when the context of the subject is given. The reading part is divided into two parts, which are preparation for reading and fluent reading. They can read syllables and words. They can read short and easy texts and pay attention to punctuation marks, stress, and intonation. They can read texts written in different handwriting. They can guess the opposite meaning of words, answer questions related to visuals, and guess the content of the text from visuals. They can

understand the texts and give appropriate responses to the comprehension questions related to the texts. They can find an appropriate title for the text and understand the meaning of shapes and symbols. As for writing, they can do painting and drawing and write letters appropriately. They can write syllables, words and numbers appropriately. They can write related words for given visuals. They can leave appropriate gaps between words and sentences. They can use capital letters and punctuation marks appropriately in their writing. They can support their writing with visuals and revise/correct what they have written (MEB, 2019).

2nd Grade Turkish Program

In grade 2, students can guess the subject of a text from visuals and they can also guess the development and conclusion of an event from visuals. Students in this grade can retell a text they have heard, determine the subjects of texts they have heard, respond to questions about texts they have heard, suggest different titles for texts they have heard, follow oral instructions, and understand non-verbal messages. As for speaking, they can use vocabulary appropriately, speak spontaneously, talk about a subject in a given framework, and apply speaking strategies. For reading, the targeted skills are fluent reading, vocabulary acquisition, and comprehension. They can understand the basic parts in reading materials, and read by paying attention to punctuation marks, stress, and intonation. They can read poems. They can read texts written in different writing styles and handwriting. They can guess the meaning of unknown words from visuals. They can guess the opposite meaning and synonyms of words. They can understand the general sense of a text. They can answer questions on the texts they have read. They can find an appropriate title for a text. They can recognize different text types. They can define the elements of a story; they can understand written instructions. They can also understand the meaning of symbols, shapes, and signs. As for writing, they can write meaningful and correct sentences. They can write poems and short texts. They can support their writing with visuals. They can find an appropriate title for their writing. They can use capital letters and punctuation in the correct places. They can correct their own writing mistakes. They can use question marks appropriately. They can apply writing strategies (MEB, 2019).

3rd Grade Turkish Program

In grade 3, students can guess the subject of a text that they are going to listen to. They can guess what will happen in a story. They can define the theme of a story that they listen to. They can give appropriate answers to questions related to a text that they listen to. They can state their own opinion in relation to what they listen to. They can explain what they listen to. They can ask questions related to the events, characters, and setting (who, where, what, how). They can follow the courtesy/politeness rules of listening and responding. As for speaking, in addition to the skills acquired in the previous grades, they can join discussions in the classroom. They can address others and respond appropriately, they know the rules of not interrupting others,

they can wait for others to finish speaking, and they know when to take turns. For reading, they can understand the proverbs in a text and they can make up a word list from the texts with their meanings. In addition to previously acquired skills, they can understand e-mail and social media contents (invitations, thank you messages, etc.). They can distinguish between real and imaginary elements in a text. They can make inferences about what they read. They can find different solutions for different problems given in a text. They can associate the content of a text read with the visuals. The relationship between image and subject is emphasized. They can understand the meanings of shapes, symbols, signs, figures, and written instructions. They can utilize materials such as maps, advertisements, posters, product labels, and user manuals. They can answer questions about the information in tables and graphics. They can write letters and short memories. They can write events in order and express their feelings and ideas. They can fill in forms in accordance with instructions. They can use capital letters and punctuation where appropriate. Students are encouraged to read what they have written in class and display it on the school or classroom board. They can write letters in accordance with their structural features. It is ensured that the students can write letters paying attention to the main and additional elements in their writings. It is ensured that students write carefully, legibly, and neatly by leaving appropriate spaces between words (MEB, 2019).

4th Grade Turkish Program

In the fourth grade, improving the higher order thinking skills of students is targeted and a variety of additional skills are added, such as following and evaluating media content and using digital content. For the targeted skills in grade 4, the skills targeted in grade 1, 2, and 3 are repeated and new skills are added. Media texts (advertising, public service announcements, etc.) are played/watched so that students can make inferences about their target audience and purpose. It is ensured that students question the content of what they listen to/watch in terms of consistency between different texts. Students can implement listening strategies. They can make inferences about what they read. They can identify problems and develop solutions for those problems. They can determine the authors' point of view in a text. They can make comparisons between texts and underline keywords. They can understand the content of digital texts. They can construct electronic mails and social media content such as advertisements, announcements, different types of messages, travel blogs, etc. They can evaluate written sources in different genres like brochures, journals, and newspapers. They can edit a text and pay attention to punctuation, write conjunctions (de, ki) appropriately, and pay attention to grammatical correctness. They can fill in forms in accordance with given guidelines. They can write abbreviations and know the meaning of them. They can write numbers correctly. They can use words with real, metaphorical, and terminological meanings in their writing. Students are encouraged to create their own writing styles and implement writing strategies (MEB, 2019).

French Teaching Program

Since 2014, the French school program has been divided into four cycles. The first cycle is the “*maternelle*” section, which includes “*petite, moyenne, and grande*” sections. The second and third cycles are elementary school. The second cycle is divided into three parts: CP, CE1, and CE2. The third cycle is divided into three parts: *CM1, CM2, and 6th* grades. Cycle four is college, which consists of 5th, 4th, and 3rd grades (Bulletin officiel n° 30 du 26-7-2018).

The targeted values in the French teaching program are, “respecting, diversity, equity, commitment to achieving excellence, collaboration, truth and integrity. Core skills and competencies are critical thinking and problem solving, creativity and innovation, communication and collaboration, cultural identity and global citizenship, personal development and leadership and digital literacy” (Gil, 2020).

In preschool education, the students develop oral and listening skills. They understand the function of writing. At this level, vocabulary acquisition and phonological awareness are emphasized. Students discover alphabetic principles and the regularities of language. Children learn the basis of their mother language, French, and the benchmarks for learning French are given in preschool. Teaching French aims to give children communication skills, helping them living in society and making the entry into other fields easier. The basics of all fields can be achieved through the mother tongue. In CE2, basic skills in reading and writing are integrated for all students, and during this cycle, explicit learning of French is programmed at certain hours each day.

It can be noted that early studies in the didactics of writing production were naturally interested in the characteristics of texts produced by students in order to explain the discrepancy between the performance achieved or achievable, and the explicit or implicit expectations of the school writing exercises (Plane, 2008).

Cycle 1. First Learning Cycle (*Petite, Moyenne, and Grande* sections of *maternelle*)

In the French program, preschool education is the period in which children learn the basics of the language and develop their language skills. In preschool education, speaking is emphasized. The mastery of alphabetical code and identification and memorization of words are frequent activities. For successful integration into other disciplines, learning French is the foundation. Written and oral expression are important in improving the ability to express oneself. The strategies for understanding are that texts are taught explicitly. In teaching students, the flow of a conversation, taking turns, debating, etc. are also emphasized (Bulletin officiel n° 30 du 26-7-2018).

Cycle 2. Cycle of Fundamental Learning (CP, CE1, and CE2)

Targeted skills in CP, CE1, and CE2 are as follows. The skills have been evaluated under three categories, which have their own subcategories. Firstly, oral language skill focuses on

listening and understanding the spoken communication, expressing oneself easily, and taking a part in discussions by paying attention to distance. Reading comprehension focuses on recognizing and identifying words, understanding a text, reading texts from different genres, and reading aloud. Writing skill focuses on copying a written or spoken text, writing texts, and correcting ones' own writing after re-reading it. Students pay attention to and learn the specific characteristics of grammar, spelling, and lexical aspects of the language (Eurydice, 2022).

In this cycle, understanding and expressing oneself are emphasized. The students can listen to and respond to texts read by adults. They can take part in different communicative contexts. They can identify words easily. They can understand a text and give appropriate answers. They can revise and correct their own writing. They can understand how language works and learn about spelling (Bulletin officiel n° 30 du 26-7-2018).

Reading and writing develop in connection with each other. Reading and writing are systematic part of language learning, and they develop along with other learning at school. In CP, children recognize the letters and sounds, and they achieve deciphering and automatic identification of words. Over the three years, autonomy in reading a variety of texts is acquired. They can understand a variety of texts, including informative texts, throughout the three years. Reading and practicing different texts improve students' general knowledge, vocabulary, and perspectives. Reading practice contributes to writing. In CP, students practice first writing activities, which are matching the letters with sounds and phonemes. At the end of CP, letter code automation should be completed.

Texts are taken from heritage literature, ranging from albums, novels, tales, fables, and poems to theatre. Texts are adapted to the children's age and language levels. Reading for different motivations, like for pleasure or for obtaining information, is encouraged. With copying, students improve the spelling of the words and they avoid making orthographic mistakes. They learn to produce the standardized layout of the letters. They learn to write using handwriting or digitally. They learn to copy and transcribe from different media, such as books, tables, posters, etc. To start writing, it is not necessary to be a fluent reader (Bulletin officiel n° 30 du 26-7-2018).

Cycle 3. Consolidation Cycle (CM1, CM2, and 6th grade)

In oral language skills, listening to understand and comprehend, speaking while taking the audience into account, taking part in a variety of spoken discourse, and taking on a role and an attitude in an interaction are emphasized. For reading and written communication, having the ability to read fluently by understanding the text, understanding texts from different disciplines including literary texts, interpreting the images and symbols, perceiving one's comprehension, and reading without needing any guidance are emphasized. Skills focused on at this level are paying attention to grammar, speaking, and lexicon; understanding the differentiation between oral and written language; identifying the parts of a sentence; acquiring lexical spelling; and comprehending the constituents of a complex sentence (Eurydice, 2022).

In this cycle, similar to the previous level, understanding and expressing oneself and listening to understand a message are targeted. The students can prepare a speech that takes the audience into account. They can read fluently and they can adopt a critical attitude towards what they read and what they listen to. They can write by hand efficiently and fluently. They can understand and interpret documents and images. They can write on a keyboard. They can become autonomous readers. They can understand the elements of language and how language works. After listening to a story, they can give related responses without depending on the text. They can master the relationship between listening and speaking. They can participate in interactions actively. They can give presentations, say a text from memory, and make short presentations with a slideshow or based on their notes. They can understand historical and artistic works by describing and interpreting them. They can have cultural exchanges and have awareness about cultural richness. In music education, developing listening skills is targeted by introducing songs from different foreign or regional languages, and in math, science, and technology lessons, teaching scientific language is targeted. Students also are trained in expressing themselves in different contexts like theatrical practice, and communicating their feelings through different gestures and bodily codes through gymnastic and acrobatic performances (Le Bulletin officiel de l'éducation nationale, 2018).

In cycle 3, students acquire literary understanding and interpretation of texts by connecting the content with their own personal experience. Students are encouraged to read complex and long texts. Students are also encouraged to read such texts from other disciplines. Readings are discussed in classes and different perspectives are voiced. In this cycle, students are first introduced to literary and artistic culture. In CM1 and CM2, the teaching of French is the responsibility of classroom teachers, and four basic language skills (speaking, reading, listening, and writing) are integrated into all lessons. In 6th grade, this teaching is provided by the French teacher, a specialist in literature and the French language. All the other courses contribute to the mastery of the language. Grammar teaching starts with spelling and it continues at all levels. In grammar teaching, the aim is to train the students to think about the language. It is not the memorization of grammatical rules, but about the functions of grammar which help in understanding a sentence. The aim here is to help the students to understand the language as an organized system regulated by rules which evolved historically (Bulletin officiel n° 30 du 26-7-2018).

2. Discussion and Conclusion

Mother language education is vital for students' further academic and personal success. If students learn their home language in an efficient way, it enables them to learn other languages effectively, in addition to ensuring academic achievement (Cummins, 1979).

Prioritizing the children's first language before the age of six is crucial for children's further academic achievement. In societies where there is more than one official language, it

is observed that the mother tongue has primary importance. When teaching a foreign language, the concepts should be taught by basing them on the mother language. In other words, in order to teach a foreign language successfully the mother tongue needs have a sound foundation (Rogers, 2014).

In both the Turkish and French programs, targeted skills are recycled, which means repeating similar skills by adding new skills to higher levels. The French program includes teaching grammar, and the rules are taught from the beginning. Explicit grammar teaching is not suggested for young learners even if it is their native language. For reading, Akyol (2015) states that the most important skill that a person gains is literacy and it is not only a technical skill but also related to senses, feelings, and perceptions. Every individual may not gain this skill at the expected time and in the expected way. In classrooms, every student may show different levels of progress in terms of their language development. When the program for targeted skills is implemented efficiently, it is sure to obtain successful outcomes.

When both the Turkish and French programs are been analyzed, different and common points are identified in both of the programs. Both are operated by the Ministry of National Education. They share the point that the national education is central. The program may look very idealized. In practice, all the targeted skills may not be realized fully. The materials for these programs need to be evaluated for further studies. The materials need to be prepared in line with those targeted aims. Teacher training is another important point for the success of the mother language teaching programs. The teacher training programs should be revised to train more qualified teachers. Mother language teaching is not only the responsibility of the Turkish or French language teachers. It is the responsibility of other fields teachers, like math, science, and arts teachers, to include training regular classroom teachers. Another stakeholder for the students' mother language development is the family. They need to be conscious about their children's language development.

Mother tongue learning can be improved through providing mother language materials, by beginning literacy through mother tongue, and by training teachers about language learning and supporting them with effective teaching methods (Nishanthi, 2020).

The programs evaluated in this study are idealized school programs. Those targeted skills may not be achieved a hundred percent. When the programs of the two countries are compared, in terms of skills improvement there is not much difference. In both of the programs, four skills are emphasized, with different strategies. There are systematic differences between Turkish and French programs in that the French program starts at an earlier stage than the Turkish program and French children acquire the basics of their language at an earlier age.

Further studies could focus on teaching Turkish as a foreign language in France and teaching French in Turkey. Nurlu (2013) mentions that Turkish is taught as a mother tongue and culture, and also taught in an "alive languages" framework. In Turkey, teaching French as a foreign language has a long history due to bilateral relations between the two countries.

Historically, how those languages are taught, how they have improved, and how they have gained commonality can be analyzed in comparative studies.

Note: The Issue Editor was not involved in the evaluation, peer review, or decision processes of the article. The related processes are conducted by the Editor-in-Chief and by the editors who are members of the board.

Peer-review: Externally peer-reviewed.

Conflict of Interest: The author has no conflict of interest to declare.

Grant Support: The author declared that this study has received no financial support.

References

- Akıncı, M. A. (2017). Emergent bilingualism of Turkish-French bilingual children in France, C.Yıldız, N. Topaj, R. Thomas & I. Güllow (eds.), *The Future of Multilingualism in the German Education System: Russian and Turkish in Focus*.
- Akyol, H. (2005). *Türkçe İlk Okuma Yazma Öğretimi*. Ankara: Pegem Yayıncılık.
- Bozavlı, E. (2017). Mother Tongue Teaching at School Comparison of Turkish and French Models, *Journal of Education and Training Studies*, 5 (4), 146-153.
- Cummins, J. (1979). Linguistic Interdependence and the Educational Development of Bilingual Children, *Review of Educational Research*, 49 (2), 222-251.
- Erdoğan, T., & Gök, B. (2011). Türkiye, Finlandiya Ve İrlanda Ana Dili Öğretim Programlarının Karşılaştırılması, *Buca Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 29, 1-19.
- Eurydice (2022). National Education Systems-France. (Retrieved May 15, 2022 <https://eacea.ec.europa.eu/national-policies/eurydice/content/primary-education>)
- Gil, S. (2020). *Essential French Primary 4 Teacher's Guide*. Cambridge University Press.
- Giroux, L. (2016). La place et de le(s) role(s) de la langue maternelle des apprenants en cours de langue étrangère, *Synergies France*, 10, 55-68.
- Helot, C. & Young, A. (2002). Bilingualism and Language Education in French Primary Schools: Why and How Should Migrant Languages be Valued? *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 5(2), 96-112.
- Kıral, B. (2020). Nitel bir Veri Analizi Yöntemi Olarak Döküman Analizi, *Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi*, 15, 170-189.
- Koç, E. S. (2021). Türkçe Dersi Öğretim Programları İle Okuma Becerileri Öğretim Programının Uluslararası Okuma Yeterlikleri Bağlamında İncelenmesi. *Milli Eğitim*, 50 (230), 169-193.
- MEB (2018). Türkçe Dersi Öğretim Programı, Ankara.
- Millî Eğitim Bakanlığı (2021). Talim ve Terbiye Kurulu Başkanlığı, İlköğretim Kurumları (İlkokul ve Ortaokul) Haftalık Ders Çizelgesi'nde Değişiklik Yapılması, 22/11/2021
- Millî Eğitim Bakanlığı. (2019). İlköğretim Türkçe dersi öğretim programı (İlkokul ve ortaokul 1-8. sınıflar) Ankara.
- Millî Eğitim Temel Kanunu (1973). Millî Eğitim Temel Kanunu-1739. pp.5101-5113
- Ministre de l'éducation nationale (2020). De la jeunesse et des sports- programme du cycle 2
- Ministre de l'éducation nationale (2020). De la jeunesse et des sports- programme du cycle 4

- Nishanthi, R. (2020). Understanding of the Importance of Mother Tongue Learning, *International Journal of Trend in Scientific Research and Development (IJTSRD)*, 5 (1), 77-80.
- Nurlu, M. (2013). Fransa'da Türkçe, Türkiye'de Fransızca Öğretimi, *Turkish Studies- International Periodical for the Languages, Literature and History of Turkish or Turkic*, 8 (10), 477-498.
- Onan, B. (2016). Türkçenin Ana Dili Olarak Öğretimine Beyin Temelli Yaklaşım ZfWT, 8 (1), 109-133
- Plane, S. (2008). La didactique du français langue maternelle à la croisée de tensions internes et externes. Durand J. Habert B., Laks B. (éds.) *Congrès Mondial de Linguistique Française - CMLF'08*, 615-619
- Rogers, A. (2014). Multilingualism in Education: The Role of First Language, *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 4 (1), 1-9.
- United Nations Language Framework (2018). French Language Curriculum, Language and Communication Programme at UN Headquarters New York, Language Training Program at UN Office in Geneva, United Nations p. 2-31.
- Le Bulletin officiel de l'éducation nationale/ Ministre de l'éducation nationale/ Programme d'enseignement du cycle de consolidation (cycle 3)