

Music as an inclusion tool: can primary school teachers use it effectively?

Ardita Devolli *

Shqipe Avdiu-Kryeziu **

* Assist.Prof.Dr., Public University of Prishtina “Hasan Prishtina“, Prishtina, Republic of Kosovo.

Email: arditadevolli@uni-pr.edu ORCID: 0000-0001-9237-7187

** Corresponding Author, Assist.Prof.Dr., Public University “Kadri Zeka”, Faculty of Education, Gjilan, Kosovo. E-mail: shqipea.k@hotmail.com ORCID: 0000-0001-9237-7187

DOI 10.12975/rastmd.20221032 Submitted June 1, 2022 Accepted September 17, 2022

Abstract

The music education subject, which is part of the curriculum area of arts, and music as a whole, as an educational activity by the teacher, is necessary to be used in activities with students for effective teaching in primary schools. It is very important that the teacher, during educational activities, includes, in every subject, music as a teaching tool with the aim of inclusiveness for all students in the classroom. The purpose of this research is to get teachers' opinions on whether they can use music as a tool for inclusiveness for effective teaching in primary schools. This research was carried out with primary school teachers, grades 1-5, with the aim of incorporating music in all subjects as a tool for inclusiveness. The research methodology is oriented to the review of the literature that deals with this topic, and the semi-structured interview with primary school teachers in Kosovo. From this research, we have obtained satisfactory results, which argue our topic that music is an effective tool in inclusiveness on primary school education.

Keywords

inclusive education, music, music education, primary school teacher

Introduction

Music as a means of inclusiveness, as an emotional, creative, aesthetic, moral factor, etc. is necessary in educational activities. Primary school teachers can use music effectively in the inclusion of special needs children in primary school. (Manning, 2016) Seeing the need and trends of inclusiveness, music as a tool facilitates the work of teachers in the inclusion of all children in the learning process (Eren, 2015).

This theoretical-practical study aims to shift attention beyond a traditional education, orienting the general public towards an inclusiveness and use of music as an inclusive teaching tool, offering concepts that may prove useful in educational policies in the use of music as a reasonable inclusive tool in primary education (Kivijärvi & Rautiainen, 2021).

The inclusive classroom enables all children to be welcomed, educated regardless of their gender, their intellectual, physical, emotional, social characteristics, in short, the inclusive classroom provides equal opportunities without distinctions, understanding the value of being different (Save the Children, 2007).

The use of music in the education of children can lead to the improvement of their career in the future, always combining it with pedagogical advice, many young people find their way to advance, socialize, relieve feelings, disorders from the autism spectrum, behavioral disorders, hyperactivity, attention deficit, etc. This shows that engaging students through music can increase feelings of inclusion and increase overall school performance (Tetty, 2019).

Curricular integration helps teachers

overcome some of the concerns such as: multiple intelligences, diversity, inclusion of students with special needs, etc. Curriculum integration can be implemented more supportively among subjects: social, emotional, cognitive, physical development (Wall & Leckie, 2017).

Literature Review

Music and Inclusive Education

The use of music as an inclusive tool is a model of good music-pedagogical practice since music is one of the oldest arts of society; (Dhomi, 2010) different researchers have argued in different ways about music in relation to inclusive education, challenging the opposite opinions to this, the use of music as an inclusive tool is a challenge of our modern times as there are teachers who hardly accept this and practice it in the learning process. It is worth saying, as the authors Les & Westerlund have concluded, that the turning point has already happened, the education of teachers putting in their first plans the use of music as an inclusive tool and interactions between subjects, has brought innovation (Laes & Westerlund, 2018). Older teachers feel less prepared for the inclusion of special needs children in primary schools, compared to their younger colleagues who feel they can use different tools to achieve successful inclusion (Barnová, Kožuchová, Krásna, & Osad'an, 2022).

Various teachers have used music to change the emotional mood of students, the integration of music education is seen as an integral part of communication with children, children like to listen to music, sing, perform. It is suggested that music should be part of school classrooms as it encourages children to participate in classroom activities that help inclusion (Sze & Yu, 2004).

For the realization of inclusive education, qualified, trained teachers are required, who include: teaching contents, methods, teaching tools, new technologies to work with special needs students (Fole, 2017). In

this context, the use of music as an inclusive tool for effective teaching is of special importance, which offers equal opportunities, quality services and innovations during the learning process (Ovcharenko, Sysoieva, Samoilenko, Chebotarenko, & Bohianu, 2021).

Very little attention has been paid to inclusive education through music, focusing mainly on music as an inclusive tool more on the curricular level of educational policies, based on a school curriculum for the education of children with special needs rather than on music as an inclusive tool that has a significant impact on effective teaching, this has recently changed and music is now given a different approach than in the past (Kivijärvi & Rautiainen, 2021).

Inclusive education and music have different effects on many types of impairments in students with special needs, e.g. in cases where students are visually impaired, the teacher must adapt to the student's abilities, giving general instructions that can benefit all students in the class (Pino & Viladot, 2019). Results from various researches showed that even children with autism (ASD) show their innate abilities through music, which helps to increase the social skills of these children (Bharathi, Venugopal, & Vellingiri, 2019). Teachers working in inclusive classrooms with students with special needs noticed that students with special needs were more involved when music had been integrated into other subjects, but despite the good inclusive intentions many teachers still feel unprepared to teach students with special needs, as they are concerned about the quality of education that students with special needs receive in these classes. Many of these concerns are attributed to the lack of training and qualifications they receive for special needs children (Manning, 2016).

Evidence gathered from many studies shows that the integrated curriculum is very effective for teaching and learning. Students who learn with an integrated teaching have higher academic achievements because the

integrated curriculum helps in getting deeper results during the learning process; these approaches lead to the increased engagement and motivation, less absenteeism in school, better attitudes towards school and society, etc. the benefits of area integration can also be seen internationally in the PISA tests where they have all the provisions of curricular integration (Drake & Reid, 2018).

The new challenges presented in today's society require constant professionalism in the learning process, which is a challenge in the interactions created at school (Freitas Martins, Joly, & Junior, 2020). A very powerful reason is to understand what role the use of music as an inclusive learning tool plays in overcoming these challenges of the time; in recent years the use of music has gained special importance as part of the educational curriculum to promote other cross-curricular disciplines (Blasco-Magraner, Bernabe-Valero, Marín-Liébana, & Moret-Tatay, 2021). Music has an extraordinary ability to express, transmit, evoke emotions, it has an impact on the intellectual, social, personal development, psychological well-being of all children without distinction even those with special needs, (Blasco-Magraner, Bernabe-Valero, Marín-Liébana, & Moret-Tatay, 2021) children with autism, down syndrome, behavioral disorders, visual impairments, physical and intellectual impairments, etc. (Meyer, 2017).

The Inclusion for Children with Special Needs and Music

The progress achieved in the digitization of society, communication technology, various applications, music have become necessary in daily use as well as in the learning process. (Lee & Chang, 2021) With the use of various digital applications, children can learn effectively in: mathematics, singing, drama, various games, music, helping children with special needs in inclusiveness and to achieve positive results (Lee & Chang, 2021).

New digital technologies and resources in music education are based on their

connections to the Internet and technological devices that help us access various online and offline applications, classifying them by: access (online and offline), distribution (paid and free), (Riley, 2016) the educational process should focus on open source and cheaper software that can be accessed by all even those who cannot afford to pay, this helps to use music as a tool for inclusiveness in effective teaching (Ruiz & Bosco, 2020). Teachers are witnessing an increasing use of software applications with which they can: record voice, listen to music, use social media, share it, etc. this creates a sustainable form of inclusion within schools where students can make a meaningful connection through music (Clauhs, Franco, & Cremata, 2019).

In recent times, teachers are increasingly using technological tools - various applications in the learning process, and it may be very normal for future teachers to use these applications in their daily teaching including: games, stories, technological simulations, get answers online, etc. in appropriate inclusive environments for an effective teaching (Camilleri & Camilleri, 2019).

Curricular integration provides teachers and students with easier ways to integrate, ask questions and research on issues involved in different areas and subjects. However, continuous research is needed in this regard to explore the positive and negative aspects of student learning during curricular integration and the role it has in the inclusion of students, especially the subject of Music Education (Wall & Leckie, 2017).

By analysing various studies, technological applications can be used in music education and inclusiveness, using the knowledge that teachers have about technology, using it for the development of students, giving importance to music in the curricular aspect, the need, importance, design, student participation, etc. all these applications (YouTube Music, Yokee, Piano Academy, Gitar

free, Karaoke-sing, Voice, Radio, Listening) provide an inclusiveness of students in primary school classrooms (Moreno, Moreira, Tymoshchuk, & Marques, 2021).

Primary School Teachers and Their Musical Competence

Given the fact that teacher competencies have a very important effect on learning outcomes, competent teachers are able to create effective, fun, stimulating learning environments, are better managers, create through music inclusive environments in their lessons, they play a very important role in conveying competences to their students (Moneva & Bacante, 2020).

Competence-based education in the Republic of Kosovo began after 2000, although in the USA it had started since the 70s, the countries of the region took Kosovo as an example. Teachers began to put teaching competencies in their diaries during the drafting of lesson plans, which gave them space to include music in the plan for the development of educational activities in all subjects (Musai, 2020).

The need for support and competence on the part of teachers for the use of inclusive practices and tools requires changes in culture, behavior, educational policies, ongoing practice of schools to provide inclusive education. Various studies suggest increasing the competencies of teachers to implement inclusive practices (Steele, McFerran, & Crooke, 2022).

According to the study conducted by the authors Çeliktaş, Enfur & Ozeke on the musical competencies of primary school teachers, it can be seen that teachers feel insecure about using music as an inclusive tool, in this study it is said that the acquisition of competencies is harder than you think (Çeliktaş, Engür, & Özeke, 2022).

Various research in education can tell us about the use of music as an inclusive tool for effective teaching, teachers have competencies and skills to function within

the situations created to achieve the desired successes, in this study we suggest that the concept of using teachers' competencies is more reasonable in terms of their teaching skills (Kivijärvi & Rautiainen, 2021).

Teachers in Kosovo are competent and qualified for the subject of music in primary school, since all public universities - Faculties of Education, which prepare future teachers in the primary program, include within their curriculum the courses music and teaching methodologies in music which prepare these teachers for a fair and inclusive use of music for effective teaching in the schools where they are employed (University of Prishtina "Hasan Prishtina", 2019).

To make teaching as inclusive as possible for all students by overcoming the challenges together, pedagogical competence needs to be used to understand the needs of each student, to adapt and create comprehensive learning strategies, by attending various trainings related to new teaching methodologies in the interconnection of subjects and their integration in different curricular areas (Santos, Carvalho, & Lobato, 2020).

The musical competences of teachers who work in primary education should be determined depending on the grade in which they work or the curricula of the musical subjects that they develop in the learning process (Begić, Begic, & Škojo, 2017). According to the primary school program, the music subject is developed by the class teacher who is a professional for this subject in primary education. (Ministry of Education, Science and Technology, 2016) During the development of the learning process in the subject of music, teachers should also use accompanying instruments such as: piano, guitar, accordion, synth, etc. while singing songs for an inclusiveness of students (Begić, Begic, & Škojo, 2017).

Research Problem

Our research is focused on highlighting the role of using music as an inclusive tool

in primary school for effective teaching. Almost all the teachers surveyed in Manning’s research study say that music is very important to be used as an inclusive tool (Manning, 2016).

The main research problem:

- What are primary school teachers’ views on the effective use of music in inclusive education for students with special educational needs?

The sub-problems are:

- What are the opinions of primary school teachers about the compatibility of the primary school curriculum with the use of music in the inclusion of students with special educational needs?
- What are the opinions of primary school teachers about the difficulties in the use of music in the primary school curriculum to integrate students with special educational needs?

Methods

Research Model

Our study is a qualitative and exploratory study of various literature related to the

role of the subject Music Education in the inclusion of students with special needs in primary schools. The qualitative method tries to help us understand the social world in which we live and why things are as they are (Mohajan, 2018).

Participants

Participants in this study are primary school teachers who teach in different municipalities in Kosovo and who have children with special educational needs in their classrooms. A semi-structured interview was used to collect data, selecting a deliberate focus group for research. To address this topic, we collected research data through a semi-structured interview with primary school teachers in Kosovo, a total of 10 teachers and 2 curriculum experts from the Ministry of Education, Science, Technology and Innovation.

The interview was confidential and the interviewed teachers were named as primary school teachers.

Table 1 shows the codes used for each participant; for example, T1-F-50 refers to T- for teachers; 1 - for the enumeration of participant; F/M - gender and 50 - age.

Table 1. Structures of Participants

Participant No	Gender	Age	Work Experience	Code
P1	Female	50 years	20 years	T1-F-50
P2	Female	47 years	10 years	T2-F-47
P3	Female	43 years	6 years	T3-F-43
P4	Female	39 years	5 years	T4-F-39
P5	Female	35 years	5 years	T5-F-35
P6	Male	32 years	8 years	T6-M-32
P7	Male	30 years	7 years	T7-M-30
P8	Female	27 years	4 years	T8-F-27
P9	Female	27 years	3 years	T9-F-27
P10	Female	25 years	2 years	T10-F-25
P11	Female	48 years	25 years	E1-F-48
P12	Female	35 years	16 years	E2-F-35

T: Primary school teacher E: Curriculum development expert

Data Collection Tools

This study aims to understand the role of music as an effective comprehensive tool in the inclusion of students with special needs in primary schools. To address this topic, we collected research data through a semi-structured interview with primary school teachers in Kosovo and curriculum experts from the Ministry of Education, Science, Technology and Innovation in Kosovo. To get the opinions of teachers, 5 open-ended questions were included in the semi-structured interview (Manning, 2016).

Semi-structured Interview Form

Semi-structured interviews are extremely suitable for a variety of valuable tasks, especially when we use multiple open-ended questions which we use to get independent opinions from each individual, important opinions on unknown issues, etc. (Newcomer, Hatry, & Wholey, 2010).

The semi-structured interview consists of a total of 5 questions, it was conducted with 10 primary school teachers (grades 1-5), whose classes have children with special educational needs, as well as 2 curriculum experts from the Ministry of Education Science Technology and Innovation.

The data obtained from the semi-structured interview are presented anonymously in written form.

Data Analysis

The data analysis was carried out through the qualitative method, which deals with social scientific research through which we collect and process non-numerical data and which seeks to interpret the meaning of these data, which help us understand social life. (Matthews & Ross, 2010) After collecting the data from the research through the qualitative method, we coded them according to the purposeful variables of the research, for our research we took as an example the book of Kumar (2017); regarding the coding presented in the research for qualitative data, we generated

them through special qualitative categories, age, gender, work experience, which we coded with separate numbers (Kumar, 2017).

Ethics

The approval for the research carried out in primary schools of the Municipality of Gjilan was given by the Municipal Directorate of Education in Gjilan. All interview participants were formally invited and willingly participated in this research. They were informed about the topic and the importance of this research, as well as that it is not obligatory to participate in the research, but they participated on their own will. All 12 participants agreed to participate in the research voluntarily without compensation. Confidentiality was guaranteed to the participants, at the same time they were informed that in our research they would be presented with codes as in Table 1.

Procedure

The research was carried out through semi-structured interviews with 10 primary school teachers in the Municipality of Gjilan (primary schools: "Abaz Ajeti", "Thimi Mitko", "Musa Zajmi", "Nazim Hikmet", and 2 Curriculum Experts from the Ministry of Education, Science, Technology and Innovation - MESTI). The interview allowed the participants to express themselves freely regarding the aforementioned topic, since teachers and curriculum experts were interviewed separately. The interview took place in the period May-June 2022 in the schools where the interviewed teachers are employed. The interviews were conducted before classtime, so that the teachers are not hindered in their work. The interview with the Curriculum Experts took place after-hours. Obtaining permission from the Directorate of Education in Gjilan was done after our request for research, they gave the permission on April 19, 2022.



Figure 1. Image from the inclusive activity through music in the subject of mathematics, (Primary School “Abaz Ajeti”, Gjilan, Grade 3-4)

Results

Our study aimed to obtain teachers’ opinions regarding the use of music as an inclusive tool for effective teaching in primary schools. From the semi-structured interview, three (3) main themes were drawn from this research:

- The importance of effective use of music in inclusive education for students with special educational needs

- Primary school teachers’ views on the compatibility of the curriculum in the use of music as an inclusive tool for students with special educational needs
- Teachers’ views regarding the difficulties in using music in the primary school curriculum for the integration of students with special educational needs

Kosovo Curriculum Framework, respectively Kosovo Core Curriculum, promotes and allows integrated teaching and learning, which enable the interconnection of curricular areas, subjects, topics and life practices, etc. Integrated teaching and learning aim to develop the main competencies foreseen for the curricular level (Ministry of Education, Science and Technology, 2016).

Theme 1. The use of music as a tool for inclusive education

Table 2. Content analysis of participants’ view about the use of music as a tool for inclusive education

Sub-theme 1: The support of the primary school curriculum for the use of music in the inclusion of children with special educational needs	f
The curriculum supports the use of music as an inclusive tool	12
Songs that can be combined with other subjects	1
The music attracts the attention of the pupils	2
It depends on the teaching unit	3
A stronger inclusion	
Children with autism	2
In mathematics	3
Language and communication	4
Drawing	2
Physical education	2
Body part	2

Quotations on the views of teachers regarding the use of music as an effective inclusive tool in primary school are divided into 3 dimensions:

Dimension 1: Curriculum requirements for using of music as an inclusive education tool

Quotations on teachers and curriculum

experts’ views regarding the support of the primary school curriculum for the use of music in the inclusion of students with special educational needs are as follows:

All participants (T1-T10, E1, E2) agreed that the curriculum supports the use of music in the inclusion of students with special educational needs.

“In music education textbooks, there are songs that can be combined with other subjects and they are used as inclusive tools when we learn: mathematics, language, art, physical education, etc.” (T1-F-50)

“With the music textbooks, we also get CDs with songs on them, listening to the songs automatically attracts the attention of the students to get involved in the planned activities” (T2-F-47)

“In my class I have a pupil with autism, he listens to music with great pleasure, he quickly catches the rhythm to dance or in mathematics to put the numbers in their place” (T5-F-35)

“In the class I work, I have a special need pupil, the pupil has speech impediment,

but follows the music, he writes musical notation, draws when there is a rhythm of music, writes the required text better when he listens to music” (T9-F-27)

“The curriculum supports inclusiveness and the use of music as an inclusive tool in all subjects depending on the teaching unit, for instance through music, all students can: maintain hygiene, perform physical education activities such as the teaching unit: head, arms, shoulders, songs to learn letters, numbers, etc. (E1-F-48)

“Through the use of music, the integration of areas and subjects can be done, learning will be more stable and we have a stronger inclusion” (E2-F-35)

Table 3. Content analysis of participants’ view about the qualification of teachers using of music as a tool for inclusive education

Sub-theme 2: Qualification for the inclusion of children with special needs using music as an inclusive tool in primary school	f
Adequate preparation for the inclusiveness of students with special needs	
Kosovar teachers are prepared	12
I am prepared	9
Appropriate methods and strategies	3
I can contribute	3
The use of music as an inclusive tool in primary school	
Inclusive tool	5
It needs improvements	6

Quotations on teachers and curriculum experts’ views regarding adequate preparation for the inclusion of students with special needs using music as an inclusive tool in primary school are as follows:

“From the third grade onwards, we are not well prepared for the subject of music, but no teacher who has completed the faculty of music could contribute more in this direction, because we are more professional for the age of children and teaching methodologies of this age” (T3-F-43)

“I think I am prepared because I have the appropriate methods and strategies for effective teaching” (T6-M-32)

“In the inclusion of pupils, I am able to contribute maximally even by using music” (T7-M-30)

“Kosovar teachers are prepared to use music as an inclusive tool because the curriculum enables them to do so” (E1-F-48)

“Inclusion is the main principle of our

curriculum and teachers are prepared for this and for the use of music as an inclusive tool although it needs continuous improvement” (E2-F-35)

Table 4. Content analysis of participants’ view about the teacher inservice training of inclusive education with music

Sub-theme 3. Training of teachers according to the fields they want	f
Teacher training	3
All training related to teaching	10
Accredited training	12
Integration of subjects	2
The use of music	4
Inclusive teaching	3
Integration of areas	3

Regarding the needs for in-service training of teachers according to the fields they want to be trained in, they stated:

All the participants (T1-12, E11, E12) said that the training related to teaching and accredited by the Ministry of Education is welcome.

“Training for inclusive education is very important “ (T1-F-50)

“Training related to subject integration would help us a lot” (T2-F-47)

“Training and different courses on the use of instruments, even though musical instruments are missing in our schools” (T3-F-43)

“Training on the use of music as an inclusive education tool” (T4-F-39; T5-F-35; T7-M-30; T9-F-27)

“Inclusive teaching and integration of fields” (T6-M-32)

“The use of music with children with hearing impairment and those with autism” (T8-F-27)

“Music and children with concentration, movement and multiple difficulties” (T9-F-27)

“The use of music applications through inclusive technologies” (T10-F-25)

“The Kosovar teachers are all trained for the curriculum which is in use and which enables them to use music as an inclusive tool” (E1-F-48)

“I am also a trainer in various trainings including curriculum which enables the integration of fields, but there is a need for trainings that enable inclusiveness in primary school” (E2-F-35)

Theme 2. Examples of the use of music in inclusive education

Table 5. Content analysis of participants' view about the examples of curricular adaptations

Sub-theme 4. Curricular adaptations in primary school for the inclusion of pupils with special educational needs, for example, the use of music in school subjects	f
Curricular adaptations in primary school for pupils inclusion	10
Primary school	8
Inclusion of pupils	7
Musical sounds	3
<i>The use of music in school subjects</i>	
Music is used in all subjects	10
The use of songs	5
Imitation	3
Counting	4
Letters	5
Inclusion	8
Means of transportation	2
Geometric figures	4

Examples of adaptations in primary school curriculum for the inclusion of pupils with special educational needs, for example, the use of music in school subjects, quotations from teachers and curriculum experts are as follows:

“The curriculum enables adaptations and the use of songs, for example learning body parts through songs” (E1-F-48)

“There are many teaching units and songs that can be linked eg. How do animals howl, their imitation in the subject the human and nature, numbers, letters, etc.” (E2-F-35)

“I often use music as a stimulant in other subjects, for example in physical education” (T2-F-47)

“When learning about means of transportation in the subject society and environment, I use the songs “Autobusi” (Bus), “Tym Tym”(Smoke smoke), “Treni” (Train) etc.” (T1-F-50)

“I use music in all subjects, e.g. the song “Loja me emra” (Game with names) in Albanian language subject, exercises with clapping, counting with claps, pencils, markers, the song “Shkruaj dhe këndo” (Write and sing)” (T3-F-43)

“Learning of geometric figures, song for the house” (T5-F-35)

“In the Albanian language lesson when we recite, we accompany it with music” (T7-M-30)

“In math class, we count, the counting of music notation, the value of music notation, $\frac{1}{2}$, $\frac{3}{4}$, etc” (T8-F-27)

“The teacher must use music according to the needs she/he has in her/his class” (T9-F-27)

“Songs of letters to remember sounds, about body parts, cleanliness “wash your hands”, imitation “chirp-chirp little bird” (exclamations, animals), emotions, etc.” (T10-F-25)

Table 6. A song that includes all the students

Albanian Language	English Language
“Vetëm duhet pak kujdes Pak kulturë, e pak vullnet E të sjellim malin në qytet” (Rasimi, 2021)	(It just takes a little care Little culture, little will And bring the mountain to the city)

Të mbjellim të gjithë nga një dru - Let's all plan...

Dua Rasimi

Note 1. The introductory part of the song “Let’s all plant a tree” - Dua Rasimi

Table 7. Song for all children

Albanian Language	English Language
“E dua Kosovën, e dua lirinë Fëmijë të dashur, gëzuar pavarësinë” (Kryeziu, 2020)	I love Kosovo, I love freedom Dear children, happy independence”

Gezuar Pavaresine - Happy Independence

Vlera

Note 2. The introductory part of the song “Happy Independence” Vlera Kryeziu

Dimension 3. Challenges of using music in inclusive education

Table 8. Content analysis of participants' view about the problems of inclusive education with music

Sub-theme 5. Problems in the inclusion of pupils with special needs during the use of music in primary school	f
<i>Problems in the inclusion of students with special needs</i>	
Lack of didactic materials	5
Music cabinet	6
Musical tools	7
Musical instruments	4
The use of music	2
Knowledge of parents	4
Overloaded curriculum	2
Support teacher	5
Assistant for children with special needs	8
Professional support	4
Conditions	2
Music	3
Challenge	5
Strategy	4
Methods	1
Effective	7
Game	3
Lesson	9

Quotations on teachers and curriculum experts' views regarding problems in the inclusion of children with special needs when using music in primary school are as follows:

“Challenges are daily and often insurmountable, especially in the absence of didactic materials and those of music” (T1-F-50)

“In lessons where music is used as an inclusive tool, it would be more effective if they were held in the music cabinet, as well as possess musical instruments and tools, space for all students to play” (T2-F-47)

“The simple problem is the lack of musical equipments, at the same time the challenge is also the knowledge of parents who often do not want their

children to be involved in all activities” (T3-F-43)

“The problem is when teachers do not find suitable forms or strategies during work” (T5-F-35)

“The overloaded curriculum and the lack of support for children with special needs with support teachers or assistants for children with special needs presents a problem in itself” (T6-M-32; T10-F-25)

“The barriers we encounter are the same for almost all Kosovar teachers: lack of necessary tools, lack of professional support in schools (lack of professional teams), lack of conditions, etc.” (T7-M-30; T8-F-27; T9-F-27)

“The problems faced by teachers

are mainly technical, they are not professional problems because Kosovar teachers are well prepared professionally, but they lack didactic tools, conditions in

schools, etc.” (E1-F-48; E2-F-35)

Dimension 4. The suggestions for inclusive education with music

Table 9. Content analysis of participants’ view about suggestions for inclusive education with music

Theme 6. Suggestions for effective inclusion of students with special educational needs using music in primary school	f
<i>Suggestions for effective inclusion of students with special needs</i>	
Multiple intelligences	1
Cross-curricular integration	9
Positive effects	6
Collaboration	8
Expert	5
Training	7
Applications	7
Special	7
Curriculum	9
Curricular area	5
Each subject	9

Teachers and curriculum experts’ suggestions for effective inclusion of pupils with special educational needs using music in primary school are as follows:

“Practise more lessons of multiple intelligences with pupils using music as a stimulating tool” (T1-F-50)

“Teachers should be offered training related to cross-curricular integration and there should be more collaborations with different experts in the school and outside the school” (T2-F-47)

“Provide inclusiveness training using music as an inclusive tool, and work more with students who have special talents” (T3-F-43)

“Create the necessary spaces for inclusiveness, the conditions, equipping schools with didactic tools, musical instruments, etc.” (T4-F-39)

“Awareness campaign for parents regarding inclusiveness, better

cooperation on the formation of professional teams in schools” (T5-F-35)

“Employ more support teachers, assistants for children with special needs, offer more training” (T6-M-32)

“Music has positive effects, music makes pupils happy, so it should be used more during lessons regardless of the subject, but we should be careful about the type and content of the songs we choose for pupils” (T7-M-30)

“Music is important like all other subjects, it should be treated as such by teachers and parents” (T8-F-27)

“The state, municipality, school, teachers and all stakeholders who are part of the learning process should handle and organize more cultural-musical activities for students, inclusiveness will succeed” (T9-F-27)

“Music and pupils with special needs are inseparable because in most cases

it brings success in inclusiveness, don't overuse it if it seems to you that it is not beneficial in lessons" (T10-F-25)

"Music brings innovation in the classroom, entertainment, cross-curricular integration, inclusiveness, we suggest using it in every subject without damaging the subject in which it is integrated, as it is with the Kosovar curriculum, and create applications that can be used in lessons". (E1-F-48; E2-F-35)

Conclusion and Discussion

The study aimed to investigate the use of music as an inclusion tool: can primary school teachers use it effectively? In this study, we researched different literature related to this issue and conducted a semi-structured interview with primary school teachers.

The findings showed that all Kosovar teachers use music as an inclusion tool for pupils with special needs depending on the situation and the subject. Similar arguments have been offered by the study of the authors Kivijarvi & Rautiainen (2021), stating that teachers rely on the use of music as part of Finnish inclusive education.

All participants indicated that they are professionally prepared for the use of music as an inclusive tool in primary school, they stated that there is a need for additional training, as professional development must be ongoing for teachers. According to researchers Laes & Westerlund (2018) teacher training faces challenges in their organization, but it should be inclusive and is necessary in all programs of the learning process and those related to music.

Music education is a special subject in primary school, the teachers also declared that they have curricular spaces to integrate it into other subjects as a teaching tool for inclusiveness, e.g. in learning numbers, letters, geometric figures, drawing, physical education, etc. For the impact of the use of music as an inclusive tool, the findings

of the study of Blasco-Magraner, Bernabe-Valero et.al. (2021) show that students in primary school were happier, better social, language, visual relations, etc. Music as an inclusive tool affects students positively in their emotions.

The problems encountered with Kosovar teachers during the research were of a technical nature, they stated that they lacked the conditions, didactic tools, musical instruments, professional support, support teachers, assistants for children with special needs, but in reality inclusiveness was realized and there were activities organized where music is used as a tool for inclusion. While researchers Moreno et.al. (2021) show that musical instruments and new technologies are accessible to everyone in Portugal, it is the opposite from our country which faces a lack of these tools.

Teachers and curriculum experts suggested that music can be integrated in all subjects, depending on the teaching unit, they also suggested having more didactic tools, creating musical applications that can be used in school, etc. In their study Freitas Martind et.al. (2020) suggested that music must be integrated into the wider community where pupils: engage, articulate, share experiences, aspirations, learn from each other, play, evaluate, taking the potential and impact that music has on human development, it brings today an inclusive development of pupils.

From the findings of the research, using music as an effective, inclusive tool brings new concepts to our society, helps inclusiveness and enables students to be equal in their classrooms. Various studies have shown that the use of music as an inclusive tool gives the opportunity to keep in step with the times and bring students an involvement in all subjects. Music can be interrelated to all subjects without distinction, the Kosovar curriculum has created the possibility to include music in all curricular areas by connecting them and to create opportunities for students to be involved in all activities

within the lesson according to their needs that they have.

Recommendations

The authors of this research, relying on the used literature and practical research, recommend that the relevant institutions in Kosovo equip the schools with the necessary didactic-musical, audio-visual tools, musical instruments, music cabinets, etc.

Teachers need to be trained in the use of music as an inclusive tool for children with special educational needs, this should be done by the responsible institutions. In addition to teachers, awareness campaigns for parents should also be held regarding the activities held in the classroom for pupils with special needs.

Actors related to teaching should take measures to improve conditions in general, hire more support teachers and assistants for children with special needs, pay attention to technology, install applications in school technology so that music can be used as an inclusive tool etc.

Recommendations for Further Research

Since our study was carried out in a region of Kosovo, and four primary schools were the focus of the study, it is recommended that similar studies be expanded throughout Kosovo and beyond to larger samples with primary school teachers and expert in various fields from the Ministry of Education.

Recommendations for Applicants

To use music as an inclusive tool for the integration of all children without distinction, in all subjects where the curriculum allows.

Music should be part of teachers' planning in curricular and extracurricular activities, for an inclusion of pupils in primary school.

Limitations of the Study

Our study is based on the researched literature and the semi-structured interview conducted with primary school teachers

and curriculum experts from the Ministry of Education, Science, Technology and Innovation. If we used any other research instrument, we could have got other results in this study.

Acknowledgment

Thanks to all those who helped us in conducting the research, special thanks to the interviewees who participated in the research without whom our research would be deficient.

References

- Barnová , S., Kožuchová, M., Krásna, S., & Osad'án, R. (2022). Teachers' Professional Attitudes towards Inclusive Education. *Emerging Science Journal*, 6(SI), 13-24. doi:10.28991/ESJ-2022-SIED-02
- Begić, J., Begić, A., & Škojo, T. (2017). Opinions of University Music Teachers on the Musical Competencies Necessary for Primary Education Teachers. *International Journal of Higher Education*, 6(1), 197-208. doi:10.5430/ijhe.v6n1p197
- Bharathi, G., Venugopal, A., & Vellingiri, B. (2019). Music therapy as a therapeutic tool in improving the social skills of autistic children. *The Egyptian Journal of Neurology, Psychiatry and Neurosurgery*, 55(1), 1-6. doi:10.1186/s41983-019-0091-x
- Blasco-Magraner, J. S., Bernabe-Valero, G., Marín-Liéñana, P., & Moret-Tatay, C. (2021). Effects of the Educational Use of Music on 3- to 12-Year-Old Children's Emotional Development: A Systematic Review. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 18(7), 1-29. doi:10.3390/ijerph18073668
- Camilleri, A. C., & Camilleri, M. A. (2019). Mobile Learning via Educational Apps: An Interpretative Study. *Association for Computing Machinery*, 5(1), 27-29. doi:https://doi.org/10.1145/3337682.3337687
- Çeliktaş, H., Engür, D., & Özeke, S. (2022). A Thematic Review of the Studies on the Music Teacher Competencies in Turkey. *International Education Studies*, 15(1), 1-15. doi:10.5539/ies.v15n1p1
- Clauhs, M., Franco, B., & Cremata, R. (2019). Mixing It Up: Sound Recording and Music Production in School Music Programs. *Music Educators Journal*, 106(1), 55-63. doi:10.1177/0027432119856085
- Dhomi, A. (2010). *Prej notës deri te kënga (From note to song)*. Prishtina: University of Pristina - Faculty of Education.
- Drake, S., & Reid, J. (2018). Integrated Curriculum as an Effective Way to Teach 21st Century Capabilities. *Asia Pacific Journal of Educational Research*, 1(1), 31-50. doi:1410-ECN-0102-2018-300-004205609
- Eren, B. (2015). The Use of Music Interventions to Improve Social Skills in Adolescents with Autism Spectrum Disorders in Integrated Group Music Therapy Sessions. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 197(1), 207 - 213. doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.07.125
- Fole, S. V. (2017). Music Education and Its Impact on Students with Special Needs . *Scholarship and Engagement in Education*, 1(1), 1-7.
- Freitas Martins, D., Joly, I., & Junior, L. (2020). Inclusive musical education: Searching for the 'working with' in social projects. *International Society for Music Education 34th World Conference on Music Education: Online 3rd -7th August 2020* (pp. 21-27). Australia: International Society for Music Education.
- Kivijärvi, S., & Rautiainen , P. (2021). Contesting music education policies through the concept of reasonable accommodation: Teacher autonomy and equity enactment in Finnish music education. *Research Studies in Music Education*, 43(2), 91 -109. doi:10.1177/1321103X20924142
- Kryeziu, V. (2020, 2 15). <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=B4hn0SVJsyg&t=24s>. (A. Rasimi, Editor, S. Avdiu, Producer, & Bitonia) Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=B4hn0SVJsyg&t=24s>: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=B4hn0SVJsyg&t=24s>

- Kumar, R. (2017). *Metodologjia e hulumtimit (Research methodology)*. Prishtinë: USAID & MASHT.
- Laes, T., & Westerlund, H. (2018). Performing disability in music teacher education: Moving beyond inclusion through expanded professionalism. *International Journal of Music Education*, 36(1), 34 -46. doi:10.1177/0255761417703782
- Lee, L., & Chang, H.-Y. (2021). Music Technology as a Means for Fostering Young Children's Social Interactions in an Inclusive Class. *Applied System Innovation*, 4(4), 2-13. doi:10.3390/asi4040093
- Manning, I. (2016). *Music for all: supporting students with special needs in the music classroom*. Toronto: University of Toronto.
- Matthews, B., & Ross, L. (2010). *Metodat e hulumtimit (Research methods)*. Tiranë: CDE.
- Meyer, J. (2017). *Music education with autistic students, music education with autistic students in the mainstream elementary classroom*. Toronto: Department of Curriculum, Teaching and Learning Ontario Institute for Studies in Education of the University of Toronto .
- Ministry of Education, Science and Technology. (2016). Kurrikula bërthamë për klasën përgatitore dhe arsimin fillor të Kosovës (klasat 0, I, II, III, IV dhe V)-Core Curriculum for Preparatory Grade and Elementary Education of Kosovo (Grades 0, I, II, III, IV and V). Prishtina: MEST.
- Mohajan, H. (2018). Qualitative Research Methodology in Social Sciences and Related Subjects. *Journal of Economic Development, Environment and People*, 7(1), 23-48.
- Moreno, D., Moreira, A., Tymoshchuk, O., & Marques, C. (2021). Finding solutions to promote the inclusion of children with Cerebral Palsy in Arts Education Programmes of Music: an integrative literature review using webQDA. *Indagatio Didactica*, 13(3), 537-558. doi:https://doi.org/10.34624/id.v13i3.25599
- Musai, B. (2020). *Arsimi në demokracinë e brishtë (Education in democracy is fragile)*. Tirna: EDUALBA.
- Newcomer, K., Hatry, H., & Wholey, J. (2010). *Handbook of practical program evaluation*. Washington: John Wiley & Sons.
- Ovcharenko, N., Sysoieva, S., Samoilenko, A., Chebotarenko, O., & Bohianu, K. (2021). Formation of prospective music art teachers' readiness for inclusive educational activity. *Amazonia Investiga*, 10(45), 175-184. doi:10.34069/AI/2021.45.09.18
- Pino, A., & Viladot, L. (2019). Teaching-learning resources and supports in the music classroom: Key aspects for the inclusion of visually impaired students. *British Journal of Visual Impairment*, 37(1), 17 -28. doi:10.1177/0264619618795199
- Rasimi, D. (2021). <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=dsqFvUQEugg>. (A. Rasimi, Editor, V. Krasniqi, Producer, & Albas) Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=dsqFvUQEugg>: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=dsqFvUQEugg>
- Riley, P. (2016). iPad Apps for Creating in Your General Music Classroom. *Journal of General Music Education*, 29(2), 4-13. doi:https://doi.org/10.1177/1048371315594408
- Ruiz, A., & Bosco, A. (2020). Digital technologies in the music classroom to support equity and inclusion in secondary school. *International Society for Music Education 34th World Conference on Music Education: Online 3rd -7th August 2020* (pp. 80-89). International Society for Music Education : Australia.

Santos, C., Carvalho, B., & Lobato, B. (2020). Inclusion of students with special educational needs at the state music conservatory: teachers' perspective. *Educação e Pesquisa*, 46(1), 18-46. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1590/S1678-4634202046215166>

Save the Children. (2007). *Disiplina pozitive në klasa gjithëpërfshirëse, mësimdashëse (Positive discipline in inclusive, nurturing classrooms)*. Tirana: Save the Children.

Steele, M., McFerran, K., & Crooke, A. (2022). Shifting the Focus to Teachers: A New Approach for Music Therapists Working in Schools. *Music Therapy Perspectives*, 40(1), 1-9. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1093/mtp/miac020>

Sze, S., & Yu, S. (2004). *Educational benefits of music in an inclusive classroom*. Online Submission, 1-3.

Tetty, T. R. (2019). Music education as a means to enhance a sense of social inclusion and empower the young in Eastern Uganda. *Journal of Social Inclusion*, 10(1), 59-77.

University of Prishtina "Hasan Prishtina". (2019, 10 1). Faculty of Education - Primary Program. Retrieved from <https://edukimi.uni-pr.edu/desk/inc/media/7140978A-1696-4481-BAA3-770B5ED59071.pdf>: <https://uni-pr.edu/>

Wall, A., & Leckie, A. (2017). Curriculum Integration: An Overview. *Current Issues in Middle Level Education*, 22(1), 36-40.

Appendix 1. Semi-structured interview

Semi-structured Interview Form
<p>Explanation: The aim of this study is to investigate The role of music as an inclusion tool: can primary school teachers use it effectively? The answers received from you will helps us in drawing the results for this research. All answers will remain confidential and only for the needs of this research.</p>
<p>Gender: Female (<input type="checkbox"/>) Male (<input type="checkbox"/>) Age</p>
<p>Questions</p>
<p>Question 1. Does the primary school curriculum support the use of music in the inclusion of children with special educational needs? Please explain with examples?</p>
<p>Question 2. Do you feel adequate for the inclusion of children with special needs using music as an inclusive tool in primary school? If in-service training is planned, what areas would you like to be trained in?</p>
<p>Question 3. Give examples of adaptations you have made to the primary school curriculum for the inclusion of children with special educational needs. For example, what songs do you use in the lessons of different subjects? Explain in detail...</p>
<p>Question 4. Do you encounter problems in the inclusion of children with special needs when using music in primary school? If yes, please explain these problems (in terms of educational environment, materials, family, school management).</p>
<p>Question 5. What are your suggestions for effective inclusion of children with special educational needs by using music in primary school?</p>

