

Women's Access to Urban Social Services in Çankaya District: A Mix Method Research

Burcu Hatiboğlu Kısacık¹ | Ali Alpaslan Odabaş²

¹ Assist. Prof., Hacettepe
University, FEAS,
Ankara/Türkiye

ORCID: [0000-0002-4396-8412](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4396-8412)

E-Mail:
burcuhatiboglu@gmail.com

² PhD Candidate, Hacettepe
University, FEAS,
Ankara/Türkiye

ORCID: [0000-0001-9343-4171](https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9343-4171)

E-Mail:
aliaodabas@gmail.com

Corresponding Author:
Burcu Hatiboğlu Kısacık

January 2023

Volume:20

Issue:51

DOI: [10.26466/opusjsr.1213973](https://doi.org/10.26466/opusjsr.1213973)

Citation:

Hatiboğlu Kısacık, B. and
Odabaş, A. A. (2023). Women's
access to urban social services in
Çankaya district:
A mix method research. *OPUS-
Journal of Society Research*, 20(51),
138-148.

Abstract

The purpose of this study was to develop a comprehensive understanding on women's access to urban welfare/social services issues and solutions for developing gender sensitive urban welfare/social services. The mixed research were conducted in Çankaya, Ankara, based on the principles of feminist methodology to answer to how the rights to access to urban services of women residents could be achieved by regarding their satisfaction of the urban social services and their daily urban life experiences? Different tools in qualitative and quantitative research methods were used to collect and generate data. Integrated findings that are based on the combination of quantitative and qualitative analysis were presented into two parts; which includes socio-demographic characteristics of the participants and the effective and accessible urban social services for women in Çankaya. It was identified that urban infrastructure and welfare/social services of Çankaya could not respond to the gender needs of women living here and caused to their dissatisfaction about the existing urban services and municipal activities. In conclusion, a new perspective were recommended for developing that focuses on the transformation of gender relations within space and urban services based on the principles of being "free of charge", "accessible", "inclusive", "safe and secure", "empowering", "healthy" and "right-based".

Keywords: Women's Access To Urban Social Services, Urban Policy, Gender Relations, Gender Equality, Çankaya.

Öz

Bu çalışmanın amacı, kadınların kentsel refah/sosyal hizmetlere erişimi sorunlarına ve toplumsal cinsiyete duyarlı kentsel refah/sosyal hizmetlerinin geliştirilmesine yönelik önerilerine ilişkin kapsamlı bir anlayış geliştirmektir. Feminist metodoloji ilkelerinden hareketle karma araştırma olarak tasarlanan bu araştırma, Ankara Çankaya'da yaşayan kadınların kentsel sosyal hizmetlerden memnuniyetleri ve günlük kentsel yaşam deneyimleri dikkate alınarak kentsel hizmetlere erişim haklarının nasıl sağlanabileceği sorusuna cevap bulmaya odaklanmıştır. Veri toplama ve bilgi üretme sürecinde nitel ve nicel araştırma yaklaşımlarından yararlanarak farklı araçlar kullanılmıştır. Nicel ve nitel analizin birleşimine dayanan bütünlük bulgular iki bölüm halinde sunulmuştur: katılımcıların sosyo-demografik özellikleri ve Çankaya'daki kadınlar için etkili ve erişilebilir Kentsel Sosyal Hizmetler. Bulgular, kentsel altyapı ve kentsel refah/sosyal hizmetler açısından Çankaya'nın, burada yaşayan kadınların toplumsal cinsiyet ihtiyaçlarına cevap veremediği ve mevcut kentsel hizmetlerden ve belediye faaliyetlerinden memnuniyetsiz olmalarına neden olduğunu göstermektedir. Sonuç olarak, "ücretsiz", "erişilebilir", "kapsayıcı", "güvenli", "güçlendirici", "sağlıklı" ve "hak temelli" olma ilkelerinden hareketle, toplumsal cinsiyet ilişkilerinin mekân ve kentsel hizmetlerde dönüşümüne odaklanan yeni bir bakış açısının geliştirilmesi için önerilerde bulunulmuştur.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Kadınların Kentsel Sosyal Hizmetlere Erişimi, Kentsel Politika, Toplumsal Cinsiyet İlişkileri, Toplumsal Cinsiyet Eşitliği, Çankaya.

Introduction

The idea and understanding about the city has mostly been shaped by how citizens imagine and experience the city. Therefore, the perspective about city and urban space, personal experiences and identities as well as the way of action and movement of the person within the urban space are the main decisive aspects. In case of not considering these main aspects, the efforts of municipalities aiming at improving urban space and welfare/social services could easily be resulted in discrimination and inequality for accessing these services for some groups, especially for women (Akduran, Yakar-Önal ve Günlük-Şenesen, 2018). Precisely in this direction, the concept of mainstreaming gender equality within urban policy is started to be discussed after Beijing 4th World Conference on Women in 1995. European Union Research and Development Program-Horizon 2020 have also gradually addressed various dimensions of gender in terms of urban planning and transportation (Sánchez de Madariaga, 2013, p.43). Within this direction, gender equality action plans and gender sensitive budgeting have been developed as the products of such tools and mechanisms. However, there has also been some concerns about the process of gender mainstreaming is not addressing the rights-based agenda emerged in the 1970s because it is used as a bureaucratic tool (Sánchez de Madariaga and Roberts, 2013; Beebeejaun, 2017). The results of the existing studies have shown that there are significant shortcomings in achieving gender equality in urban settings (Doan, 2010; Meadow, 2010; Spain, 2014). Moser (2016) has emphasized at this point that a new perspective should be developed that focuses on the transformation of gender relations within space rather than mainstreaming gender equality.

When looking at the situation of urban settings in Turkey from gender mainstreaming perspective, it is seen that the research on women-friendly cities has increased with the Local Agenda 21 meetings which were held with the effect of the European Union Harmonization process in the 2000s. Within these developments, Equality Units has been established in some

municipalities and Gender Equality Action Plans has been developed. Although there are important studies that will ensure the monitoring of gender equality at the city level in Turkey within the framework of international human rights norms (Akduran, Yakar-Önal ve Günlük-Şenesen, 2018), there is lack of evidence-based research to analyze how developments contribute to access to gender equal urban welfare/social services in Turkey.

Studies conducted at the international level in terms of women's access to urban welfare/social services has mostly handled it with its connection to the gender inequalities in the urban space in the axis of body, labor and identity (Fenster, 2005; Buckingham, 2010; Beebeejaun, 2017). Within these research, urban policies has harshly been criticized because they do not take into account the differences unique to the gender of the citizens living in a city and their needs arising from these differences have not met. According to Beebeejaun (2017) all urban settings like all public spaces are completely planned over the needs of men. In this context, it has been particularly women who face discrimination at the first place, and how they relate to the urban space is generally ignored as they are accepted as the passive users of the city. Thus, most of the women residents have seen as becoming not passive but rather incomplete citizens because of the urban welfare/social services ignoring the conditions that create different life experiences within the framework of especially gender-based division of labor (Alkan, 2006; Fenster, 2005). Based on this reality, it is identified to be need for conducting a socio-spatial analysis that holistically addresses the identity performance, the organization of labor and various appearances of the body within public and private spheres. In this respect, gender perspective proposes a new paradigm to reveal the invisibility of women in the city through gender inequalities.

At this point, it is necessary to have a right-based approach in order to focus on women's access to urban services. It should not be forgotten that how different genders relates to the city results in different experiences of discrimination and inequalities at any time when certain

conditions such as being elderly, young and disabled are identified based on unequal gender relations and intersect with each other (Author, 2022). In this direction, access to urban welfare/social services is not only to "equally access to physical and social infrastructure in cities, in other words, provision of local public services" but also it is to provide and design of urban services in accordance with the needs of everyone including special needs of general, disabled or aged women and provides easy access (Akduran, Yakar-Önal ve Günlük-Şenesen, 2018, p.16-20). Therefore, it is necessary to develop an inclusive understanding for evaluating women's access to urban welfare/social services in accordance with the right-based relationship between the urban citizens, the city administration and the urban space.

That's why, the conceptual framework of the research is built upon fundamental norms, namely the Prohibition of Discrimination, Gender Equality, Respect for Human Dignity, Sustainability which are regulated in basic documents on fundamental international human rights and urban rights such as European Charter of Local Self-Governance (1985), European Urban Charter (2008) and Charter for Women's Right to the City (2004). It was conducted based on the mixed research design analyzing both quantitative and qualitative data in different ways, and focuses on the rights of Çankaya's women residents to access to urban social services. The most important reason to focus on Çankaya district is that it is the only municipality that has an equality unit among the district municipalities in Ankara and Çankaya Municipality has been preparing the second Local Equality Action Plan by the time this research was started.

Therefore, the main aim of this study is to develop an comprehensive understanding on women's access to urban welfare/social services issues and solutions.

Methodology

This research is based on the mixed research conducted in Çankaya, Ankara, based on the principles of feminist methodology. Therefore, it fits the transformative paradigm aiming to transform the lives of the groups experiencing gender discrimination and oppression, according to the definition by Mertens (2009). The main mix method question is designed to answer to how the rights to access to urban services of women residents of Çankaya could be achieved by regarding their satisfaction of the urban social services and their daily life experiences? Different tools in qualitative and quantitative research were used to collect and generate data, and conducted the analysis separately (Creswell, 2014). Ethical approval was obtained from Hacettepe University Ethical Commission prior to concluding the study.

As part of the quantitative phase, the household interviews with 167 resident who's gender statement is women from different neighborhoods of Çankaya carried out before the COVID-19 pandemic, between December 2019-March 2020. The data were collected via home visits in 34 neighborhoods of Çankaya, based on the sample determined by Turkey Statistics Institute (TurkStat). Quantitative research was mainly carried out in a sample of 657 households under harsh winter conditions. In 281 of these households, women directly refused to participate in the study. 209 households could not be reached, despite 3 household completed, due to the fact that either nobody was at home or nobody opened the door. Some of these households were demolished or were for rent or for sale. The ideas on their satisfaction of the urban social services gathered from household surveys were analyzed via SPSS. The analysis regarding how women use urban services was conducted based on their satisfaction with their household and building where they live as well as other non-house/building urban services; their satisfaction with institutions and organizations rendering welfare/social services in urban area,

and their suggestions for improving urban services in Çankaya district.

In the qualitative phase, on the other hand, semi-structured in-depth interviews with 21 women (regarding their gender statement) conducted to understand women's daily urban life experiences after the first lock-down measures taken due to the pandemic. All the in-depth interviews were conducted via online platforms such as Zoom and WhatsApp. Based on purposeful sampling (Creswell, 2014), the relevant intersectional aspects related to their age, and the disability (visual disability and orthopedic disability) were included because of their excluded position in urban policy literature. Of the women interviewed in-depth, 4 are 65 years old and over and 3 are under 30 years old. In addition, 2 physically disabled women and 3 visually impaired women were interviewed. It was not possible to meet with hearing impaired women on an online platform. A pseudonym was used to avoid revealing people's identity information. All the interviews were analyzed by using NVIVO 12 as separately. Within the qualitative analysis, the relation with the municipality and urban services and their experiences of using them was conducted.

In the mixed research dimension, the results of the quantitative and qualitative analysis were combined and correlated them with each other and reported within the framework of the integrated findings. This "multiple form of analysis is conceptualized as 'triangulation' or 'convergent validation in social sciences" (Berg and Lune 2016). It provides to develop an idea about the aspects where the meaning is diversified for different groups and for different dimensions of qualitative and quantitative findings, and to make sense of the power relations that determine reality. As a result, the mixed research findings obtained by the integrated analysis of the results from the quantitative and qualitative research were discussed in detail under two parts.

Findings

Findings of this research are presented into two part. First one is focused on Socio-Demographic characteristics of the participants and the other is on effective and accessible Urban Social Services for women in Çankaya.

Socio-Demographic Findings

According to the socio-demographic characteristics of women surveyed (Table 1), 22.9% of them are 65 years old or more. Women over the age of 65 usually have a regular income of their own, live alone or with another female household member and have chronic health problems. This data seem to be to be compatible with the statistics by TURKSTAT. According to the statistics by TURKSTAT (TUIK, 2018), 17.6% of Çankaya consists of elderly individuals over the age of 65. According to TURKSTAT data of 2019; considering that the proportion of the elderly population in Turkey is 9.1%, and 55.8% of the elderly population consists of women, the density of the elderly population in Çankaya is remarkable.

Similarly; 38.9% of the women surveyed are received undergraduate education and 33.4% of them are received high school education. The high level of education has reflected in the proportion of the women with an income (working income or pension) among research participants. It is also compatible with the TURKSTAT statistics (TUIK, 2018), in terms of socio-economic status, mainly those who have medium or high level of socio-economic power reside in Çankaya (%68,4). In terms of education level, 46.1% of those living in Çankaya have an undergraduate or higher education level.

Having a chronic health problem is the case for 4 out of every 10 women surveyed. Women are mostly suffering from age-related diseases such as blood pressure, heart diseases, orthopedic disorders and gynecological diseases specific to women. In addition, there are other health problems that women also mentioned such as internal diseases, respiratory diseases and psychological disorders. In this direction, it can be

said that certain measures need to be taken for the special needs of women in the intersection group of age, disability and health status by considering that the status of disability and health may go worse as we grow older.

Table 1. Socio-Demographic Characteristics of Women participating in the survey

Age Distribution	N	%
65 and over	41	(24,5)
Between 35-64	88	52.7
Between 18-34	38	(22,8)
Total	167	100
Educational Background		
Illiterate/No diploma/Primary School	27	(16,2)
Secondary school	18	(10,8)
High school	57	34.1
Undergraduate/Postgraduate	65	38.9
Total	167	100
Income Status		
Has income/work/retired	98	98
Has no income/is unemployed	69	69
Total	167	167
Health Status		
Chronic Health Problem Available	63	37.7
No Chronic Health Problem	104	62.3
Total	167	100
Disability Status		
The woman surveyed has disability	16	(9,6)
The woman surveyed has no disability	151	90.4
Total	167	100

Percentages for variables where the number of observations is below 50 are given in parentheses () to underline their interpretation.

These measures need to be identified through an understanding of independence in the care relations as 3 out of 10 women participating in the study are elderly, over 65 years old; 1 out of 10 women with disabilities and 2 out of 10 women live with a household member with chronic health problems. Approximately 3 out of every 10 women have children, most of whom are pre-school and school-age children (Table 2).

This data is important in terms of showing that it is necessary to consider the gender dimension of care relations in the development of urban services for the elderly, disabled and women with health problems living in Çankaya. In this respect, while developing urban services, it should be taken into account that both the elderly, disabled and those having a chronic disease as well as the women who live together with these people must enjoy their right to act independently in the urban space. At this point, the need for support services

for the care of pre-school and school-age children including children with disability or chronic illness is also noteworthy.

Table 2. Information about household composition of women participating in the survey

Gender of the household Composition	N	%
Women living alone	31	(18,6)
Women-only households	19	(11,4)
Households with at least one man over 18	117	70.1
Total	167	100
Ages of the household / aged 65 and over		
Individuals at the age of 65+ available	49	(29,3)
No individuals at the age of 65+ available	118	70.7
Total	167	100
Ages of the household / Children under 18		
Preschool-age children available	11	(6,6)
School-age children (5-14 years old) available	24	(14,4)
Children in adolescence (15-17 years old) available	9	(5,4)
No children	123	73.6
Total	167	100
Health Status of Household Members		
Women who was surveyed has a health problem	44	(26,3)
A member with health problems other than the woman surveyed	23	(13,8)
Another member with health problems alongside the woman surveyed	19	(11,4)
Nobody in the household with health problems	81	48.5
Total	167	100
Disability Status of Household Members		
Disability status of woman surveyed	16	(9,6)
A member with disability other than the woman surveyed	10	(6)
Another disabled member alongside the woman surveyed	1	(0,2)
No disabled member in the household	140	84.2
Total	167	100

Percentages for variables where the number of observations is below 50 are given in parentheses () to underline their interpretation.

In the qualitative dimension of the study, the subjects of the research are included because of their unique characteristics to understand the differentiated experiences of inequality, discrimination and struggle in accessing urban services in Çankaya. More detailed information on the characteristics of the research subjects is given in Table 3.

Table 3. Socio-demographic characteristics of the women participated in-depth interviews

	Age	Disability Status	Income Status	Educational Status	Health Chronic	Nation
W1	65	--	Regular	Und.graduate	Yes	Turkish
W2	33	Phys. disab.	Regular	Ph.d	No	Turkish
W3	38	Visuallydisab	Regular	Ph.d	No	Turkish
W4	65	--	Regular	Ph.d	Yes	Turkish
W5	53	--	Regular	Und.graduate	Yes	Turkish
W6	43	Visual. Disab.	Regular	Und.graduate	No	Turkish
W7	56	Visual. Disab.	Regular	High school	Yes	Turkish
W8	52	--	Regular	Und.graduate	Yes	Turkish
W9	42	--	Regular	Und.graduate	No	Turkish
W10	47	--	Irregular	Und.graduate	No	Turkish
W11	25	--	Regular	Und.graduate	Yes	Turkish
W12	37	--	Regular	Und.graduate	No	Turkish
W13	36	Phys. disab.	Regular	Ph.d	No	Turkish
W14	40	--	Regular	High school	Yes	Turkish
W15	65	--	Regular	Und.graduate	Yes	Turkish
W16	47	--	Regular	Und.graduate	No	Turkish
W17	41	--	Regular	High school	Yes	Turkish
W18	57	--	Regular	Und.graduate	Yes	Turkish
W19	26	--	Regular	Und.graduate	No	Turkish
W20	24	--	Regular	Und.graduate	No	Turkish
W21	71	--	Regular	Und.graduate	Yes	Turkish

Findings on effective and accessible Urban Social Services for women in Çankaya

Urban services determine the quality of urban life. This quality is determined by the fact that all citizens can access urban infrastructure and welfare/social services responding their daily life needs without facing inequality and discrimination. Together with the quantitative and qualitative data, findings of this research have clearly shown that both infrastructural problems about the households/apartments and the urban structure have led to inequality in access to urban welfare social services for women.

Regarding the infrastructural problems about the households/apartments, 7 in every 10 women from Çankaya find the structure of their buildings and the relevant facilities within their buildings insufficient. It is often mentioned about the infrastructure problems such as insufficient insulation systems of the buildings, old electricity and water installations, insufficient elevator systems, the building structures are found to be inadequate due to the entrances' being slippery, not suitable for ambulance as well as wheelchair or strollers. In addition, certain infrastructure services such as roads, streets, sidewalks (68,3% of women), street lighting (39,5%), overpasses (59,3% of women), green spaces/parks (56,9%),

venues for art and cultural activities (55,1% of women) and sports areas (41,9% of women) are also the main urban services that Çankaya women find inadequate. They stated that these places are not accessible and difficult to go or walk alone at certain times of the day due to insecure conditions. Within the framework of qualitative research, it is also defined as a "fear of being harmed" and having a "difficulty" especially by disabled and elderly women. At this point, it should be emphasized here that based on the results of both qualitative and quantitative research, Çankaya women demand safe and secure transportation including streets, bus stops and any means of transportation so that they can meet their daily basic needs (shopping for food or cloths, or social life).

In this framework, Çankaya residents have some criticisms and suggestions regarding Municipality services. One of the main sources of their criticism is that they have poor connection with Çankaya Municipality. Quantitative research results indicate that 4 out of 10 women in Çankaya either experienced a problem with the municipality or their problem was not/could not be solved due to certain factors including not reaching the relevant persons or departments, facing bureaucracy and language barriers and being ignored due to their age. When considering the 2019 data obtained from Çankaya Municipality upon request, this could be described as normal because there is no gender-based study conducted in Resolution Center of Çankaya Municipality, where public complaints are addressed. In this respect, women of Çankaya want to "have a voice" and "be heard" in urban management during the process of developing inclusive policies and practices for urban services. They think that basic principles such as being "free of charge", "accessible and inclusive", "safe and secure", "empowering", "healthy" and "right-based" should be taken as a basis for the urban welfare/social services to be developed.

Within the results of quantitative and qualitative research, the urban welfare/social services based on these principles that Çankaya women expect from Çankaya Municipality to develop can be summarized in seven subtitles.

Free and accessible health care services:

Regarding women's access to health care services, the women of Çankaya have stated that they mostly benefited from family health centers and municipal health services by identifying these services sufficient. However, certain limitation is identified in using especially state-driven health care services such as family health centers and public hospitals. Qualitative findings has shown that the limitation is because of the "afraid of being harmed" to go to state-driven hospitals mostly located in Ulus and because of the difficulty to access that hospitals by means of public transportation. In addition to this, the discriminative and negative experiences in access to family health centers could be possible especially for unmarried and young women. In case of pregnancy-related issues, sexually transmitted infections and gynecological diseases, women have hesitated to use the state-driven health care services due to the violations of privacy. Therefore women of Çankaya prefer private hospitals located within the borders of Çankaya. This is also related to their socio-economic position as middle-upper class citizens. In this framework, it seems very important to provide sexual health services by preventing stigma and enabling people to use these services. In this respect, women demand that the sexual health services provided by Çankaya Municipality should be developed in a way that includes diagnosis and follow-up mechanisms for many sexually transmitted infections such as HIV+, HPV and syphilis as well as other health problems such as cervical cancer and breast cancer. They also emphasized that it is important that the health services to be developed are free and accessible and supported by announcements/information circulated.

Inclusive welfare/social services for special needs of care: The urban welfare/social services that Çankaya women benefit the least include women-oriented services, nursing homes and elderly care services, children centers and special education centers. It is mostly because of the limited information of women about what kind of

services the Municipality provides. Those who have information about these services, on the other hand, have complained about the insufficient capacity of women shelters or special education and rehabilitation centers, home care services for elderly and disabled, child care centers, kindergartens and pre-schools belonging to the municipality. Because of the insufficient capacity of these welfare/social services they stated that they could not benefit from this service although they want to. In this respect, it is an important demand to make municipal services transparent and public. Another issue about these welfare/social services is the inclusiveness.

At this point, it is highly important for women with disabled children that kindergartens and pre-schools must offer inclusive services in which the special needs of the disabled children and mothers are taken into consideration. As stated by many women it is important to give an opportunity for the disabled children to "play together at a young age" and to support the disabled parents "for child care and accessibility services" especially when they "took [their] child to kindergarten ... [in] cold, icy days" (W6, age 43, visually-disabled). In addition to these, the disabled women of Çankaya, stating that it is very important to support especially visually-disabled and hearing-impaired people to improve their daily-life skills (such as cooking, ironing) for empower their "independent life". At this point, they have also emphasized that the mentally-disabled women are in the most disadvantageous position that need to be considered. According to the results of the quantitative research, it should be noted that 3 out of every 10 women in Çankaya live with an elderly person over the age of 65, 2 out of 10 women live with a disabled individual and 1 out of every 10 women with an individual having chronic health problems. In this context, it should be taken into account that the elderly, the disabled, urban citizens with chronic health problems as well as the women who live together with them have to be supported to move independently in the urban space. Within this context, the municipality is asked for taking certain measures to eliminate accessibility

problems because of inadequate facilities of the buildings and apartments. There is also highly critical information regarding the fact that the elderly people, in particular those living alone, have difficulty in meeting their cleaning and self-care needs due to their health conditions such as Alzheimer's disease or dementia. In this context, some women interviewed, made noteworthy suggestions for the wellbeing of their elderly neighbors saying that the municipalities must detect those elderly people who are living alone and provide psycho-social support as well as home care services, if necessary.

Finally, within the framework of social services proposed to be inclusive, women living in Çankaya have highly important suggestions regarding the development of shelters to address different needs. In this framework, W8 (age 52), underlining the importance of building shelters that are accessible, have tailor-made designs and are developed in line various services especially for women with disabilities as they are the most vulnerable group, also emphasized that these shelters including the services for the disabled should be offered.

Safe and secure public transport and walking areas: Based on the quantitative research results, it is found that half of the women in Çankaya stated that the public transportation services in their district are inadequate. The reason behind it is mainly explained as the lack of public transportation services, unsuitable routes, overcrowded and outdated means of transport. Qualitative research results also point to similar issues of dissatisfaction. In this respect, a more regular and diverse public transport system is asked for being developed with different types of vehicles. Offering various means and regular schedules of transport in the public transport system with the integration of "voice announcement", "warning systems" as well as the construction of indoor bus stops, which will ensure their accessibility is seen as important for disabled women. Other services underlined regarding this issue also include the fixed stops for public transport and whether there is accessible underpass/overpass nearby bus stops.

The relevant recommendations include important aspects that will provide accessibility for the elderly, children and the disabled, such as arranging the uphill streets, establishing special lanes and ramps for the disabled as well as cycling paths. Within the framework of qualitative research results, the disabled and elderly women frequently emphasized that these arrangements should be made in all areas of the city and in accordance with universal design standards. In addition, 4 out of every 10 women in Çankaya stated that the street lighting in their neighborhood is insufficient. When it is evaluate in line with the results of qualitative research showing that it is a security issue to make the streets safe to walk, it should be underlined that the request of women living in Çankaya to take measures in this regard is extremely important.

Inclusive employment policy and empowering women's entrepreneurship: According to the research findings, women living in Çankaya expect that the Municipality will prioritize the disadvantaged women groups in line with employment policies and take all necessary measures. In this context, W9 (age 42) stated that "employment opportunities should be created for women", and W10 (age 47) underlined the importance of "positive discrimination" practices in the process of developing these opportunities: At this point, many women have stated that the "regulations regarding the employment of the disabled" are also "need to be considered" when the social services is developed.

Accessible, free, inclusive sports/recreation areas and cultural activities: Women living in Çankaya generally request from the municipality "to increase the number of social places for children and young people", "to establish new spaces for women to get socialized such as ladies clubs", "to have more strict smoking controls in venues", "to make sports venues open for public" and "to establish spaces for the elderly/retired people to get socialized". Within the scope of qualitative research findings, there are many suggestions that sports services, in particular offered by the

Municipality, must be free, accessible and inclusive for the disadvantaged groups, especially for the disabled women.

In this context, it is stated that the number of places where culture and arts activities through with women with different characteristics come together to raise the awareness on discrimination must be increased on a local basis. Besides, women has demanded for activity hours and calendar need to be re-arranged based on different groups such as working people and non-working people, those with and without children, the retired and the young.

Services for a healthy environment and increasing accessible and safe green spaces with public toilets: Research findings has shown that problems such as environmental pollution caused by garbage, non-recyclable wastes and car exhausts; lack of green areas and not being able to prevent noise pollution in central areas are among the most "disturbing" issues for Çankaya women. Especially those who suffer from chronic asthma, such as W15 (age 65) argue that new arrangements need to be put into practice to prevent air and noise pollution. In this respect, many women have presented to increase green spaces in the city as a suggestion for this problem. Regarding to green spaces, many women has stressed that accessibility and safety of the parks with clean public toilets are important for all. In this direction, one out of every 10 women in Çankaya thinks that the hygiene and sanitary conditions of public toilets need to be improved. Another point that should be emphasized regarding public toilets is that "gender-neutral toilets" appeared to be a demand for the disabled because it is huge problem especially for the disabled children. Regarding this problem W2 has stated that "I think, that's why all options must be available [to] not force a woman who does not want to use the same toilet as men" (age 33, physically-disabled).

Animal rights services: The findings of the research have pointed to certain services that are demanded by women of Çankaya regarding

feeding, safety and sheltering of the animals who become a part of their lives as "a member of the family". In this respect, the basic demands of "building special routes and placing food pots for pets", "increasing the animal services", "protecting the stray dogs in the parks", "improving the number, quality and capacity of shelters" and "making social places more inclusive for animals" have been come to the fore.

Discussion and Conclusion

The purpose of this study was to develop a comprehensive understanding on women's access to urban welfare/social services issues and solutions for developing urban welfare/social services sensitive to gender needs of women. Within this aim, this article has identified that urban infrastructure and welfare/social services of Çankaya cannot respond to the gender needs of women living here and cause to their dissatisfaction about the existing urban services and municipal activities. At this point, it is seen that the dissatisfaction of the women living in Çankaya is not only related to themselves, but is generally related to the inability to meet the needs of the children, the elderly, the disabled or pets that they care about due to their gender responsibilities in care relations. This is very important to show that urban services developed without aiming to empower and emancipate women in their traditional gender relations defining the boundaries of private and public space will be "inadequate" for many residents of that city.

The results of the research also show that a new perspective should be develop that focuses on the transformation of gender relations within space rather than mainstreaming gender equality, as Moser (2016) emphasizes. In this direction, it is needed to transform gender relations from the private areas of the houses to the streets, underpasses, transportation systems, and from there to the welfare institutions that provide health and care services. As it is often stated in the literature, gender equality action plans and gender sensitive budgetings developed without

this perspective will not go beyond trying to include the needs of women in the existing urban structure, therefore they are either "inadequate" (Doan, 2010; Meadow, 2010; Spain, 2014) or "will continue to be considered as works that create discrimination" and "inequality" (Sánchez de Madariaga and Roberts, 2013, Beebeejaun, 2017). In this respect, when looking at the suggestions developed by the women living in Çankaya, the basic principles of urban welfare/social services that women focus on are very important to be considered. According to them, having "free of charge", "accessible", "inclusive", "safe and secure", "empowering", "healthy" and "right-based" urban infrastructure services and welfare/social services should be the priorities of any cities.

Thus, there is a need to develop new models that will hear the voice of women in urban planning and management. Taking measures to enable women to take part in decision-making positions by increasing the inclusion of women in local politics should be considered. There is also a need to develop participatory approaches that will make women's diversifying characteristics and differing needs visible. At this point, it should be noted that both quantitative and qualitative research results has emphasized that central and local government institutes must work in cooperation with civil society and academia to improve the accessibility of urban services. It has also been stated that collaborations to be developed with academia and civil society are very important in determining the needs of Çankaya residents with different characteristics who encounter accessibility problems in the city and planning urban services by taking these needs into account.

References

- Hatiboğlu-Kısat (2022). Gendered experiences of loneliness during COVID-19 isolation: Insights for intersectional feminist social work – the case of Çankaya/Ankara, Turkey. *International Social Work*, 0(0), 193-205. <https://doi.org/10.1177/00208728221119283>.
- Akduran, Ö., Önal, A. Y., & Şenesen, G. G. (2018). Kentsel haklar ve hizmetlere erişimde toplumsal cinsiyet eşitliği haritalama ve izleme raporu. <http://www.ceidizleme.org/medya/dosya/81.pdf> (accessed 22.10.2022)
- Alkan, A. (2006). *Belediye kadınlara da hizmet eder! kadın dostu belediye hizmetleri: Neden, nasıl?.* Ka-Der.
- Beebeejaun, Y. (2017). Gender, urban space, and the right to everyday life. *Journal of Urban Affairs*, 39(3): 323-334, DOI: 10.1080/07352166.2016.1255526
- Buckingham, S. (2010). Examining the right to the city from a gender perspective'. A. Sungraynes, and C.Mathivet (eds) *Cities For All. Proposals and experiences towards the right to the city.* Habitat International Coalition, HIC.
- Charter for Women's Right to the City (2004). <http://www.ceidizleme.org/ekutuphane/143> (accessed 02.10.2021)
- Creswell, J. W. (2014). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative and mixed methods approaches (4th ed.)*. Sage Publication.
- Çankaya Municipality's Strategic Plan (2015-2019). <http://www.Çankaya.bel.tr/stratejikPlan.html> (accessed 01.10.2021)
- Çankaya Municipality's Strategic Plan (2019-2020). http://www.Çankaya.bel.tr/uploads/files/ÇANKAYA_BELEDIYE_STRATEJIK_PLAN.pdf (accessed 01.10.2021)
- Çankaya Municipality's Local Equality Action Plan 2016-2019. http://www.charter-equality.eu/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/TR_Çankaya-municipality-local-equality-action-plan-TURKISHENGLISH.pdf (accessed 01.10.2021)
- Çankaya Municipality's web site <http://www.Çankaya.bel.tr> (accessed 01.10.2021)
- Doan, P. (2010). The tyranny of gendered spaces - reflections from beyond the gender dichotomy. *Gender, Place and Culture*, 17(5), 635-654.
- European Charter of Local Self-Governance (1985). https://www.tbb.gov.tr/mevzuat/kanunlar/Avrupa_Yerel_Yonetimler_ozerklik_Sarti.pdf (accessed 22.10.2022)
- European Urban Charter (2008). <https://rm.coe.int/urban-charter-ii-manifesto-for-a-new-urbanity-publication-a5-58-pages-168095e1d5> (accessed 22.10.2022)

- Fenster, T. (2005). The right to the gendered city: Different formations of belonging in everyday life. *Journal of Gender Studies*, 14, 217-231.
- Berg, B. L., & Lune, H. (2019). *Sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştırma yöntemleri*. (Çev. H. Aydın) (4. baskı). Eğitim Yayınevi.
- Meadow, T. (2010). "A rose is a rose": On producing legal gender classifications. *Gender and Society*, 24(6), 8.
- Mertens, D. M. (2009). *Transformative research and evaluation*. Guilford.
- Moser, C. (2016). Gender transformation in a new global urban agenda: challenges for Habitat III and beyond. *Environment & Urbanization*, 29(1), 221–236. DOI: 10.1177/0956247816662573.
- Sánchez de Madariaga, I. (2013). From women in transport to gender in transport: Challenging conceptual frameworks for improved policymaking. *Journal of International Affairs, The Gender Issue: Beyond Exclusion*, 67(1), 43-65.
- Spain, D. (2014). Gender and urban space. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 40, 581–598.
- TUİK (2018). 2018 Türkiye Population Statistics, <http://www.tuik.gov.tr/> (accessed 15.10.2021)
- TUİK (2019). 2019 Türkiye Population Statistics, <http://www.tuik.gov.tr/> (accessed 15.10.2021)
- United Nations Entity for Gender and The Empowerment of Women [UN-WOMEN]. (2015). The beijing platform for action. <https://beijing20.unwomen.org/en/about> (accessed 15.10.2022).

Funding

This work was supported by the Bahri Savcı Human Rights Research Support Program of Human Rights Joint Platform in Turkey (grant number: NEAR-TS/2017/391-682, 2020).