

Reading The Allusions in Terry Pratchett's *Wyrd Sisters* and its Turkish Translation through the Lens of Intertextuality

Terry Pratchett'in *Wyrd Sisters* Adlı Eserinde ve Eserin Türkçe Çevirisinde Yer Alan Anırtırmaların Metinlerarasılık Aracılığıyla Okunması

Araştırma/Research

Kübra ÇELİK

Lect. Dr., Middle East Technical University School of Foreign Languages, Department of Basic English, kubracel@metu.edu.tr, ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2611-7082>

ABSTRACT

In this study, the intertextual allusions in the fantasy novel *Wyrd Sisters* by Terry Pratchett were classified, and their Turkish translations by Niran Elçi were analysed descriptively. As the name of the book signals with its similarity to the "Weird Sisters" or "Three Witches" in Shakespeare's *Macbeth*, it includes several intertextual references, including but not limited to Shakespeare's works. In order to exemplify these intertextual references, six intertextual allusions detected in the source text were first analysed in terms of their forms according to Ritva Leppihalme's (1997) categorization of allusions. Then they were classified as being implicit or explicit intertextual references based on the intertextuality theory suggested by Michael Riffaterre (1978). Following the classification of the intertextual allusions in the source text, translation strategies employed in the Turkish translation of the text were analysed in line with the strategies suggested by Leppihalme (1997). As a result of this study, it was found that three of the intertextual allusions are key phrases, and three of them are proper nouns. As proper nouns include the name of the intertextual reference explicitly, they are all examples of obligatory intertextuality. On the other hand, the key phrases in the source text are implicit intertextual references. For this reason, they exemplify ordinary intertextuality based on Riffaterre's (1978) intertextuality theory. The comparative analysis reveals that the translator utilized a variety of translation strategies to render important phrases and proper nouns. In the translation of the key phrases, "minimum change or literal translation" is the most commonly used strategy; however, in translating the proper nouns, the translator has used three different strategies which are "using the name, adding detailed information", "using the name with some guidance" and "replacement by another source language name". Intertextual allusions have significant roles in completing the meaning universe

of a text. This study shows that grasping the explicit or implicit allusions in the translation process contributes a great deal not only to the choice of the translation strategy but also to the transfer of the meaning universe.

Keywords: intertextuality, allusion, translation strategies, *Wyrd Sisters*, literary translation

ÖZET

Bu çalışmada Terry Pratchett'in *Wyrd Sisters* adlı fantastik romanında yer alan metinlerarası anıştırmalar sınıflandırılmış ve Niran Elçi tarafından Türkçeye yapılan çevirileri betimleyici bir biçimde incelenmiştir. Eser adının, Shakespeare'in *Macbeth*'inde yer alan "Üç Cadı" ya da "Tuhaf Kız Kardeşler" ile benzerliğinin gösterdiği üzere söz konusu eser Shakespeare'in eserlerini de kapsayan pek çok metinlerarası gönderme içerir. Bu metinlerarası göndermeleri örneklendirmek amacıyla özgün metinde saptanan altı metinlerarası anıştırma, Leppihalme'nin (1997) sunduğu yöntem doğrultusunda biçimsel olarak sınıflandırılmıştır. Bu sınıflandırmanın ardından söz konusu anıştırmalar açık ya da örtük metinlerarası göndermeler olmalarına göre Riffaterre'in (1978) metinlerarasılık kuramı doğrultusunda değerlendirilmiştir. Metinlerarasılık kuramının sunduğu bakış açısıyla sınıflandırılan anıştırmaların Türkçeye ne şekilde aktarıldığı Leppihalme'nin (1997) ortaya koyduğu çeviri stratejileri ile değerlendirilmiştir. Bu çalışmanın sonucunda saptanan metinlerarası anıştırmaların üçünün biçimsel olarak anahtar cümlecik, diğer üçünün ise özel ad olduğu ortaya konulmuştur. Özel adlara yapılan anıştırmalar, gönderme yapılan adı açıkça içermeleri nedeniyle "zorunlu metinlerarasılık" örnekleriyken, anahtar cümleciklerin örtük metinlerarası anıştırmalar oldukları görülmüştür. Bu nedenle saptanan anahtar cümleciklerin tümü Riffaterre' in (1978) metinlerarasılık kuramına dayanarak "sıradan metinlerarasılık" örnekleri olarak sınıflandırılmıştır. Yapılan karşılaştırmalı değerlendirme sonucunda çevirmenin özel ad ve anahtar cümlecikleri çevirirken farklı stratejilere başvurduğu görülmüştür. Anahtar cümleciklerin çevirisinde en çok tercih edilen strateji "en az değişim, doğrudan çeviri" iken özel adların çevirisinde "detaylı bilgi eklenerek ismin kullanılması", "ismin yönlendirmeler eklenerek kullanılması" ve "ismin kaynak dildeki başka bir ad ile değiştirilmesi" olmak üzere üç farklı stratejiye başvurulmuştur. Metinlerarası anıştırmalar metnin anlam evrenini tamamlamakta önemli bir role sahiptir. Bu çalışmada, çeviri sürecinde açık ya da örtük anıştırmaların farkında olunmasının yalnızca kullanılacak çeviri stratejisinin belirlenmesinde değil metnin anlam evreninin aktarılmasında da büyük bir paya sahip olduğu görülmüştür.

Anahtar Sözcükler: metinlerarasılık, anıştırma, çeviri stratejileri, *Wyrd Sisters*, yazın çevirisi

1. Introduction

As a prominent concept in literary and cultural studies, intertextuality refers to the interconnection between two or more texts, including literary works, historical documents or figures, or popular cultural artifacts. According to Julia Kristeva (1986), any text is derived from a "mosaic of quotations". Thus, the analysis of intertextual relations has a significant role in understanding the meaning universe of a text. Not only readers are expected to notice these references within a literary text. As an active participant who interprets and engages with the source text before conveying it to the target culture, translators are first and foremost the readers of the text they are going to translate. Thus, understanding the intertextual references constitutes an important part of the translation process.

There are several studies that work on intertextual allusions together with their translations. Mesut Kuleli (2014) examined the intertextual allusions in Orhan Pamuk's novel *Silent House* and analysed their translation into Turkish in his article titled "Intertextual allusions and evaluation of their translation in the novel *Silent House* by Orhan Pamuk". This study revealed that certain allusions were translated into Turkish through over-interpretation. Selen Tekalp (2020) is another researcher who worked on intertextual allusions and their translations in her article named "A study on the self-translation of allusions in *Bit Palas* by Elif Shafak". In this paper, Tekalp explored how intertextual allusions were transferred into another language by the same author/translator. The study revealed that Shafak translated most of the allusions with the use of foreignization strategy.

The present study aims to exemplify the intertextual allusions in Terry Pratchett's *Wyrd Sisters* (1988) and analyse the translation strategies adopted in its Turkish translation. The name of the book, *Wyrd Sisters*, stands as the starting point of this study as it immediately evokes connections with the *Weird Sisters*, that is, the characters in Shakespeare's *Macbeth* who are also known as Three Witches. This similarity signals the possible intertextual relations the text may include, which has a significant role for the reader in grasping the essence of the literary work. As a translator is first the reader of the text that she or he will translate, understanding these intertextual references constitutes an important part of the translation process. This study was conducted to demonstrate how a literary text was woven with intertextual references and to analyse the strategies adopted in their translation process. With this study, it is expected to highlight the importance of intertextual references in shaping a literary text's meaning universe and underscore the immense influence of the translator's choices in conveying these references.

2. Literature Review

Intertextuality is a literary theory, which refers to the interrelation between two or more texts. Russian literary theorist Mikhail Bakhtin (1981) is the first to introduce the concept of intertextuality even though he was not the person who coined the term. According to Bakhtin (1981), language exists in particular social contexts. He asserts that the meaning of words may be unique, but still, they are rooted in already existing patterns of meaning. In his theory, no word or utterance exists independently, in other words, monumentally as everything is derived from a collection of earlier works. Bakhtin (1981) mainly based his arguments about intertextuality on dialogism which means that the meaning and logic of all utterances depend on what previously has been said and how they previously have been perceived by others. Dialogism was the most significant concept coined by Bakhtin (1981), and it paved the way for intertextuality to be processed into a theory by Julia Kristeva.

Although Bakhtin (1981) made significant contributions to the growth of the idea of intertextuality, Kristeva (1986) is the first person who coined the term intertextuality. Kristeva criticized semiotics for ignoring the human subjects who create and interpret utterances. She based her arguments primarily on Bakhtin's idea (Kristeva, 1986).

According to Kristeva, the text is a collection of cultural textuality rather than an independent or isolated thing. Therefore, it does not have a unified meaning on its own. Instead, its meaning is understood with previously existing meaning (Kristeva, 1986).

Michael Riffaterre (1978) is another influential literary theorist who contributed to intertextuality. He gave the utmost importance to the reader's perception and defined the term intertextuality as the reader's perception of relationships that exist between two works, one of which exists previously. To Riffaterre (1990), a text cannot be read satisfactorily or completely without going through the intertext. He is one of the theorists who adopt a reader-centered approach. According to him, the validity of intertextual references is linked to the readers' understanding.

According to Riffaterre (1990), an author should create intertextual reference gaps for the reader to complete on purpose. He asserts that the text comes first, then the reader, and last the interpretation (Mishra, 1985). He divides reading into two stages from which determinate interpretation arises. The first stage is mimetic reading in which words are in direct relation to things. He asserts that in this stage of reading, the reader may face ungrammaticalities, which is a term coined by Riffaterre (1978) and refers to the distortions of rules of language existing in a text. When the reader encounters ungrammaticalities, s/he will need to look elsewhere for the interpretation of the work which occurs only in a second or retroactive stage of reading. The reader tries to interpret these ungrammaticalities through the intertextual links with preexisting texts.

Riffaterre (1978) claims that the word "hypogram" appears so frequently in the text through grammatical errors that it forces the reader to identify it by reading backward, which helps the reader recognize the intertextual aspect of the text. The term "hypogram", which was first used by Riffaterre in 1978, refers to the central element around which a text is built. According to Riffaterre, if a grammatical unit or an idea is taken directly from another text, it qualifies as a "hypogram". It is possible to conclude that Riffaterre believed that a literary work is not unconnected, but rather it is the result of inspiration from another text or the society in which it exists, which is congruent with Bakhtin and Kristeva's theories. According to Aktulum (2011), Riffaterre distinguishes between two types of intertextuality, which are "obligatory intertextuality" and "ordinary intertextuality". "Ordinary intertextuality" refers to more implicit references that necessitate extensive background knowledge in order to be realized or understood. This type of intertextuality can be established through allusions or implicit quotations, so grasping this kind of intertextual reference is entirely dependent on the cultural and literary capacity of the reader. In other words, "ordinary intertextuality" refers to covert or weak intertextual relations. They can be easily gone unnoticed by the reader who doesn't have the necessary background knowledge (Aktulum, 2011, p. 466). However, "obligatory intertextuality" refers to ungrammaticality in a text. The formal or semantic marks of the intertextual reference compel readers to make a retroactive reading. This type of intertextuality depends on the text, not on the reader. As it is linked to an ungrammaticality, it is hard for a reader to miss the intertextual reference. As a result of the uneasiness led by the ungrammaticality, the reader feels obliged to find out the intertextual relation (p. 487), and if a reader has a broad historical, cultural, or literal

background, s/he will easily discover ungrammaticalities via retroactive reading (Kuleli, 2018, p. 319).

Leppihalme is another theorist who contributed to the concept of intertextuality with her work on intertextual allusions and their translations. Leppihalme defined allusions with the terms like reference, quotation, citation, borrowing, and intertextuality. She also referred to allusions as “cultural bumps” while defining them. She claims that a cultural bump happens when someone had unfamiliar or unsettling feelings after coming into contact with anything from a different culture. Allusions have been divided into two kinds by Leppihalme (1997): “proper name (PN) allusions” and “key phrase (KP) allusions”. While in proper noun allusions, the name is explicitly stated, in key phrase allusions, a term that alludes to the name is used in place of a name. In proper noun allusions, names may include figures of real life or fiction, well-known artists, writers, etc. On the other hand, sources of key phrase allusions may include films, songs, tales, proverbs, slogans, various catchphrases, popular beliefs, and stories. Leppihalme defined allusions as culture-bound elements which have a meaning and are more than mere words. She suggests that both a reader and a translator must be knowledgeable enough to see not only explicit but also implicit references to be able to recognize and translate something that belongs to another culture.

Leppihalme (1997) proposes several translation strategies to address the aforementioned issues. There are three basic categories, each with subclasses, for translation of proper noun references, which are keeping the name in its original form (using the name in the source text; using the name with some guidance; using the name, providing a detailed explanation); replacing the name with another name (with another SL name; with a name in the target language), and omitting the name (omitting the name, but transferring the sense in another way; for example, by a common noun; omitting both the name and the allusion) (Leppihalme, 1997, pp. 78-79). On the other hand, Leppihalme (1997) also proposes nine distinct ways to translate key phrase allusions, which are using standard translation; making little changes in the translation; including extra-allusive textual advice; overtly including further material in the form of footnotes, endnotes, or prefaces; internally tagging the borrowed terms to draw attention to them, substituting a ready-made target language item; rephrasing the allusion and emphasizing its significance, re-creating the allusion by writing a section that matches its impact; entirely ignoring the allusion (p. 84). According to Bahrami (2011, p. 9), being aware of these strategies helps novice translators make conscious decisions on translating intertextual allusions. Ignoring the allusions the text includes, translators may lead the loss of the meaning hidden in intertextual allusions for the target reader, and the competent translator is aware of this possibility.

3. Method

The novel *Wyrd Sisters* (1988) by Terry Pratchett and its Turkish translation were examined in this study. Terry Pratchett was a renowned British author who gained his reputation with his Discworld series which is a collection of 41 fantasy books set in a flat, disc-shaped world. He is well-known for combining elements of fantasy, satire, humour,

and social commentary to create a rich and imaginative world. The characters in the Discworld series are the tools for Pratchett to process various significant themes, such as multiculturalism or death (Mustonen, 2016, p. 11). The books in the series do not follow a linear narrative, but rather interconnected stories set in the same world.

The research object of this study, *Wyrd Sisters*, is the sixth book of the Discworld series. The story takes place in the kingdom of Lancre where magic is a part of everyday life. The main characters are three witches: Granny Weatherwax, Nanny Ogg and Magrat Garlick. Setting the story in a kingdom and surrounding it with the magic done by the three witches strengthen Pratchett's hand to use several Shakespearean references. However, the intertextual references are not limited to the works of Shakespeare. It's possible to encounter various intertextual references to other literary works, authors, musicians, or mythical characters.

The Turkish translation of the novel, *Ucube Kocakarılar*, was translated by Niran Elçi in 2016 and published by Delidolu Publishing House which introduced Pratchett's Discworld series into Turkish with over 30 translated books. Elçi is best renowned for her translations of fantasy novels, but she is also the writer of a children's series named Karaböcü. She has translated more than 80 fantasy books, including the works of J.R.R. Tolkien, Neil Gaiman and Terry Pratchett. Her word choice and language style are appreciated because of her success to provide the reader with a joyful reading (Türk Edebiyatı İsimler Sözlüğü, n.d.)¹.

In this study, the information found in the source and target texts was examined qualitatively. The theory of Riffaterre (1978) and the classification of intertextual references by Leppihalme (1997) were used in this study to collect data. First, the intertextual allusions were analysed in terms of their forms based on Leppihalme's (1997) theory which includes proper name allusions and key phrase allusions as the two basic categories.

After this classification, the allusions were classified according to Riffaterre's theory as "ordinary intertextuality" and "obligatory intertextuality" with regard to their being implicit or explicit intertextual references. Following the analysis of the intertextual allusions based on Riffaterre and Leppihalme's theories, a retroactive reading was made so as to find their sources and ground them on concrete examples. As they are intertextual allusions, the references that they first appeared were also reported in order to show the source of the intertextual relation. In addition to the allusions in the source text being classified, the Turkish translation of the novel was also analyzed to see the translation strategies used to translate these allusions. In this analysis, translation strategies proposed by Leppihalme (1997) for the translation of allusions were taken as the basis.

4. Findings

In this part of the study, six intertextual allusions in the *Wyrd Sisters* (1988) were classified in terms of their form based on Leppihalme (1997)'s classification of the

¹ Türk Edebiyatı İsimler Sözlüğü: <https://teis.yesevi.edu.tr/madde-detay/elci-niran> [21.06.2022]

allusions. As the name of the book signals, *Wyrd Sisters* includes intertextual relations first and foremost with *Macbeth*. In addition, it refers to various other works, people or figures from literature, art and mythology. In order to exemplify this variety, six representative examples were chosen for the analysis. Two intertextual allusions were chosen among the allusions to *Macbeth*, and the remaining allusions were selected from references to literary works, musicians, and mythological figures. Following the classification of the allusions, the intertextual relations were analysed according to Riffaterre (1978)'s intertextuality theory. After the classification of the intertextual allusions in the source text, their Turkish translations were analysed in line with the translation strategies propounded by Leppihalme. The examples were presented according to the order they appear in the source text. Both the English excerpts and their Turkish translations are presented in the tables.

Example 1

In this example of intertextual allusion, Pratchett refers to *Macbeth*.

Table 1

An intertextual reference to *Macbeth*

<i>Wyrd Sisters (1988)</i>	<i>Ucube Kocakarılar (2016)</i>
Granny Weatherwax paused with a second scone halfway to her mouth. 'Something comes', she said. 'Can you tell it by the pricking of your thumbs? ' ² said Magrat earnestly. Magrat had learned a lot about witchcraft from books. 'The pricking of my ears,' said Granny. (Pratchett, 1988, p. 17).	Havamumu Nine ikinci çöreği ağzına götürürken durdu. 'Bir şey geliyor' dedi. ' Başparmaklarının karıncalanmasından mı anladın?' diye sordu Magrat merakla. Kitaplardan cadılıkla ilgili bir sürü şey öğrenmişti. 'Kulaklarımı dikerek anladım' dedi Nine (Pratchett, 2016, p. 16).

In these excerpts, Pratchett refers to *Macbeth* by using the key phrase "the pricking of your thumbs". The key phrase is taken from *Macbeth's* fourth scene, "By the pricking of my thumbs, something wicked this way comes" (Shakespeare, 1905, p. 861). In both *Macbeth* and *Wyrd Sisters*, the key phrase "pricking of my/your thumbs" takes place in a scene where the witch notices the visitor. The only difference in the key phrase is the use of the possessive adjective my/your. While in the source text, Shakespeare's words include "my", in *Wyrd Sisters* the same words are written with the possessive adjective "your". It can still be accepted as a word-to-word intertextual allusion as the other words are in the same form in both texts.

According to Leppihalme's (1997) classification, this excerpt can be classified as a key phrase allusion, as it directly refers to the phrase "pricking of my thumbs" (Shakespeare, 1905, p. 861) in *Macbeth*. Although the reference doesn't include the name of the reference, the careful reader who has the necessary background knowledge

² The intertextual allusions in the tables were written in bold by the writer of this article in order to help readers focus on the particular elements.

may grasp this intertextual relation at first sight. Also, the writer warns the reader about the intertextual reference covertly by indicating that “Magrat had learned a lot about witchcraft from the books” (Pratchett, 1988, p. 17). Since grasping these references depends on the reader’s prior knowledge, rather than the text, it represents an example of ordinary intertextuality according to Riffaterre’s theory.

In the translation analysis, it was observed that Elçi translated the key phrase as “Baş parmaklarının karıncalanmasından...” (Pratchett, 2016, p. 16). This key phrase was translated as “Baş parmaklarımın kaşınmasına...” in the translated version of *Macbeth* (Shakespeare, 1999) that is used in the present study. Thus, it may be concluded that the translation is interrelated with the Turkish version of *Macbeth*. In addition, considering the strategies propounded by Leppihalme for translating key phrase allusions, it can be stated that the “minimum change or literal translation” strategy was applied in the translation of the key phrase. It can be concluded that translating this word-to-word key phrase with the “minimum change” strategy may help the target reader grasp the intertextual reference as the target readers are familiar with Shakespeare’s works from the books and plays.

Example 2

Another intertextual allusion in *Wyrd Sisters* is a reference to a literary work, *Gormenghast* by Mervyn Peake.

Table 2

An intertextual reference to Gormenghast

<i>Wyrd Sisters (1988)</i>	<i>Ucube Kocakarılar (2016)</i>
Lancre Castle was built on an outcrop of rock by an architect who had heard about Gormenghast but hadn’t got the budget (Pratchett, 1988, p. 27).	Lancre Şatosu, Gormenghast ’* duyan, fakat yeterli bütçesi olmayan bir mimar tarafından, bir kayalığın tepesine inşa edilmişti. *İngiliz yazar Mervyn Peake’in gotik roman serisi [EN] (Pratchett, 2016, p. 26).

In these lines, Pratchett describes Lancre Castle with a reference to Gormenghast Castle which refers to Mervyn Peake’s *Gormenghast* series. As an example of gothic horror fiction, they are known for using representatives of gothic architecture. Pratchett describes the castle in detail by referring to some architectural elements that belong to Gothic buildings. However, she still mentions Gormenghast obviously. It’s probable for the reader who is familiar with Peake’s work to have an existing mental picture of a Gothic castle (Pullinen, 2016). However, the reader who has little or no knowledge about Peake’s work needs to go through a retroactive reading process. In terms of form, the intertextual allusion is an example of proper noun allusion according to the distinction made by Leppihalme (1997) as it includes the name of the reference. As the reference is mentioned by name, the reader will easily be aware of the presence of an intertextual allusion; therefore, it is an example of “obligatory intertextuality” according to Riffaterre’s theory.

In the translation analysis, it was observed that an editorial note had been added to the translation of this proper noun. In the light of the strategies proposed by Leppihalme for translating proper noun allusions, it is seen that the “using the name, adding a detailed explanation, for instance, a footnote” strategy under the “keeping the name in its original form” strategy was applied in the translation of this proper noun. With the use of this strategy, the target reader was informed about the intertextual reference in order to avoid any oversights.

Example 3

There is another excerpt that is a reference to a famous writer, Arthur Bertram Chandler.

Table 3

An intertextual reference to Arthur Bertram Chandler

<i>Wyrd Sisters (1988)</i>	<i>Ucube Kocakarılar (2016)</i>
See you turned up then. Have a drink. Have two. Watcher, Magrat. Pull up a chair and call the cat a bastard (Pratchett, 1988, p. 46).	Geldin demek. Bir içki al. İki tane al. Selam Magrat. Bir sandalye çek ve kediye piç de * *Ünlü yazar Arthur Berthram Chandler'in John Grimes isimli karakterinin ünlü vecizesi [EN] (Pratchett, 2016, p. 86).

“Pull up a chair and call the cat a bastard” is a quote used by the famous writer Arthur Bertram Chandler in the *John Grimes* novels. Since this intertextual allusion refers to a catchphrase by a famous writer, it may be classified as a “key phrase” allusion according to Leppihalme’s (1997) classification. The quote is the same as in the original work. However, it is still a covert reference, and it is hard for the reader to grasp without the necessary background knowledge. Because this intertextual reference depends on the reader, it is an example of “ordinary intertextuality” according to Riffaterre’s theory.

In the translation analysis, it was observed that Elçi translated the key phrase as “bir sandalye çek ve kediye piç de” (Pratchett, 2016, p. 86). The translation analysis based on Leppihalme’s classification shows that “provide additional information via footnotes, endnotes” strategy has been applied in the translation of the aforementioned key phrase. Also, there is an editorial footnote: “İngiliz yazar Arthur Bertham Chandler’in John Grimes isimli karakterinin ünlü vecizesi.” This example shows that not only the translator but also other actors like the editor or publisher influence the translation process. With that choice, the covert intertextual allusion in the source text was turned into an overt one in the target text.

Example 4

In the following example, Pratchett uses an intertextual allusion that is almost identical to the original.

Table 4

An intertextual reference to *Macbeth*

<i>Wyrd Sisters (1988)</i>	<i>Ucube Kocakarılar (2016)</i>
The duke took it with an expression of pathetic gratitude and blew his nose. Then he held it away from him and gazed at it with demented suspicion. 'Is this a dagger I see before me?' he mumbled. 'Um. No, my lord. It's my handkerchief, you see. You can sort of tell the difference if you look closely. It doesn't have as many sharp edges' (Pratchett, 1988, p. 85).	Dük mendili dokunaklı bir minnettarlıkla aldı ve burnunu sildi. Sonra mendili bir kol boyu uzaklıkta tuttu ve kaçık bir şüpheyle baktı. ' Bu önümde gördüğüm bir hançer mi? ' diye mırıldandı. 'Şey. Hayır lordum. Bu benim mendilim. Dikkatle bakarsanız farkı görürsünüz. Hiç keskin kenarı yok' (Pratchett, 2016, p. 81).

This excerpt represents an example of intertextual allusion to Act 2 Scene 1 of Shakespeare's (1905, 851-852) *Macbeth*. In both the *Wyrd Sisters* and *Macbeth*, the excerpt "Is this a dagger I see before me?" shows hallucinations of the knife. The phrase is taken directly from *Macbeth*.

In these excerpts, "Is this a dagger I see before me" is a word-to-word intertextual allusion. As it refers to a phrase from *Macbeth*, it may be classified as a "key phrase" allusion according to Leppihalme's (1997) classification. Although the excerpt represents an absurd conversation between the fool and the duke, it may not force the reader to make a retroactive reading. In order for the reader to realize this intertextual reference, s/he should have the background knowledge that is related to *Macbeth*. Since conceiving this intertextual reference depends on the reader, rather than the text itself, it can be classified as an example of "ordinary intertextuality" according to Riffaterre's theory.

In the translation analysis, it was seen that Elçi translated the key phrase as "Bu önümde gördüğüm bir hançer mi?" (Pratchett, 2016, p. 81). Although there are various translated versions of *Macbeth*, the key phrase was translated as "Şu önümde gördüğüm bir hançer mi?" in the translated version (1999) that is used in the present study. Thus, it is possible for Turkish readers who have known *Macbeth* beforehand to be aware of the allusion as there is a slight difference between the translated versions of this excerpt. The translation analysis shows that the "minimum change or literal translation" strategy has been applied in the translation of the key phrase. With that choice, the covert intertextual reference in the source text stays the same as the target text in terms of being implicit or explicit.

Example 5

In the following example, Pratchett refers to a mythical character by name.

Table 5

An intertextual reference to Venus Anadyomene

<i>Wyrd Sisters (1988)</i>	<i>Ucube Kocakarılar (2016)</i>
She struggled up through the weed, incoherent with rage, and rose from the ditch like Venus Anadyomene , only older and with more duckweed (Pratchett, 1988, p. 168).	Doğan Venüs gibi, ama daha yaşlı ve daha ot kaplı bir Denizden Doğan Venüs gibi, hendekten çıktı (Pratchett, 2016, p. 162).

In this example, the writer refers to Venus Anadyomene who literary refers to Venus rising from the sea (Southgate, 1998) and represents Aphrodite in essence. Various paintings show Aphrodite rising from the sea. Although Pratchett does not mention Aphrodite by name, the Western world is still familiar with the several different representations of Venus Anadyomene. Therefore, it is highly possible for them to have an image in mind without retroactive reading.

In terms of the form, it is an example of proper noun allusion according to Leppihalme's theory as it is the name of well-known paintings that depict the rise of Aphrodite over the sea. In these excerpts, the intertextual allusion, Venus Anadyomene, is mentioned by name. As the reference is explicit, it represents an example of "obligatory intertextuality" according to Riffaterre's theory.

With the consideration of Leppihalme's strategies for the translation of proper noun allusions, it is seen that the "replacement by another source language name" strategy was applied in the translation of the proper noun. The name Venus Anadyomene is not a well-known concept for the Turkish reader. Therefore, the translator refrains from using the name as such. Instead, s/he prefers clarifying it as the birth of Venus in order to create a mental image in the Turkish readers' minds.

Example 6

There is also another example of intertextual allusions encountered in the *Wyrd Sisters* where reference to the source was stated explicitly.

Table 6

An intertextual reference to Modest Mussorgsky

<i>Wyrd Sisters (1988)</i>	<i>Ucube Kocakarılar (2016)</i>
The witches sat in careful silence. This was not going to rate among the hundred most exciting coven meetings of all time. If Mussorgsky had seen them, the night on the bare mountain would have been over by teatime (Pratchett, 1988, p. 319).	Cadılar dikkatli bir sessizlik içinde oturuyorlardı. Tüm zamanların en heyecanlı yüz konsey toplantısı arasında sayılmayacaktı bu. Mussorgsky onları görmüş olsaydı, Çıplak Dağda Bir Gece , çay zamanı gelmeden bitmiş olurdu (Pratchett, 2016, p. 308).

In these excerpts, Pratchett referred to a famous Russian composer, Modest Mussorgsky, and his composition *Night on Bald Mountain* (1867). Although his famous composition has various forms, Mussorgsky wrote in a letter to Balakirev that he had been preparing for a new work based on Baron Mengden's drama, *The Witch* (Lochrie,

1992, 7). Accordingly, this composition includes a detailed description of the witches' annual meeting with the devil, in other words, the witches' sabbath.

Being mentioned by name, it is an example of the "proper name" allusion according to the distinction made by Leppihalme (1997) in terms of the form. In these lines, the writer mentions the intertextual references, Mussorgsky, and his famous composition by name; however, he doesn't present the composition as a proper noun.

The writer refers to these intertextual references overtly, but still, it includes ungrammaticalities as the name of the composition is presented ironically. It may compel the reader to make retroactive reading. Being an obvious reference, it represents an example of "obligatory intertextuality" according to Riffaterre's theory.

In the translation analysis, it was observed that Elçi kept the name "Mossorgsky" in the Turkish translation, and she translated "the night on the bare mountain" as "*Çıplak Dağda bir Gece*". Although some Turkish readers may not be familiar with this intertextual reference, the translator made it overt through the italics. When it is analyzed in terms of Leppihalme's classification, it is seen that "using the name with some guidance" under the "keeping the name in its original form" strategy was applied in the translation of the proper noun.

The analysis conducted over six examples shows the cross-textuality of Pratchett's *Wyrd Sisters* as it exemplifies the references to literary works, famous musicians, and mythological figures. While three of the intertextual allusions are in the form of key phrases, three of them are proper nouns. The key phrases are classified as examples of "ordinary intertextuality" due to the absence of explicit mention of the reference. On the other hand, the proper nouns are categorized as examples of "obligatory intertextuality" because these intertextual allusions include the name of the intertext obviously, that is, they are "nearly impossible to overlook" (Aktulum, 2011, p. 487). The translation analysis showed that the translator used five different strategies: "minimum change or literal translation", "providing additional information via footnotes, endnotes", "using the name, adding a detailed explanation, for instance, a footnote", "replacement by another source language name", and "using the name with some guidance". This diversity indicates that the translation strategies may change depending on the form of the intertextual allusion, the type of the intertextuality, and, importantly, the translator's choice based on her/his cross-cultural knowledge.

5. Conclusion

The concept of intertextuality is the focus of this article, which analyses allusions in Terry Pratchett's *Wyrd Sisters*. Containing plenty of intertextual elements, *Wyrd Sisters* was chosen as a research object. The data was gathered by scanning the book and looking for textual references. The novel has a lot of intertextual elements that are mostly implicit to the reader, so it requires a retroactive reading process in order to be understood thoroughly. In this novel, there are key phrases and proper noun allusions that refer to various kinds of intertexts.

As Riffaterre (1978) has already indicated, while some of the allusions are obvious, some others include implicit references. For the reader to grasp the intertextual allusion, the writer may get benefit from some ungrammaticalities. When the reader notices the grammatical irregularity, s/he feels compelled to read it backward, which refers to a retroactive reading process. In *Wyrd Sisters*, three key phrase and three proper noun allusions were detected. Two of the key phrases detected in the novel are based on Shakespeare's *Macbeth* while the last one is a famous quote by Arthur Bertram Chandler. Using the key phrases, the writer creates an interrelation between his own text and two other literary works. In the original texts, these are covert intertextual references because the writer places these catchphrases in ironic conversations without stating the name. The reader can only grasp these intertextual references if they have the necessary background knowledge. For this reason, these intertextual references were classified as examples of "ordinary intertextuality" based on Riffaterre's (1978) intertextuality theory. The translation analysis showed that the translator employed the "minimum change or literal translation" strategy in the translation of the key phrases from *Macbeth*. The translations of these key phrases were analysed comparatively with the Turkish translation of *Macbeth*. This analysis shows that it was translated in a way that the reader knowing *Macbeth* can grasp the relation between the two literary works easily. On the other hand, the third key phrase, which is a catchphrase by Arthur Bertram Chandler, was translated with the "providing additional information via footnotes, endnotes" strategy. This strategy turned the covert intertextual reference into an overt one in the target text. When the time and cultural environment of the original text are considered, the target text and the source text differ a lot. English readers might be familiar with this catchphrase because John Grimes was a popular series (*Author more honored abroad*, 1984) at the time when *Wyrd Sisters* (1988) was first published. The use of this strategy may result from this difference. On the other hand, there are also three proper noun allusions that refer to a literary work, a mythical character, and a musician and his composition respectively. Being explicit references, they are all examples of "obligatory intertextuality". In translating proper noun allusions, the translator preferred three different strategies, which are "using the name, adding a detailed explanation, for instance, a footnote"; "replacement by another source language name", and "using the name with some guidance". It's clear that by using these strategies, the translator aimed to make the implicit intertextual references clear for the target reader. It should be noted that not only the translator but also the other actors like the publisher or editor might have an impact on the translation.

The above discussion shows that the translator's decisions vary a lot in translating the intertextual allusion into the target culture. The varied translation strategies revealed the conscious choices of the translator in making the intertextual references overt to the reader. It is remarkable that the translator conveyed the intertextual references that the target reader may be familiar with, such as references to *Macbeth*, with the "minimum change or literal translation" strategy, but the intertextual allusions that Turkish readers may not recognize were made clear with the help of different strategies. The six intertextual allusions show the inter-connectedness of Pratchett's *Wyrd Sisters* (1988) with different texts from literature to mythology,

which may pose a challenge for the translator. The strategies applied in the translation of six intertextual allusions highlight the importance of rich cross-cultural knowledge for a translator. As this study focuses on the varied nature of the intertextual relations in *Wyrd Sisters* (1988) and the strategies applied in the translation process, six representative examples were chosen. However, it should be noted that the number of intertextual allusions is not limited to six. Further studies may be conducted to illustrate the intertextual nature of *Wyrd Sisters* (1988).

Intertextual references can only achieve their goal if the reader can understand them, according to Riffaterre (1978), who places the biggest significance on the reader's interpretation; however, the author may purposefully leave the reader's ability to make the necessary intertextual connections open. For the actors taking part in the translation process, grasping the explicit or implicit intertextual references in the source text is significant, as they have a crucial role in choosing the translation strategy.

References

- Aktulum, K. (2011). *Metinlerarasılık / Göstergelerarasılık*. Kanguru.
- Author more honored abroad*. (1984, June 20) The Canberra Times. Retrieved December 21, 2022, from <https://trove.nla.gov.au/newspaper/article/127003994>
- Bahrami, N. (2011). Strategies used in the translation of allusions in Hafiz Shirazi's poetry. *Journal of Language and Culture*, 3(1), 1-9. <http://doi.org/10.5897/JLC11.058>
- Bakhtin, M. (1981). *The dialogic imagination: four essays* (C. Emerson & M. Holquist, Trans.). University of Texas Press.
- Kuleli, M. (2014). Intertextual allusions and evaluation of their translation in the novel *Silent House* by Orhan Pamuk. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 158, 206-213. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.12.075>
- Kuleli, M. (2018). Intertextuality in translation: Analysis of intertextual signs and evaluation of translation of a short story. *International Journal of Languages' Education and Teaching*, 6(3), 317-330. <https://doi.org/10.18298/ijlet.3157>
- Kristeva, J. (1986). Word, dialogue and novel. In J. Kristeva (Ed), *The Kristeva reader* (pp.35-61.) Columbia University Press.
- Leppihalme, R. (1997). *Culture bumps: An empirical approach to the translation of allusions*. Multilingual matters.
- Lochrie, D. W. (1992). *A critical evaluation of the current performance versions of Musorgsky's Night on Bald Mountain, based on the history and content of Musorgsky's original extant versions and a new orchestration of Night on Bald Mountain* [Unpublished doctoral thesis]. Ohio State University.
- Mishra, V. (1985). Text, textuality and interpretation: an interview with Michael Riffaterre. *Southern Review*, 18 (1), 109-119.

<https://researchportal.murdoch.edu.au/esploro/outputs/journalArticle/Text-textuality-and-interpretation-An-interview/991005544009707891>

- Mustonen, M. (2016). Translating wordplay: A case study on the translation of wordplay in Terry Pratchett's *Soul Music* [Unpublished master's thesis]. University of Turku.
- Pratchett, T. (1988). *Wyrd sisters*. Victor Gollanz Ltd.
- Pratchett, T. (2016). *Ucube kocakarılar*. Niran Elçi (Çev.). Tudem
- Pullinen, V. (2016). Intertextuality as a source of humour in Terry Pratchett's novels [Unpublished master's thesis]. University of Jyväskylä.
- Riffaterre, M. (1978). *Semiotics of poetry*. Indiana University Press. <https://doi.org/10.2979/SemioticsofPoetry>
- Riffaterre, M. (1990). *Fictional truth*. The Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Shakespeare, W. (1905). *The complete works of William Shakespeare*. Oxford University Press.
- Shakespeare, W. (1999). *The Tragedy of Macbeth* (Orhan Burian, Trans.). Çağdaş Yayıncılık.
- Southgate, M. T. (1998). Venus Anadyomene. *JAMA*, 279(11), 814-814.
- Tekalp, S. (2020). A study on the self-translation of allusions in *Bit Palas* By Elif Shafak. *New Voices in Translation Studies*, 22, 117-138. <https://newvoices.arts.chula.ac.th/index.php/en/article/view/421>
- Türk Edebiyatı İsimler Sözlüğü. (n.d.). Elçi, Niran. In *Türk Edebiyatı İsimler Sözlüğü* Retrieved June 21, 2022 from <https://teis.yesevi.edu.tr/madde-detay/elci-niran>