

THE TRANSFERRING OF FOLK TALES TO MODERN SOCIETY AND THE FORMULAS DETECTED IN THE TRANSFER OF FAIRY TALES

Recai BAZANCİR*

Abstract

It is wrong to understand traditionalism as the transfer of tradition from generation to generation without changing over the centuries. No matter which society the tradition lives in, it will always carry the principles and cultural elements from the social circles in which it lives. People who tell tales, sing folk songs, and dance halay are people who have the urge to create. This event is constantly constructed and re-constructed, not only through the complex interactions of performer audience but also through the subjects' contact and exchange of information. We conducted an experiment to understand multiple factors affecting the storytelling process/performance, and we wanted to look specifically at the subjects/individuals in storytelling in modern society and their functions. In our study, the motif-index catalog in Annti Aarne & Stith Thompson's "The Types of Folktales: A Classification and Bibliography" was classified by adapting it to the folk tale named "Çembel Tiyar". In the study, 25 participants were interviewed in the province of Van, and the changes in the tale according to time and place were briefly stated with examples. At the end of our experiment, it was observed that the tale has a dynamic structure, not a static one, by specifying the serious effects of education, tradition, value judgments, and social environment on the content of the tale. The study briefly exemplified for the researchers who will compile in the field, that physical conditions should also be taken into account in the transfer process. In this context, we believe that the study will contribute technically to the researchers who will make the compilation.

Keywords: Tale, Formula, Tradition, Transfer, Listener, Narrator

* Öğretim Görevlisi Dr., Van Yüzüncü Yıl Üniversitesi.

recaibazancir@gmail.com,

Orcid: 0000-0003-2393-508X

DOI: 10.53440/bad.1273957

Makale Türü: Araştırma Makalesi

(Makale Gönderim Tarihi: 30.03.2023 - Makale Kabul Tarihi: 2.06.2023)

Atf Bilgisi: Bazancir, R. (2023). The Transferring of Folk Tales to Modern Society and the Formulas Detected in the Transfer of Fairy Tales. *Bingöl Araştırmaları Dergisi*, (18), s. 37-54.

HALK MASALLARININ MODERN TOPLUMA AKTARILMASI VE MASAL AKTARIMLARINDA TESPİT EDİLEN FORMÜLLER

Öz

Gelenekçiliği, geleneğin yüzyıllar boyunca değişmeden nesilden nesile aktarılması olarak anlamak yanlıştır. Gelenek hangi toplumda yaşarsa yaşasın, içinde yaşadığı sosyal çevrelerden gelen ilke ve kültür öğelerini her zaman üzerinde taşıyacaktır. Masal anlatan, türküler söyleyen, halay çeken insanlar yaratma dürtüsüne sahip insanlardır. Bu bireyler ya kendi iradeleriyle, yanlış bir hatırayla ya da seyirciyi memnun etmek için geleneği bir ölçüde değiştirmektedirler. Böylece her yeni anlatıda, anlatıcının kişisel yaratma dürtüsünden ve toplumsal çevrenin koşullarından, geleneksel olandan inen zamansallıkla bir değişim yaşanır. Benzer şekilde, herhangi bir bireyin/öznenin eylemlerinin diğer bireylerle özneler arası etkileşim yoluyla ortaya çıktığını düşünüyoruz. Masal anlatma edimini, bu dinamik sürecin aynı zamanda öznelerarası olduğunu da söyleyebiliriz. Bu olay, yalnızca icracı-seyircinin karmaşık etkileşimleri yoluyla değil, aynı zamanda öznelerin teması ve bilgilerinin değiş tokuşu yoluyla sürekli olarak kurulur ve yeniden kurulur. Masal anlatma sürecini/performansını etkileyen birden fazla faktörü anlamak için bir deney yaptık ve özellikle modern toplumdaki masal anlatımındaki öznelere/bireylere ve onların işlevlerine bakmak istedik. Çalışmamızda Annti Aarne & Stith Thompson'un "The Types of Folktales: A Classification and Bibliography" adlı çalışmasındaki motif indeks kataloğu "Çember Tiyar" adlı halk masalına uyarlanarak sınıflandırılmıştır. Yapılan çalışmada Van ilinde 25 katılımcı ile görüşülmüş, masalın zamana ve mekana göre ne gibi değişikliklere uğradığı örneklerle kısaca belirtilmiştir. Deneyimizin sonunda eğitim durumu, gelenek, değer yargıları ve sosyal çevrenin masalın içeriğinde ne gibi ciddi etkileri olduğu belirtilerek masalın statik değil, dinamik bir yapısının olduğu gözlemlenmiştir. Çalışma, alanda derleme yapacak araştırmacılara, aktarım sürecinde fiziki şartların da göz önünde bulundurulması gerektiğini kısaca örneklendirmiştir. Bu bağlamda, çalışmanın derleme yapacak araştırmacılara teknik anlamda katkı sunacağı kanısındayız.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Halk Masalı, Formül, Gelenek, Transfer, Dinleyici, Anlatıcı.

Introduction

Our study deals with a fieldwork experiment conducted in Van, Turkey in 2009. 49 subjects selected for this experiment were students, a physician, teachers, a carpenter, a barber, housewives, a judge, farmers, a school superintendent, a restaurant owner, and an accountant. Oya Orhun ¹ a graduate student who also teaches in a high school narrated the folk tale Çember Tiyar (Aarne-Thompson, 1961: Type no 425-425A) to the subjects. After 7 to 15

1 Oya Orhun received her field and compilation studies from İlhan Başgöz during her graduate school term. He is a literature teacher who was born and raised in Van and has the oral culture of the region.

days, the subjects retold the tale to Oya Orhun, one by one or before a group of three or more in a classroom, in the subjects' house, in a restaurant, in a barber shop, in a schoolyard, in a picnic area, in the playground, and on the street where children were playing. All narrations were recorded. The recording was not a single linear, in a few cases, the subject told the story to a second person, a brother, or a neighbor, and the narration of the second subject was also recorded and analyzed. In the study, the participants were not told that the tale would be repeated and what kind of formulas would be applied to the participants. The study was performed in its usual course and was subsequently analyzed by us.

Similar experiments were made in the past by F.C. Bartlett, a psychologist, Robert H. Lowie, an anthropologist, and Walter Anderson, a folklorist to understand the dynamics of the folktale transmission.

Bartlett used two different testing techniques for his experiment. One is what he called repeated reproduction and the other is serial reproduction. In the first experiment, 20 undergraduate students at the University of Cambridge were selected and given a folktale in writing. Each student was allowed to read the tale twice and asked to write it down half an hour or a week, a month, or even a year later.

In the serial reproduction, the first subject was given a tale and a short time later, between 15 to 30 minutes, asked to reproduce it. This reproduction, not the original folktale was given to the second subject, and he was asked to repeat it. The process continued until the subject number 20 learned it from number 19 and retold it. Bartlett analyzed the repeated text of this experiment too and proposed some laws of reproduction (Bartlett, 1917, s. 220-234).

The subject in the experiment done by Robert H. Lowie was dismiss an American Indian. Lowie, had him tell the same legend, which was a personal narrative "the adventure of a water fetcher", three times. This legend consists of a part of the initiation ceremony of the subject to the Tobacco Society. Lowie did not record the time span between the three narrations, but analyzed the text in the native language from the English translation and formulated some laws of transmission (Lowie, 1942, s. 19-22).

Walter Anderson who believed that a narrator heard the tale not from one single person but several at different times, selected 36 students and set up 3 chains of 12 participants who were run the same legend independently. And

recorded them in written forms and analyzed the results (Anderson, 1951, s. 24-25).

Bartlett's experiment, as the late Alan Dundes noted, had some problems. In the experiment, the tale or legend was given in written forms, not narrated to students, not real folk who would enjoy and retain the folk tale. The test was done in an artificial laboratory setting. And we may add that, the most important shortcoming of the experiment was that only the texts were analyzed without any reference to the individuals who transmitted and repeated the narration, as if the text would represent a super organic entity which survived by itself. The other two experiments have the same problem mainly because they do not pay any attention to the personality of the transmitter of the tale.

Robert Lowie's formulation of the transmission process is not based on the above experiment. Lowie did not reach the following conclusion in the experiment but in his early studies on American Indian folklore. These are his conclusions summarized by Dundes: "*Significant events in his (raconteur's) life, his audience, the content of immediately presiding tale told by either himself or another tale-teller, his rapport with the collector*" are important factors in the transmission of a folk tale (Dundes, 1975, s. 259). This conclusion was supported to a great extent by our experiment.

Two other studies on the dissemination and transmission of the folk tale which are not direct experiments should be mentioned here. Mark Azadowsky (1992, s. 3-5) in his pioneering work, *A Siberian Tale Teller*, explored the interrelationship of the tale and its narrator and observed that her personality had played not a small role in changing the motif, the presentation of the tale character, the aesthetic structure of the tale and so on. Azadowsky even proposed a system of classification based on the folk narrative repository.

Von Sydow devoted an article to the role of the narrator in general and pointed out the narrator's role in spreading out folk songs. He classified the narrator as an active and passive tradition bearer. To him, "*the active tradition bearers who keep the tradition alive whereas the passive bearers have indeed heard of what a certain tradition contains, and may perhaps, when questioned, recollect part of it, but do nothing themselves to spread it or keep it alive*" (Von Sydow, 1948, s. 13). Sydow understands how a song may pass from active to passive tradition and vice versa and many components which impact that change. But his discussion also ignores the personality of the active or passive tradition bearers. His active tradition bearer has no personality traits, just like any narrator who mechanically carries the tradition.

Performance studies since 1960 by placing the folklore within social, physical, and cultural milieus examined the role of the teller-performer, the place and time of the performance and audience, general culture, technical changes and many other components which cause the changes and the dissemination of folklore.

According to Fıratlıgil (2012, s. 118), “The text is always unique and special. Each text can be re-performed by different performers at different times and places. The verbal texture, on the other hand, includes the linguistic features of the text.”

There are people from all walks of life and professions in the fairy tale archive told in Anatolia. These include bandits. There are all kinds of bad people, especially thieves (Çobanoğlu, 2012, s. 138). Different Evil such as possession hunters (planning to kill, murderer, manhunter), hackers, murderers, bandit figures representing the people after him are treated as grotesque elements (Howart, 2014, s. 27 and Snodgrass, 2005, s. 43-44). In the tales examined, evil figures are usually animals. So, in these tales a metaphorical expression of the act of evil by attributing it to animals and it is seen that an anthropomorphic (anthropomorphic) rhetorical method is preferred.

Fairy tales, which are a simple and moral way of expression, are about giants, dwarfs, dragons, wizards, and witches; they include extraordinary figures such as a magician or many fantastic creatures. In particular, many entities that can impersonate, be faster, stronger, invisible, or undetectable creation is an interesting indicator of the Gothic tradition in fairy tales (2005, s. 111). In particular, shapeshifting is one of the unchanging motifs of fairy tale. In such transformations human beings become animals, plants, or any object. It is seen in the texts how the Çembel Tiyar fairy tale got its motifs in the province of Van and what kind of changes its content has undergone. The reflection and effects of fairy tale contents on the tradition of each society differ.

In our experiment, the life story and personality of the subjects, that is education, social origin, family, character, and psychology as far as possible were recorded one by one. Then Oya Orhun narrated the tale to the subjects. The tale Çember Tiyar has the following episodes and motives in Boratav’s publication (1969, s. 120-149). And also, the folk tale Çember Tiyar told to the subjects in our experiment includes the following episodes. Annti Aarne & Stith Thompson’s tale-type catalogs are classified according to the contents conveyed by the narrators. Only the initials of the names and surnames

are indicated, as the professions, age, and educational status of the people who have been compiled are desired to remain confidential.

1. Sections and Motif Structure of the Çembel Tiyar Story

1.1. The Search for The Disenchanted (Horse) Husband

A Padishah has three daughters and a horse. The horse refuses to eat raisins from the hand of the two elder sisters but the youngest. Two elder daughters were married to two notables. One day when the youngest sister feeds the horse, the horse is transformed into a young, handsome man and tells the girl that she should not marry with anyone but with him. They hugged each other. From that time on the girl refuses all marriage proposals (1969, s. 120-121).

In a marriage ceremony in the city, the two husbands of the elder sisters enter the arena riding on powerful horses and show great horsemanship and throwing javelins. The sisters boast saying to the younger sister "You see our husbands, they are great men, what do you gain in sticking a horse?" Suddenly a young man in white riding on a grey horse appears in the arena and excels over the others in all fighting and throwing javelins and so on. The next day, in another marriage ceremony, when again the two elder sisters boast for their husbands, a young man in red, riding on a red horse enters the arena and beats all the fighters. At that very minute, the youngest daughter loses her control and says, "Stupid this young man is my fiancée". She returns to the stable and buries the animal skin of the enchanted man (1969, s. 122-124).

1.2. Disenchantment and quest for a vanishing husband

Because of this revelation of the real identity, and the burning of the skin, the horse is transformed into a pigeon and tells the girl since she breaks her promise not to reveal his identity, he can not stay there anymore. Just before flying away, he tells that she should search for him by the name Çember Tiyar, and travel until an iron shoe is worn out and an iron cane is bent.

The girl takes off the road wearing an iron shoe and carrying an iron cane, when she reaches a fountain, she realizes that the shoes are worn off, and the cane is bent. There, she meets a girl who takes a jug of water to Çember Tiyar. She begs the girl to drink some water from the jug and drops her ring in the jug. Çember Tiyar learns that the girl is around the fountain while feeling the ring in drinking water. He goes to the fountain and meets the girl and transforms her into an apple, places her in his pocket, and returns to his residence.

Çember Tiyar has a monster (Dev) family. When Çember Tiyar returns home the Devs say “We feel human flesh”. Çember Tiyar makes them swear that they will not eat the girl and then make the girl human again. He says to Devs “This girl will help you in housework” (1969, s. 123-124).

One day, Çember Tiyar leaves the house. The Dev-Mother asks the young girl “Clean the house and don’t clean it.” The girl does not know what to do and cries. Çember Tiyar comes to his help and says clean the house and put all dirt together, when the mother Dev comes home disperse them around. When the Dev mother sees the task accomplished, she says “This is not your work but Çember Tiyar helped you”. For the next test, her girl is given a huge cauldron and asked to fill it with tears. The girl cries again and Çember Tiyar appears and says, “Fill the cauldron with water and add some salt.” This task is also fulfilled. For the next test, the girl is given a huge sac which should be filled with bird feathers. Again, following the instruction of Çember Tiyar, the girl goes to a high mountain and screams when flocks of birds are passing: “Birds! Çember Tiyar has a marriage ceremony please drop your feathers. They all do. Thus, she fills the sac and returns to the house. As a last difficult task, the girl is asked to fetch a sieve from the neighbor Dev’s house expecting that the Devs will devour her. Çember Tiyar helps her again and says “You will see two doors, open the closed door and close the open door. Then you will see that a horse is given meat to eat, and a dog weeds. Give the meat to the dog and the weed to horse. Then, you will see the Dev mother who places her huge breasts on her back. Suck her breasts, thus you will become her child. The girl follows the instruction and takes the sieve. The Dev mother orders the doors, the horse, and the dog to capture her. They don’t because the girl has ended their trouble. Then, the Devs decide to marry Çember Tiyar dismiss the daughter of a Dev neighbor. On the last day of the marriage ceremony, the Devs tie Çember Tiyar’s beloved on a poll and place ten burning candles on her ten fingers, and another on her head. Çember Tiyar comes and sees that the girl is about to burn, and takes all the candles, ties the neighbor’s daughter, and places the candles on her fingers (1969, s. 125-127).

1.3. Escape and Pursuit

Çember Tiyar and the girl decide to escape and take with them a comb, an ewer full of water, and a bar of soap. They are followed by the Devs. When they are about to catch the couple, the girl first throws back the comb which makes the earth a thorny place. Next time, she throws water which makes the

earth a huge sea, and the third time when the Devs are about to catch them, she throws the soap which makes the whole land very slippery. Nevertheless, Devs again reach the couple and Çember Tiyar transforms the girl into a tree and himself into a snake and wraps himself around the tree. Devs reach again and ask Çember Tiyar to unravel. When Çember Tiyar refuses, they break a branch and leave. Thus, a small finger of the girl is broken. The couple begins to escape again. The Devs follow them. This time, Çember Tiyar transforms the girl into a watermelon field and himself into an old gardener. The Devs question him if he sees a couple. He plays deaf and the Devs return. But they follow them again. The couple reaches the land of the girl's father, and Çember Tiyar, seeing that they are about to be caught transforms themselves into roses, and scatters before the throne of the Padishah (King). He feels very happy seeing the untimely roses in winter. The Devs come with a request. When the Padishah asks what they want, they ask for the roses. Padişah becomes angry and says: "Don't you think I deserve a couple of roses?" and throws roses on the floor. Roses become grains of wheat. The Devs are transformed into chickens and eat all the grains, believing that they devour the couple and leave the palace. Fortunately, under the kaftan of Padishah, two pieces of grain are hidden (1969, s. 129-133). One of them turns out to be Çember Tiyar and the other girl. They are married and live happily ever after.

In our study, similar fairy tale motifs with Thompson and Aarne are as follows. The motifs identified in the Çembel Tiyar ² tale have similar features that we have identified below. The motifs in the international fairy tale-type catalog can contain similar motif structures even in different cultures. The international language and formula structure of the tale can show similar features as in the motif example below, even in different countries of the world.

1. The Types and Motives of The Tale in International Tale Studies³

2.1. The search for the disenchanting (horse) husband

Motives:

Marriage to a person in horse form: (AaTh., 1955, B.641.6).

An enchanted horse, selected husband by the younger daughter of a padishah: (AaTh., 1961, H.11.25).

2 The motifs identified in the Çembel Tiyar tale are taken from the motif index study of Aarne & Thompson.

3 The Motif and Index Table below is from Annti Aarne & Stith Thompson. It was identified from his work "The Types of Folktales."

Revealing the secret of supernatural husband: (Thompson, 1955, C.421).

Disenchantment by destroying skin: (1961, D.721.3).

Quest for a vanishing husband: (1961, H.1385.4)

Difficult task: (1961, Q.482 1).

Years of searching or wandering: (1961, F.1012.1.0.1)

Tasks assigned in order to get rid of hero: (1961, H.0 931).

Travel until an iron shoe is worn out and an iron cane is bent: (1961, H.1125).

Escape from which: (1961, G.276ff).

Magic used to prevent pursuit: (1961, D.2165.3).

Fugitives transform themselves in order to escape detection by the pursuer: (1961, D. 671).

Obstacle flight: (1961, D.672).

Three daughters: (Elshamy, 1955, P. 234.0.3.).

Animal bridegroom: (ElShamy, 1955, D.733. 2.0.1).

Transformation into an old man to escape recognition: (1961, D1891).

Transformation of man to a tree: (1961, D.215).

Transformation man and woman to rosebush: (1961, D.213.2).

Transformation of woman to apple: (1961, D.211.5).

Transformation of man to snake: (1958, D.191).

Transformation of man (and woman) to grains: (1955, D.214).

Final action marriage and becoming king and queen: (AaTh. 425 -425A).

3. The Results of Our Experiment ⁴

3.1. The Importance of Place

C.A, a student who listened to the tale in a classroom together with some other students and was asked to repeat it 10 days later in a classroom, narrated the following:

⁴ The names of the people who were collected were kept confidential because they wanted so. In addition, only the initials of the names and surnames were used. The name, surname, age, and education information of the source persons are given at the end of the study.

“Once upon a time, a Padishah has three daughters. One of the girls wanted to marry; the second one also wanted to marry. They were married. When it was the time of the youngest girl, she did not want to get married. The Padishah had a horse, this horse always ate raisins as food. When the first and second girls fed the horse, the horse did not eat in their hands. When the third girl fed the animal, he ate it from her hand. Now, the horse told the youngest daughter: “You should not get married, I will marry you”. The girl accepted it. The horse and the girl climbed a mountain. The horse became a tree and the girl a snake. The husbands of the other sisters were powerful persons.”

The subject, following the recording, who realized that it was a very short retelling, said to the teacher Oya Turan: “I know this is short, please come to my house. I believe I will tell you there better.”

The next day, the teacher went to his house in a nearby village. There C.A. narrated the following:

“Once upon a time, a padishah has three daughters. He wants to marry these girls off. The sons of viziers and other notables wanted to marry them. The eldest girl gets married, and the middle-aged girl also gets married. But the youngest does not want to get married. Padishah has a horse which eats only raisins but no other food. When the married daughters of the Padishah visit their parents, they want to feed the horse, but the horse refuses to eat raisins from their hands. Then, the youngest girl tries, and the horse eats raisins from her hand. The married girls get hurt and leave the stable. One day, when the youngest girl and the horse are alone, the horse is transformed into a young man and says: “Don’t marry anyone. I will marry you.” The girl accepts this proposal. The time comes; the time goes. A small marriage ceremony takes place in the village. Of course, the sons-in-laws of the Padishah join the ceremony, show off their horsemanship, and win every competition. At that time Çember Tiyar the horse, reveals to the youngest girl that “I will be leaving that place, if I don’t the in-laws will kill me.” The horse flies away as a pigeon. The youngest girl, who is very sorry, follows him as a beggar, not as the daughter of a padishah. She goes for days and months, over hills and dales, and reaches a fountain where she sees a young girl. This girl keeps a bowl in her hand. The youngest girl asks the other where she is taking the water to. She replies to a man called Çember Tiyar. The girl understands that his young man is there. She takes the bowl to drink water and drops her ring in it. Çember Tiyar notices the ring when he drinks the water. He asks the girl, who has fetched the water: “Did you see there anyone else?” She says: “Yes, there was a beggar”.

Çember Tiyar realizes that is his sweetheart. Immediately, he goes to the fountain and meets his beloved. There are some men there who would like to eat the girl, but they are not able to catch them. The couple goes then to a house which is the house of the Giant-men (Dev adamlar). Çember Tiyar leaves the house and one of the Devs says to the girl “Clean this house and do not clean.” The girl does not know what to do. In the morning the Devs leave the house and Çember Tiyar comes and says: “Do not worry. Put together all the dirt in the middle of the room, and then spread it around. Do it three times.” The Devs come and say this is not your work, this must be Çember Tiyar’s work”. Then, the couple escapes from the house to a mountain top. There Çember Tiyar becomes a tree and the girl a snake wrapped around the tree. The Devs pursue them and say: “We know the tree is Çember Tiyar. “Detach yourself.” He does not. And the Devs cut a branch of the tree. As soon as they cut a part of the tree, it becomes a bunch of roses. (I do not remember if the Devs take these roses to the Padishah). Padishah loves the roses and keeps them in his lab. The Devs say to the Padişah “Do a favor for us and give us the roses. Padishah replies: “I will give whatever you want but these roses. Do you think I do not deserve a bunch of roses?” When the Devs insist on their request, the Padishah throws the roses to their feet. Suddenly, the roses become something. And the Devs eat them. And they leave the palace saying: “We ate Çember Tiyar”. But luckily two grains of wheat were hidden in Padişah’s pocket. One of them becomes Çember Tiyar and the other the girl. And they do not want to be separated again. Çember Tiyar tells the girl to take a comb and a pitcher of water. The girl takes them. When the Devs pursue them, the girl will throw something, the mirror, the pitcher of water. When they are thrown, no one will catch them. Then, they reach their goal and live happily ever after. I hope you will also reach your goal in two worlds, this and the other.”

We do not intend to compare the two narrations in detail. However, only certain issues have been mentioned in order to draw attention to the importance of space in the creation and maintenance of culture. As it is clearly shown, the variant of the tale narrated in the house of the subject in the village is longer and more detailed. It includes several motifs, scenes, and even episodes that are not found in the school version. The answer, we believe, lies in the importance of the place, in this case, a house where the boy lives. We do not know, however, what happened in the house. Was he distressed in the classroom, or in a hurry? According to Barbara Allen:

Recent studies in social sciences discovered the importance of place in the formation of identity where he or she spends good and bad times.

This place is not anymore, a geographic place but a social one. The meanings given to a place may be so strong that it becomes a central part of the identity of the person experiencing it. "Many intense feelings of belonging focus on domestic places; a room, a house, a garden. Such places can offer a feeling of safety and refuge. A sense of place can be seen as part of our cultural interpretation of the world around us. It is a place in which you feel comfortable or at home because part of how you define yourself is symbolized by certain qualities of that place (1990, s. 38-46).

3.2. Environmental Conditions Cause Competition in Storytelling

F.K., a coiffeur, who listened to the tale in his shop while he was not busy with a customer, felt that he was not successful in narrating it three days later. He was told by Oya Orhun that his neighbor and friend A.T. retold the tale much longer and more detailed than he did. F.K. the coiffeur said: "If you had told me that my friend was also the subject of this experiment, I would concentrate better and tell the tale in a more complete form than my friend."

3.3. The Effect of Social Variables on Storytelling

K.Ç. in explaining why he did not deliver a longer tale said: "My mind was very busy with my personal problems; I was engaged, and many problems related to that prevented me to concentrate. I am sorry."

A.A. says "I was very busy when I listened to the tale, because the semester vacation was near. I was making preparation to visit my family."

3.4. Family Tradition

To test the importance of family tradition, Oya Orhun changed the order of marriage of the three girls and told that the youngest girl was married first. T.B. who retells the tale changed the order and made the eldest girl marry first. It is the tradition in the family that unless the elder daughters marry, the youngest should not. Also, Miss Oya Orhun stated that there is a marriage order in the family. He stated that the tradition of marriage order in the center and districts of Van province goes from big to small, and he heard from the narrator that those who violated this rule were accused of disrespect. In addition, Orhun stated that younger siblings got married after the elders in his own family. This tradition is common throughout the province of Van.

3.5. Moral Values

T.A. an old man of 70 who listened to the tale ten days ago, asked the teacher to visit his house to repeat it. She went to his house, but he did not

want to repeat the tale and insisted to narrate a different tale. When he was asked the reason, he said: “Your tale did not include any moral value, mine would teach good morals to the listeners.”

3.6. Familiar Unfamiliar Vocabulary

Some listeners who were not familiar with some words changed them to the word that they knew. B.K. a student who was not familiar with the word bostan (watermelon field) changed it to baston, (cane) and N.İ. changed the word devler, (the devs) to Develer, (camels). This shows that some narrators, whose mother tongue is Kurdish, were not familiar with some Turkish words and heard them for the first time. This was one of the frequently encountered problems while compiling. Despite their limited vocabulary, some of the narrators were able to convey the tale with both gestures and facial expressions.

3.7. Attitude Toward the Tale and the Motivation to Listen and to Retell

The subjects who consider folktales as important and serious cultural products listened to the tale more carefully and repeated better than those who view folktales as the lies of grand mothers are motivated and tell the tale as good as the others.

Oya Orhun’s students C.A, N.T, Ç.A, E.O, E.K, A.D, and C.G took the proposal as homework and consequently listened to the tale more carefully and repeated it longer and better. Also, Oya Orhun’s M.O, S.O, A.G. Childhood friends and relatives are also included. (Information is given under the heading “resource persons” on the last page).

3.8. Familiarity with the Folk Tale Tradition

According to Oya Orhun “The subjects who grew up listening folk tales in the past, (C.A, B.K, N.T) especially those who had the experience of folk tale telling tradition around a tandur (earthen bread oven), retold the tale much better than the others who were not familiar with the tradition.”

3.9. Participant’s Idea of Inadequacy

C.D., a housewife who did not deliver, make a good narration said: “My husband is more intelligent than I am, who would repeat the tale better.”

3.10. Rewriting and Telling the Tale

C. A. wrote down the tale just after he listened, S.D. had a special notebook where she recorded some folk tales. She also wrote down the tale in her notebook, H.A. recorded the tale and told it to her friend C.E., E.D., and her

relative B.S. In all these cases the subject remembered the tale comparatively better than the others. This means that writing a tale down and retelling it to other individuals helps the teller memorize better. Even without writing the folk tale, if a reteller practices telling it to others, as E.N telling it to B.S, and B.K to S.K and T.Ç remember the tale better than the others.

3.11. Digression from the Topic

Just a single housewife M.A., who has some marital problems including digression, added personal remark to her narration. She complained about the heavy housework and the mistreatment of her husband. In addition, M.A, generally went beyond the topic and included the events she had experienced and her own personal thoughts in the content of the tale.

3.12. Impact of General Culture, Giant Men

P.A, who is a high school student active in several sports, defined Çember Tiyar who came to the fountain as a giant man (bir dev adam). Giant here does not refer to the Dev or demon, a supernatural being in the tale, but to a tall and strong man. The adjective was borrowed from the sports news in Turkish newspapers and television. Whenever a Turkish basketball theme goes abroad for a match the Turkish sports writers call them 5 giant men. (5 Dev Adam)

3.13. Changing the Place in the Tale

C.A calls it house (ev) whenever he refers to a dwelling place in the folk tale, A.G. mansion (konak), and N.H., flat (apartman dairesi). Each live in a house, mansion, and flat respectively In C.A.'s retelling the marriage ceremony of the Padishah's daughter transformed the city into a village. He lives in a village.

3.14. Gender

The folk tale is the creation of women, and the women narrate folk tales (Boratav, 1969, s. 28-29). It was surprising to find out that in our experiment, A man, aged 70, emerged as a person who insisted that he would like to tell a folk tale. Furthermore, he appeared to be the defender of moral values. His knowing a folk tale and being willing to narrate it presents a contrast to our knowledge that only the Turkish women are the folk tale narrators. That cease presents a weak argument to claim that man is the defender of the moral value. Nevertheless, this fact should be kept in mind against the argument that women are the defender of the cultural tradition in society.

In our experiment, apart from that single case, the woman repeated the tale better than the men. The narrators N.I, Ç.A, E.K, M.A, S.O, A.G, N.H, S.D, all

housewives, retold the tale much better than the boys and the other women who work outside the house.

3.15. Time of Narration and Time of Retelling

One of the narrators, 46-years old civil servant C. A, believes that the tale should be narrated in the evening. Because the telling gives rest and comfort to the narrator and helps him to get rid of the tiredness of the day. But those who listened to the tale at night explained that since they were tired of working all day, they would not listen carefully and have trouble repeating it a few days later. Oya Orhun says "In the evening, when I was a guest in a neighbor's house, I told the folktale. My audience consisting of the ages 25, 32, 30, and 78 began to listen carefully but toward the end of the tale, they began yawning and showed the signs of sleep. None of them was able to repeat the tale 5 days later but only N.M, narrated it though not completely. The others explained their failure because I did not tell them that they would retell it a few days later.

The best-retained motif in the folktale was D.191 (1961, s. 64-69) transformation of a person to a snake. All subjects without any reference to Çem-bel Tiyar narration whether short or long remembered the transformation. One explanation for that reference may be that the Turkish culture includes several legends and tales which contain the snake as a character. Another reason may be the fear of snakes. Whenever a child sees a snake, the first reaction would be to stone and kill the snake.

If a reteller told the tale to a friend for the first time a day after he listened to it, he remembered the tale better when he narrated it to the teacher for the second time. L. narrated the tale in the same evening to A.B. and a few days later, he had no problem remembering it. This explains why a good folk tale narrator who tells the tales many times would remember it easily.

Having a feeling of friendship or sympathy towards the tale narrator helps the listeners to listen to the tale more carefully and repeat it better than the other listeners.

4. The Results of Our Experiment

The study clearly shows that the folktale narrator is a unique individual who is different from the others. We can not attribute his or her individual traits to anyone else. His or her psychology at the time of receiving and giving back the tale, the social and natural environment the subject lives, the time of narration and repeating, and many other factors which we documented in

15 entries above are the factors which should not be ignored in the study of folk tale dissemination and transmission.

We are aware that our experiment is conducted in a modern society where folk tale tradition ended following the introduction of TVs to Turkish society in the 1960's. Furthermore, the folk tale society where people had no other means of entertainment and had plenty of time to tell and listen to the tale has gone forever. In such a traditional society, a good folk tale narrator had an important place in the society, was recognized as an artist, and gained some material and moral compensation for telling the tale. For that reason, we consider the conclusion of our experiment as a good contribution to the analysis of folk tale dissemination and folk tale exchange.

Result

Conditions such as participants, time, and place are important factors in the compilation of fairy tales, which are important subjects of folklore. These factors can cause significant changes in the subject and content of the tale. The educational backgrounds, patriarchal social structures, and socio-cultural values of the narrators have important effects on the content and the change of the subject of the tale. For example, in the province of Van, Kurdish is generally spoken as the dominant language. The narrators speak Turkish as a second language. Even this situation can affect some concepts in the fairy tale. The narrator, who can offer words that can fully match the plot of the "Çembel Tiyar" fairy tale in his mother tongue, tells the tale in an incomplete way and various variables while telling it in Turkish. It is necessary to add language, culture, and physical environment to the dynamics and variable structure of the tale. The woman, afraid of her husband, changed the tale and reassured herself. According to our observations, women in Van do not have equal social conditions with men. In this and similar cultures, where tradition is dominant, story and tale narrations can present us with different motif structures with multiple different dynamics.

In conclusion, we may say with confidence that textual analysis of the recorded oral narration, no matter how many times it is narrated and how many participants are involved, is not sufficient to understand the process of oral transmission and change of folk narratives unless such studies include the detailed life story of the narrator.

References

- Aarne, A. and THOMPSON, S. (1961), *The types of folktales: a classification and bibliography*. Helsinki: Academia Scientiarum Fennica.
- Allen, B. (1990). *The genealogical landscxape in sense of place, american regional culture*. (eds. Barbara Allen-Thomas J. Schlereth). Kentucky: Th University Press of Kentucky.
- Anderson, W. (1951). *Ein vonkskundliches experiment*. Helsinki : Folklore Fellows Communicatrion Publish.
- (1956). *Eine neue arbeit zur experimentellen volkskunde*. Helsinki: Folklore Fellows Cummunications, No,168.
- Azadowski, M. (1992). *Sibiryadan bir masal anası*. (Çev. İlhan Başgöz). Ankara: Kültür Bakanlığı yayınları.
- Bartlett, W. H. (1917). *Some experiments of the reproduction of folk stories*. Prentice-Hall: The Study of Folklore, Vol. 243- 258.
- Boratav, P. N. (1969). *Az gittik uz gittik*. Ankara: Bilgi Yayınevi.
- Çobanoğlu, Ö. (2012). *Halk edebiyatına giriş-I*. Anadolu Üniversitesi Yayınları.
- Dundes, A. (1965). *Study of folklore*. New Jersey: Prentice Hall Publishing.
- (1975). *On the structure of proverb*. Helsinki: Proverbium Press.
- Firatligil, Z. İ. (2012). Performans teoriye göre mersin fıkralarının icrasında anlatıcı, dinleyici ve bağlamın önemi. *The Journal of Academic Social Science Studies*, 5/1, 118.
- Howart, M. (2014). *Under the bed, creeping (psychoanalyzing the gothic in children's literature)*. McFarland & Company Publishers.
- Huizenga, J. (1955). *Homo Ludens*. Boston: Study of Play Elements in Culture Beacon Press.
- Lowie, R. H. (1942). *Studies in plains Indian folklore*. Berkeley: University of California Publications in American Archeology and Ethnology, Vol.40.
- (1951). *Some cases of repeated reproduction*. Berkeley: University of California Publications in American Archeology and Ethnology, Vol. 259-278.
- Snodgrass, M. E. (2005). *Encyclopedia of gothic literature (the essential guide to the lives and works of gothic writers)*. Facts On File Inc.
- Sydow, C. V. (1948). *On the spread of tradition* Copenhagen: Rosenkilde and Bagger Publishing.
- Thompson, S. (1955-1958). *Motif index of folk literature: a classification of narrative elements in folktales, ballads, myths, fables, medieval, romances, exempla, fabliaux, jestbooks and local legens*. Indiana: Indiana University Press.

Participants

1. Oya Orhun, 35 years old, teacher.
2. Cumali Aklan, 46 years old, public officer.
3. C. A, 16 years old, student.
4. F. K, 36 years old, coiffeur

5. A. T, 49 years old, retired.
6. K. Ç, 16 years old, student.
7. A. A, 55 years old, greengrocer.
8. T. B, 67 years old, housewife.
9. C. D, 43 years old, housewife.
10. T. A, 70 years old, retired.
11. N. M, 30 years old, housewife.
12. N. T, 15 years old, student.
13. Ç. A, 16 years old, student.
14. E. O, 15 years old, student.
15. E. K, 15 years old, student.
16. A. D, 18 years old, student.
17. C. G, 17 years old, student.
18. N. I, 37 years old, housewife.
19. Ç. A, 29 years old, housewife.
20. E. K, 44 years old, housewife.
21. M. A, 51 years old, housewife.
22. S. O, 50 years old, housewife.
23. A. G, 42 years old, housewife.
24. N. H, 60 years old, housewife.
25. S. D, 31 years old, housewife.