



Research Article

High school of fine arts instrument education-examination of kabak kemane education books in terms of form and content¹

Seyithan Deniz^{2*} and Erdem Çağlar³

Fine Art Education Department, Education Faculty, Ondokuz Mayıs University,, Samsun, Türkiye

Article Info

Received: 24 March 2023

Accepted: 05 June 2023

Available online: 30 June 2023

Keywords

Content analysis

Instrument education

Kabak Kemane

Music education

Music teaching curriculum

Abstract

The aim of this research is to examine the kabak kemane textbooks taught in Fine Arts High Schools operating under the umbrella of the Ministry of National Education in terms of form and content. The books in question were prepared and published in 2019 within the scope of the “Instrument Education-Violin Teaching Program”, which was approved and published by the Training Education Board of the Ministry of National Education in 2018. Within the scope of the research, document analysis method, one of the qualitative research methods, was used. Books that have been designated for research; technical design and regulation were examined under the themes of teaching-learning activities and measurement-evaluation activities. As a result of the analyses, it was concluded that the 9th grade textbook differs for all three themes in particular, and that the books show similarities to each other according to the themes from the 10th grade onwards. It was also determined in the research that books are prepared according to the goals set within the scope of the “Instrument Education-Violin Teaching Program” prepared in 2018, study and performance of works are often included in the teaching-learning activities in books, and in the measurement and evaluation theme, students are given the opportunity to do original works such as “study, composition study”, especially in the 11th and 12th grades. However, it has been determined that at the beginning of the units, no information was given about the achievements that students will achieve in the relevant unit.

2149-360X/ © 2023 by JEGYS

Published by Young Wise Pub. Ltd

This is an open access article under
the CC BY-NC-ND license



To cite this article:

Deniz, S., & Çağlar, E. (2023). High school of fine arts instrument education-examination of kabak kemane education books in terms of form and content *Journal for the Education of Gifted Young Scientists*, 11(2), 161-178. DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.17478/jegys.1284039>

Introduction

Education is a process aimed at creating changes in human behavior. Music education, on the other hand, is thought to create permanent changes by improving a person's perception and ability of music. Through music education, it is expected that the interaction and communication between a person and his cultural, social and natural environment, related artistic and especially musical environment, in which changes in people's behavior affect societies and changes in societies affect people, will be more efficient, effective, healthy and orderly (Uçan, 2005, 30).

It is thought that music education gives direction to social values and cultures by following a sequence from private to general. While music education contributes to the development of the ability to express a person, it provides an

¹ This study was produced from first author's master thesis

² Master student, Fine Art Education Department, Education Faculty, Ondokuz Mayıs University,, Samsun, Türkiye. seyithandeniz05@gmail.com, ORCID: 0009-0003-4565-8594.

³ Assist. Prof., Fine Art Education Department, Education Faculty, Ondokuz Mayıs University, Samsun, Türkiye. E-mail: ecaglar@omu.edu.tr, ORCID: 0000-0003-3465-4515

opportunity for the proliferation of intercommunal cultural exchanges and intercommunal interaction (Yüksel, 2018, 27).

Instrument Training

In the instrument education process, which starts with music education on its basis, a person can switch to instrument education when the music education process is completed or while the music education process is ongoing, and continue both educational processes in parallel. Instrument education can be defined as “the education given in the process of teaching complex behaviors related to the instrument and converting these behaviors into skills”. According to this, the two most important elements of the instrument education process are the teacher and the student (Çilden, 2001, 28).

Based on this idea, another of the most important elements in the instrument training process is that the person realizes the targeted behaviors by taking a model. The ability to accurately observe and reflect the modelling behavior is of great importance in terms of the instrument training process. In order for a person to receive healthy feedback on the behavior he is exhibiting and to be a good observer, it is necessary to perform one-on-one practical work with the instructor. In the process of one-on-one instrument training, it is necessary for a person to make sense of characteristics such as the right-left hand position, the way of holding the instrument and the posture of the body in a good way. Instrument education is a field of education that has a social aspect as well as a personal aspect. Taking into account the mentioned feature of instrument education, it can be stated that it is necessary to deliver this education to every point of society and to be adopted by every segment (Uslu, 1998, 7).

It is stated that instrument education, which is mostly given to interested and desirable people in order to develop talents and interests, is extremely important within the scope of attentive music education. Attentive music education is not a compulsory education for everyone at any level. On the contrary, it is an elective education depending on the opportunities required for active participation with predisposition, desire and interest (Uçan, 2005, 32).

Although trainings are mostly given within the scope of attentive education related to the instrument trainings in question, instrument trainings are provided in many official institutions that provide musical education, especially fine arts high schools and conservatories. One of the mentioned instrument trainings is kabak kemane training. Before going into the details of this training, information about kabak kemane was briefly included.

Kabak Kemane

The kabak kemane, which is among the folk music instruments, has a long-established history. The instrument in question, which dates back to the first Turkish ensembles, has been able to adapt to the time that has passed since then and has undergone transformation to a certain extent. On the contrary, it can be said that other instruments that have their origin do not move far away from sound colours (Yengin, 2019, 18).

String instruments are known as magic, ritual and epic instruments in Turkish societies. Kemence, one of the most beautiful examples in this regard, is among the most typical instruments known of Turkish cultural music. The instruments in question, where magic, fortune telling and healing prayers are also performed, have a purring and moaning sound coming from your nose and give the individual feelings full of magic and fear. Each part of the mentioned string instruments is made from natural materials, which are considered sacred in Turks. In Turkish societies, the expression string instrument has been met with the word “Iklig” for centuries, while the expression “kemence”, which is widely used in Iran, has been used in the XV. starting from the century, it began to settle in the language of Turkish societies. Thanks to this, the Turks began to use the words “Iklig” and “Gicak” together with the word kemence (Kaya, 1998, 17).

Kabak kemane, whose body is made of calabash and whose heart membrane is usually covered on the cut face of the gourd, can be based on Iklig from an etymological point of view. In terms of the way it is played and kept, there are quite similar aspects to Iklig and each other. In this context, it is possible to use the expression “the ancestor of the kabak kemane” for Iklig. Iklig has come up to date in the Anatolian geography with various names such as Hegit, Gangili, Giygiy, Giygi, Givgiv, Çagana and Dizdir. Today, the name Iklig is mentioned only on two-stringed instruments, while the name “kemane” is used for three- and four-stringed types. All of the instruments in the string instrument family,

which have a leather cover, have a hemispherical body and are played with strings, are also defined as the “Iklig family” (Akyol, 2017, 164).

Although the kemane has not undergone significant differences over time in terms of shape, it has been used with different names. It seems that these mostly consist of the bow sounds that the instrument makes, the instruments used and the way it is played. Urhan (2014, 1), related to the subject, included the following statements:

Mankind has definitely put a name to every object or event that he has created, made. Based on this, an instrument made using a gourd was called “Oklug” because it was played with an arrow; “Iklig” was given the name because it gave a squeaky sound by pushing, and the word “Oklug” evolved into the word “Iklig” over time. The instrument in question, which is played with the help of an arrow, is referred to by various names in different regions and tribes of the Asian continent. In the Anatolian lands, this instrument made from calabash was called “kabaktan kemane”, and in later times it was called “kabak kemane”. In some regions of Anatolia, for example, the name “Giygiy” has been given in Nigde, Izmir and Malatya regions, “Giygi” in Denizli and Thrace regions, and “Giygirak” in Samsun and Corum regions.

Over time, the instrument began to become widespread under the influence of its cultural processes, and therefore changing process structures, and underwent structural changes. For example, although animal intestines were used as wire in the past, steel has started to be used for wire today with the effect of industrialization. Similarly, although horsetail hair was used for a bow in the past, fishing line is used today as a product of industrialization. While manual stretching is performed in the use of a bow made using a ponytail, the bow made using a fishing line has its own stretching system. The bow in question is the bow that is also used in the kemane. In the kabak kemane, which has been used with three strings in the past, a fourth string has recently been required both in terms of its richness in playing techniques and its ability to adapt to the orchestra and soloists it is located in (Yengin, 2019, 19).

Today, the most common form of performing the kabak kemane is the four-stringed one. Starting from the first string, which is the thinnest string in the execution of the instrument in question, the tuning format is in the form of “re-la-re-la”. Four-string kabak kemanes are usually fitted with a steel binding wire. Accordingly, the first wire, which is the lowest wire of the instrument, is called the 0.20 binding wire, the second wire, which is just above it, is called the 0.30 binding wire, the third wire is called the thin *sirma* binding wire and the fourth wire is called the thick *sirma* binding wire (Çelik, 2018, 13).

In addition, it is observed that with the development of the music approach in Turkey every passing day and the spread of music education, different tuning systems have started to be used. The ability to adapt to the different sound spacing from individual to individual and the necessity of playing some works in different tuning systems have caused the use of tuning systems such as “re-la-re-sol” or “mi-la-re-sol”. Another part of the kabak kemane that has undergone changes is its augers. Since the lower threshold of the instrument is located on a thin membrane of animal origin, changes in temperatures can quickly affect the chord of the kabak kemane. Mechanical augers, which are both born from this requirement and contribute to easy tuning, are more preferred augers today. This situation also shows that the kabak kemane continues to change. Similarly, the individuals who are producing the kabak kemane instrument today are also producing five- and six-string experiments of the instrument. Although it is not widely used by performers in the full sense, some performers use these five- and six-stringed instruments both in album recordings and television programs (Yengin, 2019, 20).

Kabak kemane, which can be performed while accompanying folk songs of almost any region in Turkey, is an instrument that is mostly identified with the region, which is referred to as the “Teke Region”. Regarding the subject, Çelik (2018, 21) gives the following statements: As for today, the most important source from which even a little information can be obtained about the local performers of the kabak kemane living in our country is the official collections commissioned by the Ministry of National Education on behalf of the Folklore Archive of the Ankara State Conservatory between 1937 and 1952. The mentioned reviews have been made within the scope of almost every region of our country. It can be seen that the compilation studies related to the performance techniques of the Kabak kemane and its local performers have been obtained from studies conducted especially in the regions of Mugla, Isparta, Burdur and Antalya.

As a result of the extremely rapid development of technology and the communication tools connected to it, it can be said that the recognition of the kabak kemane has increased today. However, playing the instrument with a bow and without frets creates some technical difficulties in terms of playing. This situation has caused the kabak kemane not to be used as widely as the other folk music instrument, the baglama. The fact that new generation performers accompany different kinds of music has contributed to the arousing of curiosity of the instrument in other countries at the same time as giving a universal dimension to the kabak kemane (Yengin, 2019, 20).

As mentioned above, although the performance of the kabak kemane is not as common as the context, trainings are provided especially for individuals who are interested in this instrument and want to improve themselves.

Kabak Kemane Training

There are different institutions in our country such as higher education institutions that provide musical education, high schools operating within the scope of the Ministry of National Education, societies and associations. For the process of Turkish music education today, it can be said that “it is maintained within the scope of the master-apprentice relationship without adhering to any method”. Within the scope of the vocational education approach, which differs from the old practices in music education departments and state conservatories in higher education institutions, it seems necessary to conduct a more systematic education within the framework of a method. With this approach, it can be said that the aforementioned institutions provide services for the education of educators who can gain target behaviors and realize music education in our country (Pelikoglu, 2007, 12-13).

When the literature is examined, it is seen that the first kabak kemane education process in Turkey was given within the scope of Istanbul Technical University State Conservatory of Turkish Music in 1976-1977 academic year, and in the following years, education began at Ege University State Conservatory of Turkish Music in 1984-1985 academic year (Field, 2022, 4).

Today, it is known that kabak kemane instrument education is given in Fine Arts High Schools and conservatories. Salih Urhan, who was appointed to the Turkish Radio and Television (TRT) institution with the title of kabak kemane artist and placed the kabak kemane instrument at the forefront of Turkish Folk Music instruments, published the first kabak kemane method, which he considered essential for kabak kemane education, in 2009. With the idea that it is caused by the lack of method of the kemane instrument, in 2019 Dr. Özgür Çelik has published a new method called “Kabak Kemane I” and developed it in 2020 under the name “Kabak Kemane II”. Another valuable artist who has contributed to the field related to the subject has been Cafer Nazlibas. He has published the “Kabak Kemane I” method for the performance of the six-stringed kabak kemane instrument, which he developed with his own unique playing style, together with Mehmet Zeki Halhalli in 2019. Mehmet Akif Teke, who has been working in this field in 2021, also wrote “Kabak Kemane Method I. Position” (Alan, 2022, 5).

As it can be seen, important studies have been carried out in our country in recent years, especially in the field of kabak kemane instrument, aimed at method studies, which are the basis of instrument education. From this point of view, the study of books, which have an extremely important place in instrument education, has also gained importance.

Instrument Education - Examination of the Kemane Book

In instrument education, which is considered to have an extremely important place in the institutions where music education is provided, it is first determined which instrument should be trained depending on a person’s ability, desire and interest. After the selection process of the instrument is determined, instrument trainings based on the program and plan prepared for the training begin to be given.

The general objectives of the curriculum prepared within the scope of the kemane instrument education, which is given in the 9th, 10th, 11th and 12th grades at the Ministry of National Education Fine Arts High Schools, have been determined as follows (Ministry of National Education, 2022, 3):

- To support the healthy development of students who have completed their preschool education within the scope of emotional, cognitive and physical areas by taking into account the personal development processes,

- To contribute to the fact that students who have completed primary school are individuals with a healthy lifestyle orientation by actively using scientific, numerical and verbal reasoning at the basic level that they will need in daily life, having self-discipline and self-confidence in the context of self-awareness and moral integrity in accordance with their own individuality and development level, have acquired aesthetic sensitivity and social skills,
- To ensure that students who have completed the secondary school level become individuals who have assimilated both national and spiritual values by being able to develop the competencies they have gained at the primary school level,
- To contribute to the students who have completed high school becoming people who have assimilated both national and spiritual values and transformed them into lifestyles, who contribute to the cultural, social and economic development of the country as effective and productive individuals, who are ready to live according to their abilities and interests, a profession and higher education in order to improve the competencies they have acquired at the elementary and secondary school levels.

The most basic resources that teachers use to achieve these goals are books. Books, which are expressed by the Japanese as “as valuable as a piece of land”, are the first materials used in the process of teaching activities (Semerci, 2004). Within the scope of the Ministry of National Education Regulation on Books and Educational Tools (MONE, 2012), a definition is made for the book; “A book that is considered appropriate to be taught by the Training Education Board within the scope of both formal and non-formal educational institutions”. Books are a basic environment that examines and explains information about the subjects included in the curriculum in a regular and planned way, educates and directs students according to the goals of the courses as a source of information (EARGED, 2008).

The reasons why books are used more widely compared to other materials include that they are suitable for the student’s knowledge and age level, that they are prepared on the basis of educational programs, and that they are printed (Bayrakçı, 2005). The books in question are resources that can be accessed by students at any time and offer the opportunity to repeat and consolidate the topics. Many teachers organize their studies related to teaching-learning activities according to the teacher’s guide book and book, rather than teaching programs. This situation also shows how important books are (Gülersoy, 2013).

Books are teaching materials that are frequently used not only in our country, but also in many countries of the world. While books are used as the main source in countries such as Japan, European Union member states, and the United States, a significant part of the course time is spent with the activities contained in the books (EARGED, 2008). It is extremely valuable and important that books, which are a tool in the process of implementing programs that guide classroom teaching and are seen as the “basis of teaching materials”, can be evaluated and their shortcomings can be eliminated (Dane, Doğan and Balki, 2004). With the decision taken by the Ministry of National Education in 2003, it has implemented the “Free Book Distribution Project in Primary Education”, which aims to provide books to students studying at the primary school level, which is the compulsory education level, without any charge. Teachers have been warned when they want to use any book other than the books in question as a “book”. For this reason, it seems that the quality of the books being used throughout the country has also become extremely important. It is also obvious that it is extremely important that the books being used as sources are suitable for both teachers and students for every field. In particular, the suitability of the subject headings to the context, the inclusion of a conceptual explanation of the subject under consideration, the presence of visuals as well as conceptual explanations, the satisfactory, clear and explicit information provided, the ability of the books to keep up to date and achieve their goals provide important contributions to the processes (Bayrakçı, 2005).

In this context, no research has been found in the context of examining the books prepared on kabak kemane education. This situation encountered regarding the books in question, which is extremely important both for the teachers and the students, has formed the main problem of the research. The aim of the research is to examine the kabak kemane books being taught in Fine Arts High Schools in terms of content. The problem of working towards this goal

is; “How are the Instrument Education-Kemane books taught in Fine Arts High Schools in terms of content?” has been determined as. In this context, answers to the following questions were also sought:

- What are the technical design features of the “Instrument Education-Kemane” books being taught in Fine Arts High Schools?
- What are the teaching-learning activities in the “Instrument Education-Kemane” books taught in Fine Arts High Schools?
- What are the measurement and evaluation activities in the “Instrument Education-Kemane” books taught in Fine Arts High Schools?

Method

The Research Model

Within the scope of the research, document analysis method, one of the qualitative research methods, was used. Document analysis is a method that is being used for systematic and meticulous analysis of the content of written documents (Wach, 2013). The document analysis method is used for the purpose of examining and evaluating all documents in such a way that they are electronic and printed materials. Like other methods used within the scope of qualitative research, it requires data to be examined and interpreted in order to make sense of the document analysis method, to establish an understanding of the relevant topic, and to develop experimental knowledge (Corbin and Strauss, 2008).

Study Group

The basic documents used within the scope of the study are instrument education-kemane books prepared by the Ministry of National Education on the basis of classes for Fine Arts High Schools.

Data Collection

The basic resources within the scope of the research were obtained from the page of the Ministry of National Education Training Education Board Jul.

Data Analysis

The analysis of the data obtained as a result of the document analysis carried out within the scope of the research was carried out by content analysis.

The main purpose of content analysis studies is to shed light on the academic studies planned to be carried out later on the subject that has been covered and to determine the general trend related to the subject. Content analysis is also explained by three different methods in itself: descriptive, meta-synthesis (thematic content analysis) and meta-analysis (Çalık and Sözbilir, 2014). For descriptive content analysis, which was considered within the scope of the research; the expression “systematic studies prepared on a specified topic, published or unpublished, including the evaluation of research results and trends in a descriptive dimension by considering all studies” is used (Suri and Clarke, 2009; Lin, Lin and Tsai, 2014; Jayarajah, Saat and Rauf, 2014). In other words, all quantitative and qualitative studies conducted independently of each other, published or unpublished, within the scope of the determined topic, are reviewed and organized, and trends across the field are determined. In this way, it provides information about the general trend related to the subject to researchers who are conducting studies on the relevant subject and field or who wish to conduct research (Miles and Huberman, 1994; Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2007). The results obtained by this method are expected to shed light on the planned future research on the targeted topics (Lune and Berg, 2017; Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2018). The evaluation of instrument education-kemane books in the research was carried out in accordance with the Ministry of National Education Regulation on Books and Educational Instruments (MoNET, 2012); under the themes of technical design and arrangement, teaching-learning activities and measurement-evaluation activities. Books have been evaluated under these themes.

Findings

In the findings section of the research, the examination of kabak kemane books was revealed according to the themes of technical design and arrangement, learning-teaching activities and measurement-evaluation activities.

Theme 1. Technical Design and Editing

Under this theme, the Fine Arts High School-Kemane books were examined and the findings obtained were presented with tables according to the books at each grade level.

Table 1. 9th grade Fine Arts High School-Findings obtained from the technical design and arrangement aspect of the Kemane book

Unit No.	Unit Name	Number of Pages	Number of Images	Features of the Visuals	NPCTI	Number of Shapes	Year of Publication
1	Let's Get To Know The Kemane	16	20		9	5	
2	Kemane Playing Posture Position and Holding Techniques	16	17	In all units, all of them have been prepared as real pictures, clear and understandable visuals have been included. It offers important contributions to the facilitation of learning.	13	2	
3	Usage and Cycle on Broadcast Wires	24	7		7	1	2019
4	Kemane Playing Techniques	34	2		5	1	
5	Basic Bow Techniques	10	1		2	-	
6	Studies and Vocabulary	29	-		-	-	

NPCTI: Number of Pages Containing Theoretical Information

As can be seen in Table 1, there are a total of six units in the 9th grade Instrument Education-Kemane book published in 2019. In terms of the number of pages, it was determined that the first two units consisted of a total of 26 pages, however, an increase in the number of pages was noticed in the third and fourth sections containing basic information about the use of the instrument and performance techniques. The fifth chapter, entitled "Basic bow techniques", is the unit with the fewest pages of the book. The last part is the part where the information learned during the year is put into practice. It has been found that visual content is often included, especially in the first two sections, and the visuals decrease as the units progress. The fact that the images used in the entire book are real pictures is important for making learning easier. The second part of the book appears in the table as the section where theoretical knowledge is given the most space. Although it is important to include theoretical information in the unit, which contains information about the playing, posture and holding techniques of the instrument, it is also valuable to enrich it with visuals. As can be understood from Table 1, the decrease in the number of shapes has also attracted attention as the units have progressed. In summary, in the review of the 9th grade Instrument Education-Kemane book under the theme of technical design and arrangement, the most striking elements are that the images used throughout the book decrease as the units progress, however, the most comprehensively described unit is the fourth unit.

Table 2. 10th grade Fine Arts High School-Findings obtained from the technical design and arrangement aspect of the Kemane book

Unit No.	Unit Name	Number of Pages	Number of Images	Features of the Visuals	NPCTI	Number of Shapes	Year of Publication
1	Themes Practices-I	16	-	-	3	2	2019
2	Coloring Techniques	6	-	-	2	2	
3	Themes Practices -II	28	-	-	2	2	

NPCTI: Number of Pages Containing Theoretical Information

When Table 2 is examined, it is seen that there are a total of three units in the 10th grade Instrument Education-Kemane book published in 2019. In terms of the number of pages, it has been found that the second unit, “coloring techniques”, consists of very few pages, while the first and third units, entitled “themes practices”, have more pages. The most striking feature of the book in question is that no visuals are included in any of its units. In addition to the lack of visuals, it was found that very little space was given to theoretical information, and there was a total of seven pages of theoretical information throughout the entire book (1. Unit = 3 pages, 2. Unit = 2 pages, 3. Unit = 2 pages). It is also seen that the shapes are distributed homogeneously within the units, but they are given little space.

Table 3. 11th grade Fine Arts High School-Findings obtained from the technical design and arrangement aspect of the Kemane book

Unit No.	Unit Name	Number of Pages	Number of Images	Features of the Visuals	NPCTI	Number of Shapes	Year of Publication
1	Themes Practices -I	26	1	In the units where the visuals are included, all of them have been prepared as real pictures, clear and understandable visuals have been included. It offers important contributions to the facilitation of learning.	2	2	2019
2	Coloring Techniques	8	1		2	1	
3	Themes Practices -II	30	-		3	3	
4	Studies and Vocabulary	26	-		-	-	

NPCTI: Number of Pages Containing Theoretical Information

When Table 3 is examined, it is seen that there are a total of four units in the 11th grade Instrument Education-Kemane book published in 2019. With the exception of the second unit entitled “Colouring Techniques”, the other three units were prepared in numbers of pages close to each other. The second unit, on the other hand, consists of only eight pages, similar to the one in the 10th grade book. In the examinations carried out, it is seen that only one visual is included in the first two units, and these visuals are placed in a simple and understandable way as a real picture. It is understood that very little place is given to theoretical knowledge in all four units. Theoretical information mostly includes information about the authorities processed in the relevant unit. The figures in the book, which contain sequences of authorities related to these authorities, have also been prepared only for the representation of these strings.

Table 4. 12th grade Fine Arts High School-Findings obtained from the technical design and arrangement aspect of the Kemane book

Unit No.	Unit Name	Number of Pages	Number of Images	Features of the Visuals	NPCTI	Number of Shapes	Year of Publication
1	Themes Practices -I	22	-	-	2	2	2019
2	Colouring Techniques	6	-	-	1	1	
3	Themes Practices -II	36	-	-	3	3	
4	Studies and Vocabulary	55	1	The visual is used as a real picture, although it is black and white, it has an understandable structure.	-	-	

NPCTI: Number of Pages Containing Theoretical Information

When Table 4 is examined, it is seen that there are a total of four units in the 12th grade Instrument Education-Kemane book published in 2019, as in the 11th grade book, and the unit titles are the same. In terms of the number of pages, it is seen that the second unit titled “Colouring Techniques” is a unit with very few pages, while the last unit titled “Studies and Vocabulary” in particular, it has been found that the number of pages is quite high due to the large number of study and application examples. It has been seen that only one image is included throughout the book. However, as in other books, it has been determined that the number of authority information and authority strings transmitted within the scope of units constitutes the number of theoretical information and figures.

In summary, among the four books studied under the theme of technical design and arrangement, it was found that the 9th grade book contains more images due to the inclusion of information such as basic instrument information, instrument introduction, performance, these images are shared as real pictures, thus making learning easier, the shapes and theoretical information in the relevant books decrease as the classes progress, theoretical information and figures are included as well as the number of theme information and theme strings.

Theme 2. Learning-teaching Activities

Under this theme, the High School of Fine Arts-Kemane books were examined and the findings were conveyed with tables.

Table 5. 9th grade Fine Arts High School-The findings obtained from the learning-teaching activities in the book of Kemane

Unit No.	Unit Name	Number of Acquisition	Number of Studies	Number of Themes	Themes	Number of Sketches	Sketch-Region
1	Let's Get To Know The Kemane	5	-	-	-	-	-
2	Kemane Playing Posture Position and Holding Techniques	10	-	-	-	-	-
3	Usage and Cycle on Broadcast Wires	15	14	-	-	-	-
4	Kemane Playing Techniques	11	29	-	-	5	Malatya, Sivas, Sinop, Maraş, Ürgüp
5	Basic Bow Techniques	5	6	-	-	-	-
6	Studies and Vocabulary	4	7	-	-	26	Ordu, Kastamonu, Çankırı, Karaköse, Kars, Tokat, Bayburt, Mesudiye, Afyon, Çerkeş, Erzurum, Sivas, Kilis, Bolu, Yozgat, Urfa, Giresun, Kayseri, Siirt, Nevşehir

Table 5 shows that the first two units include information-based learning activities, the third unit is the richest unit in terms of achievement, at the same time, starting from the third unit, study studies are started with the aim of getting students to practice, especially in the fourth unit, it is aimed to provide learning with intensive practice activities. The fifth unit, in parallel with being the shortest unit, as expressed in Table 1, stands out as the unit where the fewest number of activities are carried out in terms of the number of achievements. The last unit, in accordance with its name, attracts attention with the number of studies and works it contains, as the unit in which students put into practice the studies they have learned throughout the year. At this point, the diversity of the regions of the sketches in the fourth and sixth units is also valuable for students to be able to perform works from different regions.

Table 6. 10th grade Fine Arts High School-Findings obtained from the learning-teaching activities in the book of Kemane

Unit No.	Unit Name	Number of Acquisition	Number of Studies	Number of Themes	Themes	Number of Sketches	Sketch-Region
1	Themes Practices-I	8	6	2	Buselik, Chargah	7	Kars, Sinop, Kirkuk, Erzurum, Kayseri, Tokat
2	Coloring Techniques	4	2	-	-	-	-
3	Themes Practices -II	8	6	2	Uşşak, Hüseyini	19	Erzurum, Şanlıurfa, Adiyaman, Akdağmadeni, Dinar, Divrik, Gaziantep, Kars, Erzincan, Burdur, Çorum, Bergama, Malatya, Niğde, Middle Anatolia, Ankara

When Table 6 is examined, it is seen that much more application activities are included compared to the subjects and achievements in the 9th grade book. However, since the first and third units included themes practices, the acquisition numbers were determined at the same level in parallel with the themes taught in both units. When the studies and works in the 10th grade book are examined, a process opposite to the one in the 9th grade book draws attention. Accordingly, while the excess number of studies in the 9th grade attracted attention, there was no place for formal education. On the other hand, in the 10th grade book, themes trainings have been started, and studies according to these authorities have been included. However, it was determined that the number of studies was kept low and that the performances of works specific to the authorities were included. On the other hand, it is valuable that the works in question offer diversity in a local sense.

Table 7. 11th grade Fine Arts High School-The findings obtained from the learning-teaching activities in the book of Kemane

Unit No.	Unit Name	Number of Acquisition	Number of Studies	Number of Themes	Themes	Number of Sketches	Sketch-Region
1	Themes Practices -I	8	7	2	Kurdi, Hejaz	11	Aydın, Bergama, Azerbaijan, Çankırı, Nevşehir, Trabzon, Giresun, Urfa, Bodrum
2	Coloring Techniques	2	1	-	-	1	Burdur
3	Themes Practices -II	12	9	3	Rast, Nihavent, Nikriz	15	Orta Anadolu, Kerkük, Sinop, Diyarbakır, Elazığ, Iğdır, İstanbul, Burdur, Isparta, Gaziantep, Muğla, Rumelia
4	Studies and Vocabulary	3	6	-	-	18	Lüleburgaz, Şarköy, Tekirdağ, Rumeli, Kırklareli, Giresun, Burdur, Muğla, Bodrum, Divrik, Erzurum, Yugoslavia, Elazığ, Urfa

When Table 7 is examined, it is seen that the gains in the first and third units entitled “Themes Practices” are greater. However, it has been determined that there are activities aimed at teaching two maqams in the first unit (Kurdi and Hejaz authorities) and three themes in the third unit (Rast, Nihavent and Nikriz authorities). When examined from the point of view of studies, it is seen that apart from the second unit titled “coloring techniques”, all other units include study activities. When the number of works is examined, the increase in the number of works presented to students for performance attracts attention every passing year. As a matter of fact, it is observed that the performance activities presented in the 11th grade book are much more compared to those presented in the 10th grade. However, a significant diversity in the context of units is noticeable in terms of the number of works. The fact that the number of works and the local numbers of the works in question are not the same is due to the inclusion of more than one work from the same region. It is obvious that the diversity that exists in terms of the region of the work will create an important richness and repertoire for students in instrument performance.

Table 8. 12th grade Fine Arts High School-The findings obtained in terms of learning-teaching activities in the book of Kemane

Unit No.	Unit Name	Number of Acquisition	Number of Studies	Number of Themes	Themes	Number of Sketches	Sketch-Region
1	Themes Practices -I	8	5	2	Segah, Sadzam	13	Balıkesir, Yozgat, Azerbaijan, Black Sea Region, Çanakkale, Bolu, Giresun, Rumelia Region, Bodrum, Kirkuk, Çorum, Divrik
2	Coloring Techniques	2	1	-	-	1	Diyarbakır
3	Themes Practices -II	12	8	3	Karcıgar, Saba, Eviç	16	Sivrihisar, Nevşehir, Silifke, Çiçekdağ, Sivas, Bursa, Mut, Diyarbakır, İstanbul, Ankara, Hatay, Tokat, Manisa, Isparta Azerbaijan, Kars, Divrik, Yozgat, Keskin, Erzurum, Sivas, Thrace, Görele, Tokat, Korkuteli, Muğla, Aydın, Fethiye, Rumelia Region, Giresun, Denizli, Burdur, Erzincan, Tercan, Skopje, Artvin, Kırşehir, Middle Anatolia, Amasya, Thessaloniki, Mardin, Kırklareli
4	Studies and Vocabulary	3	4	-	-	37	

When Table 8 is examined, it is seen that the number of achievements is higher with the effect of processing the issues of “Themes Practices” in the first and third units in terms of achievement. It is understood from the increase in the number of studies and works that the 12th grade book has activities that include more applications than the classroom books that came before it. Especially in the last unit named “Studies and Vocabulary”, it is seen that a lot of works are performed based on the importance of 12th grade students, who have now graduated from secondary education, being

able to perform their instruments well. As with the books taught in all other classes, the diversity in the regions of the sketches in the 12th grade book is remarkable. It has been determined that the book, which contains examples of sketches from regions all over the country, also includes examples from outside the country. This situation gives students an important richness of performance and repertoire in terms of learning-teaching activities.

Theme3. Measurement and Evaluation Activities

Under this theme, the High School of Fine Arts-Kemane books were examined and the findings were presented with tables.

Table 9. 9th grade Fine Arts High School-The findings obtained in terms of measurement and evaluation in the Kemane book

Unit No.	Unit Name	Number of Tests	NOQ	Other activities for measurement and evaluation	Relationship with acquisitions
1	Let's Get To Know The Kemane	1	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Preparing a presentation • Preparing a short video • Filling the blanks • Matching-up • Puzzle 	
2	Kemane Playing Posture Position and Holding Techniques	1	5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Explanation with items • True/False • Do with showing • Multiple choice • Observation/explanation 	All measurement and evaluation activities included in the book are directly related to the achievements in the curriculum.
3	Usage and Cycle on Broadcast Wires	1	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Matching-up • Practices (13 activities) • Explanation with items 	
4	Kemane Playing Techniques	-	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Matching-up • Do with showing • Practices (11 activities) • True/False 	
5	Basic Bow Techniques	-	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Practices (3 activities) • Fill the self-evaluation form 	
6	Studies and Vocabulary	-	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Practices (4 activities) • Fill the self-evaluation form. 	

NOQ: Number of Open-ended Questions

When Table 9 was examined, it was found that all units contained activities related to the desired achievements, as well as a multiple choice test was applied at the end of the first three units, questions related to the subjects transferred in the unit were included, open-ended questions were included in the second and third units, practical activities were included to evaluate the students' ability to perform their instruments from the third unit.

It has been determined that the answers to the questions in the tests given at the end of the unit are given at the end of the book. When viewed in general, the diversity in measurement and evaluation activities attracts attention. It is thought that this diversity will be useful for students to achieve the targeted achievements.

Table 10. 10th grade Fine Arts High School-The findings obtained in terms of measurement and evaluation in the Kemane book

Unit No.	Unit Name	Number of Tests	NOQ	Other activities for measurement and evaluation	Relationship with acquisitions
1	Themes Practices-I	-	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Listening to audio recordings • Practices • Rubric 	All measurement and evaluation activities included in the book are directly related to the achievements in the curriculum.
2	Coloring Techniques	-	2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Practices • Rubric • Composing work. 	
3	Themes Practices -II	-	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Listening to audio recordings • Practices • Rubric 	

NOQ: Number of Open-ended Questions

When Table 10 was examined, it was determined that the measurement and evaluation activities were application-weighted and related to the desired achievements. With the graded scoring key at the end of all three units, it is aimed that the student evaluates himself and realizes how much he has achieved the intended achievements.

In general, there is not much diversity in the measurement and evaluation activities. Based on the fact that the course is an application-oriented course, an intensification in this direction also attracts attention in measurement and evaluation activities. In addition, at the end of the second unit, students were asked to compose a composition. This is a very valuable activity in terms of measuring the students' mastery of their instruments and whether they can perform a study at the "synthesis" stage according to Bloom's taxonomy.

Table 11. 11th grade Fine Arts High School-The findings obtained in terms of measurement and evaluation in the Kemane book

Unit No.	Unit Name	Number of Tests	NOQ	Other activities for measurement and evaluation	Relationship with acquisitions
1	Themes Practices - I	-	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Listening to audio recordings • Practices • Creating a melody • Rubric. 	All measurement and evaluation activities included in the book are directly related to the achievements in the curriculum.
2	Coloring Techniques	-	1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Research • Practices • Listening activities • Clipboard preparation • Rubric. 	
3	Themes Practices - II	-	2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Listening to audio recordings • Practices • Rubric. 	
4	Studies and Vocabulary	-	1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Studies • Listening to audio recording • Fill the self-evaluation form 	

NOQ: Number of Open-ended Questions

When Table 11 was examined, it was found that, especially unlike the 10th grade book, applications such as "melody creation, studies" began to be more given. Accordingly, the graded scoring key at the end of the first three units of the book and the self-evaluation form at the end of the fourth unit are seen as an important measurement and evaluation activity for students to evaluate themselves. The clipboard study and audio recording listening activities that students

are asked to prepare for reading parts are also activities used to measure the degree to which the goal has been achieved at the point of “understanding and transmitting reading”. In general, it is seen that there is little diversity in measurement and evaluation activities, and the intensity is given to implementation activities.

Table 12. 12th grade Fine Arts High School-The findings obtained in terms of measurement and evaluation in the Kemane book

Unit No.	Unit Name	Number of Tests	NOQ	Other activities for measurement and evaluation	Relationship with acquisitions
1	Themes Practices - I	-	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Listening to audio recording • Practices • Rubric 	All measurement and evaluation activities included in the book are directly related to the achievements in the curriculum.
2	Colouring Techniques	-	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Practices • Listening to sketches • Rubric. • Listening to audio recording 	
3	Themes Practices - II	-	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Practices • Composing work • Rubric. 	
4	Studies and Vocabulary	-	1	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Studies 2. Practices 3. Fill the self-evaluation form. 	

NOQ: Number of Open-ended Questions

When Table 12 was examined, it was found that activities similar to the measurement and evaluation activities that started especially from the 10th grade book continued in the 12th grade book. It seems that applications aimed at students to put forward their own original sketches based on what they have learned until the last grade, such as study preparation, composition study are included. The graded scoring key at the end of the first three of the four units that make up the book and the self-evaluation form at the end of the fourth unit are activities prepared for students to make individual evaluations.

When it was examined in general, it was found that the 12th grade Instrument Education-Kemane book focused on application in measurement and evaluation activities, however, activities were also put in place to prepare studies and composition studies in order to give students the opportunity to reveal their original sketches. However, it has been observed that the diversity in measurement and evaluation activities is not very high.

When the measurement and evaluation activities were examined at all grade levels, it was determined that due to the fact that the course is an applied course, there is a variety of measurement and evaluation activities applied for important subjects such as the introduction of the instrument, holding and performance in the 9th grade, from the 10th grade the weight is given to practice activities, in this context, studies and composition studies are included so that students can present their original works from the 10th grade.

Conclusion and Discussion

Within the scope of the research, it was aimed to examine the High School of Fine Arts Instrument Education-Kemane books at the classroom level according to the themes of technical design and arrangement, teaching-learning activities and measurement-evaluation activities. According to the findings obtained in the research, there are differences between the 9th grade book and other grade books in all three themes. Accordingly, based on the findings obtained, the results for each sub-problem were shared.

Evaluation of “Instrument Education-Kemane” books from the point of view of “technical design and arrangement”. Under this theme, in the reviews of four books, it was concluded that the excess of theoretical knowledge and visuals in the 9th grade book is the most noticeable difference. Since the course is a practical course, it is aimed to provide important information such as the introduction of the instrument, the holding and execution of the instrument to the 9th grade students who have just started secondary education, therefore, it has been determined that

the embodiment studies with theoretical knowledge and visuals are more frequent. On the contrary, it has been found that theoretical knowledge and visuals have decreased in the books taught since the 10th grade.

Evaluation of “Instrument Education-Kemane” books in terms of “teaching-learning activities”. In the examinations conducted under the theme of teaching-learning activities of the High Schools of Fine Arts Instrument Education-Kemane books, it was concluded that there are differences between the 9th grade book and other books, similar to the theme of “technical design and deconstruction”. Accordingly, in the examination of the achievements aimed to be achieved by students within the framework of the curriculum prepared in 2018 at the classroom level, the excess number of achievements in the 9th grade draws attention. However, it has been determined that since the 10th grade, the emphasis has been placed on the activities of study, themes and sketches, and as we progress to the final grades, there has been an increase in activities, especially for the performance of studies and works. This situation was shaped according to the students’ “knowledge of the instrument” in the 9th grade and their “performance with the instrument” achievements in the following years. At this point, especially since the 10th grade, a serious variety and richness in the regions of the works presented to students within the scope of application activities have attracted attention. It is thought that as a result of performing many works from different regions, students will be able to access a wealth of knowledge, practice and repertoire. In addition, the pieces presented in the “reading part” section at the end of the units in the books also provide an opportunity for students to develop themselves in the field of culture, tradition, music and gain awareness. Despite all these mentioned, the fact that the “achievements” section determined within the scope of the unit is not included at the beginning of the unit, students are not informed about what and how much they will learn throughout the unit, stands out as the missing point.

Evaluation of “Instrument Education-Kemane” books in terms of “measurement and evaluation activities”. In the examination of Instrument Education-Kemane books, it has been concluded that it shows parallels to the studies carried out under “teaching-learning activities”, especially in measurement and evaluation activities. In other words, in the examinations conducted within the scope of the research, the 9th grade Instrument Education-Kemane book includes measurement and evaluation activities specific to the units and subjects prepared based on the students’ first acquaintance with the Kemane instrument, whereas the 10th grade instrument book includes measurement and evaluation activities specific to the units and subjects prepared based on the students’ first acquaintance with the Kemane instrument. It has been concluded that the activities in question have changed from the classroom level. Especially in the 9th grade book, due to the large amount of theoretical information, it is seen that while the diversity in measurement and evaluation activities draws attention, the emphasis is placed on applications from the 10th grade onwards. In the 11th grade book, it was tried to evaluate the level at which students develop themselves in composing and performing points with their instruments, individual, original studies in the direction of “composing work” were started for students, these activities continued in the 12th grade, and these studies were used to evaluate the students’ self-improvement in composing and performing points.

It is also understood that before starting the relevant unit at each grade level, studies aimed at improving the students’ readiness levels are included under the heading “Preparatory Studies”, and graded scoring keys and self-evaluation forms in measurement and evaluation activities at the end of the unit provide opportunities for students to evaluate themselves. However, since the achievements to be obtained from this unit are not shared with the students at the beginning of the unit, there are situations where the students cannot make an adequate level of evaluation in the evaluations at the end of the unit. This situation may need to be reconsidered. It can be said that the measurement and evaluation activities have been prepared in accordance with the achievements specified in the 2018 academic program.

Recommendations

Within the scope of the research, the following suggestions are included according to the results obtained;

- In order for students to improve their knowledge and skills, it may be appropriate to multiply the number of studies and works included in the Instrument Education-Kemane book.

- Introduction of the instrument, performance techniques, etc. in the 9th grade book that will be prepared especially on instrument education, the availability of units that will include in-depth knowledge and applications in matters is extremely valuable for students to learn the instrument in question and develop their performing skills. For this reason, it would be useful to include images related to a simple and understandable language in the book.
- Within the scope of measurement and evaluation activities, it is necessary to include different measurement and evaluation methods. For this purpose, it is as important to focus on the application of measurement and evaluation from the 10th grade onwards as it is to diversify the measurement and evaluation activities from this grade level onwards. In this context, it may be useful to include different measurement and evaluation activities.
- In order for students to decide whether their goals have been achieved or not, it would be useful for them to be informed about the achievements at the beginning of the unit first. Accordingly, it would be useful to include a section at the beginning of the unit of the books in question under the title “Behaviors that students are aimed to win in this unit”.

References

- Akyol, A. (2017). Kabak kemanenin dünü, bugünü, yarını, [The kabak kemane's yesterday, today, tomorrow] *İnönü Üniversitesi Kültür ve Sanat Dergisi*, 3(1), 163-181. <https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/download/article-file/339312>
- Alan, Y.E. (2022). *Müzik eğitimi veren kurumlarda kabak kemane eğitiminin öğretim modeli açısından incelenmesi*, [Examination of kabak kemane education in terms of teaching model in institutions providing music education] (Publication No.: 737656). [Master's Thesis, Sivas Cumhuriyet University Institute of Social Sciences]. Higher Education Institution Thesis Center.
- Bayrakçı, M. (2005). Ders kitapları konusu ve ilköğretimde ücretsiz ders kitabı dağıtım projesi. [The topic of books and the project of free book distribution in primary education]. *Milli Eğitim Dergisi*, 165, s. 1-10. http://dhgm.meb.gov.tr/yayimlar/dergiler/milli_egitim_dergisi/165/bayrakci.htm
- Cohen, L., Manion, L. ve Morrison, K. (2007). *Research methods in education*. (6th Edition). Routledge. <https://gtu.ge/Agro-Lib/RESEARCH%20METHOD%20COHEN%20ok.pdf>
- Corbin, J. ve Strauss, A. (2008). *Basics of qualitative research: Techniques and procedures for developing grounded theory*. Sage. https://www.academia.edu/26974367/Basics_of_Qualitative_Research_Techniques_and_Procedures_for_Developing_Grounded_Theory
- Çalık, M. & Sözbilir, M. (2014). İçerik analizinin parametreleri, [Parameters of content analysis]. *Eğitim ve Bilim*, 39(174), 33-38. DOI: 10.15390/EB.2014.3412
- Çelik, Ö. (2018). *Batı Anadolu'da kabak kemane ve icra geleneği*. [Kabak kemane and performance tradition in Western Anatolia]. (Publication No: 505042). [Doctoral Thesis, Ege University Institute of Social Sciences]. Higher Education Institution Thesis Center.
- Çilden, Ş. (2001). Müzik, çocuk gelişimi ve öğrenme. [Music, child development and learning]. *Gazi Üniversitesi Gazi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 21(1), 1-8. <https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/download/article-file/77491>
- Dane, A., Doğan, Ç. & Balkı, N. (2004). İlköğretim 7. sınıf Matematik ders kitaplarının değerlendirmesi. [Elementary school 7. evaluation of classroom Mathematics books]. *Erzincan Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 6(2), 1-18. <https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/download/article-file/67141>
- Directorate of Education Research and Development Department of the Ministry of National Education of the Republic of Turkey [EARGED]. (2008). *Evaluation of Primary School Books*.
- Gülersoy, A. E. (2013). İdeal ders kitabı arayışında Sosyal Bilgiler ders kitaplarının bazı özellikler açısından incelenmesi. [Examination of Social Studies books in terms of some features in search of the ideal book]. *International Journal of New Trends in Arts, Sports and Science Education*, 2(1), 8-26.
- Jayarajah, K., Saat, R. M. ve Rauf, R. A. A. (2014). A review of science, technology, engineering & mathematics (STEM) education research from 1999–2013: A Malaysian perspective. *Eurasia Journal of Mathematics, Science & Technology Education*, 10(3), 155-163. https://www.academia.edu/64066111/A_Review_of_Science_Technology_Engineering_and_Mathematics_STEM_Education_Research_from_1999_2013_A_Malaysian_Perspective
- Kaya, M.R.(1998). *Dünden bugüne rebab ve yeniden ele alınması*, [Rebab from yesterday to today and its reconsideration]. (Publication No: 72134). [Proficiency in Art Thesis, Istanbul Technical University Institute of Social Sciences]. Higher Education Institution Thesis Center.
- Lin, T. C., Lin, T. J. & Tsai, C. C. (2014). Research trends in science education from 2008 to 2012: A systematic content analysis of publications in selected journals. *International Journal of Science Education*, 36(8), 1346-1372. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09500693.2013.864428>
- Lune, H. ve Berg, B.L. (2017). *Qualitative research methods for the Social Sciences*. Ninth Edition. Pearson.

- Miles, M. B. & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis*. (2nd Edition). Sage Publications. <https://vivauniversity.files.wordpress.com/2013/11/milesandhuberman1994.pdf>
- Ministry of National Education of the Republic of Turkey (MoNET), (2018). *Güzel Sanatlar Lisesi Çalgı Eğitimi Kemane Dersi Öğretim Programı (9, 10, 11, 12. Sınıflar)*. [High School of Fine Arts Instrument Education Kemane Lesson Curriculum (9th, 10th, 11th, 12th Grades)], Ankara.
- Ministry of National Education of the Republic of Turkey (MoNET), (2022). *Güzel Sanatlar Lisesi Çalgı Eğitimi Kemane Dersi Öğretim Programı (9, 10, 11, 12. Sınıflar)*. [High School of Fine Arts Instrument Education Kemane Lesson Curriculum (9th, 10th, 11th, 12th Grades)], Ankara.
- Ministry of National Education of the Republic of Turkey (MoNET) (2012). *Regulation of Books and Educational Tools*. Number: 28409; Date 12/09/2012.
- Pelikoğlu, M.C. (2007). *Mesleki müzik eğitiminde geleneksel türk halk müziği dizilerinin isimlendirilmesinin değerlendirilmesi*. [Evaluation of the naming of traditional Turkish folk music sequences in professional music education]. (Publication No: 205324). [Doctorial Thesis, Gazi University Institute of Educational Sciences]. Higher Education Institution Thesis Center.
- Semerci, Ç. (2004). İlköğretim Türkçe ve Matematik ders kitaplarını genel değerlendirme ölçeği. [The general evaluation scale of Elementary Turkish and Mathematics books] *Cumhuriyet Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 28(1): 49-54. <http://eskidergi.cumhuriyet.edu.tr/makale/932.pdf>
- Suri, H. & Clarke, D. (2009). Advancements in research synthesis methods: From a methodologically inclusive perspective. *Review of Educational Research*, 79(1), 395-430. <https://doi.org/10.3102/0034654308326349>.
- Uçan, A. (2005). *Müzik eğitimi*. [Music education]. Evrensel Müzikeyi
- Urhan, S. (2014). *Kabak kemane metodu*. [The kabak kemane method]. Tezer Matbaası.
- Uslu, M. (1998). *Türkiye’de çalgı eğitiminin yaygınlaştırılması ve geliştirilmesi*. [Dissemination and development of instrument education in Turkey]. (Publication No.78333). [Doctorial Thesis, Marmara University]. Higher Education Institution Thesis Center.
- Wach, E. (2013). *Learning about qualitative document analysis*. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/259828893_Learning_about_Qualitative_Document_Analysis
- Yengin, A. (2019). *Kabak kemane eğitiminde Teke yöresi tavrının uygulanabilirliği*, [The applicability of the Teke region attitude in Kabak kemane education]. (Publication No: 546944). [Doctorial Thesis, Burdur Mehmet Akif Ersoy University Institute of Educational Sciences]. Higher Education Institution Thesis Center.
- Yıldırım, A. & Şimşek, H. (2016). *Sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştırma yöntemleri*. [Qualitative research methods in social sciences]. Seçkin Yayıncılık.
- Yüksel, U. (2018). *Ortaöğretim Müzik dersi çalgı eğitiminde aile katkısının incelenmesi*, [Examination of the family contribution in Secondary School Music lesson instrument education]. (Publication No: 509430). [Master’s Thesis, Marmara University Institute of Educational Sciences]. Higher Education Institution Thesis Center.