DETERMINATION OF WORK VALUES OF GENERATION Z USING THE DELPHI METHOD

Mehmet YILDIRIM[*]

ABSTRACT

This research has been conducted with the aim of uncovering work values using the Delphi method. When examining the methods of previous research on work values, it is observed that most of these methods are aimed at revealing the majority opinion. While these methods contribute significantly to the categorical classification of work values in the literature, they contain significant gaps in terms of revealing values that all participants agree upon. This study aims to fill this important gap in the literature, contribute to the literature, and provide guidance for future studies. As a result of the study, a consensus has been reached on 37 work values that have been categorized into seven different categories consistent with the classification of work values in the literature: social needs, stability, leisure time, external, internal, altruistic, and managerial values.

Keywords: Work Values, Generation Z, Delphi Method

Z KUŞAĞININ ÇALIŞMA DEĞERLERİNİN DELPHİ METODU İLE BELİRLENMESİ

ÖZET

Bu araştırma çalışma değerlerinin Delphi metodu ile ortaya çıkarılması amacı ile gerçekleştirilmiştir. Çalışma değerleri üzerine daha önce yapılan araştırmaların yöntemleri incelendiğinde bu yöntemlerin çoğunluğun görüşünü ortaya çıkaracak yöntemler olduğu görülmektedir. Bu yöntemler, çalışma değerlerinin kategorik sınıflandırılması için literatüre önemli katkılar sunsa da bütün katılımcıların uzlaşmaya vardığı değerlerin ortaya çıkarılması bağlamında önemli boşluklar içermektedir. Bu çalışma literatürdeki bu önemli boşluğu doldurarak literatüre katkı yapmayı ve sonraki çalışmalara rehberlik etmeyi amaçlamaktadır. Çalışma sonucunda literatürdeki çalışma değerleri sınıflandırması ile uyumlu olarak sosyal ihtiyaçlar, istikrar, boş zaman, dışsal, içsel, özgecil ve yönetimsel olmak üzere yedi farklı kategoride sınıflandırılmış 37 çalışma değeri üzerinde bir uzlaşı sağlandığı görülmüştür.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Çalışma Değerleri, Z Kuşağı, Delphi Metodu

1. INTRODUCTION

Since each generation's expectations of work are different from each other, management techniques that apply to older generations may not work for younger generations. At the same time, old recruiting techniques may no longer be useful for today's generations. Therefore, understanding work values can be helpful for organizations on how to structure jobs, working conditions, compensation packages, and human resources policies to attract these young individuals (Twenge, Campbell, Hoffman and Lance, 2010: 1122). For that reason, having information about the working values of the Z generation, which will occupy many positions of organizations in the future, will help organizations in developing more effective policies.

Employee values are another variable that influences organization policies. Values such as job, profession or work values express a series of tendencies that guide young people in some decisions that affect their future achievements (Johnson and Monserud, 2012: 46). Therefore, awareness of these values can be considered as a skill that will offer organizations a strategic advantage in both recruitment processes and organization

[*]Asst. Prof., Adıyaman University, Vocational School of Besni Ali Erdemoglu, m.mehmetyildirim@adiyaman.edu.tr, ORCID: 0000-0001-7627-0945

commitment policies. It can be said that organizations will be successful to the extent that they can develop the ability to fit the values of employees and the organization and to meet the needs of employees.

Considering the studies on work values (Ros, Schwartz and Surkiss, 1994; Twenge et al, 2010; Wahab, Quazi and Blackma, 2016; King, Murillo and Lee, 2017; Maloni, Hiatt ve Campbell, 2019) it is seen that it is generally revealed through values that reflect the opinion of the majority or it is determined by making a classification as a result of qualitative studies. In addition, some of these studies were designed to confirm the predetermined categorical classifications and evaluate the results on the axis of these classifications. Therefore, no research was found examining the work values of the Z generation in order to reach a consensus. This indicates a literature gap on this subject. Even though previous studies on work values have made significant contributions to the literature on categorical study values, these values can be made more specific by consensus-based classification. This research aims to conduct a Delphi study with the Z generation members and to reveal the work values that the participants agree on. Considering this aspect, it is thought that this research will make a significant contribution to the literature and guide further research.

2. WORK VALUES AND Z GENERATON

The groups that share key events and critical developments regarding these events as of the birth date are defined as generations. It can be argued that there is a consensus regarding the existence of four distinct generational cohorts in the present era. These are commonly referred to as Baby-boomers, Generation X, Generation Y, and Generation Z. Leaders must consider that different generations have different values and different demands of work. In addition, these generations respond differently to ordinary events. Because productivity decreases with job satisfaction when managers or employees don't understand generational differences. For this reason, managers or employees should have a perspective on generational differences (Kupperschmidt, 2000: 65-66; Bejtkovský, 2016).

Generation Z is a concept generally used for people born in 2000 and later. Therefore, it is stated that this generation has some differences to previous generations in terms of mentality and character. This generation demands more flexibility in working life (Ozkan and Solmaz, 2015: 476). One of the most distinctive features of the Z generation is expressed as technology addiction, freedom, trust and individuality (Berkup, 2014: 223). Considering that this generation consists of people born between 1995 and 2012, the youngest member of the generation is 11 and the oldest is 28 years old as of 2023. Therefore, positions in working life have been filled by these generations (Gabrielova and Buchko, 2021: 490).

Generation Z is also defined as the digital generation because they do not experience an environment without the internet. Therefore, the Z generation is a generation accustomed to communicating and interacting with technological developments (Turner, 2015: 104).

Each generation has its own unique worldview, attitude towards authority and perspective on work. Therefore, employees from the same generation are likely to share similar norms. This brings with it the possibility that their work values and attitudes towards work are affected by the generation they belong to. Thus, the possibility of changes in the job structure increases (Gursoy, Maier and Chi, 2008). From this point of view, managers in today's business world may face challenging processes. Because managers seem to need to manage generational differences at the same time. In addition, they seem to shape their processes by considering each generation's work value.

Work values refer to eventual situations such as high pay or final behaviors such as working with people. Different goals related to working life are defined as guiding principles for evaluating the results and environment related to working life and choosing among different jobs (Ros et al, 1999: 54).

When choosing a job, employees start with ideas about what is important to them. It is assumed that there are few broad tendencies under these ideas. For this reason, researchers focus on a number of study values to determine these trends. Work values, on the other hand, are seen as special reflections of individual values in the work environment. Therefore, although basic work values are named differently by different researchers, they are addressed in four basic dimensions: openness versus conservatism, self- improvement versus self-transcendence. Openness to change consists of self- management and stimulation sub-dimensions, while conservatism consists of sub-dimensions of security, conformity and tradition. On the other hand, while the self-development dimension consists of universalism and benevolence sub-dimensions, the self-transcendence dimension consists of power and success sub-dimensions. Hedonism sub-dimension, on the other hand, is evaluated under both dimensions as it includes the elements of both openness to change and self-development. In addition, work values, which reflect individual values, are discussed by researchers through their categorical classification as social, prestige, intrinsic and extrinsic values (Ros et al, 1999).

Elizur, Borg, Hunt, and Beck, (1991) see work values as the values of a particular social group. These values, on the other hand, express an entity such as an object, situation or behavior that this group attaches importance to. In addition, work values are evaluated in three categories: cognitive, emotional and instrumental.

Maloni et al (2019: 2-3) consider the individual's work values within the framework of person-job fit. They evaluate work values within the scope of person-environment fit, which includes person-organization fit, person-work fit, person-manager fit, and person-job fit. In addition, it is stated that there are seven different work values most commonly used by researchers in the literature: internal, external, social, altruistic, leisure, supervisory and stability.

Intrinsic Values: A person's intrinsic values show that he or she values the content of the job more than the general conditions of work. For this reason, it is expressed as an internal reflection of external work values (Gesthuizen, Kovarek and Rapp, 2019: 62). While external values are seen as a way to achieve goals outside of work life, when it comes to internal values, the main target of the employee is work itself (Müller and Heelden, 2013: 181). Examples of these values are learning, maintaining skills, seeing results, and creativity (Maloni et al, 2019: 3). Therefore, these job-related characteristics represent motivational factors employees should consider for individual development.

Extrinsic Values: These values show that employees are motivated by the tangible or instrumental aspects of their job. These aspects include salary, promotion, awards, bonuses, transportation opportunities, meal fees. These values are interpreted as a way of earning an income and obtaining other guarantees (Health insurance, retirement plans, job security, career development, etc.) necessary for maintaining life. At the same time, these external factors such as working environment and working conditions, good wages, ensuring job security, good physical working environment, not too much stress and pressure, good working hours and generous holidays are expressed as very important factors to reduce the undesirable features of the job (Taris and Feij, 2001: 55; Halman and Müller, 2006: 119).

Social Need Values: This value expresses the evaluation of a job through factors such as making new friends, having friendly or helpful co-workers, and receiving personal attention from colleagues (Twenge et al, 2010; Kalleberg, 1977: 128). Therefore, this value actually includes an evaluation of the employee's relationships with his colleagues in his working life.

Altruistic Values: These values mean to benefit a society or humanity (Chen and Choi, 2008: 611). Therefore, this value can be interpreted as an indication that employees do not act only to receive or protect their

personal interests when evaluating a job. With this value, employees evaluate a workplace by considering how beneficial it is to society or humanity.

Supervisory Values: These values refer to manager-employee interaction and supervisory oversight. A few examples of these values are feedback, directives given by managers, and personal loyalty with managers (Maloni et al, 2019: 3). In summary, supervisory values refer to the evaluations of the manager's approach to employees, management style, and the degree of supervision and surveillance made by employees. As a result of these evaluations, employees' judgments about the management and supervision aspects of a job emerge.

Stability Values: These values refer to elements such as a sound retirement plan, an adequate social welfare and health plan, and a predictable future (deBoer, Bordoloi, Dallmann, and Hengshen, 2021: 10). Therefore, these values express the elements that remove the future anxiety of employees in working life and the uncertainty at the end of working life, in addition, support them in the health and safety problems that will arise during their working life and contribute to working life in this direction.

Leisure Values: These values represent the opportunities offered to spend time after work days. Values such as the opportunity to vacation, spare time for other things and a slower paced job can be cited as examples (Maloni et al, 2019: 3). Therefore, these values can be interpreted as an indication that employees seek a balance between their work life and non-work life.

3. METHOD

A Delphi method, which combines qualitative and quantitative methods, was used in this study. The Delphi method aims to reach consensus on the views put forward by social group members. Because it is possible to achieve consensus by the group rather than achieving majority of the group through the Delphi technique. Furthermore this technique can be considered as a future-oriented research method that provides a clearer prediction about the future, revealing the options and wishes that shape the future. Thus, at the end of the process, consensus is reached among the respondents (Lund, 2020; Tunali and Kiraz, 2017). It therefore allows us to explore the present, predict the future, or make decisions about a subject. This technique is expressed as a scientific technique that is structured on the basis of determining the needs of an organization, identifying management problems, making decisions or policy making, and reaching consensus on an issue or problem (Fallah and Ocampo, 2020: 49). Within the scope of the research problem, in the first Delphi tour, "What are the conditions that you consider the most essential that will enable you to choose a workplace?" By asking the question, it was tried to determine the working conditions that individuals within the scope of the Z generation give importance when deciding to enter and stay in a job. This information obtained after the first round of interviews was subjected to content analysis via the Maxqda 3 program and codes were created. Based on the codes that emerged as a result of the content analysis, a five-point Likert-type questionnaire was prepared as 1- Extremely not important, 2- Not important, 3- Moderately important, 4- Important, and 5- Absolutely essential. It was distributed to participants in the second round of inter- views. In order to determine the level of agreement of the participants on the expressions within the scope of the Delphi method, the median, standard deviation and interquartile range values of the expressions were calculated using the SPSS 22 program. As a result of the second round, it was decided to conduct the third round of interviews, as there were expressions outside the threshold values determined before. As a result of the third round of interviews, there was no need for another round, as a great deal of consensus has been reached on the statements. As a result of the second and third round Delphi interviews, the threshold values of the consensus levels were taken as minimum 4 for median, maximum -/+1 for standard deviation and maximum 1 for interquartile range (Bahar and Demir, 2021).

a. Research's Aim

Generation Z is considered a cohort group consisting of more flexible, collaborative, interactive and innovative individuals, both in their professional and personal lives (Diaconu and Dutu, 2020). According to OECD 2021 data, while the number of people aged 10-20 is approximately 1.2 billion worldwide, this number is 12 million 682 thousand in Turkey (OECD, 2021). Therefore, these results show that generation Z may have an increasing importance in working life, both in Turkey and around the world. In the literature review, it is seen that different studies have been carried out on the perceptions of the Z generation about work life conditions. However, it is seen that these researches are mostly based on quantitative methods (Pekel et al, 2020), in-depth interviews (Bekman and Gunduz, 2022), and focus group interviews (Yildirimalp and Guvenc, 2020). When studies on work values are examined, it is observed that these studies are mostly conducted using methods that reflect the majority's opinion. Therefore, no research was found in which a method reflecting a consensus on work values was used both in the context of generation Z and in terms of work values. In this study, Delphi, which combines qualitative and quantitative research methods, was preferred. In the Delphi technique, instead of the majority's opinion, the participants reach consensus on the subject (Lund, 2020). For this reason, it is thought that this research will fill an important gap in the literature and make a valuable contribution to the literature. Since this is a research in which participants imagine their working life, this research will provide some valuable insights to practitioners and researchers.

b. Research's Sample

There are different opinions about the number of Delphi participants. Opinions on the number of participants reach 7 and over 1000. However, since in the Delphi method, the quality of the participants is more important than the number of participants, representation ability is not sought (Fallah and Ocampo, 2020: 50). In addition, the Delphi method is viewed as an ideal method for working with small groups. Although it is stated as an ideal number that the number of participants is between 10 and 20 in general terms, it is also stated that this number can be 100 or more, with a minimum of 7 (Erpolat, 2011: 1841). In this study, individuals who are university students with the idea of entering working life were selected to determine the working conditions that stand out in working life for the Z generation. Participants were randomly selected on a voluntary basis from university students representing Generation Z. For this purpose, a preliminary briefing about the study was conducted by reaching out to university students studying during the academic year 2022-2023. Subsequently, a list of those willing to participate voluntarily in the study was compiled. Following this, communication was established with the identified participants through online means and data was collected. In this context, this study was conducted with a sample of 36 university students.

4. RESULTS

To determine the level of agreement, median (Mdn), interquartile range (IQR), and +/-1 standard deviation range were preferred as central tendency criteria. The median was determined as at least 4 and the interquartile range as maximum 1 (Bahar and Demir, 2021). It is stated that there is statistical agreement when the interquartile range is less than 1 (Raskin, 1994: 77). It is suggested that the standard deviation should be in the range of +/- 1 for an acceptable level of fitness (Chuenjitwongsa, 2017: 2; Hasson, Keeney and McKenna, 2000: 1011). In Delphi studies, the number of tours also varies depending on the participants' agreement. However, it is stated that three rounds are generally sufficient (Kalleberg, 1977).

The questionnaire, which was prepared based on the codes related to the factors affecting employees' decision to choose a workplace and stay at work, was distributed to the participants in the second round. Table 1

shows the median, standard deviation and interquartile range values of survey data from the second round Delphi interviews.

Table 1: Median, Standard Deviation, and Interquartile Range Values of Factors Affecting Employees When Deciding to Prefer and Stay at a Job After the Second Delphi Interview

	Items	Median	Std. Deviation	Interquartile Range
1	A workplace giving high salaries to the employees	4,0000	,74203	1,00
2	**A workplace is close to where I want it**	**3,0000**	,82308	1,00
3	A workplace has health insurance for employees	4,0000	,73104	1,00
4	A workplace that the employer gives what is their rights to the employees	5,0000	,68036	1,00
5	A workplace that employees have annual leave rights	4,0000	,76707	1,00
6	A hygienic workplace	4,0000	,91398	1,00
7	A workplace has a safe place of work	4,0000	,82717	1,00
8	A workplace that pays employee salaries regularly	5,0000	,68036	1,00
9	A workplace has an environment where employees can feel comfortable	4,0000	,89382	1,00
10	**A workplace that offers fringe benefits such as transportation, road, meal**	4,0000	**1,02992**	**2,00**
11	An organized and tidy workplace	4,0000	,88852	1,00
12	**A workplace where working hours are determined**	4,0000	,93153	**2,00**
13	**A workplace where the workload of employees is low**	**3,0000**	,89307	1,00
14	A workplace that gives people confidence	4,0000	,87243	1,00
15	**A workplace with working hours suitable for me**	**3,0000**	,96986	1,00
16	A workplace that gives respects to its employees	4,0000	,87475	1,00
17	A workplace that trusts its employees	4,0000	,86388	1,00
18	A workplace where there are friendly and positive relationships among all employees	4,0000	,91324	1,00
19	A workplace where employees are treated fairly	5,0000	,64262	1,00
20	A workplace with a position related to my profession	4,0000	,97194	1,00
21	**A workplace where employees do not work on their days off**	4,0000	**1,07229**	1,00
22	A workplace where employees feel a sense of belonging	4,0000	,90209	1,00
23	**A workplace known to everyone**	**2,0000**	**1,14236**	1,00

24	A workplace that values its employees	4,0000	,79046	1,00
25	A workplace that offers career opportunities to its employees	4,0000	,66835	0,00
26	A workplace where employees are responsible	4,0000	,82062	1,00
27	A workplace with smile-face managers	4,0000	**1,09347**	**2,00**
28	A workplace that has a happy and peaceful working environment	4,0000	,91766	**2,00**
29	A workplace that has employees who trust each other and are loyal to each other	4,0000	,88852	1,00
30	**The growth period of the workplace**	**2,0000**	**1,16864**	**2,00**
31	**A workplace where employees have the opportunity to boost their careers in a short time**	**3,0000**	**1,09532**	**2,00**
32	**A workplace that supports social responsibility projects**	**3,0000**	**,98230**	1,00
33	**a workplace that has a mission and vision that suits me**	4,0000	**1,02992**	**2,00**
34	A workplace that cares for and supports employees	4,0000	,91619	**2,00**
35	a workplace where there is an openness of the workplace to innovations	4,0000	,84413	**2,00**
36	**A workplace that provides halal income for itself**	5,0000	**1,00404**	1,00
37	**A workplace with innovation-focused activities**	**3,0000**	**1,03449**	2,00
38	**A workplace where I can get an environment related to working life**	**3,0000**	,95866	1,00
39	A workplace that honest with the employee	5,0000	,88013	1,00
40	**A workplace that strives for employee motivation**	4,0000	,95936	**2,00**
41	A workplace that distribute roles according to the abilities of the employees	4,0000	,94591	1,00
42	A workplace where managers don't mistreat employees	4,0000	,84253	1,00
43	**A workplace where working from home is possible**	**3,0000**	**1,04810**	1,00
44	A workplace with managers who give confidence to their employees	4,0000	,66734	1,00
45	A workplace that is welcome by all	4,0000	,95018	1,00
46	**A workplace that contributes to the development of its employees**	4,0000	,83286	**2,00**
47	**A workplace with honest managers**	4,0000	,77407	**2,00**
48	**A workplace that gives employees the right to vacation on special days**	4,0000	,99459	**2,00**

49	A workplace that promises its employee development	4,0000	,85446	1,00
50	**A workplace that has employees who have moral values**	4,0000	,92863	**2,00**
51	**A workplace that has a goal**	4,0000	,99459	**2,00**

Since the median value was below 4, the standard deviation value was greater/smaller than +/- 1, and the interquartile range value was greater than 1 as a result of the second round interviews, the same questionnaire was sent to the participants along with the statistical results of the second round interviews, and the third round interviews were started. The median, standard deviation and interquartile range values of the third round of interviews are shown in Table 2.

Table 2: Median, Standard Deviation, and Interquartile Range Values of Factors Affecting Employees When Deciding to Prefer and Stay at a Job After the Third Delphi Interview

	Items	Median	Std. Deviation	Interquartile Range
1	A workplace giving high salaries to the employees	4,0000	,67288	1,00
2	**A workplace is close to where I want it**	**3,0000**	,68404	1,00
3	A workplace has health insurance for employees	4,0000	,74096	1,00
4	A workplace that the employer gives what is their rights to the employees	5,0000	,70458	1,00
5	A workplace that employees have annual leave rights	4,0000	,90355	1,00
6	**A hygienic workplace**	4,0000	,71712	**1,25**
7	A workplace has a safe place of work	4,0000	,78079	1,00
8	A workplace that pays employee salaries regularly	5,0000	,74336	1,00
9	A workplace has an environment where employees can feel comfortable	4,0000	,69375	1,00
10	A workplace that offers fringe benefits such as transportation, road, meal	4,0000	,76986	1,00
11	An organized and tidy workplace	4,0000	,53737	0,00
12	**A workplace where working hours are determined**	4,0000	,73613	**1,25**
13	**A workplace where the workload of employees is low**	**3,0000**	,79884	1,00
14	A workplace that gives people confidence	4,0000	,75761	1,00
15	**A workplace with working hours suitable for me**	**3,0000**	,85957	1,00
16	A workplace that gives respects to its employees	4,0000	,69631	,50
17	A workplace that trusts its employees	4,0000	,67354	,25
18	A workplace where there are friendly and positive relationships among all employees	4,0000	,75111	1,00

19	A workplace where employees are treated fairly	5,0000	,70458	1,00
20	A workplace with a position related to my profession	4,0000	,72883	1,00
21	A workplace where employees do not work on their days off	4,0000	,78363	1,00
22	A workplace where employees feel a sense of belonging	4,0000	,64030	1,00
23	**A workplace known to everyone**	**3,0000**	,99419	1,00
24	A workplace that values its employees	4,0000	,62694	0,00
25	A workplace that offers career opportunities to its employees	4,0000	,60964	1,00
26	A workplace where employees are responsible	4,0000	,71213	1,00
27	A workplace with smile-face managers	4,0000	,80606	1,00
28	A workplace that has a happy and peaceful working environment	4,0000	,64030	1,00
29	A workplace that has employees who trust each other and are loyal to each other	4,0000	,57658	0,00
30	**The growth period of the workplace**	**3,0000**	,95533	1,00
31	**A workplace where employees have the opportunity to boost their careers in a short time**	**3,0000**	,66220	1,00
32	**A workplace that supports social responsibility projects**	**3,0000**	,74635	1,00
33	a workplace that has a mission and vision that suits me	4,0000	,56723	1,00
34	A workplace that cares for and supports employees	4,0000	,62694	0,00
35	a workplace where there is an openness of the workplace to innovations	4,0000	,49237	0,00
36	A workplace that provides halal income for itself	5,0000	,86164	1,00
37	**A workplace with innovation-focused activities**	**3,0000**	,66220	1,00
38	**A workplace where I can get an environment related to working life**	**3,0000**	,70962	1,00
39	A workplace that honest with the employee	5,0000	,81704	1,00
40	A workplace that strives for employee motivation	4,0000	,66822	1,00
41	A workplace that distribute roles according to the abilities of the employees	4,0000	,60006	0,00
42	A workplace where managers don't mistreat employees	4,0000	,79661	1,00
43	**A workplace where working from home is possible**	**3,0000**	,77850	0,00
44	A workplace with managers who give confidence to their employees	4,0000	,57036	0,00
45	A workplace that is welcome by all	4,0000	,87141	1,00

46	A workplace that contributes to the development of its employees	4,0000	,64860	,25
47	A workplace with honest managers	4,0000	,62122	,25
48	A workplace that gives employees the right to vacation on special days	4,0000	,71213	,25
49	A workplace that promises its employee development	4,0000	,59108	,25
50	A workplace that has employees who have moral values	4,0000	,60006	0,00
51	A workplace that has a goal	4,0000	,77621	0,00

12th, 13th, 15th, 23rd, 30th, 31st, 32nd, 37th, 38th and 43rd statements have been found to be below the previously determined threshold value. As a result of the third round of interviews, it was not necessary to hold another round, as a great deal of consensus has been reached on the items.

After the Delphi study, the factors that generation Z consider when deciding to start or continue a business are shown in Table 3 together with their main categories. The values obtained represent the values on which a certain number of participants have reached consensus, as stated before. The study values obtained as a result of the study are not superior to each other. For this reason, only a certain classification of the obtained values has been made. The classification of study values was carried out using the most cited study values classification in the literature (Maloni et al, 2019). Thus, a scale on which the same classification can be used has been added to the literature.

Table 3: Median, Standard Deviation, and Interquartile Range Values of Factors Affecting Employees When Deciding to Prefer and Stay at a Job After the Third Delphi Interview

	Working Values	Categories	Median	Std. Deviation	Interquartile Range
1	A workplace that provides halal income for itself	Altruistic	5	0,86164	1
2	A workplace where there is an openness of the workplace to innovations	Altruistic	4	0,49237	0
3	A workplace that gives people confidence	Altruistic	4	0,75761	1
4	A workplace that is welcome by all	Altruistic	4	0,87141	1
5	A workplace that has a goal	Altruistic	4	0,77621	0
6	A workplace giving high salaries to the employees	Extrinsic	4	0,67288	1
7	A workplace that pays employee salaries regularly	Extrinsic	5	0,74336	1
8	A workplace that offers fringe benefits such as transportation, road, meal	Extrinsic	4	0,76986	1
9	A workplace that the employer gives what is their rights to the employees	Extrinsic	5	0,70458	1

10	An organized and tidy workplace	Extrinsic	4	0,53737	0
11	A workplace that offers career opportunities to its employees	Extrinsic	4	0,60964	1
12	A workplace that gives respects to its employees	Intrinsic	4	0,69631	0,5
13	A workplace that trusts its employees	Intrinsic	4	0,67354	0,25
14	A workplace where employees are treated fairly	Intrinsic	5	0,70458	1
15	A workplace where employees feel a sense of belonging	Intrinsic	4	0,6403	1
16	A workplace that values its employees	Intrinsic	4	0,62694	0
17	A workplace that honest with the employee	Intrinsic	5	0,81704	1
18	A workplace that strives for employee motivation	Intrinsic	4	0,66822	1
19	A workplace that distribute roles according to the abilities of the employees	Intrinsic	4	0,60006	0
20	A workplace that contributes to the development of its employees	Intrinsic	4	0,6486	0,25
21	A workplace with a position related to my profession	Intrinsic	4	0,72883	1
22	A workplace that promises its employee development	Intrinsic	4	0,59108	0,25
23	A workplace that has a mission and vision that suits me	Intrinsic	4	0,56723	1
24	A workplace that employees have annual leave rights	Leisure	4	0,90355	1
25	A workplace where employees do not work on their days off	Leisure	4	0,78363	1
26	A workplace that gives employees the right to vacation on special days	Leisure	4	0,71213	0,25
27	A workplace that has a happy and peaceful working environment	Social Needs	4	0,6403	1
28	A workplace where there are friendly and positive relationships among all employees	Social Needs	4	0,75111	1
29	A workplace where employees are responsible	Social Needs	4	0,71213	1

30	A workplace that has employees who trust each other and are loyal to each other	Social Needs	4	0,57658	0
31	A workplace that has employees who have moral values	Social Needs	4	0,60006	0
32	A workplace has health insurance for employees	Stability	4	0,74096	1
33	A workplace has a safe place of work	Stability	4	0,78079	1
34	A workplace with smile-face managers	Supervisory	4	0,80606	1
35	A workplace where managers don't mistreat employees	Supervisory	4	0,79661	1
36	A workplace with managers who give confidence to their employees	Supervisory	4	0,57036	0
37	A workplace with honest managers	Supervisory	4	0,62122	0,25

When the values and their classifications in Table 3 are examined, it can be said that it supports the classification used to characterize employee values created by Maloni et al (2019). Therefore, this study reveals the significance of this categorical model. However, the adoption of a value type also shows that it is not always necessary to treat that value type as a unique category (Dominick, Iordanoglou, Prastacos and Reilly, 2021: 78). What is critical here is the extent to which organizations turn these values into a organizational culture. They use these values as a strategic tool while forming their policies.

5. CONCLUSION

The Delphi method can be expressed as an ideal technique that can be used to reveal the common tendencies of the participants and the points they attach importance to regarding the researched subject (Gencturk and Akbas, 2013: 347). One of the strongest aspects of the study is its use of this method. Because, in the literature review, no Delphi study has been found that revealed that all participants agreed on the working values of the Z generation. For this reason, it is thought that the results of this research will fill this gap in the literature and guide further research.

According to the data obtained as a result of this study, the theme of "factors considered important when deciding to start and stay in a job" consists of 37 codes belonging to 7 categories: social needs, supervisory, stability, leisure, altruistic, intrinsic and extrinsic. In addition, according to the research results, there has been a consensus of all participants on 37 statements that emerged as important factors when deciding both to start a job and to continue working in a job.

Considering the possibility of Z generation members occupying key positions in working life in the coming years, all these factors should be taken into account to establish and maintain employee loyalty during and after recruitment as required by an effective human resources policy. According to this research, extrinsic rewards are among the issues the Z generation emphasizes while choosing a job. Therefore, factors such as travel, food, transportation, salary, insurance, and vacation opportunities for the Z generation are among the factors important when choosing a job. These findings show some parallels with other studies in the literature. For example, in a study conducted by Korkmaz and Cevik (2014), one of the most important issues for the Z generation when choosing a job is that the company has a favorable wage policy, career opportunities, working

environment, and job security. In another study, career opportunities, wages and job security are among the issues employees consider when choosing a job (Iorgulescu, 2016).

This study also found that factors related to the manager's fairness, honesty, reliability, moderateness, and support are important factors in choosing a job. These results partially support the study that generation Z prefers transformational leadership (McGaha, 2018). Transformational leaders help employees realize their dreams and talents. In addition, transformational leaders show genuine interest in employees (Celik, 1998: 4).

Flexible working, paid leave and a fun working environment are among Generation Z's most sought-after features in working life (Gabrielova and Buchko, 2021: 490). This study supports this. Because, according to the results of the research, among the factors that affect the preferences of the Z generation when choosing a workplace, there are factors evaluated in the leisure time category, such as annual leave rights, vacation opportunities on special days, not being called to the office on days off, and a happy and peaceful working environment.

The critical point in terms of work values is to realize that no work value has priority over another. For this reason, it is a necessity for organizations understand employees' work values and make these values shared by organizations an organizational culture for future generations. In addition, organizations should use these values as a strategic tool when determining their policies. In this way, organizations will be able to meet employees' needs and will have a strategic advantage.

This study was designed as a Delphi study and was carried out to determine the statements agreed upon as a result of several interviews. Delphi studies require a relatively long time as they combine qualitative and quantitative methods. For this reason, the sample size of this research could not be kept very large due to the time constraints of the participants and researchers. This can be expressed as one of the research limitations. Another limitation of the study is the assumption that the participants expressed their opinions clearly during the interviews. All analyses are based on this assumption. If it is possible to reach larger samples for future research, stronger evidence for the Z generation's work values can be gathered. In addition, it is thought that the values obtained as a result of this study will be the basis for the development of a scale in future studies. Thus, it may be possible to verify categorical classifications made on larger samples.

REFERANCES

Bahar, M., and Demir, N. S. (2021). Delphi tekniği uygulama sürecine yönelik örnek bir çalışma: Çok fonksiyonlu tarım okuryazarlığı. *Abant İzzet Baysal Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi, 21*(1), 35-53.

Bejtkovský, J. (2016). The current generations: The baby boomers, X, Y and Z in the context of human capital management of the 21st century in selected corporations in the Czech Republic. *Littera scripta*, *9*(2), 25-45.

Bekman, Ö. G., and Gündüz, Ş. (2022). Yöneticilerin Z kuşağından beklentileri ve z kuşağının iş yaşamı beklentileri. *International Journal of Management Economics and Business/Uluslararası Yönetim İktisat ve İsletme Dergisi, 18*(2). 649-682.

Berkup, S. B. (2014). Working with generations X and Y in generation Z period: Management of different generations in business life. *Mediterranean journal of social Sciences, 5*(19), 218.

Chen, P. J., and Choi, Y. (2008). Generational differences in work values: A study of hospitality management. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management, 20*(6), 595-615.

Chuenjitwongsa, S. (2017). *How to conduct a Delphi study*. Wales Deanery Deoniaeth Cymru. Cardiff University.

Çelik, V. (1998). Eğitimde dönüşümcü liderlik. *Kuram ve Uygulamada Eğitim Yönetimi, 16(*16), 423-442.

deBoer, P., Bordoloi, P., Dallmann, J., and Hengshen, L.(2021). Generation Z work values: A cross-national analysis. *CCBC 2021*, 188.

Diaconu, M., and Dutu, A. (2020). Employees'behavior within labor market: Generatıon Z vs. generation Y. *The USV Annals of Economics and Public Administration, 20*(1(31)), 113-119.

Dominick, P. G., Iordanoglou, D., Prastacos, G., and Reilly, R. R. (2021). Espoused values of the "Fortune 100 best companies to work for": Essential themes and implementation practices. *Journal of Business Ethics, 173*, 69-88.

Elizur, D., Borg, I., Hunt, R., and Beck, I. M. (1991). The structure of work values: A cross cultural comparison. *Journal of Organizational Behavior, 12*(1), 21-38.

Erpolat, S. (2011). Öğrencilerin ihtiyaçlarını belirlemede delphi ve bulanık delphi yöntemlerinin karşılaştırılması. Comparison of delphi and fuzzy delphi methods to determine the students'reqıırements. *In 11 Th International Educational Technology Conference* (P. 1840).

Fallah, M., and Ocampo, L. (2020). The use of the Delphi method with non-parametric analysis for identifying sustainability criteria and indicators in evaluating ecotourism management: The case of Penang National Park (Malaysia). *Environment Systems and Decisions, 41*(1), 45-62.

Gabrielova, K., and Buchko, A. A.2021). Here comes generation Z: Millennials as managers. *Business Horizons, 64*(4), 489-499.

Gençtürk, E., and Akbaş, Y. (2013). Sosyal bilgiler öğretmenliği coğrafya alan standartlarının belirlenmesi: Delphi tekniği uygulaması. *Gazi Üniversitesi Gazi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi, 33*(2), 335-353.

Gesthuizen, M., Kovarek, D., and Rapp, C. (2019). Extrinsic and intrinsic work values: Findings on equivalence in different cultural contexts. *The ANNALS of the American Academy of Political and Social Science, 682*(1), 60-83.

Gursoy, D., Maier, T. A., and Chi, C. G. (2008). Generational differences: An examination of work values and generational gaps in the hospitality workforce. *International Journal of Hospitality Management, 27*(3), 448-458.

Halman, L., and Müller, H. (2006). Contemporary work values in Africa and Europe: Comparing orientations to work in African and European societies. *International Journal of Comparative Sociology, 47*(2), 117-143.

Hasson, F., Keeney, S., and McKenna, H. (2000). Research guidelines for the Delphi survey technique. *Journal of Advanced Nursing, 32*(4), 1008-1015.

Johnson, M. K., and Monserud, M. A. (2012). Work value development from adolescence to adulthood. *Advances in Life Course Research, 17*(2), 45-58.

Iorgulescu, M. C. (2016). Generation Z and its perception of work. *Cross-Cultural Management Journal, 18*(01), 47-54.

Kalleberg, A. L. (1977). Work values and job rewards: A theory of job satisfaction. *American Sociological Review, 42*(1),124-143.

King, C., Murillo, E., and Lee, H. (2017). The effects of generational work values on employee brand attitude and behavior: A multi-group analysis. *International Journal of Hospitality Management, 66*, 92-105.

Korkmaz, O., and Çevik, N. K. (2014). A research on the determination of job selection criteria of the senior undergraduate students. *Business and Economics Research Journal, 5*(3), 167.

Kupperschmidt, B. R. (2000). Multigeneration employees: Strategies for effective management. *The Health Care Manager, 19*(1), 65-76.

Lund, B. D. (2020). Review of the delphi method in library and information science research, *Journal of Documentation, 76*(4). 929-960. https://doi.org/10.1108/JD-09-2019-0178

Maloni, M., Hiatt, M. S., and Campbell, S. (2019). Understanding the work values of Gen Z business students. *The International Journal of Management Education, 17*(3), 100320.

McGaha, K. K. (2018). *An interpretive phenomenological study of America's emerging workforce: Exploring generation Z's leadership preferences*. Doctoral dissertation, University of Phoenix.

Müller, H., and van Heelden, T. (2013). *Human values, African values, Southern African values? On work*, in Values and Development in Southern Africa Book, CODESRIA

OECD (2021). https://stats.oecd.org/Index.aspx?DataSetCode=POPPROJ,Access date, 27.09.2022

Ozkan, M., and Solmaz, B. (2015). The changing face of the employees–generation Z and their perceptions of work (a study applied to university students). *Procedia Economics and Finance, 26*, 476-483.

Pekel, B., Kaya, T., Çalışkan, F., Doğan, M., Öner, S., Kaya, T., and Erbay, E. (2020). Z kuşağı öğrencilerinin iş hayatı kişilik özelliklerinin ve iş beklentilerinin belirlenmesi: Ankara Üniversitesi örneği. *Sağlık Hizmetlerinde Kuram ve Uygulama Dergisi, 1*(1), 1-9.

Raskin, M. S. (1994). The Delphi study in field instruction revisited: Expert consensus on issues and research priorities. *Journal of Social Work Education, 30*(1), 75-89.

Ros, M., Schwartz, S. H., and Surkiss, S. (1999). Basic individual values, work values, and the meaning of work. *Applied psychology, 48*(1), 49-71.

Taris, R., and Feij, J. (2001). Longitudinal examination of the relationship between supplies–values fit and work outcomes. *Applied Psychology, 50*(1), 52-80.

Tunalı, S., and Kiraz, E. (2017). Gelecek üzerine araştırma yapma yöntemlerinin eğitim araştırmalarında kullanılması. *Yaşadıkça Eğitim, 31*(2), 41-54.

Turner, A. (2015). Generation Z: Technology and social interest. *The journal of individual Psychology, 71*(2), 103-113.

Twenge, J. M., Campbell, S. M., Hoffman, B. J., and Lance, C. E.(2010). Generational differences in work values: Leisure and extrinsic values increasing, social and intrinsic values decreasing. *Journal of Management, 36*(5), 1117-1142.

Wahab, M. A., Quazi, A., and Blackman, D. (2016). Measuring and validating Islamic work value constructs: An empirical exploration using Malaysian samples. *Journal of Business Research, 69*(10), 4194-4204.

Yıldırımalp, S., and Güvenç, D. (2020). Z kuşağının geleceğe yönelik ofis ve çalışma ortamı beklentilerine ilişkin bir çalışma. *Düzce Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi, 10*(1), 57-76.