Tarih ve Günce

Atatürk ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti Tarihi Dergisi Journal of Atatürk and the History of Turkish Republic I/1, (2017 Yaz), ss. 179-190.

A STUDY INTO THE CONCEPTS OF "TURKEY" AND "TURKISTAN" WHICH WERE USED FOR THE OTTOMAN STATE IN THE XIXth CENTURY*

Tuncer Baykara**
Translated by Gülay Webb

Abstract

"Türkistan and Türkiye/Türkiya" are two concepts which were used to describe their country by Turks who knew Europe and spoke a western language, but they were not widely distributed. However with effect from the middle of XIXth Century, as we definitely know after 1856, Turkistan started to be used for Ottoman countries as well, in official records and also later in literary work. This concept continued to live for a longer period of time until the beginning of XXth Century in official documents. In this essay has been included these consepts and their sources.

Keywords: Turkistan, Turks of Anatolia, Turkey, History of Anatolia, Turkish People

Öz

"Türkistan ve Türkiye / Türkiya", Avrupa'yı tanıyan ve batı dili konuşan Türkler tarafından ülkelerini tanımlamak için kullanılan yaygınlaşmamış iki kavramdır. Ancak XIX. Yüzyılın ortalarından itibaren, 1856'dan sonra, Türkistan Osmanlı ülkelerinde resmi kayıtlarda ve daha sonra edebi eserlerde kullanılmaya başlandı. Bu kavramlar, resmi belgelerde XX. Yüzyılın başlarına kadar daha uzun süre yaşamaya devam etti. Bu makale bu konseptleri ve kaynaklarını içermektedir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Türkistan, Anadolu Türkleri, Türkiye, Anadolu Tarihi, Türkler

^{*} Bu metnin Türkçesi 2002'de Londra'da toplanan 15. Ciepo toplantısında bildiri olarak sunulmuştur. Çeviri için Gülay Hanım'a teşekkür ederim.

^{**} Prof. Dr, Ege University.

Recently a remerkable attitude is being sensed against the concept of "TURKEY" amongst Turks in Turkey and some researchers, especially when the historical past is being discussed. For example the world famous French Medievel History expert Claude Cahen's book entitled "Pre-Ottoman Turkey" has for whatever reason been translated as Osmanlılardan Önce Anadolu'da Türkler (The Turks in Anatolia Before the Ottomans). But this work should have been understood and published directly and closest to the title which was given by it's author as Osmanlı Öncesinde Türkiye (Turkey Before the Ottomans).

As it sensed from this example as well that, there is a group of people working in the area of the history of Turkey who want to use the concept of "Turk" as least as possible. Instead of Turkey they prefer the Greek name Anadolu (Anatolia). Although it is true that, it appears the name Anatolia has been accepted as the equivalent to "Rum (Byzantine Greek)" which was in the past quite common geographically. It must be because of this that, the name of Seljuk State which existed between 1071-1308, a period where the concept of "Anatolia" was almost never referred to, has become widely known as the Anatolian Seljuks State. However experts world-wine in the subject, for example C. Cahen had clearly stated in his work that Turkey=Turquie, namely Türkiye could be used fort hat period. In just the same way, after Osman Turan, it became widespread practice to call the name of the state which was the west wing of the Seuljuks, as the Türkiye Selçuklu Devleti (Turkey Seljuk State).

It can be accepted that some Turkish historians and intellectuals finding what European experts have written to be incorrect, is an echo of their prejudice and not a scientific conviction. French researchers do not object to use the name of Turkey=Türkiye for 1300 years before, however according to some Turkish people the name Turkey is a work of the XXth Century. And fort his reason it would not be correct to use this many centuries advanced concept, for the Seljuk Era. However as we will demonstrate clearly below, the name Turkey goes back quite far and with it's Turkey form, goes back directly to the first half of XIXth Century.

After establishing this fact which is very closely related to the Turk concept, we will be satisfied to remind that this concept has, as a matter of fact, been used in the world for even the XII-XIIIth Centuries. We had shown in the book entitled Anadolu'nun Tarihi Coğrafyasına Giriş (Introduction to the Historical Geography of Anatolia) Ankara 1988, the names that were given by the people who lived in the country whose name is Turkey, to the geography that they lived on. The developments of the concept of Turkey which is sensed as that given by others, is going to be shown below.

The most effective study related to the subject is the one that belongs to B. Lewis; as we believe we have contributed to his basic and fundamental work, we saw it appropriate to examine the subject again.

B. Lewis in his work which was translated into Turkish as well was saying in brief these things below: "In the middle of the Nineteenth Century when the

young Ottomans who were under the influence of Europe, wanted to refer to their country as (Turquie=) Türkiye, they found it difficult to find an equivalent fort his name in Turkish. First they used the Farsi constructed word Türkistan which meant Country of the Turks. Later they abandoned this term possibly as it was appropriated for Middle Asia and they look the term Türkiye which was adapted from the European name which was the official name of the country in 1923"¹.

Although the Ottoman State was generally described most commonly as Devlet-i Aliye and Devlet-i Aliye-i Osmaniye (Exalted/Great Ottoman State) starting from the second half of the XIXth Century some Turkish writers started referring to it as "Türkiye" as well. The names "Türkiye/Türkiya" in Turkish publications started to be effective in the new era which came into being subsequently with the abolition of Ottoman Empire.

As far as Türkistan is concerned, this concept was used fort he Turkish countries beyond Ceyhun (River Oxus/Amu Darya) in Medieval Islamic History and geographical literature. Although Evliya Çelebi sometimes used "Türkistan" for Eastern Anatolia, it would not appear amongst Ottoman Turks as a concept that expressed the places where the Western Turkish Community lived in.

However with effect from the middle of XIXth Century, as we definitely know after 1856, Turkistan started to be used for Ottoman countries as well, in official records and also later in literary work. This concept which had the most effect on Şinasi, Namık Kemal and their contemporaries, continued to live for a longer period of time until the beginning of XXth Century in official documents.

"Türkistan and Türkiye/Türkiya" are two concepts which were used to describe their country by Turks who knew Europe and spoke a western language, but they were not widely distributed.

1. Türkistan

As we partly touched on above, this concept has been known since Medieval times as a Farsi word meaning the countries that Turks live in. But it's common meaning is the regions that the Turks lived in since the oldest times of history on the middle of Asia and in the east of Ceyhun River. However as Evliya Çelebi sometimes used this concept for the vicinity of Van, it is understood that it's meaning which is Country of Turks, continued in the subsequent centuries.

It is said that the "Türkistan" concept was used by the Young Ottomans in the XIXth Century to define the Ottoman Country. The first name that comes to mind on this subject is Şinasi (1826-1871), one of the first Turks who has been sent to Europe to study. Probably with the direct influence of Mustafa Reşit Pasha, he was sent to

¹ Bernard Lewis, *Modern Türkiye'nin Doğuşu*, translated by Metin Kıratlı, TTK, Ankara, 1970, p. 330.

France and met the concepts there. Because of this reason, the term Turquie which was used by them attracted his attention. It must be because of this and that he had republican tendencies in mind, instead of saying "Ottoman Country=Memalik-i Osmaniye" he preferred to revive an old concept of Türkistan. In Şinasi's first Eulogy which he presented to Reşit Pasha, the Türkistan concept was used clearly to Express his country:

Rûma bir Avrupalı büt vereli revnak ü şan

Reşk-i iklim-i frenk olmadadır Türkistan

Since a European (minded) person gave the Ottoman Empire the image of prosperity, power and glory Türkistan has become for European Countries, an object of envy and jealousy.

The Türkistan concept was quite effective in this era; as a matter of fact the Ottoman State had officially accepted and expressed it from the Padişah's (Sultan) mouth like this in the Paris Treaty:

"We the Sultan Gazi Abdulhamid Han whose son of Sultan Gazi Abdulmecid Han whose son of Sultan Gazi Mahmud, by the grace of God, are the Padişah of Türkistan and it's inclusive countries and towns, in this imperial letter of confirmation we declare and proclaim that my exalted state..."².

In our opinon, the Ottoman Padişah by using the concept of Türkistan was not only reflecting the developments in the western Turkish world but also he might have been having the thought of claming a specific right in Central Asia. In this way, he had stopped Russia to a certain extent in the Black Sea area after the Crimean War; he, by using the concept of Türkistan, was even making a counter attack.

According to us, this is the most remerkable side of the subject. As far as we can understand from the press arguments in around 1285/1868, the Terakki (Advancement/Progress) Newspaper had suggested Türkistan as the name of the state (see Dr. Ragib Özdem, "Tanzimattan Beri Yazı Dilimiz" (Our Written Language Since Tanzimat (the period of reforms 1839), Tanzimat, 1940, İstanbul, p. 860 and cont.) La Turquie Newspaper which was published in French objected to this and stated that it would be appropriated to call this place as Şask-eli (Eastern/Oriental Country).

Apart from Şinasi one of the persons who used the concept of "Türkistan" in their work is Namık Kemal (1840-1888). Namık Kemal of these two friends must have been influenced by Şinasi who was older than him. Ziya Pasha as well, is one those who used the expression "Türkistan". In this way İhsan Sungun in his footnote (p.840, line 91) of the entitled "Tanzimat and The New Ottomans" which was published in his famous Tanzimat book, was saying that "the title of Türkistan was used for Turkey for a while in the Tanzimat Press and some diplomatic

² Vakanüvis Ahmed Lütfi Efendi Tarihi, Vol IX., Published by M. Münir Aktepe, İstanbul, 1984, p. 230.

correspondence. Moreover in a serial advert in the İbret Magazine which commenced publication in 1288/1870, it referred to the book entitled Hayrabad which was written by the late Nabi Efendi who was "the distinguished poet of Ottoman countries and eloquent eminence of Türkistan". The expression Türkistan was also encountered in the Vakit (The Times) Newspaper which commenced publication in 1875. In the Abdulhamid period, Türkistan was more used fort he meaning of inner Asia. However in Ottoman official writing, especially in the texts of international treaties, Ottoman Padişahs including Mehmet Reşad saw themselves as the Padişah of Turkistan.

II. Türkiya-Türkiye

Türkiye/ Turkiya this concept started to be used amongst Ottoman intellectuals again in this period, starting from the middle of the XIXth Century.

In the concept of Türkiye, even starting from earliest times, the Türkiya and Türkiye forms are attracting attention. In the Arabic spelling, the using of "elif" (the letter A) or "fine he" (this is the 27th letter of the Arabic, 30th letter of Ottoman alphabet pronounced as h) has shown the existence of two different pronunciations. It is true that in the early periods of the XI-XIIIth Centuries, at the time of establishing of Turkish in Arabic Alphabet as well, it was sensed that "elif" was directly equivalent to "e". However the situation her, must have clearly reflected the expressions of Türkiya & Türkiye.

a. Türkiya

Two distinguished scholars Ahmed Vefik Pasha and Diyarbekirli Sait Pasha who used the word "Türkiya" in which had the letter "elif" at the end shold be mentioned especially.

Ahmed Vefik Pasha (1828-1891) commonly used the spelling and expression of "Türkiya" in the articles he wrote or he had had written in the Almanac and the Newspaper of the Hüdavendigar Vilayeti (name of a province comprising a large part of North Western Turkey/Province of Ottoman Princes) when he was the Vali (Governor) of Bursa.

Diyarbakırlı Said Pasha who is again a person of the same period was referring to "Türkiyâ-yı Avrupa", namely the form Türkiyâ in his work Miratül İber which was published in 1304/1886. The form of Türkiya as well is encountered in the İbret Magazine which was published in 1870.

It can be accepted that the years of Abdülhamid's reign was a period during which the concept of Türkiye/Türkiya had become widespread. Ahmed Mithat Efendi (1844-1912) and Abdülhak Hamit Tarhan (1852-1937) are the two people of

this period that used this concept quite abundantly. As a matter of fact the clearest sign of this is, it taking it's place in the French-Turkish dictionaries.

It is attracting attention in that Memalik-i Osmaniye and Türkiyâ has been given as an equivalent to Turquie in the French-Turkish Book of Ş. Sami who is a famous XIXth Century dictionary compiler. (Resimli Kamus-1 Frensevî "Illustrated French Lexicon", Dictionnaire Français-Turc Illustr. (simge 130/f "MS LineDraw), 3 ed. 1818/1901, İstanbul, p.2181a). Some of the Turks who spoke French or were trying to learn French, instead of saying Memalik-i Osmaniye, it is possible that they came into contact in this way with the word and spelling of Türkiya.

There is another important matter that attracts attention, in the 1922 printing of the Redhouse English-Turkish Dictionary, there is nothing similar fort he equivalent of Turkey.

b. Türkiye

Türkiye was used in the form of Türkiye even as early as the XIV-XV Centuries as the name of the Kölemen-Memluk State in Egypt.

The first example that we know for he present is Ali Suavi (1839-1878), where it is being used as the name of Ottoman State in the XIXth Century. He, in the Works that he published in Europe (Ulûm "Humanities", Turk Section) used both expression Türkiya and also Türkiye. For example he used the expression of Türkiye in two almanacs. Türkiye in 1288 and Türkiye in 1290, that is in 1872 and 1874. They each might be accepted as the almanacs which have been written about the Ottoman State in general. Ali Suavi here above all else whilst following the tradition in our country, must have felt more comfortable in Europe and preferred a spelling which is more in accordance with rules of Turkish.

The form of Türkiye was used between 1860-70 in the İstanbul Press as well. The Terakki Newspaper in 1868 and The Basiret in 1869 wrote about the Ottoman Country with the name and spelling of Türkiye.

b-2

If we don't attach too much importance to the forms of Türkiya&Türkiye, it seems the concept of Türkiye became common place with the influence of Young Turks who lived in Europe. The two books which were published in Egypt with the signs M.K. in 1907 were bearing the title of Türkiye: Türkiye'de Meclis-i Mebusan; Türkiye'de Sansür Eğlenceleri. (The Parliament in Turkey; The Censorship Joke In Turkey). The name of the books that came out in 1908 and in subsequent years were now solely Türkiye. For example N. Rizof Türkiye Nasıl Teceddüt Edebilir? Ahmet Rıza Bey'e Açık Mektup (How Can Türkiye Be Reformed? The Open Letter To Ahmet Rıza Bey), İstanbul Hilal Printers, 1325=1909 (İstanbul 1328/1912). The name

of İbrahim Hilmi's book too, was Uyan Türkiye (Wake up Turkey) (1329-1330/1913-1914).

Ziya Gökalp has an important place in the concept of Türkiye/Türkiya becoming widespread. Because he was using Türkiye as the name of the state even though in it's Türkiya form, in the poems he wrote that had quite an influence on the community. In his well known poem which was published in 1911 he said:

Vatan ne Türkiye'dir Türklere ne Türkistan,

Vatan büyük ve müebbed bir ülkedir: Turan.

The motherland is neither Türkiye nor Türkistan for Turks

The motherland is the great and eternal: Turan³

Or his poem in 1914

Düşmanın ülkesi viran olacak

Türkiye büyüyüp Turan olcak

The country of the enemy will be ruined

Türkiye will grow, and become Turan⁴

b-3

When the Ottaman State was defeated at the end of the First World War, Ottoman Statesmen thought of various solutions fort he situation after the enemy's occupation of the Ottoman provinces which were mostly Arab provinces. Thus in the state's new era, the concept of Turk which had not been much talked about until that time could have come to the front because those who lived in the remaining regions of the country were mostly this element and in the state's new erat his name could have been used more comfortably, very easily.

Before 23rd April 1920 came, in the years of 1918-1919, when the Ottoman State was still living with all it's organisations, the concept of Türkiye though in the form of Türkiya started to be enunciated loudly with the world's spiritual meaning. In the Ottoman History which was written by Necib Asım and Mehmed Arif (publication date 1335=1919) Türkiya was used commonly and actively.

The second book on this matter that attracts attention is the book of H. Kazım Kadri who didn't look warm to Mustafa Kemal Pasha and the ideas of Ankara but could not turn a blind eye to the situation that the country was in, maybe the most striking example amongst these. In his book entitled On Temmuz İnkılabı ve Netayici, Türkiyâ İnkırazının Saikleri (10th July Reforms and It's Consequences, Factors of Turkey's Decline which he wrote under the pseudonym Şeyh (Sheikh)

³ An ideal land where all Turks live.

⁴ Lewis, *ibid*, p. 348-349.

Muhsin-i Fani which was published by Tüccarzade Hilmi in 1336/1920, he said Türkiya even in the title.

Erkan-1 Harbiye Binbaşısı (General Staff Commander) Vecihi Bey's book entitled Filistin Ricati (Palestine Retreat) which was published by the military printing press in 1337 has been reflecting the situation in the year of the publication of the book. In this work both Türkiya (p. 4, 90) and Türkiye (p. 61) forms were being used.

Haşim Nahid (Erbil)'s book which he wrote in these years and entitled Üç Muamma (3 Mysteries) continues like this: "Garp Meselesi, Şark Meselesi, Türk Meselesi" (Western Affair, Eastern Affair, Turk Affair). This work was published in İstanbul (by the Kader Printing Press in 1337/1921) and now "Türk" was written with vav (the 29th letter of the Ottoman&Persian Alphabets; 26th letter of the Arabic Alphabet). In this work as well, as the name of the state Türkiye, has been given in a natural appearance.

After 1918, now in the new era of the state that was formerly named as the Ottoman State, the concept of Türkiye=Türkiya was used commonly.

Turkish Grand National Assembly: 23 April 1920

In 1920 during the re-opening of the Parliament in Ankara, in other words during the continuation of it's activities that had stopped previously, Türkiye was on the agenda for certain. During the foundation preparations of the Parliament, with it's subsequent name Turkish Grand National Assembly which was going to be opened on 23rd April 1920, the "Türk" based concept was received well generally. However at this tine the question of which one of Türkiye and Türkiya pronunciations should be preferred became a matter of debate. Whilst some of the Turks preferred "Türkiya", some of them wanted to use Türkiye. Dr. Rıza Nur who attended discussions effectively as both a statesman and intellectual had said: "I am the one who offered to refer to the state as Türkiye in our private discussions with you (Atatürk) when the Turkish Grand National Assembly was founded. I fought for it's approval as well. I gave evidence on this matter, it was my idea. As a matter of fact, as well as writing it in the Akşam Newspaper in an article, I had said it in the İstanbul Assembly as well, those who want to should refer to the minutes"⁵.

Dr. Rıza Nur referring to these elsewhere: "We are discussing how we are going to constitute the government, what the name of the state will be?" In these meetings we are becoming about 10 people. "What name is the state going to be given?". I said "there is no need to do so, it exists anyway: Türkiye". We had announced ourselves as the Great Ottoman State for centuries. But Europe referred to us Türkiye (Turkey) for centuries. I said this in the Assembly in İstanbulas well. The name Türkiye was accepted. Subsequently by being ignorant and conceited they wrote it as Türkiya, also thet made the official stamps like this as well. This is

⁵ Rıza Nur, *Hayat ve Hatıratım*, III, İstanbul, 1968, p. 569.

contrary to the vowel harmony rule of Turkish phonetics, I objected to this. Also one day İsmet (İnönü) asked me too which of Türkiye and Türkiya is correct. I explained. Eventually they corrected the stamps as well⁶.

In the 1920's since the beginning of the century, these concepts were known in the general thinking and Türkiye and especially Türkiya forms had been used anyway for a quite long time.

Now, if we comment on the known facts again, after 1918 even if a new government didn't arise, the name of the Ottoman State probably was going to be changed anyway.

These four Works about this which were published in İstanbul attracs attention:

- 1. 1335/1919 Türkiya
- 2. 1336/1920 Türkiya
- 3. 1337/1921 Türkiya/Türkiye
- 4. 1337/1921 Türkiye

Thus what the four (actually five) İstanbul intellectuals who appear to be independent from each other wrote , shows us clearly that the name Türkiye importantly started to take it's place especially amongst the intellectual sections of the society.

The book that Hüseyin Kazım Kadri wrote under the pseudonym Şeyh Muhsin-i Fani, was written by this influential member of Parliament who did not come to Ankara, confirms what Dr. Rıza Nur wrote about the spellings of Türkiya/Türkiye.

The pronunciation in the form of Türkiya virtually lived amongst the people who had their basic edication then and is remaining from this period. (For example İhsan Sabri Çağlayangil). Although the official name of the state was Turkey, the spelling of Türkiya can be seen in some popular publications after 1923 as well. For example Ratip Timur who drew a caricature in the Zümrüd-Anka (Phoenix) Magazine which came out in 1928, had written in the form of Türkiyâ Cumhuriyeti (Republic of Turkey) in Arabic Script. (Narrated by N. A. Banoğlu, Nükte, Fıkra ve Çizgilerle Atatürk, Yeni Tarih Dünyası, Atatürk Özel Sayısı, İstanbul, 1954, s. 20) (Atatürk by Witticisms, Anecdotes and Caricatures, New History World, Atatürk Special Edition). The Türkiya spelling with the old script continued in the year 1933 amongst Bulgaristan Turks as well.

Coming to the Türkistan concept, this has been forgotten amongst intellectuals in the earlier times. However it continued to take it's place until the reign of V.

_

⁶ Nur, *ibid*, p. 613-614.

Mehmed Reşad, in official titles of treaties that Ottoman State signed in foreign countries. However this generally hasn't been influential amongst the community.

As a result, in the light of these developments, we can say that after 1918, even if the state continued as a sultanate it seems strongly possible that Türkiye would have taken it's place in the state's name.

REFERENCES

BAYKARA, Tuncer, *The Meaning of Turk*, Ankara, 2000; on the "Turk" concept also what S. G. Clauson, G. Doerfer, Z. Velidi Togan, H. N. Orkun and İ. Kafesoğlu can be seen.

ERDEM, Hakan, "Türkistan, Nerede, Ne Zaman?", Toplumsal Tarih, Sayı: 58, (Eylül 1998).

LEWIS, Bernard, Modern Türkiye'nin Doğuşu, çev. Metin Kıratlı, Ankara, 1970.

NUR, Rıza, Hayat ve Hatıratım, III, İstanbul, 1968.

Osmanlı Muahedeleri, Devlet Arşivleri Genel Müdürlüğü, İstanbul, 2000.

ÖZDEM, Ragıb, "Tanzimattan Beri Yazı Dilimiz", Tanzimat, İstanbul, 1940.

SUNGU, Sungu, "Tanzimat ve Yeni Osmanlılar", Tanzimat, İstanbul, 1940.

Vakanüvis Ahmed Lütfi Efendi Tarihi, Vol IX., Published by M. Münir Aktepe, İstanbul, 1984.