DOI: https://doi.org/10.17214/gaziaot.1390998

Case report Megalith of the Wharton's duct: Review of literature and a case report

Sercan Küçükkurt 🕞

Department of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, Faculty of Dentistry, Istanbul Aydın University, Istanbul, Türkiye

ABSTRACT

Sialolithiasis, the most common disorder affecting salivary glands, occurs when calcified formations obstruct the ducts or glands. Typically, these formations, known as sialoliths, measure between 5 and 10 mm; however, those exceeding 15 mm are classified as megaliths. While sialoliths commonly manifest in the submandibular glands, they can develop in any salivary gland duct, with the Wharton's duct of the submandibular gland being a frequent site. These stones, formed from calcified organic material within the secretory system, can lead to pain, swelling, and disruptions in saliva flow. Chronic sialolithiasis, the primary contributor to acute and chronic infections in salivary glands, is closely associated with stone formation. The precise cause remains unclear, yet it is linked to chronic sialadenitis and partial obstruction. On the contrary, megaliths are exceptionally rare and tend to occur more frequently in male patients. The present article presents a case involving a 19 mm long megalith detected at the duct mouth of the left submandibular gland, which was treated through surgical intervention. Additionally, a comprehensive literature review on this specific topic was conducted.

KEYWORDS: Salivary gland calculi; sialolithiasis; Wharton's duct

CITATION: Küçükkurt S. Megalith of the Wharton's duct: Review of literature and a case report. Acta Odontol Turc 2025;42(1):36-42

EDITOR: Yeliz Kılınç, Gazi University, Ankara, Türkiye

COPYRIGHT: © 2025 Küçükkurt. This work is licensed under a <u>Creative Commons Attribution License</u>. Unrestricted use, distribution and reproduction in any medium is permitted provided the original author and source are credited.

FUNDING: None declared.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST: None declared.

[Abstract in Turkish is at the end of the manuscript]

INTRODUCTION

Sialolithiasis, the primary concern affecting salivary glands, involves the development of salivary stones within ducts or glands and is estimated to occur in approximately 1.2% of adults.^{1,2} This condition, also called salivary calculi, predominantly manifests in the submandibular gland and its duct, constituting more than 80% of documented cases.^{3,4}

The submandibular gland is particularly susceptible to sialolithiasis due to the distinctive characteristics of Wharton's duct, which include its lengthy and convoluted path and the specific properties of saliva.^{2.3} Notably, there is a significant gender difference, with males being twice as likely as females to experience this condition. It tends to affect individuals in their fourth to sixth decades of life.^{1,4}

While most cases exhibit intermittent pain and swelling, the severity depends on the degree of obstruction and the resulting pressure in the gland, particularly noticeable during meals.^{3,4} Radiographically, salivary stones usually appear as visible masses, but not all are discernible through standard X-rays. The diagnostic arsenal incorporates cone-beam computed tomography (CBCT) for assessing the submandibular duct.^{3,5}

Giant sialoliths, commonly known as megaliths, represent a rare form of sialolithiasis characterized by salivary stones exceeding 15 mm in any dimension.^{6,7} This distinct subset of sialoliths is primarily found in the submandibular gland and its duct, presenting diagnostic challenges due to their infrequency and potential impact on salivary gland function. A comprehensive literature review reveals only 29 reported cases of megaliths in Wharton's duct in the past 22 years, underscoring their rarity and emphasizing the importance of heightened clinical awareness.⁶

This article presents a case involving a megalith, a sizable salivary stone measuring 19 mm in length, detected at the duct mouth of the left submandibular gland. The case was successfully treated through surgical intervention. Additionally, a comprehensive literature review was conducted to provide a detailed exploration of relevant information and insights from existing studies and reports.

Received: November 14, 2023; Accepted: January 22, 2024 *Corresponding Author: Dr. Sercan Küçükkurt, Istanbul Aydın University, Faculty of Dentistry, Department of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, Beşyol Mahallesi, Akasya Sokak No: 6, Küçükçekmece, Istanbul, Türkiye; E-mail: <u>sercankucukkurt@aydin.edu.tr</u>

CASE REPORT

A 54-year-old man sought treatment at Istanbul Aydın University, Faculty of Dentistry, Department of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, due to persistent and painful purulent discharge from the unilateral submandibular ducts. The patient had no significant medical history, and no underlying conditions contributing to sialolith formation were identified.

Upon thorough examination, it was revealed that the issue originated as a minor swelling, evolving over nine months and eventually rupturing, leaving a yellowish-white mass on the right floor of the mouth. The patient underwent discomfort and the release of pus from the affected area. The enlargement exhibited a slow initiation, progressively growing in magnitude. The patient also reported an altered taste sensation for one year, accompanied by occasional pus discharge. No symptoms of dysphagia or tongue elevation were reported. The patient was conscious, cooperative, and within normal vital sign limits. Pain, described as dull and intermittent, was associated with meals, with the swelling enlarging during and after meals.

Extraoral examination showed a localized swelling in the left submandibular region, exhibiting tenderness and softness upon palpation, with normal overlying skin. Intraoral examination revealed edematous flooring on the left side of the mouth. Bimanual palpation detected a hard mass measuring approximately 2 × 1 cm in the left canine region. The overlying mucosa displayed standard color, except where a break exposed the underlying yellowish mass. Milking of the left submandibular gland resulted in minimal saliva but pus discharge. Notably, the entity has not adhered to underlying structures (Figure 1).



Figure 1. (A) Preoperative intraoral image, (B) Appearance after the sialolith removal, measuring 19 mm in length and 12 mm in diameter.

The mandible's orthopantomogram (OPG) showed a calcified mass resembling an impacted canine tooth in the left canine region. The OPG displayed a radioopaque mass in the left body of the mandible, measuring approximately 2×1 cm, extending 1 cm above the apices of teeth 33 and 34 and 4 cm below the lower border of the mandible. Subsequent computerized tomographic (CT) scans confirmed the presence of a cylindrical and elongated sialolith within the left Wharton's duct, leading to the diagnosis of the left submandibular duct sialolith (Figure 2).



Figure 2. Image of the lesion on the (A) OPG and (B) a three-dimensional model created using CBCT.



Figure 3. (A) Access to the lesion was achieved with a conservative incision, revealing the expanded duct opening after removing the lesion, (B) Suturing of the incision line with polypropylene sutures and fixation of the catheter placed to preserve canal integrity with silk stitches.



Figure 4. (A) On the 10th-day post-operation, dimensional almost normalization of the salivary gland duct opening and the region, presumed to be a ranula formed after surgical trauma, (B) Intraoral view in the first month after the operation.

With informed consent, the giant sialolith was surgically removed via an intraoral approach under local anesthesia, using transoral sialolithotomy and sialodochoplasty for minimal invasiveness. Upward and medial pressure was applied to stabilize the floor of the mouth and accurately locate the sialolith. A longitudinal incision was made over the stone, followed by meticulous mucosal dissection to expose and mobilize the sialolith. The wound was closed only at the mucosal layer. Examination post-removal revealed a hard, yellow, elongated stone measuring 19 mm in length and 12 mm in diameter. A drainage catheter was inserted postoperatively to manage purulent discharge. On the tenth day post-surgery, a ranula formation was noticed in the area, believed to be a result of surgical trauma. The ranula was addressed through a straightforward surgical intervention (Figure 3).

Postoperatively, the patient received antibiotics (amoxicillin + clavulanate, 2000 mg/day) and an analgesic (Dexketoprofen 25 mg/day) for five days. The drainage catheter was removed after 48 hours. Reassessment on the seventh postoperative day indicated normalcy in the left submandibular gland, with clear salivary flow from the healed duct (Figure 4). After a three-year follow-up, it was observed that the patient showed no symptoms, displaying adequate glandular function and normal, uninterrupted salivary flow.

DISCUSSION

In the literature review using the PUBMED database, a total of 59 case reports were found in 51 articles as a result of the search with the terms "Giant Submandibular Sialolith." "Large Submandibular Sialolith" and "Submandibular Megalith" among the articles published between 2000 and 2023 (Table 1).

When the dimensions of the sialoliths reported in the case reports are listed according to the largest value in the dimensions, the largest sialolith was reported as 72 mm by Rai and Burman⁸ in 2009. The average size of 59 cases was found to be 32.5 mm. When the area between 15-35 mm was divided into megaliths, and those over 35 mm were divided into giant sialoliths, the average size of 35 megalith cases was found to be 25.2 mm, and the average size of 24 giant sialoliths was found to be 43.1 mm. While the general average age of the cases is 47.5, it is 46.5 for giant sialoliths and 48.1 for megaliths. Fifty-one of the cases are male, and only 8 of them are female. This age range and male dominant gender status appear to be compatible with the data in the literature.1,9

Sialoliths, common in sialadenitis, are calcified formations in salivary ducts or glands. They consist of glycoproteins, mucopolysaccharides, and inorganic substances. These stones form around a central core, appearing as radiopaque masses mostly in submandibular glands.9,10

Giant sialoliths or megaliths are a rare subset of salivary gland disorders. In the literature, stones exceeding 15 mm in any dimensional value are referred to as megaliths, while those surpassing 35 mm are classified as giants.11,12

They mainly affect males, with the submandibular gland being the primary location in 94% of cases.^{1,13} The etiology and pathogenesis align with conventional sialolithiasis theories, involving the deposition of calcium salts around an initial organic nidus.^{2,13} Diagnosis involves various radiographic studies, and treatment plans vary based on the stone type and location.7,14 Options include simple approaches, surgery, or advanced methods like shock wave treatment and sialoendoscopy.3,15

Sialolithiasis, a condition characterized by the formation of salivary gland stones, is prevalent among individuals between the ages of 30 and 50, and it tends to affect males more frequently.^{1,9} It is notably rare in children. The submandibular duct or gland (80%) is the most commonly affected, followed by the parotid gland (18%), and rarely the sublingual gland (2%).^{2,16,17}

The etiology and pathogenesis of sialoliths are intricate and not completely comprehended, reflecting the complex and multifaceted nature of their origin and development. Sialoliths develop when calcium salts accumulate around an initial organic core. This core consists of altered salivary mucins, bacteria, and shed epithelial cells.11,15,18 Traditional theories propose a Table 1. Evaluation of 59 cases included in 51 articles obtained as a result of scanning between 2000 and 2023 using the PUBMED database

| Rai and Burman ⁸ 72 60 M Chaidas et al. ⁸ 58 72 M Rauso et al. ⁴¹ 56 56 M Shahoon et al. ⁴² 55 25 M Lim et al. ⁴³ 50 59 M Bodner ⁴⁵ 45 50 M Bodner ⁴⁵ 45 48 F Akinyamoju and Adisa ³² 44 54 M Singh et al. ¹⁵ 42 40 M Fowell and MacBean ⁴⁸ 41 58 M Wai et al. ⁴⁷ 41 53 M Pandarakalam et al. ⁴⁹ 40 68 M Mathew et al. ⁴⁹ 39 50 M Charan et al. ²⁴ 35 42 M Charan Patel ⁸¹ 35 57 M Charand Patel ⁸¹ 35 55 M Raveenthiran et al. ⁵⁶ 35 10 F Krishnan et al. ⁵⁶ 35 50 M < | REFERENCE | SIZE (mm) | AGE | GENDER |
|---|------------------------------------|-----------|------|----------|
| Chaidas et al. ⁶ 58 72 M Rauso et al. ⁴¹ 56 56 M Shahoon et al. ⁴² 55 25 M Lim et al. ⁴¹ 50 42 M Bodner ⁴⁵ 45 50 M Rodrigues et al. ²¹ 45 48 F Akinyamoju and Adisa ³² 44 54 M Singh et al. ¹⁵ 42 40 M Fowell and MacBean ⁴⁶ 41 58 M Iwai et al. ⁴⁷ 41 53 M Abraham et al. ¹² 40 45 M Pandarakalam et al. ⁴⁹ 40 68 M Mathew et al. ⁴⁹ 39 50 M Chara and Patel ⁵¹ 35 27 M Ledesma-Montes et al. ⁵⁰ 36 34 M Chara and Patel ⁵¹ 35 57 M Goh et al. ⁵⁴ 35 34 M Ighal et al. ¹⁵ 35 55 M Raveenthiran et al. ⁵⁵ 35 10 F | Rai and Burman ⁸ | 72 | 60 | М |
| Rauso et al. ⁴¹ 56 56 M Shahoon et al. ⁴² 55 25 M Lim et al. ⁴³ 50 59 M Bodner ⁴⁶ 45 50 M Bodner ⁴⁶ 45 50 M Rodrigues et al. ²¹ 45 48 F Akinyamoju and Adisa ³² 44 54 M Singh et al. ¹⁵ 42 40 M Fowell and MacBean ⁴⁶ 41 53 M Iwai et al. ⁴⁷ 41 53 M Abraham et al. ¹² 40 45 M Pandarakalam et al. ⁴⁸ 40 68 M Mathew et al. ⁴⁹ 39 50 M Chara and Patel ⁵¹ 35 27 M Ledesma-Montes et al. ⁵⁰ 36 34 M Chan and Patel ⁵¹ 35 57 M Goh et al. ⁵⁴ 35 55 M Raveenthiran et al. ⁵⁵ 35 10 F Krishnan et al. ⁵⁶ 30 45 M B | Chaidas et al.6 | 58 | 72 | М |
| Shahoon et al. ⁴² 55 25 M Lim et al. ⁴³ 50 59 M Sakthivel et al. ⁴⁴ 50 42 M Bodner ⁴⁵ 45 50 M Rodrigues et al. ²¹ 45 48 F Akinyamoju and Adisa ³² 44 54 M Singh et al. ¹⁶ 42 40 M Fowell and MacBean ⁴⁶ 41 58 M Iwai et al. ⁴⁷ 41 53 M Abraham et al. ⁴⁹ 40 68 M Mathew et al. ⁴⁹ 39 50 M Omezli et al. ²¹ 37 35 M Ledesma-Montes et al. ⁵⁰ 36 34 M Arslan et al. ²⁴ 35 42 M Chan and Patel ⁵¹ 35 57 M Goh et al. ⁵⁴ 35 35 55 M Ipbal et al. ¹⁶ 35 55 M M Bohner ⁴⁵ 30 45 | Rauso <i>et al.</i> 41 | 56 | 56 | М |
| Lim et al. ⁴³ 50 59 M Sakthivel et al. ⁴⁴ 50 42 M Bodner ⁴⁵ 45 50 M Rodrigues et al. ²¹ 45 48 F Akinyamoju and Adisa ³² 44 54 M Singh et al. ¹⁵ 42 40 M Fowell and MacBean ⁴⁶ 41 58 M Iwai et al. ⁴⁷ 41 53 M Abraham et al. ¹⁹ 40 45 M Pandarakalam et al. ⁴⁰ 40 68 M Mathew et al. ⁵⁹ 39 50 M Chan and Patel ⁵¹ 35 27 M El Gehani et al. ⁵² 35 41 M Emir et al. ⁵³ 35 57 M Iqbal et al. ¹⁶ 35 55 M Raveenthiran et al. ⁵⁵ 35 10 F Krishnan et al. ⁵⁶ 30 45 M Bodner ⁴⁵ 30 25 M Oliveira et al. ¹⁵⁹ 30 75 M Bo | Shahoon <i>et al.</i> 42 | 55 | 25 | М |
| Sakthivel et al. ²⁴ 50 42 M Bodner ⁴⁵ 45 50 M Rodrigues et al. ²¹ 45 48 F Akinyamoju and Adisa ³² 44 54 M Singh et al. ¹⁵ 42 40 M Fowell and MacBean ⁴⁶ 41 58 M Iwai et al. ⁴⁷ 41 53 M Abraham et al. ¹² 40 45 M Pandarakalam et al. ⁴⁶ 40 68 M Mathew et al. ⁴⁹ 39 50 M Omezli et al. ² 37 35 M Ledesma-Montes et al. ⁵⁰ 36 34 M Arslan et al. ²⁴ 35 42 M Chan and Patel ⁵¹ 35 57 M Goh et al. ⁵⁴ 35 55 M Iga et al. ¹⁶ 35 55 M Reventhiran et al. ⁵⁵ 35 10 F Krishnan et al. ⁵⁶ 34 41 M Bodner ⁴⁵ 30 25 M Bo | Lim <i>et al.</i> 43 | 50 | 59 | М |
| Bodner ⁴⁵ 45 50 M Rodrigues et al. ²¹ 45 48 F Akinyamoju and Adisa ³² 44 54 M Singh et al. ¹⁵ 42 40 M Fowell and MacBean ⁴⁶ 41 53 M Iwai et al. ⁴⁷ 41 53 M Abraham et al. ¹² 40 45 M Pandarakalam et al. ⁴⁸ 40 68 M Mathew et al. ⁴⁹ 39 50 M Omezli et al. ² 37 35 M Ledesma-Montes et al. ⁵⁰ 36 34 M Chan and Patel ⁵¹ 35 27 M El Gehani et al. ⁵² 35 41 M Emir et al. ⁵³ 35 55 M Raveenthiran et al. ⁵⁵ 35 10 F Krishnan et al. ⁵⁶ 30 45 M Bodner ⁴⁵ 30 25 M Demircan and Isler ⁶⁰ 30 62 | Sakthivel et al.44 | 50 | 42 | М |
| Rodrigues et al. ²¹ 45 48 F Akinyamoju and Adisa ³² 44 54 M Singh et al. ¹⁵ 42 40 M Fowell and MacBean ⁴⁶ 41 58 M Iwai et al. ⁴⁷ 41 53 M Abraham et al. ¹² 40 45 M Pandarakalam et al. ⁴⁸ 40 68 M Mathew et al. ⁴⁹ 39 50 M Ornezil et al. ² 37 35 M Ledesma-Montes et al. ⁵⁰ 36 34 M Arslan et al. ²⁴ 35 42 M Chan and Patel ⁵¹ 35 27 M El Gehani et al. ⁵² 35 41 M Emir et al. ⁵³ 35 57 M Iqbal et al. ¹⁶ 35 55 M Raveenthiran et al. ⁵⁵ 35 10 F Krishnan et al. ⁵⁶ 30 45 M Bodner ⁴⁵ 30 25 M Dedrier ⁴⁵ 30 45 M | Bodner ⁴⁵ | 45 | 50 | М |
| Akinyamoju and Adisa ³² 44 54 M Singh et al. ¹⁵ 42 40 M Fowell and MacBean ⁴⁶ 41 58 M Iwai et al. ⁴⁷ 41 53 M Abraham et al. ¹² 40 45 M Pandarakalam et al. ⁴⁸ 40 68 M Mathew et al. ⁴⁹ 39 50 M Omezli et al. ² 37 35 M Ledesma-Montes et al. ⁵⁰ 36 34 M Arslan et al. ²⁴ 35 42 M Chan and Patel ⁵¹ 35 57 M Goh et al. ⁵⁴ 35 35 57 M Goh et al. ⁵⁴ 35 55 M B Iqbal et al. ¹⁶ 35 55 M B Raveenthiran et al. ⁵⁶ 34 41 M Alkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 31 65 M Bodner ⁴⁵ 30 25 M Oliveira et al. ²⁹ | Rodrigues et al.21 | 45 | 48 | F |
| Singh et al. 15 4240MFowell and MacBean 46 4158MIwai et al. 47 4153MAbraham et al. 12 4045MPandarakalam et al. 48 4068MMathew et al. 49 3950MOmezli et al. 2 3735MLedesma-Montes et al. 50 3634MArslan et al. 24 3542MChan and Patel ⁵¹ 3527MEl Gehani et al. 52 3541MIgbal et al.353555MGoh et al. 54 3535Igbal et al. 16 3555MRaveenthiran et al. 55 3510FKrishnan et al. 56 3441MAlkurt and Pekef ⁵⁷ 3165MBodner ⁴⁵ 3025MCottrell et al. 59 3075MDemircan and Isler ⁶⁰ 3062MOliveira et al. 22 3042MYildirim ⁶¹ 3056MAlkurt and Peker ⁶⁷ 2845MAlkurt and Peker ⁶⁷ 2845MGoire at al. 22 3042MYildirim ⁶¹ 3056MAlkurt and Peker ⁶⁷ 2845MGodner ⁴⁵ 2646MEl Gehani et al. 52 2532FGadve et al. $^{$ | Akinyamoju and Adisa ³² | 44 | 54 | М |
| Fowell and MacBean*64158MIwai et al.474153MAbraham et al.474045MPandarakalam et al.484068MMathew et al.493950MComezli et al.23735MLedesma-Montes et al.503634MArslan et al.243542MChan and Patel513527MEl Gehani et al.523541MEl Gehani et al.533557MIqbal et al.16353557Iqbal et al.16353557Raveenthiran et al.553510FKrishnan et al.563441MAlkurt and Peker573165MBodner453025MCottrell et al.593075MDemircan and Isler603062MVildirim613056MAlkurt and Peker572845MQuipta et al.42848MKumar et al.592648MShetty and Sharma ⁶⁴ 2750MBiddle and Arora ⁶⁵ 2648MShetty and Sharma ⁶⁴ 2532FGadve et al.692545MBiddle and Arora ⁶⁵ 2648MBodner452532FSaarse et al.692545MShetty and Sharma ⁶⁴ 27< | Singh <i>et al.</i> ¹⁵ | 42 | 40 | М |
| Iwai et al. ⁴⁷ 41 53 M Abraham et al. ¹² 40 45 M Pandarakalam et al. ⁴⁸ 40 68 M Mathew et al. ⁴⁹ 39 50 M Omezli et al. ² 37 35 M Ledesma-Montes et al. ⁵⁰ 36 34 M Arslan et al. ²⁴ 35 42 M Chan and Patel ⁵¹ 35 27 M El Gehani et al. ⁵² 35 41 M Emir et al. ⁵⁴ 35 35 57 M Goh et al. ⁵⁴ 35 34 M Iqbal et al. ¹⁶ Raveenthiran et al. ⁵⁵ 35 10 F Krishnan et al. ⁵⁶ 34 41 M Alkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 31 65 M Bodner ⁴⁵ 30 25 M Oliveira et al. ²⁹ 30 75 M Demircan and Isler ⁶⁰ 30 62 M Vildirim ⁶¹ | Fowell and MacBean ⁴⁶ | 41 | 58 | М |
| Abraham et al. 12 4045MPandarakalam et al. 49 3950MOmezli et al. 2 3735MLedesma-Montes et al. 50 3634MArslan et al. 24 3542MChan and Patel 51 3527MEl Gehani et al. 52 3541MEmir et al. 53 3557MGoh et al. 54 353555Raveenthiran et al. 55 3510FKrishnan et al. 56 3441Alkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 3165MBodner ⁴⁵ 3025MCottrell et al. 59 3075MDemircan and Isler 60 3062MOliveira et al. 29 3075MAlkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 2845MAlkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 2845MAlkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 2845MAlkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 2845MAlkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 2845MGupta et al. 4 2847MShetty and Sharma ⁶⁴ 2750MBiddle and Arora ⁶⁵ 2646MEl Gehani et al. 52 2532FGadve et al. 66 2545MBodner ⁴⁵ 2532FSoares et al. 97 2554FThong et al. 20 2571MBi | Iwai <i>et al.</i> 47 | 41 | 53 | М |
| Pandarakalam et al. ⁴⁹ 4068MMathew et al. ⁴⁹ 3950MOmezli et al. ² 3735MLedesma-Montes et al. ⁵⁰ 3634MArslan et al. ²⁴ 3542MChan and Patel ⁵¹ 3527MEl Gehani et al. ⁵² 3541MEmir et al. ⁵³ 3557MGoh et al. ⁵⁴ 353555MRaveenthiran et al. ⁵⁵ 35Raveenthiran et al. ⁵⁶ 3441Alkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 3165Bhullar et al. ⁵⁹ 3075Bodner ⁴⁵ 3045Bodner ⁴⁵ 3045Bodner ⁴⁵ 3062MOliveira et al. ²² 30Otiveira et al. ²² 3042MGupta et al. ²³ 75MGupta et al. ⁴ 28Alkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 2845Al Hussona ⁶² 2821MGupta et al. ⁴ 28Al Hussona ⁶⁴ 2750MBiddle and Arora ⁶⁵ 262646M2532FGadve et al. ⁵⁶ 25Soares et al. ⁶⁷ 25Soares et al. ⁶⁷ 25Contrel et al. ²⁹ 25Man et al. ⁵⁶ 25Man et al. ⁵⁶ 25Mohsin et al. ⁵⁶ 25Soares et al. ⁶⁷ 25Soares et al. ⁶⁷ 25Soares et al. ⁶⁷ < | Abraham et al.12 | 40 | 45 | М |
| Mathew et al. ⁴⁹ 3950MOmezli et al. ² 3735MLedesma-Montes et al. ⁵⁰ 3634MArslan et al. ²⁴ 3542MChan and Patel ⁵¹ 3527MEl Gehani et al. ⁵² 3541MEmir et al. ⁵³ 3557MGoh et al. ⁵⁴ 3534MIqbal et al. ¹⁶ 3555MRaveenthiran et al. ⁵⁵ 3510FKrishnan et al. ⁵⁶ 3441MAlkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 3165MBodner ⁴⁵ 3045MBodner ⁴⁵ 3025MCottrell et al. ⁵⁹ 3075MDemircan and Isler ⁶⁰ 3062MOliveira et al. ²² 3042MYildırım ⁶¹ 3056MAlkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 2845MAlkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 2845MAlkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 2845MGupta et al. ⁴ 2847MShetty and Sharma ⁶⁴ 2750MBiddle and Arora ⁶⁵ 2646MEl Gehani et al. ⁵⁶ 2532FGacve et al. ⁶⁶ 2532FSoares et al. ⁶⁷ 2554FThong et al. ²⁰ 2571MRivera-Serrano and Schaitkin ⁶⁸ 2369Mungari et al. ⁶⁹ 2370M | Pandarakalam et al.48 | 40 | 68 | М |
| Omezli et $al.^2$ 37 35 M Ledesma-Montes et $al.^{50}$ 36 34 M Arslan et $al.^{24}$ 35 42 M Chan and Patel ⁵¹ 35 27 M El Gehani et $al.^{52}$ 35 41 M Emir et $al.^{53}$ 35 57 M Goh et $al.^{154}$ 35 55 M Raveenthiran et $al.^{56}$ 34 41 M Alkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 31 65 M Bodner ⁴⁵ 30 45 M Bodner ⁴⁵ 30 25 M Cottrell et $al.^{59}$ 30 75 M Demircan and Isler ⁶⁰ 30 62 M Oliveira et $al.^{22}$ 30 42 M Yildrim ⁶¹ 30 56 M Alkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 28 45 M All Hussona ⁶² 28 21 M Gupta et $al.^4$ 28 47 | Mathew et al.49 | 39 | 50 | М |
| Ledesma-Montes et al.503634MArslan et al.243542MChan and Patel513527MEl Gehani et al.523541MEmir et al.633557MGoh et al.54353557Raveenthiran et al.553510FKrishnan et al.563441Alkurt and Peker573165MBhullar et al.563441Bodner453045MBodner453025MCottrell et al.593075MDemircan and Isler603062MOliveira et al.223042MYildrim613056MAlkurt and Peker572845MOliveira et al.223042MYildrim613056MAlkurt and Peker572845MAlkurt and Peker572845MAlkurt and Peker572845MBiddle and Arora652648MBodner452646MEl Gehani et al.562532FGadve et al.662545MKrishnan et al.562532FGadve et al.662545MKrishnan et al.562532FSoares et al.672554FThong et al.692370MBidfan ant dalles | Omezli et al.2 | 37 | 35 | М |
| Arslan et al.243542MChan and Patels13527MEl Gehani et al.523541MEmir et al.533557MGoh et al.54353557Raveenthiran et al.553510FKrishnan et al.563441Alkurt and Peker573165Bhullar et al.583145Bodner453045Bodner453025Bodner453062MOliveira et al.2230Oliveira et al.223042Yildirm613056Alkurt and Peker5728Alkurt and Peker5728Balkurt and Peker5728Alkurt and Peker5728Alkurt and Peker5728Alkurt and Peker5728Alkurt and Peker5728Alkurt and Peker5728Alkurt and Peker5728Setty and Sharm6427SoMBiddle and Arora85262648Mohsin et al.1425Soares et al.6725Thong et al.1925Thong et al.2025Mac et al.41Softano and Schaitkin682369Mungari et al.72202437Mohsin et al.712010Milosher et al.72312032703334343535< | Ledesma-Montes et al.50 | 36 | 34 | М |
| Chan and Patel3527MEl Gehani et al. 5^{52} 3541MEmir et al. 5^{53} 3557MGoh et al. 5^{54} 353555MRaveenthiran et al. 5^{55} 3510FKrishnan et al. 5^{56} 3441MAlkurt and Peker3165MBodner 30 45MBodner 30 25MCottrell et al. 5^{9} 3075MDemircan and Isler 30 62Oliveira et al. 22 30 42Yildirm 30 56MAlkurt and Peker 28 28Quita et al. 41 28Alkurt and Peker 27 50MGupta et al. 41 Gupta et al. 41 28 Al Hussona 28 29Mohsin et al. 14 28 Shetty and Sharma 26 46 MEl Gehani et al. 52 Soares et al. 57 54 FSoares et al. 57 Soares et al. 25 54 Thong et al. 20 37 M 36 48 M 36 48 M 36 48 M 30 56 M 57 53 Soares et al. 57 Soares et al. 52 M 55 54 M <t< td=""><td>Arslan et al.24</td><td>35</td><td>42</td><td>М</td></t<> | Arslan et al.24 | 35 | 42 | М |
| El Gehani et al. ⁵² 35 41 M Emir et al. ⁵³ 35 57 M Goh et al. ⁵⁴ 35 34 M Iqbal et al. ¹⁶ 35 55 M Raveenthiran et al. ⁵⁵ 35 10 F Krishnan et al. ⁵⁶ 34 41 M Alkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 31 65 M Bodner ⁴⁵ 30 45 M Bodner ⁴⁵ 30 25 M Cottrell et al. ⁵⁹ 30 75 M Demircan and Isler ⁶⁰ 30 62 M Oliveira et al. ²² 30 42 M Yildirm ⁶¹ 30 56 M Alkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 28 45 M Gupta et al. ⁴ 28 48 M Kumar et al. ⁶³ 28 29 M Mohsin et al. ¹⁴ 28 47 M Shetty and Sharma ⁶⁴ 27 50 M | Chan and Patel ⁵¹ | 35 | 27 | М |
| Emir et al. 53 3557MGoh et al. 54 3534MIqbal et al. 16 3555MRaveenthiran et al. 55 3510FKrishnan et al. 56 3441MAlkurt and Peker 57 3165MBhullar et al. 18 3145MBodner 45 3045MBodner 45 3025MCottrell et al. 59 3075MDemircan and Isler 60 3062MOliveira et al. 22 3042MYildirm 61 3056MAlkurt and Peker 57 2845MAlkurt and Peker 57 2845MGupta et al. 4 2848MKumar et al. 63 2829MMohsin et al. 14 2847MShetty and Sharma 64 2750MBiddle and Arora 65 2646MEI Gehani et al. 52 2532FGadve et al. 66 2545MKrishnan et al. 56 2554FThong et al. 20 2571MRivera-Serrano and Schaitkin 68 2369MUngari et al. 69 2370MBoffano and Gallesio 36 2248MGraziani et al. 71 2010M <trr>Nilesh et al.7220<t< td=""><td>El Gehani et al.52</td><td>35</td><td>41</td><td>М</td></t<></trr> | El Gehani et al.52 | 35 | 41 | М |
| Goh et al. 54 3534MIqbal et al. 16 3555MRaveenthiran et al. 55 3510FKrishnan et al. 56 3441MAlkurt and Peker 57 3165MBhullar et al. 58 3145MBodner 45 3045MBodner 45 3025MCottrell et al. 59 3075MDemircan and Isler 60 3062MOliveira et al. 22 3042MYıldırım 61 3056MAlkurt and Peker 57 2845MAl Hussona 62 2821MGupta et al. 4 2848MKumar et al. 63 2829MMohsin et al. 14 2847MShetty and Sharma 64 2750MBiddle and Arora 65 2648MEd ehani et al. 52 2532FGadve et al. 66 2545MKrishnan et al. 56 2532FSoares et al. 67 2554FThong et al. 20 2571MRivera-Serrano and Schaitkin 68 2369MUngari et al. 20 2571MBiffano and Gallesio 36 2248MGraziani et al. 70 2261MArunkumar et al | Emir <i>et al.</i> 53 | 35 | 57 | М |
| Iqbal et al. ¹⁶ 3555MRaveenthiran et al. ⁵⁵ 3510FKrishnan et al. ⁵⁶ 3441MAlkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 3165MBhullar et al. ⁵⁸ 3145MBodner ⁴⁵ 3045MBodner ⁴⁵ 3025MCottrell et al. ⁵⁹ 3075MDemircan and Isler ⁶⁰ 3062MOliveira et al. ²² 3042MYıldırım ⁶¹ 3056MAlkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 2845MAl Hussona ⁶² 2821MGupta et al. ⁴ 2848MKumar et al. ⁶³ 2829MMohsin et al. ¹⁴ 2847MShetty and Sharma ⁶⁴ 2750MBiddle and Arora ⁵⁵ 2648MEd Gehani et al. ⁵⁶ 2532FGadve et al. ⁶⁶ 2545MKrishnan et al. ⁵⁶ 2532FSoares et al. ⁶⁷ 2554FThong et al. ²⁰ 2571MRivera-Serrano and Schaitkin ⁶⁸ 2369MUngari et al. ⁷⁰ 2261MArunkumar et al. ⁷¹ 2010MNilesh et al. ⁷² 2037MOteri et al. ¹³ 2040FBodner ⁴⁵ 1961M | Goh <i>et al.</i> ⁵⁴ | 35 | 34 | М |
| Raveenthiran et al.553510FKrishnan et al.563441MAlkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 3165MBhullar et al.583145MBodner ⁴⁵ 3045MBodner ⁴⁵ 3025MCottrell et al.593075MDemircan and Isler ⁶⁰ 3062MOliveira et al.223042MYildırım ⁶¹ 3056MAlkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 2845MAl Hussona622821MGupta et al.42848MKumar et al.632829MMohsin et al.142847MShetty and Sharma ⁶⁴ 2750MBiddle and Arora ⁶⁵ 2648MEd Gehani et al.562532FGadve et al.662545MKrishnan et al.562554FSoares et al.672554FThong et al.202571MRivera-Serrano and Schaitkin ⁶⁸ 2369MUngari et al.692248MGraziani et al.712010MNilesh et al.722037MOteri et al.132040FBodner ⁴⁵ 1961M | lqbal <i>et al.</i> ¹⁶ | 35 | 55 | М |
| Krishnan et al. 56 3441MAlkurt and Peker 57 3165MBhullar et al. 58 3145MBodner 45 3045MBodner 45 3025MCottrell et al. 59 3075MDemircan and Isler 60 3062MOliveira et al. 22 3042MYildırım 61 3056MAlkurt and Peker 67 2845MAl Hussona 62 2821MGupta et al. 4 2848MKumar et al. 63 2829MMohsin et al. 14 2847MShetty and Sharma 64 2750MBiddle and Arora 65 2648MEl Gehani et al. 52 2532FGadve et al. 66 2545MKrishnan et al. 56 2554FNong et al. 20 2571MRivera-Serrano and Schaitkin 68 2369MUngari et al. 69 2370MBoffano and Gallesio 36 2248MGraziani et al. 71 2010MNilesh et al. 71 2037MOteri et al. 13 2040FBodner 45 1961M | Raveenthiran et al.55 | 35 | 10 | F |
| Alkurt and Peker 673165MBhullar et al. 583145MBodner 453045MBodner 453025MCottrell et al. 593075MDemircan and Isler 603062MOliveira et al. 223042MYildırım 613056MAlkurt and Peker 672845MAl Hussona 622821MGupta et al.42848MKumar et al.632829MMohsin et al.142847MShetty and Sharma 842750MBiddle and Arora 652648MBodner452646MEl Gehani et al. 662532FGadve et al. 662532FMao et al. 112575FSoares et al. 672554FThong et al.202571MRivera-Serrano and Schaitkin 682369MUngari et al. 722037MOffano and Gallesio362248MGraziani et al.722037MOteri et al.132040FBodner451961M | Krishnan <i>et al.</i> 56 | 34 | 41 | М |
| Bhullar et al. ⁵⁸ 31 45 M Bodner ⁴⁵ 30 45 M Bodner ⁴⁵ 30 25 M Cottrell et al. ⁵⁹ 30 75 M Demircan and Isler ⁶⁰ 30 62 M Oliveira et al. ²² 30 42 M Yildırım ⁶¹ 30 56 M Alkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 28 45 M Al Hussona ⁶² 28 21 M Gupta et al. ⁴ 28 48 M Kumar et al. ⁶³ 28 29 M Mohsin et al. ¹⁴ 28 47 M Shetty and Sharma ⁶⁴ 27 50 M Biddle and Arora ⁵⁵ 26 48 M Bodner ⁴⁵ 26 46 M El Gehani et al. ⁵⁶ 25 32 F Gadve et al. ⁶⁶ 25 45 M Krishnan et al. ⁵⁶ 25 54 F Thong et al. ²⁰ 25 71 M Rivera-Serrano and Schaitkin | Alkurt and Peker57 | 31 | 65 | М |
| Bodner453045MBodner453025MCottrell et al.593075MDemircan and Isler603062MOliveira et al.223042MYildırın ⁶¹ 3056MAlkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 2845MAl Hussona ⁶² 2821MGupta et al.42848MKumar et al. ⁶³ 2829MMohsin et al.142847MShetty and Sharma ⁶⁴ 2750MBiddle and Arora ⁵⁵ 2648MBodner452646MEl Gehani et al. ⁵⁶ 2532FGadve et al. ⁶⁶ 2545MKrishnan et al. ¹¹ 2575FSoares et al. ⁶⁷ 2554FThong et al. ²⁰ 2571MRivera-Serrano and Schaitkin ⁶⁸ 2369MUngari et al. ⁶⁹ 2248MGraziani et al. ⁷¹ 2010MNilesh et al. ⁷² 2037MOteri et al. ¹³ 2040FBodner ⁴⁵ 1961M | Bhullar <i>et al.</i> 58 | 31 | 45 | М |
| Bodner ⁴⁵ 30 25 M Cottrell et al. ⁵⁹ 30 75 M Demircan and Isler ⁶⁰ 30 62 M Oliveira et al. ²² 30 42 M Yildırım ⁶¹ 30 56 M Alkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 28 45 M Al Hussona ⁶² 28 21 M Gupta et al. ⁴ 28 48 M Kumar et al. ⁶³ 28 29 M Mohsin et al. ¹⁴ 28 47 M Shetty and Sharma ⁶⁴ 27 50 M Biddle and Arora ⁵⁵ 26 48 M Bodner ⁴⁵ 26 46 M El Gehani et al. ⁵² 25 32 F Gadve et al. ⁶⁶ 25 45 M Krishnan et al. ⁵⁶ 25 54 F Thong et al. ²⁰ 25 71 M Rivera-Serrano and Schaitkin ⁶⁸ 23 69 M <td>Bodner⁴⁵</td> <td>30</td> <td>45</td> <td>М</td> | Bodner ⁴⁵ | 30 | 45 | М |
| Cottrell et al. 59 3075MDemircan and Isler 60 3062MOliveira et al. 22 3042MYildırım 61 3056MAlkurt and Peker 57 2845MAl Hussona 62 2821MGupta et al. 4 2848MKumar et al. 63 2829MMohsin et al. 14 2847MShetty and Sharma 64 2750MBiddle and Arora 55 2648MBodner 45 2646MEl Gehani et al. 52 2532FGadve et al. 66 2545MKrishnan et al. 56 2532FSoares et al. 67 2554FThong et al. 20 2571MRivera-Serrano and Schaitkin 68 2369MUngari et al. 69 2248MGraziani et al. 71 2010MNilesh et al. 72 2037MOteri et al. 13 2040FBodner 45 1961M | Bodner ⁴⁵ | 30 | 25 | М |
| Demircan and Isler603062MOliveira et al.223042MYildirm613056MAlkurt and Peker572845MAl Hussona622821MGupta et al.42848MKumar et al.832829MMohsin et al.142847MShetty and Sharma642750MBiddle and Arora552648MBodner452646MEl Gehani et al.562532FGadve et al.662545MKrishnan et al.562532FSoares et al.672554FThong et al.202571MRivera-Serrano and Schaitkin682369MUngari et al.672261MArunkumar et al.712010MNilesh et al.722037MOteri et al.132040FBodner451961M | Cottrell et al.59 | 30 | 75 | М |
| Oliveira et al. ²² 30 42 M Yıldırım ⁶¹ 30 56 M Alkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 28 45 M Al Hussona ⁶² 28 21 M Gupta et al. ⁴ 28 48 M Kumar et al. ⁶³ 28 29 M Mohsin et al. ¹⁴ 28 47 M Shetty and Sharma ⁶⁴ 27 50 M Biddle and Arora ⁵⁵ 26 48 M Bodner ⁴⁵ 26 46 M El Gehani et al. ⁵² 25 32 F Gadve et al. ⁶⁶ 25 45 M Krishnan et al. ⁵⁶ 25 32 F Soares et al. ⁶⁷ 25 54 F Thong et al. ²⁰ 25 71 M Rivera-Serrano and Schaitkin ⁶⁸ 23 69 M Ungari et al. ⁶⁹ 23 70 M Gifano and Gallesio ³⁶ 22 48 M | Demircan and Isler60 | 30 | 62 | М |
| Yıldırım ⁶¹ 30 56 M Alkurt and Peker ⁵⁷ 28 45 M Al Hussona ⁶² 28 21 M Gupta et al. ⁴ 28 48 M Kumar et al. ⁶³ 28 29 M Mohsin et al. ¹⁴ 28 47 M Shetty and Sharma ⁶⁴ 27 50 M Biddle and Arora ⁵⁵ 26 48 M Bodner ⁴⁵ 26 46 M El Gehani et al. ⁵² 25 32 F Gadve et al. ⁶⁶ 25 45 M Krishnan et al. ⁵⁶ 25 32 F Soares et al. ⁶⁷ 25 54 F Thong et al. ²⁰ 25 71 M Rivera-Serrano and Schaitkin ⁶⁸ 23 69 M Ungari et al. ⁶⁹ 23 70 M Graziani et al. ⁷⁰ 22 61 M Arunkumar et al. ⁷¹ 20 10 M Nilesh et al. ⁷² 20 37 M Oteri | Oliveira et al.22 | 30 | 42 | М |
| Alkurt and Pekers72845MAl Hussona822821MGupta et al.42848MKumar et al.832829MMohsin et al.142847MShetty and Sharma642750MBiddle and Arora652648MBodner452646MEl Gehani et al.522532FGadve et al.662545MKrishnan et al.562532FSoares et al.672554FThong et al.202571MRivera-Serrano and Schaitkin682369MUngari et al.702261MArunkumar et al.712010MNilesh et al.722037MOteri et al.132040FBodner451961M | Yıldırım ⁶¹ | 30 | 56 | М |
| Al Hussona 62 2821MGupta et al.42848MKumar et al.632829MMohsin et al.142847MShetty and Sharma ⁶⁴ 2750MBiddle and Arora ⁶⁵ 2648MBodner ⁴⁵ 2646MEl Gehani et al. ⁵² 2532FGadve et al.662545MKrishnan et al. ⁵⁶ 2532FSoares et al.672554FThong et al.202571MRivera-Serrano and Schaitkin ⁶⁸ 2369MUngari et al.692370MBoffano and Gallesio ³⁶ 2248MGraziani et al.712010MNilesh et al.722037MOteri et al.132040FBodner ⁴⁵ 1961M | Alkurt and Peker57 | 28 | 45 | М |
| Gupta et al.42848MKumar et al.632829MMohsin et al.142847MShetty and Sharma642750MBiddle and Arora652648MBodner452646MEl Gehani et al.522532FGadve et al.662545MKrishnan et al.562532FSoares et al.672554FThong et al.202571MRivera-Serrano and Schaitkin682369MUngari et al.702261MArunkumar et al.712010MNilesh et al.722037MOteri et al.132040FBodner451961M | Al Hussona ⁶² | 28 | 21 | М |
| Kumar et al. 83 2829MMohsin et al. 14 2847MShetty and Sharma 84 2750MBiddle and Arora 65 2648MBodner 46 2646MEl Gehani et al. 52 2532FGadve et al. 66 2545MKrishnan et al. 56 2532FSoares et al. 67 2554FThong et al. 20 2571MRivera-Serrano and Schaitkin 68 2369MUngari et al. 93 2370MBoffano and Gallesio 36 2248MGraziani et al. 71 2010MNilesh et al. 72 2037MOteri et al. 13 2040FBodner 45 1961M | Gupta et al.4 | 28 | 48 | М |
| Mohsin et al.142847MShetty and Sharma 64 2750MBiddle and Arora 65 2648MBodner 46 2646MEl Gehani et al. 52 2532FGadve et al. 66 2545MKrishnan et al. 56 2532FMao et al.112575FSoares et al. 67 2554FThong et al. 20 2571MRivera-Serrano and Schaitkin 68 2369MUngari et al. 69 2370MBoffano and Gallesio 36 2248MGraziani et al. 71 2010MNilesh et al. 72 2037MOteri et al. 13 2040FBodner 45 1961M | Kumar <i>et al.</i> 63 | 28 | 29 | М |
| Shetty and Sharma2750MBiddle and Arora2648MBodner452646MEl Gehani et al.522532FGadve et al.662545MKrishnan et al.552532FMao et al.112575FSoares et al.672554FThong et al.202571MRivera-Serrano and Schaitkin682369MUngari et al.692370MBoffano and Gallesio362248MGraziani et al.712010MNilesh et al.722037MOteri et al.132040FBodner451961M | Mohsin <i>et al.</i> ¹⁴ | 28 | 47 | М |
| Biddle and Arora2648MBodner452646MEl Gehani et al.522532FGadve et al.662545MKrishnan et al.552532FMao et al.112575FSoares et al.672554FThong et al.202571MRivera-Serrano and Schaitkin682369MUngari et al.692370MBoffano and Gallesio362248MGraziani et al.712010MNilesh et al.722037MOteri et al.132040FBodner451961M | Shetty and Sharma64 | 27 | 50 | М |
| Bodner452646MEl Gehani et al.522532FGadve et al.662545MKrishnan et al.562532FMao et al.112575FSoares et al.672554FThong et al.202571MRivera-Serrano and Schaitkin682369MUngari et al.692370MBoffano and Gallesio362248MGraziani et al.702261MNilesh et al.722037MOteri et al.132040FBodner451961M | Biddle and Arora ⁶⁵ | 26 | 48 | М |
| El Gehani et al. ⁵² 25 32 F Gadve et al. ⁶⁶ 25 45 M Krishnan et al. ⁵⁶ 25 32 F Mao et al. ¹¹ 25 75 F Soares et al. ⁶⁷ 25 54 F Thong et al. ²⁰ 25 71 M Rivera-Serrano and Schaitkin ⁶⁸ 23 69 M Ungari et al. ⁶⁹ 23 70 M Boffano and Gallesio ³⁶ 22 48 M Graziani et al. ⁷⁰ 22 61 M Arunkumar et al. ⁷¹ 20 10 M Nilesh et al. ⁷² 20 37 M Oteri et al. ¹³ 20 40 F Bodner ⁴⁵ 19 61 M | Bodner ⁴⁵ | 26 | 46 | М |
| Gadve et al. 66 2545MKrishnan et al. 56 2532FMao et al. 11 2575FSoares et al. 67 2554FThong et al. 20 2571MRivera-Serrano and Schaitkin 68 2369MUngari et al. 69 2370MBoffano and Gallesio 36 2248MGraziani et al. 70 2261MArunkumar et al. 71 2010MNilesh et al. 72 2037MOteri et al. 13 2040FBodner 45 1961M | El Gehani et al.52 | 25 | 32 | F |
| Krishnan et al.562532FMao et al.112575FSoares et al.672554FThong et al.202571MRivera-Serrano and Schaitkin682369MUngari et al.692370MBoffano and Gallesio362248MGraziani et al.702261MArunkumar et al.712010MNilesh et al.722037MOteri et al.132040FBodner451961M | Gadve et al.66 | 25 | 45 | М |
| Mao et al. ¹¹ 25 75 F Soares et al. ⁶⁷ 25 54 F Thong et al. ²⁰ 25 71 M Rivera-Serrano and Schaitkin ⁶⁸ 23 69 M Ungari et al. ⁶⁹ 23 70 M Boffano and Gallesio ³⁶ 22 48 M Graziani et al. ⁷⁰ 22 61 M Arunkumar et al. ⁷¹ 20 10 M Nilesh et al. ⁷² 20 37 M Oteri et al. ¹³ 20 40 F Bodner ⁴⁵ 19 61 M | Krishnan <i>et al.</i> 56 | 25 | 32 | F |
| Soares et al. ⁶⁷ 25 54 F Thong et al. ²⁰ 25 71 M Rivera-Serrano and Schaitkin ⁶⁸ 23 69 M Ungari et al. ⁶⁹ 23 70 M Boffano and Gallesio ³⁶ 22 48 M Graziani et al. ⁷⁰ 22 61 M Arunkumar et al. ⁷¹ 20 10 M Nilesh et al. ⁷² 20 37 M Oteri et al. ¹³ 20 40 F Bodner ⁴⁵ 19 61 M | Mao <i>et al.</i> ¹¹ | 25 | 75 | F |
| Thong et al. ²⁰ 25 71 M Rivera-Serrano and Schaitkin ⁶⁸ 23 69 M Ungari et al. ⁶⁹ 23 70 M Boffano and Gallesio ³⁶ 22 48 M Graziani et al. ⁷⁰ 22 61 M Arunkumar et al. ⁷¹ 20 10 M Nilesh et al. ⁷² 20 37 M Oteri et al. ¹³ 20 40 F Bodner ⁴⁵ 19 61 M | Soares et al.67 | 25 | 54 | F |
| Rivera-Serrano and Schaitkin ⁶⁸ 23 69 M Ungari <i>et al.</i> ⁶⁹ 23 70 M Boffano and Gallesio ³⁶ 22 48 M Graziani <i>et al.</i> ⁷⁰ 22 61 M Arunkumar <i>et al.</i> ⁷¹ 20 10 M Nilesh <i>et al.</i> ⁷² 20 37 M Oteri <i>et al.</i> ¹³ 20 40 F Bodner ⁴⁵ 19 61 M | Thong <i>et al.</i> ²⁰ | 25 | 71 | М |
| Ungari et al. ⁶⁹ 23 70 M Boffano and Gallesio ³⁶ 22 48 M Graziani et al. ⁷⁰ 22 61 M Arunkumar et al. ⁷¹ 20 10 M Nilesh et al. ⁷² 20 37 M Oteri et al. ¹³ 20 40 F Bodner ⁴⁵ 19 61 M | Rivera-Serrano and Schaitkin68 | 23 | 69 | М |
| Boffano and Gallesio ³⁶ 22 48 M Graziani <i>et al.</i> ⁷⁰ 22 61 M Arunkumar <i>et al.</i> ⁷¹ 20 10 M Nilesh <i>et al.</i> ⁷² 20 37 M Oteri <i>et al.</i> ¹³ 20 40 F Bodner ⁴⁵ 19 61 M | Ungari <i>et al.</i> 69 | 23 | 70 | М |
| Graziani et al. ⁷⁰ 22 61 M Arunkumar et al. ⁷¹ 20 10 M Nilesh et al. ⁷² 20 37 M Oteri et al. ¹³ 20 40 F Bodner ⁴⁵ 19 61 M | Boffano and Gallesio ³⁶ | 22 | 48 | М |
| Arunkumar et al. ⁷¹ 20 10 M Nilesh et al. ⁷² 20 37 M Oteri et al. ¹³ 20 40 F Bodner ⁴⁵ 19 61 M | Graziani <i>et al.</i> 70 | 22 | 61 | М |
| Nilesh et al. ⁷² 20 37 M Oteri et al. ¹³ 20 40 F Bodner ⁴⁵ 19 61 M | Arunkumar et al.71 | 20 | 10 | М |
| Oteri et al. ¹³ 20 40 F Bodner ⁴⁵ 19 61 M | Nilesh et al.72 | 20 | 37 | М |
| Bodner ⁴⁵ 19 61 M | Oteri <i>et al.</i> ¹³ | 20 | 40 | F |
| | Bodner ⁴⁵ | 19 | 61 | М |
| Brooks <i>et al.</i> ⁷ 19 63 M | Brooks et al.7 | 19 | 63 | М |
| Bodner ⁴⁵ 18 61 M | Bodner ⁴⁵ | 18 | 61 | М |
| Ben-Shoshan and Lacroix ⁷³ 17 16 M | Ben-Shoshan and Lacroix73 | 17 | 16 | М |
| Oteri <i>et al</i> ¹³ 15 51 F | Oteri <i>et al</i> ¹³ | 15 | 51 | F |
| MEAN 32.5 47.5 51M, 8 F | MEAN | 32.5 | 47.5 | 51M, 8 F |

mm: Milimeter. M: Male. F: Femal

two-phase process: forming a central core through salt precipitation and layered deposition. Metabolic factors and variations in the sphincter-like mechanism of the duct may contribute. Reduced salivary flow, stagnation, dehydration, changes in salivary pH, foreign bodies, and physical trauma further contribute.^{9,14} Sialoliths are not exclusive to systemic issues and can also be linked to conditions like gout, Sjögren's syndrome, the use of anticholinergics and antisialogogues medications, local trauma, head and neck radiotherapy, advanced age, and renal impairment, all of which can contribute to the formation of sialoliths.^{9,19}

Clinical features of sialolithiasis encompass symptoms such as pain, swelling, and tenderness, particularly heightened during meals when there is an increase in salivary flow. Secondary infections may lead to fever, redness, and pus discharge. Common indicators include tenderness, trismus, decreased salivary flow, and purulent discharge at the duct's opening. Palpation along the duct may reveal a sialolith. Some cases may be asymptomatic.¹⁹⁻²²

The Mealtime Syndrome presents as moderate to severe pain and swelling in major salivary glands, particularly the submandibular gland, triggered by meal-related salivary flow stimulation. Obstruction by sialoliths leads to saliva accumulation, causing pain and swelling.^{15,23} Patients may experience difficulty swallowing, tenderness, trismus, decreased salivary flow, and occasionally, purulent discharge. Careful clinical examination and radiographic imaging are essential for diagnosis and management.²³

Radiographic features play a crucial role in the diagnosis of sialolithiasis, offering essential details about the size, location, and mineral composition of the calculi. Submandibular gland sialoliths are usually visible on conventional radiographs as they are radiopaque in 80-94% of cases. The elongated or smooth cylindrical appearance of ductal sialoliths and the round or oval configuration within the gland help characterize them.^{24,25} However, sialoliths might be too small or insufficiently mineralized in the early stages to show up on X-rays. Radiolucent submandibular sialoliths, which do not appear clearly on X-rays, pose a diagnostic challenge and are documented in 20% to 43% of cases.^{12,23} Various imaging methods, including sialography, xeroradiography, ultrasonography, scintigraphy, and advanced techniques like computerized tomography and magnetic resonance imaging, complement conventional radiography, providing a comprehensive diagnostic approach.^{3,5,14,25}

The diagnosis of sialoliths entails a comprehensive evaluation, including an analysis of patient history, clinical examination, and the utilization of imaging methods. Symptoms include pain, swelling, and issues during or after meals. Clinical examination helps identify potential problems. Radiographic methods like panoramic and occlusal radiographs are crucial for visualizing calcified sialoliths. Advanced techniques such as sialography, ultrasound, computed tomography, and magnetic resonance imaging provide additional details.^{14,25,26} Sialography is useful for radiolucent stones, while ultrasound helps locate stones within the gland. These tools together provide a precise understanding of the sialolith's characteristics, guiding personalized management plans.^{8,27}

Histopathologic features of sialoliths reveal gross characteristics such as rigid calcified masses exhibiting concentric layers and a central core. The stones, mainly made up of glycoproteins, mucopolysaccharides, and cellular debris, may exhibit concentric layers surrounding a central core of amorphous material.^{28,29} Microscopically, the calcified mass reveals a layered structure, with microcrystalline apatite or whitlockite as the primary minerals. If the associated duct is removed, there may be evidence of squamous, oncocytic, or mucous cell metaplasia. Periductal inflammation is a common finding, indicating the interaction between stone formation and the glandular environment.^{30,31}

The prognosis for individuals with sialoliths is generally favorable, especially when prompt and appropriate management is implemented. Small stones treated conservatively often lead to complete resolution.^{22,32,33} Larger stones may require surgical removal or advanced techniques but are also associated with favorable outcomes. Surgical removal of the gland may be necessary in cases of chronic inflammation or recurrent infections, potentially affecting salivary function. Early diagnosis and intervention are crucial to prevent complications.^{3,9,14,32-34}

The management and treatment of sialoliths are contingent upon factors such as size, location, and the presence of multiple stones. For small, single stones, conservative measures such as applying local heat, massaging the gland, and using sialogogues may be employed. Mechanical removal or sialolithectomy may be attempted for stones located at the periphery. Sialolithectomy, involving intraoral ductotomy, is an option for stones in specific ductal regions. Surgical removal, either intraorally or extraorally under general anesthesia, becomes necessary for multiple stones, those near the gland hilum, or when recurrent infections compromise the gland.^{18,33-37}

Advanced. non-invasive techniques like Extracorporeal Shortwave (ESW) and Intracorporeal Endoscopic lithotripsy (sialoendoscopy) provide alternatives for fragmenting stones without major surgery. ESW lithotripsy uses shock waves externally, while sialoendoscopy delivers shock waves directly to the stone surface, allowing for precise intervention.^{18,33,38-40} Tailoring the approach based on individual sialolith characteristics helps clinicians select the most appropriate management strategy, emphasizing a personalized approach for optimal outcomes.

REFERENCES

1. Wang YH, Chen YT, Chiu YW, Yu HC, Chang YC. Time trends in the prevalence of diagnosed sialolithiasis from Taiwanese nationwide health insurance dental dataset. J Dent Sci 2019;14:365-9.

2. Omezli MM, Ayranci F, Sadik E, Polat ME. Case report of giant sialolith (megalith) of the Wharton's duct. Niger J Clin Pract 2016;19:414-7.

3. Zenk J, Koch M, Klintworth N, Konig B, Konz K, Gillespie MB, *et al.* Sialendoscopy in the diagnosis and treatment of sialolithiasis: a study on more than 1000 patients. Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg 2012;147:858-63.

4. Gupta A, Rattan D, Gupta R. Giant sialoliths of submandibular gland duct: Report of two cases with unusual shape. Contemp Clin Dent 2013;4:78-80.

5. Anicin A, Urbancic J. Sialendoscopy and CT navigation assistance in the surgery of sialolithiasis. Radiol Oncol 2021;55:284-91.

6. Chaidas K, Lialiaris S, Pavlou AV, Katotomichelakis M, Papouliakos S. A Rare Case of a Giant Sialolith Within Wharton's Duct. Cureus 2023;15:e35969.

7. Brooks JK, Macauley MR, Price JB. Concurrent giant sialoliths within the submandibular gland parenchyma and distal segment of Wharton's duct: Novel case report. Gerodontology 2021;38:437-40.

8. Rai M, Burman R. Giant submandibular sialolith of remarkable size in the comma area of Wharton's duct: a case report. J Oral Maxillofac Surg 2009;67:1329-32.

9. Kraaij S, Karagozoglu KH, Forouzanfar T, Veerman EC, Brand HS. Salivary stones: symptoms, aetiology, biochemical composition and treatment. Br Dent J 2014;217:E23.

10. Pachisia S, Mandal G, Sahu S, Ghosh S. Submandibular sialolithiasis: A series of three case reports with review of literature. Clin Pract 2019;9:1119.

11. Mao JS, Lee YC, Chi JC, Yi WL, Tsou YA, Lin CD, *et al.* Long-term rare giant sialolithiasis for 30 years: A case report and review of literature. World J Clin Cases 2023;11:5382-90.

12. Abraham ZS, Mathias M, Kahinga AA. Unusual giant calculus of the submandibular duct: Case report and literature review. Int J Surg Case Rep 2021;84:106139.

13. Oteri G, Procopio RM, Cicciu M. Giant Salivary Gland Calculi (GSGC): Report Of Two Cases. Open Dent J 2011;5:90-5.

14. Mohsin SF, Riyaz MA, Alqazlan AA. Detection and Management of Giant Submandibular Gland Sialolith. Pak J Med Sci 2022;38:2030-3.

15. Singh AK, Yeola M, Raghuvanshi P, Singh N. Giant Wharton's duct sialolithiasis causing sialo-oral fistula: a rare case report with literature review. J Family Med Prim Care 2020;9:5793-5.

16. Iqbal A, Gupta AK, Natu SS, Gupta AK. Unusually large sialolith of Wharton's duct. Ann Maxillofac Surg 2012;2:70-3.

17. Babu LK, Jain MK. Giant Submandibular Sialolith: A Case Report and Review of Literature. Int J Head Neck Surg 2011;2:154-7.

18. Koch M, Mantsopoulos K, Muller S, Sievert M, Iro H. Treatment of Sialolithiasis: What Has Changed? An Update of the Treatment Algorithms and a Review of the Literature. J Clin Med 2021;11:231.

19. Parkar MI, Vora MM, Bhanushali DH. A Large Sialolith Perforating the Wharton's Duct: Review of Literature and a Case Report. J Maxillofac Oral Surg 2012;11:477-82.

20. Thong HK, Othman IA, Ramli R, Sabir Husin Athar PP. Painless Giant Submandibular Gland Sialolith: A Case Report. Cureus 2021;13:e19429.

21. Rodrigues GHC, Carvalho VJG, Alves FA, Domaneschi C. Giant submandibular sialolith conservatively treated. Autops Case Rep 2017;7:9-11.

22. Oliveira Tde P, Oliveira IN, Pinheiro EC, Gomes RC, Mainenti P. Giant sialolith of submandibular gland duct treated by excision and ductal repair: a case report. Braz J Otorhinolaryngol 2016;82:112-5.

23. Ashindoitiang JA, Nwagbara VIC, Ugbem T, Odoks RK, Udo Solomon A, Akpan SO, *et al.* Huge sialolith of the submandibular gland: a case report and review of literature. J Int Med Res 2023;51:3000605221148443.

24. Arslan S, Vuralkan E, Cobanoglu B, Arslan A, Ural A. Giant sialolith of submandibular gland: report of a casedagger. J Surg Case Rep 2015;2015.

25. Goncalves M, Schapher M, Iro H, Wuest W, Mantsopoulos K, Koch M. Value of Sonography in the Diagnosis of Sialolithiasis: Comparison With the Reference Standard of Direct Stone Identification. J Ultrasound Med 2017;36:2227-35.

26. Corvino A, Caruso M, Varelli C, Di Gennaro F, Pignata S, Corvino F, *et al.* Diagnostic imaging of parotid gland oncocytoma: a pictorial review with emphasis on ultrasound assessment. J Ultrasound 2021;24:241-7.

27. Rzymska-Grala I, Stopa Z, Grala B, Golebiowski M, Wanyura H, Zuchowska A, *et al.* Salivary gland calculi - contemporary methods of imaging. Pol J Radiol 2010;75:25-37.

28. Marchal F, Kurt AM, Dulguerov P, Lehmann W. Retrograde theory in sialolithiasis formation. Arch Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg 2001;127:66-8.

29. Harrison JD. Causes, natural history, and incidence of salivary stones and obstructions. Otolaryngol Clin North Am 2009;42:927-47.

30. Teymoortash A, Wollstein AC, Lippert BM, Peldszus R, Werner JA. Bacteria and pathogenesis of human salivary calculus. Acta Otolaryngol 2002;122:210-4.

31. Brady JM, McKinney L, Stanback JS. Scanning electron microscopy of submandibular sialoliths: a preliminary report. Dentomaxillofac Radiol 1989;18:42-4.

32. Akinyamoju AO, Adisa AO. Non-surgical extraction of a massive sialolith in the Wharton's duct of a Nigerian. Afr J Med Med Sci 2015;44:177-80.

33. Badash I, Raskin J, Pei M, Soldatova L, Rassekh C. Contemporary Review of Submandibular Gland Sialolithiasis and Surgical Management Options. Cureus 2022;14:e28147.

34. Capaccio P, Torretta S, Ottavian F, Sambataro G, Pignataro L. Modern management of obstructive salivary diseases. Acta Otorhinolaryngol Ital 2007;27:161-72.

35. Faizal B, Gangadharan S, Thankappan K. Comparison between Sialendoscopy and Conventional Methods in the Treatment of Sialolithiasis. Malays J Med Sci 2017;24:94-100.

36. Boffano P, Gallesio C. Surgical treatment of a giant sialolith of the Wharton duct. J Craniofac Surg 2010;21:134-5.

37. Springborg LK, Moller MN. Submandibular gland excision: longterm clinical outcome in 139 patients operated in a single institution. Eur Arch Otorhinolaryngol 2013;270:1441-6.

38. Escudier MP, Brown JE, Drage NA, McGurk M. Extracorporeal shockwave lithotripsy in the management of salivary calculi. Br J Surg 2003;90:482-5.

39. Capaccio P, Ottaviani F, Manzo R, Schindler A, Cesana B. Extracorporeal lithotripsy for salivary calculi: a long-term clinical experience. Laryngoscope 2004;114:1069-73.

40. Zenk J, Bozzato A, Winter M, Gottwald F, Iro H. Extracorporeal shock wave lithotripsy of submandibular stones: evaluation after 10 years. Ann Otol Rhinol Laryngol 2004;113:378-83.

41. Rauso R, Gherardini G, Biondi P, Tartaro G, Colella G. A case of a giant submandibular gland calculus perforating the floor of the mouth. Ear Nose Throat J 2012;91:E25-7.

42. Shahoon H, Farhadi S, Hamedi R. Giant sialoliths of Wharton duct: Report of two rare cases and review of literature. Dent Res J (Isfahan) 2015;12:494-7.

43. Lim EH, Nadarajah S, Mohamad I. Giant Submandibular Calculus Eroding Oral Cavity Mucosa. Oman Med J 2017;32:432-5.

44. Sakthivel P, Yogal R, Singh S, Sharma P, Singh CA. Giant Sialolith of Submandibular Duct. JNMA J Nepal Med Assoc 2017;56:262-4.

45. Bodner L. Giant salivary gland calculi: diagnostic imaging and surgical management. Oral Surg Oral Med Oral Pathol Oral Radiol Endod 2002;94:320-3.

46. Fowell C, MacBean A. Giant salivary calculi of the submandibular gland. J Surg Case Rep 2012;2012:6.

47. Iwai T, Izumi T, Ohya T, Oguri S, Tohnai I. Giant Sialolith of the Submandibular Gland. J Clin Diagn Res 2017;11:ZJ03-ZJ4.

48. Pandarakalam C, Goebel WM, Seyer B. Chronic sclerosing sialadenitis or Kuttner's tumor associated with a giant sialolith: a case report. Oral Surg Oral Med Oral Pathol Oral Radiol 2013;115:e38-40.

49. Mathew J, Pothanikat JJK, Vinod Kumar RB, Padikadan NO, Arakkal NJ. Extremely Large Submandibular Sialolith Removal - A Case Report. Ann Maxillofac Surg 2022;12:237-9.

50. Ledesma-Montes C, Garces-Ortiz M, Salcido-Garcia JF, Hernandez-Flores F, Hernandez-Guerrero JC. Giant sialolith: case report and review of the literature. J Oral Maxillofac Surg 2007;65:128-30.

51. Chan EK, Patel ND. Giant calculus of the submandibular salivary duct. Ear Nose Throat J 2006;85:306, 8.

52. El Gehani R, Krishnan B, Shehoumi MI. Submandibular giant sialoliths: report of two cases and review of the literature. Ear Nose Throat J 2010;89:E1-4.

53. Emir H, Kaptan ZK, Uzunkulaoglu H, Dogan S. A rare case of asymptomatic bilateral submandibular gland sialolithiasis: a giant, fistulized calculus on the right and multiple calculi on the left. Ear Nose Throat J 2010;89:502-4.

54. Goh LC, Chitra BK, Shaariyah MM, Ng WS. Transcervical approach to the removal of a deep-seated giant submandibular calculus and the submandibular gland. BMJ Case Rep 2016;2016.

55. Raveenthiran V, Hayavadana Rao PV. Giant calculus in the submandibular salivary duct: report of the first prepubertal patient. Pediatr Surg Int 2004;20:163-4.

56. Krishnan B, Gehani RE, Shehumi MI. Submandibular giant sialoliths-2 case reports and review of the literature. Indian J Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg 2009;61:55-8.

57. Alkurt MT, Peker I. Unusually large submandibular sialoliths: report of two cases. Eur J Dent 2009;3:135-9.

58. Bhullar RS, Dhawan A, Bhullar K, Malhotra S. Giant submandibular gland duct sialolith mimicking an impacted canine tooth. Natl J Maxillofac Surg 2015;6:89-92.

59. Cottrell D, Courtney M, Bhatia I, Gallagher G, Sundararajan D. Intraoral removal of a giant submandibular sialolith obstructing Wharton's duct: a case report. J Mass Dent Soc 2011;60:14-6.

60. Demircan S, Isler S. Case reports: Giant sialolith. Br Dent J 2015;219:48.

61. Yildirim A. A case of giant sialolith of the submandibular salivary gland. Ear Nose Throat J 2004;83:360-1.

62. Al-Hussona AA. Unusually large submandibular gland stone. Kulak Burun Bogaz Ihtis Derg 2015;25:56-8.

63. Kumar ND, Sherubin JE, Bagavathy K. Sialolithiasis: An Unusually Large Salivary Stone. J Maxillofac Oral Surg 2021;20:227-9.

64. Shetty BN, Sharma P. Unusual case of a projecting intraoral giant sialolith. Indian J Surg 2010;72:155-7.

65. Biddle RJ, Arora S. Giant Sialolith of the Submandibular Salivary Gland. Radiol Case Rep 2008;3:101.

66. Gadve V, Mohite A, Bang K, Shenoi SR. Unusual giant sialolith of Wharton's duct. Indian J Dent 2016;7:162-4.

67. Soares EC, Costa FW, Pessoa RM, Bezerra TP. Giant salivary calculus of the submandibular gland. Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg 2009;140:128-9.

68. Rivera-Serrano CM, Schaitkin BM. Bilateral giant submandibular sialoliths and the role for salivary endoscopy. Am J Otolaryngol 2011;32:85-7.

69. Ungari C, Cicconetti A, Cerbelli E, Sulpasso A, Filiaci F. Giant submandibular sialolith: a case report. Clin Ter 2022;173:217-21.

70. Graziani F, Vano M, Cei S, Tartaro G, Mario G. Unusual asymptomatic giant sialolith of the submandibular gland: a clinical report. J Craniofac Surg 2006;17:549-52.

71. Arunkumar KV, Garg N, Kumar V. Oversized submandibular gland sialolith: a report of two cases. J Maxillofac Oral Surg 2015;14:116-9.

72. Nilesh K, Kothi HS, Vande A, Reddy S. Giant sialolith mimicking an impacted tooth. BMJ Case Rep 2020; 13: e233434.

73. Ben-Shoshan M, Lacroix Y. A giant sialolith in a 16-year-old boy presenting to the emergency room. Arch Dis Child 2014;99:883.

Wharton kanalı megaliti: Literatür derlemesi ve bir olgu sunumu

Özet

Tükürük bezlerini etkileyen en yaygın hastalık olan siyalolitiyazis, kalsifiye oluşumların kanalları veya bezleri tıkamasıyla ortaya çıkar. Tipik olarak, sialolit olarak bilinen bu oluşumlar 5 ila 10 mm arasındadır; ancak 15 mm'yi aşanlar megalit olarak sınıflandırılır. Sialolitler herhangi bir tükürük bezi kanalında gelişebilirken, en sık olarak submandibular bezlerde, özellikle de submandibular bezin Wharton kanal ağzında ortaya çıkar. Salgı sistemi içindeki kalsifiye organik materyalden oluşan bu taşlar ağrıya, şişmeye ve tükürük akışında bozulmalara yol açabilir. Tükürük bezlerindeki akut ve kronik enfeksiyonlara birincil katkıda bulunan kronik siyalolitiyazis, taş oluşumuyla yakından ilişkilidir. Kesin nedeni tam olarak bilinmemekle birlikte, kronik siyaladenit ve kısmi tıkanıklıkla bağlantılıdır. Aksine, megalitler son derece nadirdir ve erkek hastalarda daha sık görülme eğilimindedir. Bu makalede, sol submandibular bezin kanal ağzında tespit edilen ve cerrahi müdahale ile tedavi edilen 19 mm uzunluğunda megalit içeren bir olgu sunulmuştur. Ayrıca, konuyla ilgili kapsamlı bir literatür taraması yapılmıştır.

ANAHTAR KELIMELER: Siyalolitiyazis; tükürük bezi taşları; Wharton kanalı