

Isolation and identification of *Xanthomonas citri subsp. malvacearum*, cotton bacterial blight disease agent and determination of the antibacterial activity of various plant essential oils

Pamuk bakteriyel yanıklık etmeni Xanthomonas citri subsp. malvacearum'un izolasyonu, tanılanması ve farklı bitki uçucu yağlarının antibakteriyel etkinliğinin belirlenmesi

Soner SOYLU^{1*} Merve KARA², Yusuf GÜMÜŞ³, Emine Mine SOYLU⁴

¹Hatay Mustafa Kemal University, Agriculture Faculty, Plant Protection Department 31034 Antakya, Hatay, Türkiye

¹https://orcid.org/0000-0003-1002-8958; ²https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7320-3376; ³https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7818-1831; ⁴https://orcid.org/0000-0001-5961-0848

To cite this article:

Soylu, S., Kara, M., Gümüş, Y. & Soylu, E.M. (2024). Isolation and identification of xanthomonas citri subsp. malvacearum, cotton bacterial blight disease agent and determination of the antibacterial activity of various plant essential oils. Gıda Harran Tarım ve Bilimleri Dergisi, 28(2): 180-191

DOI: 10.29050/harranziraat.1434729

*Address for Correspondence: Soner SOYLU e-mail: soylu@mku.edu.tr

Received Date: 10.02.2024 **Accepted Date:** 17.04.2024

© Copyright 2018 by Harran University Faculty of Agriculture. Available on-line at <u>www.dergipark.gov.tr/harranziraat</u>

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Non Commercial 4.0 International License.

ABSTRACT

Cotton is one of the most important industrial crops produced in large areas in Turkey. Cotton bacterial blight disease agent Xanthomonas citri subsp. malvacearum (Syn. Xanthomonas axonopodis pv. malvacearum) is a seed-borne pathogen. Plant essential oils are natural antimicrobial compounds that have the potential to be used as an alternative to chemical control of seed-borne phytopathogens. In this study, the bacterial pathogen X. citri subsp. malvacearum was isolated from cotton plants showing typical disease symptoms during the 2023 growing season in Diyarbakır provinces and the antibacterial effect of essential oils obtained from 11 different medicinal plants (Thymus serpyllum, Origanum syriacum, Thymus syriacus, Origanum onites, Cistus laden, Salvia aramiensis, Laurus nobilis, Hypericum perforatum, Rosmarinus officinalis, Origanum majorana and Thymbra spicata) were determined by disk diffusion method. Bacterial isolates, obtained from cotton plants showing typical disease symptoms, were identified as X. citri subsp. malvacearum by biochemical and pathogenicity tests and also MALDI-TOF analysis. The essential oils used in the study showed antibacterial activity against the bacterial agent by forming an inhibition zone with a diameter of 6.33-46.33 mm in the nutrient media. T. serpyllum and T. spicata (43.33 mm), O. syriacum (43.00 mm), T. syriacus (38.33 mm) and O. onites (37.3 mm), were identified as the most effective essential oils respectively. The essential oils of H. perforatum (9.67 mm), L. nobilis (9.0 mm) and S. aramiensis (6.33 mm) showed relatively lower antibacterial activity against the disease agent. The results showed that essential oils of Thymus spp., Thymbra spp. and Origanum spp. have the potential to be used as an alternative to chemical control against seed-borne bacterial plant pathogens.

Key Words: Cotton, bacterial blight, Xanthomonas, essential oil, antibacterial

ÖZ

Pamuk Türkiye'de geniş alanlarda üretimi yapılan önemli endüstri bitkilerin başında gelir. Pamuk bakteriyel yanıklık hastalığı etmeni *Xanthomonas citri* subsp. *malvacearum* (Syn. *Xanthomonas axonopodis* pv. *malvacearum*) tohum kökenli bir patojendir. Bitki uçucu yağları tohum kökenli fitopatojen türlere karşı kimyasal

mücadeleye alternatif olarak kullanım potansiyeline sahip doğal antimikrobiyal bileşiklerdir. Bu çalışmada, Diyarbakır ilinde 2023 yetiştirme sezonunda tipik hastalık belirtileri gösteren pamuk bitkilerinden *X. citri* subsp. *malvacearum* bakteriyel etmenin izolasyonu, tanılanması ve 11 farklı tıbbi bitkiden (*Thymus serpyllum, Origanum syriacum, Thymus syriacus, Origanum onites, Cistus laden, Salvia aramiensis, Laurus nobilis, Hypericum perforatum, Rosmarinus officinalis, Origanum majorana ve <i>Thymbra spicata*) elde edilen uçucu yağların antibakteriyel etkisi disk difüzyon yöntemi ile belirlenmiştir. Tipik hastalık belirtileri gösteren pamuk bitkilerinden izole edilen izolatlar biyokimyasal ve patojenite testleri ve MALDI-TOF ile tür düzeyinde *X. citri* subsp. *malvacearum* olarak tanılanmıştır. Çalışmada kullanılan bitki uçucu yağları besi yerinde 6.33-46.33 mm çapında engelleme zonu oluşturmak suretiyle bakteriyel etmene karşı antibakteriyel etkinlik göstermiştir. En etkili uçucun yağlar sırasıyla *T. serpyllum* ve *T. spicata* (43.33 mm), *O. syriacum* (43.00 mm), *T. syriacus* (38.33 mm) ve *O. onites* (37.3 mm) olarak belirlenmiştir. *H. perforatum* (9.67 mm), *L. nobilis* (9.0 mm) ve *S. aramiensis* (6.33 mm) bitki uçucu yağları hastalık etmene karşı nispeten daha düşük oranlarda antibakteriyel etkinlik göstermiştir. Elde edilen sonuçlar *Thymus* spp., *Thymbra* spp. ve *Origanum* spp.'ye ait bitki uçucu yağlarının tohum kökenli bitki patojeni bakteriyel hastalık etmenine karşı kimyasal mücadeleye alternatif mücadele yöntemi olarak uygulanma potansiyeline sahip olduğunu göstermiştir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Pamuk, bakteriyel yanıklık, Xanthomonas, uçucu yağ, antibakteriyel Introduction confined to leaves,

Cotton (Gossypium hirsutum) is a significant industrial crop cultivated in various regions worldwide, contributing to substantial agricultural and economic potential in its producing countries. In Turkey, extensive cultivation of cotton plants in the Aegean, Mediterranean, South-eastern, and Eastern Anatolian regions is often plagued by and bacterial diseases, fungal leading to considerable losses in yield and quality. Bacterial angular leaf spot and boll rot, caused by Xanthomonas citri subsp. malvacearum (ex Smith) Schaad et al. (formerly known as Xanthomonas axonopodis pv. malvacearum) is one of the prominent diseases that affect cotton plants (Verma and Singh, 1974). The pathogen typically spreads through infected seeds in cotton bolls, giving rise to various disease symptoms in the affected plants, including seedling blight, angular leaf spots, vein necrosis, black arm, and boll rot (Hillocks, 1981; Shenge 2001; Delannoy et al., 2005; Anmod et al., 2022). The manifestation of disease symptoms leads to a reduction in chlorophyll content in leaves and stems, ultimately causing significant damage to photosynthetic activity, yield, and fibre quality (Meshram and Raj, 1988). Yield losses in cotton were previously reported to range from 10% to 30%, reaching 50% or more in cotton grown in Africa or Asia (Verma, 1986; Thaxton and El-Zik, 2001; Mishra and Krishna, 2001; Delannoy et al., 2005; Raghavendra et al., 2009). While losses are less pronounced when disease symptoms are confined to leaves, they can escalate to 90% when stem lesions develop (Singh et al., 2007). Under field conditions, bacterial blight can cause yield losses up to 50% (Watkins, 1981).

The bacterial blight disease caused by X. citri subsp. malvacearum has increasingly become a global impediment to cotton production. The most effective control approach against this disease is generally acknowledged to be the resistant utilization of cotton varieties. Geographical origins of cotton species exhibit variations in susceptibility to X. citri subsp. malvacearum, ranging from highly susceptible to highly resistant. It has been reported that resistance in cotton plants against X. citri subsp. malvacearum, with its broad host range, can be rapidly overcome (Verma, 1986; Wallace and El Zik, 1990; Hillocks, 1992; Shelke et al., 2012). Hunter et al. (1968) identified 19 physiological races of the pathogen using ten different cotton varieties, while Verma and Singh (1974) expanded this number to 32 races using only seven cotton varieties. The distribution of races varies from country to country (Oliveira et al., 2011). Different races of the pathogen (such as races 1, 2, 5, 6, 8, 12, 13, 16, and 18) have been reported to cause diseases in various cotton varieties grown in Australia, India, the United States, Nigeria, Zimbabwe, Africa, and Nicaragua (Ajene et al., 2014; Anmod et al., 2022). In addition to the six previously identified races (race 1, 2, 8, 21, 26, and 32) on different cotton varieties grown in Syria, four new races (race 3, 4, 11, 28) have been described (Abdo-Hasan, 2008). Epidemiological

studies conducted in Africa and other regions of the world have reported that some highly virulent (HV) races of the pathogen can overcome resistance in cotton varieties (El-Zik and Thaxton, 1994). Regarding the presence of the pathogen, limited studies have been conducted in Turkey on race characteristics, and the reactions of cotton varieties to the pathogen (Türkmenoğlu, 1969; Zachowski et al., 1989). The disease has recently re-emerged in the cotton cultivation areas in the South-eastern Anatolian Region of Turkey.

The utilization of resistant varieties against bacterial pathogens presents seed-borne а practical, environmentally friendly, and economical solution. However, there is a lack of highly resistant cotton varieties with high yield against cotton bacterial blight disease (Khan, 1996; Mondal et al., 2001). The most common method in combating plant diseases involves the use of chemical pesticides (Burr, 2001). In the control of cotton bacterial blight disease, some countries widely employ fungicides such as copper, Dithane M-45, and sulphur. However, it has been reported that systemic infection by the seed-borne pathogen does not yield the expected success (Sarker et al., 2017). The extended utilization of chemical pesticides may culminate in the attainment of effectiveness thresholds for these products, thereby yielding inadequate improvements in crop yield. Additionally, the over application of chemical pesticides can engender adverse, and frequently irreversible, alterations in agricultural ecosystems. (Zenelt et al., 2021). In the current era of heightened awareness of sustainability and the realization that soil is not an unlimited production resource, the adoption of good agricultural practices minimizing chemical use has become crucial (Eryılmaz et al., 2019). In this context, the use of volatile oils and extracts obtained from plants, which are naturally present, do not pose a risk of spreading toxic substances, rapidly decompose without causing environmental pollution, and do not carry residue risks, is seen as a promising alternative in the fight against plant diseases (Raghavendra et al., 2009; Sertkaya et al., 2010; Mbega et al., 2012; Atay and

Soylu, 2022; Atay and Soylu, 2023).

The antibacterial potentials of essential oils of medicinal plant species, which belong to Thymus, Mentha, Achilla, Artemisia, and Salvia genus, were previously reported to poses against certain phytopathogenic bacterial disease agents (Daferera et al., 2003; Soylu et al., 2009; Mengulluoglu and Soylu, 2012; Küçükbay et al., 2014; Ünlü and Elçi, 2019; Bozkurt et al., 2020; Ghavam et al., 2020; Dönmez et al., 2020; Orzali et al., 2020; Temtek, 2021). Among the plants used in antimicrobial studies, Thyme species stand out with their widespread distribution, significance, and health-related economic properties. The antimicrobial activities of plant extracts and volatile oils from these species are economically important and play a crucial role in disease control methods against important disease agents (Regnault-Roger et al., 2004; Pavela, 2006; Türkmen et al., 2022). Literature reviews have indicated that very few studies were conducted on the antibacterial activity of plant essential oils and extracts against the cotton bacterial blight disease agent (Kızıl et al., 2005; Nagvi et al., 2022).

In this study, the essential oils of different plant species (*Thymus serpyllum, Origanum syriacum, Thymus syriacus, Origanum onites, Cistus laden, Salvia aramiensis, Laurus nobilis, Hypericum perforatum, Rosmarinus officinalis, Origanum majorana,* and *Thymbra spicata*) were investigated for their antibacterial effects against the seed-borne plant pathogen *Xanthomonas citri* subsp. *malvacearum*.

Materials and Methods

Isolation and identification of the bacterial pathogen

The bacterial pathogen responsible for the disease was isolated from the leaves and unopened cotton bolls exhibiting typical disease symptoms, sent for diagnosis from Bismil district of Diyarbakır province to the Bacteriology Laboratory of the Department of Plant Protection at Mustafa Kemal University, Faculty of

Agriculture, Hatay (Figure 1). Visibly water-soaked lesion bearing green leaves were initially subjected to surface disinfection with 5% sodium hypochlorite for 2-3 minutes, followed by three rinses with sterile water. After surface disinfection, the tissues were macerated in sterile 50 mM MgCl₂ solution for 30 minutes and then spread onto King B (KB) Agar medium. The petri dishes were incubated at 28°C for 2 days. Bacterial isolates were also obtained directly from the water-soaked lesions on bolls, after surface disinfection with 70% ethanol, using the tissue imprinting method on King B (KB) agar medium (Aktan and Soylu, 2020). Pure isolates were obtained by transferring bacterial isolates from typical yellow colonies grown on KB agar to fresh KB plates. After applying agar classical biochemical tests (gram staining, oxidase test, motility, sporulation, pectolytic activity, gelatine liquefaction, KOH test, catalase tests, etc.), the species identification of the isolates was confirmed using MALDI-TOF MS (Bruker Daltonics GmbH, Bremen, Germany) methods (Lelliot and Stead, 1987; Schaad et al., 2001; Aktan and Soylu, 2020). The concentration of the bacterial suspension of obtained isolates was adjusted to 10⁶ cfu ml⁻¹ by dilution, and pathogenicity tests were conducted on cotyledon leaves of threeweek-old healthy cotton seedlings, including hypersensitive reaction (HR) tests on tobacco leaves. As a control, the cotyledon leaves of healthy seedlings were treated with sterile water. Inoculated plants were covered with transparent bags for 1 day in growth chambers at 26°C with high relative humidity, and then the covers were opened, and disease symptoms were daily monitored for 5 days.



Figure 1. Typical symptoms (arrow) of *Xanthomonas citri subsp. malvacearum* on cotton leaf (A,B) and boll (C,D)

Determination of the antibacterial activity of essential oils

The essential oils used in this study were obtained from existing essential oil stocks with previously demonstrated antimicrobial efficacy against various plant pathogenic bacteria and fungal agents in the Phytopathology Laboratory of the Department of Plant Protection at Mustafa Kemal University Faculty of Agriculture. The antibacterial effect of the essential oils used in the study was assessed using the disk diffusion method (Soylu et al., 2022). A bacterial suspension of the virulent bacterial isolate, prepared in sterile water with a concentration of OD₆₂₀=0.12, was spread on King B (KB) agar medium using a spreader at a concentration of 10^8 cells/mL. Subsequently, sterile antimicrobial sensitivity test disks (6 mm diameter) were placed at the centre of each petri dish, and 5 µl of essential oil was added to each disk. To prevent the evaporation of essential oils from the edges of petri dishes, dishes were wrapped with double-layered Parafilm, followed by incubation at 26°C for 2 days. Control plates were prepared using disks with sterile distilled water (Bozkurt et al., 2020). The antibacterial effect of the essential oils was evaluated by measuring the diameters of the inhibition zones formed beneath and around the disks after the removal of the disks (Figure 2).



Figure 2. (A) Inhibitory effect of *Thymus serpyllum* essential oil, the most effective of the essential oils tested, on the growth of *Xanthomonas citri* subsp. *malvacearum*. The transparent inhibition zone (arrow) around the antimicrobial susceptibility test disk containing 5 µl of the essential oil is clearly visible. (B) Indicates the absence of any inhibition zone around the disk containing sterile medium.

Statistical analysis

In vitro antibacterial efficacy experiments were conducted for each essential oil according to a Randomized Complete Block Design in at least three different petri dishes, and the trial was repeated at two distinct time points. The values obtained in the experiments were subjected to analysis of variance (ANOVA) using the SPSS statistical program (SPSS Statistics 17.0). The differences between applications were compared using the Duncan Multiple Comparison Test (P≤0.05).

Results and Discussions

Isolation and identification of the pathogen

The causal agent of the disease was isolated from diseased plants sent for diagnosis by cotton growers in Bismil district of Diyarbakır province in September 2023 to the Department of Plant Protection, Faculty of Agriculture, Hatay Mustafa Kemal University (Figure 1). Isolates, exhibiting clear yellow-coloured, sharply defined, non-

fluorescent colonies on King B medium, were purified from these colonies. Biochemical tests confirmed the isolates as gram-negative with positive reactions in starch hydrolysis (pectolytic activity), catalase, oxidase, and gelatine liquefaction tests. All representative isolates demonstrated extreme an hypersensitivity reaction (HR) in the form of tissue collapse 48 hours post-inoculation on tobacco leaves. Sprayed cotton cotyledon leaves showed watersoaked symptoms with a diameter of 2-4 mm five days after inoculation. The results of biochemical and pathogenic tests for the pathogen were consistent with previous study findings (Schaad et al., 2001).

Recent advancements in bacterial diagnostics have seen the increasing use of MALDI-TOF MS, a

Analyte Name: Analyte Description: Analyte ID: Analyte Creation Date/Time: Applied MSP Library(ies): Applied Taxonomy Tree:

Rank

next-generation method, as an alternative to chromatographic and DNA-based molecular methods for identification of plant pathogenic bacterial and fungal disease agents (Pulcrano et al., 2012; Uysal et al., 2019; Aktan and Soylu, 2020; Bozkurt et al., 2020; Soylu et al., 2023). The diagnostic results obtained through biochemical tests were also confirmed by MALDI-TOF MS, which has become a widely adopted method in recent years. The bacterium isolates obtained from infected cotton leaves and bolls, as well as those from pathogenicity tests, exhibited high similarity index values, matching reference isolates in the MALDI-TOF database such as X. citri pv. malvacearum DSM 3489, 1220, and X. axonopodis pv. malvacearum CFBP-2530 with values ranging from 2.066 to 2.175 (Figure 3).

scription.			
	YY		
ation Date/Time:	2023-09-08T03:48:21.142		
conomy Tree:	Projects, Bruker Taxonomy, Taxonomy		
	Matched Pattern	Score Value	NCBI Identifier
V.d.	itali ana alao ang DEM 2840 DEM	2.175	246

E1

(Quality)		Value	Identifier
1 (++)	Xanthomonas citri pv malvacearum DSM 3849 DSM	2.175	<u>346</u>
2 (++)	Xanthomonas citri pv malvacearum DSM 1220 DSM	2.149	<u>346</u>
3 (++)	CFBP-2530_Xanthomonas axonopodis pv. malvacearum_20160825	2.066	<u>100134258</u>

Figure 3. MALDI-TOF identification result of *X. citri* subsp. *malvacearum* MKUBK-Xcm YY isolate obtained from cotton bolls showing typical disease symptoms and used in pathogenicity test

Antibacterial activity of different plant essential oils against Xanthomonas citri pv. malvacearum

The antibacterial activities of essential oils were investigated by measuring the diameters of inhibition zones formed around the disks (Figure 2). The results obtained are presented in Table 1. Significant differences in the antibacterial effects of essential oils obtained from different plants against the bacterial isolate.

Essential oils from *Thymus, Thymbra*, and *Origanum* spp exhibited higher antibacterial activity compared to other essential oils used in

the experiment (Table 1). *In vitro* studies demonstrated that *T. serpyllum* (43.33 mm), *T. spicata* (43.33 mm), and *O. syriacum* (43.0 mm) exhibited the highest antibacterial activity against *X. citri* pv. *malvacearum*, and due to the similarity in their antibacterial effects, these oils were appeared in the same statistical group. These essential oils were followed by *T. syriacus* (38.33 mm) and *O. onites* (37.33 mm). The lowest antibacterial activities were displayed by the essential oils of *S. aramiensis* (6.33 mm) and *L. nobilis* (9.00 mm) (Table 1).

Plant essential oils	Diameter of inhibition zones (mm)
Bitki Uçucu Yağları	Engelleme zon çapıları (mm)
Thymus serpyllum	43.33 (±1.02) ^f
Thymbra spicata	43.33 (±0.88) ^f
Origanum syriacum	43.0 (±2.08) ^f
Thymus syriacus	38.33 (±2.02) ^e
Origanum onites	37.33 (±1.20) ^e
Rosmarinus officinalis	14.67 (±0.33) ^d
Origanum majorana	14.67 (±0.33) ^d
Cistus laden	11.67 (±0.33) ^{cd}
Hypericum perforatum	9.67 (±0.33) ^c
Laurus nobilis	9.0 (±0.57) ^{bc}
Salvia aramiensis	6.33 (±0.33) ^b
Kontrol	0.0ª

Table 1. Antibacterial activity^a of plant essential oils on the development of the bacterial blight disease agent *Xanthomonas citri* subsp. *malvacearum*

^a The obtained values represent the average diameter of bacterial zones (mm) measured in three different petri dishes. Similar lowercase letters next to the mean values within the column indicate that there is no statistically significant difference between the essential oils (Duncan's Multiple Range Test, P < 0.05).

The findings of this study clearly demonstrate the potential use of plant essential oils as antibacterial compounds against the seed borne pathogen causing leaf and boll blight in cotton. While the antibacterial effects of essential oils have been extensively researched against microorganisms causing issues in human and food contexts, limited number of studies exist in the literature regarding the determination of antibacterial activities of plant extracts and essential oils against plant pathogenic bacterial disease agents. Thymbra spicata var. spicata essential oil has been investigated for its antibacterial effects on economically important plant pathogenic bacteria (Basim et al., 2000). The antibacterial effects of the essential oil obtained from various plant species of Lamicaeae family (such as Ocimum cillatum, Lippia gracilis and those obtained from interspecific hybrids) were also evaluated against different plant bacterial disease agents belonging Ralstonia, to Pseudomonas, Xanthomonas, Brenneria, Pantoea, Agrobacterium and Rhodococcus genus (Moghaddam et al., 2014; Schollenberger et al., 2018; da Silva et al., 2019).

In contrast to numerous studies investigating the antibacterial activity of essential oils against different Xanthomonas spp., there is a limited number of studies focusing on X. citri subsp. malvacearum, the causal agent of cotton bacterial blight disease. Previous research by Kızıl et al. (2005) reported the ineffectiveness of essential oils from cumin (Cuminum cyminum), dill (Anethum graveolens), fennel (Foeniculum vulgare), spearmint (Mentha spicata), and anise (Pimpinella anisum) against Xanthomonas campestris pv. malvacearum. They found that coriander (Coriandrum sativum) and hyssop (Hyssopus officinalis) essential oils were effective against the pathogen. Kızıl and Uyar (2006) indicated that essential oils from Thymbra spicata, Satureja hortensis, Origanum onites, and Thymus kotschyanus had lower effectiveness against X. campestris pv. malvacearum compared to other tested plant pathogenic species. Shirsat (2008) reported that extracts from Terminalia thorelii leaves and fruits exhibited a high inhibition zone against X. axanopodis pv. malvacearum isolated from cotton plants.

A recent study by Mangalagiri et al. (2021)

investigated the antibacterial activity of essential oils from various plant species, including Cymbopogon flexuosus, C. martini, Eucalyptus citridora, Tagetus minuta, Pelargonium sp., C. winterianus, and Mentha arvensis, against X. citri subsp. malvacearum. The results indicated varying levels of antibacterial efficacy among the tested essential oils, with Cymbopogon flexuosus, C. martini, and Eucalyptus citridora showing particularly high antibacterial activity. Similarly, Naqvi et al. (2022) investigated the antibacterial properties of essential oils from different plant species, such as Syzygium aromaticum, Curcuma longa, Moringa oleifera, Azadirachta indica, Mangifera indica, Mentha piperita, Aloe vera, Syzygium cumini, Citrus limon, and Prosopis juliflora, against X. citri subsp. malvacearum. Among the tested essential oils, Mentha piperita, Syzygium cumini, Citrus limon, Moringa oleifera, and Syzygium aromaticum were identified as the most effective essential oil bearing plants, forming inhibition zones ranging from 8.41 to 8.58 mm.

The essential oils used in this study from Origanum, Thymbra, and Thymus plant species were previously determined to contain high levels of carvacrol, thymol, and y-terpinene (Bozkurt et al., 2020; Kara et al., 2022). Previous studies showed that these oils and their main components trigger rapid cell breakdown in fungal and bacterial pathogens (da Silva et al., 2019; Liu et al., 2019; Churklam et al., 2020; Kachur and Suntres, 2020). Antibacterial efficacies of plant extracts and essential oils from savory (Satureja hortensis), thyme (Thymus spicigera), oregano (Origanum onites), and round-leaved rotundifolium) oregano (Origanum were investigated against Xanthomonas axonopodis pv. vesicatoria. Essential oils exhibited greater antibacterial activity compared to plant extracts (Dadaşoğlu et al., 2016).

Furthermore, antibacterial activity of essential oils of *Helichrysum italicum, Inula graveolens, Cistus creticus, Echinacea purpurea*, and *Hypericum perforatum* were tested against potato soft rot disease agent *Pectobacterium* carotovorum subsp. carotovorum and halo blight of beans disease agent *Pseudomonas syringae* pv. *phaseolicola* (Gümüş et al., 2022). Amongst the tested essential oils, *Hypericum perforatum* essential oil demonstrated the highest antibacterial activity against *P. carotovorum* subsp. carotovorum in comparison to *P. syringae* pv. phaseolicola.

In a study conducted in Sudan, the inhibitory effects of chitosan compounds at various concentrations (1, 3, 5, and 10 mg/ml), antagonist bacterial isolate Paenibacillus spp., and water extracts and oils from the barks of certain plants (Syzygium aromaticum, Nigella sativa, Trigonella foenum graecum, and Allium sativum) and camel urine were evaluated for their effectiveness in inhibiting the *in vitro* growth of *X. axonopodis* pv. malvacearum. All tested chitosan concentrations, except 1 mg/ml, exhibited inhibitory effects against bacteria. Chitosan at 10 mg/ml showed the highest inhibitory effectiveness with a 14 mm inhibition zone, followed by 5 mg/ml and 3 mg/ml, which produced 12 mm and 11 mm inhibition zones, respectively.

Conclusions

This study focuses on isolating and identifying the cotton bacterial blight disease agent, Xanthomonas citri subsp. malvacearum, while also exploring the antibacterial activities of various plant essential oils. The investigation aims to contribute to the understanding of potential botanical agents against bacterial pathogens, thereby offering insights into novel strategies for agriculture. disease management in In consideration of the absence of cotton varieties resistant to bacterial blight disease, the potential use of plant essential oils exhibiting antibacterial Xanthomonas activitv against citri subsp. malvacearum becomes particularly intriguing. The results obtained from this study demonstrate the antibacterial potential of essential oils derived from plants such as Thymus spp., Thymbra spp., and Origanum spp. against X. citri subsp. malvacearum. This study contributes to the growing body of research on the antibacterial

of plant essential oils activity against Xanthomonas citri subsp. malvacearum, providing valuable insights into potential alternatives for the control of cotton bacterial blight disease. These findings open avenues for further research the development of sustainable on and environmentally friendly strategies for managing bacterial diseases in agriculture. However, for a more comprehensive understanding of the antibacterial effects of essential oils under in vivo conditions and their economic feasibility, further detailed investigations are warranted in future studies. This highlights the significance of exploring the *in vivo* antibacterial efficacy of these essential oils and assessing their economic viability.

Conflict of interest:

The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

Author contributions:

Setting up the experiments, methodology, interpretation of results, and writing of the original draft were provided by Soner Soylu; Merve Kara, Yusuf Gümüş performed the methodology including isolation, identification, pathogenicity and antibacterial assays; Emine Mine Soylu contributed to the methodology, reviewed and edited the manuscript. All authors critically reviewed and approved the final manuscript.

References

- Abdo-Hasan, M., Khalil, H., Debis, B., & Mir, A. N. (2008).
 Molecular characterisation of Syrian races of Xanthomonas axonopodis pv. malvacearum. Journal of Plant Pathology, 90, 431-439. DOI: https://www.jstor.org/stable/41998535
- Ajene, I. J., Shenge K. C., & Akpa, A. D. (2014). Races of Xanthomonas citri subsp. malvacearum, the causal organism of bacterial blight of cotton in northern Nigeria. Archives of Phytopathology and Plant Protection, 47(18), 2263-2269. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1080/03235408.2013.873561
- Aktan, Z. C., & Soylu, S. (2020). Diyarbakır İlinde yetişen badem ağaçlarından endofit ve epifit bakteri türlerinin izolasyonu ve bitki gelişimini teşvik eden

mekanizmalarının karakterizasyonu. *KSÜ Tarım ve Doğa Dergisi, 23*(3), 641-654. DOI: https://doi.org/10.18016/ksutarimdoga.vi.659802

- Anmod, A. B., Ingle, R. W., & Chormale, T.S. (2022). Pathological and cultural characteristics of different isolates of *Xanthomonas axonopodis* pv. *malvacearum. Journal of Plant Disease Sciences, 17*(1), 59-62. DOI: https://doi.org/10.48165/jpds.2022.1711
- Atay, M., & Soylu, S. (2022). Biber meyvelerinde hasat sonrası çürümelere sebep olan bazı fungal hastalık etmenlerine karşı Isothiocyanate bileşiklerinin antifungal etkilerinin belirlenmesi. *Harran Harran Tarım ve Gıda Bilimleri Dergisi, 26,* 290-302. DOI: https://doi.org/10.29050/harranziraat.1136632
- Atay, M., Soylu, S. 2023. Kurutmalık Biber meyvelerinde iç çürüklüğüne neden olan fungal etmenlere karşı bitki uçucu yağlarının in vitro antifungal etkileri. *KSU Tarım ve Doğa Dergisi, 26,* 76-89. DOI: https://doi.org/10.18016/ksutarimdoga.vi.1085859
- Basim, H., Yegen, O., & Zeller, W. (2000). Antibacterial effect of essential oil of *Thymbra spicata* L. var. *spicata* on some plant pathogenic bacteria. *Journal* of *Plant Diseases and Protection*, 107(3), 279-284. DOI: https://www.jstor.org/stable/43386995
- Bozkurt, İ. A., Soylu, S., Kara, M., & Soylu, E. M. (2020).
 Chemical composition and antibacterial activity of essential oils isolated from medicinal plants against gall forming plant pathogenic bacterial disease agents. *KSU Journal of Agriculture and Nature, 23*(6), 1474-1482.
 DOI: https://doi.org/10.18016/ksutarimdoga.vi.723544
- Burr, T.J. (2001). Future development of chemical and biological controls for bacterial diseases of plants. In Plant Pathogenic Bacteria: Proceedings of the 10th International Conference on Plant Pathogenic Bacteria, (pp. 19-23), Charlottetown, Prince Edward Island, Canada, July 23-27, Springer Netherlands.
- Churklam, W., Chaturongakul, S., Ngamwongsatit, B., & Aunpad, R. (2020). The mechanisms of action of carvacrol and its synergism with nisin against *Listeria monocytogenes* on sliced bologna sausage. *Food Control, 108,* 106864. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2019.106864
- da Silva, R. S., de Oliveira, M. M. G., de Melo, J. O., Blank, A.
 F., Correa, C. B., Scher, R., & Fernandes, R. P. M.
 (2019). Antimicrobial activity of *Lippia gracilis* essential oils on the plant pathogen *Xanthomonas campestris* pv. *campestris* and their effect on membrane integrity. *Pesticide Biochemistry and Physiology*, 160, 40-48. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pestbp.2019.06.014
- Dadasoglu, F., Kotan, R., Çakır, A., Karagöz, K., Dikbas, N., Ozer, H., Kordali, S., & Cakmakci, R. (2016). Use of essential oils and extracts from *Satureja* and *Origanum* species as seed disinfectants against

Xanthomonas axonopodis pv. *vesicatoria* (Doidge) dye. *Fresenius Environmental Bulletin, 25,* 5989-5998.

- Daferera, D. J., Ziogas, B. N., & Polissiou, M. G. (2003). The effectiveness of plant essential oils on the growth of *Botrytis cinerea, Fusarium* sp. and *Clavibacter michiganensis* subsp. *michiganensis. Crop Protection,* 22(1), 39-44. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/S0261-2194(02)00095-9
- Delannoy, E., Lyon, B. R., Marmey, P., Jalloul, A., Daniel, J.
 F., Montillet, J. L., Essenberg, M., & Nicole, M.
 (2005). Resistance of cotton towards *Xanthomonas* campestris pv. malvacearum. Annual Review of Phytopathology, 43(1), 63-82. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.phyto.43.040204.1 40251
- Dönmez, M. F., Şahin, B. U., & Bozhüyük, A. U. (2020). Antibacterial activities of essential oils and extracts of *Satureja* species against plant pathogenic bacteria in bean. *Journal of Agriculture, 3*(2), 57-70. DOI: https://doi.org/10.46876/ja.825656
- EL-Zik, K.M., & Thaxton, P.M. (1994). Breeding for resistance to bacterial blight of cotton in relation to races of the pathogen. Proceedings of the World Cotton Research Conference-1, CSIRO, Melbourne, pp. 236–241.
- Eryılmaz, G. A., Kılıç, O., & Boz, İ. (2019). Evaluation of organic agriculture and good agricultural practices in terms of economic, social and environmental sustainability in Turkey. *YYU Journal of Agricultural Science*, 29(2), 352-361. DOI: https://doi.org/10.29133/yyutbd.446002
- Ghavam, M., Manca, M. L., Manconi, M., & Bacchetta, G. (2020). Chemical composition and antimicrobial activity of essential oils obtained from leaves and flowers of *Salvia hydrangea* DC. ex Benth. *Scientific Reports*, 10(1), 1-10. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-020-73193-y
- Gümüş, Y., Soylu, S., Kara, M., & Türkmen, M. (2022).
 Chemical compositions and antibacterial activities of essential oils of five aromatic plants against plant pathogenic bacterial disease agents. *Journal of Agricultural Food and Environmental Sciences, 76*(6), 18-23.
 DOI: https://journals.ukim.mk/index.php/jafes/article/vie w/1899/1573
- Hillocks, R. J. (1981). Cotton disease research in Tanzania. *Tropical Pest Management*, 27(1), 1-12. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1080/09670878109414165
- Hillocks, R. J. (1992). Bacteral Blight. In Hillocks RJ. (ed.) Cotton Diseases, pp. 38-85. CAB International, Wallingford, UK.
- Hunter, R. E., Brinkerhoff, L. A., & Bird, L. S. (1968). The development of a set of upland cotton lines for differentiating races of *Xanthomonas malvacearum*. *Phytopathology*, 58, 830-832.

Kachur, K., & Suntres, Z. (2020). The antibacterial properties

of phenolic isomers, carvacrol and thymol. *Critical Reviews in Food Science and Nutrition, 60*(18), 3042-3053. DOI:

https://doi.org/10.1080/10408398.2019.1675585

Kara, M., Türkmen, M., & Soylu, S. (2022). Chemical compositions and in vitro antifungal activities of essential oils obtained from different *Origanum* species against postharvest gray mold rot of persimmon fruit. *Acta Horticulturae*, 1338, 283-290. DOI:

https://doi.org/10.17660/ActaHortic.2022.1338.41

- Khan, M. A. (1996). Relationship of Xanthomonas campestris pv. malvacearum population to development of symptoms of bacterial blight of cotton. Pakistan Journal of Phytopathology, 8(2), 152-155.
- Kızıl, S., & Uyar, F. (2006). Antimicrobial activities of some thyme (*Tymus, Staureja, Origanum and Thymbra*) species against important plant pathogens. Asian Journal of Chemistry, 18(2), 1455-1461.
- Kızıl, S., Uyar, F., & Sağir, A. (2005). Antibacterial activities of some essential oils against plant pathogens. Asian Journal of Plant Sciences, 4(3), 225-228.
- Küçükbay, F. Z., Kuyumcu, E., Azaz, A. D., Arabacı, T., & Yücetürk, S. Ç. (2014). Chemical composition of the essential oils of three *Thymus taxa* from Turkey with antimicrobial and antioxidant activities. *Records of Natural Products*, 8(2), 110-120.
- Lelliott, R. A., & Stead, D. E. (1987). Methods for the diagnosis bacterial diseases of plants. In: Preece, T.F., Ed., Methods in Plant Pathology, Blackwell Scientific Publications, Oxford.
- Liu, Q. C., Qiao, K., & Zhang, S. A. (2019). Potential of a small molecule carvacrol in management of vegetable diseases. *Molecules*, 24(10), 1932. DOI: https://doi.org/10.3390/molecules24101932
- Mangalagiri, N. P., Panditi, S. K., & Jeevigunta, N. L. L. (2021). Antimicrobial activity of essential plant oils and their major components. *Heliyon*, 7(4), e06835. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2021.e06835
- Mbega, E. R., Mortensen, C. N., Mabagala, R. B., & Wulff, E.
 G. (2012). The effect of plant extracts as seed treatments to control bacterial leaf spot of tomato in Tanzania. *Journal of General Plant Pathology*, *78*(4), 277-286. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1007/s10327-012-0380-z
- Mengulluoglu, M., & Soylu S. (2012). Antibacterial activities of essential oils from several medicinal plants against the seed-borne bacterial disease agent *Acidovorax avenae* subsp. *citrulli. Research on Crops, 13,* 641-646. DOI:

https://www.researchgate.net/publication/2877236 50_Antibacterial_activities_of_essential_oils_extract ed_from_medicinal_plants_against_seed-

borne_bacterial_disease_agent_Acidovorax_avenae _subsp_citrulli

- Meshram, M. K., & Raj, S. (1988). Seed cotton yield and fiber quality as influenced by different grades of bacterial blight under rainfed conditions. *Indian Journal of Plant Pathology*, *16*(2), 257-260.
- Mishra, S.P., & Krishna, A. (2001). Assessment of yield losses due to bacterial blight in cotton. *Journal of Mycology and Plant Pathology*, *31*(2), 232-233.
- Moghaddam, M., Alymanesh, M. R., Mehdizadeh, L., Mirzaei, H., & Pirbalouti, A. G. (2014). Chemical composition and antibacterial activity of essential oil of *Ocimum ciliatum*, as a new source of methyl chavicol, against ten phytopathogens. *Industrial Crops and Products, 59,* 144-148. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.indcrop.2014.05.006
- Mondal, K., Dureja, P., & Prakash, V. J. (2001). Management of *Xanthomonas camprestris* pv. *malvacearum*induced blight of cotton through phenolics of cotton rhizobacterium. *Current Microbiology*, *43*, 336-339. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1007/s002840010312
- Naqvi, S. A. H., Iqbal, S., Hafeez-ur-Rehman, Farooq, U., Hassan, M. Z., Shahid, M. N., Noor Shah, A., Abbas, A., Mubeen, I., Farooq, A., Ghareeb, R. Y., Kalaji, H. M., Alrefaei, A. F., & Ahmed, M. A. A. (2022). Evaluation of bacterial perpetuation assays and plant biomolecules antimicrobial activity against cotton blight bacterium *Xanthomonas citri* subsp. *malvacearum*; an alternative source for food production and protection. *Plants, 11*, 1278. DOI: https://doi.org/10.3390/plants11101278
- Oliveira, J.C., Albuquerque, G.M.R., Xavier, A.S., Mariano, R.L.R., Suassuna, N.D., & Souza, E.B. (2011). Characterization of Xanthomonas citri subsp. malvacearum causing cotton angular leaf spot in Brazil. *Journal of Plant Pathology, 93*, 707-712.
- Orzali, L., Valente, M. T., Scala, V., Loreti, S., & Pucci, N. (2020). Antibacterial activity of essential oils and *Trametes versicolor* extract against *Clavibacter michiganensis* subsp. *michiganensis* and *Ralstonia solanacearum* for seed treatment and development of a rapid in vivo assay. *Antibiotics*, 9(9), 628. DOI: https://doi.org/10.3390/antibiotics9090628
- Pavela, R. (2006). Insecticidal activity of essential oils again stcabbage aphid *Brevicoryne brassicae*. Journal of Essential Oil Bearing Plants, 9(2), 99-106. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1080/0972060X.2006.10643479
- Pulcrano, G., Roscetto, E., Iula, V. D., Panellis, D., Rossano, F., & Catania, M. R. (2012). MALDI-TOF mass spectrometry and microsatellite markers to evaluate *Candida parapsilosis* transmission in neonatal intensive care units. *European Journal of Clinical Microbiology & Infectious Diseases, 31,* 2919-2928. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10096-012-1642-6
- Raghavendra, V. B., Siddalingaiah, L., & Prakash, H. S.
 (2009). Role of cultivars, physical, chemical and organic treatments in the management of bacterial blight of cotton. *Archives of Phytopathology and*

Plant Protection, 42(12), 1101-1108. DOI: https://do.org/10.1080/03235400701622329

- Regnault-Roger, C., Ribodeau, M., Hamraoui, A., Bareau, I., Blanchard, P., Gil-Munoz, M. I., & Barberan, F. T. (2004). Polyphenolic compounds of Mediterranean Lamiaceae and investigation of orientational effects on Acanthoscelides obtectus (Say). Journal of Stored Products Research, 40(4), 395-408. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/S0022-474X(03)00031-6
- Sarker, S., Sultana, N., & Aminuzzaman, F. M. (2017). Biochemical characterization of *Xanthomonas axonopodis* pv. *malvacearum* isolated from infected cotton plant and it's in vitro sensitivity against some selected chemicals. *Artificial Intelligence Review*, 11, 1-10. DOI: https://doi.org/10.9734/AIR/2017/35626
- Schaad, N. W., Jones, J. B., & Chun, W. (2001). Laboratory Guide for Identification of Plant Pathogenic Bacteria.
 3rd ed.; The American Phytopathological Society: St. Paul, MN, USA.
- Schollenberger, M., Staniek, T. M., Paduch-Cichal, E., Dasiewicz, B., Gadomska-Gajadhur, A., & Mirzwa-Mroz, E. (2018). The activity of essential oils obtained from species and interspecies hybrids of the *Mentha* genus against selected plant pathogenic bacteria. *Acta Scientiarum Polonorum Hortorum Cultus, 17*(6), 167-174. DOI: https://doi.org/10.24326/asphc.2018.6.17
- Sertkaya, E., Kaya, K., & Soylu, S. (2010). Acaricidal activities of the essential oils from several medicinal plants against the carmine spider mite (*Tetranychus cinnabarinus* Boisd.) (Acarina: Tetranychidae). *Industrial Crops and Products, 31*, 107–112. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.indcrop.2009.09.009
- Shelke, G. V., Aurangabadkar, L. P., Kashikar, A. R., Wadyalkar, S. A., Phalak, M. S., Kharkarand, H. H., & Umslkarm, G. S. (2012). Identification of resistance source for bacterial blight disease caused by *Xanthomonas axonopodis* pv. *malvacearum* and its genetic inheritance in upland cotton. *Cotton Research Journal*, 3(2), 167-173.
- Shenge, K.C. (2001). Evaluation of plant extracts for the control of Bacterial Blight of Cotton induced by *Xanthomonas citri* subsp. *malvacearum* [M.Sc thesis].
- Shirsat, R. P. (2008). Screening of anti-phytopathogenic activity of *Terminalia thorelii*. *Ethnobotanical Leaflets*, *12*, 538-541.
- Singh, A., Srivastava, S., & Akram, M. (2007). Studies on bacterial leaf blight of cotton (*Gossypium* spp.). *International Journal of Sustainable Crop Production*, 2(3), 25-29.
- Soylu, S., Evrendilek, G.A., & Soylu, E.M. (2009). Chemical compositions and antibacterial activities of bitter fennel (*Foeniculum vulgare* Mill. var. vulgare) and dill (*Anethum graveolens* L.) essential oils against the growth of food-borne and seed-borne plant

pathogenic bacteria. Italian Journal of Food Science, 21, 347-355. DOI: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/2847905 94

Soylu, S., Kara, M., Türkmen, M., & Şahin, B. (2022). Synergistic effect of Foeniculum vulgare essential oil on the antibacterial activities of Ag- and Cusubstituted ZnO nanorods (ZnO-NRs) against food, human and plant pathogenic bacterial disease agents. Inorganic Chemistry Communications, 146, 110103. DOI:

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.inoche.2022.110103

- Soylu, S., Atay, M., Kara, M., Uysal, A., Soylu, E.M., & Kurt, Ş. (2023). Morphological and molecular characterization of Fusarium incarnatum as a causal disease agent of pepper (Capsicum annuum) fruit rot. Journal of Phytopathology, 171, 688-699. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1111/jph.13228
- Temtek, E. (2021). Kavunda bakteriyel meyve lekesi hastalığına neden olan Acidovorax citrulli'nin bazı bitki uçucu yağları ile in vitro koşullarda kontrolü. Yüksek Lisans Tezi, Iğdır University.
- Thaxton, P. M., & El-Zik, K. M. (2001). Bacterial blight. In: Kirk- patrick T.L., Rothrock C.S. (eds) Compendium of Cotton Diseases. 2nd ed., pp. 34-35.
- Türkmen, M., Kara, M., Maral, H., & Soylu, S. (2022). Determination of chemical component of essential oil of Origanum dubium plants grown at different altitudes and antifungal activity against Sclerotinia sclerotiorum. Journal of Food Processing and Preservation, 46, e15787. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1111/jfpp.15787
- Türkmenoğlu, Z. (1969). Ege Bölgesi pamuklarında zarar pamuk yapan köşeli yaprak leke hastalığı (Xanthomonas malvacearum Erw. Smith)'na karşı tohum ilaçlama denemeleri. Bitki Koruma Bülteni, 9, 223-237.

Uysal, A., Kurt, Ş., Soylu, S., Soylu, E.M., & Kara, M., (2019).

Yaprağı sebzelerdeki mikroorganizma yenen türlerinin MALDI-TOF MS (Matris Destekli Lazer Desorpsiyon/İyonizasyon Uçuş Süresi Kütle Spektrometresi) tekniği kullanılarak tanılanması. Yüzüncü Yıl Üniversitesi Tarım Bilimleri Dergisi, 29, 595-603. DOI:

https://doi.org/10.29133/yyutbd.627850

Ünlü, N., & Elçi, E. (2019). Antibacterial effects of eucalyptus and some commercial plant essential oils on tomato bacterial canker disease (Clavibacter michiganensis subsp. michiganensis). Plant Protection Bulletin, 59(2), 39-47. DOI:

https://doi.org/10.16955/bitkorb.471162

- Verma, J. P. (1986). Bacterial Blight of Cotton. CRC Press, Boca Ratoon, FL, USA.
- Verma, J. P., & Singh, R. P. (1974). Recent studies on the bacterial diseases of fiber and oil seed crops in India. Plant Pathology, 134-145.
- Wallace, T.P., & El-Zik, K.M. (1990). Quantitative analysis of resistance in cotton to three new isolates of the bacterial blight pathogen. Theoretical and Applied 79, 443-448. DOI: Genetics, https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00226150.
- Watkins, G. M. (1981). Compendium of Cotton Diseases, 2-40. St Paul, MN: American Phytopathology Society.
- Zachowski, M.A., Çınar, Ö., & Rudolph, K. (1989). Characterization of Xanthomonas campestris pv. malvacearum (angular leaf spot of Cotton) isolates from Turkey and resistance tests of Turkish cotton cultivars. Phytopathologia Mediterranea, 28, 10-15.
- Zenelt, W., Krawczyk, K., & Borodynko-Filas, N. (2021). Biodiversity and scope of endophytic and phytopathogenic bacterial species identified in plant samples investigated in the Plant Disease Clinic laboratory. Journal of Plant Protection Research, 61(1), 63-82 DOI:

https://doi.org/10.24425/jppr.2021.136274