Eskiyeni 55 (December 2024), 1567-1587 Research Article https://doi.org/10.37697/eskiyeni.1468598



Intercultural Communication According to the Principles of Hegel's Philosophy of Logic

Nurgül Ergül 0000-0002-9473-1474

Sivas Cumhuriyet University, Yıldızeli Vocational School, Department of Marketing and Advertising, Sivas,
Türkiye
ror.org/04f81fm77
nurgulergul@cumhuriyet.edu.tr

Abstract

According to Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel, the fundamental tool for understanding the development of thought is logic, and Hegel's philosophy of logic is approached in three stages: abstract logic, concrete logic, and the logic of spirit. Abstract logic examines the most basic conceptual framework of thought, while concrete logic explains how these concepts transformed into more complex thought processes. The logic of spirit analyzes how thought processes evolve in a societal and historical context. Comprehensive research on Hegel's principles of reality and intercultural communication has not been found in the literature. Therefore, religious beliefs and cultural communication phenomena have been examined based on Hegel's philosophy of logic. The research findings are as follows: The principles of reality are based on three basic principles: materialism, causality, and reciprocity. Understanding the interactions between religions and cultures, which represent different conceptual structures is significant in the light of these principles. The research results show that Hegel's dialectical process explains how conflicts between different systems of thought give rise to more complex levels of thinking. This principle plays a crucial role in resolving conflicts arising from religious beliefs and cultural diversity. The principle of transforming reality emphasizes that thought is not merely a theoretical activity but also a process that impacts social reality. In this context, religious and cultural communication is not merely a mental activity but also a process that shapes reality. The principle of the unity of opposites stresses the need to see the diversity between different religions and cultures as complementary elements with the potential for mutual understanding and enrichment. I addition, the principle of the historical process and social evolution highlights the importance of considering historical and social contexts in understanding the interactions between religious and cultural beliefs and practices. This study demonstrates that Hegel's principles of dialectical progress, transforming reality, the unity of opposites, and the historical process can be used as a functional methodology in the behavioral sciences.

Kevwords

Interdisciplinary Studies; Religion and Culture; Intercultural Communication; Hegel's Philosophy of Logic; Principle of Performativity

Highlights

- What are the implications of Hegel's Concept of Actuality in his Philosophy of Logic for interreligious and intercultural communication, and are these implications functional?
- What are the relationships between the principles of Actuality and interaction processes?
- The fundamental function in shaping conceptual processes relies on religious beliefs and cultural differences.
- The development of conceptual processes is depends on conflicts rather than compromise.
- The principles of transforming reality, the unity of opposites (dialectic) principle, and historical transformation principles are foundational for shaping religious beliefs and intercultural communication.

Citation

Ergül, Nurgül. "Intercultural Communication According to the Principles of Hegel's Philosophy of Logic". *Eskiyeni* 55 (December 2024), 1567-1587.

https://doi.org/10.37697/eskiyeni.1468598

Article Information

Date of submission16 April 2024Date of acceptance08 November 2024Date of publication20 December 2024

Reviewers Two Internal & Two External

Review Double-blind Plagiarism checks Yes - intihal.net

Conflicts of Interest The Author(s) declare(s) that there is no conflict of interest

Grant Support No funds, grants, or other support was received.

Complaints eskiyenidergi@gmail.com
S. Development Goals 4 Quality Education
License CC BY-NC 4.0

Eskiyeni 55 (Aralık 2024), 1567-1587 Araştırma Makalesi https://doi.org/10.37697/eskiyeni.1468598



Hegel Mantık Felsefesi İlkelerine Göre Kültürlerarası İletişim

Nurgül Ergül

Sivas Cumhuriyet University, Yıldızeli Meslek Yüksek Okulu, Pazarlama ve Reklamcılık Bölümü, Sivas, Türkiye ror.org/04f81fm77 nurgulergul@cumhuriyet.edu.tr

Öz

Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel'e göre düşüncenin gelişimini anlamanın temel aracı mantıktır ve Hegel'in mantık felsefesi üç asamada ele alınır; soyut mantık, somut mantık ve tin mantığı. Soyut mantık, düşüncenin en temel kavramsal çerçevesini incelerken, somut mantık bu kavramların daha karmaşık düşünce süreçlerine nasıl dönüştüğünü açıklar. Tin mantığı ise düsünce süreclerinin toplumsal ve tarihsel bağlamda nasıl evrildiğini analiz eder. Literatürde Hegel'in gerçeklik ilkeleri ve kültürlerarası iletişim üzerine kapsamlı bir arastırma bulunmamaktadır. Bu nedenle dini inanclar ve kültürel iletisim olguları, Hegel'in mantık felsefesi temelinde incelenmiştir. Araştırma bulguları şu şekildedir: Gerçeklik ilkeleri, üç temel ilkeye dayanmaktadır: maddecilik, nedensellik ve karşılıklılık. Farklı kavramsal yapıları temsil eden dinler ve kültürler arasındaki etkilesimleri anlamak, bu ilkeler ısığında önemlidir. Arastırma sonuçları, Hegel'in diyalektik sürecinin farklı düşünce sistemleri arasındaki çatışmaların daha karmaşık düşünce seviyelerine nasıl yol açtığını açıkladığını göstermektedir. Bu ilke, dini inançlardan ve kültürel çeşitlilikten kaynaklanan catısmaların cözümünde önemli bir rol oynamaktadır. Gercekliğin dönüsümü ilkesi, düşüncenin sadece teorik bir faaliyet olmadığını, aynı zamanda toplumsal gerçekliği etkileyen bir süreç olduğunu vurgular. Bu bağlamda, dini ve kültürel iletişim yalnızca zihinsel bir faaliyet değil, aynı zamanda gercekliği sekillendiren bir sürectir. Zıtlıkların birliği ilkesi, farklı dinler ve kültürler arasındaki çeşitliliğin, karşılıklı anlayış ve zenginleşme potansiyeli olan tamamlayıcı unsurlar olarak görülmesi gerektiğini vurgular. Ayrıca, tarihsel süreç ve toplumsal evrim ilkesi, dini ve kültürel inançlar ve pratikler arasındaki etkileşimleri anlamada tarihsel ve toplumsal bağlamların göz önünde bulundurulmasının önemini vurgular. Bu çalışma, Hegel'in diyalektik ilerleme, gerçekliğin dönüşümü, zıtlıkların birliği ve tarihsel süreç ilkelerinin, davranış bilimlerinde işlevsel bir metodoloji olarak kullanılabileceğini göstermektedir.

Anahtar Kelimeler

Disiplinlerarası Çalışmalar; Din ve Kültür; Kültürlerarası İletişim; Hegel'in Mantık Felsefesi; Edimsellilk İlkesi

Öne Çıkanlar

- Hegel'in Mantık Felsefesinde yer alan Edimsellik Yaklaşımının din ve kültürlerarası iletişim açısından etkileri nelerdir ve bu etkiler işlevsel midir?
- Edimsellik ilkeleri ile etkileşim süreçleri arasındaki ilişkiler nelerdir?
- Düşünsel süreçlerin şekillenmesinde temel işlev dinî inanç ve kültürel farklılıklara dayanır.
- Düsünsel süreclerin gelisimi, uzlasıdan ziyade, catısmalara bağlıdır.
- Gerçekliği dönüştürme ilkesi, Karşıtlıkların birliği (diyalektik) ilkesi ve tarihsel dönüşüm ilkeleri, dinî inançların şekillenmesi ve kültürlerarası iletişim için temel ilkelerdir.

Atıf Bilgisi

Ergül, Nurgül. "Hegel Mantık Felsefesi İlkelerine Göre Kültürlerarası İletişim". *Eskiyeni* 55 (Aralık 2024), 1567-1587. https://doi.org/10.37697/eskiyeni.1468598

Makale Bilgileri

Geliş Tarihi 16 Nisan 2024 Kabul Tarihi 08 Kasım 2024 Yavım Tarihi 20 Aralık 2024

Hakem Sayısı İki İç Hakem - İki Dış Hakem Değerlendirme Çift Taraflı Kör Hakemlik

Etik Beyan Bu çalışmanın hazırlanma sürecinde etik ilkelere uyulmuştur.

Benzerlik Taraması Yapıldı - intihal.net

Çıkar Çatışması beyan edilmemiştir.

Finansman Herhangi bir fon, hibe veya başka bir destek alınmamıştır.

Etik Bildirim eskiyenidergi@gmail.com

S. Kalkınma Amaçları 4 Nitelikli Eğitim Lisans CC BY-NC 4.0

Introduction

According to Hegel, the concept of the Absolute being thought is not in the sense of formal thought. Logic takes on the task of structuring the life of the Absolute and, by overcoming the contradictions between the finite and the infinite, the Absolute and the limited, accomplishes this task. According to Hegel, the contradictions and conflicts in the world of experience can also be overcome through a synthesis of the contradiction between the finite and the infinite1. However, this synthesis aims to overcome the fundamental contradiction by integrating the finite with the infinite. This process is a dialectical one and aims to provide a rational explanation of the Absolute. Being thought by the Absolute means it is not a formal thought. According to Hegel, the Absolute is an inherently necessary selfdevelopment process.² The task of philosophy is to present this necessary process based on its own logic. Logic is a part of philosophy that examines this process. Hegel's philosophy of logic consists of three stages: Being-in-itself (Idea), Being-for-itself (Nature), Being-in-andfor-itself (Spirit/Geist).3 Philosophy also has three main sections: logic, philosophy of nature, and philosophy of spirit. Logic aims to reveal the inner essence of the Absolute and is also a metaphysical discipline. Hegel's logic aims to explain the definitions and categories of the Absolute. These categories are the definitions of the Absolute and state that only the Absolute exists as reality. Logic includes abstract, dialectical, and imaginative aspects and aims to provide a logical explanation of the world. In conclusion, Hegel's philosophy of logic aims to explain the thought of the Absolute and its evolution. Logic is used as a tool to understand the fundamental principle of reality and the internal structure of the Absolute. Understanding, dialectics, synthesis (imagination) form the foundations of this philosophy. This philosophy has two sub-sections: the doctrine of being and essence. The doctrine of being includes three categories: quality, quantity, and measure. The second subsection, the doctrine of essence, is based on distinctions of relation and relativity. According to Hegel, the thought reflection consists of eight categories. These categories are Identity, Difference, Ground, Existence, Thing, Phenomenon, Cause, and Actuality. Substantiality, causality, and interaction are the three fundamental principles of actuality. According to these principles, the process of understanding thought is explained through categories such as Identity, Difference, Ground, Existence, Thing, Phenomenon, Cause, and Actuality. These categories represent various stages in the development of thought.⁵ Particularly, the conceptual and social ground of the thought of religion, namely God, is highly related to the stage of actuality (interaction). However, no research has been found in the literature regarding the relationships of these principles with religious and cultural contexts. In this study, the first part presents the relevant theoretical framework; the second part provides a detailed explanation of the causal relationships of these principles in the context of intercultural communication, and the third and final part offers a general evaluation. The research results indicate that the category of Identity is at the forefront of these

¹ Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel, *Felsefi Bilimler Ansiklopedisi I: Mantık Bilimi*, çev. Aziz Yardımlı (İstanbul: İdea Yayınları, 1991).

² Walter Terence Stace, *The Philosophy Of Hegel: A Systematic Exposition* (New York: Dover Publications, 1955).

³ Stern Robert. Hegel And The Phenomenology of Spirit (London: Routledge, 2002).

⁴ Hegel, Felsefi Bilimler Ansiklopedisi I: Mantık Bilimi, 68-98.

⁵ Frederick Copleston, Hegel, çev. Aziz Yardımlı (İstanbul: İdea Yayıncılık, 2010).

relationships. The category of Identity can represent common features or fundamental similarities between different religions and cultures. Difference, on the other hand, expresses the specific characteristics or differences between these diverse religions and cultures. The category of Ground can represent the common values, historical connections, or social conditions underlying the interaction between religions and cultures. Existence can represent how religions and cultures manifest concretely and are experienced. The categories of Thing and Phenomenon can represent the observable aspects of religions and cultures and how these observed forms are perceived. The categories of Cause and Actuality can represent how the interaction between religions and cultures mutually influences and changes each other. Hegel's dialectical approach emphasizes continuous interaction and development between opposites, indicating that change and evolution are inevitable in intercultural interaction. Hegel's philosophy adopts a universal understanding of history and attempts to understand intercultural interaction as a historical process. In this context, intercultural interaction may involve not only differences and diversity but also processes of evolution and synthesis. All these relationships provide a unique perspective on the processes of interaction, change, synthesis, and development in intercultural relations.

1. Hegel's Reality Principles and Intercultural Communication

Hegel's principle of reality is based on three interrelated concepts: Identity, Causality, and Interaction. These principles offer a nuanced understanding of how different cultures interact, transform, and integrate through dynamic processes in the context of intercultural communication. In his *Science of Logic*⁶ presents identity not as a static relation but as a dynamic process examined under the category of 'Essence.' Essence encompasses both appearance and reality, revealing the tension between what things are and how they manifest. This duality of essence and appearance shows that identity inherently includes both separation and unity. The unity of identity culminates in the concept of 'Life,' where being (objectivity) and thought (subjectivity) find their highest expression. In intercultural communication, the identity of thought and being can be observed in the evolving relations between cultures, which, like Hegel's concept of identity, involve both the preservation of distinct cultural features and transformative encounters with the "other."

Cultural interaction, in this sense, reflects the identity of subject and object in Hegel's logic, where the subject (a culture) recognizes itself in relation to the object (another culture). This process of self-recognition and differentiation parallels how cultures maintain their unique identities while engaging with others, leading to a redefinition and deepening of their cultural self-consciousness. In this context, identity is not fixed but is formed through an ongoing dialogue, which Hegel describes as the internal movement within being.

The principle of causality, on the other hand, states that every event or situation arises from a prior cause, forming a chain of interconnected events ⁷. In the realm of intercultural communication, this principle sheds light on the causes of interactions between cultures. According to this principle, every cultural change or adaptation is the result of previous encounters. No culture exists in isolation; each is shaped by its historical interactions,

⁶ Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel, The Science of Logic, çev. Aziz Yardımlı (İstanbul: İdea Yayınları, 2010).

⁷ Hegel, The Science of Logic.

whether through trade, migration, conflict, or diplomacy. This principle emphasizes the cumulative effect of intercultural experiences, demonstrating that each interaction serves as a cause for subsequent transformations. The evolution of a culture is thus a continuous cause-and-effect process shaped by its interactions with other cultures.

Hegel's principle of interaction posits that reality is made up of a dynamic structure of interconnected forces, constantly affecting one another. In intercultural communication, this notion translates into a process of mutual shaping. When cultures come into contact, they do not simply coexist passively; rather, they actively engage and influence each other, leading to mutual transformation. Hegel's understanding of interaction aligns with concepts such as cultural hybridity and reciprocity, where cultures affect and evolve through this exchange. This reciprocal interaction reflects Hegel's dialectical process, where each culture represents a thesis (existing values, norms, and beliefs) that encounters an antithesis (different values, norms, and beliefs) in the other culture ⁸ The interaction between these cultural forces leads to the emergence of a new understanding or practice (synthesis), which incorporates elements of both.

This synthesis does not erase cultural differences but rather signifies the dynamic blending and reshaping of identities, giving rise to new cultural forms. Through Hegel's dialectical model, intercultural communication can be understood as a developmental process in which cultures both preserve certain aspects of their identities and adopt new elements from others. The thesis-antithesis-synthesis framework offers a way to conceptualize cultural encounters not as oppositional but as transformative processes. The cultures involved in such communication are not static; they evolve through the interaction of their values and beliefs.

Hegel's logic enables us to understand intercultural communication as a necessary and positive process of cultural transformation. Through dialogue and interaction, cultures enrich each other. This is in line with contemporary discussions on multiculturalism, cultural hybridity, and global citizenship, where the focus shifts beyond rigid cultural boundaries toward the interaction of more fluid and dynamic global identities⁹.

In conclusion, Hegel's principles of Identity, Causality, and Interaction provide a solid philosophical foundation for understanding intercultural communication. As cultures encounter one another, they engage in a dialectical process that transforms them, resulting in new, hybrid identities that reflect a unity of diversity. This dynamic process highlights how intercultural communication is a force that shapes and reshapes the cultural fabric of the world. This process is closely tied to Hegel's principles of identity, causality, and interaction. For example, the interactions between immigrant communities and local societies can be seen as a process of maintaining identity while also adopting new elements. Similarly, studies on cultural hybridity emphasize that cultural identities are not fixed but are constantly evolving through a process of change and interaction of . The formation of new hybrid identities through mutual interaction and the cumulative effects of previous influences can be explained through Hegel's dialectical process (Hegel, 1812/2010). For

⁸ Hegel, The Science of Logic.

Homi K. Bhabha, The Location of Culture (New York: Routledge, 1994).

¹⁰ Bhabha, The Location of Culture.

instance, historically, trade routes have facilitated cultural exchanges between societies, leading to the creation of new cultural forms¹¹.

1.1. The Principle of Identity

Hegel's concept of identity, as examined in the *Science of Logic*, expresses a dynamic movement within the relationship of the subject to itself. Hegel addresses identity in the section on "Essence," as essence is the determination of appearance, and this reveals the essence-appearance dichotomy. This dialectic between essence and appearance implies that identity must contain both division and unity. Essence is absolute unity, and therefore addressing identity means addressing the essential movement within being. This movement expresses what Hegel considers the most fundamental ontological problem: the identity between thought and being, that is, the identity between subject and object. According to Hegel, this identity is possible through the "Concept," and the highest unity of this concept is reached in "Life." In Hegel's terminology, life represents the highest unity of thought and being, as the immediate "Idea."

This philosophical framework provides an important understanding of how identity can be addressed in the context of intercultural communication. Intercultural communication occurs through the interaction of different cultural identities. Each cultural identity, similar to Hegel's essence-appearance distinction, possesses both an internal (subjective) meaning world and external (objective) determinations. In the process of intercultural communication, these identities must maintain both an internal coherence and establish a relationship with their opposites. Just as in Hegel's concept of identity, this process is not merely an interaction of external appearances but involves the essential reflection of identities onto each other, resulting in a movement towards unity through their differences of the context of the contex

As discussed in Hegel's section on the "Concept," identity is not merely an external determination; it is the result of the reciprocal movement between subject and object. In intercultural communication, this thought indicates that identity is not limited to external factors such as language, traditions, or values but requires understanding the deep structural relationships underlying these elements. When a cultural subject interacts with another cultural object, both parties experience the dialectical movement Hegel describes: identity is both negated and reaches unity¹³.

In this context, the understanding of identity derived from the relationship between essence and appearance in Hegel's thought emphasizes that identities in intercultural communication are in a constant state of change and transformation. Even though the identities of different cultures may emerge as opposites, these oppositions are, in fact, part of the path towards unity. As in Hegel's dialectic, the identities within intercultural communication engage in a process of interaction with their opposites, and through this process, both sides achieve a broader unity of meaning¹⁴.

¹¹ Jack Goody, The East in the West (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996).

¹² Hegel, The Science of Logic.

Stephen Houlgate, The Opening of Hegel's Logic: From Being to Infinity (West Lafayette: Purdue University Press, 2006).

Robert B. Pippin, Hegel's Idealism: The Satisfactions of Self-Consciousness (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989).

The highest identity emphasized by Hegel through the concept of "Life" can be explained in the context of intercultural communication as the process where cultural identities reach mutual understanding through dialectical interaction. Intercultural communication, similar to the unity of subject and object in Hegel's dialectic, reveals that cultural differences are not merely points of division but indicate the possibility of a higher unity.

Hegel's philosophical system emphasizes the importance of the dialectical relationship between identity and opposition while offering a theoretical framework for understanding intercultural communication. Applying Hegel's understanding of identity to the process of interaction between cultural differences and similarities provides a rich foundation for understanding the dynamic nature of intercultural communication. In this context, identity is not a fixed feature in intercultural interactions but enters a continuous process of transformation¹⁵. This process illustrates how Hegel's dialectical method can be applied to intercultural communication: each cultural identity contains its contradictions, and the interaction between these oppositions allows for the reconstruction of identity

1.2. The Principle of Causality

Hegel's principle of causality is not limited to a simple cause-and-effect relationship; rather, it is understood as a totality within the dialectical process. In this context, causality is not seen as one event causing another, but as the mutual relationship and determination of events. A similar understanding of causality can be found in intercultural communication. Intercultural interactions are not merely a process of one party influencing the other, but a process in which both parties mutually shape and complete one another. When relating Hegel's concept of causality to intercultural communication, four key components come to the forefront:

1.2.1. The Dialectical Method

In Hegel's system of thought, every concept is related to its opposite concept (thesis-antithesis), and these oppositions are synthesized to form a new concept or state. This is a process of constant movement and change. In intercultural communication, this dialectical process is clearly observable. The coming together of different cultures reveals their oppositions, and these oppositions create new meanings, values, and practices through communication ¹⁶. Communication brings cultural differences to a point of synthesis, and this synthesis leads to the creation of new cultural identities and relationships. Thus, intercultural communication, like Hegel's dialectical method, is not a fixed and static process but a process of continuous change and reconstruction.

1.2.2. Intrinsic Connection

Hegel asserts that causality is not merely an external link but an intrinsic connection between events. Cause and effect are not independent of each other; rather, they define and complement one another. A similar situation exists in intercultural communication. When cultural identities interact with other cultural identities, they are not only externally

¹⁵ Charles Taylor, Hegel (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1975).

William B. Gudykunst, Cross-Cultural and Intercultural Communication (Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, 2003).

influenced; this interaction also shapes the internal structure of their identities. For example, when one culture interacts with another, this is not merely an exchange of surface-level information but a mutual process of understanding each other. Like Hegel's causality, intercultural communication should not be understood as one side influencing the other but as a mutual determination of both parties¹⁷.

1.2.3. Historical and Social Dimension

Hegel's understanding of causality is not limited to physical events; historical and social events are also evaluated within this dialectical causality process. For Hegel, history is not a mere chain of events but a process in which each event is dialectically related to the previous one. In intercultural communication, the historical and social dimensions are also important. Each cultural interaction emerges as a result of previous interactions, and these interactions contribute to the formation of new social structures. For instance, post-colonial intercultural relations cannot be understood independently of the colonial past; this historical context helps us better understand the dialectical nature of intercultural communication ¹⁸.

1.2.4. Freedom and Necessity

Hegel relates the principle of causality to the concepts of freedom and necessity. According to him, human freedom is possible through the understanding of oneself and one's surroundings within a dialectical process. In this process, necessities (cause-effect relationships) are seen as part of freedom. A similar understanding is valid in intercultural communication. The interaction between different cultures allows each party to redefine their cultural identity within the framework of these necessities. A cultural subject gains a deeper understanding of their identity by interacting with another cultural object. In this process, what may seem like inevitable cultural conflicts become tools for creating a broader space for freedom and understanding¹⁹.

The dynamic, dialectical, and mutually determinative nature of Hegel's principle of causality offers a rich theoretical framework for understanding intercultural communication. In intercultural communication, causality is not just about one culture affecting another but about cultures mutually shaping and completing each other. This process, parallel to Hegel's understanding of causality, is not fixed and unidirectional but rather multidirectional and constantly interacting. Cultural interactions, in a dialectical process where they are mutually related and complete each other, create new meanings and identities²⁰.

1.3. The Principle of Interaction

The principle of interaction emphasizes how mutual interactions between objects or concepts shape reality. Hegel proposes that reality is a continuous network of interactions and relationships. According to this principle, everything is interconnected and cannot be

19 Kim, Becoming Intercultural: An Integrative Theory of Communication and Cross-Cultural Adaptation.

Young Yun Kim, Becoming Intercultural: An Integrative Theory of Communication and Cross-Cultural Adaptation (Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, 2001).

¹⁸ Edward W. Said, Culture and Imperialism (New York: Vintage Books, 1993).

Milton J. Bennett, Basic Concepts of Intercultural Communication: Paradigms, Principles, and Practices (Boston: Intercultural Press, 1998).

considered in isolation or as independent entities. Objects or concepts interact within an ever-changing network of relationships, thereby constituting reality. Based on these principles, Hegel views reality as a dynamic process and underscores that everything is interconnected and in interaction²¹.

In Hegel's philosophy of logic, the principle of interaction lies at the heart of the dialectical method, expressing the mutual determinacy between events and processes. According to Hegel, interaction is not merely a relationship where events and processes affect each other but also one where they complement and transform one another.

In this process, interaction does not mean that each stage necessarily gives rise to another but that they mutually determine each other. Thesis and antithesis cannot exist independently; synthesis emerges from the interaction of these opposites²².

Intrinsic and Mutual Determinacy:

The principle of interaction asserts that events and processes are determined not externally but intrinsically. This means that an event or process does not merely influence another but also changes and transforms itself as a result of this interaction. This mutual determinacy necessitates understanding events and processes within a totality. According to Hegel's philosophy of logic, the principle of interaction expresses the mutual determinacy and intrinsic connections between events and processes. This principle aligns with the complex systems and interrelationships found in nature and the physical world. Events and processes should be understood not within a unidirectional causality chain but in mutual interaction and transformation.

Hegel's principles of actuality play a crucial role in understanding his intellectual system and philosophical approach. According to Hegel, interaction represents the full development of the causality relationship. This category represents the foundations of cause and effect and heralds the concept. Interaction, in one respect, is cause and in another respect, effect. This is based on an understanding where opposites are in continuous interaction, influencing and depending on each other. Interaction is a fundamental concept that shapes Hegel's dialectical thinking. These three categories demonstrate, according to Hegel's intellectual system and dialectical method, that opposites are continuously in unity, influencing each other, and achieving full development through this interaction. The relationships constituting interaction are as follows:23

- 1. Real and Ideal Relationship: According to Hegel, reality is not a mere form of existence; it is a concept where necessity and possibility are equally opposite. The relationship between the ideal and the real is primarily expressed as the realization of something that belongs to the ideal type. By nature, the idea carries a universal quality.
- 2. Teleological Approach: The concept of actuality is fundamentally shaped teleologically. In this context, it is crucial to see actuality as both a goal and a focus as an idea. Actuality expresses the realization of something belonging to the ideal type.

²¹ Fritzman, J.M., Hegel (Cambridge: Polity Press, 2014).

²² Berto Francesco, "Hegel's Dialectics as a Semantic Theory: An Analytic Reading", European Journal of Philosophy 15/1 (2007), 19-39.

²³ Burbidge John, On Hegel's Logic: Fragments of a Commentary, Atlantic Highlands (NJ: Humanities Press, 1981).

- 3. Relationship between Concept and Reality: Hegel views actuality as a synthesis between concept and reality. Reality occurs within the concept and represents a continuous evolution. This process has an internal structure that is not identical over time.
- 4. Dialectical Process: In Hegel's philosophy, actuality is closely related to the dialectical operation. This process, which appears to eliminate contradictions through various identifications, is, in fact, a product of continuous conflict and synthesis.
- 5. Universality and Individuality: While universality is prominent in Hegel's concept of actuality, the principle of individuation is lacking. This means that in Hegel, the principle of individuation that does not conform to the universal context of the idea is absent.
- 6. Relationship between Essence and Concept: Hegel establishes a relationship between essence and concept in actuality. The concept is a formation that contains the truth of essence. However, this identity is not tautological; it is a content-based synthesis.

Conclusion: Intrinsic and Mutual Determinacy

In intercultural communication, interaction is not just a superficial exchange but a profound process of mutual determinacy. This means that while one culture influences another, it is also affected and changed by this interaction. Cultures are understood as dynamic systems that shape and redefine each other.

Cultural Reciprocity: Cultural reciprocity refers to the process where different cultures influence and change each other. For example, in the globalization process, while Western culture influences Eastern culture, Eastern culture also influences Western culture. This mutual interaction leads to changes in both cultures²⁴.

Hybridization: Cultural hybridization is the process where different cultural elements come together to create new and unique cultural forms. For example, in Latin America, the interaction of European, Indigenous, and African cultures has led to the emergence of a unique cultural identity in this region.

Multiculturalism: Multiculturalism is the coexistence of different cultures within a society, where these cultures interact and create new cultural forms. This situation ensures the preservation and enrichment of cultural diversity.

2. Hegel's Principle of Actuality, the Relationship Between Religion and Culture

Religion and culture are fundamental elements that influence the existence of human communities. The interaction between these two domains has been examined by many philosophical thinkers throughout history. Hegel, a prominent figure in German idealist philosophy, is known for his philosophy of logic. Hegel's philosophy of logic holds a significant place in his intellectual development. Logic, for him, is a fundamental tool to understand the development of thought processes and concepts. Hegel divides logic into three main sections: Abstract Logic, Concrete Logic, and the Logic of Spirit²⁵. These sections encompass fundamental concepts to understand the evolution of thought and societal institutions. Intercultural communication involves the interaction between communities with different belief systems, where elements such as language, rituals, values, and norms play crucial roles. According to Hegel, logic is in constant development, and this

²⁴ Redding Paul, "Findlay's Hegel: Idealism as Modal Actualism", Critical Horizons 18/2 (2017), 359–377.

²⁵ Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel, Hegel Phenomenology of Spirit, çev. Arthur V. Miller (New York: Oxford University Press, 1977).

development occurs through the process of thesis-antithesis-synthesis. This process signifies the emergence of a new level of thinking as a result of the convergence of different thought systems. The thesis-antithesis-synthesis process facilitates the emergence of a new synthesis after the conflicts between different religions and cultures. This process is crucial for understanding the evolution of societies and the complexity of religion-culture relationships²⁶. Based on these principles, the foundation of intercultural communication lies in intellectual development and actuality. Hegel argues that thought is in constant development, and this development is an actualization process. Actuality emphasizes that thought is not merely an abstract theoretical activity but also an action that affects reality. In this context, intellectual development and actuality shape the interactions between different belief systems and cultures in intercultural communication. Hegel's principle of actuality is a fundamental principle that underlies his intellectual development and dialectical approach. This principle highlights the relationship between thought and reality, considering thought not only as a theoretical activity but also as an action that influences and transforms reality. According to Hegel, thought is not only a mental activity but also manifests itself as an action that transforms reality. This notion suggests that thought, when engaging with the world, serves as a tool to understand and transform reality. The principle of actuality emphasizes the potential of thought to create a concrete impact.

From the perspective of intellectual development, Hegel's principle of actuality includes the following elements 27 .

2.1. Dialectical Progress

Hegel believes that intellectual development occurs through the process of thesis-antithesis-synthesis. This process progresses as a thought or concept emerges as a thesis, followed by the appearance of an opposing thought or antithesis, and the conflict between them concludes in a synthesis. This dialectical process demonstrates that intellectual development is dynamic and continuous. Hegel considers the dialectical process a philosophical method and thought process, representing the dynamic nature of intellectual development, conflict, and change ²⁸. Hegel views dialectics as a way of understanding the evolution between thought and reality. The general steps of the dialectical process include:

Thesis: At the beginning of the dialectical process, a thesis is put forward. This thesis represents a specific thought, concept, or situation. This stage expresses the current state or thought.

Antithesis: The antithesis, opposing the thesis, emerges. It represents a thought or situation contrary to that of the thesis. The conflict between thesis and antithesis signifies a contradiction.

Conflict and Development: The conflict between thesis and antithesis leads to the emergence of a new situation or thought. This conflict serves as the driving force behind intellectual development and change, as per²⁹.

²⁶ Frederick Copleston, *Hegel* (İstanbul: İdea Yayınları, 1996), 96-232.

²⁷ Robert, "Hegel Phenomenology of Spirit", 102-210.

²⁸ Ferit Uslu, "Hegel'in Mantık Öğretisi- Hegel Mantığının Metafiziksel Temelleri Üzerine Bir İnceleme". Hitit Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Derqisi 1/2 (Aralık 2002), 229-252.

²⁹ Terry Pinkard, Hegel"s Phenomenology: Sociality of Reason (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1994).

Synthesis: As a result of the conflict between thesis and antithesis, a synthesis appears. The synthesis represents a new situation that transcends the conflict between thesis and antithesis, indicating a higher level of intellectual integrity. Hegel's dialectical process underscores that intellectual development is a dynamic progression arising from conflict and contradiction. This process explains not only the development of thought but also has been applied to elucidate social and historical change.

2.2. Transformation of Reality

According to Hegel³⁰, thought, far from merely understanding reality, also influences and transforms it. Intellectual development is employed to understand and shape the real world. This implies that thought is not solely a theoretical activity but also a practical action. Hegel's concept of the transformation of reality is grounded in his dialectical method and idealist philosophical system. He argues that intellectual development affects and transforms reality. Hegel's views on the transformation of reality include:

Development from past to future: Hegel contends that reality is in constant evolution. Past events, thoughts, and situations influence the current state and determine future developments. Therefore, the transformation of reality is tied to progress and development within a historical process.

Ole of ideas: Hegel believes that ideas shape reality beyond material existence. According to him, the world of thought and philosophical concepts creates reality guided by ideals and meanings that exist beyond matter. This idealistic understanding explains how thought transforms reality.

Consciousness and historical development: Hegel emphasizes the evolution of individuals' and societies' consciousness within the historical process. Social structures, institutions, and values change as a product of intellectual development. This change signifies an ongoing process of transformation in the consciousness of individuals and societies. Ideal of Absolute Morality and Freedom: Hegel sees the highest point of reality's transformation in Absolute Morality. At this point, the individual realizes their freedom and human ideals. Moral development occurs as individuals overcome internal conflicts and societal rules evolve. Hegel's idealistic and dialectical approach highlights that reality is in constant change and transformation. This article explores Hegel's perspective, emphasizing the dynamic relationship between thought and reality, intellectual development, and the transformative power of thought on reality.

2.3. Unity of Oppositions

According to Hegel, it should be considered that oppositions exist in a continuous unity. The diversity among different religions, the contrasts arising in intercultural communication should be seen as complementary elements. This unity emphasizes how differences can be transformed into mutual understanding and enrichment. Hegel's understanding of the unity of oppositions represents his dialectical method and forms the basis of intellectual development. This concept is used to understand processes of intellectual conflict and contradiction. Key points according to the principle of the unity of oppositions:

³⁰ Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel, Lectures on The History of Philosophy, Volume III", çev. E.S. Haldane, F.H. Simson (New York: The Humanities Press, 1974).

Thesis-antithesis-synthesis principle: Hegel's understanding of the unity of oppositions is shaped by the thesis-antithesis-synthesis principle. According to this principle, each thought or situation first appears as a thesis. An antithesis emerges in response to this thesis, and these two opposing thoughts or situations enter into conflict. This conflict leads to the emergence of a new synthesis. This process demonstrates the dynamic and evolutionary character of intellectual development.

Conflict and development: Hegel argues that conflict is the driving force of intellectual development. The conflict between two opposing thoughts or situations enables the transformation of thought and reality. This conflict brings about a new synthesis that realizes the unity of oppositions.

Negative thought and overcoming: According to Hegel, the process of unity of oppositions involves negative thought. This signifies an awareness of conflict and contradictions. However, these negative situations can be overcome and utilized to reach a higher level of thought. From Hegel's perspective, negative situations are part of development and progress.

Relationship between absolute idea and finite idea: Hegel sees the process of the unity of oppositions connected to the development of the Absolute Idea. Finite ideas represent stages of the process where conflicts and unions of these finite ideas ultimately lead to the emergence of the absolute idea. The absolute idea represents the highest and most comprehensive form of thought.

Holistic and developmental perspective: Hegel's understanding of the unity of oppositions is based on a holistic perspective. The process of unity of oppositions considers intellectual development as a whole and emphasizes that conflicts are temporary and developmental. This perspective demonstrates that reality is constantly undergoing transformation, and the unity of oppositions represents an evolutionary process. Hegel's scientific style is essential for understanding the evolutionary nature of intellectual development and reality.

2.4. Historical Process and Social Evolution

According to Hegel³¹, intellectual development is evaluated within the historical process. Interaction in interreligious and intercultural communication occurring within the historical process explains how different beliefs and cultures interact with each other. Hegel's philosophy of historical process and social evolution is based on his idealist thought system, viewing history as the evolution of a historical spirit. According to Hegel, history is a reflection of the process of humanity's liberation, and this process emerges through historical events and social changes. Hegel's fundamental views on the historical process and social evolution:

Intellectual development and history: According to Hegel, history is a thought process and a reflection of humanity's intellectual development. Historical events emerge as part of intellectual development, and the historical process reflects the evolution of consciousness and liberation of humanity.

Concrete manifestation of thought: Hegel believes that the historical process is the concrete manifestation of thought. History is the process where intellectual categories

³¹ Hegel, "Lectures on The History of Philosophy", 77-124.

become a concrete reality. This process signifies the progress of intellectual development of individuals and societies throughout history.

Guidance by reason: Hegel argues that progress in the historical process is connected to the development of human reason. History is the process of humanity understanding the world better and shaping the world according to this understanding. Historical events are part of an evolution guided by reason.

Intellectual and social progress: Hegel believes that intellectual and social progress are interconnected. The intellectual development of society is related to the intellectual evolution of individuals. Social change is a reflection of the intellectual transformation of individuals.

Historical spirit and world history: Hegel asserts that history has a spirit guiding world history. This historical spirit directs the development of consciousness and morality of individuals and shapes history as a whole. World history is the expression of the historical spirit. Historical conflict and finite idea: According to Hegel, conflict and contradiction are inevitable in the historical process. However, this conflict enables the continuous evolution of finite ideas. Historical conflict leads to the emergence of new ideas and the ongoing process of humanity's liberation. Hegel's understanding of the historical process and social evolution highlights that intellectual and social change is a mutually influencing process. History is a part of humanity's process of liberation and a concrete expression of intellectual development.

2.5. Universal Moral Principles

Hegel argues that universal moral principles should guide social life. In interreligious and intercultural communication, constructing an understanding around values such as tolerance and justice based on universal moral principles can create a common foundation among different communities. Therefore, in the context of Hegel's principle of action, interreligious and intercultural communication can be explained, considering the importance of the unity of oppositions, the dialectical process, historical evolution, and universal moral principles. This approach can be used to understand how healthy communication and understanding can be established among different belief systems and cultures. In Hegel's philosophy, universal moral principles are concepts that form the basis of his ethical and moral understanding. Hegel believes that morality has a universal and objective quality, and these universal moral principles play a significant role in the process of both individual and societal liberation. Hegel's basic views on universal moral principles³².

Freedom and morality: According to Hegel, freedom is the realization of an individual and living a harmonious life with one's essence. This freedom is achieved through understanding and adopting ethical values and universal principles. Morality is associated with the guidance of universal principles in the individual's process of liberation.

Universal moral ideals: Hegel believes that ethical values and principles are universal. These universal moral ideals guide ethical behavior in the individual's social life. The universal nature of ethical values is essential for the individual to understand and adopt their freedom and human ideals.

³² Hegel, Hegel's Science of Logic.

Sittlichkeit (ethical society): Hegel's concept of "Sittlichkeit" refers to the ethical society where ethical values and principles are experienced through social institutions and norms. An ethical society is a necessary environment for an individual to develop their freedom and ethical consciousness. Social norms provide the expression of ethical values.

Moral right and administration justice: Hegel argues that ethical values and principles should be organized in harmony with an individual's rights and administrative justice. Moral right signifies an individual's right to preserve their freedom in relationships with others. Administration justice refers to the fair governance of social institutions.

Virtue and moral qualities: Hegel emphasizes that an individual's moral qualities, character, and behavior should be in harmony with universal moral principles. Virtue indicates an individual's behavior in accordance with ethical values. Moral qualities are related to the individual's progress in ethical consciousness and the realization of their freedom.

Absolute morality: The highest point in Hegel's moral philosophy is Absolute morality. Absolute Morality represents a moral state where an individual maximizes their freedom and ethical consciousness, fully aligning with universal moral principles. Absolute Morality represents the highest goal that should be achieved in the individual and societal evolution. Hegel's universal moral principles provide important guidance for individuals to realize their freedom in social life and develop ethical consciousness. The universal and objective nature of ethical values aims for individuals to lead a harmonious life in line with their essence.

Conclusion

This article examines intercultural communication relationships based on Hegel's philosophy of logic. According to the research findings, the principles of reality are based on three fundamental concepts: subjectivity, causality, and the relationship of interaction. These principles highlight the importance of understanding the interactions between different conceptual frameworks representing religions and cultures. Hegel's dialectical process, shaped by the thesis-antithesis-synthesis principle, signifies the emergence of a new level of thought following the clash of different thought systems. This principle has proven to be highly functional in overcoming diversity and conflicts in intercultural communication.

The principle of the transformation of reality emphasizes that thought is not merely an abstract theoretical activity but also an action that influences the real world. This principle demonstrates that intercultural communication is not only a cognitive activity but also a process that impacts reality. The principle of the unity of contradictions underscores that the diversity between different religions and cultures should be viewed as complementary elements. This principle highlights the potential for mutual understanding and enrichment within diversity. The principle of historical processes and social evolution allows for the evaluation of interactions in intercultural communication within a historical and social context. Hegel's understanding, encompassing five different principles (interpretation of diversity, prevention of conflicts, transformation of reality, unity of opposites, and social evolution), provides an appropriate framework for understanding how different beliefs and cultures interact. Hegel's dialectical principles, particularly those of subjectivity, causality,

and interaction, form a foundation for interpreting the complex and dynamic nature of intercultural interactions. These principles provide a framework for examining how different conceptual frameworks, such as those of religion and culture, may clash and then harmonize, leading to the synthesis of new cultural understandings and identities. One of the key concepts that emerges is the Principle of Causality, which transcends a simplistic cause-and-effect framework and recognizes the mutual determination between events and processes. This is particularly relevant in intercultural communication, where cultures do not merely influence each other in a single direction, but are instead constantly transformed through these interactions. For instance, the spread of cultural practices such as cuisine, languages, or philosophical concepts across borders demonstrates how mutual determination shapes cultural identities. The global rise of hybrid cultural phenomena such as K-pop's popularity in Western countries or the increasing influence of yoga and mindfulness practices in non-Asian contexts—exemplifies this process. Cultures are not static; they evolve and redefine themselves through these interactions, often blending elements from various traditions to create new, hybrid identities and practices. Hegel's Principle of the Unity of Contradictions is also crucial in understanding intercultural communication. The diversity and contradictions between cultures should not be seen as obstacles to communication, but as opportunities for mutual enrichment and understanding. For example, in the interaction between Eastern philosophies that emphasize collectivism and Western traditions rooted in individualism, one does not necessarily negate the other. Instead, the dialogue between these perspectives has led to a broader understanding in fields like psychology, where the role of the individual in society is now considered within a more holistic framework. Viewing these contradictions as complementary is essential for navigating modern multicultural societies, where a variety of conflicting values and beliefs coexist.

Another significant component is the Principle of Historical Processes and Social Evolution. This principle emphasizes that intercultural communication cannot be separated from its historical and social context. Every cultural interaction is deeply rooted in historical developments such as colonization, migration, trade, or globalization. For example, postcolonial relations between former colonial powers and their colonies are still shaped by a history of dominance, but contemporary intercultural communication within these contexts allows for the renegotiation and reinterpretation of historical narratives. This dynamic process fosters the emergence of new cultural expressions, such as the development of Creole languages or the rise of Afro-Caribbean cultural movements, which synthesize past and present influences in a dialectical manner. The Principle of Interaction, as explained through Hegel's dialectical method, is critical to understanding the continuous process of transformation that intercultural communication entails. Cultural interaction does not occur in isolation; it is a profound exchange that shapes the identities of all participants. One of the clearest examples of this is the concept of multiculturalism in countries like Canada and the United States, where diverse ethnic and cultural groups coexist, influencing and being influenced by one another. In these societies, intercultural communication is not a superficial exchange but a deep, transformative process that redefines what it means to belong to a particular cultural identity. The blending of cultural elements from different traditions creates richer and more diverse cultural landscapes, in which new identities and social structures emerge. In line with Hegel's Principle of the Transformation of Reality, this process of interaction affects the real world not just in theoretical or cognitive terms but in tangible ways. Cultural exchanges through migration, media, trade, and technology reshape not only cultural identities but also political, social, and economic systems. For example, the widespread acceptance of global business practices rooted in Western corporate culture has transformed economies worldwide, while the integration of indigenous knowledge systems into environmental policies demonstrates the potential for intercultural communication to influence global governance and sustainability practices.

In conclusion, Hegel's dialectical principles-especially causality, interaction, and the unity of contradictions-offer a powerful theoretical framework for understanding the complexities of intercultural communication. These principles illuminate how cultures interact, influence one another, and evolve within broader historical and social contexts. Intercultural communication is not a static process; it is a dynamic and dialectical exchange in which contradictions lead to synthesis, creating new, enriched cultural forms. Hegel's philosophy provides an invaluable perspective for analyzing the reciprocal relationships between cultures, the formation of hybrid identities, and the ongoing process of global multiculturalism. By recognizing the transformative potential within these intercultural interactions, we can foster deeper mutual understanding, enrich cultural diversity, and contribute to a more integrated and tolerant world. This study emphasizes the relevance of Hegel's philosophical principles not only in the fields of theology, philosophy, and communication, but also for interdisciplinary approaches in the social sciences. These insights offer valuable tools for scholars and practitioners seeking to understand and address the challenges of cultural diversity, integration, and global social development. Hegel's principles of logic illuminate the dynamics underlying cultural reciprocity, hybridization, and multiculturalism, revealing the complex nature of intercultural interaction. Ultimately, these fundamental principles highlight the critical importance of Hegel's philosophy, particularly in theology, philosophy, communication, and psychology. The principles derived from this study are essential for enhancing integration and interdisciplinary understanding across different scientific fields.

References | Kaynakça

- Appiah, Kwame Anthony. Cosmopolitanism: Ethics in a World of Strangers. New York: W.W. Norton & Company, 2006.
- Bennett, Milton J. Basic Concepts of Intercultural Communication: Paradigms, Principles, and Practices. Boston: Intercultural Press, 1998.
- Berto, Francesco. "Hegel's Dialectics as a Semantic Theory: An Analytic Reading." *European Journal of Philosophy* 15, no. 1 (2007), 19–39.
- Burbidge, John. "On Hegel's Logic: Fragments of a Commentary." Atlantic Highlands, NJ: Humanities Press, 1981.
- Copleston, Frederick. Hegel. çev. Aziz Yardımlı. İstanbul: İdea Yayıncılık, 2010.
- Düsing, Klaus. Ontology and Dialectic in Hegel's Thought/The Dimensions of Hegel's Dialectic. by Limnatis NG NY: Continuum. 2010.
- Fritzman, J.M. Hegel, Cambridge: Polity Press, 2014.
- Gudykunst, William B. Cross-Cultural and Intercultural Communication. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, 2003.
- Harris, Errol E. An Interpretation of the Logic of Hegel. Lanham, MD: University Press of America, 1983.
- Hartmann, Nicolai. *Aristoteles ve Hegel- Diyalektik, Mantık, Ontoloji*, çev. Saygın Günenç. Ankara: Fol Yayıncılık, 2021.
- Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. Felsefi Bilimler Ansiklopedisi I: Mantık Bilimi. çev. Aziz Yardımlı. İstanbul: İdea Yayınları, 1991.
- Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *Hegel's Science of Logic*. Çev. W. H. Jonston ve L. G. Struthers. New York: Humanities Press, 1966.
- Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. Mantık Bilimi (Sözel Zusatze ile Birlikte), Felsefi Bilimler Ansiklopedisi I. İstanbul: İdea Yayınları, 2014.
- Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *Phenomenology of Spirit.* çev. Arthur V. Miller, New York: Oxford University Press, 1977.
- Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *The Science of Logic*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010.
- Houlgate, Stephen. *The Opening of Hegel's Logic: From Being to Infinity*. West Lafayette: Purdue University Press, 2006.
- Kaufmann, Walter Arnold. *Hegel: Reinterpretation, Texts, and Commentary.* Garden City, NY: Doubleday and Company Inc., 1965.
- Kim, Young Yun. *Becoming Intercultural: An Integrative Theory of Communication and Cross-Cultural Adaptation*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, 2001.
- Lectures on the History of Philosophy [Geschichte der Philosophie], in three volumes, translated by E.S. Haldane and Frances H. Simson, New Jersey: Humanities Press, 1974.
- Margolis, Joseph. "The Greening of Hegel's Dialectical Logic." *The Dimensions of Hegel's Dialectic*. Ed. Nectarios G. Limnatis. London: Continuum, 2010.
- Ng, Karen. *Hegel's Concept of Life: Self-Consciousness, Freedom, Logic.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2020.
- Pinkard, Terry, Hegel"s *Phenomenology: Sociality of Reason*. New York, Cambridge University Press, 1994.

- Pippin, Robert B. *Hegel's Idealism: The Satisfactions of Self-Consciousness*. Cambridge University Press, 1989.
- Redding, Paul. "Findlay's Hegel: Idealism as Modal Actualism." *Critical Horizons* 18, no. 2 (2017), 359–377.
- Said, Edward W. Culture and Imperialism. New York: Vintage Books, 1993.
- Stern, Robert. Hegel and the Phenomenology of Spirit. London: Routledge 2002.
- Stewart, Jon. "Hegel's Doctrine of Determinate Negation: An Example from 'Sense-certainty' and 'Perception'." *Idealistic Studies* 26/1 (1996), 57–78.
- Uslu, Ferit. "Hegel'in Mantık Öğretisi: Hegel Mantığının Metafiziksel Temelleri Üzerine Bir İnceleme." Hitit Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi 1/2 (Aralık 2002), 229-252.
- Walter Terence, Stace, *The Philosophy Of Hegel: A Systematic Exposition.* New York: Dover Publications, 1955.