



ARAŞTIRMA MAKALESİ | RESEARCH ARTICLE Kasım/November 2024, Özel Sayı 1/Special Issue 1, 17-33 Geliş: 12.12.2023 | Kabul: 27.12.2023 | Yayın: 28.12.2023 DOI: 10.47951/mediad.1401093

# Religious Commodification in Social Experiments on Zavilda TV's YouTube Channel<sup>1</sup>

Nurfudiniyah<sup>\*\*</sup> Lukman Hakim<sup>\*\*\*</sup> Jangki Dausat Fonny<sup>\*\*\*\*</sup>

#### Abstract

Social media, including YouTube, has emerged as a significant aspect of contemporary lifestyles in society. Youtubers need to be able to present interesting content ideas in order to attract more viewers and advertisers. Zavilda TV YouTube Channel turns Islam into a content idea and commodifies it to attract more viewers. Religion and spirituality are no longer something exclusive, but have become a commodity and a public broadcast, used as an object and capital in the political economy of the media. Thus, this study aims to uncover realities that reflect the practice of commodification of religion in the Islamic social experiment targeting women. This research uses a qualitative approach with a literature review. Dialogue manuscripts, titles, video descriptions and thumbnails for Zavilda TV are research objects that are studied using observation and documentation methods. The study of the political economy of media and critical discourse analysis are used to uncover and explain commodification in a more critical and in-depth way. The results found in this study are forms of religious commodification in the form of religious symbols and Islamic songs, as well as religious reflections that are given to the target to make them willing to wear the headscarf. The issue of religious tolerance is also included in the content by targeting women of religions other than Islam to try wearing the headscarf. There is a relationship that is lamely built through the clothing of talent and targets like preachers and mad'u. Zavilda TV attempts to disseminate its understanding of religion. The channel asserts that its interpretation of religious doctrine is accurate and obligatory for all Muslim women, even if some of the remarks given tend to discriminate.

Keywords: Commodification of Religion, YouTube, Islamic Social Experiments

# Zavilda TV YouTube Kanalındaki Sosyal Deneylerde Dinin Metalaştırılması

#### Öz

Sosyal medya, YouTube da dâhil olmak üzere, günümüz yaşam tarzlarının önemli bir unsuru olarak ortaya çıkmıştır. YouTuber'ların, daha fazla izleyici ve reklam veren çekebilmek için ilgi çekici içerik fikirleri sunmaları gerekmektedir. Zavilda TV adlı YouTube kanalı, İslam'ı bir içerik fikir olarak ele alarak daha fazla izleyici çekmek amacıyla metalaştırmaktadır. Din ve maneviyat, artık yalnızca bireylere özgü bir olgu olmaktan çıkarak medyanın politik

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The data in the examined accounts was constantly update and took its final form on May 2023. Data taken via YouTube platform.

<sup>\*\*</sup> B.S.Sc., State Islamic Institute of Kediri, e-mail: nurfudiniyah@gmail.com, orcid.org/0009-0001-2555-7265, East Java, Endonezya

<sup>\*\*\*</sup> M.S.Sc., State Islamic Institute of Kediri, e-mail: lukmanhakim@iainkediri.ac.id, orcid.org/0000-0003-2904-531X, East Java, Endonezya

<sup>\*\*\*\*</sup> State Islamic Institute of Kediri, e-mail: jangkidausat.fa@gmail.com, orcid.org/0009-0000-3966-8401, East Java, Endonezya

ekonomisinin bir nesnesi ve sermayesi hâline gelmiş, kamuya açık bir yayın ve ticari bir metaya dönüşmüştür. Bu bağlamda, bu çalışma, özellikle kadınlara yönelik İslami sosyal deneylerde dinin metalaştırılmasını yansıtan gerçeklikleri ortaya çıkarmayı amaçlamaktadır. Araştırma, nitel bir yaklaşım benimseyerek bir literatür taraması ile yürütülmüştür. Araştırmanın nesnesi olarak Zavilda TV'nin diyalog metinleri, başlıkları, video açıklamaları ve küçük resimleri, gözlem ve dokümantasyon yöntemleri kullanılarak incelenmiştir. Medyanın politik ekonomisi ve eleştirel söylem analizi, metalaştırma pratiklerini daha eleştirel ve derinlemesine ortaya çıkarmak ve açıklamak için kullanılmıştır. Araştırma sonuçları, dinî metalaştırmanın; dinî semboller ve İslami ilahiler, hedef kitleye başörtüsü takmayı kabul ettirme çabası ile iletilen dinî yansımalar gibi biçimlerde ortaya çıktığını göstermektedir. İçeriklerde, başörtüsü takma denemesine katılmaları için İslam dışındaki dinlere mensup kadınlar hedef alınarak dinî hoşgörü meselesine de yer verilmektedir. Ancak, hedef kitle ile içerik üreticisi arasındaki ilişki, vaiz ve muhatap arasındaki geleneksel ilişkiyi zayıf bir şekilde yansıtmaktadır. Zavilda TV, ortaya koyduğu dinî anlayışını yayma girişiminde bulunarak, bu anlayışın doğru ve tüm Müslüman kadınlar için bağlayıcı olduğunu öne sürmektedir. Bununla birlikte, bu yorumların bazı durumlarda ayrımcılığa yol açtığı gözlemlenmiştir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Dinin Metalaştırılması, YouTube, İslami Sosyal Deneyler

**ATIF:** Nurfudiniyah, Hakim, L., & Fonny, J. S. (2024). Commodification of religion in social experiment Zavilda TV's content YouTube channel. *Medya ve Din Araştırmaları Dergisi (MEDİAD)*, Special Issue 1, p. 17-33.

#### Introduction

Social media, including YouTube, has emerged as a significant aspect of contemporary lifestyles in society. The changes in the way people communicate are also driven by social media, which is available thanks to the Internet. This social media is a means of interacting with each other by sharing and exchanging information and ideas, words, pictures and videos in a virtual space (Setiadi, 2020).

Social media is also a means of self-expression; even now, social media has become a lifestyle for the community. According to a survey conducted by We Are Social, the number of active social media users in Indonesia reached 167 million in January 2023, or 60.4% of the Indonesian population (Meltwater, 2023). The average use of social media is 3 hours and 18 minutes per day (Widi, 2023). Along with many social media users, YouTube is one of the social networks used by Indonesia, after Facebook, which has reached 2.29 billion active users (Saputra, 2019).

Meanwhile, Indonesia is ranked as the fourth-highest YouTube user in the world after India, the United States, and Brazil, with 139 million users (Sadya, 2023). Digital creators, especially YouTubers, are beginning to emerge along with many social media users, not only because they want to work in cyberspace, but also because they want to make a living from content creation.

YouTubers need to be highly creative and able to present content with exciting ideas to keep viewers interested. Youtubers are busy competing to create content with creativity in a way that attracts the public's attention; creative Youtubers will get more responses from viewers and have a high probability of increasing AdSense on their channels, so Youtubers will benefit in the form of salaries from YouTube Adsense. This is why more and more people are turning YouTube into a career. Youtubers use YouTube to earn income, either directly from YouTube or from other parties (Habibi, 2021).

A variety of techniques are available for YouTubers to earn income, namely by joining the YouTube Partner Program, which will later give them Adsense, provided they already have 10,000 views, by promoting other people's services or products (endorsements), by promoting their own services or products, and a combination of several of these things. (Helianthusonfri, 2018). There are several ways to make money on YouTube, and many Youtubers are now competing to make their content as attractive as possible to attract viewers. One way is to include elements of the Islamic religion in their content. In the era of YouTuber competition, the phenomenon of business using religion is currently emerging, especially in Indonesia, a country with the highest Muslim majority population in the world. Of course, it is interesting for YouTubers to identify their target



market. Business actors are commodifying Islam as an object of content and goods with a saleable value, so the delivery is changing (Firasikha, 2019).

Commodification seeks to provide goods or services with material and commercial value. Thus, commodification is a way of transforming a relationship that was initially free of commercial elements into one that is commercial in nature (Kitiarsa, 2008). In its development, objects of consumption have also penetrated areas considered sacred, such as religious practices (Rizqa Ahmadi, Lilik Rofiqoh, 2022). Currently, Youtubers in Indonesia have also commodified religion in their content. This commodification aims to make religious content in the content so that it is watched a lot and gets clicks on ads or likes so that Youtubers can make a profit. Meanwhile, the purpose of commodifying religion is to bring religious elements into the marketplace and turn something sacred into something tradable (Saiful Hakam, Cahyo Pamungkas, 2017). Not all commodification of religion will make the sacred Islamic religion as a way of life into a commodity that has a sale or commercial value.

One of the YouTube channels that includes religion as content and commodifies it is the Zavilda TV channel. This channel has 211 thousand subscribers with the slogan "Islamic Social Experiment." this channel has received 13,118,132 views from June 2020 to October 2022 (https://youtube.com/@zavildatv?si=5zD27zs7odTgdBZG). Zavilda TV specifically creates content about Islamic social-religious experiments. Zavilda TV conducted a social experiment by visiting openly dressed women on the side of the road and talking about religion. Zavilda asked about several things related to the target's worship activities and her clothes. Apart from that, the most important thing is to invite the target to try using the hijab, veil, and closed clothing. Instead of preaching, Zavilda TV is considered to have commodified Islam because they exploit women.

In all of their content, the target of the social experiment is women by giving "bombastic" titles such as Viral! Dua Cewe S3xy Tatoan Insyaf Karena Takut Mati & Memilih Hijrah! (https://youtu.be/\_2jNUotoyDA) and all of the video titles contain elements of sexist language even though many use the words "Hijrah," "Insyaf," "Taubat," "Hijab" and words that are synonymous with other Islamic religions. Zavilda TV made the title, included elements of the Islamic faith, and made the idea of social experiment content considered a way to increase viewers, which would also increase their profits as a Youtuber.

**Figure 1.** Footage of religious symbols in Zavilda TV content (Zavilda TV, 2022c, 2022d, 2022f, 2022g)



19

The commodification of religion in the media can occur in any media, both mass media and social media (new media), because according to communication studies, all communication products can become commodification media (Jerry Indrawan, Efriza, 2020). Desika Fiorentina previously researched the commodification of religion on YouTube social media under the title Commodification of Religion in Ukhti Mega Official YouTube Content, the findings of commodification in Ukhty Mega's vlog content are religious elements that are used as content in the form of ta'aruf, young marriage, veils, etc (Fiorentina, 2022).

The commodification of religion in other social media was also raised by Farhan and Faisul Islamiyah, who reveal the commodification of religion with the headscarf on social media seen from the point of view of netizens and the role of netizens in it (Farhan, 2019). Meanwhile, Muhamad Fahrudin Yusuf presented research on the commodification of religion in the mass media under the title Commodification: Mirrors of Fractured Religion on Television: Perspectives on the Political Economy of the Media. This research led to the conclusion that almost all content in TV programmes is transformed into 'religion'. The entire process of television broadcasting cannot be separated from commodification at the levels of production, distribution, exhibition and consumption (Yusuf, 2017).

However, from the research on commodification in different media and perspectives. As in the mainstream media with a political economy perspective or on social media platforms such as Instagram with a virtual ethnographic perspective, and so on. The commodification of religion in YouTube social media from the perspective of media political economy and gender paradigm has not been raised. Therefore, this study seeks to see how the commodification of religion exists in the social experiment content of Zavilda TV's YouTube channel from the perspective of media political economy and gender paradigm.

#### Methodology

This study used a qualitative method with a literature review or literature study approach. This study focuses on the hidden reality in the form of the commodification of religion in social experiments on YouTube content. So, the objects of this research are all Zavilda Tv's visual objects in the form of manuscripts, titles, descriptions, thumbnails of video content in August, and some other viral content on other social media. These videos are collected as primary research data using observation and documentation techniques, while clarification Zavilda TV targets YouTube channels and other social media as supporting data (secondary research data).

The data analysis used in this study is based on the leading theory of the study of Media Political Economy by Vincent Mosco and content analysis in the form of Critical Discourse Analysis (AWK) by Norman Fairclough as a supporting theory to uncover hidden realities that reflect the practice of commodification of religion in the content of Zavilda TV's Islamic Social Experiment. The use of these two theories to expose and explain commodification in a more critical and in-depth manner is because the paradigm used is a gender perspective. Thus, the commodification of religion will be exposed through the study of Vincent Mosco's Media Political Economy in the Commodification of Content, the Commodification of Audiences and the Commodification of Labour. The use of these two theories to expose and explain commodification in a more critical and in-depth manner because the paradigm used is a gender perspective. Thus, the commodification of Labour. The use of these two theories to expose and explain commodification in a more critical and in-depth manner because the paradigm used is a gender perspective. Thus, the commodification of religion will be revealed through the study of Vincent Mosco's Media Political Economy in Commodification of Content, Audiences, and Labour (Mosco, 2009). These commodification findings will be criticized in more depth using AWK Norman Fairclough in the form of text analysis, Discours Practice Analysis, and socio-cultural analysis (Haryatmoko, 2019).



#### **Results and Discussions**

Commodification is converting any use value initially without selling value into a commodity or traded. Everything can become a commodity as long as it brings profit, including religion, which is used as a commodity in content and changed to advertisers to bring in profits, as Zavilda TV did (Santi, 2004). The Islamic religion has been commodified through social media, a product of the contemporary capitalist era where media has evolved from a mass industry into a profit-driven enterprise. Content creators exploit public engagement and user-generated content to generate revenue. In the end, not much different from mainstream media, social media became a for-profit corporation. Content creators take advantage of public participation, content creation, and various kinds of photos and videos to become media content commodities (Yoetadi, 2020). According to Vincent Mosco, several things are used as commodities in communication. They are often the target of commodification, including the commodification of content, the commodification of audiences, and the commodification of labor (Mosco, 2009).

#### A. Commodification of Content

Content commodification transforms the content of the message, from the construction of the message to the design of the message's meaning system, until the message is ready to be marketed. The media's message is designed to be liked by the public, even though it is unnecessary. The focus of this commodification is the commodity and its meaning (Haryono, 2020). The commodification of news is a form of media management exploitation of issues that are liked, desired or attract public attention. Alternative media with social media platforms such as YouTube allow audiences to become content producers (publishers). In social media, YouTube allows audiences to produce, develop and distribute their content (Yoetadi, 2020).

Zavilda TV makes Islam the content of its messages because most Indonesians are Muslim. All the programmes on the social experiment Zavilda TV contain content about the Islamic religion and are spiked with sensationalism to attract attention as indicated by the title "Cewe S<sub>3</sub>xy Bertato Tidak Percaya Adanya Tuhan, Menangis Ingin Insyaf!", "Cewe S<sub>3</sub>xy Malu Pakai Hijab Seketika Dikasih Renungan Ingin Hijrah Malah Nangis", "Cewe S<sub>3</sub>xy Nangis, Renungan Dosa Buka Aurat Bikin Dia Ingin Hijrah", etc. The commodification of faith in the YouTube content of Zavilda TV The relationship between the commodification of religious symbols and the differences in the escalation of spiritual life from earlier times in Indonesia is powerful (Fealy, 2008). This content makes the commodification of Islam the commercialization of Islam or the exploitation of piety and its symbols as commodities (Zulfa Makiah, Noorhaidi Hasan, Ali Sodiqin, 2022).

Zavilda TV uses religious symbols in highlights in the form of Islamic sentences and songs, which become background music to support their Islamic social experiment content. Apart from that, another spiritual element that Zavilda TV includes in its content is death. In all its videos, Zavilda TV always contains a message to remember death as presented in Table 1. However, 3 of the statements about the end labeled the target. This message is a form of religious commodification carried out by Zavilda TV.

Message Contents	Content Title
Kakak selama 20 tahun telah ingkar sama kewajiban kakak, seandainya Allah bukan Maha Penyayang, seandainya Allah itu jahat sudah dari dulu Allah murka sudah ambil nyawa kakak, sudah ambil kesehatan kakak.	Cewe S3xy Nangis, Renungan Dosa Buka Aurat Bikin Dia Ingin Hijrah
(Sis, you've been denying your responsibilities for two decades. If God wasn't so loving, if God was cruel, He	

Table 1. Zavilda TV's Reflection Message to Remember Death



would have punished you a long time a go, taken away your life and health.)	
Kita merasa satu tahun lagi kita masih hidup, satu minggu lagi saya masih bisa hidup, padahal kan yang namanya kematian nggak ada yang tahu sedangkan kakak sudah sekian lama ingkar sama Allah, meninggalkan kewajiban gitu kan. (We think we'll still be alive a year from now or even a week from now. But the truth is, none of us known when death will come. And far so long, you've been denying God and negleting your religiious duties)	Must be assigned to the main title of the article. Tutupin Aurat Artis S3xy Adeknya Celine Evangelista, Seketika Nangis Ingin Hijrah
Nggak pernah punya rasa takut? Kalau gimana seandainya tiba-tiba Allah panggil kita?. (Have you ever felt afraid? What if Allah calls us sudenly?)	Viral! Dua Cewe S3xy Tatoan Insyaf Karena Takut Mati & Memilih Hijrah!

Source: Author's analysis

### 1. Text Analysis

In this analysis, we will see how the vocabulary and use of terms in Zavilda TV's social experiment content footage commodifies religion, as well as the text construction of statements made by Vilda when persuading her targets to wear the hijab by providing religious messages and reflections on death. Religious symbols in words with Islamic nuances are inserted in the content outside of the dialogue being delivered. Some of the words inserted are "Alhamdulillah," "Masha Allah," "Hijrah," etc.

**Figure 2.** Footage of religious symbols in Zavilda TV content (Zavilda TV, 2022c, 2022d, 2022f, 2022g)



"Alhamdulillah" was the most frequently mentioned word in its content in August by 10x (total of all content). Tahmid, or "Alhamdulillah," means All Praise to Allah. Tahmid expresses a servant's gratitude to Allah SWT (Maesyaroh, 2021). According to the data obtained in this way, they also added a sentence of praise, namely "Masya Allah," which is in two of Zavilda TV's Islamic social experiment content, the word "Hijrah" to invite the target to change like a Muslim woman,



the word "Menutup aurat" (covering the awrah or practicing Islamic dress codes) which is mentioned up to 13x in the content is used as a substitute word for "Menggunakan Hijab" (wearing hijab) even though the word "Hijab" is still inserted in other content.

The use of religious symbols in Arabic terms and Islamic nuances supports the content of Zavilda TV's social experiment called the Islamic Social Experiment and strengthens its representation. Vilda is also referred to as "Ukhty." "Ukhty" itself has experienced a narrowing of its meaning from what was originally just a greeting and had the essence of my sister. She is now seen as a woman who wears Islamic clothing or covers her private parts completely (Irawati, 2014).

Islamic nuanced songs were also included to support Zavilda TV's Islamic social experiment, such as "Rasulallah ya Habiballah" and "Betapa Indahnya" sung by Ustadz. Jefri, as well as Syaikhona's song, is precisely the same as the YouTube video entitled "Sholawat Tersedih-Sholla Alaikallohu Robbi Daiman (Syaikhona)." The choice of this song implies that Zavilda TV wants to explore the emotions of its audience by including Islamic songs with lilting rhythms and deep lyrics.

Message Contents	Content Title
Kakak selama 20 tahun telah ingkar sama kewajiban kakak, seandainya Allah bukan Maha Penyayang, seandainya Allah itu jahat sudah dari dulu Allah murka sudah ambil nyawa kakak, sudah ambil kesehatan kakak. (Sis, you've been denying your responsibilities for two decades. İf God wasn't so loving, if God was cruel, He would have punished you a long time a go, taken away your life and health.)	Cewe S3xy Nangis, Renungan Dosa Buka Aurat Bikin Dia Ingin Hijrah
Kita merasa satu tahun lagi kita masih hidup, satu minggu lagi saya masih bisa hidup, padahal kan yang namanya kematian nggak ada yang tahu sedangkan kakak sudah sekian lama ingkar sama Allah, meninggalkan kewajiban gitu kan. (We think we'll still be alive a year from now or even a week from now. But the truth is, none of us known when death will come. And far so long, you've been denying God and negleting your religiious duties)	Must be assigned to the main title of the article. Tutupin Aurat Artis S3xy Adeknya Celine Evangelista, Seketika Nangis Ingin Hijrah
Nggak pernah punya rasa takut? Kalau gimana seandainya tiba-tiba Allah panggil kita?. (Have you ever felt afraid? What if Allah calls us sudenly?)	Viral! Dua Cewe S3xy Tatoan Insyaf Karena Takut Mati & Memilih Hijrah!

### Table 2. Zavilda TV's Reflection

In its dialogue, Zavilda TV tends to label its targets even though Vilda intends to reflect. It can be seen from the use of the word "ingkar" (denying) which is mentioned in the two contents, the term "ingkar" (denying) is used in the sentence "Kakak selama 20 tahun telah ingkar sama kewajiban kakak,..." and "... padahal kan yang namanya kematian nggak ada yang tahu sedangkan kakak sudah sekian lama ingkar sama Allah,...." Meanwhile, the meaning of the word "ingkar" (denying) in Indonesian is not to acknowledge, reject, and not accept either verbally or in the heart, both physically and mentally. The word "ingkar" can support Vilda's appearance and image, which is described as someone who understands religion. The word "ingkar" has Arabic roots: Ankara, yunkiru, and inkaran, synonymous with the Islamic faith. Arabic cannot be separated from Islam because the source of the religion of Muslims is the Al-Quran and Hadith, which are in Arabic (Junaid, 2018). Vilda's other labeling can be seen in the sentence, "Nggak pernah punya rasa takut? Kalau gimana seandainya tiba-tiba Allah panggil kita?." Vilda seemed to label that her target was not afraid of God.

The use of the terms "ambil nyawa" (taken away your life) and "ambil kesehatan" (taken away your health) in the sentence "Seandainya Allah itu jahat sudah dari dulu Allah murka sudah ambil nyawa kakak, sudah ambil kesehatan kakak." It is a metaphor to imply a specific picture of the meaning of death (Nugraha, 2021)

Dialog 1:

Vilda : "Kalau kewajiban-kewajiban lain meskipun jarang-jarang masih nggak, kak?. Kaya sholat gitu masih nggak, sih?. Atau memang sudah nggak pernah sama sekali?." (even the less frequent obligation, like praying, have you been neglecting those too? Or have you completely stopped doing them?)

Target : "Nggak pernah sama sekali." (completely stopped)

Vilda : "Terakhir kapan nih?. Nggakpapa, kak. Kita sharing-sharing saja." (when was the last time? Its okay, we can talk about it)

Target : "Waktu sekolah aja." (when I was still in school)

Dialog 2:

Vilda : "Menjalankan perintah agama tuh terakhir kali kapan, kak?." (when was the last time you obeyed a religious command?

Target : "Nggak tahu, satu tahun yang lalu mungkin." (I don't know, maybe a year ago)

Vilda : "Udah lama banget, ya?" (that was a long time ago, wasn't it?)

Target : "Udah lama banget." (yeah, really long time)

The dialogue between Vilda and the target implies that Vilda wants to know the intensity of the target's worship, as can be seen from the choice of the words "jarang-jarang" (less frequent obligation) and "nggak pernah" (completely stopped) as well as the question with the sentence "Terakhir kali kapan?" (when was the last time?) that Vilda mentioned. Besides that, In several other videos about tolerance as indicated in Figur 3, almost all the titles contain the word "NONIS," which refers to the term non-Islamic. Non-Islamic is the term for someone who is not or is not Muslim. Unfortunately, this term is still being debated in society because it is considered to have a negative connotation and refers to the meaning of "Kafir" (non-believer) (Rakhmatulloh, 2019).

The representation of worship can also be seen from the different terms used by Vilda. In the first content, Vilda uses the time "kewajiban-kewajiban lain" which refers to Muslim worship, namely prayer, which is confirmed by the following question sentence, namely, "Kaya sholat gitu masih nggak, sih?" (like praying, have you been neglecting those too?). Meanwhile, in the second content, Vilda uses the term "perintah agama" (religious command), This term represents religion in general, not just Islam because the target in the second content is someone who does not believe in the existence of God even though he claims to be Muslim.



**Figure 3**. Thumbnail of Zavilda TV content with target "Nonis" (2045 TV, 2022; Zavida TV, 2022; Zavilda TV, 2022a)



The video thumbnail about "Nonis" also implies the existence of a binary mindset or Binary Thinking, which is a way of thinking based on binary logic and just seeing things in this world as two categories without any gradations or deep thinking (Admin, 2022). Zavilda TV only looks at Islamic and non-Islamic religions without caring about non-Islamic faiths, namely Christianity, Catholicism, Confucianism, Hinduism, or Buddhism. Zavilda TV's social experiment also implies a bias in the meaning of tolerance in its videos. This dialog can be seen in the last video clip dialogue:

Vilda: "Sebelumnya boleh nanya nggak, kak? Agamanya apa, ya?." (may I ask you something? What religion do you follow?)

Target: "Aku Nonmuslim" (I'm not Muslim)

Vilda: "Nah gini, kak. Saya mau ngajakin, ini kalau mau sih, tanpa ada paksaan, kalau mau aja sebagai rasa toleransi aja seandainya kakak memang nonmuslim cobain coba pakai hijab. It's okay, nanti dilepas lagi nggakpapa, kak. Gimana? (Okay, so here's what a want to suggest. If you're willing, and there's no pressure at all, I'd like you try wearing hijab. It's okay, you can take it off later. What do you think?)

Target: "Nyoba doang?" (just try it?)

Vilda: "Iya nyoba doang, saya nggak paksa kakaknya yang 24 jam enggak, hanya sebagai rasa toleransi mungkin sesama agama lain gitu" (yes, just try it. I'm not forcing you to wear it 24/7, just a sign of tolerance betweet different religions)

Tolerance is an attitude that is manifested in a willingness to accept various views and opinions (Bahari, 2010). In this sense, tolerance describes the absence of discrimination and coercion against followers of other faiths. Meanwhile, the 6th verse of the Qur'an, Surah Al-Kafirun, also explains how to have an attitude of tolerance, especially as a guideline for Muslims to behave and not to impose their religious attributes on other people.



Sahih International Meaning: For you is your religion, and for me is my religion

Vilda's sudden arrival, asking for the target's time and asking about his religion implies that the construction of the relationship is unequal. This behaviour is because Vilda dresses in sharia and conveys religious messages as if she is someone who has the right to ask about other people's

MEDIAD

25

worship and makes her target not shy away when she is asked to wear the hijab, even when she is given words that tend to label her target. Religion (all actions related to religion) is one of the sensitive personal data related to individual freedom and self-respect (Nasional, 2011).

Eza and Vilda are a married couple who own the Zavilda TV channel, Vilda as the talent and Eza as the editor. Eza has also strengthened Vilda's character by adding the term "ukhty" to the content. Zavilda TV describes itself as someone who understands religion, questions the worship activities of its targets and discusses religion and tolerance. The target in this content seemed to be someone who was far from faith, often dressed openly, and did not even believe in the existence of God, the visualisation of which looked very different between the two. Women of other nationalities (Caucasian) were also targeted by Zavilda TV by adding the words "Nonis" to the title, which further clarified the identity of the target.

Zavilda TV exploits the religiosity of its target audience by asking questions about the continuity of worship. In addition, Zavilda TV also uses women from religions other than Islam. This does not show religious tolerance, but is seen as a form of imposing spiritual attributes on people of different faiths. Below are questions about worship and thumbnail images that illustrate the issue of tolerance.

#### 2. Discourse Practice Analysis

A content analysis will be conducted on Zavilda TV, a prominent YouTube channel specializing in Islamic social experiments, which boasts the highest number of subscribers and views that appear on YouTube searches when compared to similar content on other channel, such as Rohis Online, Jamal Palopo, Prawira Dijaya, Kelas Sarjana, and Aswad Atta. In August, Zavilda TV uploaded eight social experiment content. Of these eight contents, the last upload was with the title "Viral! Dua Cewe S3xy Tatoan Insyaf Karena Takut Mati & Memilih Hijrah!" received the highest number of views, namely 356 thousand views, 1.6 thousand likes, up to 12 thousand comments which also contained messages about death..

The channel further explores the theme of repentance and religious conversion through two additional videos titled 'Cewe S<sub>3</sub>xy Nangis, Renungan Dosa Buka Aurat Bikin Dia Ingin Hijrah' and 'Tutupin Aurat Artis S<sub>3</sub>xy Adeknya Celine Evangelista, Seketika Nangis Ingin Hijrah'. To increase viewership, the channel employs sensationalized titles and relevant hashtags such as #islam, #viral, and #trending. The use of hashtags also influences the number of viewers and insights gained because of the ease of searching (Mustofa, 2019). Some hashtags included are #tranding #islam and #viral, which are most often added to their uploads. Meanwhile, the content entitled "Cewe S<sub>3</sub>xy Bertato Tidak Percaya Adanya Tuhan, Menangis Ingin Insyaf!" uploaded on August 22, 2022, with 520 likes and 70,160 views, did not add any hashtags, so the number of likes and views obtained was not as high as content with hashtags.

The production of the discourse on religious symbols by inserting phrases and songs with Islamic overtones into the content was done by Eza as the editor. The choice of terms and phrases added to the content were all decisions made by Eza, who also played a role in creating the concept, negotiating with targets, tapping and the video uploading process (Wawan, 2022).

The Zavilda TV social experiment does not use hidden cameras like other social experiments. However, the target was openly recorded and had previously received a briefing, as stated by Vilda in her clarification "Kita udah ada izin upload, kita briefing, masih kita izin dulu mau buat konten, enggak?" (VR, 2022).

Zavilda TV's content is indeed inseparable from the audience's response. Many comments from netizens filled in the comments column, and even the last video reached 12 thousand comments, both pros and con. One of the contents became public discussion because the

understanding of tolerance was considered wrong. There were additional clickbait articles such as "Gimana reaksi cewe sexy nonis mirip bulan sutena saat ditawarin coba pakai hijab!" ("How does a sexy non-nis girl who looks like Bulan Sutena react when she is offered to try wearing a hijab!")



Figure 4. Zavilda TV Social Experiment Footage (2045 TV, 2022)

Unfortunately, this video is no longer available on the Zavilda TV channel. However, it has been re-uploaded by the YouTube channel or discussed in other media. Of all the videos, Zavilda TV viewers have given mixed reactions. Whether for or against the shows in it, the reactions come in different forms, one of which is through comments. However, the majority of comments highlighted the way Vilda asked her targets to wear the hijab, such as the comment from the account of bigoreseller wa1: "BUKAN BEGINI CARANYA DONG... masih banyak cara menyampaikan dengan baik tanpa harus melukai perasaan seseorang... pentingnya rasa menghargai dan menghormati seseorang... pentingnya berakhlak dan berakal".

#### 3. Sociocultural Analysis

Iournal of Media and Religion Studies

This dimension looks at how factors outside of Zavilda TV's YouTube account influence the discourse of the content being analysed, in terms of the form of religious commodification included in the content. Eza created religious symbols by inserting phrases with Islamic overtones as a response from the target and to emphasise the purpose of her social experiment. The sacred symbols inserted were based on the current state of the target, such as being confused, refusing or agreeing to wear the hijab. Songs with Islamic overtones are also included when the target is seen to be sad, crying or seemingly repentant. At such times it also helps Vilda to reflect on death. Contemplating death is certainly not lost on Zavilda TV, which commodifies it as reinforcement when it asks its targets to wear the hijab.

The life story of her target, which lies behind the decision not to wear the hijab and to dress openly, further supports the discourse in the form of questions about religious activities that are openly communicated. Dark personal life stories, her story of the loss of parental love that caused the target to lose faith in God, are explored more deeply by Vilda as support and appeal for the content of her social experiments. The dialogue between the two further reinforces the situation they wish to portray in their content.

Eza is a graduate of Mataram Tourism College, majoring in hospitality. This institution certainly influences the way Eza treats his targets. The discourse in the form of phrases with Islamic overtones that he inserted as a distraction to Zavilda TV's social experiment is also inseparable from his experience as a content creator who was a member of the Lombok influencer community.

Vilda's Instagram highlights @vilda\_emon shows screenshots from her personal WhatsApp social media home page, showing some of her WhatsApp groups. Vilda has also joined the Lombok Youth/I Da'wah group, Majlis Ta'lim Akhwat MPR, Mahabbatul Iman and the Story of the Prophet and the Companions. Of course, this also influences Vilda's way of conveying religious messages and her reflections on death. Indirectly, the institution that once housed Vilda has influenced the use of terms and the way religion is presented to its audiences.

27

Zavilda TV's social experiment content was created in Malioboro Yogyakarta, which is one of the urban areas in Indonesia and is visited by many residents from other areas either to study or travel (Sektiadi, 2021). Zavilda TV's targets are immigrants from different regions, such as the capital city of Jakarta, where urban life is free due to secondary supervision (control). Control in urban communities tends to ignore the personal behavior of each other, social control is non-personal (only applies to things that are not detrimental to the public), and control in urban society does not care about personal behavior such as religion (Novita, 2022).

It is unsurprising to find many people with diverse cultures from other regions, including those targeted by Zavilda TV, who are not native people from Yogyakarta. The clothes worn and the habits of the Zavilda targets differ from those of the people of Yogyakarta, who adhere to Javanese ethics and show more spirituality than materiality (Novita, 2022).

However, the secularisation of people in the capital is inversely proportional to the system of Indonesian society, which considers religion as a higher norm than the norms of everyday social life in general (Mulyadi, 2016). Thus, people use religion as a source of values that can regulate behavioural patterns, such as the content of Zavilda TV's Islamic Social Experiment, which includes religious symbols in its content. They also use religion as a source of values for their target behaviours. Religion also has a social control and transformative function, and religion can transform the personality of an individual or group into a new life through the teachings of their religion.

According to the 2022 Tolerance Year Notes survey, it was found that 72.6% of respondents considered that Indonesian society still upholds the value of tolerance. However, religious patience and political tolerance risk eroding national cohesion; almost half of the respondents, namely 47.6%, think religious tolerance needs to be increased further (Kontributor, 2022).

Indonesia is a pluralistic country with various beliefs such as Hinduism, Buddhism, Confucianism, Christianity, Catholicism, and Islam, with the most significant religious population being Muslims, reaching 229 million, equivalent to 13% of the Muslim population in the world (Itsram, 2021). Tolerance, considered good, and Islam as the majority religion indirectly influence the content creators of Zavilda TV to create social experiments with women of other faiths and offer the hijab.

### B. The Commodification of Audience

The commodification of audiences is the attempt to turn a media's audience into a commodity to be sold to advertisers in order to generate profits for content producers. Social media audiences are different because the characteristics of each social media platform are different. YouTube's social media audiences are called viewers for viewers and subscribers for followers.

Zavilda TV attracts viewers and subscribers through Islamic social experiment content they create and sell to advertisers through the Youtube Partner Program. They will get ads and profits from these ads when they reach 10,000 views (Helianthusonfri, 2018:135). So, in commodifying this audience, there is a "Symbiosis of Mutualism" or mutually beneficial collaboration between content creators and advertisers.



Lazada Indonesia Shopee 12.12 Birt. DOWNLOAD Tantan - Berteman... an · 4.6 \* GRATIS CEWEK PEMABUK BERTATO, PEROKOK VIRAL ! DUA CEWE S3XY TATOAN HAMPIR ADU JOTOS PREMAN DAN **DEPRESI LANGSUNG INSYAF!!** INSYAF KARENA TAKUT MATI & MEMIL.. PEMUDA INI - MEMBELA UKHTI BERCA. 364 rb v ditont n - 5 blo ls 9 E+ A  $\nabla$ E+ 57 0 nº. E+ à 1.6 rb Tidak suka Bagikan Dow Tidak suka Bagikan 10 rb Tidak suka 670 Remix Remix Banikar Zavilda TV Zavilda TV Zavilda TV SUBSCRIBE . SUBSCRIBE SUBSCRIBE

Figures 4. Ads on Zavilda TV YouTube content (Zavilda TV, 2022h, 2022e, 2022b)

The image above is an advertisement that appears in Zavilda TV content. Not just one ad, but up to two ads simultaneously in one content, and all the ads cannot be skipped (skipped). From these advertisements, Zavilda TV benefits; the more viewers who see the advertisements, the more profits they get (Pusat Bantuan Google, no date). Zavilda TV uses its audience to attract advertisers, so commodification occurs in this case.

The content of the audience also plays a role in controlling the content of the content, especially when the content is no longer in line with the norms or habits of the society, such as the number of subscribers of the Zavilda TV YouTube channel, which previously had 212,000 subscribers, dropped to 211,000 after the content went viral and received negative comments from netizens because of the perceived forcing of women to wear the hijab and intolerance towards women who are not Muslim. This case shows that the audience also plays a role in controlling the content. If the audience (viewers and subscribers) on the YouTube account decreases, the advertisements that the content creator receives will also decrease due to fewer views. (AdSense, no date).

Figure 5. Zavilda TV's Subscribers Before Receiving Negative Comments (Zavilda TV, 2022i)



Source: Zavilda TV Youtube Channel

Figure 6. Zavilda TV's Subscribers After Receiving Negative Comments (TV, 2023)



The two pictures were taken at different times. The first picture was taken on December 23, 2022, while the second was taken on January 31, 2023. You can see the difference in the number of subscribers from Zavilda TV's YouTube channel after they went viral, received negative comments, and switched to another YouTube channel.

### C. The Commodification of Labor

The commodification of labour does not only see workers as a team. Workers are also assets that can be used to drive and increase profits for content creators. Workers are not only a team that drives content production, but also a driving force for distribution. There are two processes in the commodification of labour (Haryono, 2020). First, the commodification of labour through the use of existing communication systems and technologies to increase the mastery of workers and commodify all processes performed by workers. Second, from an economic-political perspective, it explains the process of commodification, that is, when workers commodify something, they are simultaneously commodified.

This commodification also occurs in Zavilda TV. Vilda, who owns the YouTube channel Zavilda TV, is not only a content creator or designer. He is also a talent and a presenter who appears in the video. Vilda not only commodifies religion in her content, but in fact becomes a commodity and determines the course of the Islamic social experiment that is being carried out.

Vincent Mosco mentioned the commodification of labor. Vincent Mosco highlights the commodification of labor, characterized by exploitation and the intensification of work processes, demanding workers to possess multitasking abilities (Mosco, 2009). This is evident in the case of Vilda and Eza, who juggle multiple roles within their content creation process. They expressed this multiple roles in a clarification on the IWS Project's YouTube channel entitled "Eksklusif Klarifikasi Zavilda TV Paksa Orang Tak Dikenal Pakai Hijab?! HTI anti-Pancasila?" at 30:05 minutes Eza said "Disini saya akui saya sebagai videografer juga iya, saya jadi editor juga iya, pembuat thumbnail juga ya saya" (in addition to my other responsibilities, I also function as the videographer, editor, and thumbnail creator) (Wawan, 2022).

# Conclusion

Zavilda TV's social experiment shows three primary forms of commodification: audience, labour and content. First, the audience is commodified as a 'product' to be sold to advertisers. Viewers' active participation in Zavilda TV's content, such as commenting and sharing, increases engagement, which directly benefits advertisers. This highlights how the digital media industry treats viewers as data points to be monetised. Second, labour is commodified through the multitasking nature of the work. The requirement for individuals to simultaneously be videographers, editors and thumbnail creators illustrates the digital media industry's demand for multi-skilled workers in order to maximise profits. Third, content is commodified through the exploitation of religious symbols, particularly the Islamic phrase "kalimah tayyibah". Religious symbols are used not just as ornaments, but as tools to attract and engage audiences. The content is strategically designed to evoke emotional responses and increase engagement, often simplifying complex religious doctrines for commercial purposes.

The content also commodifies discussions of death and religious practices, often presenting them in ways that discriminate against certain groups. These commodification strategies are evident in every aspect of the content, from dialogue and titles to thumbnails and descriptions. The use of hashtags such as #viral and #trending is aimed at maximising viewership and engagement. In conclusion, Zavilda TV commercialises religion, turning it into a marketable commodity. Viewers are treated as consumers and religious symbols are exploited for commercial gain. This practice is consistent with the concept of 'abuse of faith', where religious beliefs are manipulated for personal gain, often at the expense of the core values of the religion.



#### References

- Admin. (2022). Destructive mindset: Pola pikir biner. LPM Motivasi. Available at: https://lpmmotivasi.com/destructive-mindset-pola-pikir-biner/ (Accessed: 12 April 2023)
- AdSense, B.G. (n.d.). Memecahkan masalah penurunan penghasilan. *Support Google*. Available at: https://support.google.com/adsense/checklist/9822920?hl=id (Accessed: 31 January 2023)
- Bahari, H. (2010). Toleransi beragama mahasiswa. Jakarta: Badan Litbang dan Diklat Kementerian Agama.
- Farhan, F.I. (2019). Komodifikasi agama dan simbol keagamaan "Jilbab" di media online dalam persepsi netizen. At-Tahdzib: Jurnal Studi Islam dan Muamalah, 7(1), 51–69.
- Fealy, G. (2008). Consuming Islam: Commodification religion and aspirational pietism in contemporary Indonesia. *Expressing Islam: Religious Life, and Politics in Indonesia*, 15.
- Fiorentina, D. (2022). Komodifikasi agama dalam konten YouTube "Ukhti Mega Official." Suarga: Studi Keberagaman dan Keberagamaan, 1(1), 35–44.
- Firasikha, L.A.N. (2019). Komodifikasi agama Islam dalam Instagram aishadeerm. Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta.
- Habibi, A. (2021). Tinjauan hukum Islam terhadap kerjasama dalam sistem monetisasi YouTube. Institut Agama Islam Negeri Ponorogo.
- Haryatmoko. (2019). Critical discourse analysis (Analisis Wacana Kritis): Landasan teori, metodologi, dan penerapan. Depok: PT Rajagrafindo Persada.
- Haryono, C.G. (2020). Kajian ekonomi politik media: Komodifikasi pekerja dan fetisisme komoditas dalam industri media. Sukabumi: CV Jejak Publisher.
- Helianthusonfri, J. (2018). Yuk jadi Youtuber. Jakarta: PT Alex Media Komputindo.
- Indrawan, J., Efriza, Ilmar, A. (2020). Kehadiran media baru (new media) dalam proses komunikasi politik. *Medium, 8*(1), 1–17.
- Irawati, R. P. (2014). Penggunaan istilah berbahasa Arab pada komunitas pergerakan Islam di kota Semarang: Tinjauan sosiopragmatik. *Al-Ta'rib*, 2(1), 20–21.
- Itsram. (2021). Toleransi beragama di Indonesia: Bagaikan gajah di pelupuk mata. ITS Online. Available at: https://www.its.ac.id/news/2021/09/25/toleransi-beragama-indonesia-bagaikangajah-di-pelupuk-mata/ (Accessed: 12 April 2023)
- Junaid, J. Bin. (2018). Ingkar sunnah dalam sorotan Imam Syafi'i. Al-Din: Jurnal Dakwah dan Sosial Keagamaan, 4(1), 1–12.
- Kitiarsa, P. (2008). Religious commodification in Asia: Marketing Gods. London: Routledge.
- Kontributor. (2022). Catatan tahun toleransi. *Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia*. Available at: https://kemenag.go.id/opini/catatan-tahun-toleransi-2022-0skqy7 (Accessed: 12 April 2023)
- Maesyaroh, E. 'Uyuni. (2021). Makna Al-Ḥamd dan Al-Syukr dalam Tafsir. Al-Fanar: Jurnal Ilmu Al-Qur'an dan Tafsir, 4(1), 63–88.
- Meltwater, W.A.S. (2023). Indonesia digital 2023: The essential guide to the latest connected behaviours. Available at: https://wearesocial.com/wp-content/uploads/2023/03/Digital-2023-Indonesia.pdf.
- Mosco, V. (2009). The political economy of communication. London: SAGE Publications Inc.

- Nasional, B. P. H. (2011). Naskah akademik RUU perlindungan data pribadi. *bphn.go.id*, 1–199. Available at: https://bphn.go.id/data/documents/na\_perlindungan\_data\_pribadi.pdf
- Novita, D. (2022). Perilaku beragama pada masyarakat urban di kota Makassar. OSF Freprint, 1–9. Available at: https://osf.io/k4drs/
- Nugraha, C. S., Muam, A. (2021). Pengantar Penerjemahan. Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press.
- Pusat Bantuan Google, B.Y. (n.d.). Memahami Analisis Pendapatan Iklan. Support Google. Available at: https://support.google.com/youtube/answer/9314357?hl=id (Accessed: 31 January 2023)
- Rakhmatulloh. (2019). Tokoh Muhammadiyah: Istilah non Islam dan kafir sama, tinggal kita pilih mana. *Sindonews.com*. Available at: https://nasional.sindonews.com/tokoh-muhammadiyah-istilah-non-islam-dan-kafir-sama-tinggal-kita-pilih-mana
- Rizqa Ahmadi, Lilik Rofiqoh, W.H. (2022). BRANDS ON PIETY? Islamic commodification of polygamous community in Indonesia. Journal of Indonesian Islam, 16(1), 153–174.
- Sadya, S. (2023). Daftar negara pengguna Youtube terbesar awal 2023, Ada Indonesia. *dataindonesia.id.* Available at: https://dataindonesia.id/internet/detail/daftar-negarapengguna-youtube-terbesar-awal-2023-ada-indonesia (Accessed: 10 July 2023)
- Saiful Hakam, Cahyo Pamungkas, E. B. (2017). Ringkasan hasil penelitian komodifikasi agama agama di Korea Selatan. Jurnal Kajian Wilayah, 7(2), 161.
- Santi, S. (2004). Perempuan dalam iklan: Otonomi atas tubuh atau komoditi? Jurnal Komunikologi, 1(1 March), 20–31.
- Saputra, A. (2019). Survei penggunaan media sosial di kalangan mahasiswa kota Padang menggunakan teori uses and gratifications. *Baca: Jurnal Dokumentasi Dan Informasi,* 40(2), 207.
- Sektiadi. (2021). Yogyakarta: Geografi, budaya, dan perubahan sosial. *Blog UGM*. Available at: https://sektiadi.staff.ugm.ac.id/2021/02/yogyakarta-geografi-budaya-dan-perubahan-sosial
- Setiadi, A. (2020). Pemanfaatan Medsos Untuk Efektifitas Komunikasi. Jurnal AMIK BSI Karawang, 12(15), 25–30.
- TV, 2045. (2022). Norak!! Zavilda TV maksa pake jilbab demi dapet duit!? Available at: http://youtu.be/LGmkdIPqWqY?si=OCj-jEDa5h7p3ot7.
- TV, Zavilda. (2022a). Aksi cewe nonis hant4m preman toleransinya bikin nangis. Available at: https://youtu.be/zToIKhSAPJ4?si=HAofwkQjHu54iTx.
- TV, Zavilda. (2022b). Cewe pemabuk bertato perokok depresi langsung insyaf!!! Available at: https://youtu.be/DpwUIhNsEVc?si=8WO89hdnkjcklynq.
- TV, Zavilda. (2022c). Cewe s3xy malu pakai hijab seketika dikasih renungan ingin hijrah malah nangis. *@Zavilda*TV. Available at: https://youtu.be/cp7gePklwAo/si=HoXsxCdhuy1kTYb.
- TV, Zavilda. (2022d). Cewe s3xy nangis, renungan dosa buka aurat bikin dia ingin hijrah. Available at: https://youtu.be/9EfqXsT\_fK8?si=AoSNFOkTggBuiL41.
- TV, Zavida. (2022). Cewe sexi nonis nangis dipakaian hijab! Aku ikut pindah karena bapakku. Available at: https://youtu.be/VGiTN3XtvvM?si=WUJD0R52s4\_-qcW\_.
- TV, Zavilda. (2022e). Hampir adu jotos remaja masa kini jaga toleransi malah dihina. Available at: https://youtu.be/2pfT5lB950E?si=zWq-VDb5mEkJ\_eK6.



- Vebrianto, V. (2022). Komodifikasi agama Islam dalam industri media digital: Studi kasus tokoh media. Jurnal Komunikasi Universitas Islam Negeri Jakarta, 3(2), 12–21.
- Wibowo, S. (2023). Toleransi beragama di Indonesia dalam perspektif kebudayaan. Analisis Kritis: Jurnal Ilmu Sosial dan Humaniora, 12(2), 120–130.
- Zahruddin, M. (2020). Toleransi beragama di Indonesia: Perspektif ajaran Islam. Al-Falah, 1(2), 80– 92.

### Araştırmacıların Katkı Oranı Beyanı/ Contribution of Authors

Yazarların çalışmadaki katkı oranları yazar sırasına göre %50, %35 ve %15 şeklindedir. The contributions of the authors to the study are as follows: 50%, 35%, and 15%, in order of authorship.

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

#### Çıkar Çatışması Beyanı / Conflict of Interest

Çalışma kapsamında herhangi bir kurum veya kişi ile çıkar çatışması bulunmamaktadır. There is no conflict of interest with any institution or person within the scope of the study.

#### İntihal Politikası Beyanı / Plagiarism Policy

Bu makale intihal.net yazılımıyla taranmıştır. İlgili dergi kurallarına uygundur. This article has been scanned using the intihal.net software and adheres to the relevant journal's guidelines.

### \*\*\*\*\*\*\*

**Bilimsel Araştırma ve Yayın Etiği Beyanı / Scientific Research and Publication Ethics Statement** Bu çalışmada "Yükseköğretim Kurumları Bilimsel Araştırma ve Yayın Etiği Yönergesi"

kapsamında uyulması belirtilen kurallara uyulmuştur.

This study adheres to the rules specified under the "Higher Education Institutions Scientific Research and Publication Ethics Directive."