
The Eurasia Proceedings of Educational & Social Sciences (EPESS), 2017

Volume 7, Pages 235-240

ICRES 2017: International Conference on Research in Education and Science

**OBSERVATIONS OF INDUSTRY SUPERVISION OF VET AND
UNIVERSITY STUDENT PRACTICUMS IN FITNESS, EXERCISE
SCIENCE AND SPORT SCIENCE: PRACTICAL
RECOMMENDATIONS RELEVANT TO THOSE PROVIDING
STUDENT MENTORSHIP**

Ian Timothy Heazlewood
The University of Sydney

Tom Walsh
Charles Darwin University

Joe Walsh
The University of Sydney, Fitness Clinic Five Dock

Daniella Kai Gu
Fitness Clinic Five Dock

Mike Climtein
The University of Sydney

Abstract: More than 30 of the 43 universities in Australia offer an exercise science and/or sport science programs. In the Vocational Education and Training (VET) sector, more than 160 Registered Training Organisations offer Australian Government approved fitness training courses. The paper is a self-reflective exercise based upon mentoring placement students from multiple registered course providers from the VET sector fitness strand. Combined with reflection on general population hours for placement students from six Sydney city and one regional New South Wales based universities this represented evaluation of more than 200 students and more than 20,000 placement supervision hours. This observation was based upon student placements conducted over the previous seven years, though a significant proportion of the students surveilled were from the previous 36 months. A number of recommendations were developed that may be relevant not just for health, fitness and exercise and sport science courses, but also may be relevant to industry mentorship across a range of fields.

Keywords: Student supervision, practical placement, vocational education and training, workplace learning

Introduction

The paper is based upon the researchers' experiences and critical self-reflections in conducting workplace learning practicums. This draws upon experience gained mentoring industry placement/work experience students in fitness courses, including exercise and sports science courses over a number of years. Such students included those from Vocational Education and Training (VET) based courses, as well as those from the university sector. It is hoped that evaluation of the discussion experience gained from providing such a service, together with a combination of practical recommendations for supervisors considering offering such a service or continuing to do so, may be of interest to the mentors both within the fields of health and fitness, as well as to practitioners in other disciplines that can relate to similar practical issues. As well as approaching topics relevant to multiple disciplines engaging in mentoring across education and science, this report also includes specific comments to VET and university sector education providers. These comments may be of broader interest other

- This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial 4.0 Unported License, permitting all non-commercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

- Selection and peer-review under responsibility of the Organizing Committee of the conference

*Corresponding author: Ian Timothy Heazlewood- Email: Ian.Heazlewood@cdu.edu.au

international organizations and associations offering mentoring services in terms of their position in relation to such education providers and the perception as well as recognition of the service that they offer.

Different universities require a varying number of placement hours from their students, which are typically split hours across multiple placement facilities. The hours required in a placement program at a particular facility may range from 60 hours to more than 150 hours. There are also guidelines for practical placement hours in order to meet professional body accreditation, outside of the university sector. For VET sector courses, this is also highly variable and can range from 30 hours to in excess of 100 hours per course. Often students might be enrolled in a number of courses and assigned only one block of hours (e.g. certificates III and IV in Fitness requiring 100 hours total).

Similar to the VET sector, Universities have financial considerations and running a placement unit is a cost-effective way of teaching, with students still paying course fees, but only requiring a practicum coordinator, usually on a part-time basis, or shared between courses/given multiple responsibilities outside of directing placements and possibly with limited qualifications in Exercise and Sports Science. These costs are saved as paying clinical professionals conducting the placements is generally more economical and general population supervision by mentors is often gratis. Health Workforce Australia reported an average of clinical hours (not including general population hours) of 368 per exercise physiology student (Health Workforce Division, Department of Health, 2014) in 2013 and that the demand for provision of supervision hours was growing (Health Workforce Division, Department of Health, 2014). Often the large quantity of practical hours are in fact also used as a selling point by the university. For example, one course advertised that it included 500 hours of supervised clinical practicum placement (reference not supplied to allow some level of anonymity).

Some universities have a reduced focus on practical instruction of exercise techniques in their sport/exercise science courses. This may be for a number of reasons, such as the focus is elsewhere (e.g. multiple theoretical biomechanics, marketing or sports management units), accreditation requirements for professional exercise physiology organisations may require a certain number of units in a certain field requiring removal of other units and practical exercise technique units may be the casualty (they may just seek to meet the minimal requirements for practical exercise instruction outside of placement units as dictated by the accreditation process), or changing a degree structure to include more profitable common, generic skills units may also result in such a reduction in practical exercise instruction units.

More than 30 of the 43 universities in Australia offer an exercise science and/or sport science programs, whilst the majority of these courses are accredited under a professional association, 26 universities have sort additional accreditation via a privately owned professional body. In the VET sector, more than 160 Registered Training Organisations (RTO) offer Australian Government approved fitness training courses. As well as supervision of VET students for RTOs, industry professionals may find themselves supervising university students as part of their “apparently healthy” practicum hours. There are numerous conditions for qualification as a supervisor such as degree, or postgraduate university qualifications, being a state sport coach or holding a Certificate IV in Fitness with a minimum of 10 years of industry experience also holding a strength and conditioning qualification from a privately owned organisation is specifically mentioned as one of the appropriate criteria for supervision of apparently healthy population practicum hours for many of these university courses. Research has demonstrated that practicum placements help engineer a smooth transition to effective professional practice (Billett, 2009).

Method

This self-reflective, descriptive exercise concerning mentoring industry placement students was based upon observations relevant to VET course students (Certificate III, Certificate IV and Diploma in Fitness), as well as university students completing their general population placement hours. Observations on students placed for specialist population/clinical hours was excluded from this report, as it was deemed that whilst some health and fitness professionals might be recognised as appropriate to supervise such hours, this would not universally be the case. Additionally, it was believed that observations on general population hours practicum students was of more direct relevance, thus of more interest to the exercise, health and fitness profession as a whole, than specialist/clinical population hours. Similarly for VET sector student supervision, hours of supervision for VET courses outside the three fitness courses mentioned above were excluded (e.g. Diploma of Massage, Diploma of Sports Coaching, Certificates in Allied Health Assistance or other VET courses).

To further inform the views and cogent outcomes of this report, observations were compiled from a team of authors, representing views of those with extensive experience teaching courses in VET and/or university sectors relevant to exercise, health and fitness, supported by those with minimal to no such experience. Observation was

also made by university staff not involved in supervising practicum students. Such a selection was made in order to develop a more rounded view.

Results

Reflection was based upon placement students from multiple registered course providers from the VET sector fitness strand. Combined with reflection on general population hours placement students from six Sydney and one regional NSW based universities this represented evaluation of more than 200 students and more than 20,000 placement supervision hours. This observation was based upon student placements conducted over the previous seven years, though a significant proportion of the students surveilled were from the previous 36 months.

The evaluation of the experience of mentoring brought attention to a number of concerns. The delivery of an educational and supportive environment to assist with the appropriate development of such students was viewed to be exceedingly time consuming.

Key findings relevant to practicum students from the university sector

1. There was a high variability between students in terms of desire to learn and interest in practical exercise instruction principles, knowledge, experience of working in a commercial environment (with many never having held a job of any kind before), co-cooperativeness, and work ethic. The high variability between students, echoed in the different courses at different universities, was reported to make planning harder, due to reduced ability to predict student capabilities.
2. Many students seemed to believe that the facility was being paid for hours of practical experience provided, however there were in fact in a purely voluntary capacity. Students were thus not as aware of the good faith put in to providing practicum supervision.
3. It was a general consensus that most universities for which a placement environment was provided, did not recognise the time and workload required by placement facility staff.
4. Some universities assigned placement students a mark based upon a report at the end of a student's industry placement. This may have helped to promote more attentive behaviour patterns for some students if they were aware of an assessment based upon performance. Unfortunately, cases were identified where students demonstrated little interest in developing practical skills, focusing entirely upon what mark they might receive and how they might attain those marks, as opposed to developing a level of generic work skills that were sorely lacked, together with specific practical experience of the general principles of exercise and sport science.
5. Some students were dramatically underprepared on presentation to the facility and had minimal knowledge of basic concepts such as exercise instruction and program design. It was necessary to teach them such fundamental skills.
6. In some cases students presented with minimal or incorrect knowledge of the basic principles of exercise science such as exercise instruction and programming, however believing they possessed a high degree of knowledge in this area. The re-education required was in some cases a tedious task.
7. It was found that for supervising coaches without extensive prior experience of working with interns, teaching at the relevant level, or being aware of the relevant course and the associated level of knowledge and expertise of the students, at times found it particularly burdensome to supervise students. Sometimes this could be extremely stressful and these coaches in particular expressed preference for stopping the provision of this free service.
8. For those universities with shorter placement allocations it could be difficult to gain any benefits for the placement facility as 60 hours was often not adequate to train a practicum student with adequate skills and abilities that in return they could make a contribution to the facility hosting the student. On the contrary however 150 hours is a significant investment of time and if the student was not passionate about learning and developing, then this could be frustrating.
9. Mentoring university placement students can be an exceedingly rewarding experience. Whilst some students might have no interest in their practicum placements for the purpose of developing vital industry skills and knowledge, for those that were interested and passionate about exercise/sport science, the positive emotional reward of assisting and helping develop such a future coach on their path mitigated all negative factors associated with placement supervision.

Differences Reported for the Scenario of Practicum Students from the VET Sector (fitness courses only)

1. As per the university sector, providing practicum placements for students from the VET sector could be a highly rewarding experience, with some VET sector students keeping in touch after graduating through their own businesses or joining the health, exercise and sport science team in some capacity.
2. In general, it was observed that VET sector students had more interest in the practical skills required for the health and fitness industry. For some this was attributed to the students having completed exercise training activities themselves, prior to study, though often it was also because they wished to work in the fitness industry as a career choice, so they were enthusiastic and passionate to learn.
3. Many VET sector students lacked knowledge in certain areas compared to university students, though university students were more variable in their knowledge base. As a generalization, it was observed that the knowledge of basic exercises, basic program design and ability to interact with clients was much higher in VET sector than university practicum students. University students on average however had far higher knowledge in areas such as anatomy, psychology, motor learning, biomechanics and physiology.
4. Some of the best performing practicum students were in fact those who had previously studied VET courses, had work experience in the industry and were now completing their practicum hours as part of their university course. This re-iterates the value of such an articulation into the university system.
5. A number of strength training coaches who had worked with large RTOs found that they could coerce involvement with larger franchises over boutique gyms. The claim was made that placement hours could turn into a recruitment process, rather than an opportunity to learn principles and develop skills without an alternative agenda.
6. Another observation was that some RTOs were undergoing a similar issue to the lack of practical exercise instruction skills being taught at some universities. Some RTOs appeared to be very concerned with current fads such as one example of dropping Olympic lifting from the syllabus, in order to create time to discuss a circuit training exercise trend called Crossfit. Rather than teaching basic principles which would assist students to evaluate the next fad for themselves they were more concerned about what was considered the current fad.
7. It was reported that in some large RTOs if they were partnered with another company they would suppress mention of competitors and even exclude coaches from participating in their courses. An attitude that would perhaps not be replicated in the university system.
8. Many RTOs had more focus on (more units/teaching time allocated) working with special populations than performance, with multiple modules on special populations and group exercise vastly outweighing athletic focused programming and exercise instruction.
9. Placement students had reported to supervisors that much of what they had learnt in their courses appeared to not be relevant in a practical environment. One interesting comment was "I would have preferred more emphasis on things like periodisation which you actually need to be proficient in rather than topics such as the correct way to hand someone a water bottle and towel".

Discussion

From the involvement of the practicum supervisor in the workplace there appears to be variations in the knowledge and skills in students from different universities and courses. One limitation of this from the field report is that it is based upon observations from Sydney, Australia and findings may not be wholly extrapolated to other states or rural settings even within Australia. It is hoped that observations and suggestions may be of interest to those health and exercise practitioners considering or currently taking industry placement students in order to provide information that might allow better informed decisions in their own practices. It may also be of interest to those providing mentorship in other fields in research and education. Some of the basic principles discussed may be able to be translated into other settings and perhaps the findings from the many thousands of supervised hours discussed in this report may assist those conducting mentorship in other areas. Most importantly, it should be remembered that the negative and positive issues raised above apply to some, but certainly not all practicum students.

Though it was observed that the attitude of the placement student was a more important factor than their knowledge on commencement, it might be suggested that education providers in the university sector, should be aware of quality control issues, enforcing a minimal level of skills and abilities prior to being able to initiate placement. It should be noted however that with the significant emphasis on practical exercise instruction skills in the workplace and competency based approach to assessment in VET fitness courses, differences in practical competency performance would be expected as were observed.

Whilst it is observed that the universities have differing course structures, they have become more homogenous in recent years primarily due to private organization driven professional body accreditation requirements. Whilst

it does make it more challenging at times to deal with students at very different levels of knowledge, having a variety of students can at times be helpful and make practicum more interesting. In terms of homogenising the content of courses (such as for accreditation requirements), whilst it might make practicum supervision easier, it is viewed as a negative outcome in terms of prescriptiveness (McAllister & Nagarajan, 2015) and collective student knowledge and is not a recommendation of this report.

Those (rare) university practicum students believing that they are experts in the field, but often demonstrating incorrect knowledge, might be attributed to a number of factors. One concern is that this may be related to less experienced or sessional (part time) staff in exercise instruction related units losing some consistency across the degree. It is also a concern that due to strict guidelines to attain professional accreditations in the field of exercise physiology, at least one of the Sydney based universities significantly reduced its number of practical exercise based units. These courses have also been known to suffer in order to accommodate generic skills based common units that can be run across multiple different subject fields for economical purposes.

Conclusion

Whilst a series of concerns have been raised about practicum students, the reward is great when the right student is supervised properly. It was a general consensus that VET students were preferred over university placement students. Though there was great variation between students, there was also great variability between different universities. It was generally believe that universities and some of their students, were under appreciative of the service provided. It should be considered whether this would change if a financial contribution for general population placement supervision was required as per specialist clinical hours. The recommendations below may well prove relevant not just for health, fitness and exercise and sport science courses, but also may be relevant to industry mentorship across a range of fields.

Recommendations

1. A supervisor can expect practicum students to present with very different knowledge levels, experience and passion.
2. Many students are underprepared for practical work in the industry and the work done to prepare them can be underappreciated
3. The time costs and work needed to adequately provide a placement environment imply it may be appropriate to request funding, particularly from the university sector, for mentoring students on general population practical placement, as per clinical population students.
4. It should be considered that even experienced staff, should they not be experienced at teaching or supervision may find this activity particularly time consuming and demanding. Thus mentorship or assistance may be required.
5. It would be prudent to accept practical students in a trial capacity, particularly for those requiring more than 100hours of practicum, this could be combined by filtering, such as interviewing potential candidates.
6. Feedback for the university would be to indicate to students where placements are provided on a voluntary basis and this might increase awareness students.
7. For university students complementing an exercise/sport science degree with some VET study, or seeking a mentor may be indicated on/prior to graduation for increased preparedness prior to working in this sector.

Acknowledgements

This manuscript was based on a provisional report presented at the International Conference on Research in Education and Science (ICRES) Ephesus-Kusadasi, Turkey, May 2017

References

- Billett, S. (2009). Realising the educational worth of integrating work experiences in higher education. *Studies in Higher Education*, 34(7), 827-843. <http://srhe.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/03075070802706561>
- Health Workforce Division, Department of Health. (2014). Health Workforce Australia: Clinical Training 2013. Canberra ACT: Health Workforce Australia.

McAllister, L., & Nagarajan, S. (2015). Accreditation requirements in allied health education: Strengths, weaknesses and missed opportunities. *Journal of Teaching and Learning for Graduate Employability*, 6(1), 2-23. <https://ojs.deakin.edu.au/index.php/jtlge/article/view/570>