



Research Article

Doi:[10.5281/zenodo.7496563](https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.7496563)

OPPORTUNITIES AND CHALLENGES OF FEDERALISM IN THE CONTEXT OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT: THE CASE OF SOMALIA¹

1. Asma Aden Abdirahman²

ORCID No 0000-0002-4295-4203

2. Kamala Valiyeva³

ORCID No 0000-0002-7551-8555

Başvuru Tarihi: 14.11.2022

Kabul Tarihi: 09.12.2022

Yayın Tarihi: 30.12.2022

ABSTRACT

This working paper outlines the opportunities and challenges of federalism and community development in Somalia. In 2004 Somali clan elders and politicians considered adopting federalism as the new system of government and by 2012, Somalia adopted federalism and established four states: Jubaland, Galmudug, Hirshabelle, and the Southwest States, in addition to the previously established states Puntland and Somaliland. This paper focuses on how federalism affects community development in Somalia and identifies opportunities and challenges of federalism for community development. Federalism has offered opportunities with significant improvement in security, economic improvement, a better education system, a healthcare system, power distribution, political stability, and women's and youth's empowerment. However, it thus poses challenges which are border conflicts, power disputes, the exploitation of natural resources, and minority injustice. The method used for this research is a survey data analysis.

Keywords: Federalism, Community development, Somalia, Opportunities, Challenges.

TOPLUMSAL KALKINMA BAĞLAMINDA FEDERALİZMİN FIRSAT VE ZORLUKLARI: SOMALİ ÖRNEĞİ

ÖZET

Bu araştırma, Somali'de Federalizmden kaynaklı fırsat ve zorlukların toplumsal kalkınma özelinde incelenmesi hakkında yazılmıştır. 2004'te Somalili klan büyükleri ve politikacılar federalizmi yeni hükümet sistemi olarak benimsemeyi kanaatindeydiler ve 2012'de Somali federalizmi benimseyerek daha önceden kurulmuş olan Puntland ve Somaliland eyaletlerine ek olarak dört eyalet kurdu. Bu eyaletler: Jubaland, Galmudug, Hirshabelle ve Güney Batı Eyaletleriydi. Bu makale, federalizmin Somali'de toplumsal kalkınmayı nasıl etkilediğine odaklanmakta ve federalizmin toplumsal kalkınma açısından meydana getirdiği fırsatları ve zorlukları değerlendirmektedir. Federalizm, ekonominin büyümesi, toplumsal güvenliği, eğitim ve sağlık sisteminin gelişimi, kadınların ve gençlerin toplumsal hayata daha çok katılması, güç dağılımının dengelenmesi ve siyasi istikrarın sağlanması gibi fırsatlar sunmuş olsa da bunların yanı sıra sınır çatışmaları, güç anlaşmazlıkları, doğal kaynakların sömürülmesi ve azınlık adaletsizlikleri gibi zorluklar da doğurmuş olmaktadır. Bu araştırma için kullanılan metodoloji anketlerden sağlanan verilerin analiz edilmesi şeklindedir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Federalizm, Toplumsal Kalkınma, Somali, Fırsatlar, Zorluklar

¹ This article is derived from the thesis work entitled "Opportunities and Challenges of Federalism in the Context of Community Development Concept: the Case of Somalia".

² Asma Aden Abdirahman, İstanbul Ticaret University, asmaaden107@gmail.com

³ Asst. Prof., Kamala Valiyeva, İstanbul Ticaret University, kvaliyeva@ticaret.edu.tr



1. INTRODUCTION

Somalia is a country located in the horn of Africa it has the largest coastline in mainland Africa approximately 3,333 km along the Indian Ocean, Gulf of Aden, and Red sea. Somalia's location turns Somalia into a strategically important trading center in the ancient world. The official language of Somalia is Somali despite being a member of the Arab League. Most Somalis are herders, farmers, and fishermen. With the opening of the Suez Canal in 1869, Somalia's strategic location became even more significantly important for the West because of the country's important location at the intersection of Africa and Asia. The United States and thirteen European countries met in 1884-1885 in Berlin (Berlin Conference) to divide Africa among themselves, and they divided Somalia into three parts, British Somalia, Italian Somalia, and French Somalia. In 1960 both British Somalia and Italian Somalia gained their independence, and united. While French Somalia voted to remain under the rule of the French and later voted to gain its independence in 1977. Adam Abdullahi Osman became the first president of Somalia. Abdul Rashid Ali Sharmarke became his successor on June 10, 1967 (Ingriis, 2017). A military coup led by Mohamed Said Barre overthrew the government a few days later (Payton, 1980). Siyad Barre promoted Somalia's modernization and nationalism and putting clan loyalty aside and promoting the idea of Greater Somalia and Pan-Somalism. In 1988, after 20 years of Siad Barre's harsh dictatorship, rebellion erupted, and armed conflict erupted. On January 26, 1991, these militia groups toppled the Barre administration which will eventually lead the country towards chaos and political instability.

As a result of Barre's removal from office, the country's governmental structure began to collapse. Barre tried to reclaim control after that, but each time he failed (Lyons & Samatar 2010). Somalia established a federal government in 2004, forming a new transitional parliament and electing a new president. Most Somalis and the majority of politicians, including the activists who led the transformation of the Somali Republic into a federal government, have failed to grasp the nature and ramifications of federalism since its proclamation in 2004. Furthermore, Somalis have long been victims of strife and war, yet they continue to enjoy the political and social stability that is essential to everyone's liberty and freedom of speech (Elmi, 2014). Two decades after Somalia formally embraced federalism, there have been notable opportunities and challenges associated with it.

The African Union (AU) soldiers and a United Nations (UN) mission to construct national transitional institutions contributed significantly to Somalia's post-revolutionary civil war. Their presence offered a safe space for Somalis to debate their problems and create their democratic system without fear of violent Islamist groups or tribal strife. In addition, federal administrations provided services to cities, villages, and rural regions, allowing the government to expand across the country (Lotze & Kasumba, 2012). In 2012 By electing president Hassan sheikh Mohamud, Somalia officially adopted federalism. And Hassan Shaikh Mohamud alongside Minister Abdullahi Odawa heading the Ministry of Interior and Federal Affairs. Jubaland, Galmudug, Hirshabelle, and Southwest states were established in addition to the previously established states Puntland and Somaliland which proclaimed their independence. Somalia has officially six states plus the Banadir region, which hosts the country's capital and is under the central government's control.

2. METHODOLOGY

The research focuses on the opportunities and challenges of federalism and community development in Somalia. The method of data collection utilizes both qualitative and quantitative design to help gather information on the subject matter. The research is informed by two primary sources of information including desk research of secondary data from published and unpublished materials, newspaper articles, journals, books, and academic materials. The second sources include a quantitative approach administered through online interviews to help in the data collection. In terms of the interviews, the questionnaires were only available to Somali citizens currently living in Somalia under the current federal setup. A total of 150 questionnaires were shared via online platforms including social media which gained a respondent number



of 109 participants. The data was used together with an existing literature review on the operationalization of federalism and community development in Somalia. The analysis helps us understand the current context of the federal system in Somalia which depicts the merits and demerits of Somalia's embrace of a federal government and how it can deliver sustainable development within Somali communities.

3. LITERATURE REVIEW

3.1 Understanding of federalism in Somalia

According to Haji(1989), tribes and political leaders have long envisioned the federal system as the greatest way to distribute power and wealth, both before and after independence. The independent constitution party, formed in 1948, was one of the early proponents of federalism in Somalia.

According to Abubakar (2016), to fulfill and meet the needs and requirements of various groups and to improve the co-existence among the ethnic groups and other identity groups. He also stated that from this perspective to achieve the required outcome of the society among the federal member states. It is also vital for the democratic survival, encouraging peaceful participation, transition, and intergovernmental federalism. Somalia is one of the world's most ethnically varied societies, and its federalism was implemented to meet the interests of different clans rather than to address the ethnic variety of its people. Except in a few locations where inter-clan violence worsened, the coexistence of various clans in most regions of Somalia remained constant over the two-decade-long conflict (Abubakar, 2016).

Since the proclamation of federalism in Somalia, most Somalis do not have much knowledge about federalism, and the majority of politicians including activists that promote and led federalism failed to grasp its nature and ramification. Somalis have been enjoying political and social stability even though they have been under strife and war for decades, they did have freedom of speech and liberty (Elmi 2014).

Ali (2019) argued that the transition of Somalia from central to federal government was not an easy process but, the federal system was seen as a solution to overcome the political schisms by encouraging and engaging politicians. Political decision-makers in Somalia see that federalism is complementary to the country's tribal situation. Every tribe started to believe that they couldn't trust others and they should handle their affairs without any interference or coercion. Some politicians believe the political will and decision-making authority was transferred from Somalia legislators to regional powers the day Somalia adopted federalism and tribes' distrust grew as a result of that. (Dahir, Ali, and Hersi 2019)

3.2 Community development in Somalia

According to the United Nation (UN), community development is defined as a strategy that actively engages society to foster economic and social success for the community (United Nations 1955).

According to the United Nations Industrial development project, During Somalia's 25-year conflict, critical economic infrastructure has been destroyed or seriously damaged, including government buildings, public facilities, highways, transportation, and communication networks. For income, service supply, and international humanitarian help, urban Somalis rely mostly on an informal economy based on commerce, transportation, utilities, communication, and construction. Limited investments in the productive sectors have resulted from a lack of economic infrastructure that fosters industrial development and supports economic growth. Background information done by the UN stated that Somalia is one of the world's poorest countries, with 73% of the population living on less than USD 2 per day and 43% on less than USD 1 per day. With 76 % under the age of 29, and just 50 % of those above the age of 10 economically active. The country has a massive population of youth bulge and majority of them remain jobless (UNIDO, 2020). Due to problems of inadequate rainfall, Somalia suffered widespread food insecurity in 2017, with drought conditions persisting across the country. In the face of near-total crop failures and diminished rural job options, the country's coping mechanisms are being pushed to breaking point. Infrastructure restrictions,



limited state institutions and capacity, and continuing insecurity are among the country's major concerns. Although, this study according to the World Bank, growth is expected in the next three years where Somalia's economy is projected to grow at a stable nominal annual pace of 5–7%, driven by aggregate demand fueled by a thriving private sector, remittances, and decreased oil prices. The Somali diaspora is still devoted to investing in the country's economic and social development. Due to its favorable geographic location and long coastline, Somalia has the potential to become a regional economic center (UNIDO 2020).

The government of Somalia has made a strong commitment to improving public service delivery by establishing local administrations as part of the peace and restoration process. Local government is widely acknowledged as playing an increasingly strong role in participatory community development. Devolution, according to the World Development Report (2003), is critical to making service delivery work for the poor (Jessop, 2014). Local government, being the closest government to the people, and the growing population of Somalia will necessitate increased spending on education, housing, food, and health must create methods and opportunities to meet people's needs to assist the government in long-term economic growth. If the local government cannot meet all the expectations then it would be difficult for the people to get interested in community development (Ahmed, 2018).

4. CONCEPTS AND DEFINITIONS

4.1. Theoretical Framework of Federalism

Federalism simply refers to the transfer of power and responsibility from the federal government to the state levels. According to Gerken (2017), we should also think of it as the municipal and state levels giving way to a grassroots movement. While some racial and ethnic groupings or progressive dissidents may be in the minority on a national level, at the local and state levels they can build majorities and be in a position to rule as powerful political players (Mariotti, 2019).

Federalism is a type of confederation that tries to achieve the advantages of unity and variety, or at the very least, to find a balance between the two sides. It recognizes their right to self-determination and autonomy through safeguarding diverse community's political rights ideologies that embrace self-rule and shared rule (Watts, 1998 & Ibrahim, 2003).

The federal government is characterized as a confederation of states in which authority is divided between the general government, which is distinct from the government-affiliated state in certain ways, and the associated states, each of which is a separate state (Thomas, et. Al, 1964). There is a distinct national goal that has been embraced by federalism to solve certain specific difficulties in a country in all present federal states across the world. Federalism is also appropriate for nations that place a high priority on principles like liberty and representation or if a serious external danger drives the federating units to join together. In these systems, national parties aim to strengthen relationships between citizens of various federating units, and in combination with an effective judicial system, they operate as a glue keeping the federation together (Kelemen, 2007). Where there are regional distinctions of varied people, languages, and religions, the federal system has always been applied for conflict prevention or post-war situation. In certain post-conflict environments, such as Ethiopia, Bosnia and Herzegovina, South Africa, and the Democratic Republic of Congo, federalism has begun. According to Burgess, Federalism is transforming a unitary political community into a well-organized federation. Carl Friedrich, a leading proponent of this idea, believes that federalism is a dynamic process in which numerous independent political groups collaborate to solve issues, allowing them to become more unified (Burgess, 2006).

Although federalism is specific to each location, it is impossible to generalize about it. There are some components that are present everywhere, though, and they are generally uniform. Federalism seems to be more common among the world's largest states in terms of population and territory. As a result, federalism has been implemented by a few of the bigger states. In the case of Somalia, it is clear that despite the



country's mainly homogenous population, the necessity for federalism results from deep-seated division. (Hussein, 2017). Furthermore, in the subject of authority and state autonomy of power federalism offers a unique opportunity for power distribution by empowering different components of sub-national governments. Palermo and Alber (2015) supported this position acknowledging that a federal state is a constitutional state without a sovereign since all of its powers and authority are divided across several areas and are constrained and beholden to the federation's constitution as well as the constitutions/statutes of its constituent states. There is no space for any fundamental or infinite authority of the state or of the federated states under the concept of competence, which stands for authority. Moreover, the federalism concept of authoritative participation should continue, and power should be distributed among diverse groups of a nation. Most Federalists, on the other hand, devised an assessment that federalism provides as a factual fact in its appreciation for variety as a living reality in its social, economic, cultural, and political situations. Unlike a unitary system, federalism is founded on political reality, such as the presence of many groups' interests as well as people and their variety via legal terminology and acceptable means. The coexistence of several nations in one state is as vital for civilized life as the coexistence of men in the community (Acton, 1907).

4.2. Types of Federalism

There are various forms of federalism.

Dual federalism: The balance of power between the two competent authorities is fundamental to the notion of dual federalism. For a decade, at least a substantial movement in balance has witnessed the balance between state and central government and prevented corruption between state and federal governments. Dual federalism also known as informally Layer Cake or divided sovereignty is a government where authority is divided that is distinguished between state and national authority meaning the state government has its authority and the central government cannot intrude and vice versa. Dual federalism effectively combines the powers of either the federal or state governments. It states that both may exercise equal power and live together in peace. Dual federalism has been used in various regions of the world, including the United States, Australia, Canada, Brazil, and India. When evaluating the scope of the federal government's authority in the United States, it is important to take into consideration the states' reserved powers (Ebegbulem, 2011).

Cooperative federalism: According to Scheiber Cooperative federalism, in theory, is the relationship between the federal government and state government is one in which they share governmental tasks. As a result of the decentralized structure of duties, citizens have access to multiple centers of authority in which power does not appear to be centralized at either lever or in one agency. The federal grant-in-aid cooperation of policy responsibility and financial capacity, administrative dependency, and function duplications are largely engaged in cooperative federalism, according to Scheiber, who also claimed that the term is a new primary concept. The Great Depression encouraged the expansion of the federal grant program, which radically altered the balance of power between the federal and state governments. Since 1933 cooperative federalism has been defined as collaboration between central and state governments so that the central government can grant-in-aid to the central government and avoid the state government establishing a grant program that can be directly funded by the local or special district authorities (Scheiber, 1986).

Creative federalism: Creative federalism is when the national government has jurisdiction across all regional governments and the state government utilized the state authority, which indicates that neither the state government nor state government can change the constitution without the permission of all parties that are involved. By integrating the underprivileged into the structure of America, creative federalism aimed to support establishing a great society. Rapid establishment of classified grant programs for state and local government and direct federal funds to cities were features of its efforts. Federal subsidies shaped activities and orientations at the state and local levels, as seen by great society initiatives like Head start by providing



poor children with early education and eliminating poverty in society (Shafritz, Russel, Borick, and Hyde, 2016).

Progressive federalism: Progressive federalism is when the dominance of big businesses is diminished while boosting and strengthening trade unions and labor movements by giving power to ordinary people (Foster 2021). In the United States (US), there is now a movement taking shape that seeks to rebalance the relationship between state and federal government and reconsider where we look to express constitutional rights while advancing democracy, equality, and social justice. Progressive federalism was used by the Obama administration in the United State to allow them to have more authority over issues such as environmental and consumer protection to protect (Levine and Yavorek, 2018).

4.3. The Concept of Community Development

Community development is a systematic method in which authorities assist community people in effectively collaborating on issues relevant to society. Community development strengthens and connects communities by empowering residents. According to Stacey, the perfect characteristic of the community is the sensation of connection that was claimed to be tied to the social interactions within the specific geographic region (Stacey 1969). Community development is a progression of community welfare in a deliberate manner (economic, environmental, and cultural). It is also a process in which society takes collective action to deal with common challenges they have, and come together to find a solution for that challenge (Frank &Smith 1999). Community development is a new method of interacting, organizing social life, promoting human rights, and human desires are becoming available as a result of this process of constructing and re-forming the framework of human society (Ife & Tesoriero 2006). According to Mendes, community development uses community structure to meet social issues and empower groups of society is characterized as community development. (Mendes 2008). Community development is a way to connect with society and figure out a method that helps people make positive changes in their lives and promote collaboration and trust between people and their society. (Bartley, 2003). Following World War II, developing nations faced a variety of issues with political/public management, such as dysfunctional government, bureaucratic pathology, disorganized public institutions, and organizational and functional complexity in the provision of public services (Escobar, 1988). To address institutional issues and inefficiencies in local governance, a number of structural and pluralist strategies had surfaced by the late 1970s (Campbell, 1972; Peters, 2001, pp. 3-12). Nonetheless, those strategies increased state-centrism and consolidated more administrative authority in the hand of the central government (Pankaj, 2007). The top-down decision-making process decreased the efficiency of the administrative system and increased the upward responsibility of institutional structures. Parallel to this, a pattern of systemic lawlessness, favoritism, political intervention, and breaches of human rights evolved (Zafarullah and Huque, 2001). Usually, community development programs are designed for underdeveloped countries due to the majority of the people lack basic human needs. However, when it comes to developed countries the case is different because usually, the basic needs are available, and for the ones that cannot get the basic need the government is supporting them to fulfill those needs

5. THE NEXUS BETWEEN COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT AND FEDERALISM: SOMALIA

5.1. Background of Federalism in Somalia

Siyad Barre's military dictatorship eventually fell apart in 1991, resulting in unparalleled instability and the creation of a rebel leader to control some territories, which Somalia is still dealing with (Heritage institution, 2020). However, after eight years of Somali's central government, regional administrators decided to build the Puntland State Regional Administration. Although the northeast regions had neither strong governance nor decentralized administration under the prior administration, the Puntland state government had the goal to promote the adoption of a federal political structure in Somalia (Farah, 2017). According to Farah, the long-term characteristics of several pre-war disputes make significance favor to the external society in



settling local conflicts. The goal of the meetings that were held in Garowe in 1991 was to stabilize regional security and peace which led to the establishment of Puntland state in 1998 (cited in Bradbury, 2008). The goal of the Garowe meeting was not so that Puntland can be independent of Somalia, but to establish Puntland as a federal state to limit the future central government's authority in the Northeast (Brickhill and Bryden, 2010). According to Farah (2017), For Somalia finally, taking a step to pursue a federal political system was considered after the establishment of the Puntland State of Somalia (PSS) and they used federalism as an excellent model to re-established the Somali government.

In January 2009, the Djibouti peace process to adopt federalism in Somalia was endorsed by the UN Security Council, which led to the election of Sheikh Sharif Sheikh Ahmed in 2009 and the re-implementation of the Transitional Federal Government (TFG) and brought a second power-sharing agreement, this time with the Ahlu Sunna Wal Jamaa'a Sufi coalition (ASWJ) (Gaas and Gomsrud, 2010). The Arta conference was the foundation of the first Somali government Transitional Federalism Government (TFG), which gained its legitimacy ever since before 1991 and allowed Somalia to reclaim its seats in the United Nation and regional organizations. The TFG faced challenges from the Somali Reconciliation and Restoration Council (SRRC) and Pan Somali which made up of commanders from various parts of the nation (AMISOM, 2022).

The United Nations organized the Garowe one (1) and two (2) meetings hosted by Somalia's transitional federal government and held in Garowe Puntland in 2011. In Feb 2012 the second national constitution conference brought together the roadmap's signatories as well as civil society members. The conference was inaugurated by Sharif Hassan the Speaker of the Parliament, who emphasized the need to agree on several key principles. The participants were the president of Puntland at that moment Abdirahman Mohamed Faroole and the Prime Minister Abdiweli Mohamed Ali (Reliefweb 2012). Somalia's Constituent Assembly was formally created and launched in Mogadishu on July 25, 2012. 825 elders from 18 districts across the country came to enroll in the meeting and on August 1, the Somalia Provisional Constitution was accepted by the Assembly. The percentage of women elected to the Assembly was only 24%, significantly below the 30% objective established in Garowe II (UN 2012). This was the first time that this number of women have taken an active role in Somalia's politics, even before the collapse of the Somalia government.

5.2. Communities In Somalia

Somalis have the same ethnic groups, speak the same language, and practice the same religion, they also share the same religion and culture which is a classical argument that Somali people make. Nevertheless, deep down this claim reveals that it is false and deceptive (Ahmed and Green 1999). According to Ahmed and Green 1999, contemporary analyses of Somali political issues majority of them agree that the issue is based on the misconception and naïve generalization about the Somali people's alleged distinctiveness as a culturally homogeneous entity (cited at mukhtar, (1996). Being a Muslim dominion the country's second language is Arabic, however, Somali is the widely spoken language across the country. Family is at the foundation of Somali culture, hence it is highly important, in Somalia family comes first, and considering the family is the most essential aspect of Somali culture. In most parts of the country, a particular clan or sub-clan can be predominant, however, it's not uncommon to see several clans live together in a particular place since Somalis are nomadic. Somalis are predominantly Sunni Muslims and therefore social customs, attitudes, and gender rules are essentially based on Islamic traditions. There are non-Somali minorities who make up 15% of the nation's population, such as Bantus, Eyle, Indians, Arabs, Pakistanis, Ethiopians, and Britons. In Somalia, paternal lineage determines membership in the clan (BioGreat Tv 2020) in which Clan families and clans are sub-clans, major bloodlines, (dia is manual aid that each sub-clan collects to help each other or pay each other finds when they commit a crime) and dia-paying groupings (jilib/Bah) make up the Somali social and political system. The dia-paying members have an unwritten commitment to help one another and share money. The dia-paying members have run from hundreds to thousands of households in Somalia and they are a very stable entity (Ahmed and Green, 1999).



Clan membership does not have an official leader, but the traditional leaders in the communities prefer to have a council of elders with shared responsibilities they also represent their separate groups as legitimate representatives throughout the colonial regime. And the meetings of clan members are not automatically conferred specific rights and responsibilities, instead, they are discussed and agreed upon in unwritten contracts (Ahmed and Green, 1999). Somalis use this method to prevent conflicts between clans as the clan elders are the ones that deal with clan problems.

As Somalis place more trust in their community than in the government and the system, adopting federalism is not surprising, and federalism appears to be the best way for Somalis to achieve peace and stability.

6. OPPORTUNITIES AND CHALLENGES OF FEDERALISM IN COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

6.1 The Opportunities of Federalism in Community Development

This part of the paper will analyze the opportunities of federalism in community development and demonstrate how it benefits the Somali communities.

6.1.1. Security

After many years of conflict and the establishment of the Somali federal government, the aim was to create a shared vision of federal and state-level security institutions that are shared, trusted, and capable. Although African Union Mission in Somalia (AMISOM) was key in fighting Al-Shabaab in Somalia, however, the effectiveness of creating a security organization such as the police, army, and intelligence agencies depends on managing political security. Therefore, reestablishing security institutions is essential to re-establishing the Somali state, and during the past 20 years, external interventions and Somali political players have primarily focused on this demand to improve (Keating and Abshir 2018). The FGS has received military assistance from Turkiye after the first visit of President Recep Tayyip Erdogan to Mogadishu, in which Turkiye opened the largest military training base abroad in Mogadishu. For the first time, well-trained graduates from Somalia since the collapse of the Somalia government, graduated from the Turk-Som Military Training Academy in Mogadishu in July 2019 with 152 skilled trained officers, along with 81 lieutenants and 71 sergeants (Waal, 2019). Al-Shabaab lost the authority in major cities of the country however they remained in rural areas and maintained underground networks, attacks, and collect taxes.

6.1.2 Education

Due to the country being a failed state for many years, the quality of education was not great. Many students lost their homes, their parents as well as their sources of income which forced them to be drop out and seek work. 55% of adults in Somalia are literate according to a World Bank study, although the rate differs from state to state in Somalia. For instance, in Puntland 42.9 % can read and write, in Somaliland 45.3%, and in South-central Somalia 38.3% (Abdullahi, et al, 2020). However, there was one university before the civil war and 44 in 2012, Somalia has seen an amazing expansion in the number of universities in the country. There are an estimated 124 universities in the country, with over 70 of them located in Mogadishu alone. A study conducted by Iftin foundation in 2018 indicated that 14971 students graduate from 54 universities, mostly from faculties of social science (Abdullahi, et al, 2020). After more than 20 years for the first time that FGS started taking the unified national examination for the first time in 2015 after decades. In 2017 the schools that took the unified examination were 77 across South-central Somalia. Banadir, Jubaland, Southwest, Galmudug, and Hirshabeele regions were the regions that sat for the unified examination. Somaliland and Puntland did not sit for these particular exams as these states have regional centralized exams (AMISOM, 2017). The education of Somalia has seen many changes with Turkish schools in the capital city of Mogadishu, the University of Simad, Mogadishu University, Amoud University, Hargeisa University, and East Africa University, and there are thousands of students that are graduating from these, and many other universities in Somalia.



6.1.3 Healthcare system

After Somalia's federal system was implemented the country's healthcare system changed apparently, and both the FGS and FMS are attempting to provide the society with better healthcare system with the help of International Organizations. A compact for Sustainable Peace signed by the Federal Government, and the international community, Somalia is poised to embark on a new stage of political and economic growth. An area where the Somali authorities have seen to be significant was the building of the health system (Warsame, Handuleh, and Patel, 2016). From 2013 to 2016 the country's first post-civil war Health Sector Strategic Plan (HSSP) was created with the monitoring of the Ministry Of Health, Joint Health and Nutrition Program (JHNP), and international donors. The health care system aimed to outline the Somali Health Policy which offers a framework for the country. Somaliland's Ministry of Health was functioning since 1991, it may not be the best in the world, however, but it is the country's longest-functioning ministry of health since the collapsed of the Somalia government. Puntland was also functioning, and improving the health system of the state since 1997, both Somaliland and Puntland had existing strategic health plans, and the acknowledgment of the varying objectives in each area and strengthening these local ministries and providing them may play a significant improvement in the healthcare system of Somalia. The development taking place in Somalia currently may benefit the nation's healthcare system; new hospitals are opening and government policies may all influence it, as well as the reopening of formerly closed hospitals, such as Digfer Hospital, which was reconstructed with the assistance of Turkey and renamed Erdogan in honor of Turkish President Recep Tayyip Erdogan.

6.1.4 Economic growth

Following federalism, Somalis in Somalia and the diaspora came home to invest in the country, and the economy of Somalia was somehow boosted. Years of violence and political unrest left the nation one of the poorest in the world; yet, it was able to rebuild political stability, which may be the reason why the nation's economy is now slowly but steadily growing. Numerous studies contend that federalism can help preserve long-term economic growth. According to Rodrik, Subramanian, and Trebbi 2002, In the agglomeration of economic necessities, decentralized governments facilitate a stronger focus on building the economy of the country (cited Feld, Zimmermann, Döring, 2004). For example, Somalia has recovered from being a formally failed state, and the economy of the nation is gradually expanding. The state members started negotiating agreements with international investors to grow their respective states. A state can be a testing ground for social and economic ideas without affecting the rest of the country if the resident desires and that is an incredible feature of the federal system (Feld, Zimmermann, Döring, 2004). Due to the nation's status as a failed state for the previous two decades, there were no foreign investors in the country; but, after adopting federalism, improvements began to occur as a result of the safety and political stability of in the country.

6.1.5 Women and youth development

A significant number of young people are running for political office in Somalia, participating both in the parliament and several government ministries following federalism. The country has never seen such a large number of young people participate in politics and voice their opinions on national affairs, being part of the policy-making and decision-making of the country. According to JIGA 2017, The international community has worked together to achieve peacebuilding and state-building (PSG) under the Somali Compact since the adoption of FGS in 2012. In the years between 2014-2016 to restore and strengthen the Somali economy, the PSG4 Economic Foundation has listed youth employment as one of its top goals. It has an emphasis on creating jobs, improving livelihoods, and inclusive growth to revive and expand the Somali economy. Between 2014 and 2016, the development partners invested a total of US\$73 million in the growth and employment of the private sector. Several donors have been working on vocational training for young employees as one of the important components of supporting PSG4. In Somalia Despite an increase in women's political engagement over the decade, the Somali Federal Government's constitution requires that 30% of the parliament be made up of women, and women's representation in the upper house



increased by 14% after quotas for women were implemented in 2012. Although the system is far from ideal, it helped women's ambitions and normalized their place in society (Koshin, 2022).

6.1.6 Political stability

Federalism can be a strategy to avoid the entire country from collapsing and becoming a failed state again. States like Puntland and Somaliland, which created their separate systems before the establishment of federalism, where in Somaliland the presidents were elected under the democratic principle of one man one vote and in Puntland also the parliament elects the president which attained political stability far earlier than the rest of Somalia. The South and Central went down the same route after the federation, giving the remainder of the country some degree of stability. Muhammad (2007), stated that the connection between federalism and political stability is inescapable since it entails setting up the state in a way that fosters unity while maintaining existing diversity within a larger national entity. That it is a system that regulates potential and actual conflict that frequently results from heterogeneity within a political entity is implied in this statement. Following federalism, Somalia held its first election and every candidate was willing to accept if and when they lost the election. The former presidents were also willing to step down from their position when they lost, and this practice has been happening ever since.

6.1.7 Power distribution

Opposite to the unitary system, federalism allows for the distribution of national authority among state members. By distributing authority, state governments will be able to handle local affairs per their state's interests and avoid having one region dominating all the rest. Power distribution is perhaps the most crucial element of a federal constitution since it helps to prevent instability and conflict between the two-opposing jurisdiction. Even though many nations have accepted the idea of power distribution, each has made its own version, however, the common standards of all federal systems are that states should have control over regional concerns while the central government handles the national interest (Fasih, 2021). According to the Somali constitution, State members and the federal government of Somalia, each has parts of authority in international relations, currency printing, and national security are under the authority of the federal government. The federal state members have power over their respective state and the FGS has to negotiate with the representatives of the states in any agreements related to state members. The state governments have the power to control regional courts, primary and secondary education administration, municipal affairs, maintain the state military, police, and livestock.

By strengthening and balancing the available local resources with their awareness and ability to respond to local needs, they could have a positive influence on the development of their communities. The various power structures may be manipulated to assist community development projects through such activities.

6.2 Challenges of Federalism in Community Development

This part of the paper will discuss the challenges of applying federalism in community development of Somalia. Such as border conflicts, power disputes between the federal government and state members, the injustice of minorities, and the exploitation of natural resources.

6.2.1 Border conflicts

Federalism was implemented to avoid conflict within the Somali community and achieve sustainable peace, however, it appears that the borders have also led to new disputes between states. People who live close to the borders where conflicts happen live unstable lives due to state-to-state conflicts that cause death and destroy schools, roads, internal displacement, and the economy of that community. The designation of disputed territories following clan borders has been one of the biggest obstacles to the federal state's restoration in Somalia. As the South West states of Somalia assert that Lower Shabelle, Bakol, Bay, Gedo, Lower Juba, and Middle Juba are their territory. As the conflict between Puntland and Somaliland over Sool and Sanaag. Similarly, Galmudug and Puntland also have disputes over borders (Mohamed, 2016). Conflicts between Somaliland and Puntland over the regions of Sool and Sanaag cannot be easily resolve



since Somaliland is a self-declared government and Puntland is an autonomous part of Somalia. Additionally, the residents of that region have different opinions and are divided into more than three groups, some of which want to be a part of Somaliland and some of which want to be a part of Puntland, while others established their own state Khatumo state. Sool and Sanaag are being claimed by Somaliland since they were under British colonial administration, while Puntland is also claiming the Harti clan resides there.

6.2.2 Power dispute

The state members of Somalia have challenged the government of Somalia many times, while states like Puntland threatens to declare an independent government. The cause of that challenge can be that Puntland and Somaliland had been on their own for a decade before the federal government's establishment. Lack of unanimity and the absence of a defined constitution may distinguish the federal government's authority and state members. Due to the differences in the syllabus, Puntland opposed the announcement of a centralized test being held throughout Somalia; also, the centralized exam had been held in Puntland for more than a decade and would be challenging to change overnight. The federal government's interference with the state members led to the emergence of an authoritarian regime. President Farmajo's government was alleged to have attempted to create a unitary system. To destroy the federal system of the country, Farmajo and Khayre are alleged to have attempted to put in the power of the state members' governing authorities that support them. The federal government interferes with the internal elections with state members like Hirshabelle, Galmudug, and Jubaland. Furthermore, the federal government's intervention-related activities, including social media campaigns, coercive tactics, and additional funding, are used to carry out the intervention (Nor, 2020). Ingiriis stated that the government structure fails to properly define the duties and obligations of each authoritative institution, which triggered conflicts between the political stakeholders (Ingiriis, 2018). And to prevent power disputes, there should be a written agreement or include a constitutional amendment in Somalia's constitution that take action against those who violate the structure of the government. The Federal government and state members should be flexible and create a safe ground for the people of Somalia and focus on the community instead of their gains.

6.2.3 Exploitation of natural resources

Natural resources including oil, gas, fish, and other minerals are abundant in Somalia. However, the civil war, corruption, and lack of consequences caused the natural resources of the country to be exploited easily. Nevertheless, With Soma Oil and Gas and Somalia-Fishguard, the Somali Federal Government has signed two significant agreements. Existing contracts between international fishing corporations and local governments would be impacted by the deal. Regional authorities used to provide fishing permits to international businesses. It is unknown how many foreign fishing boats there are in the waters surrounding Somalia and the agreements that the state governments sign with international companies cannot be revoked (Ahmad, 2014). As stated in the Somalia constitution, the federal government and state members, particularly the state where the resources are being explored, must discuss and reach an agreement on the terms before exploring Somalia's natural resources. Nonetheless, this did not prevent certain politicians to come to an agreement with international investors without the awareness and approval of anyone. For instance, when the minister of Petrol and Mineral resources Abdirashid Ahmed sign a Production Sharing Agreement (PSA) with the U.S.-Based Coastline Exploration, he thanked the president of Somalia Farmajo for the support of the process, however, since it was an unlawful agreement, the President and Prime Minister both denied it, and the Prime Minister suspended all the individuals involved in the agreement until court take actions against them (Cavcic, 2022). The Somali government previously abandon the natural resources of the country which made its exploitation very easy and unaccounted for.

6.2.4 Minority injustice

The Somalis were tribe-based people who would always turn to their tribal elders for help with the problems they caused. The tribal elders always resolved the problem either by paying dia (Dia is the amount of money that people agree to pay between them) or by resolving it in any way possible. The vast majority of people



think that tribalism serves as the basis for Somalia’s federalism, which can be a disaster when it comes to the minority groups, because if the state was built for clans then the minorities can suffer injustice. Many local governments in America are imposing harsh penalties and treating the nation’s minorities unfairly. And the majority of local leaders ignore the discrimination against minorities in many Somali states. Minorities in Somalia account for the majority of child marriages, child laborers, and out-of-school children. A study done by the Minority Right Group (MGR) stated that although the Somaliland constitution in articles 8.1 and 8.2 stated that all citizens of Somaliland have equal rights and shall not be discriminated against on the ground of ethnicity, clan affiliation, and residence are banned. However, that did not stop the discrimination against the minorities, although Somaliland is more advance in the rights of the minority than the rest of Somalia, still very few minority members hold influential or executive roles as a result of their lack of political involvement, low educational attainment, and limited career possibilities, which makes discrimination and harassment still possible (Hill, 2010). Internal displacement persons (IDP) women and children from minority groups frequently had their rights violated in Puntland, according to MRG researchers (Hill, 2010). Regardless of where they live in Somalia, minorities experience the same discrimination, poverty, lack of political participation, refusal of intermarriage, etc. Federalism will not work unless the system is changed and each state must incorporate minorities into all aspects of local life.

7. DATA ANALYSIS

An online survey questionnaire was sent to 150 members and get a response of 109.

Tables one, and two, are to show the gender, and age of the individuals that participated in this survey.

Table 1. Gender of the respondents

| Gender | Frequency | Percentage |
|---------------|------------------|-------------------|
| Female | 40 | 63% |
| Male | 68 | 37% |
| Total | 108 | 100% |

Table 2. Age of the respondents

| Age | Frequency | Percentage % |
|--------------|------------------|---------------------|
| 18-25 | 27 | 24.8% |
| 25-30 | 64 | 58.7% |
| 30-35 | 13 | 11.9% |
| 35 and older | 5 | 4.6% |
| Total | 109 | 100% |

8. FINDINGS

8.1 Opportunities of Federalism in Community Development

Federalism helps improve Somalia's community, according to the majority of respondents who participated in this quantitative study to examine the subject. The study’s sample size was 109 participants, to achieve the objectives of the study and the overall mean index was 3,30, with “strongly agree” as the primary possibility. Federalism helps community development, particularly for Somali communities, to find the objective of the research, the researcher asks “if federalism is a way to develop the communities in Somalia.” as evidenced by the question, the majority of the respondents “strongly agree” with a mean of



3,31 and std. deviation of 0,22. “Federalism is an easy way to know the needs of the people in the community and find solutions easily” the majority of the people “strongly agree” with this question. When asked people “if federalism will work in Somalia if people have enough knowledge about it and follow the constitution” the majority of the respondents “strongly agree” which shows that Federalism needs to be understood by the Somali population, and the national court of Somalia must take legal actions against those who violate the nation’s constitution.

8.2 Challenges of Federalism in Community Development

Quantitative data was collected and the majority of respondents to this survey on the challenges of federalism, which included 109 people, disagreed with the main question, “Federalism does not help the development of the communities in Somalia”, people “disagree” This indicates that there is a high likelihood that federalism will contribute to community development, and the majority of those who took part in the survey agreed. Federalism has its challenges, however, it still supports Somalia’s local community development. When participants were asked, “federalism has the potential to exclude the minority from political participation”. They “agree” that it does.

Although border disputes, minority injustice, resource exploitation, and power struggles are some of federalism’s challenges. The majority “strongly disagrees” that “federalism will never work in Somalia even if people have more knowledge about it and follow the constitution,” suggesting that federalism will function in Somalia if people abide by the constitution and are more aware of federalism.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

Before the British, and Italian colonizers, Somalis were people that dealt with everything through a clan structure, including the economy, marriage, criminal activity, and international and domestic trade. Up until the colonial forces invaded the nation, this system was operating flawlessly for them. Following its independence, Somalia experienced a brief period of democratic rule, although it was short-lived until Barre toppled the administration. The dictatorship period of Barre's administration then began. Barre’s government was exclusively interested in constructing the capital city; the rest of the country was not a priority, giving people who could afford to move to the capital city a better life and education. Then Barre’s administration was overthrown. Then clan militias began to fight to control the nation, jeopardizing its peace and stability in the process, which caused the country to be in a failed state. To address the disagreements that resulted in a centralized government system, a federal political system was chosen during the Eldoret and Mbaghati peace conferences, which took place between 2002 and 2004. The effort to bring peace to Somalia has failed 15 times before. So Somalis decided to establish a federal political system as a result of the inherent federalist characteristics of self-rule and shared rule in Somalia. And after decades of war and instability, in 2012, Somalia officially adopted a federal system. Somalia saw a positive impact on the federal system. Federalism has been advantageous to Somalia in many ways, yet there are still challenges. The majority of respondents to the survey indicated that they considered federalism the ideal way to develop Somali communities. The Somali community has experienced challenges with federalism, including the exploitation of the nation's natural resources, injustice against minorities, border conflicts, and power struggles. These problems may be avoided if individuals uphold the constitution or endure the consequences if they don't. After all, Somalia has had a federal system of government for ten years, and the nation’s sustained federalism may be attributed to the opportunities. Therefore, it is necessary to consider how to resolve the challenges of federalism, and the constitution must be explicit. Some may criticize the federal system and call it a clan system that will divide the Somali people. However, in order to achieve peace and stability in Somalia, federalism is the solution that is needed, where power will be distributed among states. And based on the findings of this research, balancing the state member’s power with the federal government of Somalia is crucial to promote the country's education, security, and economic growth. For the state members to be able to assist and serve local communities, the federal government must recognize the power of the state members.



Recommendations

- One man, one vote must be applied to the upcoming election. People can only pick someone ready for an actionable change in Somalia in this way.
- To protect the interests of all local citizens, a robust and inclusive local democracy is required.
- The government of Somalia has to focus on building national and constitutional courts that are powerful to resolve the conflicts between the states and between the state members and the federal government.
- Minority groups have to have a system that works fairly and effectively so they can report the crimes committed against them.
- The constitution of the federal government has to be completed.

REFERENCES

Abdullahi, U. et al. (2020). Somali's education sector: Forging skills through a demand-driven education system. The heritage institution for policy studies.

Ahmad, L. (2014). Federalism moves heighten Somalia's natural resources debate. By Uncategorized.

Ahmed, I. and Green, R., H. (1999). The heritage of war and state collapse in Somalia and Somaliland: Local-level effects, external intervention, and reconstruction. Feb, 1999 Vol. 20 No. 1, Taylor & Francis.

Ali, A. Y. S., Dahir, A. H., & Hersi, Z. D. (2019). Federalism in post-conflict states: Assessing Somalia's challenges and the way forward. Perspectives on Federalism.

AMISON (2022). The Somali peace process. <https://amisom-au.org/about-somalia/somali-peace-process/>

BioGreat Tv, (2020). Major ethnic groups in Somalia and its Peculiarity. <https://youtu.be/jvfLiedXwoo>

Brettschneider, C. (2017). State and Local Governments Can Protect the Constitution from Trump. Time Magazine.

Brickhill, J., Bryden, M. (2010). Disarming Somalia: lessons in the stability from collapsed state. *Taylor & Francis Online*. <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/14678801003665992>

Burgees M. (2006). Comparative federalism: theory and practice, New York: Routledge 270 Madison Ave, New York, NY 10016.

Cavcic, M. Somalia's inaugural offshore oil & gas deal with U.S. operator deemed illegal. Offshore energy.

Christiansen, T. et al.(1964) (eds), The Social Wheare, 1964.

Ebegbulem, J. C. (2011). Federalism and the politics of resource control in Nigeria: a critical analysis of the Niger Delta crisis. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*.

Eghosa-Osaghae, E. (2004), Federalism and the management of diversity in Africa, Identity, culture and politics, Vol. 5 No. 1/2.

Elmi, A. A. (2014). Decentralization options for Somalia. The Heritage Institute for Policy Studies. The Heritage Institute for Policy Studies.

Farah, M., A. (2017). Federalism: state-building Somalia and people's state ownership. *Academia Accelerating the world's research*.

Fasih, F. (2021). Federalism with special reference to the distribution of legislative powers under U.S.A and Indian constitutions. <http://www.legalservicesindia.com/article/137/Federalism....html>

Foster J. (2021) Progressive Federalism. Youtube KingMab.



- Frank, F. and Smith, A. (1999) *The Community Development Handbook*. Human Resources Development Canada (HRDC).
- Haji, M. M. (1989). *The Emergence and Role of Political Parties in the Inter-River Region of Somalia from 1947-1960*
- Harry N. Scheiber, (1986): *Cooperative Federalism*, Encyclopedia.com <https://www.encyclopedia.com/politics/encyclopedias-almanacs-transcripts-and-maps/cooperative-federalism>
- Hill, M. (2010). *No redress: Somalia's forgotten minorities*. Minority Rights Group International.
- Hussein, M., A. (2017). *Federalism in Africa and Somalia*. Altin University. Thesis Master.
- Ife, J. W., & Tesoriero, F. (2006). *Community development: Community-based alternatives in an age of globalisation*.
- Ingiriis Mohamed, 2017, *Who assassinated the Somali President in October 1969? The Cold War, the clan connection, or the coup d'état*. African Security.
- Ingriis, M. H. (2018). *State and Clan Violence in Somalia*. state and clan violence in Somalia. African Conflict & Peacebuilding Review, Volume 8, Number 1, Spring 2018.
- Jay M. S., E.W. R, Christopher P. B., and Albert C. H., (2016): *Introduction Public Administration*. (9th ed.). Routledge. https://himia.umj.ac.id/wp-content/uploads/2021/08/Introducing-Public-Administration-by-Jay-M.-Shafritz-et-al.-z-lib.org_.pdf
- JIGA, (2017). *Youth employment baseline study (YEBS) for Somalia*. page.
- Keating, M. and Abshir, S. (2018). *The politics of security in Somalia*. Central on international cooperation. April 2018.
- Kelemen, R. D. (2007). *Built to last? The durability of EU federalism*. Making history: European integration and institutional change at fifty.
- Kincaid, J. (1990). *Federalism and community in the American context*. Publius: The Journal of Federalism, 20(2).
- Koshin, S., A. (2022). *The importance of Somali women in leadership for sustainable development and peace*. March 30, 2022.
- Levine J. and Yavorek T. (2018). *Types of federalism*. Manopdf.com. https://nanopdf.com/download/file-5afd93170cb92_pdf
- Lyons Terrence & Samatar Ahmed I., (2010), *Somalia: State Collapse, Multilateral Intervention, and Strategies for Political Reconstruction*, Brookings Institution Press, Washington, DC.
- Mariotti, S. (2019). *The new progressive federalism: common benefits, state constitutional rights, and democratic political action*. New Political Science, 41:1.
- Mendes, P.P (2008). *Challenging oppression: A critical social work approach*. Canada: Oxford University Press.
- Muhammad, A., A. (2007). *federalism and political stability in Nigeria: current peril and future hopes*. Journal of Sustainable development in Africa.
- Nor, F., M. (2020). *Opportunities and challenges of federalism in Somalia*. Master's thesis.



Pankaj, A.K (2007). Review article: State-led development of developing societies. *Journal of Asian and African Studies*, Vol. 42 No. 3/4.

Peters, B.G. (2001), *The Future of Governing*, University Press of Kansas, Lawrence, KS.

Payton, G. D. (1980). The Somali Coup of 1969: The Case for Soviet Complicity. *The Journal of Modern African Studies*.

Reliefweb (2012). Second Somali National Consultative Constitution Conference. <https://reliefweb.int/report/somalia/second-somali-national-consultative-constitutional-conference>

Stacey, M. (1969). The myth of community studies. *The British Journal of Sociology*.

United Nations Industrial development project (UNIDO), (2020), project document of the federal republic of Somalia. Project title: Productive sectors development programme for Somalia. [https://open.unido.org/api/documents/18744970/download/190362_ProDoc_PSDP%20Somalia_v7_EB%20review2\[3\].pdf](https://open.unido.org/api/documents/18744970/download/190362_ProDoc_PSDP%20Somalia_v7_EB%20review2[3].pdf)

Waal, Y., H. (2019). Renewed hope: rebuilding Somalia's national army. *Daily Sabah*.

Warsame, A., Handuleh, J., & Patel, P. (2016). Prioritization in Somali health system strengthening: a qualitative study. *International health*.

Zafarullah, H. and Huque, A.S. (2001), "Public management for good governance: reforms, regimes, and reality in Bangladesh", *International Journal of Public Administration*, Vol. 24 No. 12, pp. 1379-1403.