

## Düzce University Journal of Science & Technology

## Open Source Data Mining Programs: A Case Study on R

Fatih KAYAALP<sup>a\*</sup>, Muhammet Sinan BAŞARSLAN<sup>b</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Computer Engineering Department, Düzce University, Düzce, TÜRKİYE
 <sup>a</sup> School of Advanced Vocational Studies, Doğuş University, İstanbul, TÜRKİYE
 \* Corresponding Author: fatihkayaalp@duzce.edu.tr

#### ABSTRACT

The processes on the way from raw data to meaningful information is called data mining. The data is processed by applying various methods of data mining in order to extract hidden information among raw data. The processed raw data becomes usable in the next steps of data mining. There are many open source and commercial applications to be used in data mining and data processing. In this study, information about data mining programs are given, and a case study on the R program. The R program has been chosen because it has a large preference rate among the users as shown by various graphs.

Keywords: Data Mining, Open Source Programs, R, Churn Analysis

## Açık Kaynak Kodlu Veri Madenciliği Programları: R'da Örnek Uygulama

## Özet

Ham verilerden anlamlı bilgilere geçiş sürecine veri madenciliği denir. Veri, ham veriler arasında gizli bilgileri çıkarmak için çeşitli veri madenciliği yöntemleri uygulanarak işlenir. İşlenmiş ham veriler, veri madenciliğinin bir sonraki aşamasında kullanılabilir hale gelir. Veri madenciliği ve veri işlemede kullanılmak üzere birçok açık kaynak ve ticari uygulama vardır. Bu çalışmada veri madenciliği programları hakkında bilgi verilmiş ve R programı üzerinde bir vaka çalışması sunulmuştur. R programı, çeşitli grafiklerle de gösterildiği üzere kullanıcılar arasında büyük bir tercih oranına sahip olması dolayısıyla seçilmiştir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Veri Madenciliği, Açık Kaynak Programlar, R, Kayıp Müşteri Analizi

#### I. INTRODUCTION

Nowadays, access to knowledge is not the result of long struggles as in the old times. Instant access and sharing of information have become possible. The important thing here is whether this information is useful to be used. At this point, government and commercial institutions' use of the acquired information for the good of humanity is of great importance. For example, it is now much easier for commercial enterprises to offer their all range of products to the people. Through e-commerce, customers now do shopping from groceries to clothing stores and to large or small firms without leaving their homes. A customer-focused business entity, such as a bank or a telecommunications company, wants to maintain the continuity of business with its customers and does not want to lose customers. For this reason, they keep customer records and information. However, this information must be stable, in other words it needs processing for customer acquisition and preventing customer churn. These operations are generally called data mining. Nowadays, besides the information gathered with interaction during trading as in the example given above, data are obtained by means of various data collection methods.

Advances in data collection tools and database technologies require vast amounts of information to be stored and analyzed in information repositories. In line with the advances in computer technology, data mining methods and programs aim to put vast amounts of data into effective and efficient use. To combine knowledge and experience, it is necessary to use software developed for Data Mining. Data mining became compulsory due to ever growing data records (GB/hour), satellite and remote sensing systems, space observations through telescopes, developments in gene technology, scientific computations, simulations, models, and data mining [1].

Programs are needed to implement data mining applications. Access to applications used for data mining and acquiring information about these applications can be found on the Internet, in various books or articles. There is a variety of applications in this regard, such as IBM SPSS Modeler 15, Excel, SAS, Angoss, KXEN, SQL Server, MATLAB, RapidMiner (YALE), WEKA, R, Orange and KNIME. Table 1 shows these commercial and open source applications.

Commercial (Closed Source Code)	<b>Open Source Coded</b>
SPSS Clementine	Orange
Excel	RapidMiner
SPSS	WEKA
SAS	R
Angoss	Keel
KXEN	Knime
MS SQL Server	Tanagra
MATLAB	Scriptella ETL
Oracle Modules	jHepWork
	Elki

 Table 1. Commercial and Open Source Data Mining Programs[2]

In this study, open source data mining programs are compared and a sample application is developed in R. A brief information on data mining is given in the second section. A comparison about open source data mining programs is presented and the R language is explained briefly in the third section. In the fourth section, a case study with R is presented. The fifth and final section presents the results.

## II. DATA MINING

There are various definitions of data mining in literature. It can be called as the task of obtaining a "valuable" information among vast amounts of data [3]. Data mining, in other words knowledge discovery in databases (KDD), is the process of extracting information that is potentially useful and understandable that has never been discovered before in vast amounts of data. Data analysis techniques such as backend database management systems, statistics, artificial intelligence, machine learning, parallel and distributed processes are also called data mining [4][5].

Data mining is the search for relationships and rules in vast amounts of data using computer programs which allow us to make predictions about the future. If we assume that the future, at least the near future, will not be too different from the past, the rules drawn from the past will be valid in the future and will allow us to make the right predictions for the future [6].

The first steps of information discovery in databases were taken by the 1990 and data mining has become a new standard widely used in line with the new technologies [7]. Processing raw data to make it usable, that is discovery of knowledge requires a certain process. The process involves the steps described in Figure 1.



Figure 1. Data Mining Process[4]

# III. COMPARISON OF R AND OTHER OPEN SOURCE DATA MINING PROGRAMS

Today it is necessary to use computer programs to make data mining applications due to the huge size of data. Computer programs are offered as commercial and open source (free) programs. This section provides a comparison of open source and freely available programs and an overview of the R program to be used in the study.

It is a program developed for graphics, statistical calculations and data analysis. It's a GNU project similar to the S language. It was developed in the Department of Statistics at Auckland University in New Zealand by Robert Gentleman and Ross Ihaka. It is also known as R & R. R is superior to the S language due to its different applications. It features linear and nonlinear modeling, classical statistical

tests, time series analysis, classification, clustering, etc. R can run on Windows, MacOS X and Linux systems [3][8].

As shown in Table 2, the R language does not lag behind other selected programs. In addition, thanks to its packages, R can be expanded according to the desired operations and R has advantages with its statistics efficiency as well as package diversity compared to others.

Parameter	Keel	Knime	Orange	R	RapidMiner (YALE)		
Data Mining Algorithms	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Machine Learning Packages	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Statistical Calculation	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Data Analysis	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Preprocessing	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Attribute Selection	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Visualization	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
GUI	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Expandability	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Flexibility	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Ease of Use	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Error-free Operation	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Documentation	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Scripting	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Additional Packages	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Data Import/Export	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Supported File Formats	.dat, .arff, .csv, .xml, .txt, .prn, .xls, .dif, .html	.arff, .csv	.tab, .basket, .names, .data, .txt, .xls (.arff and .csv only reads )	.r, .txt, .ods, .csv, .xml	.sml, .srff, .stt, .bib, .clm, .cms, .cri, .csv, .dat, .ioc, .log, .matte, .mode, .obf, a bar, one pair, .res, .sim, .thr, .wgt, .wls, .xrff, .arff		
Working with Databases	Yes (SQL Data- bases)	Yes (Oracle, MS SQL Server, PostgreS QL, MySQL, Access, ODBC, JDBC)	Yes (MySQL)	Yes (Informix, Oracle, Sybase, DB2, MS SQL Server, MySQL, PostgreSQ L, MS Access, ODBC)	Yes (Oracle, MS SQL Server, PostgreSQL, MySQL, JDBC, Sybase, Access, IBM DB2, Ingres, Text Files)		
Working with Excel	Yes (with import)	No	No	Yes	Yes		

#### Table 2. Comparison of Open Source Data Mining Softwares [2]

Table 3 shows the top 10 programs and usage preferences rates of data mining programs in 2016 [9].

Progr	am Nai	ne	F					
_			Pre	es				
	R							
Р	ython		4	45.8%				
	SQL							
E	Excel			33.6%				
Rap	idMine	ſ		32.6%				
Н	adoop		-	22.1%				
S	Spark		4	21.6%				
Ta	ableau			18.5%				
K	NIME			18.0%				
Scil	kit-learn	l	17.2%					
0%	10%	20%	30%	40%	50% 60%			
к -								
Python	-07-							
SQL								
Excel	-							
RapidMiner								
Hadoop					0100/			
Spark					010 %share			
Tableau		-		- 2	013 %share			
KNIME								
scikit-learn	-	-						

Table 3. Usage Preference Rates of Data Mining Program [9].

Figure 2. Top 10 Data Mining Programs in 2016 compared to 2015 [10]

As it is seen in Table 3 and Figure 2, the rate of preferences of the R program is increasing day by day since it is platform independent, open source, have numerous packages available and supported by a large user group on Internet. Because of this, an R-based application has been developed in this study.

#### IV. A CASE STUDY ON R

This study aims to make an application in customer conversion analysis by using a telecommunications data set which foresees to be separated from customer service subscription by a telecommunications company in Turkey. Among the open source programs, the R program is used. In this section, all the operations performed during the application are presented.

#### A. PROBLEM DEFINITION

A customer churn analysis study was conducted to estimate the churn rate by using customer data obtained from a telecommunications company. The data set used in the study includes information about 8000 customer records for a period of 6 months of call related data. In this study, a classification was performed with the decision trees for customer churn rates at the 6th month using C4.5 decision tree algorithm.

#### B.DATA PREPARATION AND DEFINITION

The telecommunications data set contains 8000 customer records and 22 attributes. Table 4 shows all the variables, formats and types related to telecommunications data set. When Table 4 is examined, it is seen that telecommunications data set has numerical and categorical attributes. A view of sample data is also given in Figure 3.

Attribute	Description	Data type		
gender_flag	Gender	NOMINAL		
Age	Age	NUMERICAL		
age_of_line	Customer lifetime duration	NUMERICAL		
tariff_type	Tariff type (Postpaid, Prepaid)	NOMINAL		
device_type	Device type, Smartphone, Laptop etc.	NOMINAL		
last_reload_year	Last reload date (for Prepaid subscribers)	NOMINAL		
last_reload_amount_07	Last reloaded amount (for Prepaid subscribers)	NUMERICAL		
mmo_count_07	Monthly number of conversations with subscribers (call)	NUMERICAL		
mmo_duration_07	Monthly talk time with subscribers (call)	NUMERICAL		
mmo_non_count_07	Number of conversations per month with other operator subscribers (call)	NUMERICAL		
mmo_non_duration_07	Monthly talk time with other operator subscribers (call)	NUMERICAL		
mmt_count_07	Monthly number of conversations with subscribers (in call)	NUMERICAL		
mmt_duration _07	Monthly talk time with subscribers (in call)	NUMERICAL		
mmt_non_count _07	Number of conversations per month with other operator subscribers (in call)	NUMERICAL		
mmt_non_duration_07	Monthly talk time with other operator subscribers (in call)	NUMERICAL		
call_distinct_07	Number of different people talked monthly	NUMERICAL		
msmo_count_07	Number of SMSs per month	NUMERICAL		
callcenter_count_07	Monthly CC Complaints call count	NUMERICAL		
payment_07	Monthly payout amount, invoice for postpaid, total reload for prepaid	NUMERICAL		
Unpaid_07	Number of unpaid invoices on time	NOMINAL		
payment_type_07	Invoice payment method, automatic?	NOMINAL		
Churn_2013_07	Has the subscriber churned?	BINARY		

#### Table 4. All variables, formats and types related to telecommunications data set

'data.frame': 8000 ol	bs. of 22 variables:
<pre>\$ gender_flag</pre>	: int 2 2 2 3 3 2 3 2 2 2
\$ age	: int 50 37 29 47 22 55 31 37 53 49
<pre>\$ age_of_line</pre>	: num 2935 49 2935 2935 49
<pre>\$ tariff_type</pre>	: int 1 2 1 1 1 1 2 1 1 1
<pre>\$ device_type</pre>	: int 10 10 0 10 10 3 10 3 3 3
<pre>\$ last_reload_year</pre>	: int 2014 1900 1900 2014 2014 2014 2014 2014 2013 1900
<pre>\$ last_reload_amount</pre>	: Factor w/ 31 levels "0","10","10,75",: 23 1 1 14 14 14 17 14 2 1
\$ mmo_count_07	: num 7 32 1 1 8 0 148 0 0 19
<pre>\$ mmo_duration_07</pre>	: num 7 32 1 1 8 0 148 0 0 19
<pre>\$ mmo_non_count_07</pre>	: num 3 15 29 98 61 117 136 23 0 1
<pre>\$ mmo_non_duration_07</pre>	: num 10 214 0 9168 1514
\$ mmt_count_07	: num 54 27 9 93 139 12 29 19 0 48
<pre>\$ mmt_duration_07</pre>	: num 7185 20040 2569 1993 0
<pre>\$ mmt_non_count_07</pre>	: num 3 15 29 98 61 117 136 23 0 1
<pre>\$ mmt_non_duration_07</pre>	: num 3611 15330 8081 15238 6483
<pre>\$ call_distinct_07</pre>	: int 39 2 33 0 32 0 46 17 0 0
\$ msmo_count_07	: int 1644 35 29 2 1644 17 1644 5 0 16
<pre>\$ callcenter_count_07</pre>	: int 0 0 1 0 1 0 2 1 0 0
<pre>\$ payment_07</pre>	: Factor w/ 507 levels "0","1","1,00E-06",: 175 1 1 1 1 1 260 1 1 1
\$ unpaid_07	: int 1000010011
<pre>\$ payment_type_07</pre>	: int 2 27 2 20 10 1 19 9 8 19
\$ churn_2013_07	: Factor w/ 2 levels "H","E": 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1

#### Figure 3. Types and general distributions of data types in R Studio

Figure 4 shows a summary of the telecommunications data set.

> summary(aveami	Lce7)											
gender_flag	age a	age_of_line	<pre>tariff_type</pre>	devi	ce_type	last_r	eload_year	mmo_avea	a_count_0	7 mmo_av	ea_duration_0	7 mmo_nonavea_count_07
U: 13 Min	n. :16.00 Mi	in. : 49	Kontörlü:5461	Mobil Tel	:3701	2014	:3980	Min.	0.00	Min.	: 0.00	Min. : 0.00
K:5758 1st	Qu.:28.00 1s	st Qu.: 266	Fatural1:2539	Akıllı Telef	on:3254	Bilinmey	en:2326	1st Qu.	0.00	1st Qu	.: 0.00	1st Qu.: 2.00
E:2229 Med	lian :36.00 Me	edian : 705		Bilinmeyen	: 786	2013	:1189	Median	: 15.00	Median	: 15.00	Median : 24.00
Mea	in :38.13 Me	ean :1117		Usb Modem	: 229	2012	: 275	Mean	40.63	Mean	: 40.63	Mean : 63.87
3rd	i Qu.:46.00 31	rd Qu.:1476		Tablet PC	: 17	2011	: 113	3rd Qu.	54.00	3rd Qu	.: 54.00	3rd Qu.: 82.00
Max	t. :73.00 Ma	ax. :2935		Modül	: 11	2010	: 77	Max.	:1049.00	Max.	:1049.00	Max. :1155.00
				(Other)	: 2	(Other)	: 40					
mmo_nonavea_dur	ration_07 mmt_av	<pre>/ea_count_07</pre>	mmt_avea_duratio	n_07 mmt_nona	vea_count	_07 mmt_n	onavea_dur	ation_07	call_dis	tinct_07	msmo_count_0	7 callcenter_count_07
Min. : 0	Min.	: 0.00	Min. : 0	Min. :	0.00	Min.	: 0		Min. :	0.00	Min. : 0	Min. : 0.0000
1st Qu.: 133	1st Qu	1.: 4.00	1st Qu.: 650	1st Qu.:	2.00	1st Q	u.: 815		1st Qu.:	6.00	1st Qu.: 1	1st Qu.: 0.0000
Median : 2782	Mediar	n : 23.00	Median : 3310	Median :	24.00	Media	n: 4564		Median :	23.00	Median : 15	Median : 0.0000
Mean : 10564	Mean	: 42.62	Mean : 10541	Mean :	63.87	Mean	: 8989		Mean :	30.23	Mean : 403	Mean : 0.9441
3rd Qu.: 13610	3rd Qu	1.: 59.00	3rd Qu.: 10469	3rd Qu.:	82.00	3rd Q	u.: 11735		3rd Qu.:	44.00	3rd Qu.: 172	3rd Qu.: 1.0000
Max. :322551	Max.	:629.00	Max. :781720	Max. :	1155.00	Max.	:199968		Max. :	99.00	Max. :1644	Max. :26.0000
payment_07	unpaid_07	pay	ment_type_07 chur	n_2013_07								
0 :4156	Min. :0.0000	Mobil Tel	:3701 H:78	57								
20 : 708	1st Qu.:0.0000	Akıllı Te	lefon:3254 E: 1	43								
10 : 434	Median :0.0000	Bilinmeye	n :786									
30 : 302	Mean :0.2021	Usb Modem	: 229									
25 : 154	3rd Qu.:0.0000	Tablet PC	: 17									
40 : 120	Max. :2.0000	Modül	: 11									
(Other):2126		(Other)	: 2									

Figure 4. Overview of the data set

#### C.DATA CLEANING

Data cleaning is the most critical and time-consuming step in the data mining process. There are missing values and outliers in the data set. Various existing packages can be used in R program to determine and analyze missing values. In this study, the missing data are obtained by using mice package, which has various predefined expectation algorithms [11]. Outlier values were solved by the boxing method.

#### D.MODELLING AND ASSESSMENT

The next step after data cleaning and transformation is the modeling step. Different models are tested on the dataset and the model with the highest accuracy is selected. In this study, a model was created using the C4.5 decision tree classification algorithm. Rpart [11], Rweka [12], Partykit [13], and Caret [14] packages were used to construct the model. To use these packages, they have to be called from the relevant library. After this, the data set is divided into two parts as training and test data. Dividing the data set into training and test data sets is important in terms of getting the best validation and learning outcomes. Methods such as k-fold cross validation, bootstrap and hold out are used to achieve this separation [15].

In this study, accuracy and error rate, diagnostic superiority ratio and f-measure were used as performance measures in addition to dividing training and test groups into different percentages for performance evaluation of decision tree and classification model. The measurement performance metrics used for performance evaluation will be briefly described in the subheading.

#### 1. Performance Metrics

Evaluation of the model created by classification algorithms is carried out by various methods. One of these methods is the confusion matrix [16]. The actual values and the values predicted by the classification algorithm are shown in Table 3. Performance evaluation criteria of classification algorithms are shown in Table 5 below [16-18].

		Actual Result							
		Yes	No	Toplam					
tesult	Yes	True Positive (tp)	False Positive (fp)	tPoz					
cted R	NoFalse Negative (fn)Tot alpoz		True Negative (tn)	tNeg					
Predi			neg	m					

Table 5. The Confusion Matrix

Accuracy of the model generated by the classification algorithms according to Table 5 is given by Eq. (1) [17].

$$Accuracy = \frac{d_p + d_n}{m} \tag{1}$$

The error rate equation is shown in Eq. (2) [17].

#### $Error Rate = 1 - Accuracy \tag{2}$

The supremacy of the predicted positive class is called the ratio of the negative class supremacy [94]. Equation (3) shows the diagnostic superiority ratio [17].

**Diagnostic Superiority Ratio** 
$$= \frac{LR+}{LR-}$$
 (3)

The F-measure equation is shown in Eq. (4) [17].

$$F - measure = \frac{2*PPV*TPR}{PPV+TPR}$$
(4)

The dataset is divided into two parts for training and testing of the proposed model. There are several methods to be used for this partitioning. In this study, holdout methods were used. In hold out method, the test and training data sets are separated with a specific ratio. Hold out separations used in the study are shown in Figure 5.



Figure 5. Test and training set separation with the hold out method.

#### 2. C4.5 Decision Tree Algorithm Application

In this section, applying C4.5 decision tree method which is one of the classification methods is given. The libraries of Rpart, Rweka, Partykit and Caret packages mentioned in the previous section must be installed and called. Figure 6 shows the installation and call of the corresponding libraries.

```
#Upload libraries
install.packages("rpart")
install.packages("Rweka")
install.packages("partykit")
install.packages("caret")
install.packages("ROCR")
#Invoking libraries
library(rpart)
library(RWeka)
library(partykit)
library(caret)
library(ROCR)
```

Figure 6. Library installation and call

Figure 7 shows the 60% training and 40% test set separations. The operation codes shown in Figure 7 are also used for separations at different percentages. The performance measurement by changing the percentages is called as the hold out method.

```
#Random Separation of Training and Test Set
set.seed(2016)
randomayir60 <- createDataPartition(y = aveamice7c45$churn_2013_07, p = .60, list = FALSE)
trainSET60 <- mice7c45[randomayir60,]
testSET60 <- mice7c45[-randomayir60,]</pre>
```



The codes for decision tree model, the overview of the model and the graphical visualization of the tree are shown in Figure 8 respectively.

```
#Creation of model with training set
DT_model60 <-J48(churn_2013_07~., data=trainSET60)
print(DT_model60)
summary(DT_model60)
plot(DT_model60)</pre>
```

Figure 8. Setting up the model with the training set

Figure 9 shows a screenshot of the tree generated by the C4.5 decision tree algorithm seen in Figure 7. It is unlikely to print the model by looking at the tree pattern. Figure 10 shows a screenshot of the separation obtained by printing the tree.



Figure 9. Image of the C4.5 tree



Figure 10. Print of the model and tree separation

A sample rule obtained from Figure 10: if age\_of\_line  $c \le 274$  and mmo\_non\_count\_07  $\le 24$  then E (customer churn).

#### V. CONCLUSION

As a result of the study, the training and test sets of the model are compared with 60%-40%, 75%-25% and 80%-20% divisions, respectively. Table 3 shows the criteria of accuracy, error, superiority and F-measure, which are performance evaluation criteria for these distinctions. In some studies, only the accuracy criterion is sufficient to compare the models generated by the classification algorithms. In addition to the accuracy; error, diagnostic odds ratio and F-measure are also included.

	Accuracy				DOR Error (Diagnostic Odds F-meas Ratio)						-measu	re
Hold Out Percentages	60	75	80	60	75	80	60	75	80	60	75	80
C4.5	0.978	0.977	0.981	0.021	0.022	0.018	40.59	38.88	77.54	0.989	0.988	0.990

Table 6. Accuracy, Error, Diagnostic odds ratio and F-measure values

In the study conducted on the customer dataset, C4.5 Decision of the customers with the decision tree was estimated. This work has been implemented on R program from open source data mining programs.

The performance criteria has achieved high performances in all holdout distinctions of the classification model established by C4.5 decision tree algorithm. Due to the fact that the decision tree is performing well with the nominal data types seen in previous studies. Since the purpose of this study is to carry out a sample work on R program, a more comprehensive study will be carried out by diversifying the classification algorithms in later studies.

This study was carried out to show the capabilities of R program needed for data mining processes. As seen in the tables in Section 3, the use of R has increased significantly in the last two years and does not lag behind the others.

The aim of the churn analysis which was the case study of the paper is to help the Customer Care Management stuff of the company to detect the possible churners. The results of the the classification model established by C4.5 decision tree algorithm shows that the churners can be detected with 0.977 to 0.981 accuracies. The next stage after detecting the possible churners, the company would offer attractive proposals to persuade these customers not to churn.

Telecommunications data set is used within the scope of the study. The missing data and outliers in the data set are resolved and prepared for processing with the help of the continuously evolving packages provided with the R program. A model, based on prediction with C4.5 decision tree algorithm was established as a result.

### VI. REFERENCES

[1] M. Dener, "Açık Kaynak Kodlu Veri Madenciliği Programları:WEKA'da Örnek Uygulama" presented at 11<sup>th</sup> Acad. Inform.Conf., 2009, Şanlıurfa, Turkey, 2009.

[2] M. Kaya, S. A. Özel, "Açık Kaynak Kodlu Veri Madenciliği Yazılımlarının Karşılaştırılması", presented 14<sup>th</sup> Acad. Inform. Conf., 2014, Mersin, Turkey, 2014.

[3] Ö. Yalçın, *Veri Madenciliği Yöntemleri*, 2<sup>nd</sup> Ed., Papatya Yayıncılık, 2013.

[4] J. Han, M. Kanber, *Data Mining: Concepts and Techniques*, Morgan Kaufmann, 2006.

[5] M. J. Berry, G.S. Linoff, *Mastering Data Mining*, John Wiley&Sons, New York, 2004.

[6] L. B. Ayre, *Data Mining For Information Professionals*, June, 2006.

[7] E. Alpaydın, Zeki Veri Madenciliği: Ham Veridan Altın Bilgiye Ulaşma Yöntemleri, 2000.

[8] Anonymous, *R* (12, December 2016) [Online]. Access: https://en.0wikipedia.org/index.php?q=aHR0cHM6Ly9lbi53aWtpcGVkaWEub3JnL3dpa2kvUl8ocHJ vZ3JhbW1pbmdfbGFuZ3VhZ2Up

P. Gregory, Top Analytics, Data Science Software – Kdnuggets Software Poll Results, [Online].
 Erişim: https://www.kdnuggets.com/2016/06/r-python-top-analytics-data-mining-data-science-software.html

[10] Anonymous, (05, January 2018) [Online]. Access: https://www.kdnuggets.com/2016/06/r-python-top-analytics-data-mining-data-science-software.html, 2018.

[11] T. Therneau, B. Atkinson, B. Ripley, (20, February 2017) *Rpart Packages*. [Online]. Access: https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/rpart/rpart.pdf. 2017.

[12] T. Hornik, C. Buchta, T. Hothorn, A. Karatzoglou, D. Meyer, A.Zeleis, (11, January 2016). *RWeka Packages*, [Online]. Access: https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/RWeka/RWeka.pdf, 2016.

[13] T. Horthon, A. Zeileis, (10, January 2016). *Partykit Packages*, [Online]. Access: https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/partykit/partykit.pdf, 2016.

[14] M. Kuhn, J. Wing, S. Weston, A. Williams, C. Keefer, A. Engelhardt, C. Candan, (2016, 12 November). *Caret: Classification and Regression Training*. [Online]. Access: https://cran.r-project.org/pub/R/web/packages/caret/caret.pdf, 2016.

[15] Ş. Özdemir, Eğitsel Veri Madenciliği Çalışması: Lise Öğrencilerinin Okula Devamlılık Durumlarının Öngörülmesi, R ile Veri Madenciliği (Balaban-Kartal), Çağlayan Kitabevi, 2016.

[16] N. Japkowicz, "Performance evaluation for learning algorithms," International Conference on Machine Learning, Edinburg, Scotland, 2012.

[17] M. Clark, "An Introduction to machine learning with Applications in R," Lecture Notes, University of Notre Dame, 2015.

[18] P. Flach, "The many faces of ROC analysis in machine learning," *ICML Tutorial*, 2004.