



ANADOLU
DİL VE EĞİTİM DERGİSİ
Anatolian Journal of Language and Education
(ANADEL/AJLE)

Geliş/Received: 27.02.2025 *Kabul/Accepted:* 30.06.2025
Makale Türü/Article Type: Araştırma / Research

Analysis of Keywords in Graduate Studies on Turkish and English Curricula

*Aslı MADEN**
*Abdulahap AVŞAR***
*Ayşenur ŞENTERZİ****

ABSTRACT

In the study titled Analysis of keywords in postgraduate studies on Turkish and English curricula, it was aimed to identify and compare the keywords in the studies on Turkish and English curricula. Qualitative research approach was preferred in the study and data were collected through document analysis. While scanning, the studies with curricula in their titles were taken into consideration. The data obtained from the research were subjected to content analysis. As a result of the research, a total of 42 postgraduate studies, 36 at master's level and 6 at doctoral level, were accessed about the Turkish curriculum. On the other hand, a total of 43 studies, 32 master's and 11 doctoral level studies, were accessed about English curriculum. There are 162 keywords in total, 105 of which are different, in the postgraduate studies on Turkish curricula. As a result, when the curricula in both mother tongues were examined, it was determined that the doctoral level studies on the English curriculum were more than the studies on the Turkish curriculum, and the keyword usage rates in the studies on both curricula were almost at the same level.

Keywords: Turkish curriculum, English curriculum, keyword and frequency.

Türkçe ve İngilizce Öğretim Programları ile İlgili Yapılan Lisansüstü Çalışmalarda Yer Alan Anahtar Kelimelerin Analizi

ÖZ

Bu çalışmada Türkçe Dersi Öğretim Programı ve İngilizce Dersi Öğretim Programı ile ilgili hazırlanan lisansüstü çalışmalarda yer alan anahtar kelimelerin tespit edilmesi ve karşılaştırılması amaçlanmıştır. Çalışmada nitel araştırma yöntemi tercih edilmiş ve veriler doküman analizi ile toplanmıştır. Tarama yapılırken adımda öğretim programları geçen çalışmalar ele alınmıştır. Araştırmadan elde edilen veriler içerik analizine tabi tutulmuştur. Araştırma sonucunda Türkçe Dersi Öğretim Programı ile ilgili 36 adet yüksek lisans, 6 adet doktora olmak üzere toplamda 42 adet lisansüstü teze erişilmiştir. İngilizce Dersi Öğretim Programı ile ilgili ise 32 adet yüksek lisans, 11 adet doktora düzeyinde olmak üzere toplamda 43 adet lisansüstü teze ulaşılmıştır. Türkçe öğretim programları ile ilgili yapılan lisansüstü tezlerde 105 tanesi farklı olmak üzere toplamda 162 anahtar kelime kullanılmıştır. İngilizce öğretim programları ile ilgili yapılan lisansüstü tezlerde ise 101'i farklı toplamda ise 154 anahtar kelime tespit edilmiştir. Sonuç olarak her iki öğretim programı

Atf Bilgisi: Maden, A., Avşar, A. & Şenterzi, A. (2025). Analysis of keywords in graduate studies on Turkish and English curricula. *Anadolu Dil ve Eğitim Dergisi*, 3(1), 27-40. Doi: <https://10.0.20.161/zenodo.15769812>

* Assoc Prof. Dr., Bayburt University, Faculty of Education, Department of Turkish Education, asmaden25@gmail.com, ORCID: 0000-0002-3336-0198.

** MSc, Bayburt University, Faculty of Education, Department of Turkish Education, vahapvsr@gmail.com, ORCID: 0000-0002-2290-8445.

***Independent Researcher, senterzi888@gmail.com, ORCID: 0009-0000-5380-6823.

incelendiğinde İngilizce Dersi Öğretim Programı ile ilgili yapılan doktora düzeyindeki tezlerin Türkçe Dersi Öğretim Programı ile ilgili yapılan doktora tezlerine göre daha fazla olduğu, her iki program ile ilgili yapılan çalışmalardaki anahtar kelime kullanım oranlarının hemen hemen aynı düzeyde olduğu sonucuna ulaşılmıştır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Türkçe öğretim programı, İngilizce öğretim programı, anahtar kelime ve sıklık.

Introduction

Throughout history and across the globe, human beings have always depended on communication to fulfil the fundamental aspects of life. This need has been met through the utilisation of both verbal and non-verbal means. Language is the indispensable tool of verbal communication and the most important element enabling people to communicate and maintain a sense of unity in social life. In the developing world, communication tools are undergoing rapid innovation and updating; nevertheless, the efficacy of language as a means of communication remains unparalleled. Effective communication and language use are vital to the maintenance of healthy social relationships. In her seminal study, İpek (2015) posited that the primary function of language is to facilitate communication between individuals within their respective societies, thereby distinguishing humans from other living organisms. The speaker placed particular emphasis on the assertion that language constitutes the most fundamental and efficacious means of communication. Communication is defined as the transfer of a feeling or intention from one mind to another, either directly or via a system of signs (İpek, 2015). Curricula may be defined as systematic, planned educational documents that contain the knowledge and skills included in a specific course and aim to provide students with this knowledge and these skills. In addition to ensuring standardisation in the education and training process, curricula also serve as a guide for teachers and textbook writers. In the process of devising curricula, a number of factors must be given full consideration. These include the developmental levels of students, the needs of society and contemporary educational approaches, methods and techniques. Curricula provided by the Ministry of National Education (MEB) cover the objectives, content, teaching methods and techniques, and assessment and evaluation processes of the relevant course (MEB, 2018). Furthermore, curricula are designed to ensure that students are prepared for a profession, higher education and life in accordance with their interests and abilities, having acquired the competencies delineated in the Turkish Qualifications Framework (MEB, 2024). The process of language acquisition commences irregularly from infancy and continues systematically through school age. The importance of a systematic education programme in facilitating the acquisition of a child's mother tongue or a foreign language in accordance with established rules cannot be overstated. Consequently, the systematic implementation of teaching in educational institutions is contingent upon a robust foundation of educational programmes. As posited by Kılıç (2003), the curriculum is conceived as a meticulously planned series of activities, meticulously designed to effect behavioural change in the desired direction in the individual. It may be concluded that curricula, which are instrumental in ensuring that the education process progresses in accordance with a specific system, exert a considerable influence on Turkish language teaching and English language teaching. The studies examining the curricula are of significant value in terms of identifying the advantages and disadvantages of the programmes.

In the contemporary context, the process of locating and accessing a study is relatively straightforward. However, it is imperative to acknowledge that this pursuit often results in the accumulation of a substantial amount of information. In this context, Sevim and İşcan (2012) emphasised that researchers must possess strong information literacy skills to efficiently navigate the vast quantities of data and identify the specific information they require. The effective utilisation of techniques facilitates the access to information that is suitable for the purpose when browsing scientific publications in the library or on the internet. It can be posited that the necessity for information and

knowledge has increased concomitantly with the transition from industrial society to the information society. In the information age, the ability to access, use and reproduce information efficiently, effectively and quickly has become more important than the mere storage or possession of information (Özel, 2014). From this standpoint, the importance of facile and expeditious access to information cannot be overstated. At this juncture, the incorporation of keywords that accurately reflect the content of the study will greatly facilitate the researcher's access to the desired information. Cin Şeker (2020) asserts that keywords are pivotal in identifying the subject area of a study and the manner in which it addresses the subject. The utilisation of keywords in scanning facilitates the identification and retrieval of relevant publications by researchers, thereby enabling effective study-related research. Consequently, the systematic implementation of teaching in educational institutions is contingent upon a robust foundation of educational programmes. As posited by Kılıç (2003), the curriculum is conceived as a meticulously planned series of activities, meticulously designed to effect behavioural change in the desired direction in the individual. It may be concluded that curricula, which are instrumental in ensuring that the education process progresses in accordance with a specific system, exert a considerable influence on Turkish language teaching and English language teaching. The studies examining the curricula are of great value in terms of identifying the advantages and disadvantages of the programmes.

Tatar and Tatar (2008) posit that keywords represent the most significant element in reflecting the content of studies, and that they facilitate the acquisition of a preliminary understanding of the scope of research in a relatively brief period. It is imperative that the keywords employed are of a high calibre and align with the content of the study. A review of the extant literature reveals that the Turkish Curriculum has been examined in areas such as enriching vocabulary (Maden, 2021), curriculum elements (Atik & Aykaç, 2017). As demonstrated in the works of Kocayığıt & Aykaç (2019), the habit of using a dictionary has been identified as a contributing factor (Maden & Demir, 2019). Furthermore, the selection of genre and theme has been found to be a crucial element in the process (Şahin & Bayramoğlu, 2016). The outcomes of speaking have been examined by Kavruk & Yıldırım (2021), with a focus on methods and techniques (Maden, 2022). Finally, Sallabaş & Dağ (2020) have explored the significance of values education in this context. The English curriculum has been examined in a number of areas, including the EISNER Model (Çelik & Filiz, 2018), listening and speaking skills (Özüdoğru, 2017), multiculturalism (Üzülmez & Karakuş, 2018) and geography topics (İnce, 2019). In today's environment, the process of finding and accessing work is relatively easy. However, it is imperative to recognise that this search often results in a significant amount of information accumulation. In this context, Sevim and İşcan (2012) emphasised that researchers need to have strong information literacy skills to effectively navigate large amounts of data and identify specific information. A substantial body of research has been dedicated to the analysis of scientific publications. Cin Şeker (2020), for instance, examined the use of keywords in graduate theses prepared for listening and speaking skills. Çevik and Muzaffer (2021) conducted a study of the keywords of graduate theses prepared in the field of teaching Turkish as a foreign language. In a related study, Sevim and İşcan (2012) evaluated the keywords present in graduate theses, while Tatar and Tatar (2008) examined the use of keywords in articles published in the fields of science and mathematics education. Despite the plethora of studies grounded in keyword analysis that are extant in the literature, there is an absence of research that focuses on the utilisation of keywords in the context of curricula, which serve as the fundamental cornerstone of education and training. In the contemporary world, foreign language learning has gained great importance in tandem with mother tongue education in the context of global developments. From this standpoint, given the absence of extant studies in the literature on the keywords of graduate theses prepared for Turkish and English curricula, it is predicted that this study will make a significant contribution to the field.

Purpose of the Study

In the contemporary world, which is undergoing rapid development and change, educational programmes, which occupy a central position in the teaching process, are also subject to change and updating. Research on the development and revision of curricula has the potential to facilitate the work of curriculum designers and educators engaged in the education and training process. The present study was conducted with the objective of examining the frequency of keyword usage in graduate theses on Turkish and English curricula. This approach will facilitate the identification of subjects that are the focus of study, the concepts that are prioritised, and the domains in which new research is required. Furthermore, a comparison of postgraduate theses addressing both programmes will elucidate the parallels and divergences in the studies conducted in associated domains. In accordance with the objective of the study, responses to the following inquiries were sought:

1. How are the number and frequency of keywords used in graduate theses on Turkish Curriculum and English Curriculum?
2. What are the common keywords in the postgraduate theses on Turkish Curriculum and English Curriculum?

Method

Research Model

This study utilised document analysis, a qualitative research method, with the objective of ascertaining the frequency of keyword utilisation in graduate studies across Turkish and English curricula. Document analysis is defined as the process of examining written materials that contain information about events or phenomena that are the subject of research. As Şimşek (2009) asserts, documents represent a crucial repository of information, which must be utilised effectively within the context of qualitative research. Neuman's definition of qualitative research is as follows: In qualitative research, the deterministic approach is not a priority, and definitive cause-effect relationships are not established between events. In lieu of numerical data and statistics, verbal narratives and in-depth qualitative analysis are given precedence. This research method involves the evaluation and analysis of events and contexts in their own natural language. The approach under scrutiny here is one which does not attempt to distance itself from the value system in which the problems under discussion exist; rather, it focuses on interpreting and making sense of the network of relationships that dominate situations in their natural environment (Karataş, 2015).

Data Collection and Analysis

The studies included in the research were collected from the Council of Higher Education (YÖK) Thesis Center. In the course of data collection, the study exclusively encompassed theses bearing curricula in their titles and those prepared until 2023. The data collected from the data source underwent a process of classification and content analysis. As posited by Yıldırım and Şimşek (2021), content analysis can be defined as the conceptualisation of data, the identification and interpretation of relationships between concepts through themes. The collected data were grouped under two headings: An examination and interpretation of the frequency of keyword usage was conducted in the context of both English curriculum studies and Turkish curriculum studies.

Reliability of the Research

In order to ensure the reliability of the research, the opinions of two field experts were taken into consideration and calculated according to the formula proposed by Miles and Huberman (1994), which states that reliability is to be calculated as $\text{consensus}/(\text{consensus} + \text{disagreement}) \times 100$. The reliability of the study was determined to be 88%, as indicated by the results of the calculation. The

calculation yielded a result that exceeded 70%, thereby substantiating the reliability of the research, as corroborated by Miles and Huberman (1994).

Findings and Interpretation

The findings obtained within the scope of the research are presented in this section.

The frequency of use of keywords employed in graduate theses related to the Turkish Curriculum is presented in Table 1:

Table 1. Frequency of use of keywords used in Turkish Curriculum studies

No	Keywords	Frequency of Use
1	Turkish Language Curriculum	23
2	Textbook	10
3	Turkish Textbook	6
4	Curriculum	5
5	Turkish Course	4
6	Theme	4
7	Language	3
8	Teacher Opinions	3
9	Turkish	2
10	Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language	2
11	Child	2
12	Creative Thinking	2
13	Values Education	2
14	Mother Tongue	2
15	Turkish Curriculum for Primary Education	2
16	Text Analysis	1
17	Eisner's Educational Criticism Model	1
18	2019 Turkish Language Curriculum	1
19	Curriculum Evaluation	1
20	Turkish Course Curriculum for Middle School	1
21	Critical Thinking Skill	1
22	Middle School	1
23	Thinking	1
24	Communication	1
25	Cooperative Learning	1
26	Learning Motivation	1
27	Attitude	1
28	Retention	1
29	Foreign National Primary School Students	1
30	Teaching Turkish as a Second Language	1
31	Curriculum Design	1
32	Program Design for Teaching Turkish as a Second Language	1
33	Language for Specific Purposes	1
34	Needs Analysis	1

No	Keywords	Frequency of Use
35	Curriculum Development	1
36	Mastery Learning Model	1
37	Multiple Holistic Approach	1
38	Meta-Analysis	1
39	Meta-Thematic Analysis	1
40	Course Program	1
41	Turkish Teaching Set	1
42	Primary School	1
43	Critical Reading	1
44	Message	1
45	Scientific Novel	1
46	Fictional Novel	1
47	Text Types	1
48	Turkish Course Book	1
49	Value	1
50	Haldun Taner	1
51	Teaching Process	1
52	Case Study	1
53	Education Information Network (EBA)	1
54	FATİH Project	1
55	Student	1
56	Teacher	1
57	Grammar Teaching	1
58	Teacher's Guidebook	1
59	Student Workbook	1
60	Education Information Network	1
61	Turkology	1
62	CEFR (Common European Framework of Reference for Languages)	1
63	Curriculum Evaluation	1
64	CIPP Model (Context, Input, Process, Product)	1
65	Algeria	1
66	Aesthetics	1
67	Beauty	1
68	Poetry	1
69	Constructivism	1
70	Süreyya Berfe	1
71	Beyond the Horizon	1
72	Emotions	1
73	Word	1
74	Vocabulary	1
75	Method-Technique	1
76	Turkish Curriculum and Turkish Textbook	1

No	Keywords	Frequency of Use
77	Word Teaching Techniques	1
78	SBS (Placement Exam)	1
79	TEOG Exam	1
80	Vocabulary Enriching Objectives	1
81	Reşat Nuri Güntekin	1
82	100 Essential Works	1
83	Themes in the Turkish Curriculum	1
84	Reading Outcomes	1
85	Reading Comprehension	1
86	Vocational Training Center	1
87	Mother Tongue Education	1
88	Turkish Language Program	1
89	Reading Area Outcomes	1
90	Reading Skill	1
91	Turkish Folklore Studies	1
92	Tale	1
93	Turkish Curriculum for Second Level of Primary Education	1
94	Text	1
95	Comprehensibility	1
96	Language Errors and Expression Disorders	1
97	6th and 7th Grade Turkish Textbooks	1
98	New Turkish Language Curriculum	1
99	Love and Awareness of Language	1
100	Learning Areas	1
101	Group Teaching Methods	1
102	Elementary School	1
103	Constructivist Teaching Approach	1
104	Basic Skills	1
105	CIPP Model	1
	Total	162

An analysis of Table 1 reveals that a total of 162 keywords, including 105 distinct ones, were employed in postgraduate theses on the Turkish Curriculum. The most frequently used keywords are Turkish Curriculum and Textbook. It was also determined that the keywords used consisted of between one and seven words.

The frequencies of the keywords employed in the postgraduate theses on the English Language Teaching Program are presented in Table 2:

Table 2. Frequency of use of keywords used in English Language Teaching Program studies

No	Keywords	Frequency of Use
1	Program Evaluation	19
2	English Language Curriculum	15
3	Curriculum Development	3

No	Keywords	Frequency of Use
4	Teacher Opinions	3
5	Foreign Language Teaching	3
6	Early Age Language Teaching	2
7	Common European Framework of Reference for Languages (CEFR)	2
8	Student Perceptions	2
9	Teacher Perceptions	2
10	Curriculum Implementation	2
11	English Teachers	2
12	Mixed Method Research	2
13	Foreign Language Education	2
14	2nd Grade English Course	2
15	Eisner's Educational Criticism Model	2
16	English Course	2
17	English Language Teaching Program	2
18	Curriculum Commitment	2
19	CEFR (European Framework)	2
20	English Language Teaching	2
21	Learning Outcomes	1
22	Secondary School Prep English Curriculum	1
23	Revised Bloom's Taxonomy	1
24	ADOÇEP	1
25	9th Grade	1
26	Curriculum Application	1
27	Teacher	1
28	Curriculum Expert	1
29	Middle School English Language Curriculum	1
30	Stake's Congruence-Contingency Model	1
31	Vocational and Technical Anatolian High School	1
32	Evaluation	1
33	Educational Program	1
34	Curriculum	1
35	Primary School 2nd Grade English Curriculum	1
36	Curricula	1
37	English Language Curricula	1
38	Curriculum Revision	1
39	Primary Education	1
40	English	1
41	Bloom's Taxonomy	1
42	Knowledge Dimension	1
43	Cognitive Process Dimension	1
44	2nd Grade English Curriculum	1
45	Stufflebeam's CIPP Model (Context, Input, Process, Product)	1
46	Universal Design for Learning	1
47	English Curriculum	1

No	Keywords	Frequency of Use
48	English Curriculum Focused on Foreign Languages	1
49	Basic Language Skills	1
50	Stake's Congruence Model	1
51	Foreign Language-Focused Education	1
52	Illuminative Model Program Evaluation	1
53	4+4+4 Education System	1
54	Second Grade English Curriculum	1
55	Vocational High School	1
56	Foreign Language	1
57	5th Grade English Curriculum (2017)	1
58	Educational Criticism Model	1
59	Methods and Techniques	1
60	Measurement Tools	1
61	TEOG (Transition to High School Exam)	1
62	Revised Bloom's Taxonomy	1
63	Curriculum Alignment	1
64	Primary School English Curriculum	1
65	Annual Unit Plan	1
66	7th Grade English Course	1
67	CIPP Model	1
68	Value	1
69	Values Education	1
70	English Language Teachers	1
71	Curriculum	1
72	Middle School English Language Curriculum	1
73	FATİH Project	1
74	EBA English	1
75	Material Evaluation	1
76	Hammond's Cube Model	1
77	TEOG Exam	1
78	Curriculum Compatibility	1
79	Primary School 2nd Grade English Curriculum	1
80	CEFR – Common European Framework	1

No	Keywords	Frequency of Use
81	Illuminative Evaluation Model	1
82	Participant-Focused Program Evaluation	1
83	Stufflebeam's CIPP Model (Context-Input-Process-Product)	1
84	7th Grade English Curriculum	1
85	9th Grade of Secondary Education	1
86	3rd Grade Middle School English Curriculum	1
87	Teaching English to Children	1
88	Primary School English Language Curriculum	1
89	Affective Objectives	1
90	Student-Centered Teaching	1
91	Teacher-Centered Teaching	1
92	Primary School English Curriculum	1
93	Textbook Evaluation	1
94	Anatolian High Schools	1
95	6th Grade English Curriculum	1
96	European Language Portfolio	1
97	New English Language Curriculum	1
98	Constructivism	1
99	Learner-Centeredness	1
100	Teaching Style	1
101	Curriculum Evaluation	1
Total		154

According to Table 2, a total of 154 keywords were used in graduate theses related to the English Language Curriculum, 101 of which were unique. The most frequently used keywords were *Program Evaluation* and *English Language Curriculum*. The keywords found in the studies varied in length, ranging from single-word to seven-word phrases.

The shared keywords that appear in graduate theses related to the Turkish Language Curriculum and the English Language Curriculum are presented in Table 3.

Table 3. Common Keywords Used in Graduate Theses on Turkish and English Language Curricula

Keyword	English <i>f</i>	Turkish <i>f</i>
Program Evaluation	19	1
Curriculum	1	5
Teacher Opinions	3	3
Curriculum Development	3	1
Curriculum Evaluation	1	1

Keyword	English <i>f</i>	Turkish <i>f</i>
Teacher	1	1
Values Education	1	2
Value	1	1
FATİH Project	1	1
Method-Technique	1	1
TEOG Exam	1	1
Primary Education	1	1
Constructivism	1	1
Total	35	20

In Table 3, it is observed that there are 13 common keywords mentioned in graduate theses on both the Turkish and English curricula. The term *curriculum evaluation* was found in 19 theses related to the English curriculum and in 1 thesis related to the Turkish curriculum. The term *curriculum* was mentioned once in theses concerning the English curriculum and five times in those related to the Turkish curriculum. The term *teacher views* appeared three times in theses in both fields. The term *curriculum development* was mentioned three times in English curriculum theses and once in Turkish curriculum theses. The terms *curriculum evaluation*, *teacher*, *value*, *Fatih Project*, *method-technique*, *TEOG Exam*, *primary education*, and *constructivism* were each mentioned once in theses from both domains. It was also determined that the term *values education* appeared once in theses related to the English curriculum and twice in those related to the Turkish curriculum.

Discussion, Conclusion and Suggestions

In this study, which examined the frequency of keyword usage in graduate theses related to the Turkish Language Curriculum and the English Language Curriculum, the following results were obtained:

- A total of 85 graduate theses related to the Turkish and English language curricula were accessed from the YÖK National Thesis Center.
- Of the 42 theses analyzed on the Turkish Language Curriculum, 36 were prepared at the master's level and 6 at the doctoral level.
- Of the 43 theses analyzed on the English Language Curriculum, 32 were prepared at the master's level and 11 at the doctoral level.
- It was found that 39 of the graduate theses on the Turkish Language Curriculum included keywords, while 3 did not.
- It was observed that 41 of the graduate theses on the English Language Curriculum included keywords, whereas 2 did not.
- In the graduate theses on the Turkish Language Curriculum, a total of 162 keywords were identified, with 105 of them being unique. In the English Language Curriculum theses, 154 keywords were found in total, 101 of which were unique.
- It was concluded that there are 13 common keywords used in graduate theses related to both the Turkish and English Language Curricula.

- The keywords used in the theses prepared on both curricula consist of a minimum of 1 and a maximum of 7 words, showing similarity in this respect.

It was found in the study that the keywords *program evaluation*, *curriculum*, *teacher views*, *curriculum development*, *curriculum assessment*, *teacher*, *values education*, *value*, *Fatih Project*, *method and technique*, *TEOG exam*, *primary education*, and *constructivism* were common in theses related to both the Turkish and English language curricula. This finding indicates that studies in both fields are shaped around similar conceptual frameworks. The prominence of the terms *program evaluation* and *curriculum* shows that the effectiveness of the curricula is being questioned. The inclusion of *teacher views* and *teacher* as shared concepts demonstrates that teachers are involved in the process. The presence of *values education* and *value* in both programs suggests that not only academic outcomes but also students' ethical and social development are emphasized. The shared focus on *constructivism* indicates that both curricula are designed with a student-centered and active learning approach. A review of the literature revealed that there is a lack of studies analyzing keywords in research related to Turkish and English curricula, and such studies remain limited in number. In a similar study by Tatar and Tatar (2008), the use of keywords in articles published in science and mathematics education was examined, and it was concluded that misconception studies were more prominent in science education, while studies on attitudes were more dominant in mathematics education. A study by Altunkaynak (2023), which analyzed research on the Turkish curriculum, showed similarity to the present study in terms of examining curricula. In another study conducted by Erdem et al. (2015), the keywords used in academic articles on teaching Turkish as a foreign language were examined, and it was concluded that studies in this area were insufficient. Unlike the present study, the number and frequency of keywords in that study were found to be low. Sevim and İşcan (2012) analyzed keywords in graduate theses related to Turkish education, and their findings on the number of keywords were similar to those of the current study.

In conclusion, the keywords of graduate theses addressing both English and Turkish curricula are diverse, reflecting the examination of various dimensions of the curricula. However, it was also determined that some concepts are either under-researched or not studied at all.

Based on these findings, the following recommendations are proposed:

1. While developments in each field continue, more direct studies should be conducted on constantly updated curricula to ensure the effectiveness of education.
2. Graduate theses should focus on under-researched areas such as digital literacy, assessment and evaluation, and cultural transfer, which were identified as lacking in current studies.

Araştırma ve Yayın Etiği

Bu çalışmada, Yükseköğretim Kurumları Bilimsel Araştırma ve Yayın Etiği Yönergesi'nde belirtilen tüm kurallara uyulmuştur. Yönergede *Bilimsel Araştırma ve Yayın Etiğine Aykırı Eylemler* başlığı altında açıklanan eylemlerden hiçbiri gerçekleştirilmemiştir.

References

Altunkaynak, M. (2023). Trends in research on the Turkish language course curriculum: A content analysis. *Journal of the Social Sciences Institute of Balıkesir University*, 26(50), 469–482.

- Atik, S., & Aykaç, N. (2017). An evaluation of the 2009 and 2015 Turkish language curricula in terms of curriculum components. *Ahi Evran University Journal of Kirsehir Faculty of Education*, 18(3), 586–607.
- Cin Şeker, Z. (2020). A descriptive analysis of keywords in articles published in the Journal of Mother Tongue Education. *Journal of Mother Tongue Education*, 8(3), 797–811.
- Çelik, K., & Filiz, S. B. (2018). Evaluation of the secondary school English language curriculum (2014) based on Eisner's model. *Journal of Educational and Social Research*, 5(1), 50–67.
- Çevik, A., & Muzaffer, N. (2021). A content analysis of keywords in MA theses on teaching Turkish as a foreign language. *International Journal of Contemporary Educational Research*, 7(2), 722–744.
- Erdem, M. D., Gün, M., Şengül, M., & Özkan, E. (2015). A content analysis of keywords in academic articles on teaching Turkish as a foreign language. *Ondokuz Mayıs University Journal of Education Faculty*, 34(1), 213–237.
- İnce, Z. (2019). The scope of geography topics in the 9th grade English curriculum and textbooks. *Journal of Innovative Research in Social Studies*, 2(2), 149–165.
- İpek, B. (2015). Language awareness in the individual. *Littera Turca: Journal of Turkish Language and Literature*, 1(2), 33–44.
- Karataş, Z. (2015). Qualitative research methods in social sciences. *Journal of Spiritual-Based Social Work Research*, 1(1), 62–80.
- Kavruk, H., & Yıldırım, N. (2021). Reflection of speaking outcomes in the Turkish language curriculum on secondary school textbooks (Grades 5–8). *International Journal of Languages' Education and Teaching*, 9(2), 159–174.
- Kılıç, D. (2003). Introduction to the teaching profession. Aktif Publishing.
- Kocayığıt, A., & Aykaç, N. (2019). An evaluation of the primary school Turkish curriculum in terms of curriculum components (1923–2017). *Mustafa Kemal University Journal of Social Sciences Institute*, 16(44), 251–279.
- Maden, A. (2021). The Turkish language curriculum in terms of enriching vocabulary. *International Journal of Turkish Literature Culture Education (TEKE)*, 10(2), 756–777.
- Maden, S. (2022). Turkish language curricula – Methods and techniques. Nobel Publishing.
- Maden, S., & Demir, R. (2019). Observations on dictionary usage habits in the middle school Turkish language curricula. *Mersin University Journal of the Faculty of Education*, 15(2), 419–436.
- Ministry of National Education (MEB). (2018). Turkish language course curriculum (Grades 1–8). Board of Education and Discipline.
- Ministry of National Education. (2024). Common text of the Türkiye Century Education Model curricula. <https://tymm.meb.gov.tr/ortak-metin>
- Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis: An expanded sourcebook* (2nd ed.). SAGE Publications.
- Özel, N. (2014). Information literacy skills and training needs of research assistants: The case of Ankara University. *Information World*, 15(2), 253–283.
- Özüdoğru, F. (2017). Teaching listening and speaking skills in the context of the 2nd grade English language curriculum. *Mehmet Akif Ersoy University Journal of the Faculty of Education*, (42), 189–210.
- Sallabaş, M. E., & Dağ, M. (2020). A comparative perspective on Turkish language curricula in terms of values education. *Ihya International Journal of Islamic Studies*, 6(2), 538–551.
- Sevim, O., & İşcan, A. (2012). A content analysis of keywords in MA theses in the field of Turkish language education and instruction. *Electronic Turkish Studies*, 7(1), 1863–1873.
- Şahin, D., & Bayramoğlu, C. D. (2016). Evaluation of the 2015 Turkish language curriculum in terms of text types and themes. *Turkish Studies*, 11(3), 2095–2130.

- Şimşek, H. (2009). Methodological problems in educational history research. *Ankara University Journal of Faculty of Educational Sciences*, 42(1), 33–51.
- Tatar, E., & Tatar, E. (2008). Analysis of science and mathematics education research I: Keywords. *İnönü University Journal of the Faculty of Education*, 9(16), 89–103.
- Üzülmez, Y. K., & Karakuş, F. (2018). A multiculturalism-oriented analysis of the middle school English curriculum and textbooks. *Turkish Studies*, 13(11).
- Yıldırım, A., & Şimşek, H. (2021). *Qualitative research methods in social sciences*. Seçkin Publishing.