

## **A Contrubition from Outside to the Field of New Ilm al-Kalam: Milasli Ismail Hakkı's Views**

Yeni İlm-i Kelâm'a Alan Dışı Bir Katkı: Milaslı İsmail Hakkı'nın Görüşleri

### **Resul ÖZTÜRK**

Prof. Dr., Atatürk Üniversitesi, İlahiyat Fakültesi, Kelam Anabilim Dalı  
Professor Dr., Atatürk University, Faculty of Theology, Department of Kalâm,  
Erzurum / Turkey  
resulozturk65@hotmail.com

ORCID ID: [orcid.org/0000-0001-5307-0772](https://orcid.org/0000-0001-5307-0772)

### **Makale Bilgisi | Article Information**

**Makale Türü / Article Type:** Araştırma Makalesi / Research Article

**Geliş Tarihi / Date Received:** 02 Nisan / April 2018

**Kabul Tarihi / Date Accepted:** 19 Mayıs / May 2018

**Yayın Tarihi / Date Published:** 30 Haziran / June 2018

**Yayın Sezonu / Pub Date Season:** Haziran / June

**DOI:** 10.29288/ilted.381446

**Atıf / Citation:** Öztürk, Resul. "A Contrubition from Outside to the Field of New Ilm al-Kalam: Milasli Ismail Hakkı's Views / Yeni İlm-i Kelâm'a Alan Dışı Bir Katkı: Milaslı İsmail Hakkı'nın Görüşleri". *ilted: ilabiyat tetkikleri dergisi / journal of ilabiyat researches* 49 (Haziran / June 2018/1): 105-130. doi: 10.29288/ilted.412045

**İntihal:** Bu makale, iThenticate yazılımınca taranmıştır. İntihal tespit edilmemiştir.

**Plagiarism:** This article has been scanned by iThenticate. No plagiarism detected.

web: <http://dergipark.gov.tr/ilted> | <mailto:ilabiyatdergi@atauni.edu.tr>

**Copyright** © Published by Atatürk Üniversitesi, İlahiyat Fakültesi /  
Ataturk University, Faculty of Theology, Erzurum, 25240 Turkey.

Bütün hakları saklıdır. / All right reserved.



## Abstract

Since the end of the 19<sup>th</sup> century, especially in Kalam, innovations in various fields of Islamic thought have been looked for. Discussions about the method and contents of the Kalam have made the necessity of this renewal of the Kalam. Some translations from Western languages and some works contain information contrary to Islam. As a result, Islam has to be re-expressed. For this purpose, it is inevitable to use a new language and method and to benefit from the possibilities of philosophy in this field. The Kalam had to rely on the new philosophy and its methods in order to be able to repel the attacks directed at the religious belief. Therefore, "New Kalam" movement was born and İzmirli İsmail Hakkı was the pioneer of this movement. In this approach, many topics such as religious-state relations, secularism, human rights, women's issues, racism, alienation, international security crisis, colonialism, hunger, belief and freedom of thought, which are all discussed in today's world, have entered into the scope of Kalam.

The fact that Kalam is a science based on human interpretation proves that everyone it is open to everyone who has the quality. In this context, it is worth noting that Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı, who was a medical doctor, finds this courage in himself and responds by writing a book to the questions of the Anglican Church. His work is important for showing different approaches. He has demonstrated a Koranic approach without using classical Kalam sources. The relationship between faith and religion, approach to different religions and the importance that Islam gives rise to science are the main themes of his. It is especially worthwhile of him to study the wisdom of worship, psychological and moral dimensions.\*

**Keywords:** Kalam, New Kalam, Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı, Koran, human, innate (natural disposition).

## Öz

XIX. yüzyılın sonlarından itibaren, başta Kelâm olmak üzere İslâm düşüncesinin çeşitli alanlarında yenilik arayışlarına gidilmiştir. Kelâm ilminin metot ve içeriği hakkındaki tartışmalar bu ilmin yenilenmesindeki gerekliliği iyice belirginleştirmiştir. Batı dillerinden yapılan bazı tercümelemler ve bu tercümelemler paralelinde yazılan eserlerin İslâm'a zıt bilgiler içermesinin sonucu olarak, İslâm'ı yeniden ifade etmenin gerekliliğini ortaya çıkarmıştır. Bu amaçla yeni bir dil ve metot kullanmak ve bu alanda felsefenin imkânlarından istifade etmek kaçınılmaz olmuştur. Kelâm ilminin dine yöneltilen saldırıları püskürtülebilmesi için yeni felsefeden ve onun metotlarından istifade etmesi gerekli idi. Böylece öncülüğünü İzmirli İsmail Hakkı'nın yaptığı "Yeni İlm-i Kelâm" hareketi doğmuştur. Bu yaklaşımda Kelâm'ın konularına günümüz dünyasında tartışılan din-devlet ilişkileri, sekülerizm, insan hakları, kadın sorunu, ırkçılık, sömürgecilik, açlık, inanç ve düşünce hürriyeti gibi pek çok konu girmiştir.

Kelâmın insan yorumuna dayanan bir ilim olması bu ilmin yorumunun donanım sahibi herkese açık olduğunu göstermektedir. Bu bağlamda tabip olan Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı'nın kendisinde bu cesareti bulması ve Anglican Kilisesinin sorularına bir kitap yazarak cevap vermesi kayda değerdir. Onun eseri farklı yaklaşımlar göstermesi bakımından önemlidir. O, Klasik Kelâm kaynaklarını kullanmadan Kur'an merkezli bir yaklaşım sergilemiştir. İslâm'ın fitriliği, iman-amel ilişkisi, farklı dinlere yaklaşım ve İslâm'ın ilme verdiği önem onun temel konularındandır. Özellikle ibadetlerin hikmetleri, psikolojik ve ahlaki boyutlarını incelemesi kayda değerdir.

**Anahtar kelimeler:** Kelâm, Yeni İlm-i Kelâm, Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı, Kur'an, insan.

\* Note: The name of the book / article / paper in the bibliographical information in the footnote is written in original form and given in English in square brackets.

## INTRODUCTION

The changes in Ottoman Empire, which started with the Tanzimat Reform Era, brought with them great changes in the world view of Islam society. The life plan of a culture community which continued beginning with the Tanzimat Era was given up and instead of that a much more different life plan that is contrary to the previous one in many aspects was adopted. Late 19<sup>th</sup> century is a period in which the movements of modernization and Westernization peaked in Ottomans. In this period a positivist understanding of science was met with approval by some intellectuals and was considered as the only truth. Within this context, being charmed by an intellectual search which is in the forms of East-West, Islam-Science synthesis, Late Ottoman intellectuals started a process of re-questioning the methods and context of Islamic Sciences. By this, they showed different approaches in interpreting the basic texts (Nass) in Islam. Intellectuals that are known as Pro-Western were influenced by various movements and by accepting the data of positive sciences as the ultimate truth, they defended the idea of accepting them immediately. They started to claim that religious conservatism causes Muslims to recede.<sup>1</sup> While questioning the underdevelopment of Muslims generally Muslims were regarded as responsible. It was presented as another reason of underdevelopment that Muslims followed Western civilizations step by step and instead of Allah's name, they mentioned the names of their Sultans and emirs.<sup>2</sup> It is seen that the general characteristics of the different Islam understandings which came to existence at that time, were constructed by the ideas of either the necessity to turn back to the "pure and real Islam" or "approaching Quran in a way independent from the other sources" as the basic source.

The attacks of denialist materialist movements were directed to the fundamental belief principles and to revelation, which is the foundation of religion.<sup>3</sup> These attacks, since the late 19<sup>th</sup> century, Kalam being in the first place, triggered a search for renewal in Islamic thought and Islamic sciences. The necessity that the science of Kalam had to be renewed swiftly became a current issue for the Islamic scholars. The renewal of the science of Kalam made it necessary to change its means. The "New *Ibn-i Kalam*" discussions of the recent scholars caused a new discourse to come to the fore.<sup>4</sup> It was inevitable for Kalam, which was in the position of understanding and

- 
- 1 M. Sait Özervarlı, *Kelâmda Yenilik Arayışları (XIX. Yüzyıl Sonu -XX. Yüzyıl Başı)* [Search for Renewal in Kalam (Late 19<sup>th</sup> Century – Early 20<sup>th</sup> Century)] (İstanbul: İSAM Pub., 1998), 37 vd.; İsmail Bulut, *Nübüvve Çığdaş Bir Yaklaşım – Muhammed Ferid Vecdi-* [A Contemporary Approach to Prophecy – Muhammed Ferid Vecdi-] (Ankara: Berikan Pub., 2016), 27.
  - 2 Abdülaziz Çavuş, *Anglikan Kilisesine Cevap* [Answer to the Anglican Church], translated by Mehmet Akif, ed. Süleyman Ateş (Ankara: Directorate of Religious Affairs Pub., 1979), 37.
  - 3 Resul Öztürk, *Yeni İlm-i Kelâm Hareketi ve Mehmed Vehbi Efendi* [The New İlm al-Kalam Movement and Mehmed Vehbi Efendi] (Erzurum: Eğitim Pub., 2014), 4.
  - 4 M. Sait Özervarlı, "Osmanlı Kelâm Geleneğinden Nasıl Yararlanabiliriz" [How Can We Benefit from Ottoman Kalam Tradition], *Dünden Bugüne Osmanlı Araştırmaları, Tespitler-Problemler-Teklifler* [Ottoman Researches from Past to Present, Determinations-Problems-Suggestions] (İstanbul: İSAM Pub., 2007), 211; M. Sait Özervarlı,

defending the belief principles of Islam, to understand the effective movements of the time and to defend Islam against them. Within this context, the basic idea to be defended was the fact that the science and philosophy understanding of the time when the science of Kalam came into existence and today's science and philosophy understanding differentiated. Theoretical sciences have now been replaced by experimental sciences, and the philosophy was replaced by materialist and positivist philosophical movements, in other words, Greek philosophy gave its place to modern Western Philosophy.<sup>5</sup> In today's world, a great many topics have been incorporated into the topics of science of Kalam such as the much-discussed religion-state relations, secularism, human rights, women's problems, racism, colonialism, hunger, freedom of belief and thought.<sup>6</sup> Besides, the hidden causes, psychological and moral aspects of worships have also been included in the topics of science of Kalam, as well.<sup>7</sup>

## 1. THE NEW ILM AL-KALAM MOVEMENT

It was in almost all the scholars' agenda of Late Ottoman Period that it was necessary to renew the science of Kalam. It was widely accepted, by almost everyone, that the present Kalam had lost its scholarly value and accordingly it had to be written again according to the requirements of the day.<sup>8</sup> This desired science of Kalam was started to be called as "the New Ilm al-Kalam". The most significant determinant accelerating the search for renewal in the science of Kalam was that the primary –non-Muslim– respondents of this science had changed their methods. The outer factors in the construction process of the science of Kalam had undergone great changes. This situation made firm the necessity for Muslims to change their present systems.<sup>9</sup> It became unavoidable for the science of Kalam, which has benefited from the evidence and the methods of philosophy throughout the intellectual history,

"Son Dönem Osmanlı Düşüncesinde Arayışlar: Mehmed Şerafeddin'in İctimâi İlm-i Kelâmı" [Searches in Late Ottoman Ideology: Mehmed Şerafeddin's Conventional Science of Kalam], *İslâm Araştırmaları Dergisi* [Islamic Researches Journal] 3, 1999, 157-170; M. Sait Özervarlı, "Osmanlıların Son Dönemindeki Batılılaşma Hareketinin İslâm Düşüncesinde Yenilik Çabalarına Tesiri" [The Influence of Westernization Movement in Late Ottoman Period to the Efforts of Renewal in Islamic Thought], *Osmanlı Dünyasında Bilim ve Eğitim: Milletlerarası Kongresi (12-15 Nisan 1999)* [Science and Education in Ottoman World: International Congress (12-15 April 1999)], ed. Hidayet Yavuz Nuhoğlu (İstanbul: IRCICA, 2001), 663-673; Öztürk, *Yeni İlm-i Kelâm Hareketi* [The New Scientific Kalam Movement], 3.

5 İzmirlî İsmail Hakkı, *Yeni İlm-i Kelâm* [The New Ilm al-Kalam] (Ankara: Umran Pub., 1981), 56.

6 Ramazan Altıntaş, "Sosyal Kelâm'a Giriş: M. Şerafeddin Yaltkaya Örneği" [Introduction to Social Kalam: M. Şerafeddin Yaltkaya Sample], *Kelâmın İşlevselliği ve Günümüz Kelâm Problemleri* [The Functionality of Kalam and Contemporary Kalam Problems] (İzmir: İzmir İlahiyat Foundation Pub., 2000), 130.

7 Adnan Bülent Baloğlu, "Sebilürreşâd Dergisinde Yeni İlm-i Kelâm Tartışmaları" [The New Ilm al-Kalam Discussions in Sebilurresad Journal], *İzmirlî İsmail Hakkı Sempozyumu (24-25 Kasım 1995)* [İzmirlî İsmail Hakkı Symposium (24-25 November 1995)], prep. Mehmet Şeker – Adnan Bülent Baloğlu (Ankara: TDV Pub., 1996), 309.

8 Abdüllatif Harpûti, *Kelâm Tarihi* [The History of Kalam], ed. Muammer Esen (Ankara: Ankara School Pub., 2005), 17; Şerafettin Gölcük, *Kelâm Tarihi* [The History of Kalam] (Konya: Esra Pub., 1992), 275-276; Özervarlı, Mehmed Şerafeddin'in İctimâi İlm-i Kelâmı" [Mehmed Şerafeddin's Conventional Science of Kalam], 160.

9 Hilmi Karaağaç, *Hasan Hanefî'nin Kelâm İlmini Yenileme Projesi* [Hasan Hanefî's Project of Renewing the Science of Kalam] (Doctoral Thesis, Ankara University, 2008), 11.

to benefit from the new philosophy's and its own methods and to change its methods in order to be able to get rid of every kind of attack directed at religion.<sup>10</sup> This situation is actually a compulsory result of the fact that science of Kalam is a dynamic science.<sup>11</sup>

The works compiled within the frame of new Kalam movement are actually works that have an experimental quality written by taking into consideration the needs of the time and modernizing Muslim society. The basic characteristics of these works, which claim to renew the science of Kalam, are their being attentive to be simple and comprehensible by taking the data of the contemporary disciplines such as psychology and sociology and their abstaining from classical debates and discussions.<sup>12</sup>

### 1.1. The Basic Characteristic of the New İlm al-Kalam Movement

The prominent representatives of the New İlm al-Kalam movement compiled new works of Kalam with the aim of setting a model for the renewal movement they started and of encouraging the necessary works to be done in this direction. The most significant characteristics seen in these works are search for answers to the belief problems of society,<sup>13</sup> trying not to enter into discussions about sects,<sup>14</sup> the trial to establish a dialogue with the Modern Western Philosophy<sup>15</sup> and the redefinition of the science of Kalam.<sup>16</sup> We can array the most significant characteristics of the works written with the assertion of the New İlm al-Kalam as follows:

- 
- 10 İzmirli İsmail Hakkı, *Yeni İlm-i Kelâm [The New İlm al-Kalam]*, 3-4; Altıntaş, "Sosyal Kelâm'a Giriş" [Introduction to Social Kalam], 129; Ramazan Altıntaş, "Yeni Bir Kelâm: Vahidüddin Hân Örneği" [A New Kalam: Vahidüddin Hân Sample], *Cumhuriyet Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi [Cumhuriyet University Faculty of Theology Journal]* 7/1 (2003): 119; İzmirli İsmail Hakkı, *Muhassalu'l-Kelâm [Muhassal al-Kalam]* (İstanbul: Evkâf-ı İslâmiye Pub., 1336), 13-14; Adnan Bülent Baloğlu, "İzmirli İsmail Hakkı'nın 'Yeni İlm-i Kelâm' Anlayışı" [İzmirli İsmail Hakkı's Understanding of the New İlm al-Kalam], *İzmirli İsmail Hakkı Sempozyumu (24-25 Kasım 1995) [İzmirli İsmail Hakkı Symposium (24-25 November 1995)]*, prep. Mehmet Şeker – Adnan Bülent Baloğlu (Ankara: TDV Pub., 1996), 99.
  - 11 Nayed Aref Ali, "İkbal ve Kelâm İlminin Yeniden İnşası" [Ikbal and the Reconstruction of the Science of Kalam], *Uluslararası Muhammed İkbal Sempozyumu Bildirileri (İstanbul, 1-2 Aralık 1995) [International Muhammed İkbal Symposium Papers (İstanbul, 1-2 December 1995)]* (İstanbul: İ.B.B. Office of Cultural Affairs Pub., 1997), 200.
  - 12 Özerverli, *Kelâmda Yenilik Arayışları [Search for Renewal in Kalam]*, 83.
  - 13 Baloğlu, "Yeni İlm-i Kelâm Tartışmaları" [The New İlm al-Kalam Discussions], 309.
  - 14 Baloğlu, "İzmirli İsmail Hakkı'nın 'Yeni İlm-i Kelâm' Anlayışı" [İzmirli İsmail Hakkı's The New İlm al-Kalam Understanding], 106; Baloğlu, "Yeni İlm-i Kelâm Tartışmaları" [The New İlm al-Kalam Discussions], 280.
  - 15 İzmirli İsmail Hakkı, *İslâm'da Felsefe Akımları [Philosophical Currents in İslam]*, ed. N. Ahmet Özalp (İstanbul: Kitabevi Pub., 1997), 43; İzmirli İsmail Hakkı, *Yeni İlm-i Kelâm [The New İlm al-Kalam]*, 1, 18-19, 94.
  - 16 Bekir Topaloğlu, *Kelâm Araştırmaları Üzerine Düşünceler [Opinions upon Kalam Researches]* (İstanbul: İFAV Pub., 2004), 5-6; İlyas Çelebi, "Kelâm İlminin Yeniden İnşasında İlke ve İçerik Sorunları" [Principle and Context Problems in the Reconstruction of the Science of Kalam], *Kelâmın İşlevselliği ve Günümüz Kelâm Problemleri [The Functionality of Kalam and Contemporary Kalam Problems]* (İzmir: İzmir İlahiyat Foundation Pub., 2000), 90; Öztürk, *Yeni İlm-i Kelâm Hareketi [The New İlm al-Kalam]*, 18-29.

### 1.1.1. The Emphasis of Kalam of Quran

In a time when the necessity of The New Ilm al-Kalam is discussed, what will be the content of Kalam has been one of the most basic topics. The main approach in the works which have been written within the frame of a new method and understanding in the last two centuries is “to turn back to the pure Islam” in the light of Quran and Authentic Sunnah by cleaning false belief, superstitions and bid’ah.<sup>17</sup> It is possible for the Islam world to be freed from the underdevelopment and recession only by turning back to Quran. The spirit of Quran is the foundation of Islam. For this reason the only guide must be Quran.<sup>18</sup> Like Shaikh Muhsin-i Fani az-Zahiri (Huseyin Kazim Kadri)<sup>19</sup>, the suggestion of Şerafeddin Gölcük, who is one of the Kalam scholarly of today, is in the direction of “Kalam of Quran”. According to Gölcük, the teachings of Quran must constitute 50% of Kalam; the History of Kalam must constitute 25% and the Classical Kalam topics must constitute not more than 25% of it.<sup>20</sup> In the Kalam works, written in that time, there can be observed a desire to develop a Quran-centered system. However, this couldn’t be realized.

### 1.1.2. The Efforts to Produce Human-Centered Kalam and Women’s Rights Topic

One of the most basic emphases in the New Kalam is human. While it is noted that it is necessary to reconsider the method and content of the science of Kalam, a human-centered Kalam is suggested. Topics such as human beings’ origin, historicalness, ability to develop a culture and based on that environment, population, economy, social differentiation etc. have been included in the topics of the contemporary Kalam.<sup>21</sup> Since then, human beings and saving their dignity has been one of the most important topics of Kalam. Because the atmosphere, in which the human dignity is saved, is an atmosphere where there is least economic, social, political and judicial exploitation. Environments, in which every kind of imbalance, injustice is seen, are not the foundations of societies that can produce believer people with spiritual richness.<sup>22</sup> About respecting human and the universal rights of human, these statements by Milasli İsmail Hakkı are quite meaningful: “Human was created in an esteemed condition and in the most beautiful form without any registration according to Islam. Therefore, any kind of behavior that may violate and insult either of others’

17 Baloğlu, “Yeni İlm-i Kelâm Tartışmaları” [The New Ilm al-Kalam Discussions], 265.

18 Şehmus Demir, *Kur’anın Temel Hedefi* [The Primary Objective of Quran] (Ankara: Fecr Pub., 2009), 102.

19 Shaikh Muhsin-i Fani az-Zahiri (Huseyin Kazim Kadri), in his criticism to İzmirli İsmail Hakkı’s the New İlm al-Kalam overemphasizes the necessity to take Quran as the base. See. Baloğlu, “Yeni İlm-i Kelâm Tartışmaları” [The New Ilm al-Kalam Discussions], 285.

20 Gölcük, *Kelâm Tarihi* [The History of Kalam], 276 et al.

21 Nadim Macit, Cumhuriyet Döneminde Kelâm İlmi ve Yöntem Sorunu” [The Science of Kalam in the Republic Period and Scientific Method Problem], *İslâmî İlimlerde Metodoloji/Usûl Meselesi I* [Methodology/Procedure Issue in Islamic Sciences I] (İstanbul: Ensar Pub., 2005), 328.

22 Gölcük, *Kelâm Tarihi* [The History of Kalam], 277-280.

honor or his own honor is forbidden.”<sup>23</sup> Islamic thinkers had also taken into consideration another practice which is against the human dignity, the topic of slavery. Milaslı İsmail Hakkı emphasized this topic, as well. With various social reasons like the imperative of war, he defended the fact that slavery was allowed in the early Islamic periods.<sup>24</sup>

One of the most fundamental problems to be addressed at that time was the “woman” issue. Topics such as woman-man equality, women’s distributive share, men’s having the authority to divorce were discussed more than ever in that era. The fact that all human beings are equal, all of them were created from a man and a woman, without discriminating for gender, color, race, and social status and that the liabilities of woman and man to Allah are equal and independent from each other have been put on excessive emphasis. The personality principle for belief and good character was reminded by advocating that one of the spouses’ being unbeliever or having a bad character cannot influence the other.<sup>25</sup> It was emphasized that women should be ensured for educational and judicial rights in order to be able to retrieve the prestige in the early Islamic period.<sup>26</sup>

In that time, there were made various evaluations on the topic of Muslim men’s or women’s getting married to Jewish or Christian women or men.<sup>27</sup> It is vital that Abdulaziz Çaviş (1876-1929) compares (11 pages) the rights and authorities granted to women by Islam with the approach to women in the older societies after explaining the creation of women, physiological and psychological differences with various examples (11 pages). Çaviş, who draws attention to the independence of women in religious suggestions and belief, puts forward the principles that determine the rights of women in topics such as property, inheritance and goods.<sup>28</sup> Milaslı İsmail Hakkı reminds that the punishment for unchastity that is proven with precise evidence is equal for both sides because the equality of women and men is complied with in Islam. According to him, man and woman are charged with working and acquiring a profession to make their living.<sup>29</sup>

23 Milaslı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-İslam]* (İstanbul: Hilal Pub., 1341), 107, As Allah is not only the “Lord of Muslims” but also the “Lord of Universes” it is a requirement of the religion to help human beings without considering their religions and sects. See. Milaslı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-İslam]*, 91.

24 Milaslı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-İslam]*, 105 et al.

25 Çelebi, “Kelâm İlminin Yeniden İnşasında İlke ve İçerik Sorunları” [Principle and Context Problems in the Reconstruction of the Science of Kalam], 95.

26 Ahmet Kanlıdere, “Musa Carullah” [Musa Carullah], *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslâm Ansiklopedisi [Turkish Religious Foundation Islam Encyclopedia]* (İstanbul: TDV Pub., 2006), 31: 215.

27 Abdülaziz Çaviş’s defending that a Muslim woman can get married to a Jewish or Christian man only with the condition of assuring religious freedom is significant. Çaviş, *Anglikan Kilisesine Cevap [Answer to the Anglican Church]*, 33.

28 See Çaviş, *Anglikan Kilisesine Cevap [Answer to the Anglican Church]*, 151-180. Çaviş’s having given room to the women topic for 30 pages can be evaluated as an example for that it is a fundamental topic in The New İlm al-Kalam.

29 Milaslı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-İslam]*, 130.

## 2. THE INFLUENCE OF THE ANGLICAN CHURCH IN THE NEW ILM AL KALAM DISCOURSE

Anglicanism is a sect which came into existence in England after the reform movement in 16<sup>th</sup> century. Since the reconstruction by Charles II. in 1660, the Anglican Church had the quality of being a church that is completely unique to England.<sup>30</sup> The word Anglican means, “of England, belonging to England”. Anglican was used as an adjective defining England and the Church of England. The English Church was also called “Ecclesia Anglicana”. Therefore, “the Anglican Church” and the English Church mean the same thing. The Anglican (English) Church is one of the churches with the most number of followers.<sup>31</sup>

The importance of the Anglican Church in this study is the dynamism brought by its questions. Questions were directed to the Ottoman Mashihat Institute (The Institution of Shaikh al-Islam) by the Anglican Church -the official church of England- to know about Islam in 1335 (1919). The Church asked for questions; *What is Islam religion? What is Islam (religion)? How does Islam contribute to reflection (thought) and life? What solutions does it offer to the problems of the age? What does it say about political and spiritual powers that change the world for the better of for the worse?* and wanted detailed answers to these questions up to fifty thousand words.<sup>32</sup> The Shaikh al-Islam Institution wanted to answer these questions asked by the Anglican Church and for this aim accepted İzmirli İsmail Hakkı’s work called *al-Cevab as-Saded fi-Beyani Deen at-Tawheed* as the answer to be given to the church. However, this answer couldn’t be given because of the collapse of Ottoman Empire. The work was later made published by Islamic taxes and Foundations Secretary of that time, Mehmed Vehbi Efendi in 1339 (1923).<sup>33</sup>

Mehmed Vehbi Efendi, also, offers Abdülaziz Çaviş (1876-1929)<sup>34</sup> to compile a work that would be easier to translate into other languages and be more compact, to be given as an answer to the Anglican Church. Abdülaziz Çaviş wrote his work called *al-Acwiba fil-Islam an-Esilat al-Ancilikiyyah* upon this suggestion. This study discusses, in general, what kind of innovations Islam brings along in terms of belief, worships, morals, politics, justice, scholarship and civilizations and especially what kind of rights Islam grants to women. By this, he draws a portrait of Islam. It was paid

30 Kürşat Demirci, “Hıristiyanlık” [Christianity], *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslâm Ansiklopedisi* [Turkish Religious Foundation Islam Encyclopedia] (İstanbul: TDV Pub., 1998), 17: 335-338.

31 Resul Çatalbaş, “Anglikan (İngiliz) Misyoner Teşkilatlar” [Anglican (English) Missionary Associations], *Bozok Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* [Bozok University Faculty of Theology Journal] 2/2 (2012): 121.

32 About these questions and answers See Zekeriya Akman, “Anglikan Kilisesi’nin Meşihat Kurumuna Soruları ve Bunlara Verilen Cevaplar” [The Questions of the Anglican Church to the Mashihat Institute and Answers Given to Them], *Hikmet Yurdu* [Hikmet Yurdu] 6 /11 (January-June 2013/1): 357-377.

33 İzmirli İsmail Hakkı, *el-Cevabu’s-Sedid fi Beyan-i Dini’t-Tevhid* [al-Cevab as-Saded fi-Beyani Deen at-Tawheed] (Ankara: Ali Şükrü Pub., 1339).

34 Muhammed Eroğlu, “Abdülaziz Çaviş” [Abdülaziz Çaviş], *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslâm Ansiklopedisi* [Turkish Religious Foundation Islam Encyclopedia] (İstanbul: TDV Pub., 1988), 1: 187-188.

attention in the work that without giving much room to details, there should be given a general idea about Islam. Çaviş wrote the book in Arabic. Before the work was published, it was serialized as some parts in the *Sebilurreşad* journal. Later this book was translated by Mehmet Akif and it was published in Istanbul in 1340 (1924).<sup>35</sup> Another work written with the aim of giving answers to the questions of the Anglican Church is *Haqiqat al-Islam* by Milaslı İsmail Hakkı.

### 3. EXAMINATION OF MILASLI ISMAIL HAKKI AND HIS WORK CALLED “HAQIQAT AL-ISLAM” IN TERMS OF THE NEW ILM AL-KALAM

#### 3.1. The Life of Milaslı İsmail Hakkı

Milaslı İsmail Hakkı was born in Milas district of Muğla in 1870. His father is Hacı Mehmet Bey. He completed his primary, secondary education and high school in Milas, Aydın and İzmir then by graduating from Mektebi Tıbbiye-i Mulkiye (Istanbul University Faculty of Medicine) in 1888, he became a medical doctor. After working as Municipality and State doctor in various places, he was appointed to the position of “The General Inspector of the General Administration of Health.”<sup>36</sup> Doctor Milaslı İsmail Hakkı, who worked as Beirut Health Inspector, Inspector of the General Administration of Health,<sup>37</sup> was the Head of General Administration of Health between 02.11.1920-02.09.1926. He got retired in 1929 when he was the Bitlis Director of Health. After his retirement, he continued writing books and died in Istanbul in 1938.<sup>38</sup>

Milaslı İsmail Hakkı, undertook active roles in the War of Independence, too. He made a speech which was against occupation in the famous meeting held in Sultanahmet Square in May 1919. He made a name for himself in his time either within the scope of alphabet discussions or of religious issues, and he was in a consensus with the Islamic thinkers of the time such as Manastırlı İsmail Hakkı, Babanzade Ahmed Naim and Ömer Ferit Kam. He wrote various articles about religion and scholarship in the journals called *Sırat-i Mustakim* and *Sebilurreşad*. Milaslı İsmail Hakkı was among the founders –who were 28 people- of the Hilal al-Ahdar (The Green Crescent), which is today called Yeşilay Cemiyeti (the Green Crescent Society) and was founded in 1920. Although we do not have a certain information about whether he took madrasah education or not, it is understood from the books<sup>39</sup>

35 Çaviş, *Anglikan Kilisesine Cevap* [Answer to the Anglican Church], 7.

36 T.R. Ministry of Health Album Department of Inspection Board Album, (Ankara), 22.

37 T.R. Ministry of Health Album Department of Inspection Board Album, 44.

38 Resul Çatalbaş, “Milaslı Dr. İsmail Hakkı'nın Hayatı, Eserleri ve İslâm ile İlgili Görüşleri” [Milaslı Dr. İsmail Hakkı's Life, Works and Views on İslam], *Artuklu Akademi / Journal of Artuklu Academia* 1 (2014): 100. It is a great absence not to have Milaslı İsmail Hakkı article in *Turkish Religious Foundation İslam Encyclopedia*.

39 The fact that he wrote his book *İslâm Dininde Etlerin Tezkiyesi* [The References of the Meats in İslam] in Arabic shows his proficiency in the Arabic language. This work was written in 1925 in Arabic with the name of *Tezki-yetü'l-luhûm fi'l-İslâm* and was published as a 22 paged booklet. By expanding this booklet, the author made it published in Turkish in 1933. See Milaslı İsmail Hakkı, *İslâm Dininde Etlerin Tezkiyesi* [The References of the Meats in İslam] (İstanbul: Ahmet Sait Pub., 1933), 4-8, 16-20.

and booklets he wrote that he knew Arabic in a good level. Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı wrote articles and books in the fields of Islamic sciences such as doctrines, tafsir and Islamic law much as he was a medical doctor. His major works are as follows:

*The Medical Benefits of Salaah* (İstanbul: Tahir Bey Pub., 1898), 24 p.; *Haqiqat al-Islam* (İstanbul: Hilâl Pub., 1341-1343), 224 p.; *Islam Religion and Scholarship and Sciences* (Dersaadet: Numune-yi Tibaat, 1909), 334 p.; *Can Quran be translated? And in the New Area Translation and Tafsir of Surat al-Fatihah* (İstanbul: Hilal Pub., 1342), 15 p.;<sup>40</sup> *Let's Learn and Teach Our Religion* (Ankara: Yeni Cezaevi Pub., 1947), 47 p.; *The References of the Meats in Islam* (İstanbul: Ahmet Sait Pub., 1933), 31 p.; *The Miracles of Quran and the Tafsir of Cognate Verses* (İstanbul: Türkiye Pub., 1935), 165 p.; *What is the Real Meaning of Laylat al-Qadr and Where Does the Real Sawab Come From?* (İstanbul: Reklam Pub., 1936), 15 p.; *The Troubles of Alcohol and Solutions to Get Rid of It* (Dersaadet: Hilal Pub., 1333), 84 p.; *The New Writing Style and Its Elif-ba* (İstanbul: A. Asaduryan Pub., 1327); *Elif-ba with the New Letters* (İstanbul: Matbaa-i Hayriye, 1333); *Generalization of Education and Reclamation of Letters* (İstanbul: A. Asaduryan Pub., 1324). Furthermore, Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı has numerous articles published in journals called *Sirat-ı Mustakim* and *Sebilurresad*.<sup>41</sup>

### 3.2. Analysis of “Haqiqat al-Islam” in Terms of the New Ilm al-Kalam

This work by Milaşlı comprising of 216 pages was published by Hilal Matbaası (Publishing) in Istanbul in 1341. Milaşlı did not use the word the science of Kalam in any part of his work and therefore did not define himself as a “Kalam scholar”. However, this work by him can be considered a work of Kalam with respect to its dealing with the problems of the New Ilm al-Kalam. Actually it is not a common thing for the word “Kalam” to be used in works written about Islam in those times - e.g. Ahmet Hamdi Akseki’s *Islam Religion*”. In his book’s preface, Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı states that like some others he was also suggested<sup>42</sup> to write answers to the question of the Anglican Church and that he wrote that book also with the demand by his followers. After finishing the answers given to the questions of the Church, Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı discusses the question of his own asking why the followers of the Islam religion, which brought a perfect order to the world, are in severe poverty at that time and tried to answer this under the title “a very important question”.

40 See Ercan Şen, “Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı’nın (1870-1938) Kur’an Tercümesine Dair Bir Risalesi: Kur’an Tercüme Edilebilir mi ve Yeni Vadide Fatihâ Tercüme ve Tefsiri” [Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı’s (1870-1938) Booklet on the Translation of Quran: Can Quran be translated? And in the New Area Translation and Tafsir of Surat al-Fatihah], *Gaziosmanpaşa Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* [Gaziosmanpaşa University Journal of Theology Faculty] 1/2 (2013): 264-267.

41 Milaşlı has 16 books in total, 10 of which were in the field of religion, 3 in medicine and 3 in language. About his works and evaluations See Çatalbaş, “Milaşlı Dr. İsmail Hakkı” [Milaşlı Dr. İsmail Hakkı], 102-108; Şen, “Kur’an Tercüme Edilebilir mi ve Yeni Vadide Fatihâ Tercüme ve Tefsiri” [Can Quran be translated? And in the New Area Translation and Tafsir of Surat al-Fatihah], 262-265.

42 It is not certain whether this suggestion was official or not. His not being mentioned in the process of writing answers to the Anglican Church makes it more likely that he was not officially suggested to do the work.

Milaslı indicates that the atheism movement which started in the West spread to our country and as a result it raises doubts about the belief and foundations of religion. In this respect it is vitally important in terms of illuminating the environment that Milaslı congratulated Ahmet Hamdi Aksekili as he “wrote a book that was in conformity with the needs of the time’s schools and was written in a proper style and tone, and he lit a luminous torch which would stop our people from going to extreme ways”.<sup>43</sup>

By emphasizing the necessity of once more development of the Muslims, he strongly suggests that Muslims should not fall in despair and that their work should be proper to the real believers. According to him there are three bases of religion. These are the righteousness of the mind, the righteousness of the body and the righteousness of the spirit. By realization of these the great advancements can be realized once more. The righteousness of the mind will be possible through knowledge and skill, the righteousness of the body will be possible through health and the righteousness of the spirit will be possible through good character.<sup>44</sup> Now, we can talk about some topics that we have determined in terms of The New İlm al-Kalam in Milaslı İsmail Hakkî’s *Haqiqat al-Islam*.

### 3.2.1. The Emphasis of Disposition in Milaslı İsmail Hakkî

Disposition (Fitrah) is a word derived from the root “fatr” which means “to split and dig something” and it means “the first creation”.<sup>45</sup> As a term it means “man’s feeling and tendency, which he innately has, to believe in, to be connected to and to worship Allah. According to this, disposition is a character a person innately has, and it is influential on his belief, standard of judgment, view of life and worldview. For this reason, it was not considered possible to think of disposition different from a person’s intelligence, behaviors and institutions of the outer world.”<sup>46</sup>

As we will see some examples, it is a frequently seen issue that disposition is emphasized in the New İlm al-Kalam. It is one of the main dynamics of Islam that human disposition always states the truth. It is the most basic determinant to secure the justice between an individual and the society, and to maintain the purity of the differences between individuals and relations between masses that Islam is a religion of disposition. Islam’s being dispositional means none of its laws are against the laws of creation.<sup>47</sup> Within this context, it would be to the point to remind Kara Hisar Deputy Muhammed Kamil’s emphasis on disposition. In interpreting the 30<sup>th</sup> verse<sup>48</sup>

43 Milaslı İsmail Hakkî, “Aksekili Ahmet Hamdi Efendi’nin ‘Dini Dersler’ Kitabı Mühim Bir Eksliğimizin İtamına Doğru Büyük Bir Hatve” [Aksekili Ahmet Hamdi Efendi’s book called ‘Religious Courses’ is a Big Step to Complete a Great Lacking of us], *Sebilürreşad* 17/442 (September 1335): 219-221.

44 Milaslı İsmail Hakkî, *Hakikat-i İslâm* [*Haqiqat al-Islam*], 88.

45 İbn Manzur, *Lisânu’l-Arab* [*Lisan al-Arab*], (Beyrut, ts.), “fatr” art.

46 Muhsin Demirci, *Kur’anın Ana Konuları* [*Main Topics of Quran*] (İstanbul: İFAV Pub., 2012), 111.

47 Çaviş, *Anglikan Kilisesine Cevap* [*Answer to the Anglican Church*], 42, 65, 66.

of Surah ar-Rum: “Fitrah al-Allah is Allah the Supreme’s creating man as kabil al-Tawheed and kabil al-Islam. O My Beloved, uphold to this perfect disposition. Otherwise it would not be a success to change this ability. The true religion is the Islam Religion, which is advance ruling of creation. However, most of the people do not know this. It has been informed via numerous Hadith that everyone will accept Islam in accordance with their disposition, and that the necessity of religion for man will be convinced of. Islam is the religion of mind and disposition. For this reason, Quran is not satisfied with just a belief, but also it commands to think of the existential truths. It orders to find the truths in material and spirit, in the creation of the sky and the earth, night and day and by analyzing these secrets of the universe to deduce them to the existence of al-Bari.”<sup>49</sup> Islam is a religion which takes dispositional truth into consideration. Islam is such a religion that it has come for the life to be lived, for the afterlife to give an account, for the nafs to find excellence, for the body to stay healthy, for the actions to benefit, for the words to show goodness, for the mind to think and for the conscience to examine.<sup>50</sup>

Milashlı İsmail Hakkı, who strongly emphasizes that Islam is a dispositional religion, states that the path Islam follows is based on the human disposition. According to him, as this religion is the religion of disposition, all of Islam’s beliefs and practices are not separated from disposition. There is no change as Allah created. This is the eternal religion which has no fault.<sup>51</sup> According to the Islamic belief human beings were essentially created in a disposition to be religious with the true religion. Mind and thought certainly requires religion.<sup>52</sup> It is not possible for one not to search for the truth if he has not lost his disposition. Every human being, who is searching for the truth, will understand the existence of the creator after the respect, love, thinking and astonishment Allah made or inspired by looking in a way to take a lesson from the universes and the conditions happening in them. Quran says people are responsible to understand the divine being and does not take the doubt in this as possible.<sup>53</sup> It is certain that for people with common sense, doubt about understanding and accepting the divine being is not possible. Islam religion orders the acceptance of everything after examination and research. As a matter of fact, the traditional use of “la” first and “illa” next is shown to explain this meaning. Islam does not forbid the use of doubt and misgiving feelings in human beings. A good examination with good intention and common sense would definitely lead a person to confirmation.<sup>54</sup>

48 “So direct your face toward the religion, inclining to truth. [Adhere to] the fitrah of Allah upon which He has created [all] people. No change should there be in the creation of Allah. That is the correct religion, but most of the people do not know.” (ar-Rum 30/30).

49 See Kara Hisar Deputy Muhammed Kamil, “İlm-i Kelâm Tarihi” [The History of Ilm al-kalam], *İslâm Mecmuası [Islam Journal]* 4/51 (İstanbul 1332): 1013-1016.

50 Çaviş, *Anglikan Kilisesine Cevap [Answer to the Anglican Church]*, 42, 44, 50.

51 Milashlı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 3; (ar-Rum 30/30).

52 Milashlı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 31.

53 “Their prophet said: “Can there be doubt about Allah, Creator of the heavens and earth?” (al-Ibrahim 14/10).

54 Milashlı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 25-26.

Another evidence of Islam's being dispositional is that the moral laws and doctrines it commands are intellectual. Because the evidence of whether they really come from Allah or not is their examination by mind. Allah laid the burden of applying to intellectual evidences to know the Prophets and thus to know the Creator of everything.<sup>55</sup> According to Milaslı, the most important base in Islam is intellect, in other words it is topics' being dependent on the mind. For this reason, if an ecclesiastical law's common conflicts with intellectual evidence, the ecclesiastical law's common must be glossed. Because, its being accordant with mind is the essence of belief. "Mind is primary, transfer is interpreted" principle has been accepted as an essential one.<sup>56</sup>

### 3.2.2. Questioning the Belief-Action Relation in the New İlm al-Kalam

The matter of belief-action relation is one of the most basic topics of the science of Kalam. It is known that earlier Kalam discussions were formed around this topic. The topic, which can be evaluated also as another expression of belief-action relation, is the relation between Religion and Character. Mehmed Vehbi Efendi, by saying "Only religion provides a good character and good social intercourse", wants to base the good character on the ground of religion.<sup>57</sup> Also, Abdulaziz Çaviş tells that Muslims are people with supreme good character and politeness and the encouragements of Islam for this topic with examples.<sup>58</sup>

Muhammed Abduh underlines that the power vivifying each monotheistic religion is the same. He states that the religion comes from Allah and therefore it is one and only, however their appearing and coming to existence differ from each other. All of the religions have made calls for believing in Allah, to worship Him sincerely and ordering the good and forbidding the bad.<sup>59</sup> Abdulaziz Çaviş restates the same idea in almost the same words and advocates that the religion Allah sent to all nations is the same one and the changes are about secondary statements on practices and the forms of worshipping.<sup>60</sup>

It is understood that forming a Kalam suitable to the needs of the time is only possible through a new definition of it. Ömer Nasuhi Bilmen redefined Kalam by adding *prophecy and the afterlife* to the Kalam definition of al-Jurjani. This shows it is necessary to update the definition of this science in conformity with the conditions of the time. Bekir Topaloğlu redefined the science of Kalam and this is also important

55 Muhammed Abduh, *Tevhid Risalesi [Tawheed Booklet]*, translated by Sabri Hizmetli (Ankara: Fecr Pub., 1986), 54.

56 Milaslı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 114.

57 Mehmed Vehbi Efendi, *el-Akâidü'l-Hayriyye [al-Akaid al-Hayriyyah]* (İstanbul: Ahmed Kâmil Pub., 1340-1343), 63.

58 See Çaviş, *Anglikan Kilisesine Cevap [Answer to the Anglican Church]*, 181-182.

59 Abduh, *Tevhid Risalesi [Tawheed Booklet]*, 52.

60 Çaviş, *Anglikan Kilisesine Cevap [Answer to the Anglican Church]*, 72.

in terms of expressing the expectations from Kalam and the necessities of the time. His definition is as follows: “Kalam is a science which determines Islam’s belief foundations and its *basic doctrines about behaviors due to conventional laws*, bases them within the frame of *the wholeness of conventional laws*, supports them with intellectual methods and which criticizes counter arguments and answers them.”<sup>61</sup> In this definition, the emphasis on the “*basic doctrines about behaviors due to conventional laws*”, “*conventional laws*” and “*the wholeness of conventional laws*” are important in terms of its aiming at the problems in the holistic approach to the belief-action relation and the conventional laws in today’s society.

In the New Ilm al-Kalam, it is considered an important problem for the belief principles to break connections with life and to be isolated from the daily life. As a result of the reaction against the belief definitions of Kharijite and Mutazilah, the connection between action and belief was broken.<sup>62</sup> With the accumulation and experience from the past, it is seen that the completeness of belief-action is wanted to be in the goals of Kalam which must be presented to the people of the day.<sup>63</sup>

Milaslı İsmail Hakkı, who puts the stress on belief-action relation, defines religion as “believing in Allah, angels, books, prophets, the afterlife, destiny and that good and bad were created by Allah’s ordaining and *behaving according to the instructions informed by Quran and the prophet of the last times*”. He also draws attention to this topic by saying “The obvious religion brought by the Prophet is based on *belief and action* and contains religion and practice.”<sup>64</sup>

### 3.2.3. Approach to Different Religions and Sects in Milaslı İsmail Hakkı

It is personally stated by Milaslı İsmail Hakkı that in the New Ilm al-Kalam, condemnation was not made to any divisions except for the “Batiniyye” division, which consist of a hidden denial.<sup>65</sup> It can be said that this approach is the general attitude of

61 Topaloğlu, *Kelâm Araştırmaları Üzerine Düşünceler* [Opinions upon Kalam Researches], 5-6. Bekir Topaloğlu’s definition of the New Ilm al-Kalam is: “the New Ilm al-Kalam is a science which rejects every kind of materialism and positivism as a philosophical vision, which answers the biological and psychological criticism against religion (Darwinism, Freudism), which proves the existence of Allah by benefiting from positive sciences after criticizing new philosophical movements and which defends divinity by proving and explaining the principles of Islam. See Bekir Topaloğlu, *Kelâm İlmî Giriş* [Introduction to the Science of Kalam] (İstanbul: Damla Pub., 2013), 39.

62 Çelebi, “Kelâm İlminin Yeniden İnşasında İlke ve İçerik Sorunları” [Principle and Context Problems in the Reconstruction of the Science of Kalam], 90.

63 Mustafa Sinanoğlu, “Türkiye’de Son Dönem Kelâm Çalışmaları: Gelenek ve Modernite Arasında Bir Arayış” [Recent Kalam Studies in Turkey: A Search between Tradition and Modernity], *Modern Dönemde Dini İlimlerin Temel Meseleleri İlmî Toplantı (14-17 Nisan 2005)* [The Fundamental Topics of Religious Sciences in Modern Times Scientific Meeting (14-17 April 2005)] (İstanbul: İSAM Pub., 2007), 139.

64 Milaslı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm* [Haqiqat al-Islam], 3.

65 See Baloğlu, “İzmirli İsmail Hakkı’nın ‘Yeni İlm-i Kelâm’ Anlayışı” [İzmirli İsmail Hakkı’s Understanding of the New Ilm al-Kalam], 106; Baloğlu, “Yeni İlm-i Kelâm Tartışmaları” [The New Ilm al-Kalam Discussions], 280.

the time.<sup>66</sup> Milaslı İsmail Hakkı, as well, presents a quite wide acceptance about different religions and sects. He says, by underlining that Islam is just, compassionate and respectful to everyone, that: It is obligatory in Islam to treat everyone in a just, compassionate and respectful way without discriminating their religions and sects. Islam orders that unless they become harmful, non-Muslims should be respected and be done kindness just because they are human beings.<sup>67</sup> Islam's invitation is a universal invitation to all followers of all religions, Christianity being in the first place. Disputation and conflict with People of the Scripture should be made in a quite respectful way; we should always take the content of their books into consideration and we must base on common judgments.<sup>68</sup> The freedom and toleration granted by Islam to other religions and sects is so perfect that it has never been shown in anywhere.<sup>69</sup>

Milaslı, by moving from verses such as al-Ankabout 29/46, stresses that as the Believers of Islam already confirms and believes in the prophets and the originals of books of People of the Scripture, Muslims do not consider them to be strangers.<sup>70</sup> According to him, accepting Islam does not mean rejecting Christianity or Jewishness. On the contrary it is to confirm them. That is, confirming them by correcting the devastation and by accepting the unmanipulated form more. What our religion asks is only the confirmation of the ultimate truth.<sup>71</sup> “And [mention] when Jesus, the son of Mary, said, “O children of Israel, indeed I am the messenger of Allah to you confirming what came before me of the Torah and bringing good tidings of a messenger to come after me, whose name is Ahmad.” But when he came to them with clear evidences, they said, “This is obvious magic.” (as-Saf, 61/6). This invitation is a universal one directed to all religions, Christianity being in the first place. In this, it is seen how various nations, different religions, different consciences can unite with a fundamental conscience and a true word, and what a wide and clear right path and law of freedom Islam teaches to the humanity.

### 3.2.4. The Importance of Scholarship in Milaslı İsmail Hakkı

Milaslı İsmail Hakkı is quite complainant of the ignorance which is present at his time. Like all the thinkers of the time, he perseveringly advocates the importance of sciences and the necessity to get rid of ignorance as soon as possible. According to

66 Bulut, *Muhammed Ferid Vecdi*, 25.

67 Milaslı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 170, 193.

68 Milaslı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 170.

69 Milaslı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 171.

70 “And do not argue with the People of the Scripture except in a way that is best, except for those who commit injustice among them, and say, We believe in that which has been revealed to us and revealed to you. And our God and your God is one; and we are Muslims [in submission] to Him.” Milaslı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 198.

71 Milaslı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 198.

Islam, studying sciences is one of the greatest duties. There are a lot of verses and hadith showing this. One cannot be a complete Muslim without knowing scholarships, and it is scholarship which is to save Islam. Those to whom Allah grants scholarship get rid of the danger of losing their belief. It is vitally important in terms of showing the place of real scholars in Islam that scholars are the Prophets' successors. Milaşlı searches for the importance of scholarship in its transmitting him to Allah, and wants each Muslim to know his own nafs before everything. Islam informs that by a one's thinking of what is happening in himself and in the universe, it is possible to know Allah. A person's recognition of his nafs is a gateway for the stage of properly knowing Allah. One who knows his nafs well does not have a suspicion that the power in him comes from his Creator. By this way, man knows his Creator.<sup>72</sup>

The topic, which Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı handles under a special title, is the underdevelopment of Muslims. He asks the question as *A Quite Important Question* "why are the followers of a religion with such supreme doctrines and bases so underdeveloped". According to him underdevelopment is a matter to be surprised at and it shows that the first order of Islam "Read!" is not valued properly by Muslims.<sup>73</sup> Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı enumerates the various causes of Muslims' underdevelopment. To him, the primary reason is the leading one is that literacy (reading and literary composition) did not gain wide currency. He draws attention to a reality by saying: "Although there are times in our history when we raised great scholars, we have never been able to succeed in making every class literate such as the rich-poor, villager-townsman, woman-man, officer-tradesman, farmer-merchant according to their status in our society".<sup>74</sup> We have not been able to abolish illiteracy totally although we have built important centers of civilization. Whereas the absolute must of Islam is scholarship, knowledge, civilization and prosperity. In its advanced shade, there should be no ignorance and darkness. The statement in the Hadith: "*To study scholarships is a fard to -women and men- all Muslims*"<sup>75</sup> informs us about this. Muslim worked to carry out this order. For that matter they worked more than every other nation and built a school in the shade of every masjid.<sup>76</sup>

Milaşlı identifies the reasons of underdevelopment with the impracticality of the alphabet used by the society. According to him, every class became literate because the alphabet used by Europeans provided everyone the chance and they bettered themselves at everything compared to Muslims. The reason of our society's underdevelopment is because of the writing system of our alphabet. We must also make our letters scientific by writing them separately and by simplifying them with additions

72 Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 9.

73 Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 217.

74 Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 218.

75 İbn Mace, *Mukaddime [Muqaddimah]*, 17.

76 Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 218.

in between them which provide transitivity and make our writing similar to the writing styles of other nations.<sup>77</sup>

### 3.2.5. First Creation and the Creation of Adam According to Milaslı İsmail Hakkı

One of the most remarkable opinions of Milaslı İsmail Hakkı is his view on the creation of Adam. The common view on the creation of Adam is as follows: Adam was created of soil, he was put in the heaven and he was later dismissed from the heaven as he made a mistake against a divine order. As for Milaslı, according to this belief, it is understood that people (in today's meaning) have had no maturation until they became human beings. In his opinion, it is informed in Quran that man has had significant maturation until he reached the position of responsible, obligated mature. "Who perfected everything which He created and began the creation of man from clay. Then He made his posterity out of the extract of a liquid disdained. Then He proportioned him and breathed into him from His [created] soul." (as-Sajdah, 32/7-9). From this verse it is understood that the creation of man first started in the earth. In the verse, it is informed that "after the generation came into being from lineage and semen (liquid disdained) and it continued for some time it gained unity and after this unity was formed Allah breathed into him from His soul".<sup>78</sup> For Milaslı, *ruh-al-Allah* means is the blessing of understanding (marifat-al-Allah) the duty of worshipping Allah in the religious thinking. In other words, it is the spiritual life in human beings. Apart from the material life given to people, they were also given a spiritual life and this spiritual life was described as *ruh-al-Allah*. *Ruh-al-Allah* used for Jesus is in this meaning, as well.<sup>79</sup>

Milaslı tried to prove his hypothesis moving from the 30<sup>th</sup> verse of Surah al-Baqarah. "And [mention, O Muhammad], when your Lord said to the angels, "Indeed, I will make upon the earth a successive authority." They said, "Will You place upon it one who causes corruption therein and sheds blood, while we declare Your praise

77 Milaslı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 219-220. For the improvement of letters and for Milaslı İsmail Hakkı's opinions on this See Yusuf Akçay, "Osmanlı Dönemi Alfabe Tartışmaları Bağlamında Dr. İsmail Hakkı Bey ve İslah-ı Huruf Cemiyeti" [Dr. İsmail Hakkı Bey and the İslah al-Huruf Association within the scope of Alphabet Discussions in Ottoman Period], *Uluslararası Türk Dili ve Edebiyatı Kongresi (Erzurum 25-27 Nisan 2007) [International Turkish Language and Literature Congress (Erzurum 25-27 April 2007)]* [paper not published yet]. Milaslı is of those who suggests the letters to be written separately and the Arabic letters to be used after being improved in this way. For the use of the writing he suggested See Milaslı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 224. See. Taner Aslan, "İkinci Meşrutiyet Düşüncesinin Cumhuriyete Tesirleri" [The Influences of Second Constitutionalism to the Republic], *Dumlupınar Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi [Dumlupınar University Social Sciences Journal]* 21 (August 2008): 359-360.

78 Milaslı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 40.

79 Milaslı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 41. "And [mention, O Muhammad], when your Lord said to the angels, I will create a human being out of clay from an altered black mud. And when I have proportioned him and breathed into him of My [created] soul, then fall down to him in prostration. So the angels prostrated - all of them entirely, Except İblees, he refused to be with those who prostrated." (al-Hijr 15/28-31).

and sanctify You?” Allah said, “Indeed, I know that which you do not know.” (al-Baqarah, 2/30). Milaşlı interpreted the word “khalifah”-mentioned in this verse- as it means to succeed the ones before one and for this reason there were other people on earth before Adam.<sup>80</sup>

### 3.2.6. Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı’s Godhead Understanding and Jesus

Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı made different interpretations about Jesus, as well. “And mention, [O Muhammad], in the Book [the story of] Mary, when she withdrew from her family to a place toward the east. And she took, in seclusion from them, a screen. Then We sent to her Our Angel, and he represented himself to her as a well-proportioned man. She said, “Indeed, I seek refuge in the Most Merciful from you, [so leave me], if you should be fearing of Allah.” He said, “I am only the messenger of your Lord to give you [news of] a pure boy.” She said, “How can I have a boy while no man has touched me and I have not been unchaste?”. He said, “Thus [it will be]; your Lord says, ‘It is easy for Me, and We will make him a sign to the people and a mercy from Us. And it is a matter [already] decreed.’.” So she conceived him, and she withdrew with him to a remote place.” (Maryam, 19/16-22). “And [the example of] Mary, the daughter of ‘Imran, who guarded her chastity, so We blew into [her garment] through Our angel, and she believed in the words of her Lord and His scriptures and was of the devoutly obedient.” (at-Tahrim, 66/12). “O People of the Scripture, do not commit excess in your religion or say about Allah except the truth. The Messiah, Jesus, the son of Mary, was but a messenger of Allah and His word which He directed to Mary and a soul [created at a command] from Him. So believe in Allah and His messengers. And do not say, “Three”; desist - it is better for you. Indeed, Allah is but one God. Exalted is He above having a son. To Him belongs whatever is in the heavens and whatever is on the earth. And sufficient is Allah as Disposer of affairs. Never would the Messiah disdain to be a servant of Allah, nor would the angels near [to Him]. And whoever disdains His worship and is arrogant - He will gather them to Himself all together.” (an-Nisa, 4/171-172). “The Messiah, son of Mary, was not but a messenger; [other] messengers have passed on before him. And his mother was a supporter of truth. They both used to eat food. Look how We make clear to them the signs; then look how they are deluded.” (al-Maidah 5/75). The meaning of ruh-al-Allah in Jesus is the position of prophecy which is the greatest position of the soul. Mary was breathed in the body of a man. This soul is not unique to Jesus. Allah blessed Jesus not only divinity; but perfect servitude - which is the absolute must of marifat-al-Allah- and perfect humanity.<sup>81</sup> The prostration of the angels to Adam is because of this soul.<sup>82</sup>

80 Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 40.

81 Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 40-41.

82 Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 41; al-Hijr 15/28-31; al-Baqarah 2/30.

Milashlı interprets Islam's understanding of divinity as follows: Divinity does not accept plurality or fragmentation. There are no grades or levels of divinity. Referring to a creature, which eats and drinks in reality, as divinity is a claim that can never be accepted. Allah envision of Islam is the eternal, everlasting, al-Hayy (undying) and al-Qayyum (ever-existent) true Divinity which is miraculous, the creator of uncountable skies, earths and universes, which manages and decides on the changes of the smallest bits of the smallest parts of the created things. It is obvious that such a divinity, power and ability cannot belong to an unable human being. What Muslims can accept in a human being is only Rabbaniyyah (wish for goodness), not Rububiyyah (Divinity). Neither Jesus, nor other prophets claimed to be divine. It is not for a human [prophet] that Allah should give him the Scripture and authority and prophethood and then he would say to the people, Be servants to me rather than Allah, but [instead, he would say], Be pious scholars of the Lord because of what you have taught of the Scripture and because of what you have studied (Ali 'Imran, 3/79).<sup>83</sup> Knowing Allah piously means to have been blessed with His great blessings. All the beliefs and knowledge, authorities and prophecies are various grades of being honored by this great blessing.<sup>84</sup>

The verse of Surah al-Isra 17/111, which informs that Allah is above having a son, and that He has had no partner in [His] dominion and has no [need of a] protector out of weakness, must also be evaluated within this context. "Indeed, the example of Jesus to Allah is like that of Adam. He created Him from dust; then He said to him, "Be," and he was." (Ali 'Imran, 3/59). This verse states the fact that Jesus's, just like Adam's, substance is dust, that is, like all human beings he was created from dust. From this, it is understood that referring to Jesus as divinity is superstitious. Also, Jesus was taught science and divine talents, just like they were given to Adam.<sup>85</sup>

### 3.2.7. The Discourse of the Mysteries of Worships in Milashlı İsmail Hakkı

One of the most significant characteristics observed in the New İlm al-Kalam is the emphasis paid on the mysteries and aims of worships. Islam obligated worships in order for human beings to clean their inner worlds and also their bodies. Islam ordered belief and marifat-al-Allah by thinking them as superior to the created as the healing of the soul. In the same way, Islam ordered worships, obeying, be grateful for the blessings, to rule people with justice and to bestow upon the created according to their needs as the healing of the body. In order to form a good structure of society among people, Islam ordered helping each other and cooperation, to take of relatives and friends, to protect the rights between enemies, to give equal treatment in return to get rid of the enemies and to form a defense power for jihad against infidels and

83 Milashlı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 41.

84 Milashlı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 44.

85 Milashlı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 41.

for other reasons. All of the worships consist of performing the duties which are honoring Allah and gaining the consciousness of worshipping Allah. Vehbi Efendi, puts forward the perception of the time for example by saying: “such claims increased in number nowadays, for this reason new interpretations, new answers and new explanations are necessary”<sup>86</sup> before answering to the claims about the needlessness of fasting.

Milashlı İsmail Hakki, as well, gave importance to the mysteries and aims of the worships within the scope of the problems of his time and placed too much stress on this topic.<sup>87</sup> Milashlı draw attention to the fact that when the movements done while performing the salaah are examined, these contain “duties for body and soul in a way full of honoring and respecting Allah”<sup>88</sup> The takbir and tasbeeh, standing (qiyam) and sitting (quud) done before and during performing the salaah, bowing (ruku) and sajdahs all state respecting to Allah and Allah’s divinity. The essential aim of the salaah is mentioning (dikhr) of Allah and thought. The movements and details in the salaah are forms, each of which contains important mysteries.<sup>89</sup>

Milashlı, who starts to tell the benefits of the salaah for body with wudu, reminds the necessity to use the organs for good reasons with each organ washed in wudu. Then he draws attention to the benefits of wudu for material cleanliness and for health. Also, the movements done while performing the salaah are quite beneficial in terms of body’s health and form as well as presenting sajdah and respect.<sup>90</sup> The most supreme image shown by performing the salaah with community is the image showing that all believers are completely equal before Allah. Islam is based on a true brotherhood. Therefore, rich-poor, employer-employee worship in the same line side by side, in the same form and towards the same direction. The salaah has a lot of and important mysteries such as this.<sup>91</sup>

Zakat, which is one of the commands of religion, is Allah’s order and it includes numerous mysteries, as well. A believer pays zakat to certain people as if he were paying a debt back and without expecting for something in return while performing this duty. Zakat should be paid in the time when the poor need it the most and in a hidden way unless there is a benefit such as setting an example for others. While performing this duty, it should be paid by accepting that what is paid is little and not enough and without becoming arrogant and showing off. Also, while paying the zakat the good, clean, flamboyant and cute part of the property should be donated.<sup>92</sup>

86 Vehbi Efendi, *el-Akâidü’l-Hayriye [al-Akaid al-Hayriyyah]*, 61.

87 Milashlı İsmail Hakki, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 72. He wrote a summary for belief matters, 72 pages.

88 Milashlı İsmail Hakki, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 72.

89 Milashlı İsmail Hakki, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 72.

90 Milashlı İsmail Hakki, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 73-74.

91 Milashlı İsmail Hakki, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 81.

92 Milashlı İsmail Hakki, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 85-86. About the topic of importance of Zakat See Vehbi Efendi, *el-Akâidü’l-Hayriye [al-Akaid al-Hayriyyah]*, 64; Abduh, *Tevhid Risalesi [Tawheed Booklet]*, 211-212; Çavuş, *Anglikan Kilisesine Cevap [Answer to the Anglican Church]*, 103-108.

On the mysteries of fasting, Milaslı İsmail Hakkı makes important reminders, as well, and he especially stresses the benefits of fasting in terms of health. Mehmed Vehbi Efendi and Abdülaziz Çaviş showed a joint approach by explaining the material and spiritual benefits of fasting.<sup>93</sup> Milaslı İsmail Hakkı draw attention to the topic of the mysteries of Hajj. He gave answers to the deniers, who think Hajj and the actions in Hajj are unnecessary, and collocated the mysteries of this worship. In short, Hajj is an important worship, which is a sign of breaking the connection with anything except Allah by taking off the clothes which give arrogance to man and walking on bare foot and bareheaded. The actions of Hajj include a lot of material benefits, as well, apart from the spiritual reward and good deeds. The change of climate experienced in the Hajj visit is an important gain and it includes every type of travelling. There are profits in Hajj such as meeting a lot of people, gathering information, merchandising etc. At the same time Hajj has numerous advantages in terms of society and good character. The Hajj worship is a mighty activity in terms of Muslims strengthening their beliefs by saying takbirs with many people who have worldly positions and ranks in a respectful and serving way in Allah's place, repenting and praying for forgiveness, deciding not to commit sins and to continue doing good deeds, nurturing their nafs and improving the good character.<sup>94</sup> Hajj makes people get used to sacrificing for Allah's sake. The animals sacrificed in Hajj, the zakat and almsgiving make people get used to sacrificing. The Hajj worship is the best display of the verse "The believers are but brothers, so make settlement between your brothers. And fear Allah that you may receive mercy" (al-Hujurat, 49/10).<sup>95</sup>

While interpreting the 115<sup>th</sup> verse<sup>96</sup> of the Surah al-Baqarah, Milaslı İsmail Hakkı made a good comment using the verse "Righteousness is not that you turn your faces toward the east or the West" (al-Baqarah, 2/177). There are different aims about the change of kiblah. One of these is to differentiate Muslims and non-Muslims. Another aim is to demolish the idea that only Masjid al-Aqsa may be the kiblah. The main reason why the kiblah was changed is to show that the belief of sacralization of a place is not true. From this, it is necessary to understand the preminent and exceptional supremacy.<sup>97</sup>

We can conclude the study by reminding some interesting opinions of Milaslı İsmail Hakkı. One of these is "And of his signs is the creation of the heavens and earth and what He has dispersed throughout them of creatures. And He, for gathering

93 See Milaslı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 95-96; Vehbi Efendi, *el-Akâidü'l-Hayriye [al-Akaid al-Hayriyyah]*, 62 vd.; Çaviş, *Anglikan Kilisesine Cevap [Answer to the Anglican Church]*, 98-101.

94 Milaslı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 96-98.

95 Vehbi Efendi, *el-Akâidü'l-Hayriye [al-Akaid al-Hayriyyah]*, 96-97; Çaviş, *Anglikan Kilisesine Cevap [Answer to the Anglican Church]*, 101-103; Abduh, *Tevhid Risalesi [Tawheed Booklet]*, 207.

96 "And to Allah belongs the east and the west. So wherever you [might] turn, there is the Face of Allah. Indeed, Allah is all-Encompassing and Knowing." (al-Baqarah 2/115).

97 Milaslı İsmail Hakkı, *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*, 96-98.

them when He wills, is competent.” (ash-Shuraa, 42/29). Moving from this verse, Milaşlı asserts that there are living things in different celestial bodies than the earth. Also, he interpreted the verse “For each one are successive [angels] before and behind him who protect him by the decree of Allah” (ar-Ra’d, 13/11) as the protectiveness of blood circulation and others against microbes and illnesses.<sup>98</sup>

## CONCLUSION

The science of Kalam, which has a vital position as Islam beliefs are mentioned in it, tried to understand and answer the movements it is directly related to in 19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> centuries just like it did in every period of Islamic history of thought. The mentioned centuries are ones in which there were great changes and upheavals, and in which radical inquisition was made against beliefs and values. Against these inquisitions, the later periods’ scholarly stepped into action and tried to understand the problems of the time they lived. The general opinion stating that content and methods of Islamic sciences cannot satisfy the needs brought the idea of renewing and reviving them, and within this context, hard effort was made about the need for renewal in the science of Kalam as well as other sciences. There are important factors triggering and accelerating the attempts of renewal in the science of Kalam. The primary of these factors is that the non-Islamic movements, to which this science is directed, changed their methods and in this way the threat risks formed for the Islamic belief doctrines became different. The differences in the needs, problems and culture and interest levels of the people in the formation process of the Science of Kalam and of the people today made it necessary for the science of Kalam to change methods. The method change in philosophy and other social sciences and the science of Kalam’s not being able to meet the needs with the current content and methods necessitated the renewal. In this new period, a lot of topics that are discussed in today’s world such as religion-state relations, secularism, human rights, women’s problems, racism, colonialism, hunger, freedom of belief and thought were included in the scope of Kalam.

Some thinkers, who were not competent in Islamic sciences, wrote some books with the aim of elucidating and especially defending Islam. One of these is Doctor Milaşlı İsmail Hakki. Milaşlı added significant works to the literature on the religion and thought of Islam, as well as on fields of medicine and language. His book *Haqiqat al-Islam*, which was written with the aim of answering the questions of the Anglican Church, contains original opinions. Also this book, which has the characteristic of a Kalam book although it does not use sources of Kalam, has a quality which we can call Kalam of Quran. He tried to prove that Islam is the true religion by telling the rationality of Islam’s beliefs and teachings. Moreover, he tried

to emphasize that Islam is the religion of disposition by revealing the mysteries of Islam's orders such as wudu, the salaah, zakat, fasting etc. It is also of a distinct value for us that a person who is a doctor understands and interprets the beliefs of Islam.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Abduh, Muhammed. *Tevhid Risalesi [Tawheed Booklet]*. Translated by Sabri Hizmetli. Ankara: Fecr Pub., 1986.
- Abdulaziz, Çaviş. *Anglikan Kilisesine Cevap [Answer to the Anglican Church]*. Translated by Mehmet Akif. Ed. Süleyman Ateş. Ankara Directorate of Religious Affairs Pub., 1979.
- Akçay, Yusuf. "Osmanlı Dönemi Alfabe Tartışmaları Bağlamında Dr. İsmail Hakkı Bey ve İslah-ı Huruf Cemiyeti" [Dr. İsmail Hakkı Bey and the İslah al-Huruf Association within the Scope of Alphabet Discussions in Ottoman Period]. *Uluslararası Türk Dili ve Edebiyatı Kongresi (Erzurum 25-27 Nisan 2007) [International Turkish Language and Literature Congress (Erzurum 25-27 April 2007)]* [paper not published yet].
- Akman, Zekeriya. "Anglikan Kilisesi'nin Meşihat Kurumuna Soruları ve Bunlara Verilen Cevaplar" [The Questions of the Anglican Church to the Mashihat Institute and Answers Given to Them]. *Hikmet Yurdu* 6/11 (January-June 2013/1): 357-377.
- Altıntaş, Ramazan. "Sosyal Kelâm'a Giriş: M. Şerafeddin Yaltkaya Örneği" [Introduction to Social Kalam: M. Şerafeddin Yaltkaya Sample]. *Kelâmın İşlevselliği ve Günümüz Kelâm Problemleri [The Functionality of Kalam and Contemporary Kalam Problems]*. 129-149. İzmir: İzmir İlahiyat Foundation Pub., 2000.
- Altıntaş, Ramazan. "Yeni Bir Kelâm: Vahîdüddîn Hân Örneği" [A New Kalam: Vahîdüddîn Hân Sample]. *Cumhuriyet Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi [Cumhuriyet University Faculty of Theology Journal]* 7/1 (Sivas 2003): 101-128.
- Aslan, Taner. "İkinci Meşrutiyet Düşüncesinin Cumhuriyete Tesirleri" [The Influences of Second Constitutionalism to the Republic]. *Dumlupınar Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi [Dumlupınar University Social Sciences Journal]* 21 (August 2008): 345-378.
- Baloğlu, Adnan Bülent. "Sebilürreşâd Dergisinde Yeni İlm-i Kelâm Tartışmaları" [The New İlm al-Kalam Discussions in Sebilurresad Journal]. *İzmirli İsmail Hakkı Sempozyumu (24-25 Kasım 1995) [İzmirli İsmail Hakkı Symposium (24-25 November 1995)]*. Prep. Mehmet Şeker – Adnan Bülent Baloğlu. 265-312. Ankara: TDV Pub., 1996.

- Bulut, İsmail. *Nübüvvete Çağdaş Bir Yaklaşım – Muhammed Ferid Vecdi- [A Contemporary Approach to Prophecy – Muhammed Ferid Vecdi-]*. Ankara: Berikan Pub., 2016.
- Çatalbaş, Resul. “Anglikan (İngiliz) Misyoner Teşkilatlar” [Anglican (English) Missionary Associations]. *Bozok Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi [Bozok University Faculty of Theology Journal]* 2/2 (2012): 121-138.
- Çatalbaş, Resul. “Milaslı Dr. İsmail Hakkı'nın Hayatı, Eserleri ve İslâm ile İlgili Görüşleri” [Milaslı Dr. İsmail Hakkı's Life, Works and Views on Islam]. *Artuklu Akademi / Journal of Artuklu Academia* 1 (2014): 99-129.
- Çelebi, İlyas. “Kelâm İlminin Yeniden İnşasında İlke ve İçerik Sorunları” [Principle and Context Problems in the Reconstruction of the Science of Kalam]. *Kelâm'ın İşlevselliği ve Günümüz Kelâm Problemleri [The Functionality of Kalam and Contemporary Kalam Problems]*. 87-99. İzmir: İzmir Foundation of Theology Pub., 2000.
- Demir, Şehmus. *Kur'an'ın Temel Hedefi [The Primary Objective of Quran]*. Ankara: Fecr Pub., 2009.
- Demirci, Kürşat. “Hristiyanlık” [Christianity]. *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslâm Ansiklopedisi [Turkish Religious Foundation Islam Encyclopedia]*. 17: 328-340. İstanbul: TDV Pub., 1998.
- Demirci, Muhsin. *Kur'an'ın Ana Konuları [Main Topics of Quran]*. İstanbul: İFAV Pub., 2012.
- Eroğlu, Muhammed. “Abdülaziz Çaviş” [Abdülaziz Çaviş]. *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslâm Ansiklopedisi [Turkish Religious Foundation Islam Encyclopedia]*. 1: 187-188. İstanbul: TDV Pub., 1988.
- Gölcük, Şerafettin. *Kelâm Tarihi [The History of Kalam]*. Konya: Esra Pub., 1992.
- Harpûtî, Abdüllatif. *Kelâm Tarihi [The History of Kalam]*. Ed. Muammer Esen. Ankara: Ankara School Pub., 2005.
- İbn Manzûr. *Lisânu'l-Arab [Lisan al-Arab]*. Beyrut, ts.
- İzmirli İsmail Hakkı. *Yeni İlm-i Kelâm [The New Ilm al-Kalam]*. Ankara: Umran Pub., 1981.
- İzmirli İsmail Hakkı. *Muhassalu'l-Kelâm [Muhassal al-Kalam]*. İstanbul: Evkâf-ı İslâmîye Pub., 1336.
- İzmirli İsmail Hakkı. *el-Cevabu's-Sedid fi Beyan-i Dini't-Tevhid [al-Cevab as-Saded fi-Beyani Deen at-Tawheed]*. Ankara: Ali Şükrü Pub., 1339.

- İzmirli İsmail Hakkı. *İslâmîda Felsefe Akımları [Philosophical Currents in Islam]*. Ed. N. Ahmet Özalp. İstanbul: Kitabevi Pub., 1997.
- Kanlıdere, Ahmet. “Musa Carullah” [Musa Carullah]. *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslâm Ansiklopedisi [Turkish Religious Foundation Islam Encyclopedia]*. 31: 214-216. İstanbul: TDV Pub., 2006.
- Karaağaç, Hilmi. *Hasan Hanefî'nin Kelâm İlmini Yenileme Projesi [Hasan Hanefî's Project of Renewing the Science of Kalam]*. Doctoral Thesis, Ankara University, 2008.
- Kara Hisar Meb'usu Muhammed Kamil. “İlm-i Kelâm Tarihi” [The History of Ilm al-Kalam]. *İslâm Mecmuası [Islam Journal]* 4/51 (İstanbul 1332): 1013-1016.
- Macit, Nadim. “Cumhuriyet Döneminde Kelâm İlmi ve Yöntem Sorunu” [The Science of Kalam in the Republic Period and Scientific Method Problem]. *İslâmî İlimlerde Metodoloji / Usûl Meselesi I [Methodology/Procedure Issue in Islamic Sciences I]*. 273-333. İstanbul: Ensar Pub., 2005.
- Mehmed Vehbi Efendi. *el-Akâidü'l-Hayriyye [al-Akaid al-Hayriyyah]*. İstanbul: Ahmed Kâmil Pub., 1340-1343.
- Milaslı İsmail Hakkı. *Hakikat-i İslâm [Haqiqat al-Islam]*. İstanbul: Hilal Pub., 1341.
- Milaslı İsmail Hakkı. *İslâm Dininde Etlarin Tezkiyesi [The References of the Meats in Islam]*. İstanbul: Ahmet Sait Pub., 1933.
- Milaslı İsmail Hakkı. “Aksekili Ahmet Hamdi Efendi'nin ‘Dini Dersler’ Kitabı Mühim Bir Eksikliğimizin İtmamına Doğru Büyük Bir Hatve” [Aksekili Ahmet Hamdi Efendi's Book Called ‘Religious Courses’ is a Big Step to Complete a Great Lacking of us]. *Sebilurreşad* 17/442 (September 1335): 219-221.
- Nayed, Aref Ali. “İkbal ve Kelâm İlminin Yeniden İnşası” [Ikbal and the Reconstruction of the Science of Kalam]. *Uluslararası Muhammed İkbal Sempozyumu Bildirileri (İstanbul, 1-2 Aralık 1995) [International Muhammed İkbal Symposium Papers (İstanbul, 1-2 December 1995)]*. 197-201. İstanbul: İ.B.B. Office of Cultural Affairs Pub., 1997.
- Özervarlı, M. Sait. *Kelâmîda Yenilik Arayışları (XIX. Yüzyıl Sonu -XX. Yüzyıl Başı) [Search for Renewal in Kalam (Late 19<sup>th</sup> Century – Early 20<sup>th</sup> Century)]*. İstanbul: İSAM Pub., 1998.

- Özervarlı, M. Sait. “Osmanlı Kelâm Geleneğinden Nasıl Yararlanabiliriz” [How Can We Benefit from Ottoman Kalam Tradition?]. *Dünden Bugüne Osmanlı Araştırmaları, Tespitler – Problemler - Teklifler* [Ottoman Researches from Past to Present, Determinations-Problems-Suggestions]. İstanbul: İSAM Pub., 2007.
- Özervarlı, M. Sait. “Son Dönem Osmanlı Düşüncesinde Arayışlar: Mehmed Şerafeddin’in İctimai İlm-i Kelâmı” [Searches in Late Ottoman Ideology: Mehmed Şerafeddin’s Conventional Science of Kalam]. *İslâm Araştırmaları Dergisi* [Islamic Researches Journal] 3 (1999): 157-170.
- Özervarlı, M. Sait. “Osmanlıların Son Dönemindeki Batılılaşma Hareketinin İslâm Düşüncesinde Yenilik Çabalarına Tesiri” [The Influence of Westernization Movement in Late Ottoman Period to the Efforts of Renewal in Islamic Thought]. *Osmanlı Dünyasında Bilim ve Eğitim: Milletlerarası Kongresi (12-15 Nisan 1999)* [Science and Education in Ottoman World: International Congress (12-15 April 1999)]. Der. Hidayet Yavuz Nuhoğlu. 663-673. İstanbul: IRCICA, 2001.
- Öztürk, Resul. *Yeni İlm-i Kelâm Hareketi ve Mehmed Vehbi Efendi* [The New Ilm al-Kalam Movement and Mehmed Vehbi Efendi]. Erzurum: Eğitim Yayınevi, 2014.
- Sinanoğlu, Mustafa. “Türkiyede Son Dönem Kelâm Çalışmaları: Gelenek ve Modernite Arasında Bir Arayış” [Recent Kalam Studies in Turkey: A Search between Tradition and Modernity]. *Modern Dönemde Dinî İlimlerin Temel Meseleleri İlmî Toplantı (14-17 Nisan 2005)* [The Fundamental Topics of Religious Sciences in Modern Times Scientific Meeting (14-17 April 2005)]. 115-140. İstanbul: İSAM Yayınları, 2007.
- Şen, Ercan. “Milaslı İsmail Hakkı’nın (1870-1938) Kur’an Tercümesine Dair Bir Risalesi: Kur’an Tercüme Edilebilir mi ve Yeni Vadîde Fatıha Tercüme ve Tefsiri” [Milaslı İsmail Hakkı’s (1870-1938) Booklet on the Translation of Quran: Can Quran be translated? And in the New Area Translation and Tafsir of Surat al-Fatihah]. *Gaziosmanpaşa Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* [Gaziosmanpaşa University Journal of Theology Faculty] 1/2 (2013): 261-286.
- Topaloğlu, Bekir. *Kelâm İlmi Giriş* [Introduction to the Science of Kalam]. İstanbul: Damla Yayınları, 2013.
- Topaloğlu, Bekir. *Kelâm Araştırmaları Üzerine Düşünceler* [Opinions upon Kalam Researches]. İstanbul: İFAV Yayınları, 2004.