Gönderilme Tarihi
 : 25.11.2019

 Kabul Tarihi
 : 09.01.2020

 DOI
 : 10.32705/yorumyonetim.650699

Derleme Makaleler / Review Articles

# INDUSTRY 4.0 WITHIN THE FRAMEWORK OF SUPPLY CHAIN: A LITERATURE REVIEW AND FUTURE RESEARCH DIRECTIONS

# **Ourania ARETA**

Lecturer, Izmir Bakircay University, Faculty of Economics and Administrative Sciences ourania.areta@bakircay.edu.tr, ORCID: <u>0000-0001-8607-6089</u>

# Hunaida AWWAD

Ass. Prof., Izmir Bakircay University, Faculty of Economics and Administrative Sciences hunaida.awwad@bakircay.edu.tr, ORCID: <u>0000-0002-6006-5944</u>

# ABSTRACT

Since its introduction on 2013, Industry 4.0 concept has been applied towards the digitalization of the business environment and has been increasingly a favorite topic for academic research. Moreover, there is a high need of an efficient supply chain to gain a competitive advantage; this point has encouraged incorporations to give a high attention to Industry 4.0 as a crucial element in their structure. The aim of the authors is to examine the progress and identify any research gaps with relevance to scholarly outcomes on Industry 4.0 within the framework of the supply chain. Thus, the authors have systematically reviewed the articles regarding the topic that were published from 2013 and onwards. In this paper, the obtained results from both the generic analysis (e.g. year of publication, subject areas) and the specific one corresponding to four subject areas and the three levels of Industry 4.0 are presented, which can be used as a base for future research agenda in related topics.

Keywords: Supply Chain, Industry 4.0.

#### **INTRODUCTION**

The digital revolution of this decade is affecting people's life in almost all aspects, but it is not clear enough how it is affecting the industrial production (Glas & Kleemann, 2016). Authors refer to it as the fourth industrial revolution, which comes as the continuum of the first three: firstly, the creation of steampowered mechanical manufacturing tools; secondly, the use of electrically powered technologies; and finally the use of electronics and information technology (IT) for manufacturing automation (Drath & Horch, 2014). Since the third one, IT has evolved enormously and new terminology and applications, such as Internet of Things (IoT) and Cyber-Physical Systems, have been introduced into the operations and business environment.

Since its introduction in Germany, on 2013, Industry 4.0 has been "defined by many as a global transformation of the manufacturing industry by the introduction of digitalization and the Internet" (Tjahjono, Esplugues, Ares, & Pelaez, 2017). Industry 4.0 has been labelled in several ways, such as Smart Factories, Smart Industry, Advanced Manufacturing or Industrial Internet of Things (IIoT) (Tjahjono et al., 2017). It includes and not limited to, the use of robotics, high technological sensors, Artificial Intelligence (AI), cloud computing, big data analytics, IoT, 3D printing, mobile devices, software-as-a-service and Cyber-Physical-Systems (CPSs) that will work as a bridge between people and machines (Geissbauer, Vedsø, & Schrauf, 2016).

As the supply chain has a substantial role into the planning and execution of a business, the introduction of Industry 4.0 has a major effect on the whole business as well. The structure of the Supply Chain Management requires a very efficient collaboration between suppliers, manufacturers and customers so that all the steps, which take place from when the order is dispatched until the end-of-life of the product, are very clear (Gilchrist, 2018). Thus, the digitalization and automation of processes that Industry 4.0 has brought, made an impact on the supply chain (Tjahjono et al., 2017). Besides the technical dimension of business digitalization (Felser, 2015), Glas and Kleemann (2016) support that Industry 4.0 is "rather the complete new organization and network coordination of value and supply chains". Thus, they adopt the Hierarchy of Industry 4.0 (see figure 1), which encompasses other concepts, such as "Smart Factory", "Internet of Things and Services" or "Cyber-Physical Systems", as sub-systems or sub-elements of the primary Industry 4.0 concept.

Yorum-Yönetim-Yöntem Uluslararası Yönetim-Ekonomi ve Felsefe Dergisi •Cilt: 7 •Sayı: 3•ss: 129-141



Figure 1. The "Hierarchy" of Industry 4.0 (derived from (Glas & Kleemann, 2016).

Academic community is aware of the importance of Industry 4.0. Industry 4.0 related literature has increased in the last couple of years (Saucedo-Martínez, Pérez-Lara, Marmolejo-Saucedo, Salais-Fierro, & Vasant, 2018). In order to understand the degree of which this literature has dealt with the Supply Chain element, this paper presents the results of a systematic literature review on articles published from 2013 and onwards. The scope of the analysis has been intentionally limited to include only keywords related to Industry 4.0 and Supply Chain; four subject areas; and the three levels of Hierarchy of Industry 4.0 (see figure 1). The aim of the authors is to examine the progress and identify any research gaps with relevance to scholarly outcomes on Industry 4.0 within the framework of the supply chain. The results can be used as a base for future research agenda in related topics.

#### **REVIEW METHODOLOGY**

The review of the available literature was conducted through SCOPUS database; Title, Abstract and Keyword was searched by setting the keywords namely, (supply) AND (chain) AND (industry) AND (4.0), and with the restrictions of language (only English) and time of publication (from 2013 and onwards), 118 articles in various subject area categories came up. The distributions of articles based on the country, the year and citations, and the subject area are presented in figures 2, 3 and 4 respectively.

Overall, 11.9% of the total published works were reviews, and 114 of them originated from 47 countries, while 4 of them were not defined. As it can be seen, there has been a rapid increase in the number of publications with a peak on 2018, when 263 articles were published. That shows that Industry 4.0 with regards the supply chain has gotten an increased attention by scholars, something that is compatible with the overall trend on Industry 4.0 publications, which as of 2014 has doubled through the years (Saucedo-Martínez et al., 2018). Moreover, the same authors justify the specific increase due to the "opportunities provided by the emerging technologies applicable to Supply Chain Management" (Saucedo-Martínez J.A. et al., 2018).



Figure 2. Published articles in different countries



Figure 3. Number of articles and their citations per year

Furthermore, the authors decided to further restrict their search outcomes by selecting the top 4 among the subject areas, namely Engineering, Business, Management and Accounting, Decision Sciences and Computer Science, which counted for the 81.7% of the total publications. The specific areas were chosen due to close relevance with MIS domain. Following the initial screening and having read their titles, abstracts and keywords, the authors found necessary a further restriction that was based on the keywords of the articles (KEY (supply) AND KEY (chain) AND KEY (industry 4.0)), which would ensure that all selected papers are explicitly and specifically dedicated to Industry 4.0 and Supply Chain. Thus, the final selection constitutes of 51 publications.

For the analysis of the publications to take place, two elements were taken into consideration:

- a. Subject areas (Scopus classification):
- Engineering,

- Business, Management and Accounting,
- Decision Sciences and
- Computer Science
- b. "Hierarchy" of Industry 4.0 (derived from (Glas & Kleemann, 2016)):
- Supply Chain Perspective
- Production or Consumption Perspective
- Internet of Things and Services



Figure 4. Distribution of articles according to subject area

To be able to classify the articles into the subject area and level of Industry 4.0 they belong to, authors checked the abstracts, keywords and in some cases the full article (see table 1). For the validity of results, all sources were examined by two people.

# FINDINGS

As aforementioned, the final selection is consisted of 51 articles. The observations of the authors are the following:

- a. Regarding the year of publication: the majority of the articles (42 ones) were published in the last two years (see figure 5), which shows that the interest towards the Industry 4.0 within the supply chain context was recently increased, following the trend of the overall Industry 4.0 related publications (Saucedo-Martínez et al., 2018).
- b. Regarding the type of publication: out of the 51 articles, 12 of them were review works (there were 14 review articles in the primary screening with the 118 publications).
- c. Regarding the country (articles may have more than one country of origin): on top of the list is Germany with 12 articles, something that should have been expected, as Industry 4.0 was first introduced there. UK and Italy follow with 9 articles, showing that they are the 2 EU countries that after Germany took the lead on the subject. Then, we find the two world-manufacturing centers, USA and China with 7 articles each; France and India follow with 6 articles; Brazil and Russia Federation with 5 articles; and South Africa and Spain with 4 ones.

- d. The comprehensive summary of the 51 articles with respect to author, publication year, subject area and Industry 4.0 level is presented in table 1.
- Regarding to "Hierarchy" of Industry 4.0 (derived from (Glas & Kleemann, 2016)): 55% of the articles covers one level of Industry 4.0, while 29% covers two levels and 16% covers all three levels of Industry 4.0.



*Figure 5. Distribution of articles according to year, type and country.* 

Table 1. Comprehensive summary of articles with respect to author, publication year, subject area o	ınd
---	-----

Industry 4.0 level.

No.         Authors/Year         ENG         CS         BMA         DS         1         2         3           1         Rajput S, Singh S.P./2019         • <th></th> <th></th> <th>S</th> <th colspan="4">Subject Areas</th> <th colspan="3">Industry 4.0 Level</th>			S	Subject Areas				Industry 4.0 Level		
1       Rajput S., Singh S.P./2019       •       •       •         2       Galati F., Bigliardi B. /2019       •       •       •         3       Müller F., et al. /2019       •       •       •         4       da Silva V.L., et al. /2019       •       •       •         5       Nascimento D.L.M., et al. /2019       •       •       •         6       Ardito L., et al. /2019       •       •       •         7       Frank A.G., et al. /2019       •       •       •         8       Tortorella G., et al. /2019       •       •       •         9       Culto G., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         10       Ivanov D., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         12       Ghadimi P., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         14       Manavalan E., Jazyakrishna K./2019       •       •       •       •         15       de la Fuente-Mella H., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         16       Sundarakani B., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         17       Zheng M., et al. /2018       •       •	No.	Authors/ Year	ENG	CS	BMA	DS	1	2	3	
2       Galati F., Bigliardi B. /2019       •       •       •       •         3       Müller F., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         5       Nascimento D.L.M., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         6       Ardito L., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         7       Frank A.G., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         9       Culot G., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         10       Ivanov D., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         11       Dolgui A., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         12       Ghadimi P., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         13       Panetto H., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         14       Manavalan E., Javakrishna K. /2019       •       •       •       •         16       Sundarakani B., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •       •         17       Zheng M., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         18       Rahman N.A.A., et al./2018       •       •	1	Rajput S., Singh S.P./2019		•			•			
3       Müller F., et al. /2019       •       •       •         4       da Silva V.L., et al. /2019       •       •       •         5       Nascimento D.L.M., et al. /2019       •       •       •         6       Ardito L., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         6       Ardito L., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         7       Frank A.G., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         9       Culot G., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         10       Ivanov D., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         11       Dolgui A., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         12       Ghadmin P., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         13       Panetto H., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •       •         14       Manavalan E., javakrishna K. /2019       • <t< td=""><td>2</td><td>Galati F., Bigliardi B. /2019</td><td>•</td><td>•</td><td></td><td></td><td>•</td><td>•</td><td>•</td></t<>	2	Galati F., Bigliardi B. /2019	•	•			•	•	•	
4       da Silva V.L., et al. /2019       •       •       •         5       Nascimento D.L.M., et al. /2019       •       •       •         6       Ardito L., et al. /2019       •       •       •         7       Frank A.G., et al. /2019       •       •       •         9       Culot G., et al. /2019       •       •       •         10       Ivanov D., et al. /2019       •       •       •         11       Dolgui A., et al. /2019       •       •       •         12       Ghadmii P., et al. /2019       •       •       •         13       Panetto H., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         14       Manavalan E., Javakrishna K. /2019       •       •       •       •         15       de la Fuente-Mella H., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         15       de la Fuente-Melda P. /2019       •       •       •       •       •         16       Sundarakani B., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         17       Zheng M., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         20       Bar K., et al. /2018	3	Müller F., <i>et al.</i> /2019		•			•	•	•	
5       Nascimento D.L.M., et al. /2019       •       •       •         6       Ardito L., et al. /2019       •       •       •         7       Frank A.G., et al. /2019       •       •       •         8       Tortorella G., et al. /2019       •       •       •         9       Culot G., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         10       Ivanov D., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         12       Ghadimi P., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         13       Panetto H., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         14       Manavalan E., layAkrishna K./2019       •       •       •       •         15       de la Fuente-Mella H., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         16       Sundarakani B., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •       •         18       Rahman N.A.A., et al/2019       •       •       •       •       •       •         19       Pirvulescu P., Enevoldsen P./2019       •       •       •       •       •       •         21       Mazg B., Ha-Brooskhire J.E. /2018       •	4	da Silva V.L., <i>et al.</i> /2019			•	•	•	•		
6       Ardito L., et al. /2019       •       •       •         7       Frank A.G., et al. /2019       •       •       •         9       Culot G., et al. /2019       •       •       •         10       Ivanov D., et al. /2019       •       •       •         11       Dolgui A., et al. /2019       •       •       •         12       Ghadimi P., et al. /2019       •       •       •         13       Panetto H., et al. /2019       •       •       •         14       Manavalan E., layakrishna K. /2019       •       •       •         15       de la Fuente-Mella H., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         16       Sundarakani B., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         17       Zheng M., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         18       Rahman N.A.A., et al./2018       •       •       •       •         20       Bar K., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         21       Mazzola L., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         23       Wang B., Ha-Brookshire I.E. /2018       •       •       •	5	Nascimento D.L.M., et al. /2019	•	•	•			•		
7       Frank A.G., et al. /2019       •       •       •         8       Tortorella G., et al. /2019       •       •       •         9       Cubto G., et al. /2019       •       •       •         10       Ivanov D., et al. /2019       •       •       •         11       Dolgui A., et al. /2019       •       •       •         12       Ghadimi P., et al. /2019       •       •       •         13       Panetto H., et al. /2019       •       •       •         14       Manavalan E., layakrishna K. /2019       •       •       •         15       de la Fuente-Mella H., et al. /2019       •       •       •         16       Sundarakani B., et al. /2019       •       •       •         17       Zheng M., et al. /2018       •       •       •         18       Rahman N.A.A., et al./2018       •       •       •         20       Bar K., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         21       Mazzola L., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         22       Ding B. /2018       •       •       •       •         23       Wang B., Ha-Brooksh	6	Ardito L., <i>et al.</i> /2019			•		•	•	•	
8       Tortorella G., et al. /2019       •       •       •         9       Culot G., et al. /2019       •       •       •         11       Dolgui A., et al. /2019       •       •       •         12       Ghadimi P., et al. /2019       •       •       •         13       Panetto H., et al. /2019       •       •       •         14       Manavalan E., Javakrishna K. /2019       •       •       •         15       de la Fuente-Mella H., et al. /2019       •       •       •         16       Sundarakani B., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         17       Zheng M., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •       •         18       Rahman N.A.A., et al./2019       •       •       •       •       •       •         20       Bär K., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •         21       Mazzola L., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •         22       Dig B. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •       •       •       •       •       •       •       • <td>7</td> <td>Frank A.G., <i>et al.</i> /2019</td> <td>•</td> <td></td> <td>•</td> <td>•</td> <td></td> <td>•</td> <td></td>	7	Frank A.G., <i>et al.</i> /2019	•		•	•		•		
9       Culot G., et al. /2019       •       •       •         10       Ivanov D., et al. /2019       •       •       •         12       Ghadimi P., et al. /2019       •       •       •         13       Panetto H., et al. /2019       •       •       •         14       Manavalan E., lavakrishna K. /2019       •       •       •         15       de la Fuente-Mella H., et al. /2019       •       •       •         16       Sundarakani B., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         16       Sundarakani B., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         17       Zheng M., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         18       Rahman N.A.A., et al /2019       •       •       •       •         19       Pirvulescu P., Enevoldsen P. /2019       •       •       •       •         20       Bär K., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         21       Mazzola L., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         23       Wang B., Ha-Brookshire J.E. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       • <t< td=""><td>8</td><td>Tortorella G., <i>et al.</i> /2019</td><td></td><td></td><td>•</td><td></td><td></td><td>•</td><td></td></t<>	8	Tortorella G., <i>et al.</i> /2019			•			•		
10       Ivanov D., et al. /2019       •       •       •         11       Dolgui A., et al. /2019       •       •       •         12       Ghadmin P., et al. /2019       •       •       •         13       Panetto H., et al. /2019       •       •       •         14       Manavalan E., layakrishna K. /2019       •       •       •         15       de la Fuente-Mella H., et al. /2019       •       •       •         16       Sundarakani B., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         17       Zheng M., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •       •         18       Rahman N.A., et al./2019       •       •       •       •       •       •         20       Bär K., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •         21       Mazzola L., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •         23       Wang B., Ha-Brookshire J.E. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •       •       •       •       •       •       •       •       •       •       •       •       •       •	9	Culot G., <i>et al.</i> /2019	•		•		•	•	•	
11       Dolgui A., et al. /2019       •       •       •         12       Ghadimi P., et al. /2019       •       •       •         13       Panetto H., et al. /2019       •       •       •         14       Manavalan E., layakrishna K. /2019       •       •       •         15       de la Fuente-Mella H., et al. /2019       •       •       •         16       Sundarakani B., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         17       Zheng M., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         18       Rahman N.A.A, et al./2019       •       •       •       •         19       Pirvulescu P., Enevoldsen P. /2019       •       •       •       •         20       Bär K., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         21       Mazzola L., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         22       Ding B. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         23       Wang B., Ha-Brookshire I.E. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         24       Dallasega P., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •	10	Ivanov D., <i>et al.</i> /2019	•		•	•		•		
12       Ghadimi P., et al. /2019       •       •       •         13       Panetto H., et al. /2019       •       •       •         14       Manavalan E., layakrishna K. /2019       •       •       •         15       de la Fuente-Mella H., et al. /2019       •       •       •         16       Sundarakani B., et al. /2019       •       •       •         17       Zheng M., et al. /2019       •       •       •         18       Rahman N.A.A., et al//2019       •       •       •         19       Pirvulescu P., Enevoldsen P. /2019       •       •       •         20       Bär K., et al. /2018       •       •       •         21       Mazzola L., et al. /2018       •       •       •         22       Ding B. /2018       •       •       •       •         23       Wang B., Ha-Brookshire I.E. /2018       •       •       •       •         24       Dallasega P., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         24       Dallasega P., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         25       Pasetti Monizza G., et al. /2018       •       •       •       • <td>11</td> <td>Dolgui A., <i>et al.</i> /2019</td> <td>•</td> <td></td> <td>•</td> <td>•</td> <td></td> <td>•</td> <td></td>	11	Dolgui A., <i>et al.</i> /2019	•		•	•		•		
13       Panetto H., et al. /2019       •       •         14       Manavalan E., layakrishna K. /2019       •       •         15       de la Fuente-Mella H., et al. /2019       •       •         16       Sundarakani B., et al. /2019       •       •         17       Zheng M., et al. /2019       •       •         18       Rahman N.A.A., et al./2019       •       •         19       Pirvulescu P., Enevoldsen P. /2019       •       •         20       Bär K., et al. /2018       •       •         21       Mazzola L., et al. /2018       •       •         22       Ding B. /2018       •       •       •         23       Wang B., Ha-Brookshire I.E. /2018       •       •       •         24       Dallasega P., et al. /2018       •       •       •         25       Pasetti Monizza G., et al. /2018       •       •       •         26       Telukdarie A., et al. /2018       •       •       •         27       Bienhaus F., Hadud A. /2018       •       •       •         28       Lutra S., Mangla S.K. /2018       •       •       •         31       Gružauskas V., et al. /2018       •	12	Ghadimi P., <i>et al.</i> /2019	•	•			•		•	
14       Manavalan E., Javakrishna K. /2019       •       •       •         15       de la Fuente-Mella H., et al. /2019       •       •       •         16       Sundarakani B., et al. /2019       •       •       •         17       Zheng M., et al. /2019       •       •       •       •         18       Rahman N.A.A., et al./2019       •       •       •       •         19       Pirvulescu P., Enevoldsen P. /2019       •       •       •       •         20       Bär K., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         21       Mazzola L., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         23       Wang B., Ha-Brookshire J.E. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •         24       Dallasega P., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •         25       Pasetti Monizza G., et al. /2018       • <t< td=""><td>13</td><td>Panetto H., <i>et al.</i> /2019</td><td>•</td><td>•</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>•</td><td></td></t<>	13	Panetto H., <i>et al.</i> /2019	•	•				•		
15       de la Fuente-Mella H., et al. /2019       •       •         16       Sundarakani B., et al. /2019       •       •         17       Zheng M., et al. /2019       •       •         18       Rahman N.A.A., et al/2019.       •       •       •         19       Pirvulescu P., Enevoldsen P. /2019       •       •       •         20       Bär K., et al. /2018       •       •       •         21       Mazzola L., et al. /2018       •       •       •         22       Ding B. /2018       •       •       •       •         23       Wang B., Ha-Brookshire I.E. /2018       •       •       •       •         24       Dallasega P., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         25       Pasetti Monizza G., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         26       Telukdarie A., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         28       Luthra S., Mangla S.K. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •         30       Fernández-Caramés T.M., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •       •       •       •	14	Manavalan E., Jayakrishna K. /2019	•	•			•		•	
16       Sundarakani B., et al. /2019       •       •       •         17       Zheng M., et al. /2019       •       •       •         18       Rahman N.A.A., et al./2019       •       •       •         19       Pirvulescu P., Enevoldsen P. /2019       •       •       •         20       Bär K., et al. /2018       •       •       •         21       Mazzola L., et al. /2018       •       •       •         22       Ding B. /2018       •       •       •       •         23       Wang B., Ha-Brookshire J.E. /2018       •       •       •       •         24       Dallasega P., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         25       Pasetti Monizza G., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         26       Telukdarie A., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         29       Lenz J., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         29       Lenz J., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         31       Gružauskas V., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         32       Byrne G., et al. /2018       •	15	de la Fuente-Mella H., <i>et al. /</i> 2019	•	•				•		
17       Zheng M., et al. /2019       •       •       •         18       Rahman N.A.A., et al/2019       •       •       •         19       Pirvulescu P., Enevoldsen P. /2019       •       •       •         20       Bär K., et al. /2018       •       •       •         21       Mazzola L., et al. /2018       •       •       •         23       Wang B., Ha-Brookshire J.E. /2018       •       •       •         24       Dallasega P., et al. /2018       •       •       •         25       Pasetti Monizza G., et al. /2018       •       •       •         26       Telukdarie A., et al. /2018       •       •       •         27       Bienhaus F., Haddud A. /2018       •       •       •         28       Luthra S., Mangla S.K. /2018       •       •       •         30       Fernández-Caramés T.M., et al. /2018       •       •       •         31       Gružauskas V., et al. /2018       •       •       •         32       Byrne G., et al. /2018       •       •       •         33       Cruz Introini S., et al. /2018       •       •       •         34       Xue X., et al. /2018 <td>16</td> <td>Sundarakani B., <i>et al. /</i>2019</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>•</td> <td></td> <td>•</td> <td></td> <td>•</td>	16	Sundarakani B., <i>et al. /</i> 2019			•		•		•	
18       Rahman N.A.A., et al/2019       •       •       •         19       Pirvulescu P., Enevoldsen P. /2019       •       •       •         20       Bär K., et al. /2018       •       •       •         21       Mazzola L., et al. /2018       •       •       •         22       Ding B. /2018       •       •       •         23       Wang B., Ha-Brookshire J.E. /2018       •       •       •         24       Dallasega P., et al. /2018       •       •       •         25       Pasetti Monizza G., et al. /2018       •       •       •         26       Telukdarie A., et al. /2018       •       •       •         27       Bienhaus F., Haddud A. /2018       •       •       •         28       Luthra S., Mangla S.K. /2018       •       •       •         29       Lenz J., et al. /2018       •       •       •         31       Gružauskas V., et al. /2018       •       •       •         32       Byrne G., et al. /2018       •       •       •         33       Cruz Introini S., et al. /2018       •       •       •         34       Xue X., et al. /2018       •	17	Zheng M., <i>et al.</i> /2019		•				•	•	
19       Pirvulescu P., Enevoldsen P. /2019       •       •       •         20       Bär K., et al. /2018       •       •       •         21       Mazzola L., et al. /2018       •       •       •         22       Ding B. /2018       •       •       •       •         23       Wang B., Ha-Brookshire I.E. /2018       •       •       •       •         24       Dallasega P., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         25       Pasetti Monizza G., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         26       Telukdarie A., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         27       Bienhaus F., Haddud A. /2018       •       •       •       •         29       Lenz J., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         30       Fernández-Caramés T.M., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         31       Gružauskas V., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         33       Cruz Introini S., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •         34       Xue X., et al. /2018       •       •       • </td <td>18</td> <td>Rahman N.A.A., <i>et al</i>/2019.</td> <td></td> <td>•</td> <td>•</td> <td>•</td> <td>•</td> <td>•</td> <td></td>	18	Rahman N.A.A., <i>et al</i> /2019.		•	•	•	•	•		
20       Bär K., et al. /2018       •       •         21       Mazzola L., et al. /2018       •       •         22       Ding B. /2018       •       •         23       Wang B., Ha-Brookshire I.E. /2018       •       •         24       Dallasega P., et al. /2018       •       •         25       Pasetti Monizza G., et al. /2018       •       •         26       Telukdarie A., et al. /2018       •       •         27       Bienhaus F., Haddud A. /2018       •       •         28       Luthra S., Mangla S.K. /2018       •       •         29       Lenz J., et al. /2018       •       •         30       Fernández-Caramés T.M., et al. /2018       •       •         31       Gružauskas V., et al. /2018       •       •         32       Byrne G., et al. /2018       •       •       •         34       Xue X., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         36       Ivanov D., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         37       Tombido L.L., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         39       Dolgui A., et al. /2018       •       •       •	19	Pirvulescu P., Enevoldsen P. /2019		•	•	•	•	•		
21       Mazzola L., et al. /2018       •       •       •         22       Ding B. /2018       •       •       •         23       Wang B., Ha-Brookshire I.E. /2018       •       •       •         24       Dallasega P., et al. /2018       •       •       •         25       Pasetti Monizza G., et al. /2018       •       •       •         26       Telukdarie A., et al. /2018       •       •       •         27       Bienhaus F., Haddud A. /2018       •       •       •         28       Luthra S., Mangla S.K. /2018       •       •       •         29       Lenz J., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         30       Fernández-Caramés T.M., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         31       Gružauskas V., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         33       Cruz Introini S., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         34       Xue X., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •         35       Melnyk S.A., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •         36	20	Bär K., <i>et al. /</i> 2018	•					•		
22       Ding B. /2018       •       •       •         23       Wang B., Ha-Brookshire J.E. /2018       •       •       •         24       Dallasega P., et al. /2018       •       •       •         25       Pasetti Monizza G., et al. /2018       •       •       •         26       Telukdarie A., et al. /2018       •       •       •         27       Bienhaus F., Haddud A. /2018       •       •       •         28       Luthra S., Mangla S.K. /2018       •       •       •         29       Lenz J., et al. /2018       •       •       •         30       Fernández-Caramés T.M., et al. /2018       •       •       •         31       Gružauskas V., et al. /2018       •       •       •         32       Byrne G., et al. /2018       •       •       •         33       Cruz Introini S., et al. /2018       •       •       •         34       Xue X., et al. /2018       •       •       •         35       Melnyk S.A., et al. /2018       •       •       •         36       Ivanov D., et al. /2018       •       •       •         37       Tombido L.L., et al. /2018       • <td>21</td> <td>Mazzola L., <i>et al.</i> /2018</td> <td></td> <td>•</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>•</td> <td>•</td>	21	Mazzola L., <i>et al.</i> /2018		•				•	•	
23       Wang B., Ha-Brookshire J.E. /2018       •       •         24       Dallasega P., et al. /2018       •       •         25       Pasetti Monizza G., et al. /2018       •       •         26       Telukdarie A., et al. /2018       •       •         27       Bienhaus F., Haddud A. /2018       •       •         28       Luthra S., Mangla S.K. /2018       •       •         29       Lenz J., et al. /2018       •       •         29       Lenz J., et al. /2018       •       •         30       Fernández-Caramés T.M., et al. /2018       •       •         31       Gružauskas V., et al. /2018       •       •         32       Byrne G., et al. /2018       •       •         33       Cruz Introini S., et al. /2018       •       •         34       Xue X., et al. /2018       •       •       •         35       Melnyk S.A., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         36       Ivanov D., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         37       Tombido L.L., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         39       Dolgui A., et al. /2018       •       • <td>22</td> <td>Ding B. /2018</td> <td>•</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>•</td> <td>•</td> <td></td>	22	Ding B. /2018	•				•	•		
24       Dallasega P., et al. /2018       •       •         25       Pasetti Monizza G., et al. /2018       •       •         26       Telukdarie A., et al. /2018       •       •         27       Bienhaus F., Haddud A. /2018       •       •         28       Luthra S., Mangla S.K. /2018       •       •         29       Lenz J., et al. /2018       •       •         29       Lenz J., et al. /2018       •       •         30       Fernández-Caramés T.M., et al. /2018       •       •         31       Gružauskas V., et al. /2018       •       •         32       Byrne G., et al. /2018       •       •         33       Cruz Introini S., et al. /2018       •       •         34       Xue X., et al. /2018       •       •       •         35       Melnyk S.A., et al. /2018       •       •       •         36       Ivanov D., et al. /2018       •       •       •         39       Dolgui A., et al. /2018       •       •       •         40       Barata J., et al. /2018       •       •       •         41       Ante G., et al. /2017       •       •       •         4	23	Wang B., Ha-Brookshire J.E. /2018	•				•			
25       Pasetti Monizza G., et al. /2018       •       •         26       Telukdarie A., et al. /2018       •       •         27       Bienhaus F., Haddud A. /2018       •       •         28       Luthra S., Mangla S.K. /2018       •       •         29       Lenz J., et al. /2018       •       •         29       Lenz J., et al. /2018       •       •         30       Fernández-Caramés T.M., et al. /2018       •       •         31       Gružauskas V., et al. /2018       •       •         32       Byrne G., et al. /2018       •       •         33       Cruz Introini S., et al. /2018       •       •         34       Xue X., et al. /2018       •       •       •         35       Melnyk S.A., et al. /2018       •       •       •         36       Ivanov D., et al. /2018       •       •       •         37       Tombido L.L., et al. /2018       •       •       •         39       Dolgui A., et al. /2018       •       •       •         40       Barata J., et al. /2018       •       •       •         41       Ante G., et al. /2018       •       •       •	24	Dallasega P., et al. /2018	•	•			•			
26       Telukdarie A., et al. /2018       •       •         27       Bienhaus F., Haddud A. /2018       •       •         28       Luthra S., Mangla S.K. /2018       •       •         29       Lenz J., et al. /2018       •       •         30       Fernández-Caramés T.M., et al. /2018       •       •         31       Gružauskas V., et al. /2018       •       •         32       Byrne G., et al. /2018       •       •         33       Cruz Introini S., et al. /2018       •       •         34       Xue X., et al. /2018       •       •         35       Melnyk S.A., et al. /2018       •       •         36       Ivanov D., et al. /2018       •       •         37       Tombido L.L., et al. /2018       •       •         38       Dallasega P. /2018       •       •         40       Barata J., et al. /2018       •       •         41       Ante G., et al. /2018       •       •         42       Müller J.M., Voigt KI. /2018       •       •         43       Shamim S., et al. /2017       •       •         44       Haverkort B.R., Zimmerman A. /2017       •       • <t< td=""><td>25</td><td>Pasetti Monizza G., et al. /2018</td><td>•</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>•</td><td></td></t<>	25	Pasetti Monizza G., et al. /2018	•					•		
27       Bienhaus F., Haddud A. /2018       •       •         28       Luthra S., Mangla S.K. /2018       •       •         29       Lenz J., et al. /2018       •       •         30       Fernández-Caramés T.M., et al. /2018       •       •         31       Gružauskas V., et al. /2018       •       •         32       Byrne G., et al. /2018       •       •         33       Cruz Introini S., et al. /2018       •       •         34       Xue X., et al. /2018       •       •       •         35       Melnyk S.A., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         36       Ivanov D., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         36       Ivanov D., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •         37       Tombido L.L., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •         38       Dallasega P. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •         40       Barata J., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •         42       Müller J.M., Voigt KL. /2018       •	26	Telukdarie A., et al. /2018	•					•		
28       Luthra S., Mangla S.K. /2018       •       •         29       Lenz J., et al. /2018       •       •         30       Fernández-Caramés T.M., et al. /2018       •       •         31       Gružauskas V., et al. /2018       •       •         32       Byrne G., et al. /2018       •       •         33       Cruz Introini S., et al. /2018       •       •         34       Xue X., et al. /2018       •       •         35       Melnyk S.A., et al. /2018       •       •         36       Ivanov D., et al. /2018       •       •       •         37       Tombido L.L., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         38       Dallasega P. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         39       Dolgui A., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         41       Ante G., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         42       Müller J.M., Voigt KI. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         43       Shamim S., et al. /2017       •       •       •       •       •       •         44	27	Bienhaus F., Haddud A. /2018			•		•			
29       Lenz J., et al. /2018       •       •       •         30       Fernández-Caramés T.M., et al. /2018       •       •       •         31       Gružauskas V., et al. /2018       •       •       •         32       Byrne G., et al. /2018       •       •       •         33       Cruz Introini S., et al. /2018       •       •       •         34       Xue X., et al. /2018       •       •       •         35       Melnyk S.A., et al. /2018       •       •       •         36       Ivanov D., et al. /2018       •       •       •         37       Tombido L.L., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         38       Dallasega P. /2018       •       •       •       •         39       Dolgui A., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         41       Ante G., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         42       Müller J.M., Voigt KI. /2018       •       •       •       •         43       Shamim S., et al. /2017       •       •       •       •         44       Haverkort B.R., Zimmermann A. /2017       •       •       •	28	Luthra S., Mangla S.K. /2018	•					•		
30       Fernández-Caramés T.M., et al. /2018       •       •         31       Gružauskas V., et al. /2018       •       •       •         32       Byrne G., et al. /2018       •       •       •         33       Cruz Introini S., et al. /2018       •       •       •         34       Xue X., et al. /2018       •       •       •         35       Melnyk S.A., et al. /2018       •       •       •         36       Ivanov D., et al. /2018       •       •       •         37       Tombido L.L., et al. /2018       •       •       •         38       Dallasega P. /2018       •       •       •       •         39       Dolgui A., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         40       Barata J., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         41       Ante G., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         42       Müller J.M., Voigt KI. /2018       •       •       •       •         43       Shamim S., et al. /2017       •       •       •       •         44       Haverkort B.R., Zimmermann A. /2017       •       •       •       •	29	Lenz J., et al. /2018	•	•				•		
31       Gružauskas V., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         32       Byrne G., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         33       Cruz Introini S., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         34       Xue X., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         34       Xue X., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         35       Melnyk S.A., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         36       Ivanov D., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •         37       Tombido L.L., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •         38       Dallasega P. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •         39       Dolgui A., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •         41       Ante G., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •         42       Müller J.M., Voigt KI. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •	30	Fernández-Caramés T.M., et al. /2018	•						•	
32       Byrne G., et al. /2018       •       •       •         33       Cruz Introini S., et al. /2018       •       •       •         34       Xue X., et al. /2018       •       •       •         35       Melnyk S.A., et al. /2018       •       •       •         36       Ivanov D., et al. /2018       •       •       •         37       Tombido L.L., et al. /2018       •       •       •         38       Dallasega P. /2018       •       •       •         39       Dolgui A., et al. /2018       •       •       •         40       Barata J., et al. /2018       •       •       •         41       Ante G., et al. /2018       •       •       •         42       Müller J.M., Voigt KI. /2018       •       •       •         43       Shamim S., et al. /2017       •       •       •         44       Haverkort B.R., Zimmermann A. /2017       •       •       •         45       Majeed M.A.A., Rupasinghe T.D. /2017       •       •       •         46       Tjahjono B., et al. /2017       •       •       •       •         47       Dallasega P., et al. /2016 <t< td=""><td>31</td><td>Gružauskas V., et al. /2018</td><td>•</td><td></td><td>•</td><td></td><td>•</td><td></td><td></td></t<>	31	Gružauskas V., et al. /2018	•		•		•			
33       Cruz Introini S., et al. /2018       •       •       •         34       Xue X., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         35       Melnyk S.A., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         36       Ivanov D., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •         36       Ivanov D., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •         37       Tombido L.L., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •         38       Dallasega P. /2018       •<	32	Byrne G., et al. /2018	•					•		
34       Xue X., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         35       Melnyk S.A., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         36       Ivanov D., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         36       Ivanov D., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         37       Tombido L.L., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         38       Dallasega P. /2018       •       •       •       •         39       Dolgui A., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         40       Barata J., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         41       Ante G., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         42       Müller J.M., Voigt KI. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         43       Shamim S., et al. /2017       •       •       •       •       •       •         44       Haverkort B.R., Zimmermann A. /2017       •       •       •       •       •         45       Majeed M.A.A., Rupasinghe T.D. /2017       •       •       •       •       •       •	33	Cruz Introini S., <i>et al.</i> /2018				•	•	•	•	
35       Melnyk S.A., et al. /2018       •	34	Xue X., <i>et al.</i> /2018		•		•			•	
36       Ivanov D., et al. /2018       •       •       •         37       Tombido L.L., et al. /2018       •       •       •         38       Dallasega P. /2018       •       •       •       •         39       Dolgui A., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         40       Barata J., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         41       Ante G., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         42       Müller J.M., Voigt KI. /2018       •       •       •       •         43       Shamim S., et al. /2017       •       •       •       •         44       Haverkort B.R., Zimmermann A. /2017       •       •       •       •         45       Majeed M.A.A., Rupasinghe T.D. /2017       •       •       •       •         46       Tjahjono B., et al. /2017       •       •       •       •         47       Dallasega P., et al. /2017       •       •       •       •         48       Huang Y., et al. /2016       •       •       •       •         49       Reddy G.R.K., et al. /2016       •       •       •       • <t< td=""><td>35</td><td>Melnyk S.A., <i>et al.</i> /2018</td><td>•</td><td></td><td>•</td><td>•</td><td>•</td><td>•</td><td>•</td></t<>	35	Melnyk S.A., <i>et al.</i> /2018	•		•	•	•	•	•	
37       Tombido L.L., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •         38       Dallasega P. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         39       Dolgui A., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •         40       Barata J., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •         41       Ante G., et al. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •         42       Müller J.M., Voigt KI. /2018       •       •       •       •       •       •         43       Shamim S., et al. /2017       •       •       •       •       •       •         44       Haverkort B.R., Zimmermann A. /2017       •       •       •       •       •         45       Majeed M.A.A., Rupasinghe T.D. /2017       •       •       •       •       •         46       Tjahjono B., et al. /2017       •       •       •       •       •       •         48       Huang Y., et al. /2016       •       •       •       •       •       •         49       Reddy G.R.K., et al. /2016       •       •       •       •       •<	36	Ivanov D., <i>et al.</i> /2018	•	•				•		
38       Dallasega P. /2018       •	37	Tombido L.L., <i>et al.</i> /2018	•				•			
39       Dolgui A., et al. /2018       • </td <td>38</td> <td>Dallasega P. /2018</td> <td>•</td> <td></td> <td>•</td> <td></td> <td>•</td> <td>•</td> <td></td>	38	Dallasega P. /2018	•		•		•	•		
40       Barata J., et al. /2018       • </td <td>39</td> <td>Dolgui A., <i>et al.</i> /2018</td> <td>•</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>•</td> <td></td>	39	Dolgui A., <i>et al.</i> /2018	•					•		
41       Ante G., et al. /2018       • <td>40</td> <td>Barata J., <i>et al.</i> /2018</td> <td></td> <td>•</td> <td>•</td> <td>•</td> <td>•</td> <td>•</td> <td>•</td>	40	Barata J., <i>et al.</i> /2018		•	•	•	•	•	•	
42       Muller J.M., Voigt KI. / 2018       •	41	Ante G., <i>et al.</i> /2018	•					•		
43       Snamim S., et al. /2017       • </td <td>42</td> <td>Muller J.M., Volgt KI. /2018</td> <td>•</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>•</td> <td>•</td> <td></td>	42	Muller J.M., Volgt KI. /2018	•				•	•		
44       Haverkort B.K., Zimmermann A. /201/       •	43	Snamim S., et al. / 2017	•					•	•	
45       Majeed M.A.A., Rupasingne 1.D. / 2017       •	44	Haverkort B.K., Zimmermann A. /2017		•				•	•	
40       1 Janjono B., et al. /2017       •	45	Majeed M.A.A., Rupasinghe T.D. / 2017		•	•	•		•	•	
47       Danasega P., et al. /2017       •       •       •         48       Huang Y., et al. /2016       •       •       •         49       Reddy G.R.K., et al. /2016       •       •       •         50       Kovács G., Kot S. /2016       •       •       •         51       Ivanov D. et al. /2016       •       •       •	40	1  Janjono B., et al.  / 2017	•	•		<u> </u>	•	•	•	
48       Huang Y., et al. /2016       •       •         49       Reddy G.R.K., et al. /2016       •       •         50       Kovács G., Kot S. /2016       •       •         51       Ivanov D. et al. /2016       •       •	4/	Danasega P., et al. /201/	•	•				•		
49     Keddy G.K.K., et al. /2016     •     •       50     Kovács G., Kot S. /2016     •     •       51     Ivanov D. et al. /2016     •     •	48	nuang Y., et al. /2016	•					•		
DU         NOVACS G., KOL 5. / 2010         • <td>49 E0</td> <td>Keuuy G.K.K., <i>et al.</i> /2016</td> <td>•</td> <td> </td> <td></td> <td><u> </u></td> <td></td> <td>•</td> <td></td>	49 E0	Keuuy G.K.K., <i>et al.</i> /2016	•			<u> </u>		•		
	5U E1	NOVACS G., KOL S. $/2016$			•		•	•		

Taking into consideration the abovementioned elements, Table 2 provides a summary of the results, which show the following:

The majority of publications (66.6%) have Engineering related subject, while Computer Science, Business, Management and Accounting, and Decision Sciences account for 41.2%, 35.3 % and 21.6% respectively. All three levels of Industry 4.0 are covered within all subject areas, and in several proportions: The Supply Chain Perspective (level 1) has been discussed more from a Business, Management and Accounting framework (66.7%) followed by Computer Science with 61.9%. The Production or Consumption Perspective (level 2) has a 100% presence in Decision Science related articles, and 83.3% in Business, Management and Accounting. The Internet of Things and Services (level 3) is present in 45.5% in Decision Science related articles, and 33.3% in Business, Management and Accounting. Under Engineering subject area, the most popular among the levels is No 2, which accounts for the 24 articles, and is justified since level 2 covers the production (manufacturing) operations. The same goes for the Business, Management and Accounting and Decision Science related subjects. Under Computer Sciences area, there are almost the same number of articles for the first 2 levels, while the Internet of Things and Services stays low with only 4 publications. The latest is a common element for the rest of the subject areas, where level 3 accounts for the less proportion compared to the other two.

*	ENG		CS		BN	ЛA	DS		
	#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%	
Articles: 51	34	66.6	21	41.2	18	35.3	11	21.6	
Level 1	15	44	13	61.9	12	66.7	4	36.4	
Level 2	24	70.6	12	57.1	15	83.3	11	100	
Level 3	10	29.4	4	19	6	33.3	5	45.5	

\*An article may cover more than one subject area and may discuss more than one level of Industry 4.0 hierarchy.

# DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS

This paper has reviewed articles about industry 4.0 within the framework of supply chain from the time when Industry 4.0 was introduced. The aim of the authors was to examine the progress and identify any research gaps with relevance to scholarly outcomes on the topic. The authors utilized a deductive method in order to select the final 51 articles for a more detailed screening, which showed the following observations:

- a. The topic is still in its early stages for researchers and more studies can deal with the supply chain in the context of industry 4.0.
- b. The majority of the articles focus on the production perspective, while the service and the supply chain as a whole perspectives account less interest;

- c. Only (16%) of the publications cover all three levels of Industry 4.0 Hierarchy, an element that can be addressed more in the future.
- d. From the findings, we can see that the majority of publications (66.6%) is concentrated on Engineering; authors feel that other subject area need more attention from researchers.

As it can be derived from the aforementioned, researchers can move towards applications of Industry 4.0 within the supply chain context from a more holistic point of view. This refers to both Supply Chain and Industry 4.0 elements.

Moreover, and based on the limitations of the current work regarding the selection of the database and the applied deductive methodology, further and more detailed bibliographical review can occur, taken into consideration a more extended variety of criteria and subject areas.

In summary, this systematic literature review has provided the status of the Industry 4.0 in relation to supply chain through the analysis of academic publications. It has also underlined suggestions for some potential directions based on gaps that were detected.

### REFERENCES

- America, R. (2015). *America's Moment: Creating Opportunity in the Connected Age.* WW Norton & Company.
- Ante, G., Facchini, F., Mossa, G., & Digiesi, S. (2018). Developing a key performance indicators tree for lean and smart production systems. *IFAC-PapersOnLine*, *51*(11), 13-18.
- Ardito, L., Petruzzelli, A., Panniello, U., & Garavelli, A. (2019). Towards Industry 4.0: Mapping digital technologies for supply chain management-marketing integration. *Business Process Management Journal*, 25(2), 323-346.
- Bär, K., Herbert-Hansen, Z., & Khalid, W. (2018). Considering Industry 4.0 aspects in the supply chain for an SME. *Production Engineering*, 12(6), 747-758.
- Barata, J., Rupino Da Cunha, P., & Stal, J. (2018). Mobile supply chain management in the Industry 4.0 era: An annotated bibliography and guide for future research. *Journal of Enterprise Information Management*, 31(1), 173-192.
- Bienhaus, F., & Haddud, A. (2018). Procurement 4.0: factors influencing the digitisation of procurement and supply chains. *Business Process Management Journal*, *24*(4), 965-984.
- Byrne, G., Dimitrov, D., Monostori, L., Teti, R., van Houten, F., & Wertheim, R. (2018). Biologicalisation: Biological transformation in manufacturing. *CIRP Journal of Manufacturing Science and Technology*, 21, 1-32.
- Conseil national de l'industrie. (2013). *The New Face of Industry in France*. Paris: French National Industry Council.
- Cruz Introini, S., Boza, A., & Alemany, M. (2018). Traceability in the Food Supply Chain: Review of the literature from a technological perspective. *Direccion y Organizacion, 64*, 50-55.

- Culot, G., Orzes, G., & Sartor, M. (2019). Integration and Scale in the Context of Industry 4.0: The Evolving Shapes of Manufacturing Value Chains. *IEEE Engineering Management Review*, 47(1), 45-51.
- da Silva, V., Kovaleski, J., & Pagani, R. (2019). Technology transfer in the supply chain oriented to industry 4.0: a literature review. *Technology Analysis and Strategic Management*, *31*(5), 546-562.
- Dallasega, P. (2018). Industry 4.0 fostering construction supply chain management: Lessons learned from engineer-to-order suppliers. *IEEE Engineering Management Review*, *46*(3), 49-55.
- Dallasega, P., Rauch, E., & Linder, C. (2018). Industry 4.0 as an enabler of proximity for construction supply chains: A systematic literature review. *Computers in Industry*, *99*, 205-225.
- Dallasega, P., Rojas, R., Rauch, E., & Matt, D. (2017). Simulation Based Validation of Supply Chain Effects through ICT enabled Real-time-capability in ETO Production Planning. *Procedia Manufacturing*, 11, 846-853.
- de la Fuente-Mella, H., Rojas Fuentes, J., & Leiva, V. (2019). Econometric modeling of productivity and technical efficiency in the Chilean manufacturing industry. *Computers and Industrial Engineering*.
- Ding, B. (2018). Pharma Industry 4.0: Literature review and research opportunities in sustainable pharmaceutical supply chains. *Process Safety and Environmental Protection*, *119*, 115-130.
- Dolgui, A., Ivanov, D., Sethi, S., & Sokolov, B. (2018). CONTROL THEORY APPLICATIONS TO OPERATIONS SYSTEMS, SUPPLY CHAIN MANAGEMENT AND INDUSTRY 4.0 NETWORKS. *IFAC-PapersOnLine*, *51*(11), 1536-1541.
- Dolgui, A., Ivanov, D., Sethi, S., & Sokolov, B. (2019). Scheduling in production, supply chain and Industry
  4.0 systems by optimal control: fundamentals, state-of-the-art and applications. *International Journal of Production Research*, 57(2), 411-432.
- Drath, R., & Horch, A. (2014). Industrie 4.0: Hit or hype?[industry forum]. *IEEE industrial electronics magazine*, 8(2), 56-58.
- European Commission. (2016). *Factories of the Future PPP: Towards Competitive EU Manufacturing.* Bruxelles: European Commission.
- Fernández-Caramés, T., Fraga-Lamas, P., Suárez-Albela, M., & Díaz-Bouza, M. (2018). A fog computing based cyber-physical system for the automation of pipe-related tasks in the industry 4.0 shipyard. *Sensors (Switzerland), 18*(6).
- Foresight. (2013). *The Future of Manufacturing: A New Era of Opportunity and Challenge for the UK.* London: UK Government.
- Frank, A., Dalenogare, L., & Ayala, N. (2019). Industry 4.0 technologies: Implementation patterns in manufacturing companies. *International Journal of Production Economics, 210*, 15-26.
- Galati, F., & Bigliardi, B. (2019). Industry 4.0: Emerging themes and future research avenues using a text mining approach. *Computers in Industry*, *109*, 100-113.

- Ghadimi, P., Wang, C., Lim, M., & Heavey, C. (2019). Intelligent sustainable supplier selection using multiagent technology: Theory and application for Industry 4.0 supply chains. *Computers and Industrial Engineering*, *127*, 588-600.
- Gružauskas, V., Baskutis, S., & Navickas, V. (2018). Minimizing the trade-off between sustainability and cost effective performance by using autonomous vehicles. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 184, 709-717.
- Haverkort, B., & Zimmermann, A. (2017). Smart Industry: How ICT Will Change the Game! *IEEE Internet Computing*, *21*(1), 8-10.
- Henning, K. (2013). Recommendations for implementing the strategic initiative INDUSTRIE 4.0.
- Huang, Y., Xu, Y., Fang, X., & Wei, B. (2016). Current status, future developments and recent patents on big data technique in process control systems. *Recent Patents on Mechanical Engineering*, 9(2), 112-124.
- Ivanov, D., Dolgui, A., & Sokolov, B. (2019). The impact of digital technology and Industry 4.0 on the ripple effect and supply chain risk analytics. *International Journal of Production Research*, *57*(3), 829-846.
- Ivanov, D., Sethi, S., Dolgui, A., & Sokolov, B. (2018). A survey on control theory applications to operational systems, supply chain management, and Industry 4.0. *Annual Reviews in Control, 46*, 134-147.
- Ivanov, D., Sokolov, B., & Ivanova, M. (2016). Schedule coordination in cyber-physical supply networks Industry 4.0. *IFAC-PapersOnLine*, *49*(12), 839-844.
- Kang, H., Lee, J., Choi, S., Kim, H., Park, J., Son, J., . . . Do Noh, S. (2016). Smart manufacturing: Past research, present findings, and future directions. *International Journal of Precision Engineering and Manufacturing-Green Technology*, 3(1), 111-128.
- Lenz, J., Wuest, T., & Westkämper, E. (2018). Holistic approach to machine tool data analytics. *Journal of Manufacturing Systems*, 48, 180-191.
- Li, K. (2015). Made in China 2025. Beijing: State Council of China.
- Luthra, S., & Mangla, S. (2018). Evaluating challenges to Industry 4.0 initiatives for supply chain sustainability in emerging economies. *Process Safety and Environmental Protection*, *117*, 168-179.
- Majeed, M., & Rupasinghe, T. (2017). Internet of things (IoT) embedded future supply chains for industry
  4.0: An assessment from an ERP-based fashion apparel and footwear industry. *International Journal of Supply Chain Management*, 6(1), 25-40.
- Manavalan, E., & Jayakrishna, K. (2019). A review of Internet of Things (IoT) embedded sustainable supply chain for industry 4.0 requirements. *Computers and Industrial Engineering*, *127*, 925-953.
- Mazzola, L., Waibel, P., Kaphanke, P., & Klusch, M. (2018). Smart process optimization and adaptive execution with semantic services in cloud manufacturing. *Information (Switzerland)*, 9(11).

- Melnyk, S., Flynn, B., & Awaysheh, A. (2018). The best of times and the worst of times: empirical operations and supply chain management research. *International Journal of Production Research*, 56(1-2), 164-192.
- Müller, F., Jaeger, D., & Hanewinkel, M. (2019). Digitization in wood supply A review on how Industry 4.0 will change the forest value chain. *Computers and Electronics in Agriculture, 162*, 206-218.
- Müller, J., & Voigt, K.-I. (2018). The Impact of Industry 4.0 on Supply Chains in Engineer-to-Order Industries An Exploratory Case Study. *IFAC-PapersOnLine*, *51*(11), 122-127.
- Nascimento, D., Alencastro, V., Quelhas, O., Caiado, R., Garza-Reyes, J., Lona, L., & Tortorella, G. (2019). Exploring Industry 4.0 technologies to enable circular economy practices in a manufacturing context: A business model proposal. *Journal of Manufacturing Technology Management, 30*(3), 607-627.
- Panetto, H., Iung, B., Ivanov, D., Weichhart, G., & Wang, X. (2019). Challenges for the cyber-physical manufacturing enterprises of the future. *Annual Reviews in Control*.
- Pasetti Monizza, G., Bendetti, C., & Matt, D. (2018). Parametric and Generative Design techniques in massproduction environments as effective enablers of Industry 4.0 approaches in the Building Industry. *Automation in Construction*, *92*, 270-285.
- Pirvulescu, P., & Enevoldsen, P. (2019). Supply Chain management in the age of digitalization. *International Journal of Supply Chain Management*, 8(2), 414-428.
- Rahman, N., Muda, J., Mohammad, M., Ahmad, M., Rahim, S., & Fernando, M.-V. (2019). Digitalization and leap frogging strategy among the supply chain member: Facing GIG economy and why should logistics players care? *International Journal of Supply Chain Management*, 8(2), 1042-1048.
- Reddy, G., Singh, H., & Hariharan, S. (2016). Supply chain wide transformation of traditional industry to industry 4.0. *ARPN Journal of Engineering and Applied Sciences*, *11*(18), 11089-11097.
- Saucedo-Martínez, J., Pérez-Lara, M., Marmolejo-Saucedo, J., Salais-Fierro, T., & Vasant, P. (2018). Industry 4.0 framework for management and operations: a review. *Journal of Ambient Intelligence and Humanized Computing*, 1-13.
- Shamim, S., Cang, S., Yu, H., & Li, Y. (2017). Examining the feasibilities of Industry 4.0 for the hospitality sector with the lens of management practice. *Energies*, *10*(4).
- Sundarakani, B., Kamran, R., Maheshwari, P., & Jain, V. (2019). Designing a hybrid cloud for a supply chain network of Industry 4.0: a theoretical framework. *Benchmarking*.
- Telukdarie, A., Buhulaiga, E., Bag, S., Gupta, S., & Luo, Z. (2018). Industry 4.0 implementation for multinationals. *Process Safety and Environmental Protection*, *118*, 316-329.
- Tjahjono, B., Esplugues, C., Ares, E., & Pelaez, G. (2017). What does Industry 4.0 mean to Supply Chain? *Procedia Manufacturing*, *13*, 1175-1182.

- Tombido, L., Louw, L., & van Eeden, J. (2018). A systematic review of 3pls' entry into reverse logistics. *South African Journal of Industrial Engineering, 29*(3 Special Edition), 235-260.
- Tortorella, G., Miorando, R., & Mac Cawley, A. (2019). The moderating effect of Industry 4.0 on the relationship between lean supply chain management and performance improvement. *Supply Chain Management*, *24*(2), 301-314.
- Wang, B., & Ha-Brookshire, J. (2018). Exploration of Digital Competency Requirements within the Fashion Supply Chain with an Anticipation of Industry 4.0. International Journal of Fashion Design, Technology and Education, 11(3), 333-342.
- Xue, X., Kou, Y.-M., Wang, S.-F., & Liu, Z.-Z. (2018). Computational Experiment Research on the Equalization-Oriented Service Strategy in Collaborative Manufacturing. *IEEE Transactions on Services Computing*, 11(2), 369-383.
- Zheng, M., Wu, K., Sun, C., & Pan, E. (2019). Optimal decisions for a two-echelon supply chain with capacity and demand information. *Advanced Engineering Informatics*, *39*, 248-258.