

THE IMPACT OF STRUCTURAL ADJUSTMENT POLICIES ON THE FEMINISATION OF LABOUR: TURKEY AS A CASE

Beyza Ç. KARAHASANOĞLU TEKİN

İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi, İ.İ.B.F., İktisat Bölümü, Araştırma Görevlisi

THE IMPACT OF STRUCTURAL ADJUSTMENT POLICIES ON THE FEMINISATION OF LABOUR: TURKEY AS A CASE

Abstract: For the last two decades, increasing emphasis and attention have been given to the economic situation of women within the context of many changes that occurred in the world economy. Today the world is characterized by major changes in the economic, social and political agendas. The social development model was modified by the developmental strategies of the 1980s supply-side economics following successive economic crises of the 1970s. During the 1980s and afterwards, many developing countries adopted structural adjustment programs that have incorporated elements such as labor market deregulation, public expenditure contractions, privatization and other labor flexibility policies.

The main objective of this paper is to investigate the implications of the structural adjustment policies on gender composition and segregation of labor in Turkey. Like many other developing countries, Turkey has also adopted structural adjustment programs accompanied by the reorientation of the Turkish economy from import-substitution industrialization to export-led industrialization in the post-1980 period. Starting from this point, I will attempt to discuss whether a feminization of labor has occurred in Turkey during the adoption process.

Keywords: Female Labour, Segregation of Labour, Export-Oriented Growth Strategy, Structural Adjustment Programs

YAPISAL UYUM POLİTİKALARI VE KADIN İŞGÜCÜ: TÜRKİYE ÖRNEĞİ

Özet: 1970'li yıllar boyunca birçok az gelişmiş ülkede temel kalkınma stratejisi olan ithal ikameci kalkınma politikalarından ihracata yönelik sanayileşme politikalarına geçilmiştir. Geçiş aşamasında uygulanan yapısal dönüşüm ve reform programlarının geliştirmekte olan ülke ekonomileri üzerindeki etkisi iktisat literatüründe önemli bir yer tutmaktadır. Yapılan çalışmaların önemli bir kısmı bu politikaların işgücü piyasaları üzerindeki etkisini araştırmaya yöneliktir. İşgücü piyasalarında yaşanan yapısal dönüşümün kadın emeğinin arzı üzerindeki etkisi literatürde üzerinde özellikle durulan bir konu olmuştur. Yapılan çalışmalarda dünya genelinde ithal ikameci kalkınma politikalarından ihracata yönelik kalkınma stratejisine geçişle birlikte kadınların işgücüne katılma oranlarında artış yaşandığı gözlenmiştir. Geliştirmekte olan birçok ülkede olduğu gibi Türkiye'de de ithal ikameci sanayileşmeden ihracata yönelik sanayileşme stratejisine geçilirken yapısal uyum politikaları takip edilmiştir. Bu çalışmanın amacı Türkiye'de 1980 sonrası izlenen yapısal uyum politikalarının kadın işgücüne etkilerini incelemek ve işgücünün kadınlaşması olarak yorumlanan sürecin Türkiye'de yaşanıp yaşanmadığını araştırmaktır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Kadın İşgücü, Yapısal Uyum Politikaları, İhracata Dönük Sanayileşme Stratejisi, İşgücü, İstihdam

I. INTRODUCTION

For the last two decades, increasing emphasis and attention have been given to the economic situation of women within the context of many changes that occurred in the world economy. The impact of the present rapidly changing socio-economic climate on women's employment has received much focus. Today the world is characterised by major changes in the economic, social and political agendas. The social adjustment development model was modified by the development strategies of the 1980s supply-side economics following successive economic crises of the 1970s. Subsequently, after the economic crisis of the early 1980s, the majority of the developing countries facing major adjustment problems have adopted policies directed toward restructuring of their economies. A global growth strategy based on

greater market orientation with trade liberalisation was esteemed to be the only viable development strategy for developing countries [1-3].

In addition to industrialised countries, many developing countries, which have also adopted such growth strategies, put great emphasis on cost competitiveness leading to the pursuit of flexibility in labour costs. These structural adjustment programs have incorporated elements such as labour market deregulation, public expenditure contractions, privatisation and other labour flexibility policies. Moreover, globalisation of production, transformations in technology and organisation of work under adjustment have introduced new technologies that have been associated with changing skills and job structures in the labour market. These changes, which are not gender neutral, have direct impact

on the world of employment with both positive and negative consequences on female and male workers.

As a result of these changes, the nature of employment has been rapidly altered, in both developing and industrialised economies. The interrelations between employment and gender have become prominent in the process of the contemporary restructuring of the world economy. The female labour participation rate statistics indicate that woman's economic activity rates and their share of the labour force have been increasing in recent decades [1,4,5]. Arguably, a global feminisation of employment – namely, absolute and relative growth of female labour – is occurring by means of greater labour flexibility [1]. In numerous studies published in recent years, the general consensus tends to reconfirm the existence of this trend referred as the feminisation of the labour force in the literature [1,6].

The main objective of this paper is to investigate the implications of these structural adjustment policies on gender composition and segregation of labour in Turkey. Like many other developing countries, Turkey has also adopted structural adjustment programs accompanied by the reorientation of the Turkish economy from import-substitution industrialisation to export-led industrialisation in the post-1980 period. Starting from this point, I will attempt to discuss whether a feminisation of labour has occurred in Turkey during the adoption process. The results I have obtained during my study appear to undermine the general global consensus on the matter. In other words the transition to export-led growth in Turkey does not seem to be accompanied by neither the feminisation of employment nor the decline in the significance of gender segregation in Turkey [7,8].

In considering the transformation of the nature of employment and its effect on women's employment, the erosion of labour regulations have been critical. Therefore to elaborate on the thesis that there is a global feminisation of employment, it is necessary to begin the analysis with a close examination of the structural adjustment policies and their labour implications. In the following sections, I will first discuss the contemporary structural adjustment processes and the impact of macroeconomic changes on the labour market in general. This introductory part will provide an overview of the current situation of female labour and gender equality with reference to the differential impact of changing global environment on women and men. An overview of the industrialisation strategies and gender composition of labour in the developing countries will also be assessed by a close examination of the literature on female labour and industrialisation. The second part focuses on the consequences of the transition from import substituting industrialisation to export-led growth in Turkey on women. In this part, I will examine the shift in the

Turkish industrialisation strategies in the context of structural adjustment policies in the post-1980 period. Finally I will try to investigate the implications of the changes in industrialisation strategies on gender composition and segregation of employment in Turkey's case.

II. ECONOMIC RESTRUCTURING and GENDER COMPOSITION of EMPLOYMENT

Adjustment and Labour: a brief overview

The social adjustment development model has long influenced policy making in most of the world, particularly after 1945. However, the emergence of successive economic crisis in the 1970s led this model into trouble. The social development model, basically, concerned with a variety of labour standard measures that grant protective legislation for workers and labour security. The advocates of this model thus stand to manage a redistributive welfare state through labour market regulation and larger role for the public sector in economy. By the early 1980s supply-side economic agenda that led to a series of changes in economic policy displaced the social adjustment development model. The economic crisis in the capitalist world economy was the main reason behind the transition from social adjustment development strategies to structural adjustment policies. Although some capitalist economies continued to enjoy high levels of employment and rapid rates of growth, by the late 1970s, most parts of the capitalist world economy particularly Latin America and sub-Saharan Africa have experienced rising unemployment, inflation and indebtedness [9]. Certainly, the crisis of the international capitalist economy has led to the international restructuring of production, significant changes in the organisation of international trade and finance and the informalization of employment.

The result was the adoption of fundamental social and economic restructuring found in the stabilisation and structural adjustment policy packages of IMF and World Bank programs. These structural adjustment programs put great emphasis on market mechanisms and cost competitiveness and accordingly involved policies such as trade liberalisation, cuts in public expenditure, reduction in government intervention, privatisation and labour market deregulation. The aim was to restructure the economy so as to generate growth based on open economies, and meanwhile to reduce the balance of payments deficits. State planning, redistributive welfare state, income security, labour standards and social rights were no longer priority issues. In other words what was considered as objectives of economic growth previously

under the social adjustment development model became costs and rigidities in the 1980s [1,3].

The advocates of supply-side economics have identified export-led industrialisation as the most effective development strategy. Thus, they have been urged to shift resources (including labour) to export industries. This shift has meant switching of resources from domestic nontradable production to tradable exportable production. In order to implement a costless reallocation of resources and cost-cutting international competitiveness, supply side agenda has focused on economic models that entail reducing domestic consumption lowering unit labour costs. These measures no doubt have modified the nature of employment and removed labour market regulations.

Before looking more specifically at how structural adjustment policies have altered the gendered nature of labour market, their general implications should be addressed. As the supply side economics approach advocates reliance on the market mechanism and concerned primarily with the cost competitiveness, labour market regulations were perceived as rigidities raising costs. This has given rise to deregulation, informal and many insecure forms of working activities since flexibility and security erosion enabled employers to substitute lower-cost labour. Low-income, labour abundant countries with low labour costs have played important roles in this process. As Standing [1] argued, international competition from low-income countries where labour costs and labour rights were least developed, has been instrumental in weakening the rights and benefits of those in the lower end of the labour market of many industrialised economies. In the context of this cost-cutting international competitiveness perspective, governments have been urged to remove or weaken minimum wage legislation, implement policies of cuts in public expenditures, privatisation and public sector reform. Such policies have meant increase in low-wage employment and a shift from direct to indirect forms of employment such as temporary, part-time employment. The pursuit of flexibility and low cost has also encouraged outwork sources and the use of homeworking where labour regulations are least effective [1,10].

The adjustment policies also brought about increased incentives to the production of tradable goods relative to nontradables (goods that are only consumed domestically). From this perspective the effects of adjustment on wages indicate a rise in relative wages in the tradables sector. However, in tradables the effects could go other way depending on the relative magnitude of the substitution (labour crowding) effects [4]. Structural adjustment programs are also generally associated with the tendency for labour to move into sectors with flexible entry such as the informal and agricultural sector. Then labour crowding in these sectors

may have the effect of depressing relative wages. Although informal sector is highly heterogeneous and there is no clean coincidence between informality and non-tradability, certain kinds of activity in the informal sector such as petty commerce (where women are over-represented) may fall in the category of non-tradables. In the rural sector of the developing countries that implemented stabilisation and structural adjustment, the effects of adjustment on agricultural incomes appear to be more positive compared to incomes in the formal and informal urban-sectors [4]. The increase in relative prices of agricultural output due to market deregulation and trade liberalisation brings about the increased incentives for agricultural production. Moreover, employment-income reducing policies such as public sector expenditure cuts have more limited effects in rural areas. Due to the expansion of export crop production, the benefits of the growth of agricultural exports under trade liberalisation also generate possibilities for rural wage employment growth.

Gender Analysis of Adjustment and Women's Work in Developing Countries

Changes in levels and structure of employment

Even though measurements of labour force participation are dubious and limitations in data collection undercount women's economic activities, the available data indicate that women's participation and economic activity rates have been rising [5]. The ratio of women to men in the economically active population of age 15 and over has increased from 37:100 in 1970 to 62:100 in 1990 [11]. The average participation rate was highest among women in Eastern Europe and Central Asia. In 1990 woman's economic activity rates were 58 per cent for Central Asia and Eastern Europe. In the developed regions outside of Europe and sub-Saharan Africa and Southeastern Asia it was 53-54 per cent, and it was around 50 per cent in Western Europe, the Caribbean and Oceania. The rates for Latin America and Western Asia were considerably lower, while they were 30-34 per cent for Western Asia and the lowest 21 per cent for North Africa. Over the past two decades, economic activity rates show that woman's share of the labour force have been increasing in all regions except sub-Saharan Africa and Eastern Asia by contrast to men's whose average economic activity rates have declined significantly everywhere except Central Asia (Table.1).

**Table.1: Economic Activity Rates of Persons
Aged 15 and over by Sex, 1970-1990**

	Adult economic activity rate (percentage)					
	1970		1980		1990*	
	W	M	W	M	W	M
<u>Developed Regions</u>						
Eastern Europe*	56	79	56	77	58	74
Western Europe**	37	78	42	75	51	72
Other Developed	40	81	46	78	54	75
<u>Africa</u>						
Northern Africa	8	82	12	79	21	75
Sub-Saharan Africa	57	90	54	89	53	83
<u>Latin America and Caribbean</u>						
Latin America	22	85	25	82	34	82
Caribbean	38	81	42	77	49	72
<u>Asia and Pacific</u>						
Eastern Asia	57	86	58	83	56	80
South-Eastern Asia	49	87	51	85	54	81
Southern Asia	25	88	24	85	44	78
Central Asia**	55	76	56	77	58	79
Western Asia**	22	83	26	81	30	77
Oceania	47	88	46	86	48	76

Despite woman's rising economic activity rates, and men's declining rates over the past two decades the gender gap continue to remain wide. There is evidence of a widespread positive trend in many parts of the developing countries in terms of the women's rising economic activity rates [1]. However, such rising rates of female participation in paid labour were not accompanied by a qualitative improvement but deterioration in the economic position of women [9]. Women have increasingly entered the labour force with highly disadvantageous conditions. Declining of household incomes as real wages fall and increasing unemployment under adjustment lead to the increased participation of women in paid employment particularly in the informal sector. A summary of case studies done by the Commonwealth Secretariat [12] concludes that, female unemployment tends to rise (having started from a higher baseline than men's) under adjustment; women's involvement in informal sector work increases, with a deterioration in the position of woman working in this sector, there is an increase in women's unpaid family labour in agriculture. On the other hand women are the main beneficiaries of expansion of export processing employment where this occurs under adjustment.

A crucial but often neglected aspect of adjustment and stabilisation policies is the long-term impact on human capital investment. Under economic restructuring and conditions of recession, teenagers who would otherwise be in school, enter the labour market in significant numbers as "secondary workers". Baden [4] suggests that as more women enter the labour force, the reproductive burden is being transferred to older daughters with prejudice to their school attendance or performance. Declines in public investment in education under adjustment and stabilisation programmes also bring about the disincentive to the education of children; especially, a greater negative impact on girls education. This in turn reinforces woman's involvement in low productivity and low-paid work.

Studies of gender and adjustment do not necessarily regard the impact of adjustment on women as negative. However, some constraints of adjustment policies increasing their reproductive responsibilities, limiting their access to education, to credit and other inputs intensify the negative effects of adjustment on women's labour.

Formal Sector Employment

Under adjustment by the effects of demand restraint, the formal sector tends to be the first to get hit. Employment losses particularly in public sectors, and following trade liberalisation in previously protected industries and wage declines occurred first in formal sectors [4]. However, both the relevant importance of the formal sector in employment and the gender composition of employment in the formal sector vary considerably between countries. In Latin America the formal sector is a large source of employment and provides around two-thirds of non-agricultural employment [13]. Within the formal sector, the public sector is relatively less important representing around one-quarter of formal sector jobs. In many Latin American economies there was an expansion of employment in the services sector during the 1970s, which continued in the 1980s with women taking a major share of these jobs. There has been a major growth in export-oriented manufacturing employment particularly in the 1980s (e.g. Jamaica, Mexico) and women have been the beneficiaries of these new jobs [4]. In sub-Saharan Africa where women form a significantly lower proportion of wage earners than men, women are much more likely to be in public sector employment than in the private sector. In much of sub-Saharan Africa the public sector has suffered considerable losses in both employment and real wage levels, which have not been compensated by private sector growth. Although the generally higher representation of men in public sector suggest that the cut-backs have had a greater impact on men, the relative effects of the declining public sector employment are not clear. While, in absolute terms the loss of women's

employment in the public sector may not be as great as that of men, as Elson [14] argues, this has an overall effect on women's bargaining power in labour markets since the public sector employment is relatively free from discriminatory practices compared to the private sector. With the assumption that there is greater concentration of women in public than in private sector, public sector pay has fallen faster than private sector leading to a relative decline in women's wages.

In manufacturing industry women are under-represented worldwide including the developing regions. Women in manufacturing tend to be concentrated in unskilled occupations and specific industries such as garments and electronics. In Latin America and the Caribbean, 16 to 27 percent of economically active woman were employed in manufacturing in 1991, the proportion was even lower in sub-Saharan Africa at around 6 percent [13]. The implicit assumption of the supply side economic agenda is that, with the removal of protective tariffs, there will be a decline in import substitution industry with a high proportion of male employment, on the other hand export oriented industries will expand with a higher proportion of women. Thus, women will gain more from trade liberalisation and export expansion.

There is evidence that in some countries particularly Latin America, the Caribbean and Asia that there has been an expansion of female employment in export processing manufacturing industries. For example, in Mexico, employment in the export sector grew annually by 14.5 percent between 1980 and 1989 with a large but falling proportion of female labour [4]. The falling share of female labour in this sector may be explained by the shift in the skill requirements of export industries. Technological upgrading demonstrates that the gains of expansion of export-oriented industries on women's employment may not be permanent. Therefore it may be assumed that a growth in women's employment in manufacturing probably occurred under unfavourable conditions, such as increases in subcontracting, homeworking and other forms of unprotected informal employment.

Informal sector employment

The informal sector is an important source of work for women. In almost all studies of adjustment that stressed the significance of female labour supply in the restructuring, special attention has been given to the increasing involvement of women in the informal economy. Women tend to be concentrated in small-scale production, low productivity part of informal sector activities (which are more likely to be non-tradable) and thus are more vulnerable to falling incomes (due to

demand restraints) and crowding effects of adjustment programs.

The empirical measurement problems of the informal sector are further complicated when looking at women's participation in the sector where labour takes place within the home and in many cases is unpaid. Until recently there was no recommended statistical definition for informal sector. In 1993, with the improved understanding of women's economic activity, the International Conference of Labour Statisticians agreed on a definition of the informal sector. It defines informal own-account enterprises as enterprises in the household sector owned and operated by own-account workers, which may employ contributing family workers and employees on an occasional basis but do not employ employees on a continuous basis. Informal sector enterprises engage in the production of goods or services with the primary objective of generating employment and income to the persons concerned "and typically operate at a low level of organisation with little division between labour and capital as factors of production and on a small scale" [15].

Women are not generally more numerous than men in the informal sector employment and in some countries fewer women are in the informal labour force than men. However, a greater proportion of the female than male labour force are represented in the sector and makes up 40 per cent or more of the informal sector in several countries [5]. As in the formal sector of the economy, women and men have different participation rates and different activities in the informal sector. In all African countries except Egypt, more than one third of economically active women outside the agriculture sector work in the informal sector. Whereas with the exceptions of Egypt and Mali, more than 20 percent of economically active men are found in the informal sector. In other words economically active women are more likely than men to be in the informal sector in this region [5].

In Asian countries the participation percentage of women in the informal sector varies widely. In western Asian countries less than 10 per cent of economically active women are in the informal sector while in the rest of the region the share reaches 41 per cent in the Republic of Korea and 65 per cent in Indonesia. In some Asian countries, such as the Syrian Arab Republic and Turkey, higher proportions of men than women work in the informal sector. In none of the Latin American countries the informal sector represent a large share of the labour force. However, it is a source of work opportunities for about 15-20 per cent of both women and men, with the highest figures for women in Honduras (34 per cent) and for men in Jamaica (25 per cent) (Table.2).

Table.2: Production and Employment in the Informal Sector, Selected Country Studies

Country or area		Percentage of which is informal production				Percentage of labour force which is informal							
		Manu.	Trans.	Serv.	Total	Manu.		Trans.		Serv.		Total	
		W	M	W	M	W	M	W	M	W	M		
Africa													
Burundi	1990	35	8	18	25	60	31	0	13	21	17	32	21
Congo	1984	39	10	36	33	43	39	0	11	60	21	57	25
Egypt	1986	21	29	15	18	5	22	0	31	3	18	3	21
Gambia	1983	48	16	57	51	100	38	0	13	60	23	62	25
Mali	1990	45	45	37	40	35	63	0	50	33	39	34	45
Zambia	1986	41	7	48	39	81	31	0	8	71	31	72	29
Latin America and Caribbean													
Brazil	1990	12	23	23	18	5	14	2	24	24	23	21	19
Costa Rica	1984	14	9	16	15	13	14	0	11	7	22	8	19
Honduras	1990	26	17	28	26	52	15	0	19	29	26	34	21
Jamaica	1988	19	23	30	25	11	21	0	29	32	27	28	25
Mexico	1992	9	20	20	16	11	8	2	21	16	30	15	22
Uruguay	1985	16	10	16	16	20	15	0	12	14	19	15	17
Venezuela	1992	16	46	22	23	30	13	10	50	20	25	21	23
Asia and Pacific													
Indonesia	1985	38	44	56	49	57	28	20	44	68	47	65	41
Iraq	1987	15	33	7	12	13	15	0	34	4	7	5	11
Korea	1989	17	34	44	30	21	24	40	36	52	78	41	48
Malaysia	1986	13	20	23	19	22	9	5	22	26	21	24	17
Qatar	1986	1	3	1	1	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1
Syria	1991	21	38	22	24	18	21	0	39	4	91	7	61
Thailand	1990	10	40	18	16	14	8	14	43	30	11	24	12
Turkey	1985	11	42	21	22	9	12	6	44	6	23	7	21
Fiji	1986	14	21	12	13	20	15	0	25	9	13	10	15

Source: *The World's Women 1995, Trends and Statistics, United Nations, New York [5]*.

Prepared by the Statistical Division of the United Nations Secretariat from information Compiled by Lourdes Ferran as consultant to the United Nations Secretariat.

The importance of the informal sector relative to overall production and to labour force varies in each country and there is a positive relationship between the importance of informal sector production and women's participation (Table.2). For example in Egypt where the percentage of the informal production is the lowest among the observed countries the participation of women is extremely low. Available data show that African informal activities have greater importance than in other regions representing between 18 and 51 percent of total production. Several Sub-Saharan countries show high levels of informal production and substantial contribution by woman workers. Except for Indonesia where the informal sector represents almost half of total production,

informal sector production is less important in the countries in Asia and in Latin America.

Agricultural Employment

In Sub-Saharan Africa agriculture constitutes the main source of livelihood for households especially for women. A high percentage of the female labour force, 75 per cent, is in agriculture in Sub-Saharan Africa and 55 per cent in Southern Asia [5]. Large proportions of women in agriculture in these countries are unpaid family workers working in self-employment and family business. Therefore although there are considerable regional variations much of the literature relating the adjustment and the agricultural sector from a gender perspective relates to sub-Saharan Africa (Table.3).

Table.3: Percentage distribution of the female and male labour force by industrial sector, 1994

	Female labour force			Male labour force		
	A	I	S	A	I	S
Developed regions						
Eastern Europe	17	35	48	20	45	35
Western Europe and Other Developed	7	20	73	7	43	50
Africa						
Northern Africa	25	29	46	27	33	40
Sub-Saharan Africa	75	5	20	61	15	23
Latin America and Caribbean						
Central America	7	19	74	41	23	36
South America	10	14	76	27	28	45
Caribbean	11	12	77	23	28	49
Asia and Pacific						
Eastern Asia	35	29	36	29	34	37
South-eastern Asia	42	16	42	47	19	34
Southern Asia	55	25	20	59	14	27
Central Asia	33	20	47	34	31	35
Western Asia	23	15	61	19	33	48
Oceania	21	13	66	27	29	44

A: Agriculture, I: Industry, S: Services

Source: *The World's Women 1995, Trends and Statistics, United Nations, New York [5]*.

Prepared by the Statistical Division of the United Nations Secretariat from data provided by the International Labour Office, Bureau of Statistics, based on the 1986 ILO estimates and projections.

As mentioned above, the advocates of adjustment policies predict that, the overall impact of adjustment on agriculture in terms of output, prices and incomes are more positive than for other sectors. The adjustment

policies in agriculture increase agricultural output and incomes through the increasing incentives to cash crop production. This improved price incentive lead to increases in demand for labour in which women's labour is an important component. Much of women's agricultural work is in subsistence crops rather than cash crops. In developing countries most agricultural households consume mainly food produced within the family holding and the extent of production for the market varies widely. Therefore women are more likely to benefit from incentives under expanded commercial agriculture when they are able to market surplus produce from traditional food or cash crops. This may be partly as a result of favourable price changes, but also requires access to sufficient land, labour and markets, as well as prior investment in improving productivity [14].

In population surveys and censuses the participation of women in agriculture is largely underreported but some data show the extent of invisible work. According to the 1991 Indian Census, 73 per cent of rural women were not economically active [5]. But a survey by the Ministry of Planning in 1987/88 showed that of women engaged in housework and classified as not economically active, 60 per cent of rural and 15 per cent of urban women collected firewood, fodder or foodstuffs, maintained kitchen gardens or fruit trees, or raised poultry or cattle. Moreover, 52 per cent of rural women and 9 per cent of urban women prepared cow dung cakes for fuel, and 63 per cent of rural and 32 per cent of urban women collected water from outside the premises. All of these activities are considered as economic activities in ILO recommendations [5].

Global Feminization: Some Ambiguities

In the context of supply-side macro-economic policies of the 1980s, the empirical evidence suggests that exports promotion and trade liberalisation policies lead to the feminisation of the labour force. This relationship between export-oriented industrialisation and feminisation is particularly important in the economies specialising in commodities that require low skill and labour-intensive methods [1,3] argued that the global feminisation and flexibility of the work force are interlinked phenomena, which have been closely related to erosion of labour regulations. However, this interpretation and the global feminisation of employment thesis may be questioned by several points.

Despite the positive trend, the increase in the female labour force participation, there is still a substantial gap between men and women in their economic activity rates and inequalities in working conditions remain. Women have been most likely to suffer from the social costs of the changes in the world economy such as globalisation, increased international competition,

and the transition to market economies, changes in technology and structural adjustment [11]. By deteriorating the quality and conditions of work and reducing employment opportunities in the public sector, economic restructuring programmes have forced women to move into informal work activities such as home-based production, petty trading that are not covered by labour legislation. Performing more than 70 per cent of the unpaid work, woman continue to labour under gender segregation and still face inequalities in the labour market in terms of the level of education, vocational training, flexibility and accesses to productive resources [11]. Even the increase in women's labour force participation rate was only 3 per cent during the period from 1970 to 1990 and there have been growing numbers of women among the unemployed, underemployed and workers in precarious employment [16].

The failure of adjustment to generate significant employment creation in most countries means that unemployment rates, especially those of women, have persisted at high levels. In the developed regions officially reported unemployment rates among women for recent years are more than men, about 50 to 100 per cent greater, in about two thirds of countries [5]. As women's percentage of unemployment increased, women became even more overrepresented than before in precarious and informal employment. Unemployment is difficult to measure in the populations dependent on subsistence agriculture and due to the limitations in data for the poorer countries of sub-Saharan Africa and Asia. Female unemployment rates in sub-Saharan Africa and Latin America and the Caribbean have been higher than that of men's historically and this trend continues. In urban Africa unemployment rates doubled between 1975 and 1990 from around 10 per cent to 20 per cent (Table 4).

The crucial point, however is that even the workforce is feminised, it would still be wrong to see this as an irreversible and sustainable process. Moreover, the phenomenon of female-led and export-led growth has been geographically patchy as well as being highly volatile (This phrase is borrowed from Razavi [3]). Even in Asia and Latin America, export-oriented and female-intensive firms have been successful only in some countries, while complex political and economic factors have precluded their emergence in most parts of sub-Saharan Africa and the Middle East [3]. Women are disadvantaged in the processes of production which are capital-intensive and which rely on skilled labour. Based on this assumption there is also some evidence to suggest that technological and skill upgrading of export products, especially multi-skilling of flexible labour engaged in high-performance production, can lead to a process of de-feminisation of manufacturing labour (Razavi, 1999).

Table.4: Unemployment Rate by Sex, 1991-92 (%)

	W	M		W	M
Developed regions			Latin America and Caribbean		
Australia	10.0	11.4	Argentina	7.7	6.6
Austria	6.2	5.7	Bahamas	12.5	11.0
Belgium	10.7	4.6	Barbados	25.7	20.4
Canada	10.4	12.0	Bolivia	7.8	6.9
Czechoslovakia	5.4	4.7	Brazil	3.4	3.8
Denmark	12.9	10.0	Chile	5.6	4.1
Finland	10.5	15.2	Costa Rica	5.4	3.5
France	12.8	8.1	Ecuador	8.5	4.1
Germany	7.1	5.2	El Salvador	7.2	8.4
Greece	12.9	4.8	French Guiana	17.6	11.7
Hungary	10.5	7.6	Guadeloupe	34.0	16.0
Iceland	3.6	2.6	Jamaica	23.1	9.3
Ireland	12.1	17.3	Mexico	3.1	2.5
Italy	16.8	7.5	Netherlands Antilles	20.9	13.1
Japan	2.2	2.1	Nicaragua	19.4	11.3
Latvia	1.2	0.9	Panama	21.2	10.0
Luxembourg	1.9	1.5	Paraguay	4.7	5.4
Malta	2.3	4.4	Peru	10.7	6.0
Netherlands	9.5	10.9	Puerto Rico	12.9	19.0
New Zealand	5.1	6.5	Trinidad and Tobago	23.4	15.7
Norway	14.9	11.8	Uruguay	11.6	7.2
Poland	5.0	3.4	Venezuela	9.4	9.6
Portugal	10.7	6.2			
Romania	25.6	14.3	Asia and Pacific		
Spain	25.6	14.3	China	1.1	0.8
Switzerland	3.4	2.8	Hong Kong	1.9	2.0
Sweden	3.8	5.7	Israel	13.9	9.2
United Kingdom	7.2	11.5	Korea, Rep. Of	2.1	2.6
United States	6.9	7.6	Macau	2.5	3.0
Yugoslavia (former)	19.3	11.7	Pakistan	16.8	4.5
			Phillippines	9.9	7.9
			Singapore	2.6	2.7
			Sri Lanka	21.0	10.6
			Syrian Arab Republic	14.0	5.2
			Thailand	2.4	2.1
			Turkey	7.2	8.1

Source: *The World's Women 1995, Trends and Statistics, United Nations, New York [5]*.

Compiled by Carmen Mc Farlane as consultant to the Statistical Division of the United Nations Secretariat from International Labour Office, Year Book of Labour statistics and national reports. Data are generally from labour force or household sample surveys, or are official estimates. Exceptions are the United Kingdom whose data are from social insurance statistics; and Austria, Czechoslovakia, Denmark, Hungary, Iceland, Latvia, Luxembourg, Malta, Poland, Romania, Switzerland, the former Yugoslavia, French Guiana and Guadeloupe, whose data are derived from employment office statistics.

Table.5: Women's average wages in manufacturing as percentage of men's, 1970, 1980 and 1990

	1970	1980	1990
Developed regions			
Australia	57	79	82
Belgium	68	70	76
Czechoslovakia	..	68	68
Denmark	74	86	85
Finland	70	75	77
France	..	77	79
Germany (Federal Rep. Of)	70	73	73
Greece	68	68	76
Hungary	72
Ireland	56	69	69
Italy	..	83	..
Japan	..	44	41
Luxemburg	55	61	65
Netherlands	72	80	77
New Zealand	..	71	75
Norway	75	82	86
Portugal	72
Spain	72
Sweden	80	90	89
Switzerland	65	66	68
United Kingdom	58	69	68
United States	68
Africa			
Egypt	64	62	68
Kenya	..	62	74
Swaziland	..	55	54
Zambia	73
Latin America and Caribbean			
Costa Rica	..	70	74
El Salvador	82	81	94
Netherlands Antilles	..	79	66
Paraguay	..	79	66
Asia and the Pasific			
Cyprus	..	50	58
Guam	..	50	51
Hong Kong	..	78	69
Korea, republic of	..	45	50
Myanmar	84	86	97
Singapore	55
Sri Lanka	..	75	88

Considering the linkages between export-oriented manufacturing and gender discrimination in wages, in some cases the income distributive aspects of structural adjustment policies have been associated with falling wages and rising urban poverty. It has been also argued that these income distributive effects have in turn pushed women into both formal and informal sector employment

with women's wages barely making up some of the shortfall from declining male wages and social sector cut-backs. Women currently earn an average of between 50 and 96 per cent of men's pay, but there are significant variations between countries and regions. For example, women's earnings as a percentage of men's earnings in non-agricultural employment stand between 90 and 96 per cent in Australia and Turkey, but between 57 and 60 per cent in Cyprus and Korea. In none of the 37 countries with data does women's pay in manufacturing industries equal men's. Ratios closer to equality between women's and men's wages—higher than 80—are found in some of the Nordic countries, in Italy and Australia, and among some developing countries, including El Salvador, Myanmar and Sri Lanka (Table.5).

Several feminist writers have questioned the interpretation of a global feminisation thesis. First of all in many cases the growth of women's share of industrial employment reflects the faster growth of labour-intensive sectors in which women have always been employed, such as textiles, clothing and footwear, and the decline of jobs/sectors previously dominated by men, rather than the substitution of cheaper women for men [17]. Another critical observation about global feminisation made by Elson [17] is that male norms of full-time employment may not necessarily be the desirable norm to which all workers do and should aspire. "The global feminisation thesis confounds two distinct processes which, Elson argues, are not intrinsically interlinked: flexibility of production made possible by technological changes, and the erosion of workers' rights made possible by the unfettered mobility of capital and political decisions by states and employers to eschew responsibility for worker's well-being" [3].

III. RESTRUCTURING of THE TURKISH ECONOMY and THE CHANGE in THE STRUCTURE of EMPLOYMENT

In Turkey, as in other developing countries, the gender pattern of employment has changed considerably since the economic crisis of the 1970s. The 1980s witnessed a turning point in the Turkish economy and were marked by the reorientation of the Turkish economy from import-substitution industrialisation to export-oriented manufacturing. This industrial restructuring was achieved through a variety of structural adjustment policies that aim increasing integration into international markets. As in many developing countries the Turkish adoption of structural adjustment policies in the post-1980 period, has led to significant changes in the labour markets. At the same time, the gender composition of the labour force in Turkey has exhibited a systematic change through the restructuring process.

In Turkey like in many other developing countries, structural adjustment was accompanied by the deterioration of labour standards, informalisation of employment and other familiar aspects of these policies such as erosion of wages, job security and increasing unemployment [7,8,18,19]. As mentioned before, Standing [1] has argued that, in such employment conditions a feminisation of employment, through the relative and absolute growth in the use of women's labour and the substitution of women for men. Standing (1989) has further argued that this feminisation of employment is a global phenomenon and has resulted from structural adjustment with increase emphasis in flexibility. Indeed, studies of the female economic position during the course of export-led industrialisation indicate a growth in female industrial employment. In developing countries women's share of employment has been growing in the export-oriented manufacturing sector. Both through the changes in income distribution and through the shifts in outward orientation of the economy, structural adjustment policies led to a feminisation of the labour force in these countries [6]. This provides some support to the Standing's argument that export-oriented production leads to the feminisation of employment.

In Turkey, female share of employment in the manufacturing industries, especially in labour-intensive sectors has also increased following the structural adjustment. For example, the rate of the increase in women's employment was 76 per cent with only 11 per cent increase for men between 1980-1992 [18]. Nonetheless, the reorientation of the Turkish economy from import substitution to export-led industrialisation does not seem to point an economy-wide feminization of the labour force. Studies show that successful export-orientation of the Turkish economy was not accompanied by a feminisation of employment in large-scale manufacturing industries but with a possible increasing involvement of women in the informal economy through homeworking [7,8,18,20,21]. In the following sections, I will first present an overview on the shift in Turkish industrialisation strategies and its implications for the female employment. Then, the lack of feminisation of employment in the Turkish case of structural adjustment will be examined.

Industrialisation strategies and the gender composition of employment

Import-substituting industrialisation (ISI) policies are generally associated with the marginalisation of women from modern manufacturing employment. The rationality behind this argument is that the capital intensive nature of the technology used under ISI provide mostly skilled jobs undertaken by men and create only a small proportion of the new employment opportunities. The Latin American experience of ISI after World War II

supports this argument and shows a slow growth of women's manufacturing employment [7,22]. The other argument relating the changes in women's employment to the industrialisation process is the one that focuses on the export-led industrialisation (ELI). Studies focusing on the post 1960's ELI experiences especially in East Asian economies and also in Latin American countries conclude that ELI was accompanied by the feminisation of the labour force [1,3,6]. The pursuit of flexibility and lowering unit labour costs under ELI resulted in high and growing concentration of women in labour-intensive manufacturing industries. The position of women in the context of industrialisation strategies and gender composition employment was referred as the female marginalisation. "While the earlier studies emphasise the marginalisation of women by exclusion from capitalist development and industrialisation, this later vintage of studies emphasises women's marginalisation by inclusion and segregation into labour-intensive sectors with 'low wages' and 'low skills'" [6].

Turkey's experience of import substitution industrialisation is quite familiar to what happened in other developing countries during the post-World War II period. As many Latin American countries, Turkey began to implement an economic program which was characterised by protectionism, planning and a considerable degree of state involvement. These import substitution policies led, especially in 1960s, to a rapid growth of manufacturing and thus to the formation of an industrial base [23]. The average annual rate of growth of manufacturing between the years of 1963 and 1977 was about 10.2 percent. On the other hand, the share of manufactured goods in exports has risen significantly, from an average of 20.6 percent in 1963-65 to 31.2 percent in 1978-80 [7]. Turkey, however, remained a closed economy due to the protectionist policies implemented during those two decades and the international trade amounted only to the 9.9 percent of GDP by the end of the era, in 1980 [7,23].

The rapid growth of the manufacturing, on the other hand, hasn't changed the structure of Turkish economy significantly. In spite of the considerable industrialisation, the manufacturing sector accounted for only 10.7 percent of the employment and 16.7 percent of the GDP in 1980 [7]. One important objective of the government during this period has been to increase investment in the public sector with the effect of increasing production in agriculture. The import-oriented growth strategies that influenced the Turkish economy until 1980 thus promoted heavily market-oriented agricultural production both through subsidies and the use of new technology [24]. Even though the growth of the manufacturing sector was considerable, agriculture remained as the major sector of the economy during the

ISI period with a share of 60.4 percent in total employment and 29 percent of GDP in 1980 [7,8].

Turkey has started a shift in its industrialisation policy from an import substitution industrialisation to a more export oriented program by the end of 1970s, more specifically in January 1980, with the adoption of a new stabilisation package. This shift basically followed the severe economic crisis that the country suffered since 1977. In an attempt to find a remedy for the rising national debt and foreign currency crisis, a structural adjustment and stabilisation program was introduced in 1980. This stabilisation program which has been implemented after the 1980 proposed devaluation of currency, liberalised trade by dismantling foreign exchange controls and quotas on imports, direct government support in the form of subsidies, tax rebates and credits to encourage exports and privatisation attempts. These policies have also been supported by income policy and the falling costs of labour. Following the military coup d'état in September 1980, the nature of the labour policy has also changed fundamentally [8,23]. The power of labour unions and labour standards were reduced and wages have fallen dramatically from an index of 100 in 1979 to 71 in 1982 and 68 in 1985 [18]. The fall in wages with export incentives and devaluation have made labour-intensive production, such as clothing industry, internationally competitive. This export-oriented growth based on low-cost production resulted in the restored growth rates of GDP with an average 4.8 per cent annual growth rate between 1980 and 1985 [23]. At the same time, Turkey became an outward-oriented economy with the 24 per cent share of exports in GDP in 1985 [7,23].

The data on labour-force statistics in Turkey show that the share of women in economically active population was around 35 per cent both during the ISI and ELI period. Their share, which fell from 43.11 per cent to 36.06 per cent between 1955 and 1980, showed another slight fall between 1980 and 1985 and became 35.44 per cent [8]. During the 1990s, female labour force participation rate accounted for between 35.1 per cent in 1989 and 29.7 per cent in 1999 [25]. Even though Turkey has experienced a considerable industrialisation between 1960 and 1985, an overwhelming proportion of the economically active women were in the agricultural sector. According to the 1985 population census, women were making up 53.8 per cent of the agricultural labour force, with 92 per cent working as unpaid family labour [24]. Based on the same census findings, 86.5 per cent of economically active women were in the agricultural sector with only a 4.4 per cent manufacturing share during the same period [7]. During the 1990s, more than 70 per cent of all women participating in the labour force were in the agricultural sector. According to the Household Labour Force Surveys [25], 72 per cent of economically active

women were in the agricultural sector making up 47.6 per cent of the agricultural labour force.

The same consistency of the female participation rate is observed in the manufacturing industry in the course of both ISI and ELI. Under the ISI period, the share of the female employment in manufacturing first grew from 16.26 per cent in 1960 to 22.51 per cent in 1970 and then declined to 15.36 per cent by 1980. Thus, the manufacturing data covering only large establishments also supports the argument of consistency of the female share in manufacturing which was around 18.5 per cent through both ISI and ELI periods [7]. The 1990s showed a similar relative constancy of the share of economically active women in manufacturing industry. During this period, the share of economically active women in manufacturing varied between 7.9 per cent in 1989 and 9.3 per cent in 1999 [25].

In manufacturing industry, with regard to the sexual segregation of employment, we observe that women tend to be heavily concentrated in certain branches of the manufacturing sector. This characteristic of female employment in Turkish manufacturing industry is mostly observable in the textile, clothing industry. For example, 51 per cent of economically active women were employed in the textile, clothing and leather industries and 18 per cent in the food, beverage, and tobacco industries in 1980 [26]. Therefore a particular attention should be drawn to the textile industry to examine the links between industrial restructuring and the changes in gender composition of employment. In the next section, I will attempt to scrutinize the textile industry, which has important consequences for the female employment in the light of the two recent studies.

The restructuring of the textile industry and female workers

The clothing industry in Turkey has experienced a considerable expansion in 1970s and textiles became the most important export products of Turkey [18,21]. The switch to export-led industrialisation policies with increasing integration into international markets has risen the degree of competition in the industry. Along with that, both direct government support and labour costs became extremely important for newly emerged institutions such as associations of small exporters, foreign trade companies and semi-public exporter associations [18]. The government also encouraged production for export by direct subsidies; in the first half of the 1980s direct subsidies to export sectors amounted 20 per cent of the total cost of production [18]. In this suitable environment, the clothing industry developed rapidly in the second half of the 1980s: clothing exports reached to approximately US\$6,100 million (28 per cent of total exports) in 1995 from 130 million (9 per cent of total exports) in 1980

[18]. Parallel to the expansion of production and exports, between 1985 and 1990 the registered employment in the clothing industry increased by 47 per cent and accounted 7 per cent of total manufacturing employment. According to the same official statistics, women's share in total employment in the sector is about 59 per cent, which supports the previous arguments above.

However, despite these positive trends, Ansal's [21] research on the impacts of industrial restructuring for women employment documents that restructuring in the textile industry led to the deterioration in the economic position of women in Turkey in 1980s. Based on a case study she conducted in large textile establishments in Istanbul and the information she gathered, she argued that women seem to be disadvantaged in the processes of production, which are capital-intensive and which rely on skilled labour. She attributed this deterioration in the economic position of women to the technological and skill upgrading of textile industry during the 1980s. Çağatay and Berik [7] and Çağatay [8] have put forward a similar argument about the feminisation of employment. They argued that women's labour force participation throughout the 1980's does not indicate an economy-wide feminisation.

A more recent study reported by Eraydın and Erendil [18] provides further arguments on this issue and conclude that women are no longer serve as a reserve labour as it was the case at the beginning of the restructuring process, but they have become active agents in the labour markets with increasing bargaining power. Eraydın and Erendil conducted a survey by randomly selecting 240 clothing firms and by interviewing 500 women working in this industry in 1996. The survey showed that wages in the industry are very low: 11 per cent of the paid workers and 75 per cent of the homeworkers earn less than the official minimum wage. According to the same survey in which four major groups are identified; paid workers, factory owners, homeworkers and family workers, homeworkers were found to be the most disadvantaged group being mostly migrant families. However the survey on the Istanbul clothing industry indicated that during the rapid expansion of the industry, women more than 80 per cent of whom came from families migrating to Istanbul from rural areas, have become an integral part of the labour market and can no longer be described as marginal in the labour market.

Informal Sector

Much of the literature on restructuring and adjustment argues that the feminisation of labour is almost synonymous with the downgrading of employment conditions and the increasing participation rates of women in precarious and informal employment [10,14]. The reason is that the intensified international competitiveness

led to the pursuit of flexibility in production, which in turn enhanced temporary, part-time and home-based employment where women are overrepresented. The Turkish experience of structural adjustment also showed that export-oriented growth and competitive conditions in the industrialisation process has been based on the low-cost production and flexibility in the structures of production. Both flexibility and cost-cutting international competitiveness were achieved in deregulated market conditions through the extensive use of temporary employment and high rates of labour turnover. Female employment has been used as a reserve army in this process and as a result much of the expansion in women's employment occurred in the informal sector [19]. Evidence from many developing countries show that export oriented growth and production coincides with the increasing involvement of women in the homeworking. Whether the same pattern was observed in Turkey during the restructuring remains an important question yet to be answered.

Women are vulnerable to invisibility and disguised employment conditions in which official statistics are inadequately recorded and most of the employment is disguised or hidden. Homeworking that involves unskilled, semi-skilled and usually migrant labour is one of those sectors in which women are vulnerable to disguised employment conditions. As Standing [1], noted women make up a majority of migrants in many developing countries and often gain entry to labour markets by only taking the most precarious jobs. One study in Istanbul clothing industry [18] also reveals the example of rural-to-urban migration and finds that during the initial phases of migration, women have entered into the labour market mainly through the informal sector.

Another study, Çınar's [19] research, on urban unskilled female labour force in Istanbul examines the informal labour market opportunities for women in Turkey. Using exploratory samples and data from three surveys conducted in Turkey, the study tries to find out whether international competition and cost efficiency led to a switching from factory or workshop production to out-sourcing production through use of homeworking or subcontracting to small informal enterprises. As noted earlier, the global pursuit of flexible low-cost labour has encouraged industrial enterprises to use more informal forms of labour (homeworking and subcontracting to small informal enterprises) that are not covered by minimum wage legislation and other job security regulations such as health insurance and retirement benefits. Thus the expectation relating to cost advantages leads us to expect that homework wages are substantially cheaper than formal sector wages.

The survey findings document that mostly married unskilled women take work at home due to the scarcity of

jobs open to them in the formal sector. The cost advantage by subcontracting and advantage of keeping the workforce flexible to match seasonal fluctuations in export demand lead employers to prefer unskilled migrant women in the informal sector. The hourly wages received by women doing homework have been calculated and compared with formal sector wages and were found to be close to minimum wages. The results from the subcontracting survey showed that there is no important difference between homework wages and formal sector wages. Based on the same survey conducted to quantify the number of homeworking migrant women in urban centers, the estimates show that 3.10 per cent of the total female population in Istanbul are taking work at home and at least one in four migrant women take homework in. Even though homeworking has become an important part of production involving female migrant labour, the production switching from factories or workshops to informal homeworking was not observed for the Turkish case.

The lack of feminisation of the labour force

Another way of evaluating the phenomenon of female labour in Turkey is to analyse the urban labour force separately. In contrast to high economic activity rates in rural areas, women have very low economic activity rates in the urban areas. Considering the urban labour markets, urban women's labour-force participation rates has increased throughout the adjustment period and reached its highest level 18.83 percent in 1989. During the 1990s, women in urban areas made up only 16-17 per cent of the labour force, while in rural areas they accounted for between 54 per cent in 1989 and 47 per cent in 1999 [25]. An important characteristic of the labour markets in Turkey is that women have higher unemployment rates than males in all educational background and have longer unemployment spells. During the 1980s women in the urban sector faced a very high unemployment rate compared to the low unemployment rates for women in rural sector [7]. Urban female unemployment, a striking characteristic of the urban labour markets in Turkey, indicates that unemployment is first of all and in itself an urban female phenomenon [8]. Moreover the participation rate of women in the urban economy is mostly affected by high unemployment rates of women who tend to be unemployed for a longer period than men. While Standing's [1] - feminisation argument predicted a relative and absolute growth in the use of women's labour with a fall in female unemployment rates, the Turkish urban sector does not support this position. The increase in urban women's labour-force participation in Turkey did not lead to the feminisation of employment as indicated in Standing's thesis but in a sense to the feminisation of unemployment [8].

During the 1980s, women in the urban sector experienced high unemployment rates that range from 23 per cent in 1982 to 33 percent in 1985. These figures, however, were much lower for men: 9 and 11.6 per cent respectively. In 1989 and 1990, the unemployment rates for women and men turned to be 26.5 per cent for women and 10.7 per cent for men. According to the Household Labour Force Survey Results [24] the urban unemployment rate for women has fallen gradually throughout the 1990s and became 16.4 per cent in 1999, while the comparable figure for men was 10.6 in 1999 (Table.6). Another feature of the Turkish urban employment is that the same situation holds for younger groups; women aged between 15 and 24 years experience a higher unemployment rate than the men of the same age group, 40 per cent and 21 per cent in 1990, respectively [27].

Table. 6: Non-Institutional Civilian Population by Period, Sex and Labour Force Status, 1989-1999

	Labour Force Participation Rate (%)				Unemployment Rate (%)			
	Urban		Rural		Urban		Rural	
	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M
1989	17.2	71.1	54.4	79.9	26.3	10.7	4.3	6.1
1990	17.0	72.3	49.2	77.7	26.3	11.1	4.3	6.1
1991	13.8	70.0	52.2	80.5	20.9	10.5	2.0	5.4
1992	16.3	70.4	46.9	76	20.3	10.4	3.0	6.0
1993	16.7	67.7	46.5	75.1	19.4	9.7	1.9	6.0
1994	16.2	67.6	48.5	75.4	19.7	11.2	2.0	6.7
1995	15.5	66.6	48.4	75.9	16.4	9.4	2.3	5.8
1996	14.3	66.2	48.6	75.2	13.9	8.3	1.7	5.3
1997	16.1	64.4	45	75.5	14.6	8.0	2.1	3.8
1998	14.9	64.7	41.5	74.9	15.0	8.7	2.2	3.7
1999	15.8	64.3	47.6	73.7	16.4	10.6	2.1	4.3

In studying the gender composition of employment in Turkey, we should also consider the patriarchal relations that shape the female labour participation. The persistence of patriarchy and in particular the patriarchal family unit may constitute a significant customary constraint on women's mobility and employment [2]. Moghadam and Karshenas [1] define the patriarchal family as a kingship-based unit in which members have clearly-defined roles derived from age and gender, and within which women are economically dependent upon the males. Two recent studies one on women home-workers in urban Turkey [19] and the other on female labour in the Istanbul Clothing Industry [18], suggest that patriarchal relations still exist. Çınar observes that the permission of the male household head is important among women and the lack of this permission may be a significant obstacle in female labour force participation.

As noted earlier, the HLFS data underrecords the extent of female labour and much of the informal

activities, eg. home-working. The patriarchal relations constitute an important reason for the underestimation of the numbers of home workers who carry out their activity secretly. At the same time, for married unskilled women whom husbands do not allow them to work outside provides an available option for working.

Throughout the 1990s, female labour force participation rate in Turkey was around 30 per cent, even though this share showed a gradual fall from 36.06 per cent to 31.8 per cent between 1980 and 1999 [25]. This decline in the female participation rate reflects mainly the migration from rural to urban areas where women's labour force participation rates are much lower than the rural areas [8,19]. Therefore this trend in the women's labour force participation rates throughout the 1980s and 1990s does not seem to indicate an economy-wide feminisation. Moreover, the U-shaped pattern of women's labour force participation that is observed in industrialised economies does not seem to appear in Turkey [8].

Women's changing status across economic development can be studied in the histories of developed economies and through a cross section of the world economies. Using cross-country data, several studies found that across the process of economic development the women's share of the labour force is U-shaped [6,28]. When incomes are extremely low and when certain type of agriculture dominate women are in the labour force to a great extent. They are sometimes paid labourers but more often are unpaid workers on family farms and in household businesses. As income rise in most societies, often because of an expansion of the market or the introduction of a new technology, women's labour force participation rates fall. This decline in female labour force participation rates owes mainly to an income effect and to the reduction in the relative price of home-produced goods and the decrease in the demand for women's labour in agriculture. But as female education improves and the level of economic development increases, women move back into the paid labour force, as reflected in the move along the rising portion of the U-shaped curve [28]. The evidence, however, shows that the U-shaped pattern of the women's share of the labour force is not observed in Turkey's case. At the same time a process of feminisation of the labour force did not follow the structural adjustment policies [8].

IV. CONCLUSION

The investigation of the structural adjustment and the female employment in Turkey shows that the transition from ISI to ELI in Turkey has occurred without an economy-wide feminisation. Moreover, based on the dissimilarity index (DI) calculated by Çağatay and Berik

[7], there is no evidence of a decrease in the overall degree of gender segregation in the 1980s.

Although one type of economic activity –home-based production- seems to contribute to the growth of female urban manufacturing employment, the general trend towards feminisation of labour is not clearly evident, at least, in Turkey's case. This could consist merely of a false appearance. Firstly, the empirical evidence, which is available, seems to limit the extent of the research from the beginning. Limitations in data collection undercount woman's economic activities and their economic contribution. The available data fails to take into account especially the non-market, informal work which consists of work performed by women who are not directly included in the labour force (eg. working within the family structure and in family-run businesses, and of women working at home through subcontracting). This group could consist of a considerable part of the female labour depending on the structure of the national economy in question. The predominance of the agricultural sector could amplify the magnitude of the unrecorded female work force. Representing large proportions of the work force in agricultural smallholdings, in family farms or businesses, women tend to be inadequately recorded in statistics. Furthermore, the cultural and ideological differences could also play a major role in determining the gender composition of the labour force. A more patriarchal society for example may have an influence on female labour participation and may hamper it. Cultural emphasis on female education, religious approach to women's work, the average of marriage age etc. could also be considered as crucial factors. Moreover, the general socio-economic development level of the relevant country could affect the women's participation. Depending mainly on the socio-economic status of the family unit (and arguably of the developing country in question), the economic needs of the family might induce women to participate in the production process. The U-shaped pattern of women's labour force participation could be an empirical example of such findings. Finally, the overall age distribution of the population could have significant ramifications. Greater affluence and ease might decrease this participation, whereas poverty might impel both parents to work actively. In addition to these few elements mentioned, other factors could be mentioned to enlarge the scope of the research.

REFERENCES

- [1] STANDING, G., "Global Feminisation Through Flexible Labour", *World Development*, Vol.17, No: 7, 1989, pp.1077-1096.
- [2] KARSHENAS, M.; V.M., "Female Employment, Competitiveness and Structural Adjustment in the Middle East and North Africa", **Paper to be presented at the Middle East Economic Association (MEEA) Meeting, January 4-6 1997**, New Orleans, 1997.
- [3] RAZAVI, S., "Export-Oriented Employment, Poverty and Gender: Contested Accounts", *Development and Change*, Vol. 30, 1999, pp. 653-683.
- [4] BADEN, S., "The Impact of Recession on Women's Employment in OECD Countries", **Paper prepared for the Interdepartmental Project on Equality for Women in Employment**, ILO, Geneva, , 1993.
- [5] **The World's Women 1995, Trends and Statistics**, United Nations, New York, 1995.
- [6] ÇAĞATAY, N.; ÖZLER, Ş., "Feminization of the Labour Force: The Effects of Long-term Development and Structural Adjustment", *World Development*, Vol. 23, No: 11, pp.1883-1894.
- [7] ÇAĞATAY, N.; BERİK, G., "Transition to Export-led Growth in Turkey: Is there a Feminization of Employment?", *Capital and Class*, Vol.43, 1991, pp.153-177.
- [8] ÇAĞATAY, N., "Turkish Women and Structural Adjustment", in I. Bakker (ed.), **The Strategic Silence. Gender and Economic Policy**, Zed Books, London, 1994, pp.130-136.
- [9] ELSON, D., "From Survival Strategies to Transformation Strategies: Women's Needs and Structural Adjustment", in Benena, L. and S. Peldmen (eds.), **Unequal Burden, Economic Crises, Persistent Poverty and Women's Work**, Westview Press, Boulder, 1992.
- [10] DREW,E.; EMEREK, R., "Employment, Flexibility and Gender", in Eileen Drew, Ruth Emerek and Evelyn Mahon (eds.) **Women, Work And the Family in Europe**, Routledge, London, 1998, pp.89-99.
- [11] DATE-BAH, E., **Promoting Gender Equality at Work**, ILO Publications, Geneva, 1997.
- [12] "Woman and Structural Adjustment: Selected Case-Studies Commissioned for a Commonwealth Group of Experts", **Commonwealth Economic Papers**,No: 22, London, 1991.
- [13] **The World's Women 1990, Trends and Statistics**, United Nations, New York, 1991.
- [14] ELSON, D., "Gender and adjustment in the 1990s: An Update on evidence and strategies", **Background paper for the International Meeting on Economic Distress, Structural Adjustment and Woman**, Commonwealth secretariat, London, June 1991.
- [15] *From the resolution of the fifteenth International Conference of Labour Statisticians, January 1993*,

concerning statistics of employment in the informal sector, **System of National Accounts 1993**, pp. 111-112

[16] **Human development report 1995**, UNDP, Oxford University Press, New York, 1995.

[17] ELSON, D., "Appraising Recent Developments in the World Market for Nimble Fingers", in A. Chhachhi and R. Pittin (eds) **Confronting State, Capital and Patriarchy: Women Organizing in the Process of Industrialization**, Macmillan, in association with the Institute of Social Studies, Basingstoke, 1996, pp. 93-130.

[18] ERAYDIN, A.; ERENDİL, A., "The Role of Female Labour in Industrial Restructuring: New Production Processes and Labour Market Relations in The Istanbul Clothing Industry", **Gender, Place and Culture**. Vol.6, No.3, 1999, pp.259-272.

[19] KAZGAN, G., **Tanzimat'tan XXI. Yüzyıla Türkiye Ekonomisi, Birinci Küreselleşmeden İkinci Küreselleşmeye**, Altın Kitaplar, İstanbul, 1999.

[20] ÇINAR, M.E., "Unskilled Urban Migrant Women and Disguised Employment: Home-working Women in Istanbul, Turkey", **World Development**, Vol.22, No: 3, 1994, pp.369-380

[21] ANSAL, H., "Ekonomik Yeniden Yapılanma Sürecinde Kadın Emegi", **Türk-İş/97 Yıllığı, 1990'Ların Değerlendirme Yazıları**, Türk-İş Araştırma Merkezi, Cilt 2, Ankara, 1997.

[22] ACOSTA-BELEN, E.; BOSE, C. E., "Colonialism, Structural Subordination, and Empowerment. Women in the Development Process in Latin America and The Caribbean", in C.E. Bose and E. Acosta-Belén (eds.) **Women in the Latin American Development Process**, Temple Univ. Press, Philadelphia, 1995, pp.15-36.

[23] BORATAV, K., **Türkiye İktisat Tarihi**, Gerçek Yayınevi, İstanbul, 1988.

[24] MORVARIDI, B., "Gender Relations in Agriculture: Women in Turkey", **Economic Development and Cultural Change**, Vol.40, No.3, 1992, pp.567-586.

[25] **SIS 1999 April Household Labour Force Survey Results**. State Institute of Statistics, Ankara.

[26] ECEVİT, Y., "Shop Floor Control. The Ideological Constructing of Turkish Women Factory Workers", in N.Redclift and M.T. Sinclair (eds.), **Working Women: International Perspectives on Labour and Gender Ideology**, Routledge, London, 1991, pp.56-78.

[27] **SIS 1989 April Household Labour Force Survey Results**, No: 1445, State Institute of Statistics, Ankara, 1991.

[28] GOLDIN, C., "The U-Shaped Female Labor Force Function in Economics Development and Economic History", in T.P. SCHULTZ (ed.), **Investment in Women's Human Capital**, The University of Chicago Press, London, 1995, pp.61-90.



Beyza Ç. KARAHASANOĞLU TEKİN

İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi
İnönü Cad. No: 28
Kuştepe – İSTANBUL

Tel: +90 (212) 216 22 22 - 6284
bevyak@bilgi.edu.tr

Beyza Ç. KARAHASANOĞLU is currently enrolled as a Phd student in the Department of Political Studies and International Relations at Bogazici University. She has been working as a Research and Teaching Assistant at the Istanbul Bilgi University. Her primary research interests are gender and politics in the middle-east, political economy of gender differences, especially in developing countries.