

Journal of Balkan and Black Sea Studies

Year 3, Issue 4

June 2020

e-ISSN

2667-470X

editors



Editor in Chief and Owner

Mehmet HACISALİHOĞLU, Prof. Dr.,
Yıldız Technical University,
Director of Center for Balkan and Black Sea Studies (BALKAR)

Managing Editors

Responsible Director: Hakan DEMİR, PhD., Sakarya University
Deniz ERTUĞ, PhD., Istanbul
Jahja MUHASILOVIĆ, PhD. cand., Boğaziçi University
Fatih Fuat TUNCER, Assist. Prof. Dr., Gelişim University
Keisuke WAKIZAKA, Assist. Prof. Dr., Gelişim University
Cengiz YOLCU, PhD cand., 29 Mayıs University

Secretary

Ersin YILMAZ

Editorial Board



- Chair:** Mehmet HACISALİHOĞLU, Prof. Dr.,
Fuat AKSU, Assoc. Prof. Dr., Yıldız Technical University
Isa BLUMI, Assoc. Prof. Dr., Stockholm University
Cengiz ÇAĞLA, Prof. Dr., Yıldız Technical University
Ali ÇAKSU, Assoc. Prof. Dr., Yıldız Technical University
Bilgin ÇELİK, Assoc. Prof. Dr., Dokuz Eylül University
Neriman ERSOY-HACISALİHOĞLU, Assoc. Prof. Dr., Istanbul University
Ayşe KAYAPINAR, Prof. Dr., Namık Kemal University
Levent KAYAPINAR, Prof. Dr., Namık Kemal University
Elçin MACAR, Prof. Dr., Yıldız Technical University
Çiğdem NAS, Assoc. Prof. Dr., Yıldız Technical University
Ali Fuat ÖRENÇ, Prof. Dr., Istanbul University
Nurcan ÖZGÜR-BAKLACIOĞLU, Prof. Dr., Istanbul University
Esra ÖZSÜER, Assist. Prof. Dr., Istanbul University
Laçın İdil ÖZTİĞ, Assist. Prof. Yıldız Technical University
Milena PETKOVA, Assist. Prof. Dr., Kliment Ohridski University, Sofia
Cevdet ŞANLI, Assist. Prof. Dr., Yıldız Technical University
A. Gül TOKAY, PhD., Istanbul/London
Tsvetelina TSVETKOVA, PhD., Sofia

International Advisory Board

- Vermund AARBAKKE (Assist. Prof. Dr., Aristotelian University of Thessaloniki)
Fikret ADANIR (Prof. Dr., Bochum)
Yıldırım AĞANOĞLU (Başbakanlık Osmanlı Arşivi)
Bülent AKYAY (Assist. Prof. Dr., Trakya University)
Giorgi ANCHABADZE (Prof. Dr., Ilia State University, Tbilisi)
Andrey ANDREEV (Prof. Dr., Veliko Tarnovo University)
Ali ASKER (Assoc. Prof. Dr., Karabük University)
Mustafa AYDIN (Prof. Dr., Kadir Has University)
Mustafa AYDIN (Prof. Dr., İstanbul University)
Ayşegül AYDINGÜN (Prof. Dr., Middle East Technical University)
Aydın BABUNA (Prof. Dr., Boğaziçi University)
Evgeniy BAHREVSİY (Dr., Russian Cultural and Natural Institute, Moskva)
Bojan BALKOVEC, (Assoc. Prof. Dr., Ljubljana University)
Evren BALTA (Assoc. Prof. Dr., Özyeğin University)
Tsira BARAMIDZE (Prof. Dr., I. J. Tbilisi State University)
Nikica BARIĆ, (Dr. Croatian Institute of History)
Boban BATRIČEVIĆ, (Dr., University of Montenegro)
Milivoj BEŠLIN, (Dr., Belgrade University)
Kemal BEYDİLLİ (Prof. Dr., 29 Mayıs University)
Ourania BESSİ (Dr. Birmingham University)
Yuliya BİLETSKA (Dr. Erciyes University)
Faruk BİLİCİ (Prof. Dr., INALCO, Paris)
Bülent BİLMEZ (Prof. Dr., İstanbul Bilgi University)
Nuray BOZBORA (Prof. Dr. Marmara University)
Nazım CAFEROV (Assist. Prof. Dr., Azerbaijan State Economy University)
Zdenko ČEPIĆ, (Prof. Dr., Institute of Contemporary History -Slovenia)
Tihomir CIPEK, (Prof. Dr., Zagreb University)
Merab CHUKHUA (Assoc. Prof. Dr., I. J. Tbilisi State University)
Konrad CLEWING (Dr., Südost-Institut, Regensburg)
Ahmet CONKER (PhD., Yıldız Technical University)
Mitat ÇELİKPALA (Prof. Dr., Kadir Has University)
Birgül ÇOLAKOĞLU (Prof. Dr., İstanbul Technical University)
Melek DELİLBAŞI (Prof. Dr., Ankara)
Birgül DEMİRTAŞ (Prof. Dr., TOBB Economics and Technology University)
Ayşe DIETRICH (Prof. Dr., International Journal of Russian Studies)
Ljubodrag DIMIĆ, (Prof. Dr., Belgrad University)
Margarita DOBEVA (PhD., Institute for Balkan Studies, Sofia)
Feridun M. EMECEN (Prof. Dr., 29 Mayıs University)
Halit EREN (Prof. Dr., IRCICA Director General)
M. Ozan ERÖZDEN (Prof. Dr., MEF University)
Rossitsa GRADEVA (Assoc. Prof. Dr., American University in Bulgaria/Blagoevgrad)
Nevena GRAMATIKOVA (PhD., Bulgarian National Library)
Darina GRIGOROVA (Assoc. Prof. Dr., Sofia University)
Abdullah GÜNDOĞDU (Prof. Dr., Ankara University)
Sadriye GÜNEŞ (Asist. Prof. Dr., İstanbul University)

Fuat HACISALİHOĞLU (Assist. Prof. Dr., Ordu University)
Ali HÜSEYİNOĞLU (Assist. Prof. Dr., Trakya University)
Nedim İPEK (Prof. Dr., Ondokuz Mayıs University)
Toğrul İSMAYIL (Prof. Dr., Sütçü İmam University)
Mümin İSOV (Assist. Prof. Dr., Trakya University)
Svetlana IVANOVA (Assoc. Prof. Dr., Sofia St. Kliment Ohridski University)
Husnija KAMBEROVIĆ, (Prof. Dr., Sarajevo University)
Ertuğrul KARAKUŞ (Assoc. Prof. Dr., Kırklareli University)
Ayşe KAYAPINAR (Prof. Dr., Namık Kemal University)
Levent KAYAPINAR (Prof. Dr., Namık Kemal University)
Özkan Özer KESKİN (PhD., Ordu)
Machiel KIEL (Prof. Dr., Bonn)
Markus KOLLER (Prof. Dr., Bochum University)
Işık KUŞÇU (Assoc. Prof. Dr., Middle East Technical University)
Şule KUT (Prof. Dr., Okan University Istanbul)
Elçin MACAR (Prof. Dr., Yıldız Teknik University)
Hans Georg MAJER (Prof. Dr., Munich)
Mirjana MARINKOVIĆ (Prof. Dr., Belgrade University)
Admir MULAOSMANOVIĆ (PhD., International University of Sarajevo)
Mirela MURGESCU (Prof. Dr., Bucharest University)
Ghia NODIA (Prof. Dr., Ilia State University, Tbilisi)
Hasan OKTAY (Assoc. Prof. Dr., Uluslararası Vizyon University, Gostivar)
Mehmet ÖLMEZ (Prof. Dr., Istanbul University)
Gencer ÖZCAN (Prof. Dr., Istanbul Bilgi University)
Kader ÖZLEM (Assist. Prof. Dr., Uludağ University)
Enriketa Papa PANDELEJMONI (PhD., Tirana University)
Ivan PARVEV (Prof. Dr., Sofia Kliment Ohridski University)
Antoni PEHAR (PhD., Sarajevo)
Spyridon PLOUMIDIS (PhD., National Kapodistrian University of Athens)
Radmila RADIĆ, (PhD., Institute for Recent History of Serbia)
Mihai Sorin RADULESCU (Prof. Dr., Bucharest University)
Biljana RISTOVSKA-JOSIFOVSKA (Prof. Dr., Institute of National History, Skopje)
Orlin SABEV (Prof. Dr., Institute for Balkan Studies, Sofia)
Georgios SALAKIDES (Assoc. Prof. Dr., Thrace Demokretus University, Komotini)
Abdullah SAYDAM (Prof. Dr., Erciyes University)
Oliver Jens SCHMITT (Prof. Dr., University of Vienna)
Oleksandr SEREDA (Assist. Prof. Dr., İstanbul University)
İbrahim SEZGİN (Prof. Dr., Trakya University)
S. Akşin SOMEL (Assoc. Prof. Dr., Sabancı University)
Ali Emre SUCU (Ph.D. candidate, MGIMO Moskova)
İlira SULO (Prof. Dr., University of Tirana)
Oktay F. TANRISEVER (Prof. Dr., ODTÜ)
Abdullah TEMİZKAN (Assoc. Prof. Dr., Ege University)
Ljubinka TRGOVČEVIĆ, (Prof. Dr., Belgrade University)
Zaza TSURTSUMİA (Prof. Dr., Queen Tamar University, Tbilisi)
Ömer TURAN (Prof. Dr., Middle East Technical University)
Fatma Sel TURHAN (Assoc. Prof. Dr., Istanbul Technical University)
Novica VELJANOVSKI, (Prof. Dr., Macedonia)
Anđelko VLAŠIĆ, (PhD., Croatian Institute of History)

General Information



Journal of Balkan and Black Sea Studies is an interdisciplinary refereed journal focusing on the humanities and social sciences of the Balkan countries and the former Soviet republics. The journal welcomes contributions in the fields of history, economics, politics, international relations, culture, art, geography, literature, theology, ethnography and environmental sciences. The idea behind this initiative is to extend a cross-cultural and cross-disciplinary approach over issues of regional importance. Under this light, the journal aspires to act as an academic forum for scholars in historical as well as contemporary context on a wide range of cross-regional issues and to provide the epistemological framework for a comparative investigation, which would enhance our understanding of the Balkan, and Black Sea societies, politics and communities. Furthermore, manuscripts connecting the region with wider scopes, such as technological applications, will be also considered.

The journal is published online with two issues per year (June and December) commencing in 2018 and themed issues are anticipated. Submitted manuscripts should be original and not published or under consideration for publication elsewhere. Their length should not exceed 8.000 words. The manuscript will be subject to anonymous peer-review by at least two members of the scientific committee. The use of graphics and images in colour is encouraged and not subject to limitations (within reason). However, it is the responsibility of the individual authors to acquire copyright permission if needed. The language for manuscripts is English and Turkish. Articles, other than in English or Turkish, will be occasionally accepted. Articles must have an abstract of up to 150 words in English.

Copyright@2020 by BALKAR

Design and Page Setting

Mehmet Hacısalihođlu

Conditions of Publication



Guidelines for Submission: Each issue will include articles, review essays, and shorter book reviews. All articles are to be submitted in electronic form to the journal editorial board at <http://dergipark.org.tr/balkar> and at balkar@yildiz.edu.tr. Submissions are to be up to 8,000 words in length and may be accompanied by footnotes and a bibliography. Transliterations will be kept to a minimum, and when used will follow the standard adopted by the appropriate scholarly bodies in the respective language areas. Articles are expected to be written in English though submissions in other languages can also be considered. Review essays are to be up to 4,000 words in length. They may review one or more books and may also focus on multiple works of a single author, works in a series, or publications around particular historical sources. Book reviews are to be 1,000 words in length.

Review of Submissions: All submissions are evaluated through a double-blind review process and include review both by editorial board members and external reviewers.

Publishable Copy: Articles are to be submitted via electronic means in Word format and accompanied by a copy in pdf format. The pictures and figures should be sent separately in 200 dpi resolution in tif format.

General Style Rules: 1. The text must be formatted with 1.5-inch margins and be double-spaced. 2. A separate cover sheet must be included with the manuscript title, author's name, ORCID iD Number, professional affiliation, complete mailing address and telephone number. 3. A short abstract of 70-100 words in English (including also key words) should accompany the article. 4. Capitalization: authors should be consistent in their use of capitalization. 5. Italics: the titles of works and periodicals should normally be italicized. Foreign words should also be italicized. 6. In general, foreign words and phrases, both in main text and footnotes should be provided in translation. All non-Roman alphabets should be transliterated according to the rules of international transliteration. 7. All articles should include footnotes. 8. All articles should have a bibliography at the end of the article. 9. Illustrations, tables, maps and figures must be numbered consecutively in the text and captions identifying the source of any image or data should be used. Figure title: below the picture; Table title: above the table. 10. For further reference, The Chicago Manual of Style Online (<http://www.chicagomanualofstyle.org>) is recommended.

Editorial Office Contacts



Journal Website: <http://dergipark.org.tr/balkar>

Postal address:

BALKAR, Yıldız Technical University,

Davutpaşa Campus, İİBF,

34220 Esenler, Istanbul-Turkey

e-mail: balkar@yildiz.edu.tr

Tel: +90212383 68 33

Contents

Articles

11-34

Soviet-Turkish Relations in 1921-1923:
A Few Nuances from the Bulgarian Archives
Tsvetelina Tsvetkova, Dr.
Center for Balkan and Black Sea Studies of YTU, Istanbul

35-62

89 Bulgaristan Göçmenlerinin Kimlik Kurguları Üzerinden Şehre Uyum
Pratikleri: Sakarya Örneği
Begüm Hergüven, PhD candidate
Yıldız Technical University

63-77

Historiographic controversy about the Crusades against Bosnian
“heretics”
Dženan Dautović, Assoc. Prof. Dr.
Regional Museum Travnik and Faculty of Pedagogy University of Bihać

79-108

Peace Treaty Tensions:
The Relationship between Content and Implementation of Negotiated
Agreements in Former Yugoslavia
Michael Schulz, Assoc. Prof. Dr. and
Jens Stilhoff Sørensen, Assoc. Prof. dr.
School of Global Studies, University of Gothenburg

109-138

Ethnicity Based Democratic Constitutional Structures:
the Cases of Bosnia and Herzegovina, North Macedonia and Kosovo
Avdi Smajljaj, Assist. Prof. Dr.
Department of Political Science, IIUM, Kuala Lumpur

139-168

Turkish Local Communities and City Diplomacy with Bosnia and
Herzegovina
Jahja Muhasilović, PhD Candidate
Boğaziçi University, Istanbul

Book Reviews

169-173

Giorgi Kazbegi, Bir Rus Generalinin Günlükleri "Türkiye
Gürcistan'nda Üç Ay", İstanbul: Doruk Yayıncılık, 2019.

Taner Gökdemir, PhD Candidate.

İstanbul University

Editorial

Journal of Balkan and Black Sea Studies is an Istanbul-based journal aiming at strengthening academic exchange among social scientists from Turkey, the Balkans, the Caucasus and Eastern European countries. We published the first number of the journal in December 2018 (with six research articles and two book reviews), the second number in June 2019 (with six research articles, one review article and two book reviews), and the third number in December 2019 with six articles and two book reviews. This issue is the 4th issue of the journal and includes six research articles (five in English and one in Turkish) and one book review.

The first article “Soviet-Turkish Relations in 1921-1923: A Few Nuances from the Bulgarian Archives” by *Tsvetelina Tsvetkova* (Sofia) deals with the diplomatic relations between the Soviet Union and the Ankara government during the Turkish war of liberation. She utilizes Bulgarian archival sources which give valuable information about this critical period and help us also to understand the Bulgarian attitude towards both countries.

The second article “The Immigrants of 1989 from Bulgaria and Their Adaptation to City as Identity Construction: Sakarya Case” (in Turkish) by *Begüm Hergüven* (Istanbul) deals with the process of integration of Turks from Bulgaria who came to Turkey through deportation or forced migration in 1989. She analyses her interviews with emigres in the city of Sakarya and finds out important results regarding the difficulties of integration of Turkish migrants into the city and community consisting of emigres from different parts of Eastern Anatolia.

The third article “Historiographic controversy about the Crusades against Bosnian “heretics” by *Dženan Dautović* (Travnik/Bihać) deals with the history of the Bosnian church and tendencies and interpretations in the existing historiography.

The fourth article “Peace Treaty Tensions: The Relationship between Content and Implementation of Negotiated Agreements in Former Yugoslavia” by *Michael Schulz* and *Jens Stillhoff Sörensen* (Gothenburg)

analyses the peace treaties or agreements in Bosnia and Herzegovina, Kosovo and Macedonia. The authors discuss the conditions and obstacles in the implementation of these agreements and treaties and their limited role to solve the ethnic tensions in the region.

The fifth article “Ethnicity Based Democratic Constitutional Structures: the Cases of Bosnia and Herzegovina, North Macedonia and Kosovo” by *Avdi Smajljaj* (Kuala Lumpur) discusses the constitutions of three former Yugoslav republics with multi-ethnic populations and ethnic tensions. The author shows that despite the ethnic principles in the constitution, the expected positive effect on the inter-ethnic relations has not been achieved and that on the contrary the gap among the ethnic groups have become bigger.

The sixth and last article of this issue “Turkish Local Communities and City Diplomacy with Bosnia and Herzegovina” by *Jahja Muhasilović* (Sarajevo) deals with Turkish NGOs and local community associations which were established mainly by Muslim emigrees from the Balkans. He analyses their role and impact on Turkish foreign policy and relations with Bosnia and Herzegovina.

The issue also includes one book review of the Turkish translation of “Giorgi Kazbegi, Diary of a Russian General, ‘Three Months in Turkish Georgia’ (İstanbul: Doruk Yayıncılık, 2019)” by *Taner Gökdemir* (İstanbul).

I would like to thank all the authors for their valuable contributions and all referees for their precious efforts during the evaluation process of the articles.

Mehmet Hacısalihoğlu, Prof. Dr.

Editor in Chief