

AFRICANIA

İNÖNÜ UNIVERSITY INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF AFRICAN STUDIES

Cilt/Volume:4 Sayı/Number:2



AFRICANIA

İNÖNÜ ÜNİVERSİTESİ ULUSLARARASI AFRIKA ARAŞTIRMALARI
DERGİSİ

*İNÖNÜ UNIVERSITY INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF AFRICAN
STUDIES*

Cilt / Volume: 4, Sayı / Issue: 2, (Temmuz / July 2024)
(e-ISSN: 2757-8925)

Yayımcı | Publisher

**İNönü Üniversitesi Afrika Çalışmaları Araştırma ve Uygulama Merkezi
(İNÜAFAM)**

*İNönü University Center for African Studies
(INUAFAM)*

Yazı İşleri Müdürü | Managing Editor

Emin GİTMEZ

Mizanpaj – Tasarım Editörü | Layout – Design Editor

Beyza Betül EKİCİ

Africana, uluslararası hakemli bir dergidir. Altı ayda bir yayımlanır. Dergide yayımlanan yazıların bilimsel sorumluluğu yazarlarına aittir.

İletişim Adresi | Correspondence

İNönü Üniversitesi Afrika Çalışmaları Uygulama ve Araştırma Merkezi (İNÜAFAM)
Bulgurlu Mahallesi, İnönü Üniversitesi Merkez Kampüsü, 44210, Battalgazi /Malatya

Telefon: (0422) 377 49 01

E-Posta: africania@inonu.edu.tr

Web: <https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/africana>

Çevrimiçi (Online) Yayın Tarih | Online Release Date

30 Temmuz/July 2024

DERGİ HAKKINDA | ABOUT THE JOURNAL

Dergi Adı | The Name of the Journal: AFRICANIA

e-ISSN: 2757-8925

Yayın Aralığı | The Range of Publication

Yılda 2 Sayı (Ocak & Temmuz) - Biannual Issue (January & July)

Dergi Web Sitesi | The Website of the Journal

<https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/africana> - <https://https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/africana>

Yayın Başlangıç Tarihi | Publication Start Date

Ocak, 2021 - January, 2021

Baş Editör | Editor in Chief

Dr. Osman KARACAN

Yayıncı | The Publisher

İnönü Üniversitesi Afrika Çalışmaları Araştırma ve Uygulama Merkezi (İNÜAFAM)

Inonu University African Studies Research and Application Center (INUAFAM)

İmtiyaz Sahibi | Concessionaire

İnönü Üniversitesi - Inonu University

Yayımlandığı Ülke | Country of Publication

Türkiye

Yayın Modeli | Publication Model

Açık Erişim - Open Access

Yayın İçeriği | Publication Content

Afrika ile ilgili sosyal bilimlerin tüm alanlarında makale kabul etmektedir.

It has accepted articles in all fields of social sciences related to Africa.

Yayın Dili | Publication Language

Türkçe, İngilizce, Arapça, Fransızca.

The Turkish language, the English language, the Arabic language, the French language.

Ücret Politikası | Price Policy

Africana dergisinin tüm giderleri yayıncı tarafından karşılanmaktadır. Dergide makale yayımlama ücretsizdir. Gönderilen ya da kabul edilen makaleler için herhangi bir işlem ücreti veya gönderim ücreti talep edilmemektedir. All expenses of Africana have been covered by the publisher. Publishing an article in the journal is free of charge. No processing or submission fees are charged for submitted or accepted articles.

Arşiv Politikası | Archive Policy

Africana dergisinde yayımlanan makaleler Dergipark ev sahipliğinde LOCKSS'da arşivlenir. Ayrıca, eser sahibinin inisiyatifi ile makaleler, YÖKSİS, üniversite veri tabanları (DSpace, AVESİS gibi), Google Scholar, Academia, Researchgate gibi alanlarda da kısıtlama ve süre sınırı olmaksızın erişime açılabilir. Africana dergisi eser sahibine her türlü arşivleme ve kullanma özgürlüğü tanıdığı gibi, Budapeşte Açık Erişim İnisiyatifinin (BOAI) açık erişim politikasını benimsemiş olması gereğince, dergide yayımlanan bilimsel makaleler ve araştırmaları ücretsiz olarak son kullanıcı ve kurumlara sunmaktadır. Kullanıcılar, yayıncı veya yazarın iznine gereksinim duymadan Africana'da yayımlanan makalelerin tam metinlerini okumak, indirmek, kopyalamak, dağıtmak, arama yapmak veya bağlantı kurmak hakkına sahiptir. Böylece, bilimsel bilginin yaygınlaşması ve kullanımının kolaylaştırılması amaçlanmaktadır. Africana, makalelerin tüm sürümlerinin herhangi bir kısıtlama olmaksızın yazar tarafından arşivlenmesine izin verir. Bu arşivlemeye, dergiye gönderilen makalenin ilk halinden, kabul edilinceye kadarki sürede dergi sistemine kaydedilen bütün versiyonlar dâhildir.

Articles published in Africana are archived in LOCKSS hosted by Dergipark. In addition, at the initiative of the author, articles can be made available without restrictions and time limits in YÖKSİS, university databases (such as DSpace, AVESİS), Google Scholar, Academia, Researchgate. According to the Journal Africana provides the author with the freedom to archive and use all kinds of archives, and the Budapest Open Access Initiative (BOAI) adopts the open access policy, the scientific articles and research published in the journal are made available to the latest users and institutions free of charge. Users have the right to read, download, copy, distribute, search or link to the full text of articles published in Africana without the need for permission from the publisher or the author. This is intended to facilitate the dissemination and use of scientific knowledge. Africana allows all versions of articles to be archived by the author without any restrictions. This archiving includes all versions saved in the journal system from the first version of the article submitted to the journal until it is accepted.

Açık Erişim Lisansı | Open Access License

CC BY-NC 4.0

Telif Hakkı Sahibi | Copyright Holder

Yazar(lar) telif hakkını korur. - The author(s) retains copyright.

Politika Koşulları | Policy Terms

Atıf ve alıntı standartlarına uyularak dergiye atıf yapılmalıdır. DOI ile yayıncı sürümüne bağlanmalıdır. The journal should be cited in accordance with citation and citation standards. It should be linked to the publisher version with DOI.

Hakemlik Türü | Type of Refereeing

Çift Taraflı Kör Hakemlik - Double Blind Review

İntihal Kontrolü | Plagiarism Checker

iThenticate

İletişim | Contact

africana@inonu.edu.tr

İtiraz

Makalenizin reddedilme gerekçesini hatalı buluyorsanız, lütfen gerekçenizi açık bir şekilde belirterek africana@inonu.edu.tr adresi üzerinden iletişime geçiniz.



Africana Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International (CC BY-

NC 4.0) Lisansı ile lisanslanmıştır.

Africana is licensed under a Creative Commons AttributionNonCommercial 4.0

International (CC BY-NC 4.0) License.



Africana Açık Erişim politikasını benimsemektedir.

The Journal of Africana Supports Open Access Policy

Editöryal Yetkili

Dr. Osman KARACAN

ORCID: 0009-0006-3706-6574

E-posta: Osman.karacan@inonu.edu.tr

Telefon: 0536 269 86 98

Adres: İnönü Üniversitesi Fen Edebiyat Fakültesi Tarih Bölümü

Şehir: Malatya

Ülke: Türkiye

Posta Kodu: 44280

AFRICANIA DERGİSİ'NİN YER ALDIĐI İNDEKLER



EDİTÖR KURULU | EDITORIAL BOARD

Baş Editör | Editor in Chef

Osman KARACAN | İnönü Üniversitesi /Türkiye

ORCID ID: 0009-0006-3706-6574

Editörler | Editors

Ayşe TOMAT YILMAZ | MEB /Türkiye

ORCID ID: 0000-0001-8631-2854

Mustafa Yunus GÜMÜŞ | Türkiye

ORCID ID: 0000-0003-2432-2955

Süleyman EKİCİ | İnönü Üniversitesi /Türkiye

ORCID ID: 0000-0001-8477-000X

Ali BÜYÜKASLAN | İstanbul Medipol Üniversitesi /Türkiye

ORCID ID: 0000-0001-6770-0085

Editör Yardımcıları | Assistant Editors

Gufran DÜNDAR | Sakarya Üniversitesi /Türkiye

ORCID ID: 0000-0003-0986-4473

Beyza Betül EKİCİ | İnönü Üniversitesi /Türkiye

ORCID ID: 0000-0002-7872-1583

Alan Editörleri | Section Editors

Zehra YILDIRIM | Rabat Mohammad V Üni./Fas

ORCID ID: 0000-0002-5303-3792

Esmâ KARADAĞ | Cape Town Üniversitesi /Güney Afrika

ORCID ID: 0000-0002-3516-7260

Necati FIRATLI | El Manar Üniversitesi /Tunus

ORCID ID: 0000-0002-2202-1385

Zekeriya AKDAĞ | İnönü Üniversitesi /Türkiye

ORCID ID: 0000-0002-0866-603X

Ramazan MEŞE | İnönü Üniversitesi /Türkiye

ORCID ID: 0000-0001-8524-7923

Burak YETİMOĞLU | Uluslararası Rabat Üniversitesi /Fas

ORCID ID: 0000-0001-5603-3643

Ülkü ÇİÇEK | Uluslararası Rabat Üniversitesi / Fas

ORCID ID: 0000-0001-6233-8785

Onur YAMANER | Türkiye

ORCID ID: 0000-0002-8715-2060

Fatma YILDIZ | Cape Town Üniversitesi /Güney Afrika

ORCID ID: 0000-0002-8392-5142

Ayşe AYTEKİN | Gümüşhane Üniversitesi /Türkiye

ORCID ID: 0000-0002-5952-762X

Selahattin YILDIRIM | İnönü Üniversitesi /Türkiye

ORCID ID: 0000-0003-3104-0251

Mohammad RIGIDERAKHSHAN | Türkiye

ORCID ID: 0000-0003-1495-6284

Halil İbrahim KOÇ | Niğde Üniversitesi /Türkiye

ORCID ID: 0000-0002- 9536-7627

Veysel ÇETİN | Türkiye

ORCID ID: 0000- 0001-8415-4485

Dil Editörleri | Language Editors

İsmail SÖYLEMEZ | İnönü Üniversitesi /Türkiye

ORCID ID: 0000-0001-7000-3686

Ümit YAKAR | İnönü Üniversitesi /Türkiye

ORCID ID: 0000-0002-2317-5159

Zahide PARLAR | İnönü Üniversitesi /Türkiye

ORCID ID: 0000-0002-4616-9579

Osman ŞAHİN | İnönü Üniversitesi /Türkiye

ORCID ID: 0000-0003-2959-241X

Selahattin YILDIRIM | İnönü Üniversitesi /Türkiye

ORCID ID: 0000-0003-3104-0251

Mustafa Yunus GÜMÜŞ | Türkiye

ORCID ID: 0000-0003-2432-2955

Semra TAYDAŞ OSMAN | RWTH Aachen Üni./Almanya

ORCID ID: 0000-0002-5419-8249

Fatma ÖRS | İnönü Üniversitesi /Türkiye

ORCID ID: 0009-0004-5896-0175

Etik Editörü | Ethic Editor

Hüseyin GÜNEŞ | Türkiye

ORCID ID: 0000-0003-1713-8316

İstatistik Editörü | Statistics Editor

Gökhan KONAT | Bolu Abant İzzet Baysal Üni/Türkiye

ORCID ID: 0000-0002-5419-8249

YAYIN KURULU | EDITORIAL BOARD

Dr. Abdurrahman ALİ	Samara University Ethiopia
Dr. Ahmet KAVAS	Dakar BE Türkiye Senegal
Dr. Ali BÜYÜKASLAN	İstanbul Medipol Üniversitesi Türkiye
Dr. Askia Nasir KABARA	Kano University of Science and Tecnology Nigeria
Dr. Bellil ABDELKARİM	Chadli Bin Jadid University, Algeria
Dr. Elem EYRİCE TEPECİKLIOĞLU	Yaşar Üniversitesi Türkiye
Dr. Enver ARPA	Ankara Sosyal Bilimler Üniversitesi Türkiye
Dr. Gökhan TUNCEL	İnönü Üniversitesi Türkiye
Dr. Hande SAPMAZ	Mardin Artuklu Üniversitesi Türkiye
Dr. Harun BEKİROĞLU	İnönü Üniversitesi Türkiye
Dr. İrfan NEZİROĞLU	Hartum BE/Türkiye Sudan
Dr. İsmail SÖYLEMEZ	İnönü Üniversitesi Türkiye
Dr. Jama Musa JAMA	Redsea Cultur Foundation Somaliland Somalia
Dr. Kasim SALİFU	Ghana
Dr. Mbaye LO	Duke University USA
Dr. Mehmet Emin ŞAHİN	Hakkâri Üniversitesi Türkiye
Dr. Mohamed El- Moctar El-SHINQITI	Hamad Bin Khalifa University Qatar
Dr. Mohamed Jama MADAR	Hargeisa University Somaliland Somalia
Dr. Mohamoud Yusuf MUSE	Hargeisa University Somaliland Somalia
Dr. Muddathir ABDEL-RAHİM	International University of Africa Sudan
Dr. Muhammed HARON	Bostwana University/Sellenbosch University South Africa
Dr. Muhammed OSMAN	International University of Africa Sudan
Dr. Murat KAYACAN	İzmir Kâtip Çelebi Üniversitesi Türkiye
Dr. Mustafa Yunus GÜMÜŞ	Türkiye
Dr. Mürsel BAYRAM	Ankara Sosyal Bilimler Üniversitesi Türkiye
Dr. Neslihan DERİN	İnönü Üniversitesi Türkiye
Dr. Osman KARACAN	İnönü Üniversitesi Türkiye
Dr. Recep KARABULUT	İnönü Üniversitesi Türkiye
Dr. Recep ŞEHİTOĞLU	GAÜN Türkiye
Dr. Selim ARGUN	Diyanet İşleri Başkanlığı Türkiye
Dr. Süleyman EKİCİ	İnönü Üniversitesi Türkiye
Dr. Usame EŞKAR	International University of Africa Sudan
Dr. Yahya BAŞKAN	İnönü Üniversitesi Türkiye
Dr. Yunus NAMAZ	Fırat Üniversitesi Türkiye
Dr. Yunus TURHAN	Hacı Bayram Veli Üniversitesi Türkiye
Dr. Zahide PARLAR	İnönü Üniversitesi Türkiye
Dr. Zekeriya AKDAĞ	İnönü Üniversitesi Türkiye

İÇİNDEKİLER | CONTENTS

Araştırma Makaleleri | Research Articles

An Overview of Africa's Social History in the Context of "History From Below": The Example of African Socialism

Afrika'nın Toplumsal Tarihine "Aşağıdan Tarih" Yazımı Bağlamında Bir Bakış: Afrika Sosyalizmi Örneği

Özgür YILMAZ

(01-13)

Life in the Heart of Southwest Ethiopia: Preliminary Reflections on the Pastoral Life of the Hamar People
Güneybatı Etiyopya'nın Kalbinde Yaşam: Hamar Halkının Pastoral Yaşamına Yönelik Ön Değerlendirmeler

Evrin TEKELİ

(14-28)

İnceleme Makaleleri | Review Articles

How the Somali Government Works with the Traditional Clan-Based Systems: Literature Review
Somali Modern Yönetiminin Geleneksel Yönetim Sistemi ile Nasıl Çalıştığı: Literatür Taraması

Afifa WARSAME

(29-53)

Comparison of the Postcolonial Elements in the Arrow of God and its Turkish Translation Within the
Scope of Venuti's Foreignization Strategy

Venuti'nin Yabancılaştırma Stratejisi Kapsamında Arrow Of God Eserindeki Postkolonyal Unsurlarının
ve Türkçe Çevirisinin Karşılaştırılması

Yaşar AKGÜN

(54-66)

Kitap İncelemesi | Book Review

A History of Slavery, Race, and Islam in the Eyes of Chouki El Hamel

Chouki El Hamel'in Gözünden Kölelik, Irk ve İslam Tarihi

Melek EYİGÜN

(67-70)

AN OVERVIEW OF AFRICA'S SOCIAL HISTORY IN THE CONTEXT OF "HISTORY FROM BELOW": THE EXAMPLE OF AFRICAN SOCIALISM

AFRİKA'NIN TOPLUMSAL TARİHİNE "AŞAĞIDAN TARİH" YAZIMI BAĞLAMINDA BİR BAKIŞ: AFRİKA SOSYALİZMİ ÖRNEĞİ

Yıl 4, Sayı 2, ss.01-13.

Year 4, Issue 2, pp.01-13.

Makale Türü: Araştırma Makalesi

Article Type: Research Article

Geliş Tarihi: 03.11.2023

Submitted: 03.11.2023

Kabul Tarihi: 27.05.2024

Accepted: 27.05.2024

DOI: 10.58851/africana.1385892

Atf Bilgisi / Reference Information

Yılmaz, Ö. (2024). An Overview of Africa's Social History in The Context of "History From Below": The Example of African Socialism, *Africana Dergisi*, 4 (2), 01-13. <https://doi.org/10.58851/africana.1385892>

Özgür YILMAZ

İstanbul Üniversitesi, ozguryilmaz955@gmail.com,

ORCID: 0000-0003-3020-8550

Abstract

This study offers an in-depth look at the complex social history of Africa using the perspective of "history from below". This approach foregrounds the stories and experiences of marginalized groups that are often overlooked in traditional elite-centered narratives. African socialism, as a distinctive form of socialism based on pre-colonial social values and Pan-African ideals, provides a compelling case study to illustrate the value of this perspective. The study uses the methodology of comparative historical analysis based on a range of primary and secondary sources, and the term "Africa" refers to the countries of Sub-Saharan Africa. The work questions the Eurocentric narratives that have long dominated African historiography. By centering the voices of marginalized groups, it reveals the complexity and diversity of Sub-Saharan African societies that are often obscured by colonial and post-colonial perspectives. The study reveals the social dynamics that have shaped Africa's history by examining the interplay between power relations, cultural practices, and economic structures. It also highlights the diversity of African socialism and the influence of local contexts. It shows the role of women and marginalized groups in shaping African socialism. The study questions interpretations that view African socialism as simply an imitation of European models and shows how this ideology was shaped by local traditions, cultural values and political contexts. As a result, the study offers a multidimensional and rich understanding of African socialism and the social history of Africa using "history from below" and comparative historical analysis. These findings provide valuable insights into current debates about development, social justice, and the role of government in Africa.

Keywords: History from Below, Social History, Africa, Socialism, African Socialism.

Öz

Bu çalışma, "aşağıdan tarih" perspektifini kullanarak Afrika'nın karmaşık toplumsal tarihine derinlemesine bir bakış sunmaktadır. Bu yaklaşım, genellikle geleneksel elit merkezli anlatılarda göz ardı edilen, marjinalleştirilmiş grupların hikayelerini ve deneyimlerini ön plana çıkarmaktadır. Afrika sosyalizmi, sömürge öncesi toplumsal değerler ve Pan-Afrikan ideallere dayanan özgün bir sosyalizm türü olarak, bu perspektifin değerini göstermek için çekiçi bir vaka çalışması sunmaktadır. Çalışma, bir dizi birincil ve ikincil kaynağa dayanan karşılaştırmalı tarihsel analiz metodolojisini kullanmaktadır. Çalışmada kullanılan "Afrika" terimiyle Sahra Altı Afrika ülkeleri ifade edilmektedir. Çalışma, Afrika tarih yazımında uzun süredir egemen olan Avrupa merkezli anlatıları sorgulamaktadır. Marjinalleştirilmiş grupların seslerini merkeze alarak, sömürgecilik ve sömürge sonrası perspektiflerle sıkça gölgelenen Sahra Altı Afrika toplumlarının karmaşıklığını ve çeşitliliğini ortaya çıkarmaktadır. Çalışma, güç ilişkileri, kültürel pratikler ve ekonomik yapılar arasındaki etkileşimi inceleyerek Afrika'nın tarihini şekillendiren toplumsal dinamikleri açığa çıkarmaktadır. Ayrıca, Afrika sosyalizminin çeşitliliğini ve yerel bağlamların etkisini vurgulamaktadır. Çalışma, kadınların ve marjinalleştirilmiş grupların Afrika sosyalizminin şekillenmesindeki rolünü açığa çıkarmaktadır. Çalışma, Afrika sosyalizmini basitçe Avrupa modellerinin bir taklidi olarak gören yorumları sorgular ve bu ideolojinin yerel gelenekler, kültürel değerler ve siyasi bağlamlar tarafından nasıl şekillendiğini göstermektedir. Sonuç olarak, çalışma, "aşağıdan tarih" ve karşılaştırmalı tarihsel analiz kullanarak Afrika sosyalizminin ve Afrika'nın toplumsal tarihinin çok boyutlu ve zengin bir anlayışını sunmaktadır. Bu bulgular, Afrika'daki gelişim, sosyal adalet ve hükümetin rolü hakkındaki güncel tartışmalara değerli içgörüler sağlamaktadır.

Anahtar kelimeler: Aşağıdan Tarih, Toplumsal Tarih, Afrika, Sosyalizm.

STRUCTURED ABSTRACT

This study delves into the intricate social history of sub-Saharan Africa, employing the lens of "history from below" as a guiding framework. This approach prioritizes the narratives and experiences of marginalized groups, often overlooked in traditional, elite-centered accounts. By adopting this perspective, we gain a more comprehensive and nuanced understanding of the region's rich social fabric. African socialism, a unique form of socialism rooted in pre-colonial communal values and Pan-African ideals, serves as a compelling case study to illustrate the value of "history from below." The study employs a comparative historical analysis methodology, drawing upon a diverse range of primary and secondary sources. In the study, the phrase "Africa" is used to describe the countries in the sub-Saharan region.

The study challenges Eurocentric narratives that have long dominated African historiography. By centering the voices of marginalized groups, it unveils the complexity and diversity of Sub-Saharan African societies, often obscured by colonial and post-colonial perspectives. The study uncovers the intricate social dynamics that have shaped Africa's history. It examines the interplay of power relations, cultural practices, and economic structures, revealing the resilience and adaptability of Sub-Saharan African communities. The study highlights the agency of marginalized groups in shaping their own destinies. It demonstrates how these groups have resisted oppression, adapted to changing circumstances, and actively contributed to the region's social and cultural transformation.

African socialism is presented as a diverse and locally influenced ideology, challenging simplistic interpretations that portray it as a mere imitation of European models. The study underscores the role of grassroots movements and popular mobilization in shaping socialist experiments in Africa. It highlights the agency of ordinary citizens in advocating for social justice and challenging entrenched power structures. The study's emphasis on "history from below" and comparative historical analysis offers valuable insights into the diverse experiences and perspectives that shaped African socialism. By examining case studies from various countries, the study reveals the adaptability and contextual variations of African socialism, challenging the notion of a monolithic ideology. It demonstrates how local traditions, cultural values, and political contexts influenced the implementation and outcomes of socialist policies.

Moreover, the study highlights the role of women and marginalized groups in shaping African socialism. It challenges the traditional portrayal of African socialism as a male-dominated movement, revealing the active participation of women in political, economic, and social spheres. The study also sheds light on the experiences of ethnic minorities, Indigenous groups, and other marginalized communities, often overlooked in mainstream narratives of African socialism. Furthermore, the study's comparative approach allows for a nuanced understanding of the challenges and opportunities faced by sub-Saharan African socialist experiments. It reveals the impact of external factors, such as global economic conditions, Cold War politics, and the influence of superpowers, on the trajectory of African socialism. The study also examines the internal dynamics of socialist regimes, including power struggles, economic constraints, and the challenges of balancing ideological principles with practical realities.

The study emphasizes that sub-Saharan African socialism is not a homogenous entity but a collection of varied practices influenced by local contexts and traditions. By examining specific case studies, it highlights how different regions adapted socialist principles to their unique cultural and historical circumstances. This approach not only broadens our understanding of African socialism but also challenges the conventional wisdom that often oversimplifies the ideology. The study also underscores the importance of grassroots movements and local initiatives in the success and failures of socialist policies. It highlights how ordinary citizens, through their collective efforts and mobilization, played a crucial role in shaping the direction and outcomes of these policies. This grassroots perspective provides a more democratic and

inclusive view of African socialism, emphasizing the active participation of all societal members.

In conclusion, this study provides a rich and multifaceted understanding of Africa's social history and the complexities of sub-Saharan African socialism. By employing the lens of "history from below" and comparative historical analysis, it unveils the diverse perspectives, experiences, and challenges that shaped the continent's post-colonial trajectory. The study's findings offer valuable insights for contemporary debates about development, social justice, and the role of government in sub-Saharan Africa. This comprehensive approach not only enriches our understanding of African history but also offers practical lessons for contemporary policy-making and social development strategies. Additionally, the study emphasizes the importance of inclusive historical narratives that recognize the contributions of all societal members. By highlighting the voices of marginalized groups, the research advocates for a more equitable and just representation of sub-Saharan Africa's past, ultimately informing a more inclusive and democratic future.

Introduction

History from below and social history have gained recognition in current Turkish literature. History from below focuses on unveiling the untold stories, challenging the official historical narrative. While social history shares a similar purpose, it is often not used interchangeably. This study discusses both concepts together, exploring what history from below is, how it differs from traditional historiography, and provides examples.

This study is based on the method of comparative historical analysis. The basic strategy of comparative historical analysis involves focusing on specific sets of cases that exhibit sufficient similarity to be meaningfully compared with one another. While this approach may face criticism from those advocating for universalising knowledge, comparative historical analysts persist in asking historically delimited questions due to the limitations of universal theoretical approaches. They argue that such questions offer significant analytic advantages, especially when compared to the often too general ahistorical concepts generated by universalising programs of the past and present. By examining cases and processes at a less abstract level, comparative historical analysts derive lessons from past experiences that speak to present concerns. Although their insights remain grounded in the histories examined and cannot be directly transposed to other contexts, comparative historical studies provide more meaningful advice regarding contemporary choices and possibilities than studies aiming for universal truths but lacking critical historical details (Mahoney & Rueschemeyer, 2003, pp. 7-10). When Africa is mentioned in the study, the Sub-Saharan region is meant.

In summary, history from below empowers the voices of marginalised social classes and emphasises their acts of protest. Social history is a variation of history from below, explores how people shape their lives within a cultural and societal framework. The relationship between history from below and the understanding of social history is integral to a more inclusive and comprehensive approach to studying the past. History from below represents an historiographical perspective that endeavours to reveal and comprehend the experiences of ordinary individuals who have traditionally been overshadowed by political elites and major institutions in conventional historical narratives. This approach is driven by the recognition that most people throughout history were not the architects of grand political strategies or the architects of monumental events, but rather individuals with unique stories and struggles. History from below redirects the historical lens towards the lives of common people, shedding light on their day-to-day existence, challenges, and contributions. This shift in focus aligns closely with the broader framework of social history, which is concerned with the study of society and its various facets. Social history, in contrast to political or military history, emphasises the social structures, cultural practices, and everyday experiences that shape the lives of people from different social classes. The synergy between history from below and

4 | Özgür YILMAZ

social history becomes evident as both perspectives strive to challenge and diversify historical narratives. By exploring the perspectives of those often excluded from mainstream historical discourse, these approaches provide a more nuanced understanding of the past. Social history, enriched by insights gained from history from below, becomes a powerful tool for unravelling the complexities of societies, offering a more holistic and democratic account of human history. The relationship between history from below and social history is symbiotic, contributing to a more inclusive and empathetic exploration of the human experience across time.

Theoretical Framework

In the ever-evolving landscape of historical scholarship, there exists a compelling imperative to present the narratives of the past through a lens that seamlessly integrates history, and social history. The traditional delineations between these disciplines are gradually giving way to a more comprehensive approach that recognises the interconnectedness of historical events, societal structures, and cultural expressions. This conceptual shift is not merely academic; it reflects a broader recognition that to utterly understand the human experience, we must explore history as a multidimensional tapestry. By contextualising the conceptual transitions from conventional historical narratives to the incorporation of social and cultural dimensions, we embark on a journey that transcends traditional boundaries, offering a more nuanced and inclusive understanding of the complexities inherent in the human story. This integrated perspective allows us to appreciate history not as a linear sequence of events, but as a rich tapestry woven with the threads of social dynamics and cultural intricacies, providing a comprehensive and interconnected narrative of our collective past.

The history from below was first used in English by Edward P. Thompson in 1966 as the title of an article published in the Times Literary Supplement (de Oliveira & Courier, 2022, p. 3). According to this usage, the approach to history from below explores the historical experiences and existences of people whose existence is ignored in the mainstream historical narrative. The experiences of the masses, who are inaccessible or unimportant, not seen as a problematic in historiography, are important. History from below is based on the need to reconstruct ordinary people's experiences, to understand the man in the past. Diaries, memoirs, and political manifestos are used that use the history from below approach. The approach of history from below is under the influence of Marxism. It focuses on the history of the labour movement, and in this context, it differs from the modern understanding of political history: It moves away from the general chronological narrative. It synthesises a richer historical understanding that combines peoples' everyday experience with more traditional forms of history. The approach of history from below therefore implies that there is something to relate "above" (Sharpe, 2001, p. 26-34).

History from below aims to re-establish the agency of subordinate social classes from oppressed geographies—for example, the Middle East and Africa. Therefore, it focuses on their protest actions. The approach of history from below feels the influence of Michel Foucault in the analysis of marginals, prisoners, prostitutes, insane in the context of examining the oppressed (Cronin, 2008, p. 1-11). The history from below approach considers the wider context of popular life, including daily habits and associations, memories, and traditions, as the only way to understand the motives or motives underlying popular actions (de Oliveira & Courier, 2022, p. 4).

The idea of history from below is positioned in opposition to nationalist historiography or modernisation theory: In this way, it becomes opposed to the understanding of total history (Çetinkaya, 2014, p. 15-16). So, history from below is against the "great man" narrative. The great man approach deals with certain events from the perspective of leaders (Harman, 2013: 9). In this total understanding of history, the "underlying" is excluded. In this understanding, elite forms of history are examined, not popular forms (Uslu, 2017, p. 99).

Eric Hobsbawm is associated with the concept of history from below. His approach involves focusing on the experiences and perspectives of ordinary people, marginalised groups, and social movements, rather than solely concentrating on political elites or traditional sources of historical narratives. Hobsbawm, along with other historians like E.P. Thompson, contributed to the development of social history and the exploration of the lives of common people throughout history. In his works, such as "The Making of the English Working Class" Thompson emphasised the importance of understanding history from the perspective of those who are not traditionally considered central figures in historical narratives. This approach aims to provide a more inclusive and comprehensive understanding of the past. History from below is a history rooted in the experience of the subordinated, oppressed, and dispossessed. In this context, history from below draws closer to the postcolonial criticism advocated by Subaltern Studies (de Oliveira & Courrier, 2022, p. 5-6). Both currents consider subalterns as active rather than passive subjects (Fick, 2004, p. 10). Important Subaltern Studies theorist Dipesh Chakrabarty (2010, p. 30) draws attention to the relationship between Subaltern Studies and history from below:

“Subaltern historiography necessarily required the separation of the history of power from the history of any universal capital, the critique of the nation form, and the questioning of the relationship between power and knowledge (hence the archive itself and history as a form of knowledge).”

The idea of history from below, as outlined by Chakrabarty, serves as a critical perspective that challenges both historicism and Eurocentrism. Eurocentrism, characterised by the belief that Europe is the central determinant of world culture and progress, is scrutinised within the framework of history from below. Chakrabarty argues that Eurocentrism perpetuates an understanding of a single modernity rooted in European experiences, disregarding alternative modernities that may have originated from diverse cultural contexts (Bhambra, 2007). This critique of Eurocentrism aligns with the rejection of the notion that Europe is the exclusive starting point for progress and modernity. In addition, Afrocentrism developed by Molefi Kete Asante (2000, p. 195) and Asia-centrism approaches put forward by Yoshitaka Miike (2010, p. 190-215) can be presented as alternatives to the Eurocentric perspective. These approaches support the idea that history should be understood not only from Europe but also from other parts of the world.

Moreover, Eurocentrism, as a theoretical construct in world history, is implicated in sustaining ideas of European superiority and a predetermined destiny. It has influenced various social theories and ideologies, emphasising Europe's uniqueness and expansionism as central factors (Alatas, 2006). This critique, in turn, intersects with the broader approach of history from below, which seeks to shift the focus from traditional historical narratives dominated by elites to the experiences and perspectives of ordinary individuals and marginalised groups.

The development of social history as a variant of history from below reflects a broader historiographical shift that challenges traditional perspectives and Eurocentric frameworks. Social history, once marginalised within historical disciplines, expanded its scope to incorporate diverse topics such as women's history, gender studies, medicine, crime, and consumerism. This expansion aligns with the inclusive goals of history from below, emphasising the importance of recognising the experiences of ordinary individuals, particularly workers, and understanding their identities rooted in the context of the workplace (Magraw, 2002).

Examples of Social History in Africa: African Socialism

In this part of the study, African socialism will be examined. First, the article starts with the example of African socialism. African socialism emerged as an anti-colonial project in the colonial process. African socialism or Afro socialism developed differently from traditional/Orthodox Marxist practices. The reason for this is that socialist movement practices in Africa are based on different social structures and historical experiences. For example, when the first socialist movements of the 20th century came to power, Africa

was still under colonial rule (Shire, 2019, p. 27).

Due to its anti-colonial stance, African socialism is rooted in Pan-Africanist ideals. Diverging from conventional Marxist ideology, African socialism draws inspiration from longstanding ethical codes prevalent in African societies over centuries. The foundational principles of African socialism are grounded in the practices of mutual aid and solidarity observed in African communities (Mboya, 1963, p. 17). Widely embraced during the initial years of independence, African socialism found traction in several nations, including Ghana, Guinea, Senegal, and Tanzania. The term “African socialism” itself holds multiple connotations, with proponents explicitly highlighting their divergence from communism. Some proponents even asserted that they do not align with Marxist principles (Akyeampong, 2018, p. 69). Julius Nyerere (1987, p. 5), one of the pioneers of African socialism, emphasises the difference of Africa:

“Since the appearance of millionaires in a society does not depend on its affluence, sociologists may find it interesting to try and find out why our societies in Africa did not, in fact, produce any millionaires for we certainly had enough wealth to create a few. I think they would discover that it was because the organization of traditional African society, its distribution of the wealth it produced was such that there was hardly any room for parasitism. They might also say, of course, that because of this Africa could not produce a leisured class of landowners, and therefore there was nobody to produce the works of art or science which capitalist societies can boast. But works of art and the achievements of science are products of the intellect which, like land, is one of God’s gifts to man. And I cannot believe that God is so careless as to have made the use of one of His gifts depend on the misuse of another!”

Some of the countries where socialism was implemented in Sub-Saharan Africa and their implementation years are as follows: Tanzania (1960s-1980s), Mozambique (1970s-1980s), Angola (1970s-1990s), Ethiopia (1970s-1990s), Benin (1970s-1980s), Zimbabwe (1980s-1990s), and Madagascar (1970s-1990s). But first, the typical characteristics of African socialism will be discussed.

In the expression African socialism, the word Africa is not used to describe a continent to which a foreign ideology would be transmitted. It bears the African roots of a system that is characteristically African (Mohan, 1966, 220). African socialism is not simply a copy of one or another form of European socialism. In fact, socialism must be seen in its different forms in practice, in doctrine, in geographical areas, and in history. But all forms of European socialism have a common denominator. Beyond the different currents of socialism, there are everywhere a certain number of common features that gradually build up modern socialist thought. Of these features, only man's eternal revolt against the injustice to which he is subjected, but against the self-imposed idea that this injustice is natural and incorrigible, is indicated. European socialism in its various forms is a historical fact in the sense that it emerged at a particular time in history that was particularly painful for the workers and inspired them with a profound humanitarian ideal and a program of action. The reason for the emergence of these forms of socialism has been the effort of man to get something back for his fellow man. It is an intellectual socialism: it arises from the phenomenon of industrialisation, as something to meet a dramatic situation. But this classical understanding of socialism is not at all the same as what Africans call African socialism.

African socialism is not a fortunate invention, a means to meet this or that crisis, to combat this or that human condition: it is the result of African humanism, which aims to give everyone what they need. The African world is a world in constant socialisation, and a black person is a socialised being. African socialism is not a reaction against anyone. The problem is not a class struggle, as society is not characterised by the existence of warring classes. The problem is to prevent the rise of a sharply stratified society that will eventually lead to such a struggle. The problem in African socialism is a return to the source. African socialism has experienced the shock of colonisation for a certain period and is now a reality that needs to be rethought in the context of evolution (Kanoute, 1964, p. 49).

African socialism was influenced by black ideologies such as humanism, ujamaa, and négritude (Ottaway, 1978, p. 477). The concept of ujamaa comes from Swahili for extended family or family, which is distinguished by various basic characteristics such as how a person becomes a person through people or community. Négritude, on the other hand, put forward the idea of an identity for Black people around the world as a response to the alienated position of Black people in history. As a result, it can be said that African socialism is an attempt to recapture and modernise the communal way of life practiced by the traditional African way of thinking (Alofun, 2014, pp. 69-72).

After gaining independence in 1961, Tanganyika's merger with Zanzibar in 1964 drew global attention to its new President, Julius Nyerere, affectionately known as Mwalimu (the Teacher). Under his leadership, the concept of Ujamaa, meaning "familyhood" in Swahili, gained international recognition and became a tangible reality for the Tanzanian people. Since then, Ujamaa has remained a focal point of discussion when analysing Tanzania's postcolonial history. Julius Nyerere introduced Ujamaa in the late 1950s, defining it in his essay "Ujamaa – the Basis for African Socialism". With the adoption of the Arusha Declaration in 1967, Ujamaa became the official policy of the single-ruling-party TANU (Tanganyika African National Union) and the primary development strategy, which persisted until the late 1970s, despite its eventual economic shortcomings. However, as argued by numerous scholars, Ujamaa's legacy transcends its historical context and continues to influence the present. To grasp its impact, it is crucial to delve into its foundational principles and its relationship with African socialism. Although Julius Nyerere referred to Ujamaa as "the basis of African socialism," the term is often used interchangeably with African Socialism, albeit with Tanzanian nuances. African Socialism emerged as a socialist doctrine in various African nations, including Senegal, Ghana, Kenya, and notably Tanzania under Nyerere's leadership, in the wake of French and British colonial rule in the 1950s and 1960s. African Socialist leaders aimed to achieve economic development, social control, and the promotion of African identity by drawing on precolonial communal ideals. However, the term lacked a clear definition and manifested differently in each country. Nyerere's interpretation of African socialism found expression in ujamaa, core tenets of which he outlined in an essay. Emphasising communitarian values, Nyerere traced their roots to a precolonial era where individuals lived, worked, and supported one another within a communal framework. This communal ethos extended to the idea of communal land ownership. Additionally, Ujamaa underscored egalitarianism and equality, harkening back to a time when wealth distribution within the community was equitable, irrespective of individual differences in wealth acquisition. Moreover, participation in nation-building was paramount, as Nyerere envisioned a collective effort where every citizen contributed to the nation's prosperity for the benefit of all (Boesl, 2023, p. 2). During the 1970s, Tanzania's Ujamaa policy faced challenges and failed due to internal conflicts, opposition, and agricultural difficulties. Despite government efforts, including villagization and nationalisation, conflicts arose between different interest groups, hindering the policy's success. Additionally, erratic rainfall led to crop failures and food shortages, prompting costly imports and coercive measures. These factors, compounded by forced villagization, contributed to the policy's downfall (Keskin et al., 2019, p. 299).

The attainment of independence by Mozambique on June 25, 1975, marked a pivotal moment in the nation's history. It served as an interlude between the oppressive Portuguese colonialism and the devastating war of destabilisation that Mozambique would endure until the early 1990s. For the revolutionaries of the Front for the Liberation of Mozambique (FRELIMO), this transitional period was a time to celebrate their hard-fought victory and envision a promising future. Their aim, as declared by FRELIMO's inaugural cabinet, was to eradicate all remnants of colonialism and imperialism to eliminate the exploitation of man by man and establish the political, material, ideological, cultural, and social foundations of a new society. FRELIMO's project of "scientific socialism" and "popular democracy" found favour among many leftist Western observers and was lauded in numerous books examining Mozambique's revolution and socialist transition. However, some questioned how a Marxist-oriented revolution could occur in Mozambique, given its underdeveloped economy and social conditions. Nevertheless, rural unrest enabled the radical fringe to assume control and propel society towards a Marxist-inspired transformation

(Robinson, 2003, p. 131). The collapse of socialism in Mozambique was a complex process. The early mistakes and excesses of the FRELIMO government, combined with the economic and social challenges faced by Mozambique after independence, contributed to the failure of socialism. Additionally, the destabilisation war waged by Renamo, supported by South Africa, undermined FRELIMO's policies and severely weakened the country's economic and social infrastructure. FRELIMO's delayed response in acknowledging and correcting its own mistakes further exacerbated the problems and contributed to the collapse of socialism. Consequently, the collapse of socialism in Mozambique occurred because of the complex interplay of internal and external factors (O'Meara, 1991, p. 102).

The emergence and development of socialism in Angola is closely intertwined with the country's struggle for independence and subsequent political processes. The independence movement of Angola, particularly under the leadership of MPLA (People's Movement for the Liberation of Angola), embraced a structure and form of resistance based on socialist ideals. During the struggle for independence, MPLA's ideology was shaped by Marxist-Leninist principles, and socialism became the primary goal of Angola's liberation. MPLA received support from the Soviet Union and other Eastern Bloc countries, and with this support, it adopted a socialist state model. With the declaration of Angola's independence in 1975, MPLA seized power and began taking steps to structure the country as a socialist state. MPLA embraced a one-party rule and sought to regulate the country's political, economic, and social life according to socialist principles. However, MPLA's socialist policies and one-party rule led to instability and discontent in the country, leading to increased opposition. Particularly, other political groups such as UNITA opposed MPLA's rule and initiated a separatist rebellion in the eastern part of the country. The development of socialism in Angola faced challenges by the late 1990s, including the collapse of the Soviet Union and international economic pressures. During this period, the MPLA government was forced to transition to a multi-party system, implement economic liberalisation, and market reforms. In conclusion, the emergence and development of socialism in Angola are deeply connected to the country's struggle for independence, MPLA's rise to power, and subsequent political transformations. Socialism played a significant role in shaping Angola's political and economic structure for many years and had a profound impact on the country's modern history (Camba, 2018).

The emergence of socialism in Ethiopia began with the overthrow of Haile Selassie in 1974 and the establishment of the military government known as the Derg. The Derg emerged as a response to social inequalities and economic exploitation. Upon coming to power, the Derg implemented radical policies such as land reform and the nationalisation of the economy. However, during this period, tensions among ethnic groups in Ethiopia escalated, and separatist movements gained strength. Particularly, demands for independence rose in the regions of Eritrea and Tigre. This clashed with the state's centralising policies. The Soviet Union provided military and economic support to the Derg regime, making Ethiopia a Soviet ally. However, with the collapse of the Soviet Union in the late 1980s, this support waned, leading to economic hardships in Ethiopia. In 1991, the Derg regime was overthrown, and the Ethiopian People's Revolutionary Democratic Front (EPRDF), a coalition government, took its place. The new government abandoned old Marxist ideals, transitioning to a market economy and initiating democratic reforms. However, the country still grapples with ethnic tensions and political instability. Issues like ethnic conflicts between different regions of Ethiopia and Eritrea's quest for independence persist (Clapham, 1992, pp. 108-116).

The roots of socialism in Benin can be traced back to the period following its independence from France in 1960. Like many newly independent African nations, Benin sought to establish a distinct national identity and pursue economic development that prioritised social welfare. Leaders such as President Hubert Maga and Prime Minister Sourou-Migan Apithy initially embraced a mix of socialist and nationalist principles, advocating for state-led economic planning and social justice. However, the early attempts at socialist policies were short-lived, as political instability and power struggles characterised much of Benin's post-independence era. In 1972, General Mathieu Kérékou seized power in a military coup, marking a

significant turning point in the country's trajectory. Kérékou, influenced by Marxist ideology, embarked on a radical transformation of Benin's political and economic landscape. The Kérékou regime declared Benin a Marxist-Leninist state and instituted far-reaching reforms aimed at centralising state control over the economy. Key sectors such as agriculture, industry, and finance were nationalised, and the government promoted collectivisation and cooperatives as part of its socialist agenda. Social services such as education and healthcare were expanded, and efforts were made to redistribute wealth and reduce inequality. However, despite these ambitious goals, the socialist experiment in Benin faced numerous challenges and contradictions. Economic mismanagement, corruption, and inefficiency plagued the state-controlled economy, leading to stagnation and decline. Moreover, the authoritarian nature of the regime stifled political dissent and undermined democratic institutions, contradicting the socialist principles of equality and participatory governance. By the late 1980s, mounting internal discontent and external pressure from international donors forced the Kérékou government to reconsider its socialist policies. Economic crisis, coupled with growing demands for political reform and democratisation, culminated in widespread protests and strikes in 1989 and 1990, leading to the collapse of the Marxist regime. The transition to democracy in Benin marked the end of the socialist experiment and ushered in a new era of political pluralism and economic liberalisation. The legacy of socialism, however, continues to shape Benin's political and social landscape, as the country grapples with issues of poverty, inequality, and governance (Allen, 1992, pp. 65-70).

The emergence of socialism in Zimbabwe began in the 1980s when the country gained independence, with socialist ideals and social equality emphasised during the struggle for independence. During this period, freedom fighters advocated for a socialist vision that embraced broad segments of society. However, after independence was achieved, the establishment and implementation of a truly socialist state faced practical challenges. In the post-independence period, the development of socialism in Zimbabwe progressed gradually. The new government implemented various policies to ensure social justice and reduce economic inequalities. Steps such as land redistribution and expanding access to education and healthcare were taken. However, these policies drew criticism from international capital and strained the country's economic balance. The decline of socialism in Zimbabwe can be attributed to pressure from international capital and internal political instability. The reaction of international capital hindered the country's economic growth and development. Additionally, internal political disputes and governance uncertainties prevented the effective implementation of socialist policies. In conclusion, the collapse of socialism in Zimbabwe had a profound impact on the country's economic and political future. This process shaped Zimbabwe's domestic policies and foreign relations and influenced the country's social and economic structure (Meisenhelder, 1994, pp. 83-87).

Madagascar's transition away from socialism marked a significant turning point in the country's political and economic history. The collapse of socialism was driven by both internal and external factors, primarily economic failures and political repression. Challenges in implementing socialist policies, economic imbalances, and a growing external debt burden weakened the economy and lowered living standards. Additionally, authoritarian rule and repressive methods used by socialist leaders to suppress dissent exacerbated public dissatisfaction and political instability. External influences, particularly the end of the Cold War and increasing Western influence, also contributed to the decline in support for socialism. International community demands and financial institutions further shaped domestic policies, leading to the downfall of the socialist regime. Consequently, Madagascar initiated democratisation and economic reforms, focusing on democratic governance and market economy principles (Gow, 1997, pp. 409-411).

Furthermore, political repression and authoritarian rule played a role in the downfall of socialism. Socialist leaders resorted to oppressive methods to suppress opposition and maintain power, leading to increased discontent among the population and deepening political instability. External factors also contributed to the collapse of socialism. With the end of the Cold War, many countries like Madagascar fell under the influence of the West, leading to a decline in support for socialism. Demands from the

international community and financial institutions influenced the country's internal policies and contributed to the collapse of the socialist regime. In conclusion, the collapse of socialism in Madagascar marks a significant milestone in the country's political and economic history. This period paved the way for democratic reforms and economic restructuring. Today, Madagascar continues its journey towards democratic governance and market economy reforms (Gow, 2011, pp. 439-439).

Evaluating the connection between social history and history from below in a postcolonial context is one of the topics that will develop critical theory. Critical theory must decolonise and bring into question what is below. The traditional understanding of history includes a racialization project unlike the understanding of history from below. This project is based on the ignorance of the peoples of Asia, Latin America, and Africa. The peoples of these three continents are dehumanised by traditional Western philosophy. The colonial narrative also leads a knowledge production process. The oppressed peoples are left unaware of their own roots and are thus condemned to the knowledge of the coloniser. To get rid of this racialization project, the colonial logic of traditional history must be liquidated by the method of decolonisation. In the process of this decolonisation method, historical narrative from below and examining the social history of peoples have a prominent place.

Countries like Tanzania, Mozambique, Angola, Ethiopia, Benin, Zimbabwe, and Madagascar have experienced socialism at separate times, resulting in various outcomes. Tanzania and Mozambique attempted to embrace socialist ideals and implement them. However, they faced challenges in economic development and political stability during their socialist periods. External interventions and internal authoritarian regimes contributed to the failure of socialism in these countries. In contrast, Angola and Ethiopia saw socialism implemented in a more authoritarian and militaristic manner. Their socialist experiences ended in prolonged internal conflicts and economic collapse, showcasing the consequences of using warfare and repression to enforce socialist ideals.

While Benin, Zimbabwe, and Madagascar achieved some successes in economic development and social justice during their socialist periods, they eventually succumbed to political instability and economic downturns. The failure of socialism in these countries can be attributed to internal political repression, external interventions, and shortcomings in economic governance. Overall, the experiences of Tanzania, Mozambique, Angola, Ethiopia, Benin, Zimbabwe, and Madagascar offer important lessons for the feasibility and effectiveness of socialism. These experiences underscore the need for socialist ideals to be grounded in a strong political and economic foundation to succeed in real-world conditions.

African countries like Tanzania, Mozambique, Angola, Ethiopia, Benin, Zimbabwe, and Madagascar embraced socialist ideals in the post-independence era, each charting its own unique socialist path. However, most of these socialist experiments faced external pressures, internal conflicts, and economic challenges, resulting in failure or the inability to achieve desired outcomes. When viewed in the context of "history from below," African socialism reflects the demands and struggles of the lower strata of society and workers. However, the influence of political leaders and elite groups made it difficult for these demands to be fully realised or implemented.

In Tanzania, Julius Nyerere's Ujamaa policy encouraged societal solidarity and development. Yet, challenges in implementation and economic failures limited its impact and drew criticism. Mozambique and Angola adopted socialism as part of their independence struggles. However, internal conflicts and external interventions prevented these countries from realising their socialist goals. In Benin and Zimbabwe, socialist policies reflected the society's aspirations for equality and development. However, economic hardships and political instability constrained these countries' socialist experiences. In Madagascar, Didier Ratsiraka's regime became a symbol of socialism's failure and economic collapse, leading to widespread discontent and resistance among the lower strata and ordinary people.

In conclusion, when examined within the framework of "history from below," African socialism underscores the significance of demands and struggles from the grassroots, but external influences and internal conflicts have hindered the realisation of socialist ideals.

Conclusion

History from below and social history aim to use the narratives of the below as historical methods, which opposes the traditional understanding of history. In this way, there is a possibility of resistance against the colonial historical fiction. These narratives of the social history are intertwined with the cultural. The geographical historical materialist method provides a valuable tool in this context, making it easier for the researcher to turn his/her gaze to subaltern geographies.

An overview of the historical context and the concept of African socialism provides valuable insights into the evolution and outcomes of socialist experiments in Africa. Throughout history, African nations have grappled with the challenges of post-colonialism, economic dependency, and political instability. The concept of African socialism emerged as a response to these challenges, aiming to address socio-economic inequalities and promote national development. However, the implementation of socialist policies varied across different countries, influenced by factors such as colonial legacies, internal power struggles, and external pressures from global superpowers.

In the context of "history from below," the experiences of African nations highlight the importance of grassroots movements and popular mobilisation in shaping political change. The struggles of ordinary people against oppressive regimes and socio-economic injustices have played a crucial role in shaping the course of history. From anti-colonial movements to labour strikes and civil unrest, bottom-up movements have been instrumental in challenging entrenched power structures and advocating for social justice.

When examining the intersection of "history from below" and African socialism, it becomes evident that the success or failure of socialist experiments in Africa cannot be attributed solely to ideological principles or top-down policies. Instead, a nuanced understanding of historical dynamics, including the agency of ordinary citizens and the complexities of local contexts, is essential. Moreover, the legacy of African socialism underscores the need for inclusive governance, grassroots empowerment, and sustainable development strategies that prioritise the well-being of all citizens.

In conclusion, the historical trajectory of African socialism reflects a complex interplay of socio-political forces, economic imperatives, and ideological aspirations. By contextualising socialist experiments within the broader framework of "history from below," African socio-political dynamics, and employing a comparative historical analysis methodology, we gain deeper insights into the challenges and opportunities facing the continent. The quest for social justice and inclusive development remains central to Africa's ongoing journey towards a more equitable and prosperous future.

REFERENCES

- Akyeampong, E. (2018). African socialism; or the search for an indigenous model. *Economic History of Developing Regions*, 33(1), pp. 69-87.
- Alatas, S. F. (2006). *Alternative Discourses in Asian Social Science Responses to Eurocentrism*. Sage.
- Allen, C. (1992) 'Goodbye to all that': The short and sad story of socialism in Benin, *Journal of Communist Studies*, 8(2), pp. 63-81.
- Alofun, G. O. O. (2014). African socialism: A critique. *IOSR Journal of Humanities and Social Science (IOSR-JHSS)*, 19 (8).
- Asante, M. K. (2000). Afrocentricity, race, and reason. Manning Marable (Ed.), *In Dispatches from the ebony tower: Intellectuals confront the African American experience* (pp. 195-203).
- Bhambra, G. K. (2007). *Rethinking Modernity Postcolonialism and the Sociological Imagination*. Palgrave Macmillan.
- Boesl, H. (2023). The concept of Ujamaa and its impact on postcolonial Tanzania. *Voices from Tanzania*, 4, 1-10.
- Camba, T. (2018). *The History of Politics in Angola: from Nationalism to the Totalitarian Single-party System*. Redalyc. <https://www.redalyc.org/journal/5863/586364252007/html/> Accessed: 13.05.24.
- Clapham, C. (1992). The socialist experience in Ethiopia and its demise. *The Journal of Communist Studies and Transition Politics*, 8(2), pp. 105-125, <https://doi.org/10.1080/13523279208415149>
- Cronin, S. (2008). Introduction. (Ed. Stephanie Cronin) *Subalterns and Social Protest History from Below in the Middle East and North Africa*. Routledge.
- Çetinkaya, Y. D. (2014). 1908 Osmanlı Boykotu Bir Toplumsal Hareketin Analizi. İletişim Yayınları.
- de Oliveira, J. C. M. & Courrier, C. (2022). *Ancient History from Below: An Introduction*. (Ed. Cyril Courrier & Julio Cesar Magalhães de Oliveira) *Ancient History from Below Subaltern Experiences and Actions in Context*. Routledge.
- Fick, C. E. (2004). *The Making of Haiti the Saint Domingue Revolution from Below*. The University of Tennessee Press.
- Gow, B. A. (1997). Admiral Didier Ratsiraka and the Malagasy socialist revolution. *The Journal of Modern African Studies*, 35(3), pp. 409-439, <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022278X97002486>
- Harman, C. (2013). *Halkların Dünya Tarihi*. 3rd Press. (U. Kocabaşoğlu, Trans) Yordam.
- Kanoute, P. (1964). African Socialism. *Transition*, (13), 49-51, <https://doi.org/10.2307/2934431>
- Keskin, İ., Abdalla, M. J., (2019), The Sociological Analysis of The Failure of Ujamaa Policy, *ARHUSS*, 2(3): pp. 297-313.
- Magraw, R. (2002). *France, 1800–1914 A Social History*. Longman.
- Mahoney, J. & Rueschemeyer, D. (2003). *Comparative Historical Analysis: Achievements and Agendas*. (Ed. James Mahoney & Dietrich Rueschemeyer) *Comparative Historical Analysis in the Social Sciences*. Cambridge University Press.
- Mboya, T. (1963). African Socialism. *Transition*, (8), pp. 17-19, <https://doi.org/10.2307/2934729>
- Meisenhelder, T. (1994). The Decline of Socialism in Zimbabwe. *Social Justice*, 21 (58), pp. 83-101.
- Miike, Y. (2010). Culture as Text and Culture as Theory: Asiaticity and Its Raison D'être in Intercultural Communication Research. (Eds Nakayama, T. K., & Halualani, R. T.) *In The handbook of critical intercultural communication*. Malden, MA: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Mohan, J. (1966). Varieties of African Socialism. *Socialist Register*, 3, pp. 220-266.
- Nyerere, J. K. (1987). Ujamaa: The Basis of African Socialism. *The Journal of Pan African Studies*, 1(1), pp. 4-11.
- O'Meara, D. (1991). The Collapse of Mozambican Socialism. *Transformation*, (14).

- Ottaway, M. (1978). Soviet Marxism and African Socialism. *The Journal of Modern African Studies*, 16(3), pp. 477-485, <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022278X00002536>
- Robinson, D. (2003). Socialism in Mozambique?: The 'Mozambican Revolution' in Critical Perspective. *Limina: A Journal of Historical and Cultural Studies*, 9, 131-151.
- Sharpe, J. (2001). *History from Below*. (Ed. Peter Burke) New Perspectives on Historical Writing. Polity Press.
- Shire, M. A. (2019). Afrika'da Sosyalist Rejimlerin Doğuşu: Somali Örneği 1969-79. [Unpublished Master Thesis]. Ankara University.
- Uslu, A. (2017). *Siyasal Düşünceler Tarihine Giriş Tarih Yazımı, Temel Yaklaşımlar ve Araştırma Yöntemleri*. Tarih Vakfı Yurt Yayınları.

LIFE IN THE HEART OF SOUTHWEST ETHIOPIA: PRELIMINARY REFLECTIONS ON THE PASTORAL LIFE OF THE HAMAR PEOPLE**GÜNEYBATI ETİYOPYA'NIN KALBİNDE YAŞAM: HAMAR HALKININ PASTORAL YAŞAMINA YÖNELİK ÖN DEĞERLENDİRMELER**

Yıl 4, Sayı 2, ss.14-28.

Year 4, Issue 2, pp.14-28.

Makale Türü: Araştırma Makalesi

Article Type: Research Article

Geliş Tarihi: 03.05.2024

Submitted: 03.05.2024

Kabul Tarihi: 20.07.2024

Accepted: 20.07.2024

DOI: 10.58851/africana.1477827

Atf Bilgisi / Reference Information

Tekeli, E. (2024). Life in the Heart of Southwest Ethiopia: Preliminary Reflections on the Pastoral Life of the Hamar People, *Africana Dergisi*, 4 (2), 14-28. <https://doi.org/10.58851/africana.1477827>

Evrım TEKELİ

Dr.Oğr. Üyesi, Mustafa Kemal Üniversitesi, tevrım@gmail.com,
ORCID: 0000-0002-4546-8921

Abstract

Ethiopia is a country with a rich cultural history spanning thousands of years, where diverse ethnic groups coexist. This study focuses on one example of this diversity, the rural Hamar people in the Lower Omo Valley, which is internationally recognised for its unique cultural practices and ecological richness. The Hamar community is among the diverse ethnic groups in the Southern Omo Region and embodies a pastoral lifestyle closely linked to agro-pastoralism, in which cattle play a central role both culturally and economically. This lifestyle is particularly notable in the region due to its specific cultural practices and economic reliance on cattle. This study presents an in-depth examination of the pastoral lifestyle and traditional practices of the Hamar people in the Lower Omo Valley in southwestern Ethiopia. The aim is to understand the cultural, economic and environmental dynamics underlying the lifestyle of the Hamar and to explore the unique socio-economic structure and ecological adaptation of these villages. The study is also intended to contribute to the sustainability of pastoralism and to the preservation of cultural diversity at both a regional and global level. The use of observer and participant observation techniques also constitutes a preliminary study of the biological aspects of dietary habits, which I intend to examine in depth through the daily practices of the society and to carry out in the field of physical anthropology in the future. Through this research, the paper contributes to the wider discourse on the preservation of Ethiopian culture, highlighting the need to protect the rich heritage of the Hamar community amidst evolving external influences.

Keywords: Agro-pastoralism, cultural preservation, Ethiopia, Hamar, traditional practices.

Öz

Etiyopya, binlerce yıllık zengin bir kültürel tarihe sahip olan ve çeşitli etnik grupların bir arada yaşadığı bir ülkedir. Bu çalışma, bu çeşitliliğin bir örneği olan ve özellikle eşsiz kültürel uygulamaları ve ekolojik zenginliği ile uluslararası alanda tanınan Aşağı Omo Vadisi'ndeki kırsal Hamar topluluğuna odaklanmaktadır. Hamar topluluğu, Güney Omo Bölgesi'nde yer alan çeşitli etnik gruplar arasında yer almakta olup, sığırların hem kültürel hem de ekonomik açıdan merkezi bir rol oynadığı tarımsal pastoralizmle yakından bağlantılı pastoral bir yaşam tarzını benzersiz bir şekilde somutlaştırmaktadır. Bu çalışma, Etiyopya'nın güneybatısındaki Aşağı Omo Vadisi'ndeki Hamar topluluğunun pastoral yaşam tarzı ve geleneksel uygulamalarının derinlemesine bir incelemesini sunmaktadır. Yapılan çalışmada Hamar topluluğunun yaşam tarzını belirleyen kültürel, ekonomik ve çevresel dinamikleri ve bu topluluğun benzersiz sosyo-ekonomik yapısı ve ekolojik uyumu incelenmiştir. Bu çalışma, bölgesel ve küresel düzeyde pastoralizmin sürdürülebilirliği ve kültürel çeşitliliğin korunması konularına katkıda bulunmayı amaçlamaktadır. Saha ve katılımcı gözlem tekniklerinin bir kombinasyonu ile yürütülen araştırma, Hamar topluluğunun geleneksel yaşam biçimlerini sürdürürken karşılaştıkları günlük faaliyetleri, kültürel uygulamaları ve zorlukları incelenmiştir. Gözlemci ve katılımcı gözlem tekniklerinin kullanılması, toplumun günlük

pratiklerini derinlemesine incelemeyi ve ileride fiziki antropoloji alanında gerçekleştirmeyi düşündüğüm beslenme alışkanlıklarının biyolojik yönden ele alınacağı araştırmanın ön çalışmasını da oluşturmaktadır. Bu araştırma sayesinde makale, Etiyopya'daki yerli kültürlerin korunmasına ilişkin daha geniş bir söyleme katkida bulunmakta ve gelişen dış etkilerin ortasında Hamar toplumunun zengin mirasını koruma ihtiyacını vurgulamaktadır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Agro-pastoralizm, kültürel koruma, Etiyopya, Hamar, geleneksel uygulamalar.

STRUCTURED ABSTRACT

Ethiopia, situated in the Horn of Africa, boasts a rich cultural heritage and a history dating back millions of years. This country is considered a cradle of civilisations with a history spanning thousands of years and is therefore known as the "Land of Origins" (Unesco, 2024). Ethiopia's prehistoric past has been home to important discoveries that shed light on ancient human history. In particular, the three-million-year-old skeleton of *Australopithecus afarensis*, also known as 'Lucy' or 'Dinqinesh', found in 1974 in the Afar desert in eastern Ethiopia, (Johanson & Edey, 1981) has provided valuable clues to human history. However, Ethiopia's history of civilisation is not limited to the prehistoric periods. The country has been home to many civilisations since ancient times. For example, the Tigray region in the north of the country is known for Lalibela, an important Christian Ethiopian Orthodox church centre. Also, the city of Axum is known as the centre of the Kingdom of Aksum, one of Ethiopia's ancient kingdoms, and many historical monuments and artefacts are found here. The rich history and cultural heritage of Ethiopia has aroused interest and admiration throughout the world (Levine, 2004). The country is of great importance in terms of religious and cultural heritage, as well as important discoveries in human history (Stringer, 2003). Therefore, Ethiopia has been a destination point for many researchers, scientists and enthusiasts of the origins of civilisation.

The South Omo Zone, part of Ethiopia's Southern Nations, Nationalities, and Peoples' Region (SNNPR), is home to diverse ethnic groups, each with unique languages and customs. South Omo Region is a region of pastoral local communities recognised for their traditional way of life based on agriculture and animal husbandry. These communities traditionally practise a combination of agriculture and animal husbandry called agro-pastoralism (Tegegne et al., 2013). Animals are not only of economic value to these communities; they also have a deep cultural significance. For example, cattle are considered a symbol of wealth, prestige and social status and play a central role in various ceremonies. However, these communities show resilience to cope with these challenges, relying on traditional knowledge from the past and seasonal migration patterns. In response to periods of drought, they engage in seasonal migrations to locate more productive grazing areas, thereby safeguarding and sustaining their livestock (Mekuriaw & Harris-Coble, 2021).

The Hamar, an important ethnic group in the South Omo region, maintain rich cultural practices such as coffee ceremonies, beekeeping, and animal husbandry. These traditional practices form the social and cultural fabric of the Hamar community. Specifically, coffee ceremonies play a crucial role in the social interactions and communal cohesion of the Hamar people. Coffee is seen not only as a beverage, but also as a means of hospitality and strengthening social bonds. Beekeeping also occupies an important place in Hamar culture. Traditional beehives are hung on trees and honey has been produced by local people for years. Honey is used for both dietary and commercial purposes and plays an important role in the economic and cultural life of the Hamar community.

Marriage customs also form part of the Hamar cultural identity. Marriage is often marked by the exchange of animals and reflects the importance the village places on wealth and social status. This custom forms the basis of the community's economic and social relations and strengthens the bonds between members of the group. In this context, marriage is seen not only as a union between two individuals, but also as a union between two families and even two local societies.

Other notable cultural markers that contribute to the unique identity of the Hamar people include the iron necklaces worn by women, the red oxide ornaments and the borkoto worn by men. These markers

reflect the Hamar's traditional style of dress and adornment and are considered part of their identity. The iron necklaces, in particular, are a symbolic expression of women's marital status and reflect social relations and status within the settlement.

Unfortunately, today the growth of tourism and modern influences are major challenges to the preservation of traditional ways of life. Tourist visits and external influences can affect and change the traditional practices of the community. Efforts should be made to preserve the traditional way of life and to maintain the cultural heritage of the group, but these efforts can be challenged by the impact of the modern world. Therefore, this ethnic group strives to balance traditional and modern elements and struggles to maintain its cultural identity. Pastoralist communities in the South Omo Region, therefore, not only survive despite environmental challenges, but also maintain their own cultural identity and traditions. This resilience enables these communities to sustain and pass on their valuable heritage to future generations. This is critical for the cultural diversity and sustainable development of the region and Ethiopia.

Introduction

Ethiopia is located in the Horn of Africa, situated in the northeastern part of the continent of Africa. It is bordered by Eritrea to the north, Djibouti and Somalia to the east, Kenya to the south, South Sudan to the west, and Sudan to the northwest. The discovery of the three-million-year-old skeleton of *Australopithecus afarensis*, famously known as 'Lucy or Dinqinesh' found in the Afar desert of eastern Ethiopia in 1974 provides valuable insights into our early human ancestors. Recent findings at Aramis extend the recorded history of Ethiopia to 4.4 million years ago, although *A. afarensis* had previously been dated to between 3 and 3.6 million years ago (Johanson & Edey, 1981). Ethiopia held a special place in the beliefs of the ancient Greeks. According to Homer, the ancient gods would often travel to Ethiopia, located in the Horn of Africa, to enjoy the hospitality of a people renowned for their grace and virtue. The human population in Ethiopia is richly varied. In addition to major communities such as the Amhara in the central region, the Tigray people in the north, and the Oromo in the south and central regions, Ethiopia is home to numerous smaller ethnic groups, each with distinctive languages and customs (Munro-Hay, 2019). The South Omo Zone located in the Southern Nations, Nationalities and Peoples Region (SNNPR) is Ethiopia's one of the nine administrative regions. It is home to 45 ethnic groups, each with their own unique language and culture. The pastoral region of the South Omo Zone is one of the most remote and sparsely populated areas in Ethiopia (Michael et al., 2005).

The Lower Omo Valley in southwestern Ethiopia is known for its distinctive cultural practices, livestock-range management, and ecological landscape. This UNESCO World Heritage Site is home to agricultural, pastoralist, and agro-pastoralist communities from Ethiopia's diverse and traditional ethnic groups. The South Omo Zone is renowned for its diverse indigenous communities, encompassing the Mursi, Nyangatom, Banna, Tsemay, Bodi, Arbore, Dassenech (also known as Dassanach), Nyangatom, Hamar, and Karo. These communities serve as an invaluable repository of traditional knowledge and practices, offering a unique insight into the continent's rich cultural tapestry. Clack and Brittain's (2018) comprehensive documentation of these groups is a testament to this rich heritage. It represents a normative condition where diverse groups consistently express and uphold their distinct identities, rather than just arriving and interacting. The Southern Omo region in southern Ethiopia covers an area of 23,535 square kilometers and encapsulates a unique cultural dynamic (Gebeyehu and Abbink, 2022). The communities in the South Omo Zone have a traditional lifestyle that revolves around agro-pastoralism, where agriculture and animal husbandry are intertwined. Cattle, in particular, hold significant cultural and economic value, symbolizing wealth and playing a central role in various ceremonies and rites of passage (Kusse et al., 2022). The South Omo Zone has one of the highest cattle densities per 1000 inhabitants in the country, according to Whyte (1979). These groups are more closely related to pastoralist cultures than agricultural cultures. For many ethnic communities, cattle represent a symbol of prestige, affluence, and sustenance, and are intricately connected to their cultural identity, as noted by Gebeyehu and Abbink (2022). Animal husbandry and agro-pastoralists face numerous challenges due to their reliance on critical resources such as land, water, forests, wildlife, livestock, and pasture. This is especially true during prolonged drought

and low rainfall, which can lead to scarcity of resources and dried-out grazing areas. The well-being of animals is at risk in such situations, as vegetation fades away and pastoralists are left with diminished resources to sustain their herds.

The southwestern region of Ethiopia is home to a diverse range of cultures, each with their own unique practices. These cultural expressions are often showcased through intricate body adornments, unique hairstyles, and colourful attire. Rituals and ceremonies play an important role in their lives, marking important milestones such as initiation into adulthood, marriage and seasonal festivals. Over the past thirty years, the Hamar's traditional way of life has changed rapidly. Tourist interest in the local markets set up on certain days in the towns of Dimeka and Turmi has begun to affect the traditional practices of the people. Anthropologists Jean Lydall and Ivo Strecker's extensive studies and documentaries on Hamar in the 1970s and beyond have been invaluable resources (see Lydall & Strecker, 1979a, 1979b; Strecker & Berinas, 2013; Lydall, 2000a, 2000b). Tourist visits have had a significant impact on the Lower Omo communities, particularly on the local communities residing in the Omo Valley. Lydall asserts that the Hamar people are among the most prominent tourist groups in the region, with a significant presence in the tourism sector and a reputation as a popular tourist destination. (Lydall, 2000b). This has resulted in a series of social, cultural, and material changes that have altered their traditional lifestyles. The introduction of new dynamics by these visitors has intervened in the traditional norms and habits of local communities, bringing about a transformation in their way of life.

South Omo region is one of the arid and semi-arid regions in Ethiopia. Irregular and low rainfall causes severe water scarcity for livestock. Pastoralists and agro-pastoralists therefore need to travel long distances to find water sources (Adicha and Mada, 2020). The Hamar are deeply rooted in pastoral and agro-pastoral traditions, relying mainly on livestock for their livelihood. Their lifestyle centers around the practice of herding livestock, which entails seasonal movements to find suitable grazing pastures (Tefera, 2013). A Pastoral Development Office (PDO) survey conducted in 2005 revealed that 35% of the Hamar people were engaged in agro-pastoral activities, while the remaining 65% were predominantly pastoral. Pastoralism is not just an occupation for the Hamar; it is a way of life imbued with rich cultural practices and profound ecological knowledge. Their intimate connection with the land and their animals is evident in their seasonal migration patterns, where entire communities embark on arduous journeys to follow the natural rhythms of the environment (Figure 1). During the dry season, when resources become scarce in their home territories, the Hamar demonstrate remarkable resilience and adaptability by migrating to areas with abundant grass and water. This ensures the well-being of their livestock and, consequently, their own survival. Furthermore, the intricate social organisation of the Hamar is of the utmost importance in sustaining their pastoral lifestyle.

The lifestyles of traditional pastoral societies and the key elements of these livelihoods have long been of interest to anthropologists and researchers alike. This study addresses the following research question: 'What are the key elements and characteristics of the pastoral lifestyle of the Hamar in the Lower Omo Valley, southwest Ethiopia?' It examines traditional practices, economic activities, and social structures of the Hamar, with the aim of understanding the pastoral lifestyle of the Hamar and its role and importance within the community.

Definition of the study area and data collection techniques

The South Omo Zone is located in the southwestern region of the country and is home to sixteen distinct ethnic groups, each with unique cultures and livestock-range management practices (Worku and Lisanework, 2016). The study was conducted in the Hamar Woreda, which is located in the Southern Nations, Nationalities, and Peoples' Region (SNNPRS) and is home to one of the ethnic groups in the South Omo Zone. According to the 2007 census data, 83.9% of Ethiopia's population lived in rural areas (Central Statistical Agency Ethiopia, 2012). Hamar Woreda, where the study was conducted, covers an area of 5,6978 square kilometers and includes 24 k'ebeles. K'ebele is a local administrative division, similar in size to a sizable village (Szava, 2015). The Hamar are a pastoralist group. They herd cattle, goats and sheep

in the south-western region of Ethiopia (Courtright et al.,1993). “They speak an Omotic language”(Petrollino, 2022, 4). They are the predominant ethnic group in the pastoral regions of the zone (Courtright et al., 1993; Yitbarek, 2020) with an estimated total population of 56,359 according to demographic data from the Central Statistic Agency (CSA) of Ethiopia in 2007 (Bekele et al., 2019). They are known for their warm hospitality and vibrant cultural traditions, (Dessiye, 2012) much like other communities in the South Omo Zone, and move seasonally with their herds to find grazing areas and water for their animals. This forms their shared identity.

The field research was initiated between August-September 2022. Qualitative research method was used in this study and the data obtained are based on participant observation and observation techniques. The observed population consisted of 38 households and about 300 individuals. The research on the daily life of the rural community of Hamar used both field and participant observation techniques to collect data. Observation is a technique used in the social sciences to systematically describe events, behaviours and artefacts within a social setting. It is used to collect data about people, processes, and cultures, and is also regularly used by researchers in community settings to record human behaviour (Marshall & Rossman, 2014; Kawulich, 2005). Observations are a crucial tool for researchers to depict current conditions using the five senses. They create a textual snapshot of the subject under investigation and serve as the principal techniques employed by anthropologists during fieldwork (Erlandson, 1993; De Munck, 1998). Kawulich (2005) recommends overt observation as the preferred technique, where participants are fully aware that they are being observed for research purposes. The aim of this approach is to uncover the rich tapestry of the Hamar's cultural heritage and its impact on their daily lives. Various aspects of daily activities, cultural rituals, customs, routines and interactions were recorded through field observation. Participant observation, a technique that has been used for decades (Whyte,1979; Hames and Michael,2014), provided first-hand information about the perspectives, traditions, and experiences of members of the population. Observations of daily activities provide deep insights into communal traditions, rituals, socio-economic activities, and dietary habits. These observations have contributed to my understanding of the overall dynamics of society through people's lifestyles, cultural values, and daily habits. I gathered some information with the help of a language assistant who speaks Amharic, English, and Hamar while making observations. The Hamar people's hospitality and openness significantly enriched my research experience. They welcomed me into their homes and daily activities, allowing me to observe and participate in their cultural practices. This welcoming environment was essential for the depth and quality of my observations.



Map 1. Map of the South Omo Zone region located in southwestern Ethiopia, including the Hamar Woreda that is the focus of my article, as well as nearby towns in the region.



Figure 1: Hut in the village of Hamar

1.Social structure and gender roles in the Hamars

My observations indicate that the Hamar people are facing a number of challenges in Ethiopia. Their culture is often shaped by the accessible resources in a specific region, which can have a profound impact on geographic location and food consumption. Women perform a variety of essential tasks, including waking up early, preparing meals, caring for children, collecting firewood and water, grinding grain, milking, cleaning the house, and participating in agricultural work. Children between the ages of 8 and 10 are also responsible for carrying water as part of their household chores. According to their age, each child carries water containers of varying sizes on their backs and fetches water every other day. They also learn to grind from their mothers and take care of their brothers and sisters when their mothers are away at the market or field.

Following the morning buna ceremony, with the first light of dawn the Hamar men embarks on the task of herding their animals towards the expansive pasture areas. As the sun ascends, the Hamar men, each with their hands with the borkoto, set out on this daily journey. Borkoto is a traditional household item made from wood, used as both a pillow and a stool. Hamar men carry it with them to use when they need a bit of rest in the fields. The borkoto carried by Hamar men, who establish a deep connection with their surroundings, reflects not only a practical tool they use when they want to rest but also a cultural emblem embodying the heritage and responsibilities passed down through generations. As the sun set, I also witnessed the Hamar men returning to the village with their animals. This daily ritual not only sustains the community's livelihood, but also reinforces the cultural significance of the borkoto as an integral part of the Hamar men's identity and their harmonious coexistence with the land.

Beekeeping is a long-standing tradition in various regions of Ethiopia, where traditional beehives are suspended from trees. In this village, beekeeping is among the daily tasks carried out by men, forming a significant part of their societal roles. Men make traditional beehives that are hung on trees (Figure 2). The honey, which is regularly consumed in homes, is produced through a process that begins with selecting the finest wood, usually sourced from resilient trees that withstand the elements. The selected pieces are crafted into beehive structures, carefully designed to house and protect the precious honey-making inhabitants. What distinguishes this practice is the coating of the exteriors of the hives with a covering derived from animal feces. The resulting beehives provide shelter for the bees and exemplify the beauty of traditional

wisdom.

In this village, theft is non-existent, even in the beekeeping area where traditional beehives are hung on trees. According to local residents, there is an unwavering trust in each other, which is highlighted by the preservation of the security of personal belongings, including beehives. This demonstrates an extraordinary level of honesty and mutual respect within the community. For the Hamar people, beekeeping is an important activity that contributes to the subsistence economy of the Hamar society and is part of the men's roles in the social structure.



Figure 2: Beehive construction

2. The food culture and ritual practices of the Hamar people

Sorghum, also known as *Sorghum bicolor* (L.), is the world's fifth most important cereal crop, following maize, rice, wheat, and barley (Jaćimović et al., 2024). It holds a significant position as one of the most produced and consumed crops in Ethiopia (Strecker, 1976; Yali & Begna, 2022). Sorghum is at the heart of the Hamar's agro-pastoral diet and is cultivated mainly by the women of the village. Sorghum is the Hamar's main source of livelihood. It is cultivated by women and used to prepare various foods. After harvesting, it is ground into flour using grinding stones and skilfully transformed into a variety of delectable dishes. Sorghum has a higher protein content than corn, but a lower amount of digestible protein (Kaplan & Kızılsimşek, 2012).

Another way to prepare a main meal is by making a dish called 'muna.' This involves creating sausage-like rolls from ground wheat and boiling them in a gourd (Figure 3). The responsibility of making muna falls on adult women, as it requires precision in balancing the mixture of water and flour to prevent the rolls from disintegrating during cooking. This extensive and laborious task is performed by Hamar women and girls.



Figure 3: Traditional pastoralist living: a 'muna' dish

Due to the region's low annual rainfall and limited land for gardening based on family size, moringa is grown as a vegetable, while thorn is cultivated as a fruit in the fields. The moringa tree has the potential to play a significant role in addressing climate change and increasing the incomes of impoverished farmers in Africa (Gedefaw, 2015). Moringa (*Moringa oleifera*) is a plant that produces edible leaves and is cultivated in fields. It is undemanding in terms of care and water requirements. The leaves are collected for both household use and year-round market sales (Figure 4).

Maize is the primary source of daily nutrition in the villages. The main meals of the day revolve around dishes made from carbohydrate-containing cereals, such as wheat and maize. Maize, in various forms, makes up a significant portion of the food in every household. To prepare it, a small quantity of oil and salt is added to water that is brought to a boil, and then mixed to form a crumbly dough that is usually eaten with fingers. Porridge is one of the most consumed and cooked foods in the village. Maize flour is the main ingredient in the porridge, which is a staple food for all the ethnic groups, especially during the rainy season when there is an abundance of grass and water.

2. 1. Cultural practices, rituals and ceremonies

From my fieldwork, it is evident that the Hamar have a plethora of cultural practices, rituals, and ceremonies that shape their distinctive way of life. They celebrate and express their identity through a variety of customs that encompass daily life, significant events, and rites of passage. Among their daily rituals, coffee ceremonies hold a special place. The buna, a local beverage made from coffee beans, is carefully prepared in the early hours of the morning. When coffee is brewed at home outside of regular meal times, neighbours may be invited to share in this delightful moment. The coffee ceremony is also a symbol of hospitality. Brewed in large earthenware pots, the buna is served to everyone in the house. In Hamar, the coffee ceremony is not just a daily routine; it is a collective celebration that strengthens bonds through a shared love for this beloved beverage.

Parsi is a beloved beverage among the Hamar people in the South Omo Zone, and it holds a special place in their celebrations. It is a symbol of the rich cultural fabric woven into the daily life and ceremonies of the village. Parsi is made from grains such as sorghum, maize, or wheat, and it plays a delicious and symbolic role in Hamar traditions. While some households may choose to add alcohol to their Parsi, others prefer the natural sweetness of honey to personalize this beverage. 'Parsi' also consumed as food, as seen in the image figure 5. It is a highly esteemed drink that is often served during cultural events or rites of passage. It embodies the stories, traditions, and rituals passed down through generations, making it a

valuable and enduring symbol of Hamar cultural identity.



Figure 4: The Moringa plant



Figure 5: Preparation of 'parisi' also consumed as food

3. The family structure and marriage types of the Hamars

The Hamar household is polygamous. It is patriarchal and patrilocal. (Tefera, 2013, p.122). The Hamar have a varied system for getting married. It depends on the household. Divorce is not common in this society. Men can marry more than two women as long as they can afford the bride price. The female offsprings from these marriages serve as an indicator of the family's future wealth. Marriage practices, whether monogamous or polygamous, vary among Hamar households. A man is able to father children with any of his wives. The change in marriage customs in this community was a striking example. Young girls are often married off in exchange for cattle, commonly called dowry. Despite the age difference between brides and grooms in some marriages, they are usually married to their husbands in exchange for sheep, goats and cattle. In such cases, the groom may be expected to pay the bride price himself if he is financially able to do so. Nevertheless, they may request assistance from other members of the community if they lack the necessary resources.

The existence of this support system is contingent upon the high value placed on lineage and the perpetuation of the family name. In the event of the first wife experiencing fertility issues or only giving birth to female offsprings, a man may elect to enter into a second marriage with the objective of ensuring the continuity of the lineage. In some cultures, a man may choose to pursue a second marriage if he has attained sufficient wealth and is dissatisfied with the attitudes or work ethics of his children from his first marriage. This decision should not be based on subjective evaluations and should be clearly marked as a cultural practice. The responsibilities of children in contributing to the household and preserving traditions play a significant role in family dynamics in the Hamar culture.

3.1. Bride wealth

Animals are the bedrock of wealth within pastoral societies. It is a common misconception that herds of cattle, sheep and goats are merely possessions; in fact, they are living embodiments of wealth. Cattle are not merely objects of ownership; they serve a pivotal function in the formation of social identity within

pastoral societies, such as the Hamar. It occupies an important place in important rituals such as birth, death and marriage (Petrollino, 2022). The size of a family's livestock holdings often determines its social standing and economic stability. In this context, the exchange of animals holds profound cultural weight, such as in the bride price, where the transfer of livestock serves as a symbolic gesture representing the union of two families. In accordance with traditional practices observed among the Hamar people, distribution of cattle, sheep, and goats to the bride's family among the Hamar people is contingent upon the economic capacity of the groom's household. In instances where the groom's family encounters financial limitations, it is common practice to seek assistance from extended relatives to fulfill the customary bride wealth obligations. Disputes and transgressions too are often resolved through livestock exchanges or compensations. From rites of passage to communal celebrations, livestock are sacrificial offerings that bridge the earthly and spiritual realms.

According to the Hamar perspective, wealth is determined by the number of livestock owned by a man. This differs from the modern, centralized paper currency system in that the Hamar's purchasing power is based on tangible, living animals that they care for.

In recent years, however, the Hamar people have faced significant challenges. They report that poor rains have dried up water sources and depleted grazing land, leading to the deaths of livestock in large numbers. This has resulted in reduced livelihoods, food insecurity, and profound cultural and social losses for the people of this village, especially with the loss of their cattle, which represent not only an economic investment but also a crucial part of their social fabric.

3.2. Cultural practices related to the social status of women in marriage

During my fieldwork, I observed the significant cultural practices and symbolism associated with the iron necklaces worn by Hamar women. In a unique cultural twist, the number of iron necklaces a woman wears can reveal her marital status. Traditionally, the number and style of these necklaces convey meaningful information about a woman's marital status. In the traditional context, if a Hamar woman wears three iron necklaces, it signifies her position as the first wife in a marriage. Conversely, the presence of two iron rings indicates that she held the role of a second wife. The third iron ring, distinguished by a hook, served as a symbolic marker identifying her as a man's first wife. The wearing of iron rings was once deeply rooted in cultural customs, but it has now transitioned into a predominantly decorative aspect of Hamar women's attire. In recent years, iron rings have become popular as decorative accessories, moving away from their original function as indicators of marital status. Additionally, women wear beaded necklaces on their arms and necks. They soften animal hides and sew their traditional clothing, embellishing them with sea shells and various beads.

The tradition of colouring the hair of Hamar women with red ochre is an important part of the deep-rooted cultural heritage of their society. This tradition takes a special place in the lives of women and helps them to express their identity, cultural belonging and social status. The red ochre is acquired from the local market and is sprinkled onto their hair. Then, a blend of butter and water is applied to the hair. This creates a striking visual expression with cultural significance (Figure 6). Additionally, the mixture applied to the body serves as a natural shield, providing a protective layer against the effects of the sun. This practice also keeps flies at bay, ensuring comfort in the daily lives of the women. In the Hamar village, red clay painting holds a profound cultural significance, particularly as a rite of passage for young girls before embarking on the journey of marriage. Before getting married, young girls have their bodies and hair painted with red clay, which remains on their skin for approximately three months. The Hamar women's tradition of hair colouring is not only about personal care and beauty, but also expresses an important cultural symbolism for their whole. It is a significant ritual that has been passed down from generation to generation and has become part of their society's identity.



Figure 6: Hamar women are exhibiting the cultural practice of colouring their hair with a mixture of red ochre

Conclusion

Ethiopia is known as the 'Land of Origins' due to being a cradle of civilisation with a history that extends for thousands of years. The Ethiopian Woreda has a long-standing reputation for hospitality, a tradition that endures to this day. This is a testament to their rich cultural heritage. Similarly, the Hamar people believe that true prosperity lies not in material possessions such as cars, salaries, or houses, but in the natural treasures bestowed by their ancestral lands. Material possessions may come and go, but the enduring prosperity of Hamar land lies in the intrinsic connection between its people and the natural treasures that grace their lives.

This study, conducted through participant observation, contributes to our understanding of the intricate interplay among culture, environment, and human behavior. By documenting the lifestyle and cultural practices of the Hamar ethnic group, this research underscores the importance of preserving indigenous knowledge and fostering mutual respect amidst a rapidly changing world. These insights enhance our understanding of social evolution, emphasizing the need for cultural preservation and sustainable development strategies.

Reflecting on my experiences, observing the Hamar people was a particularly positive experience due to their hospitable and helpful nature. During my fieldwork as an anthropologist, I noticed that the Hamar people did not seem to attach much importance to race or ethnicity. They welcomed me and other anthropologists from different ethnic backgrounds with open arms and expressed considerable delight upon our return after an extended absence. This openness and warmth greatly enhanced my understanding of their culture and society. My observation of the daily life of the Hamar people in the Omo valley has deepened my understanding that cultural exchange and mutual respect are the foundation for fostering harmonious relationships. In the embrace of the Hamar, the significance of shared humanity is such that it transcends any distinctions, thereby reinforcing the idea that our common experiences and shared values serve to bridge cultural divides. The Hamar people's way of life is defined by their harmonious coexistence with nature. They have a deep respect for the land, their animals, and each other. The Hamar people have a resilient livelihood, forged through their age-old traditions and adaptive strategies. They continue to

thrive amidst the challenges of modernity and environmental change.

Despite my extensive reflection on the subject, it is evident from direct observation and engagement with the Hamar community that a substantial transformation is imminent. In the coming years, tourist visits to the Lower Omo will bring significant social, cultural and material changes to the traditional lifestyles of local communities in the Omo Valley. While the Hamar living in rural areas remain relatively isolated from these influences, villages closer to towns and cities are beginning to feel the impact of tourism. This evolving dynamic highlights the delicate balance between preserving cultural heritage and adapting to external influences. It is crucial to monitor these changes closely to understand their long-term impact on the cultural fabric and socio-economic structure of the Hamar community.

Acknowledgements

In particular, I would like to thank Maya for his invaluable help in assisting me with my observations. I would like to express my gratitude to the Hamar people for their hospitality during my research. Additionally, I appreciate the support provided by the South Omo Research Center. As a survivor of the earthquake that occurred on February 6, 2023, I would like to express my gratitude to Koç University ANAMED for providing me with the opportunity to write this article and pursue my academic studies.

REFERENCES

- Adicha, A. & Mada, M. (2020). Agro Pastoralist's Perception and Willingness to Participate in Water Harvesting Practices in South Omo Zone, Southern Ethiopia. *American Journal of Agriculture and Forestry*. Vol. 8, No. 5, pp. 223-234. doi: 10.11648/j.ajaf.20200805.16
- Bekele, D., Alamirew, T., Kebede, A. et al. (2019). Modeling Climate Change Impact on the Hydrology of Keleta Watershed in the Awash River Basin, Ethiopia. *Environmental Modeling & Assessment* (24): 95–107. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10666-018-9619>
- Central Statistical Agency [Ethiopia], & ICF International. (2012). *Ethiopia Demographic and Health Survey 2011*. Addis Ababa, Ethiopia and Calverton, MD USA: Central Statistical Agency.
- Clack, T. & Brittain, M. (2008). *The River: Peoples and Histories of the Omo-Turkana Area*. Archaeopress Publishing Ltd.
- Courtright, P., Klungsoyr, P., Lewallen, S. et al. (1993). The Epidemiology of Blindness and Visual Loss in Hamar Tribesmen of Ethiopia: The Role of Gender. *Tropical Geography and Medicine* 45(4) 168-170.
- De Munck, V. & Sobo, E. (1998). *Using Methods in the Field: A Practical Introduction and Casebook*. Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press.
- Dessiye, B. (2012). *The Impacts of Harmful Traditional Practices on Women's Socio-Economic and Political Activities: The Case of Pastoral Women in Hamer Woreda, South Omo Zone, SNNPRS*. Master's thesis, Indira Gandhi National Open University, India.
- Erlandson, D. A., Elizabeth, L.H., Bruce, L.S. et al. (1993). *Doing Naturalistic Inquiry: A Guide to Methods*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Gebeyehu, A. K. & Abbink, J. (2022). Land, Sugar, and Pastoralism in Ethiopia: Comparing the Impact of the Omo-Kuraz Sugar Projects on Local Livelihoods and Food Security in the Lower Omo Valley. *Pastoralism* 12 (1) 1-20. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s13570-022-00242-8>.
- Gedefaw, M. (2015). Environmental and Medicinal Value Analysis of Moringa (*Moringa oleifera*) Tree Species in Sanja, North Gondar, Ethiopia *AJCSR*-480 (2): 20-35.
- Girma, M. (2023). Production system of indigenous goat population reared in pastoral and agro-pastoral districts of SNNPR, Ethiopia. *Int. J. Agril. Res. Innov. Tech.* 13(1): 51-59. <https://doi.org/10.3329/ijarit.v13i1.68007>.
- Hames, R. & Michael, P. (2014). Direct and Indirect Behavior Observations. In: Bernard R and Gravlee C (eds) *The Handbook of Methods in Cultural Anthropology*. Rowland and Littlefield: Lanham, pp. 293-313.
- Jaćimović, S., Kiproviski, B., Sikora, V., et al. (2024). Diversity in nutritional and functional quality of sorghum restorer lines collection. *Journal of Food and Nutrition Research* (ISSN 1336-8672).
- Johanson, D. & Edey, M. (1981). *Lucy: The Beginnings of Humankind* Simon & Schuster.
- Kaplan, M. & Kızılsimşek, M. (2012). Farklı Tane Sorgum (*Sorghum bicolor* L.) Hat ve Çeşitlerinin Besleme Değerlerinin Belirlenmesi. *Erciyes Üniversitesi Fen Bilimleri Enstitüsü Fen Bilimleri Dergisi* 28, (1): 11-14.
- Kawulich, B.B. (2005). Participant Observation as a Data Collection Method *Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung/Forum*.

- Kusse, K., Alemayehu, Yidnekachew E, Gedion E et al. (2022). The Market Chain Analysis of Live Cattle in South Omo Zone, Southern Ethiopia. *International Journal of Agricultural Research, Innovation, and Technology* 12 (1): 56-66. <https://doi.org/10.3329/ijarit.v12i1.61032>.
- Levine, D. N. (2004). Reconfiguring the Ethiopian nation in a global era. *International Journal of Ethiopian Studies*, 1-15.
- Lydall, J., Strecker, I. A. (1979a). *The Hamar of Southern Ethiopia* (Vol. 12). Renner.
- Lydall, J., Strecker, I. (1979b) *Work Journal: The Hamar of Southern Ethiopia Vol. I. Hohenschäftflarn*: Renner.
- Lydall, J. (2000a). The Threat of the HIV/AIDS Epidemic in South Omo Zone, Southern Ethiopia. *Northeast African Studies*,7(1),41-61.
- Lydall, J. (2000b). Having fun with ideophones: a socio-linguistic look at ideophones in Hamar, Southern Ethiopia. In *Proceedings of the XIV International Conference of Ethiopian Studies* (pp. 886-91). Addis Ababa University.
- Marshall, C. & Rossman, G.B. (2014). *Designing qualitative research*. Sage publications.
- Mekuriaw, Z. & Harris-Coble, L. (2021). Ethiopia's livestock systems: Overview and areas of inquiry.
- Michael, Y.G, Hadgu, K. and Ambaye, Z. (2005). Addressing Pastoralist Conflict in Ethiopia: The Case of the Kuraz and Hamar Sub-districts of South Omo Zone. Report, Africa Peace Forum, Ethiopian Pastoralist Research and Development Association.
- Munro-Hay, S. (2019). *Ethiopia, The Unknown Land: A Cultural and Historical Guide*. I.B. Tauris.
- Niebling, M. (2017). Schooling in Hamar in the South Omo Zone. In: 3. Kölner Afrikawissenschaftlichen Nachwuchstagung (KANT III), Köln, Germany, 5-7 September.
- Pastoral Development Office (PDO) (2005). Report Paper. Hamer District Pastoral Development Office, Dimeka.
- Petrollino, S. (2022). The Hamar cattle model: the semantics of appearance in a pastoral linguaculture. *Language Science*, 89, 101448. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.langsci.2021.101448>
- Strecker Ivo, A. (1976). "Traditional Life and Prospects for Socio-Economic Development in the Hamar Administrative District of Southern Gamu Gofa." A Report to the Relief and Rehabilitation Commission of the Provisional Military Government of Ethiopia, Addis Ababa.
- Strecker, I. A. & Berinas, B. A. (2013). *The Hamar of Southern Ethiopia* (Vol. 12). LIT Verlag Münster.
- Stringer, C. (2003). Human evolution: Out of Ethiopia. *Nature*. 423(6941):692–3, 695.
- Szava, A. (2015). Explaining Child Malnutrition in Two Villages in South West Ethiopia: Local Views and Local Opportunities. PhD Thesis, Charles Darwin University, Australia.
- Tefera, S. (2013). From cattle herding to sedentary agriculture: the role of hamer women in transition. *African Study Monographs*, Suppl. 46: 121–133.
- Tegegne, A., Gebremedhin, B., Hoekstra, D., Belay, B., and Mekasha, Y. (2013). Smallholder dairy production and marketing systems in Ethiopia: IPMS experiences and opportunities for market-oriented development. Working Paper No. 31. ILRI: Addis, Ababa, Ethiopia.

- United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) (2024). Intergovernmental Committee for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage, Republic of Botswana. <https://ich.unesco.org>.
- Whyte, W.F. (1979). On Making the Most of Participant Observation *The American Sociologist*, February 14 (1): 56-66.
- Worku, B. & Lisanework, N. (2016). Pastoral Perceptions towards Livestock and Rangeland Management Practices in Kuraz District of South Omo Zone, South Western Ethiopia. *Journal of Natural Sciences Research* 6, (1): 1-10.
- Yali, W. & Begna, T. (2022). Sorghum breeding in Ethiopia: Progress, achievements and challenges. *Agricultural Science and Food Technology* 8(1): 045-051. DOI: 10.17352/2455-815X.000144.
- Yitbarek, Y. (2020). The 2015 conflict in Hamar district of South Omo Zone, southern Ethiopia. In: Susanne Epple/Getachew Assefa, *Legal Pluralism in Ethiopia*, 371-398. <https://doi.org/10.14361/9783839450215-017>.

HOW THE SOMALI MODERN GOVERNANCE WORKS WITH THE TRADITIONAL GOVERNANCE SYSTEM: LITERATURE REVIEW

SOMALİ MODERN YÖNETİMİNİN GELENEKSEL YÖNETİM SİSTEMİ İLE NASIL ÇALIŞTIĞI: LİTERATÜR TARAMASI

Yıl 4, Sayı 2, ss.29-53.

Year 4, Issue 2, pp.29-53.

Makale Türü: İnceleme Makalesi

Article Type: Review Article

Geliş Tarihi: 24.03.2024

Submitted: 24.03.2024

Kabul Tarihi: 17.07.2024

Accepted: 17.07.2024

DOI: 10.58851/africana.1457965

Atf Bilgisi / Reference Information

Warsame, A. (2024). How The Somali Government Works with the Traditional Clan-Based Systems: Literature Review, *Africana Dergisi*, 4 (2), 29-53. <https://doi.org/10.58851/africana.1457965>

Afifa WARSAME

Yüksek Lisans, TED University, caffo113@gmail.com,
ORCID: 0009-0004-4029-3714

Abstract

Somalia, located in the Horn of Africa, has a complex history influenced by tribalism, colonialism, and internal conflict. During the colonial era, European powers collaborated with clan leaders, resulting in Somalia's division along clan and tribal lines. This division led to the creation of artificial borders, which fragmented the land and fostered regional and clan-based identities. After gaining independence in 1960, Somalia initially aimed to establish a strong, centralized state. The Siad Barre regime, which came to power through a military coup in 1969, tried to suppress clan and regional identities in favor of a communist ideology. However, the regime's downfall in 1991 plunged Somalia into a prolonged period of violence and state collapse. Warlords and clan-based factions fought for power, leading to a protracted civil war. This paper analyzes the intricate relationship between Somalia's traditional and modern governance systems. It examines the potential for collaboration, the challenges faced in nation-building efforts, and the lasting impact of clan-based structures. The study begins by exploring traditional governance, highlighting the important role of customary law, elders, and religious clerics in consensus-building mechanisms and maintaining social harmony. It emphasizes the historical significance and contemporary relevance of these institutions. The paper then delves into the challenges involved in establishing a modern state in Somalia. It examines the obstacles that hinder the realization of democratic ideals and the establishment of a centralized administration. A key focus is evaluating the potential synergies and conflicts between traditional and modern systems.

Keywords: Somali Customary Law, Xeer, 4.5 Power Sharing, Somali Government, TNG, TFG.

Öz

Afrika Boynuzu'nda yer alan Somali'nin kabilecilik, sömürgecilik ve iç çatışmalardan etkilenen karmaşık bir tarihi vardır. Sömürge döneminde Avrupalı güçler, klan liderleriyle iş birliği yapmış ve bu durum Somali'nin klan ve kabile hatlarına göre bölünmesine yol açmıştır. Bu bölünme, toprağı parçalayan ve bölgesel ve klan temelli kimlikleri besleyen yapay sınırların oluşmasına yol açmıştır. Somali, 1960 yılında bağımsızlığını kazandıktan sonra başlangıçta güçlü, merkezi bir devlet kurmayı hedeflemiştir. 1969 yılında askeri darbeyle iktidara gelen Siad Barre rejimi, komünist ideoloji uğruna aşiret ve bölgesel kimlikleri bastırmaya çalışmıştır. Ancak rejimin 1991'deki devrilmesi, Somali'yi uzun bir şiddet dönemine ve devletin çöküşüne sürüklemiştir. Savaş ağaları ve klan temelli gruplar iktidar için savaşmış ve bu da uzun süren bir iç savaşa yol açmıştır. Bu makale, Somali'nin geleneksel ve modern yönetim sistemleri arasındaki karmaşık ilişkiyi analiz etmektedir. İş birliği potansiyelini, ulus inşa etme çabalarında karşılaşılan zorlukları ve klan temelli yapıların kalıcı etkisini inceliyor. Çalışma, geleneksel yönetimi keşfederek, geleneksel hukukun, yaşlıların ve din adamlarının fikir birliği oluşturma mekanizmalarında ve sosyal uyumu sürdürmedeki önemli rolünü vurgulayarak başlıyor. Bu kurumların tarihsel önemini ve çağdaş önemini vurgulamaktadır. Makale daha sonra Somali'de modern bir devlet kurmanın zorluklarına değiniyor. Demokratik ideallerin gerçekleşmesinin ve merkezi bir yönetimin kurulmasının önündeki engelleri inceliyor. Temel odak noktalarından biri, geleneksel ve modern sistemler arasındaki potansiyel sinerjileri ve çatışmaları değerlendirmektir.

Anahtar kelimeler: Somali Örf Hukuku, Xeer, 4.5 Yetki Paylaşımı, Somali Hükümeti, TNG, TFG.

STRUCTURED ABSTRACT

Somalia, located in the Horn of Africa, is bordered by Ethiopia on the west, Djibouti on the northwest, the Gulf of Aden on the north, the Indian Ocean on the east, and Kenya on the southwest. Before colonization, Somalia had a traditional governance system, which later evolved to include elements of modern governance. The traditional governance in Somalia was characterized by customary law and the authority of elders, which played a significant role in shaping social order in the country. Customary law, known as Her, consists of oral customs and practices that have been passed down through generations. It is one of the oldest legal systems in Somalia, alongside civil and Islamic law.

Elders are crucial in traditional governance, guiding communities and resolving disputes based on cultural and social norms. Their authority is deeply rooted in Somali society and dates back to pre-colonial times. During the colonial era, clan elders also served as indirect rulers, further cementing their historical significance.

The influence of customary law and elders in decision-making and conflict resolution has been instrumental in maintaining social cohesion and stability within Somali communities. They have played essential roles in upholding traditional values, resolving disputes, and preserving the cultural fabric of Somali society.

However, traditional governance structures, such as clan elders and Her councils, have often marginalized women, limiting their formal role in decision-making processes. Men primarily dominate decision-making in these structures, which extends to economic opportunities, human rights, and participation in broader societal affairs. Traditional practices, like forced marriages as part of Diya payments and restrictions on widows' rights, have further perpetuated gender inequalities and constrained women's agency within the governance framework.

Somalia's experience with colonialism has significantly impacted its history, governance structures, and societal dynamics. In the late 19th century, European colonial powers such as Britain, Italy, and France gained control over different regions of Somalia. These powers employed various governance strategies, including direct rule by France and indirect rule by Britain and Italy. These strategies have influenced the development of administrative systems and power structures in the region. Colonial rule in Somalia introduced foreign administrative structures and disrupted traditional governance systems. While some traditional leaders were able to retain power under colonial oversight through indirect rule, direct rule by France resulted in the establishment of new administrative frameworks that marginalized traditional authorities.

During the colonial era, European powers collaborated with clan leaders individually to exert control over the region. This approach caused Somali society to fragment along clan and tribal lines, leading to the creation of artificial borders that divided clan territories and encouraged regional and clan-based identities.

The arbitrary drawing of borders by colonial powers continues to have lasting effects on Somali society and politics. These borders did not align with traditional clan territories, which contributed to tensions and conflicts based on competing clan interests and historical grievances.

Somalia achieved independence in 1960, marking the end of colonial rule. Initially, the country aimed to become a centralized state under President Aden Abdullah Osman. However, deep-seated clan and regional rivalries hindered the unity and stability of the nation. The legacy of colonialism continued to influence the post-independence period, presenting challenges in unifying diverse clan and regional identities under a centralized state structure.

In the late 1960s, the Siad Barre regime took power through a military coup and attempted to suppress clan and regional identities in favor of a communist ideology. This led to internal conflicts and eventually triggered a civil war in the late 1980s. The civil war and the subsequent collapse of the central government in 1991 threw Somalia into a state of lawlessness and instability. This period was characterized by clan-based violence, humanitarian crises, and the rise of various factions vying for power. Since the early 2000s, Somalia has been engaged in state-building efforts with support from international partners and regional organizations, aiming to establish a stable and functional government that promotes peace, security, and governance in the country.

The modern governance system in Somalia has undergone significant changes since its establishment in 2012. The federal structure, adopted that year, divides power between the federal government and member states. This system aims to decentralize authority, promote regional autonomy, and address historical grievances among different regions and clans. The Somali provisional constitution, ratified in 2012, outlines the principles and structures of the modern governance system. It establishes a framework for the separation of powers among the legislative, executive, and judicial branches, ensuring accountability and a proper balance of power.

The modern governance system in Somalia prioritizes the protection and advancement of human rights, inclusive governance, and equal rights for all citizens. Efforts have been made to promote gender equality, minority rights, and political inclusivity to foster a more representative and participatory system. Increasing women's participation and representation in decision-making processes is also being worked on, but challenges remain in achieving gender equality, overcoming cultural barriers, and ensuring meaningful inclusion of women in governance structures.

The modern governance system in Somalia faces various challenges, including security threats, political instability, and clan dynamics that still play a significant role in decision-making and governance processes. To address the struggle for power between clans, the "4.5 formula" has been implemented as a power-sharing mechanism. This formula allocates parliamentary seats based on a clan-based ratio of 4.5. It aims to provide proportional representation for major clan groups (4) and smaller clans (0.5), ensuring that each clan has a voice in the political decision-making process. However, the 4.5 formula has faced criticism for reinforcing clan identification in politics and potentially hindering progress. Critics argue that it may lead to political stagnation, favor certain clans over others, and impede the development of a more merit-based and inclusive governance system.

This paper examines the governance dynamics in Somalia, focusing on the interplay between traditional and modern systems. It shows that traditional structures, like clan elders, still play a significant role in decision-making and conflict resolution alongside modern governance institutions. The paper emphasizes the enduring influence of traditional governance systems, particularly the clan-based system, in Somali society. Despite attempts to suppress them, these systems have remained resilient and continue to be important in local governance and decision-making. The study reveals a fundamental conflict between traditional and modern governance models in Somalia, which represent different mindsets and approaches. The coexistence of these systems poses challenges to social cohesion, especially in a rapidly changing and modernizing society. The findings suggest that religious clerics have less power in modern Somali administration, indicating a transformation in traditional power structures and the evolving role of religious authorities in governance.

INTRODUCTION

Somalia is a country in the Horn of Africa with a long and complicated history characterized by a blend of tribalism, colonialism, and civil conflicts. Somalia was made up of several city-states and

sultanates that were built on Islamic ideas and customary law until European settlers arrived in the 19th century. These coastal city-states and sultanates conducted business with the Arabian Peninsula, Persia, India, and China. As crossroads for commerce between the Red Sea and the Indian Ocean, the city-states of Mogadishu, Zeila, and Berbera were particularly significant.

The coastal position of Somalia makes it susceptible to outside influence. The Ottoman Empire started to establish itself in the area at the beginning of the 16th century, and the port city of Zeila developed into a significant Ottoman base. European nations started showing interest in Somalia in the 19th century and tried to establish colonial administration there.

Britain, Italy, and France established colonial power over various regions of Somalia in the late 19th century. The western region of Somalia was captured by Britain and became known as British Somaliland, while the southern region was occupied by Italy and became known as Italian Somaliland. Djibouti, a nearby area that subsequently became part of French Somaliland, was seized by France.

The colonial powers used various methods to manage Somalia, with France employing direct rule while Italy and Britain adopted an indirect rule strategy. Traditional leaders were permitted to preserve their power structures under indirect rule because colonial authorities interacted with them on their behalf. In contrast, during direct control, traditional leaders were ignored, and new administrative frameworks were set up by the colonial powers.

During the colonial era, when European powers depended on working with clan leaders separately to rule the area, Somalia began to break apart along clan and tribal lines. This caused artificial borders to be drawn, dividing clan and tribe lands, and it helped regional and clan-based identities to form.

Following its declaration of independence in 1960, Somalia initially seemed to be headed in the direction of becoming a powerful, centralized state. The new administration, headed by President Aden Abdullah Osman, aimed to unite the Somali people by fostering a sense of a common national identity and making investments in public utilities and infrastructure. Deep-seated clan and regional rivalries, which remained despite the establishment of a centralized government, however, hindered these attempts.

The Siad Barre regime aimed to stifle clan and regional identities in favor of a communist ideology after seizing power in the 1969s through a military coup. The administration of Barre tried many measures intended to foster national unity, such as outlawing clan-based structures and fostering a national tongue, but these initiatives eventually failed. Numerous armed groups, including clan-based militias and Islamist groupings, also opposed the government.

In 1991, the Barre administration fell, ushering in a period of continuous violence and state breakdown in Somalia. With warlords and clan-based factions competing for control, the country sank into a period of civil war. Extreme violence, such as clan warfare, warlordism, and the formation of Islamist extremist groups like Al-Shabaab, was prevalent during this time.

International attempts to restore Somalia and set up a functional central government have been concentrated there since then. A complicated interaction between conventional clan-based governing institutions and contemporary state-building aspirations has characterized these efforts. Although the ancient clan-based groups have come under fire for fostering conflict and impeding the development of a powerful, centralized state, they have also been praised for offering some stability and legitimacy in the absence of a functioning government.

This paper aims to explore the literature review on Somali governance. It aims to understand how

the Somali government can coexist with traditional governance. This topic has been well-represented in the literature. Nevertheless, most of the studies focused on modern governance, traditional governance, or peacebuilding in isolation. To this end, this literature review aims to synthesize the findings from relevant studies that have tried explicitly to explore how these systems could coexist and interact to aid state-building and peace processes in Somalia.

Abokor (2016) details the role of clan Elders in state and peace-building, showing the capacities traditional structures could offer in support of modern governance. Ahmed (2017) investigates how to handle relations between clans, state institutions, and external interventions; it features an explanation of the 4.5 power-sharing formula. This study offers insights into challenges and potential for integrating clan-based systems into formal governance. Ahmed (2014) gives an account of clan loyalties and traditional practices in state-building processes within Somalia. Ibrahim (2013) makes a case for clan-based governance in times of political transition. Menkhaus (2007) explained governance without a central government and the role that it played by informal and traditionalistic systems. Notably, this "governance without government" helps to elaborate the way such traditional systems can complement the formal state structures.

The literature is rich in documenting existing interactions between traditional and modern governance in Somalia. This paper attempts to find ways in which traditional and modern governance systems can collaborate by using existing literature. The paper first will look at Somali Traditional governance. It offers a thorough examination of the function of elders, religious clerics, and customary law in traditional government systems as well as the development of these systems over time. Secondly, it aims to explore Somali modern governance, and difficulties state-building attempts in Somalia, including the influence of outside players, as well as the historical background of state-building in the nation. Thirdly, this paper explores the interrelationship and potential conflicts between Somalia's traditional and contemporary governing systems. And finally, it examines the advantages and disadvantages of introducing conventional forms of government into current state-building initiatives. The goal of this paper is to provide readers with a thorough knowledge of the intricate dynamics of Somalia's conventional forms of government and state-building initiatives.

1. TRADITIONAL MODES OF GOVERNANCE IN SOMALIA

Traditional forms of government have existed in Somalia for a very long time and have undergone tremendous development throughout the years. They still play a big role in Somali society today. The most common traditional forms of government in Somalia have been customary law, elders, and religious clerics (Oluma/Wadaadaha).

Understanding the function of traditional forms of government in Somalia is essential for comprehending the political and social dynamics of the country. The literature on the influence of customary law, elders or clan-based systems, religious clerics, and their roles in decision-making and conflict resolution, the effects of these traditional modes of governance on social cohesion and stability, and the place of women in traditional governance systems will all be reviewed in this section.

1.1. The Customary law

According to Bradbury (Bradbury et al., 2010, 58-59), Her is a collection of oral, unwritten customs and practices that are passed down from one generation to the next. The Her legal system, as noted by Kadiye (2020, p.5), is the oldest in Somalia and one of the three that contribute to the formal Somali legal system, along with civil and Islamic law. Although Islam had an impact on it, Her predated Islam, and some of its principles were at first incompatible with Islamic doctrines. But as Somalis embraced Islam,

Her was modified to adhere to God's instructions. However, many of Her 's historic conservative components are still there.

The term "Her" is disputed in origin, but its meaning hasn't changed. According to Miicaad and Ceeleeye (Miicaad & Ceeleeye, 2010, p.15), one explanation argues that it comes from "Xero," which means "camp," and denotes a place encircled by a wall or fence constructed by people to defend themselves against attackers. Over time, "Xero" became "Her," which stands for a commitment among residents of a locality not to deceive or mistreat one another. Another interpretation states that "Her " alludes to a big, strong rope that binds an authentic Somali home (Aqal Somali) together and prevents it from being carried away by the wind. This implies that "Her " is a force that unites individuals.

Somalis use multiple sayings to characterize the Her. The saying "Tol waa Tolone," for instance, implies "people are woven together and the Her is what woven them together." "Xeer waa Kab aad ku socoto," another saying, means "The Her is a shoe to walk on." Because shoes protect users from the sand's heat, thorns, stones, and small, invisible creatures, this saying emphasizes the significance of Xeer in Somali society. People risk going into problems without shoes, just as they would if they disregarded Her. "Kabi waa ku sidaa," which means "shoes keep you up," is a similar term that emphasizes how Her helps individuals stay on their feet. It is obvious that the Her is of the highest importance to Somali civilization from the name of Her, its history, and how Somalis describe it (Miicaad & Ceeleeye, 2010, p.5)

The first point that is answered in this part is why Somalis felt the need to create a system like Her and what function it serves in Somali culture. There is a clear need for a consensus code because there is no centralized administration, and the population is separated into tribes. Hobbes noted that the government is a form of social contract and that the necessity for it results from the fact that people cannot coexist peacefully due to a lack of resources, which breeds competition and hostility among them. Somali elders realized the issue with the state of nature. In addition, it is said that without regulations, humans behave like animals ("Meeshaan xeer ka jirin waa lagu xooloobaa"). This phrase appears to be in harmony with Thomas Hobbes' concept of the state of nature.

The Her was founded to stop Greed, Invasion, Murder, and Robbery. Somali elders explain these points by claiming that a person or individuals are first born with lust, then they attempt invasions to obtain more, then they may murder each other (the offender and the defense), and finally, the victor should loot other things, which is robbery. To save the blood, money, culture, asylum, the underprivileged, and the land was another justification for founding the Her (Miicaad & Ceeleeye, 2010).

Her is what unites Somalis, and it can be argued that by settling several issues and preserving peace in the society, it is a guardian of social cohesion. The ancient Her system has been crucial to the Somali people's survival. According to Andre Le Sage (Le Sage, 2005, p.33), conflicts within Somali society frequently result from disagreements over natural resources, especially in pastoral areas. These disputes are often settled utilizing the Her principles and the traditional institution of conflict resolution. When it comes to resolving disputes, the Somali people generally recognize and respect customary institutions. Gundel estimated that between 80 and 90 percent of criminal cases and conflicts were resolved using Her (Gundel 2006, p.46). For decades, Her has been the best method for resolving disputes and fostering communal cohesiveness, making it an essential part of Somali society. Even before resorting to Islamic Sharia or constitutional law, the majority of Somalis, whether they live in rural or urban regions, follow Her standards, which are their initial and preferred method of obtaining justice (Malim, 2018, p.115).

Another query can be, "Who is the Her maker? Who decides which norms to add and which to remove? Who decides which rules are appropriate for society?" Due to the coexistence of several clans, Somali clans created the Her social compact to regulate behavior within the society. Members of the clan

have agreed to and recognized this Her as a binding rule (Miicaad & Ceeleeye, 2010). According to Gundel (2006, p.13), nearly all of these clan members are men. Every society relies on adult males to make decisions since there is no central authority. In this instance, the reliance on the adult male is influenced by Islamic law, but it has also been suggested that Somalis had a patriarchal culture before the advent of Islam. As a result, the clan elders have respect among their clans and are seen as fair and honest decision-makers. Her is both protected and carried out by revered elders known as the Her Begti.

When talking about Her, one question that comes up is how it functions. The traditional Somali legal and social system known as Her has a judicial system that resembles modern court procedures in several aspects. In this system, there are a variety of participants, including attorneys, court reporters, defendants, and plaintiffs (Ahmed, 2019, p.9). Gundel (2006, p.11) claims that the law council is in charge of resolving legal difficulties and conflicts. The council is made up of respected locals who are familiar with the Her system and its varied customs. The law council uses a "veil of ignorance," which implies that they purposefully keep their knowledge of the identity of the parties engaged in a dispute or the particular circumstances surrounding a case to guarantee impartiality in their decisions. This strategy guarantees that their judgments are devoid of any personal biases or preconceptions and entirely based on the facts provided and the merits of the case (Ahmed, 2019, p.9). There was no any hierarchical within the council, it was so democratic system in which all adult males had access to take part (Richards, 2009, p.98).

There are several Her forms as well, each with its practices and perspectives. Guud and Gaar are the two primary categories of Her. Guud deals with the fundamental tenets of conventional clan law that govern everyday interactions between people, civic affairs, and means of resolving conflicts both inside and across clans. For clans and sub-clans that are predominantly engaged in pastoralism, fishing, frankincense collecting, etc., Gaar refers to special regulations that govern localized economic production relations (Le Sage, 2015, p.33).

The most pertinent division for this subject is Her Guud, which is divided into two primary sections: punitive (dhiig) and civil (dhaqasho). Dhiig is further broken down into three categories: Qudh (murder), Qoon (violence), and Tuugo (stealing). There are multiple subcategories of various crime degrees within each of these categories. For instance, Qoon can be either bodily injury, which has around 12 degrees of harm and each with a corresponding amount of Diya compensation, or moral harm, such as slander. This includes little mishaps like ripped clothing as well as serious cuts and fractures, as well as amputations (Le Sage, 2015, p.33).

The four sections of Dhaqasho, the civil code Her, deal with family (xilo), private property (xoolo), territory (deegan), and hospitality (maamuus)-related concerns. There are several subcategories within each of these groups. For instance, rules for the upkeep, distribution, and use of land, inanimate objects, and living animals are included in Her about private property. Inheritance, gift-giving, and the standing of "lost and found" possessions are likewise governed by its regulations. The areas of Xeer where shari'a has been most thoroughly implemented are Xilo and Xoolo, which concern family relationships and private property problems, respectively. It's interesting how this draws a comparison to secular state court systems that largely employ shari'a to handle family, inheritance, and small civil dispute concerns (Le Sage, 2015, p.33).

The dynamic aspect of the Her system, which enables it to alter and adjust to new situations over time, is one of its essential qualities. The Somali people have a long tradition of negotiation and dispute settlement, and the Her method embodies this attitude of adaptation and flexibility, as Gundel (2006, p.12) notes. Agreements formed under the Her system are not sacrosanct and can be changed or even abandoned if the situation warrants it, unlike many current legal systems that are dogmatic and inflexible. This level of adaptability, which enables the Her system to react to shifting social, economic, and political situations, is crucial for its success. Additionally, the Her system's capacity to change over time guarantees that it will

continue to be applicable and efficient in serving the requirements of Somali communities. This is one of the main justifications for why the Her system is so highly valued in Somali culture as a vital protection of social cohesiveness.

It is not always true to declare that Her is without difficulties and inconveniences. Although the Somali clans have recognized and used the Her ancient legal system for many years, it is not always relevant or regularly enforced. Kadiye (2020, p.5) asserts that Her is a polycentric system, which means that various groups within Somali culture have diverse interpretations of it. All Somali groups share basic parts of Her, such as Diya compensation, marriage customs, and property management, although there are differences in the laws that apply to different livelihood systems, such as agriculture and pastoralism. According to Bradbury et al., (2010, 58-59), these laws might vary across urban and rural areas and throughout time.

According to Omar (2018, p. 26), the fact that Her places more emphasis on group accountability than individual accountability for crimes committed within a clan is one of its key features. As a result, people may feel less responsible for their acts, this might result in a rise in violent crimes like murder and physical assault. Her furthermore encounters several difficulties. For instance, the number of seniors who are specialists in Her is dwindling with time and it is an oral system that has not been recorded. There is also an increasing preference among younger generations for modern dispute-resolution organizations over old ones, particularly in cities. Finally, if a party disobeys a Her judgment, there is no practical way to enforce it.

1.2. Elders (Odayada)

Clan elders in Somali society have a position of respect within their clans and are given the authority to speak out for and represent their clan members on any issues that may have an impact on or influence their interests. Although theoretically any adult man can hold the position of elder and have the authority to speak in council (shir), in reality, elders are chosen to represent their clan based on qualities like age, oratory ability, and Money (Ibrahim, 2018, p.62). Menkhaus (2000) asserts that a clan elder's ascent to a position of power is contingent upon a lifetime reputation as a skillful negotiator, a reliable mediator, an orator, or a wise and devout man, rather than on an inherited position. The majority of scholars concur that traditional elders must be skilled communicators. Ibrahim (2018, p.62) pointed out that clan leaders have a bond with the community, live in a conflict-ridden environment, and are respected and trusted. They also possess moral authority and the ability to persuade others. As noted by Bradbury et al. (2010, 58-59), Isim, Suldaan, Garaad, Ugaas, and Malaq are a few senior-titled elders in some clans who are seen as having a lot of authority inside their clan.

Elders in the Her system, often referred to as Her begti, are essential to preserving social order and mediating conflicts (Kadiye, 2020, p.5). These elders have the moral clout and power to gather resources for the safety of the community and to arbitrate conflicts. When resolving conflicts, they take precedent and tradition into consideration. They also serve as judges and mediators in legal proceedings. In Somali communities, clan elders have been instrumental in preserving social order and security for many years by using the traditional Her method of handling conflicts.

The elders' power derives mostly from their historical standing in Somali culture, which grants them influence over assets, marriage ties, and networks that transcend clan, ethnicity, and generational lines. Many Somalis also think that elders have superhuman abilities, which increases their perceived authority. Clan elders mediate and set the standards that regulate behavior and relationships both inside and outside the Mag-paying commune under the Her system. The elders, who are mostly males, interpret the Her in a way that serves the interests of all the participating clans, making them crucial in mediating and settling

conflicts between various local groups (Malim, 2018, p.120).

Furthermore, elders have a role in more than just resolving disputes. They serve as cultural and moral watchdogs and are crucial to upholding traditional values in Somali society. According to Malim (2018, p.113), Somali clan leaders assumed the role of guardians of Islam and traditional culture during the colonial era and instructed their people to oppose the introduction of Western education. As a kind of protest against Westernization, many parents therefore forbade their kids from attending Western schools. Due to this opposition, an educated or modified form of Islam maintained its supremacy and is still very important to modern-day Somali culture and way of life. The elders are a vital part of Somali society because of their effect on preserving harmonious relationships and a community-centered way of life.

In addition to their traditional responsibilities, Somali elders now participate in contemporary governmental organizations in places like Puntland and Somaliland. Their participation in these institutions demonstrates their significance and influence in modern Somali society. For instance, according to Bradbury, the Guurti, or Upper House of Elders, in Somaliland has formalized the elders' function as guarantors of safety and peace (Bradbury et al., 2010, 58-59). They have moreover taken a leading role in choosing party candidates. The nomination of candidates for parliamentary seats has also involved elders in Puntland.

It is crucial to keep in mind, nevertheless, that the prestige and function of Somali elders have evolved. They have historically been of utmost significance in pressing warring parties to agree to a truce, starting talks between parties, and making decisions based on Her. However, since Somali governments have been paying the elders to uphold public order since the colonial era, their function and reputation have degraded. As a result, people began to believe that elders were corrupted and that their authority had been compromised (La Sege, 2015).

Despite these difficulties, Somali elders continue to have a substantial amount of power and play a crucial part in many facets of society, such as governing, resolving disputes, and upholding traditional norms. The changing function of elders is a reflection of Somali society's dynamic character and their ongoing usefulness in adjusting to contemporary conditions while retaining traditional norms and rituals.

1.3. Religious Clerics (Oluma/Wadaadaha)

As a country with a large Muslim population, Somalia is heavily affected by Islamic clerics who have significant influence over Somali society. Clerics, or leaders of the religion in Somalia, are important in influencing the country's religious and cultural discourse. Their engagement extends across several fields, including politics, administration, dispute resolution, and the implementation of Sharia law.

The religious elders of Somalia have important positions and play crucial responsibilities in the community. Gunther Schlee discusses the function of religious leaders in the implementation of Sharia law (Schlee 2013, P. 260). These clergy carry out judicial duties including administering marriage and divorce processes and assist elders in fostering peace amongst feuding clans. The traditional Somali culture, in which religion is seen as the most important component of life, is upheld in large part by Somali religious leaders. Their moral impact and respect come from their in-depth understanding of religion and Sharia law.

Within the framework of Her, the customary law of Somalia, religious leaders are partly essential in settling disputes and promoting peace. According to Schlee (2013, p. 260) and La Sage (2015, p.16), sheiks and leaders of religion, referred to as wadaad and ulema, had no direct say in them but they assisted elders in attempting to mediate a peaceful settlement between rival clans. They don't directly arbitrate or resolve conflicts between parties. They collaborate with elders to promote amicable discussions, consensus-

building, and the prodding of adversaries toward reconciliation. As they are seen as being impervious to financial influence and having the power to "curse" disobedient clansmen, religious leaders are viewed as having greater moral authority and objectivity, which contributes to their impact on dispute resolution (La Sage, 2015, p.36).

Religious leaders in Somalia have proven their power in several areas. It was shown their part in endorsing certain practice guidelines for the use of contraceptives, particularly the promotion of birth spacing to improve the health of women and children (Egeh, Dugsieh, Osman, 2019, p. 28). Additionally, according to a report by the United Nations Population Fund (UNDP), some religious leaders have actively promoted the use of family planning while others have aggressively opposed practices such as female genital mutilation (FGM) in Somalia. They have banded together in recent years to combat religious extremism and terrorism, releasing a fatwa condemning such actions and promising to back the government's fight against radical groups like Al-Shabaab.

While Somali religious clerics play an important role in fostering peace, prosperity, and stability in the country, they face several obstacles. The many ways that Somali society interprets Islamic law is one difficulty. Some religious authorities urge strict devotion to Islamic law, which can spark disagreement and discussion among the populace. Finding consensus on particular problems can occasionally be difficult due to the range of viewpoints.

The existence of misunderstandings and misrepresentations about the implementation of Sharia law in Muslim nations in Western media is another difficulty for Somali religious leaders. Such misunderstandings might reinforce unfavorable preconceptions and make it difficult to comprehend the real function and influence of religious authorities in Somali culture. Günther Schlee (2013) emphasizes the need to dispel these myths in order to promote greater communication and discussion.

For religious leaders, the security risk presented by terrorist groups like Al-Shabaab adds still another level of difficulty. Al-Shabaab is still capable of carrying out large-scale operations in Somalia and its neighboring nations, according to a study by the Council on Foreign Relations (2022), which poses a serious security danger to Somali society and its religious leaders. The safety of religious leaders is at risk, and their attempts to advance peace and stability in the area are hampered by this threat.

1.4. Women

In traditional governance structures, such as clan elders and Her councils, women may have a limited or nonexistent formal role. Decisions are primarily made by male clan leaders by agreement, which often marginalizes women and reduces their interests to those of the clans (La Sage, 2015, p.16). The exclusion of women from participation is also seen among the Guurti, whom they are not allowed to participate since they are unable to advance to the position of elder in the traditional system (Omar, 2018, p.27). Women face discrimination and are not permitted to serve as Her Begti or to represent any party, claims La Sage (2015, p. 36). To put it succinctly, Her is predominantly male. Women have very little influence on the creation and operation of Her since they are not granted the same political rights as males. Due to Somalia's patriarchal society, women are not actively involved in resolving disputes; instead, they subtly convey their opinions through males, according to Yusuf (2018, p. 14).

Based on La Sage (2015, p. 38) when it comes to the treatment of women, a number of Her practices stand out for criticism: Godobtir, which is the forced marriage of a girl into an enraged clan as part of a Diya payment; Higsin, which is the forced marriage of a deceased wife's sister to the widower; and Dumal, which is the forced marriage of a widow to a male relative of her deceased husband. Oftentimes, a raped woman is coerced into marrying her perpetrator. Although the stated purpose of this is to preserve the

woman's honor, it serves to guarantee that the victim's clan will receive the entire amount of the attacker's dowry. Further bloodshed is also avoided since marriage strengthens the link between the man and woman's respective clans. In addition, women are customarily "denied the right to inherit capital assets such as camels, horses, buildings, seagoing vessels, and frankincense plantations," and husbands' abuse of their wives is typically accepted unless it becomes so severe or ongoing that it disrupts society. In addition to limiting women's access to property and money, this restriction on their rights also jeopardizes their general status and well-being (Kadiye, 2020,p.27).

In summary, women have been marginalized in Somalia's traditional systems of government, with few political rights and limited access to the legal system and decision-making processes. These restrictions go beyond conventional forms of government and have an impact on their economic chances within society as well as their more extensive human and Islamic rights.

2.MODERN GOVERNANCE SYSTEM IN SOMALIA

It is said that modern governance started from the democratic principles and ideas that were developed during the Enlightenment era of the 17th and 18th centuries. These principles act as a catalyst for how governance systems have changed over time. The peace of Westphalia was one of the most significant factors that marked the basis of the establishment of independent sovereign states. As a result, the growth and sustainability of the state were linked to the territorial control and mobilization of force.

The Westphalian state and the notion of sovereignty were limited to focusing on the state's ability to control its territory and to gain enough capital that is required for territorial integrity and security. However, this perspective looks over domestic affairs within the state's boundaries. When Max Weber defined the state, he highlighted the control of a democratic territory (Richard, 2014, p.3).

Nevertheless, how modern statehood is understood has expanded beyond the control of territory and monopolization of force. According to the Montevideo Convention on the Rights and Duties of States in 1933, a State is a legal entity that has a defined territory, a permanent population, an effective government, and independence (Brownlie, 1998, 70-72). The term effective government emphasizes the importance of the actions and responsibilities of the central government in areas that are beyond physical and territorial security. It emphasizes the need to fulfill domestic sovereign responsibilities through institutional authority and organizational capacity (Richard, 2014, p.3).

In the case of Somalia, the origin of its modern governance can be found in its colonial past. Before European colonialism, Somalia had a long history of clan-based and customary systems of government that were important in forming societal structures and resolving conflicts. But when European colonial powers arrived, they overthrew these established structures and imposed their own.

2.1. Pre-Independence Era/Colonial Era

If we examine the pre-independence era or the colonial era, we can understand how modern governance evolved in Somalia. The 'Mad Mullah,' Sayyid Mohammed Abdule Hassan, started the fight for Somali independence and the reunion of all Somalis in 1899, which marked the Somali resistance to colonialism. The "Dervish Movement," a resistance movement that took place throughout the nation, began in the north and continued until 1920 (Sheikh-Abdi, 1977, p.659). Hassan tried to bring Somali clans together in their struggle against colonial powers through his poetry. Due to Hassan's military achievements, the British and Ethiopians eventually teamed up to fight him (Hess, 1964, p.416).

Fighting against forced labor and slavery was one manifestation of colonial rule's opposition in the

South. Nassib Buunto was the leader of the "Gosha Revolt," which took place between 1890 and 1907 and was directed against both the colonizers and the Somali overseers who served them (Mukhtar, 1996, p.545). The southern Somalis were subjected to forced labor, which led to several fatalities from disease and grueling efforts.

The political evolution of Somalia accelerated following the Second World War and the end of Italian colonization in 1941 (Ahmed, 2019, p.11). The British Mandate ruled the Somali areas as a result of Italy's defeat in the conflict. After World War II, proponents of self-determination and democracy became more vocal, leading to the founding of the Somali Youth League (SYL) in 1945, which was made up of former British workers. Hassan's demand for the unity of Somali clans under Somali sovereignty served as the SYL's main source of motivation. They emphasized supporting education, creating social institutions, and fighting clan rivalries among Somalis (Barnes, 2007, p.280)

Amministrazione Fiduciaria Italiana della Somalia (AFIS), an UN-approved program created by Resolution 289, was in charge of Somalia from 1950 until 1960. The AFIS looked to help Somalia create a contemporary nation with a democratic administration. The AFIS sent Somali youth, mostly from the SYL, to Italy for three years to receive education in a variety of subjects related to governance, law, history, civilization, Islam, international law, UN organization, economy, geography, and the international statute for the organization of Somalia (Tripodi, 1999, p.368). This was done as part of the effort to develop future Somali leaders.

Two other prominent parties appeared during the trusteeship period, Hisbia Dighil Mirifle (HDM), which represented the inter-river region in the south, and Partito Democratico Somalo, which was created by the union of various parties. Political participation increased from 38,567 to 62,509 people between 1950 and 1954 (Ware, 1965). However, throughout the AFIS, problems appeared, such as political violence in Somalia that was frequently linked to the rhetoric of north vs south. The HDM in the south, which considered the presence of nomadic clans as reflecting northern interests and was concerned about the economic repercussions, fought with the SYL, perceived to have substantial British support and representing nomadic clans (Mukhtar, 1988, p.85).

To evaluate how Somalis might behave in contemporary state elections, Somalia held its first municipal election in March 1954. To prepare for the elections, the nation undertook a registration process. On July 1st, 1960, Somalia finally achieved independence as a result of this (Sheikh-Abdi, 1977, p.661).

As we see Somalia has gone through numerous stages of trying to adapt to contemporary governance practices throughout its history. We will study pre-conflict governance, during-conflict governance, and post-conflict governance in the coming section. These times illustrate Somalia's development and the difficulties it experienced in building efficient governmental institutions in the wake of war and state breakdown.

2.2. Pre-Conflict Governance

Due to the introduction of universal suffrage, the 1958 elections in Somalia were a significant turning point (Tripodi, 1999, p.367). The former Somalia colonial possessions of the British and Italian powers were combined to establish the new state of Somalia in 1960. In a democratic parliamentary system, Ali Sharmarke served as Prime Minister, while Aden Abdullah Osman was elected as the nation's first president. The creation of "Greater Somalia" or "Somali-Weyn," which aspired to combine all Somali lands, including French Somalia (Djibouti), the Northern Frontier District (NFD) in Kenya, and the Ogaden region in Ethiopia, was the main goal of the Somali government. This cause was brought up during the Cairo Conference in 1961, as well as in front of the United Nations and the Organisation of African Unity

(which is now the African Union). These attempts, however, did not result in appreciable advancement because of the vested interest in maintaining established international borders (Sheikh-Abdi, 1977, p.661).

The newly constituted state had numerous difficulties during the early stages of independence due to attempts at colonial control in the government and the use of clan ties in politics. Italians desired political power during their retreat from Somalia, and they tried to do it by replacing Italian workers with Somalis from their colonial region (Mukhtar, 1989, p.88). According to Samatar & Samatar (1987, p.682), the government also depended on foreign aid from former colonial powers, which had an impact on the budget of the country. Sadly, lawmakers used this outside funding for personal wealth and power, which led to a rise in the number of political parties from 24 in 1964 to 62 in 1969.

Clan loyalty persisted in playing a key role in Somali politics notwithstanding the creation of a modern sovereign state. As seen in the elections of 1956 and 1958, clan affiliations were used as a strategy to take control of the government (Mukhtar, 1989, p.83).

The clan ties created in earlier years were put to the test in 1964 when the first general parliamentary elections were held. Despite 21 political parties running in the elections, the Somali Youth League (SYL) won 69 of the 123 seats in parliament, claiming victory. Politicians from both the southern and northern areas held places in the new government, giving the impression of a balanced representation. However, due to problems like politicians breaking their early vows or not providing the support they had promised, the administration resigned in 1966 (Ahmed, 2019, p.15)

2.2.1. Somalia Under Siyad Barre's Ruling

Political parties were outlawed and replaced by the Supreme Revolutionary Council (SRC) following Barre's coup. The SRC sought to end the use of clan connections as a political platform in addition to adopting Marxist socialism as the official system of government. According to Sheikh-Abdi (1977, p.662), Somalis are familiar with socialism and its concepts. Their culture combines elements such as the old communalistic system of Hanti Wadaag, which entails sharing animals and wealth. This mechanism guarantees that less fortunate relatives and individuals who have suffered misfortune obtain reparation via Xoolo-Goyn. Xoolo-Goyn is analogous to severing a portion of the herd or biting off a piece of bread to feed a hungry partner. Somalia also values other socialist principles like Iska Wax u Qabso (self-help) and Isgargaar (cooperation).

The dictatorship carried out several nation-building projects, including the development of a written form of the Somali language, literacy drives, and improvements to the nation's healthcare system (Davidson, 1975, p.28).

Clan politics made a comeback in Somalia under Barre's rule as a way to acquire and hold onto power. Political tensions along clan lines were exacerbated by the Barre regime's use of public finances for the Ogaden war (Samatar and Samatar, 1987, p.683). To start a war with Ethiopia over the Ogaden region in 1977, the government eventually revived the idea of "Somali-Weyn" (Adam, 1992). According to Adam (Adam, 1992, p.22), while portraying his cabinet ministers as mediators, Barre started damaging clan relationships, inciting tensions subtly, and giving opponents money and weapons. He stifled the growth of Somalia's minor bourgeoisie while favoring his own Darood family clan and concentrating power there. Ahmed (2019, p.24) noted that to create the MOD, Barre brought together three Darood sub-clans: the Maheran clan (his father's clan), the Ogaden clan (his mother's clan), and the Dolbahante clan (his son-in-law's clan).

Bantu Somalis were at risk during this time because their lands were taken by the government and

given to Barre's allies as incentives (Besteman, 1996, 581-582). As noted by Luling (1997, p290), Barre upheld the ban on using clan names in public while also acting in clan clientelism, giving weapons and cash to his allies, and promoting attacks against rival clans. Barre indirectly encouraged resource scarcity and instability by damaging the nation's economy, which encouraged clan loyalty as the only means of surviving. The protracted civil war that Somalia has been experiencing for the past 20 years was eventually caused by Barre's obsession with elevating his clan to the position of the ruling elite (Ahmed, 2019, p.16).

Barre used collective punishment to quell clan dissent. According to Elmi and Barise (2006, p.35), the military administration utilized disproportionate force and collective punishment to stifle dissenting voices, denying people the ability to express their dissatisfaction. When a group of soldiers tried to take over the regime in 1978, the government of Siad Barre retaliated by using the national army and police to punish civilian Majerteen clan members. As a result, the military slaughtered people, committed widespread violations, and devastated clan-inhabited places.

Barre also gave the order to bomb Hargeisa in the late 1980s, which caused a large number of fatalities, internal displacement, and infrastructure destruction (Samatar, 1997, p.704). According to Ahmed and Green (1999, p.119), there may have been 100,000 fatalities as a result of the Hargeisa attacks. By using strategies akin to those used by the KGB, Barre effectively converted the entire nation into an open-air prison. The actions in Hargeisa, which purported to exterminate Isaaq clan members exclusively based on their clan ancestry, have been compared to genocide.

2.3. During conflict: Somalia's Collapse and Humanitarian Aid

Under Barre's rule, Somalia's government disintegrated, sparking a protracted civil war and a significant humanitarian disaster. Barre's methods consolidated clan differences among Somalis, escalating tensions that carried over into the civil war. Diverse Somalis had diverse experiences as a result of the civil war; some, like the Darood, were the targets of violence, while others, like the Bantu, who had weak clan ties, were subjected to killings by Barre's soldiers (Adam, 1999, p.176).

During the civil war, several groups emerged, representing various clans and regions in their struggle against Barre, including the Somali National Movement (SNM), the Somali Salvation Democratic Front (SSDF), the Somali Patriotic Movement (SPM), and the United Somali Congress (USC) (Luling, 1997, p.294; Samatar, 1997, p.177). A fragmented and chaotic post-Barre era characterized by small-scale civil wars along clan lines resulted from the faction leaders' struggle for power following Barre's overthrow (Adam, 1999, p.176). Originally organized to combat Barre, clan militias grew out of hand and split into sub-clan and sub-sub-clan militias, which engaged in theft, bloodshed, and destruction over all of Somalia (Samatar, 1997, p.704).

Organizations like the Worldwide Committee of the Red Cross (ICRC) and the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) started worldwide humanitarian aid initiatives in the 1990s to improve the dreadful situation in Somalia. These initiatives, however, ran into serious obstacles and were mostly ineffective. Out of 8 to 10 million inhabitants, 4.5 million Somalians, or more than half the population, were projected to be starving and in need of aid (Adam, 1999, p.181). An estimated 300,000 to 500,000 people perished as a result of famine and other problems, such as infectious diseases (Ahmed and Green, 1999, p.120).

According to Menkhaus (2010, 323-324), despite being targeted by clan militias, humanitarian organizations engaged militias as security guards and gave them financial support under the pretense of "technical support". The aid provided by NGOs was nevertheless still at risk of being seized due to tribes' fluctuating territorial control. Ahmed and Green (1999, p.122) noted that such organizations

unintentionally gave clan militias more power and influence by giving them a new source of income. Moreover, the United Nations (UN) and other entities attempted external interventions, such as conflict resolution conferences, but these efforts encountered substantial obstacles and failed to result in a peaceful conclusion (Ahmed and Green, 1999, p.122). External forces have occasionally been blamed for escalating the crisis and lessening the likelihood of a peaceful resolution (Adam, 1999, p.186).

Following the civil war, de-facto nations like Somaliland and Puntland with their distinct clan dynamics and governmental systems arose (Johnson and Smaker, 2014, p.5). Clan elders in Somaliland were instrumental in forging power-sharing agreements amongst clans, resulting in some degree of stability (Johnson and Smaker, 2014, p.6). Despite not being recognized by the African Union or the UN, Puntland, which is primarily inhabited by the Majerten sub-clan of the Darod tribe, pursued self-governance (Njoku, 2013).

Clan agreements in southern-central Somalia produced a power-sharing arrangement that made the area somewhat stable. To summarise, the Pre-conflict and during-conflict periods in Somalia, from 1960 to 2000, demonstrated the complex dynamics of clan politics, external influences, and the pursuit of establishing a modern democratic system. Somalia had a protracted civil war and a humanitarian disaster as a result of the breakdown of the government in 1991. Somalis and international groups worked to rebuild the nation throughout the period of government that followed the conflict. We shall examine Somalia's post-conflict government in the following part, as well as the difficulties encountered during the restoration effort.

2.4. Post-Conflict Governance

In the last three decades, efforts have been made in Somalia to rebuild and establish a contemporary governing structure. The goal is to develop a system that supports consistency, openness, and efficient government both at the national and local levels. To reconstruct state institutions, advance security, and foster political reconciliation, later initiatives including the Transitional National Government, Transitional Federal Government, and Federal Government of Somalia have been put in place. These initiatives signify ongoing attempts to install a reliable and efficient system of government in Somalia.

2.4.1. Transnational National Government

After Somalia's central government fell apart in 1991, the country descended into a protracted period of upheaval and violence. Several international and regional peace conferences were convened to create a transitional governing authority. In the early 1990s, these conferences were held in far-off nations like Egypt and Yemen as well as close-by states like Djibouti, Kenya, and Ethiopia. These conferences' main goal was to bring together various warlords and factions for talks with the ultimate goal of reaching a power-sharing agreement (Menkhaus, 2007, p.360).

Warlords became powerful figures during these peace discussions, presenting themselves as clan representatives. With each succeeding session, there were more warlords claiming to speak for their respective tribes. For instance, there were six factions representing six clans at the Djibouti conference in 1991, and there were fifteen clan-based groups at the Addis Abeba conference in 1993. There were 28 factions present at the Cairo summit in 1997, up from the previous year (Elmi, 2010, p.35). The predominance of warlords and their connections to clans complicated the peace process and hampered government attempts.

The Transitional National Government (TNG), headed by President Abdi Qasim Salad Hassan, was established in 2000 as a consequence of the peace talks held in Arta, Djibouti. A power-sharing plan based

on the 4.5 formula was enacted by the TNG, which had a 245-member parliament. With a 0.5 allocation set aside for minorities like the Bantu and Benadiri, this method distributed parliamentary seats among the four largest clan families, the Dir, Darood, Hawiye, and Digil-Mirifle (Ahmed, 2019, p.5).

The TNG represented Somalia in the international community and worked to bring back stability and government in the nation. However, internal strife and warlord hostility limited its efficacy. According to Menkhaus (2007, 359-360), Somalia's TNG, which is predominantly represented by clans centered in Mogadishu, notably the Hawiye/HaberGedir/Ayr sub-clan, has failed to operate as a cohesive administration. It was opposed by the Somali Reconciliation and Rehabilitation Council (SRRC), led by Abdullahi Yusuf and supported by Ethiopia. This schism has had a considerable influence on Somali politics, with the SRRC calling for federalism and opposing Islamism, and the Mogadishu-based alliance opposing Ethiopia, including Islamists, and supporting a strong central authority. Moreover, the Isaaq clan, which was regarded as the fifth main clan, was combined with the Dir clan during the peace negotiations, which caused tensions and accusations of aggression (Elmi, 2010, p.29). Hussein Aidid and Musa Sudi were serious threats to the TNG, which led to internal conflict and, eventually, the government's collapse after roughly 18 months (Le Sage, 2005, p.5).

2.4.2. Transitional Federal Government

According to Elmi (2010, pp. 94-95), Ethiopia, with the support of Kenya, pushed the IGAD regional organization to hold another reconciliation meeting in Kenya. At the 2001 IGAD conference in Khartoum, the Ethiopian delegation said that Somalia's peace process was inadequate, noting the exclusion of major partners. Consequently, a summit hosted by Kenya, sponsored by IGAD, and dominated by Ethiopia began on October 15, 2002. After two years, this conference finished with Ethiopia imposing a charter, parliament, and government on Somalia, with practically all of Ethiopia's proxies serving in parliament. During the meeting, the Transitional Federal Government (TFG) was formed, and its representatives chose Abdullahi Yusuf, a long-time Ethiopian warlord, as president. According to La Sage (2005, p. 13), Colonel Abdullahi Yusuf was chosen by a clan-based Transitional Federal Assembly of 275 MPs.

According to Ahmed (2019, p.5), the TFG used the same 4.5 clan power-sharing method to elect officials as its forerunner. The entire number of parliamentary seats was distributed according to the 4.5 formula, yielding roughly 62 seats for major clan groups and 31 seats for smaller clan groupings. Although the precise number of members in parliament has changed between elections, the general idea of applying the 4.5 formula for seat distribution has stayed constant.

The Transitional Federal Government (TFG) faced several problems, both within Somalia and from external parties. Interference from neighboring nations impeded the peace process that culminated in the foundation of the TFG. Elmi (2010, p.21) claims that Ethiopia and Kenya put their interests ahead of long-term stability in Somalia. Fearing a unified "Greater Somalia" that would threaten their rule over Somali-inhabited lands, they sought to build a weak administration that would not pursue such a goal.

Elmi (2010, p.23) goes on to say that, while Ethiopia and Kenya participated, other regional actors like as Eritrea and Egypt were disappointed with the outcome. According to news reports, Egypt's cold welcome of President Abdullahi Yusuf on his 2004 visit to Cairo typifies this displeasure.

Historically, Arab states have had a rivalry with Somalia's neighbors, Ethiopia and Kenya. Somalia and the Arab world are naturally linked by their shared religion and culture, but Ethiopia and Kenya share borders and a history of conflict with Somalia. These regional tensions, combined with Ethiopia's alleged efforts to undercut Egypt's earlier peace proposal from 1997, exacerbated the situation.

This outside interference not only hampered the peace process but also harmed the TFG's legitimacy. Furthermore, Elmi (2010, p. 22) argues that Somalia lacks the key ingredients for a viable federation. The country could not simply successfully handle various tiers of government—local, regional, and federal. Further complicating matters, there was no agreement on how to divide Somalia into federal states. Some, like northern federalists, called for two regions, while others, such as Puntland and the Rahanweyn Resistance Army, preferred four or five. Others, including several members of the Darod clan, opted to return to the 18 regions formed during Siad Barre's reign. In contrast, some Hawiye clan members advocated for a restoration of the eight districts that existed before Barre's dictatorship. The lack of agreement on a federal structure was a key challenge to constructing a stable and unified Somalia.

According to Elmi (2010, 95-139), the establishment of the Islamic Courts Union (UIC) in 2006 was a watershed moment. The UIC vanquished the majority of warlords, restoring calm to Mogadishu and the surrounding territories. This popularity among Somalis concerned Ethiopia, which saw the UIC as a danger and responded militarily. However, Ethiopia's withdrawal in 2009 was prompted by a mix of vigorous UIC opposition and discussions with Somali parties. This opened the door for a new era in Somali politics.

Building on this momentum, Djibouti conducted a series of peace negotiations in 2008, concluding in the creation of the Government of National Unity (GNU) in February 2009. This was an important milestone because prior attempts at reconciliation had been mostly fruitless (Elmi, 2010).

Sheikh Sharif's 2009 election used the 4.5 formula, which is a power-sharing system based on clan representation. This system would continue to play a part in subsequent Somali administrations, including the 2012 administration that saw the founding of the Federal Republic of Somalia (FRS). (Ahmed, 2019, p. 6.)

2.4.3. Why The 4.5 Formula?

Power-sharing is defined by Papagianni (2007, p. 24) as political systems that ensure the involvement of representatives of all major communal groups in political decision-making, particularly in the executive. Conflicting parties come together through power-sharing to agree on representation in all facets of government. It is usually applied in societies where concerns about identity, such as those based on religion or race, are prevalent. A predetermined formula or a formula based on political parties' electoral performance can be used to accomplish power sharing in the executive (Papagianni, 2007, p. 25).

Power-sharing, according to Papagianni (2007, p. 27), not only makes agreements easier to sign but also makes them last longer. Power-sharing agreements, however, can impede political advancement and freeze the realities of wartime. They are hampered by the key players' persistent lack of confidence in one another. Power-sharing arrangements frequently overlook the interests of minorities in decision-making and are unable to address all the many problems that confront a nation that has experienced violence.

The 4.5 formula for Somalia is predicated on the possibility of power-sharing amongst Somali clans. It aims to specifically address the long-standing power struggles and clan-based disputes that afflict the country. After the Somali 4.5 power-sharing formula was established, executive power-sharing was used as a political tool. This meant that the allocation of power was based on a predetermined formula that allocated parliamentary seats according to clans in governmental representation. Lewis (1993, p. 495) states that the four main clan groups in Somalia are the Hawiye, the Darood, the Dir (which includes the Isaaq clan), and lastly the Digil and Mirifle. These clan groups comprise the bulk of the country's population. These clans have traditionally had a great impact on the social and political dynamics of the country. There are minority clans, according to Ahmed (2019, p. 6), including the Gabooye, Tumaal, Yibir, Midgaan, Somali Bantu, and Banadiri Reer Hamar. These clans, who make up the formula's 0.5 representation

component, are usually marginalized and underrepresented.

Therefore, the 4.5 formula aims to specifically address the long-standing power struggles and clan-based conflicts that have afflicted the country. Clans in Somalia operate much like ethnic groupings in other nations. By allocating authority among the four major family clans and providing 0.5 representation to women and minority clans, the formula seeks to guarantee that all important stakeholders are included in the governing process (Ahmed, 2019, p. 28).

According to Ahmed (2019, p. 29), the 4.5 Formula has been successful in putting a stop to clan animosity, but it has also caused politics to stagnate and made it difficult to move away from clan-based politics. Furthermore, minority clans and Somali Bantus have suffered as a result of the 4.5 Formula, which has created challenges for the government in terms of legitimacy and democratic governance.

2.4.4. Current Governance

After twenty years, the government of Somalia received worldwide legitimacy in 2012 when Hassan Sheikh Mohamud, a former teacher and member of civil society, was elected president. The Somali provisional constitution, which established a federal structure of member states sharing power, was ratified that same year. According to the constitution, the Somali government has control over the entire country, including the self-declared independent state of Somaliland. By building effective political institutions and responsive, responsible government, the adoption of the constitution was primarily intended to put an end to protracted tensions, wars, political turbulence, and disorder (Kouroutakis, 2014, p.196).

According to Ahmed (2019, p.37), the protection and advancement of human rights, as well as inclusive governance, are prioritized by the Constitution, which supports a liberal and inclusive administration. It divides government into three distinct branches: the legislative, executive, and independent judicial, all of which are intended to preserve a proper balance of power and guarantee accountability. Article 11 of the constitution states that all citizens have equal rights and obligations under the law, regardless of their sex, religion, social or economic status, political viewpoint, clan, disability, occupation, birth, or dialect (Som. Const.).

Presently, Jubbaland, Gamudug, Puntland, the Southwest State of Somalia, Hir-Shabelle, and Somaliland are among the states that make up the federal government of Somalia. The federal government and the member states each have their level of government, according to the Constitution. The federal government is given authority over issues like foreign relations, national defense, immigration and citizenship, and monetary policy (Som. Const. art. 54), whereas the states have more control over local issues. The particular authority given to the states is still being worked out (Ahmed, 2019, p.37)

The significance of the 4.5 power-sharing model's absence from the constitution lies in its indication of a shift away from clan-based governance and towards a system that grants each individual the right to vote for themselves, so bolstering the notion of one person, one vote (Ahmed, 2019, p. 37). A major challenge when it comes to upcoming elections in Somalia, according to Crouch & Njagi (2017, p. 12), is how to handle the transition from the stable but undemocratic clan power-sharing formula of 4.5 to the introduction of a direct, one-person, one-vote democracy, which could have unpredictable results and jeopardize the tenuous stability that has been established.

In the 2012 elections, 135 elders who voted for the president helped elect 271 members of parliament using the 4.5 formula. Following the 2017 elections, a two-tiered government system with the House of the People (Lower House) and the Upper House was established. The National Leaders Forum increased the electorate to 14,025 delegates, constituting 275 electoral colleges with 51 electors for each

parliamentary seat, to strengthen democracy and fight corruption. President Farmaajo was elected as a result of this procedure (Crouch & Njagi, 2017, p.12).

Moreover, Somalia's President, Hassan Sheikh Mohamud (HSM), took office in May 2022. Despite expectations of a permanent constitution with public input by 2016 (Ainte, 2014), the 2022 election, like its predecessor, relied on the existing 4.5 power-sharing system based on clan affiliation. This system assigns key positions like speaker, prime minister, and president to specific clan groups. Clan elders and state legislatures select national parliamentarians, who then elect the president.

Somalia in 2024 is a nation in negotiation, not just with itself but with its very foundation – the constitution. The ongoing review process exposes the complexities of building a unified nation from the fragments of a turbulent past. Media reports paint a picture of a contentious process fraught with both potential progress and significant setbacks.

On March 30, 2024, a significant milestone was reached as both houses of the Somali Federal Parliament approved the first four chapters of the revised constitution (Hiiraan Online, 2024). This vote represents a critical step forward, but the process is far from complete.

One major point of contention is the shifting balance of power between the president and the prime minister. The parliament's earlier approval of a bill granting the president the authority to appoint and dismiss the prime minister marks a significant change (Africanews, 2024). This altered the previous system where the prime minister required parliamentary approval. Proponents argue this change addresses long-standing power struggles that have plagued Somali politics for years. However, skepticism lingers regarding its effectiveness in fostering lasting stability.

The review process has also reignited tensions between the federal government and some regional states. Puntland, a semi-autonomous region, reportedly threatened secession if the revised constitution failed to address their concerns (Bloomberg, 2024). This episode highlights the ongoing challenge of balancing federalism with national unity, a tightrope walk Somalia has struggled with since its inception.

Further complicating the situation are concerns raised by Human Rights Watch (HRW) regarding proposed amendments that could weaken child protection measures (HRW, 2024). The potential reduction of the age of majority to 15 and the possibility of loopholes permitting certain forms of female genital mutilation (FGM) have sparked outrage from human rights advocates (HRW, 2024). These proposals expose the fault lines between progress and tradition, highlighting the need to prioritize the well-being of children, particularly girls.

2. INTERRELATIONSHIP OF BOTH SYSTEMS

Traditional Somali governance and modern Somali governance share numerous striking parallels. Both systems place a high value on clans as social entities, similar to tribal groups in other countries. The 4.5 Formula implemented in Somalia aims to promote opportunities for clan involvement in government without guaranteeing specific government positions. This reflects the recognition of clans as powerful entities in both traditional and modern settings.

Furthermore, both traditional and modern governments recognize the historical importance of clan elders as political figures. This practice extends back to pre-colonial times and became increasingly prevalent during the colonial era when colonial forces relied on clan elders as indirect rulers. The continued role of clan elders in modern governance highlights the enduring influence of traditional structures.

Leadership and decision-making procedures also exhibit shared characteristics. Traditional clan-based systems rely on clan elders to guide communities and settle disputes, while modern governance entrusts elected officials and government authorities with leadership and decision-making on behalf of the state. Both systems acknowledge the need for representation and participation, achieved through clan elders in the traditional system and democratic elections in the modern system.

Finally, both traditional and modern governance systems emphasize legal structures and standards. Traditional clan-based systems rely on customary law, reflecting the community's established norms and social values. Modern governance systems are guided by statutory laws and regulations that govern the state and its institutions. Notably, the Somali constitution integrates customary law principles, underscoring the interconnection between traditional and modern legal frameworks.

On another hand, there are substantial contrasts between Somali Traditional and Modern Governance Modes. Customary law was not written down in traditional modes, but rather dynamically interpreted based on the community's cultural and social norms. In modern government, on the other hand, there is a written constitution that gives a framework for administering the state.

Another distinction is found in the gender and age dynamics. Power was primarily controlled by men in conventional ways of administration, with no opportunities for engagement for women or younger generations. All clans, however, were treated equally and had representation in decision-making procedures. Modern administration, on the other hand, has made achievements in increasing the participation of women and younger generations, but it has also resulted in the marginalization of particular clans. For example, the 4.5 power-sharing formula has resulted in unequal representation, with certain clans having fewer representatives than others.

Traditional and modern governance have different representation processes. Traditional means of representation relied on clan elders' wisdom, expertise, and experience, who were chosen to represent their clans. There were no elections, and the elders' authority was acknowledged by the community. Representatives in modern administration are elected through elections, but the selection process does not always prioritize skill or ability. Individuals aspiring to enter parliament, on the other hand, may rely on clan support and resort to bribery or other methods to win votes.

Furthermore, decision-making in traditional models of administration was frequently seen as trustworthy and free of bribery or corruption. Elders would convene to deliberate and make choices in the best interests of the community. However, there has been an upsurge in bribery and corruption in modern government, where monetary incentives play a role in influencing decisions.

These distinctions emphasize the changing nature of the Somali government and the difficulties in harmonizing traditional and modern systems. In Somalia's state-building efforts, balancing the need for inclusive representation, accountable decision-making, and effective governance remains a difficult issue.

In Somalia, the possibility of collaboration between traditional and modern governance is crucial for achieving stability and legitimacy. The current 4.5 power-sharing arrangement, which distributes power based on parliamentary seats and clan representation, has, however, been a source of disagreement and criticism.

The 4.5 formula and other power-sharing arrangements have limitations and can contribute to political stagnation. The 4.5 system in Somalia reinforced clan identification in politics, resulting in a lack of progress and the inability to construct a legitimate and effective government. Former warlords and conflict actors gained legitimacy and influence by participating in the power-sharing system (Papagianni,

According to Papagianni (2007, p.24), political power-sharing has some important features such as proportional representation, proportional allocation of positions and funds, and minority protection. In Somalia, the 4.5 power-sharing formula does not correspond to these features of political power-sharing. Certain groups in Somali society are disadvantaged as a result of historical discrimination and power distribution based on clan representation.

To develop collaboration between the traditional and modern governments in Somalia, it is critical to address the flaws of the 4.5 power-sharing system and shift towards more inclusive and transparent practices. This could include efficiently executing the constitution, establishing clear participation criteria, and prioritizing capacity-building of governmental institutions and security forces. Somalia may move towards a more peaceful and prosperous future for all of its residents by fostering equal representation, accountability, and legitimate governance.

4. REFLEXIVITY

As a Somali born and raised in Somalia, I have experienced firsthand the tumultuous events that have shaped our country's history. I witnessed the devastating impact of the conflict between the Ethiopian army and Islamic forces, which ravaged our communities and left deep scars on our society. The Somali system has influenced every aspect of my life, from economic opportunities to education, health, and social dynamics.

In this paper, I aim to provide a comprehensive literature review on the topic at hand. Despite the personal experiences that have shaped my perspective, I endeavor to approach this review with scholarly rigor and objectivity. My goal is to present a balanced analysis that encompasses both traditional modes of Somali governance and modern governance structures. By exploring how these systems can coexist and sometimes conflict, I hope to provide readers with a synthesized understanding of this complex topic.

CONCLUSION

To summarize, upon reviewing the literature review on both the Somali traditional system of governance and the modern system of governance, the paper research demonstrated the strong influence and inevitability of traditional ways of governance in Somalia, particularly the clan-based system. These traditional systems have deep roots and continue to play an important role in government, especially at the local level. The findings show that the previous Somali authorities' attempts to repress clan-based systems have been futile. These mechanisms have resisted such repression and have remained key participants in the country's governing dynamics. Moreover, the research highlights the inherent conflict between traditional and modern models of governance, as they represent opposing mindsets and methods. Traditional systems' flexible structure can occasionally provide problems for social cohesion, especially in a quickly changing and modernizing society. The findings indicate that religious clerics' power has been diminished in the setting of modern administration in Somalia. Further investigation is required to comprehend the elements that contribute to this phenomenon and its repercussions.

REFERENCES

- Abokor, A. (2016). Somalia: The Role of Clan Elders in State and Peace-Building. In *Elders and Political Leadership in the Somali Region* (pp. 41-58). Palgrave Macmillan.
- Adam, H. M. (1992). Somalia: militarism, warlordism or democracy?. *Review of African Political Economy*, 19(54), 11-26.
- Adam, H. M. (1999). Somali civil wars. In *Civil wars in Africa: Roots and resolution* (pp. 161-192).
- Ahmed, A. I. (2017). Clan, State, and External Intervention in Somalia. *Africa Spectrum*, 52(2), 3-27.
- Ahmed, I. I., & Green, R. H. (1999). The heritage of war and state collapse in Somalia and Somaliland: local-level effects, external interventions and reconstruction. *Third World Quarterly*, 20(1), 113-127.
- Ahmed, M. (2014). State Formation and the Challenge of Clanism in Somalia. *Africa Today*, 60(2), 3-23.
- Ahmed, N. (2019). Somalia's struggle to integrate traditional and modern governance: The 4.5 formula and 2012 provisional constitution [Master's Thesis, the American University in Cairo]. AUC Knowledge Fountain.
- Barnes, C. (2007). The Somali Youth League, Ethiopian Somalis and the Greater Somalia Idea, c. 1946–48. *Journal of Eastern African Studies*, 1(2), 277-291.
- Barnes, C. (2009). Civil society and peacebuilding: Mapping functions in working for peace. *The International Spectator*, 44(1), 131-147.
- Besteman, C. (1995). The invention of Goshu: Slavery, colonialism, and stigma in Somali history. In *The invention of Somalia* (pp. 43-62).
- Besteman, C. (1996). Violent politics and the politics of violence: the dissolution of the Somali nation-state. *American Ethnologist*, 23(3), 579-596.
- Bradbury, M. (2013). Becoming Somaliland. *African Affairs*, 112(449), 498-516.
- Bradbury, M., & Healy, S. (Eds.). (2010). *Whose peace is it anyway?: Connecting Somali and international peacemaking*. Conciliation Resources.
- Browne, E., & Fisher, J. (2013). *Key actors mapping: Somalia*. Birmingham: GSDRC, University of Birmingham.
- Bryden, M. (2012). Rebuilding the Somali State: From Crisis in 2007 to Imminent Collapse in 2010. *Journal of Eastern African Studies*, 6(3), 467-488.
- Bryden, M. (2017). In Search of a Functioning Somali State. *The Journal of Modern African Studies*, 55(2), 251-272.
- Cox, M. (2001). *State building and post-conflict reconstruction: lessons from Bosnia*. Geneva: Centre for Applied Studies in International Negotiations (pp. 3-28).
- Crouch, J., & Njagi, S. (2017). *Electoral Crossroads: Dilemmas of future democratisation in Somalia (Rep.)*. London, UK: Saferworld. Retrieved from <https://www.saferworld.org.uk/resources/publications/1126-electoral-crossroads-dilemmas-of-future-democratisation-in-somali>

- Egeh, A. A., Dugsieh, O., Erlandsson, K., & Osman, F. (2019). The views of Somali religious leaders on birth spacing - A qualitative study. *Sexual & reproductive healthcare: official journal of the Swedish Association of Midwives*, 20, 27–31.
- Elmi, A. A. (2010). Understanding the Somalia conflagration: Identity, political Islam and peacebuilding.
- Fernandes, C. (2017). *Clan-Based Governance in Somalia: The Role of Traditional Authorities in Stability and Development*. Institute for Security Studies.
- Gundel, J. (2009). *Clans in Somalia*. Austrian Red Cross, Vienna. Available at: http://www.ecoi.net/file_upload/90_1261130976_accord-report-clans-in-somalia-revised-edition-20091215.pdf [Accessed 18 October 2012]
- Hagmann, T., & Hoehne, M. V. (2009). Failures of the state failure debate: Evidence from the Somali territories. *Journal of International Development*, 21(1), 42-57.
- Hess, R. L. (1964). The 'mad Mullah' and northern Somalia. *The Journal of african history*, 5(3), 415-433.
- Hoehne, M. V. (2014). Public authority and clan governance in Somalia. In F. Schomerus, & T. Allen (Eds.), *From the Ground Up: Land Rights, Conflict and Peace in Sub-Saharan Africa* (pp. 79-94). Zed Books.
- Ibrahim, M. (2013). Traditional Governance Systems and the Challenge of Political Transition in Somalia. *African Affairs*, 112(448), 431-457.
- Jaamac Muuse Miicaad, & Cabdalla Xaaji Ceeleeye. (2010) *Xeer-dhaqameed*.
- Kaplan, S. (2012). Somali challenges, African solutions: Towards an indigenous approach to state-building. *Stability: International Journal of Security and Development*, 1(1), 3.
- Kaplan, S. (2016). Making Sense of Somalia: Differentiating Governance Models. *Stability: International Journal of Security & Development*, 5(1), 1-15.
- Klobucista, C., Masters, J., & Aly Sergie, M. (2022). *Al-Shabaab*. Council on Foreign Relations. Available at: <https://www.cfr.org/backgroundunder/al-shabaab>.
- Kouroutakis, A. P. (2014). State Fragility and Transitional Justice in Somalia: An Analytical Framework. *Journal of International Criminal Justice*, 12(5), 1035-1054.
- Le Sage, A. (2005). Stateless justice in Somalia: Formal and informal rule of law initiatives.
- Leeson, P. T. (2007). Better off stateless: Somalia before and after government collapse. *Journal of comparative economics*, 35(4), 689-710.
- Lewis, I. M. (1972). The politics of the 1969 Somali coup. *The Journal of modern African studies*, 10(3), 383-408.
- Lewis, I. M. (1988). *A modern history of the Somali: Nation and state in the Horn of Africa*. Boulder & London: Westview Press.
- Lewis, I. M. (1993). *Understanding Somalia: Guide to culture, history and social institutions*. Haan Pub.
- Lewis, I. M. (2016). *Blood and bone: The call of kinship in Somali society*. Red Sea Press.

- Luling, V. (1997). Come back Somalia? Questioning a collapsed state. *Third World Quarterly*, 18(2), 287-302.
- Menkhaus, K. (2007). Governance without government in Somalia: spoilers, state building, and the politics of coping. *International security*, 31(3), 74-106.
- Menkhaus, K. (2007). The crisis in Somalia: Tragedy in five acts. *African Affairs*, 106(424), 357-390.
- Menkhaus, K. (2010). Stabilisation and humanitarian access in a collapsed state: the Somali case. *Disasters*, 34(s3).
- Menkhaus, K. (2014). Somalia: State Failure, Terrorism, and Piracy. In *Understanding Conflicts: Cross-Disciplinary Perspectives on International Relations* (pp. 173-188). Routledge.
- Menkhaus, K. (2016). Somalia: The Problem of the State. *African Affairs*, 115(460), 326-334.
- Mukhtar, M. H. (1989). The Emergence and Role of Political Parties in the Inter-River Region of Somalia From 1947-1960. *Ufahamu: A Journal of African Studies*, 17(2).
- Mukhtar, M. H. (1995). Islam in Somali history: Fact and fiction. In *The invention of Somalia* (pp. 1-27).
- Mukhtar, M. H. (1996). The plight of the Agro-pastoral society of Somalia. *Review of African Political Economy*, 23(70), 543-553.
- Mukhtar, M. H. (2003). *Historical dictionary of Somalia* (Vol. 87). Scarecrow Press.
- Njoku, R. C. (2013). *The history of Somalia*. ABC-CLIO.
- Odowa, A. M. (2013). What can current leaders in Somalia learn from their past history? *International Training Programme for Conflict Management*, 2239-7949, 19-24.
- Papagianni, K. (2007). Power-sharing: A conflict resolution tool. *Africa Mediators' Retreat*, 23-33.
- Prunier, G. (1996). Somalia: civil war, intervention and withdrawal (1990–1995). *Refugee Survey Quarterly*, 15(1), 35-85.
- Richards, A. (2012). Somali views of state and governance before and after the outbreak of civil war. *Journal of Eastern African Studies*, 6(3), 489-506.
- Samatar, A., & Samatar, A. I. (1987). The material roots of the suspended African state: Arguments from Somalia. *The Journal of Modern African Studies*, 25(4), 669-690.
- Samatar, A. I. (1992). Destruction of state and society in Somalia: beyond the tribal convention. *The Journal of Modern African Studies*, 30(4), 625-641.
- Samatar, A. I. (1997). Leadership and ethnicity in the making of African state models: Botswana versus Somalia. *Third World Quarterly*, 18(4), 687-708.
- Schlee, G. (2013). Customary law and the joys of statelessness: idealised traditions versus Somali realities. *Journal of Eastern African Studies*, 7(2), 258-271.
- Sheikh-Abdi, A. (1977). Somali nationalism: Its origins and future. *The Journal of Modern African Studies*, 15(4), 657-665.
- Stremlau, N. (2018). Governance without government in the Somali territories. *Journal of International Affairs*, 71(2), 73-89.

53 | Afifa WARSAME

- The Federal Republic of Somalia: Provisional Constitution [Somalia]. (2012). available at: <http://www.refworld.org/docid/51b6d0c94.html>
- Tripodi, P. (1999). *The colonial legacy in Somalia: Rome and Mogadishu: from colonial administration to Operation Restore Hope*. Springer.
- UNDP. (2012). *Strengthening Traditional Governance Systems in Somalia*. Retrieved from <https://www.undp.org/content/dam/rba/docs/Reports/UNDP-RBAP-TJ-2006-004-Strengthening%20Traditional%20Governance%20Systems%20in%20Somalia.pdf>
- United Nations. (2019). *The Role of Good Governance and the Rule of Law in Promoting Peace and Security*. Retrieved from <https://www.un.org/development/desa/financing/sites/www.un.org.development.desa.financing/files/2019-07/IssueBrief>
- World Bank. (2020). *Governance and Institutions*. Retrieved from <https://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/governance>

COMPARISON OF THE POSTCOLONIAL ELEMENTS IN THE ARROW OF GOD AND ITS TURKISH TRANSLATION WITHIN THE SCOPE OF VENUTI'S FOREIGNIZATION STRATEGY

VENUTİ'NİN YABANCILAŞTIRMA STRATEJİSİ KAPSAMINDA ARROW OF GOD ESERİNDEKİ POSTKOLONYAL UNSURLARININ VE TÜRKÇE ÇEVİRİSİNİN KARŞILAŞTIRILMASI

Yıl 4, Sayı 2, ss.54-66.

Year 4, Issue 2, pp.54-66.

Makale Türü: İnceleme Makalesi

Article Type: Review Article

Geliş Tarihi: 15.05.2024

Submitted: 15.05.2024

Kabul Tarihi: 30.07.2024

Accepted: 30.07.2024

DOI: 10.58851/africana.1484537

Atf Bilgisi / Reference Information

Ağün, Y. (2024). Comparison of the Postcolonial Elements in the Arrow of God and its Turkish Translation Within the Scope of Venuti's Foreignization Strategy, *Africana Dergisi*, 4 (2), 54-66.

<https://doi.org/10.58851/africana.1484537>

Yaşar AĞGÜN

Arş. Gör., İzmir Ekonomi Üniversitesi, yasar.akgun@ieu.edu.tr,
ORCID: 0000-0002-8728-2615

Abstract

Postcolonial literature has emerged as a significant field in recent decades, sparking exploration across various disciplines, notably in translation studies. Translation within the context of postcolonial literature involves assessing decisions made in the light of resistance against colonial cultural impositions. This has led to the development of postcolonial translation as a burgeoning area within translation studies. Chinua Achebe, a pivotal figure in postcolonial literature, has produced seminal works characterized by linguistic elements that challenge conventional norms, deliberately incorporating the "foreign" elements within ostensibly "fully English" texts. This essay primarily aims to examine the foreignization strategy proposed by Lawrence Venuti by comparing original texts with their Turkish translations, particularly those by Nazan Arıbaş Erbil. Through this analysis, the extent to which Erbil's translations maintain the foreignizing effect of the original texts will be explored. By scrutinizing linguistic decisions within the context of postcolonial literature and translation, this study seeks to shed light on the complexities and nuances of cross-cultural communication and the preservation of linguistic identity in translated works. Ultimately, the research aims to provide a deeper understanding of the translator's role in postcolonial literature and the implications of their decisions on cross-cultural communication and the preservation of linguistic identity in order to ensure an awareness.

Keywords: Chinua Achebe, Postcolonial literature, Translation, Lawrence Venuti, Foreignization, Arrow of God.

Öz

Sömürge sonrası Afrika edebiyatı son yıllarda mühim bir araştırma konusu hüviyetini kazanmış ve bununla beraber farklı alandaki birçok araştırmayı da mümkün kılmıştır. İrdelendiği önemli bir çalışma alanı da çeviribilim olarak karşımıza çıkmaktadır. Kolonileştirici kültürel unsurlara karşı postkolonyal direnç amacıyla ışık tutulan tercüme ile ilgili kararların değerlendirildiği bir alan oluşturan sömürgecilik sonrası çeviribilim çalışmaları, çeviribilim çalışmalarında önu açık ve gelişen bir alan olarak ortaya çıkmaktadır. Öyle ki, son zamanlarda bu alanda pek çok eser kaleme alınarak, Batı'nın sömürge kavramını deneyimlemek zorunda kalan toplumların kolonileşme sürecine direnirken gerçekleştirdikleri entelektüel girişimler irdelenmiş ve bugünkü sömürge sonrası çeviribilim çalışmalarının da büyük bir paydaşı olduğu yeni bir külliyyat yaratılmıştır. Bu kapsamda, postkolonyal edebiyatın önde gelen figürü olarak kabul edilen Chinua Achebe, şüphesiz ki postkolonyal dil öğelerini içeren kilit bасыpıtlar kaleme almıştır ve bu eserler, okuyucuların bilinçli bir şekilde "yabancı" bırakılan dil kararlarını "tamamen İngilizce" bir metinde görmelerini sağlar. Kural olarak tamamıyla doğru ve akıcı bir İngilizce kullanan Achebe, metnine yerleştirdiği kendi kültürüne özgü kullanımlar ve kültürel ifadelerle sömürgecinin dili olan İngilizcede adeta yeni delikler açmakta ve bu sayede kendi kültürü önüne çekilen perdeyi aşarak Batı "medeniyeti" altında sessizleştirilen toplumların sesini duyurmaktadır. Bu nedenle, bu makalede, Lawrence Venuti'nin önerdiği yabancılaştırma stratejisine dayanarak, orijinal metindeki kararlar ile Nazan Arıbaş Erbil'in Türkçe çevirisi karşılaştırılacak ve Türkçe çevirisinin hedef metinde ne ölçüde aynı yabancılaştırma etkisini sağladığı anlaşılmasına çalışılacaktır.

Anahtar kelimeler: Chinua Achebe, sömürge sonrası Afrika edebiyatı, çeviribilim, Venuti, yabancılaştırma.

STRUCTURED ABSTRACT

The emergence of postcolonial literature as a prominent field in recent years has spurred interdisciplinary exploration, particularly within translation studies. In this context, translation in postcolonial literature involves evaluating decisions against colonial cultural impositions, giving rise to the burgeoning area of postcolonial translation within translation studies. Chinua Achebe, a pivotal figure in postcolonial literature, is known for producing seminal works that challenge conventional linguistic norms by intentionally incorporating "foreign" elements into ostensibly "fully English" texts. The deliberate use of native language elements and cultural references within Achebe's English prose serves to disrupt the colonial narrative and assert the value and richness of African cultures. This approach has influenced many scholars and translators, prompting a deeper examination of how language and culture intersect in postcolonial contexts.

This essay delves into the foreignization strategy proposed by Lawrence Venuti by comparing original texts with their Turkish translations, particularly those by Nazan Arıbaşı Erbil. Venuti's foreignization strategy advocates for retaining the foreignness of the source text to challenge the dominant cultural norms of the target language, thereby promoting a more authentic and respectful representation of the original culture. Through this comparative analysis, it seeks to assess the extent to which Erbil's translations maintain the foreignizing effect of the original texts. By scrutinizing linguistic decisions within the context of postcolonial literature and translation, this study aims to illuminate the intricacies of cross-cultural communication and the preservation of linguistic identity in translated works. A critical aspect of this analysis is understanding the specific techniques used by Erbil to retain the cultural essence of Achebe's works in the Turkish context. The comparison reveals shared literary patterns and purposes between Achebe and Erbil, indicating Erbil's successful pursuit of maintaining the postcolonial sensitivity in the target text. The Turkish translation is rich with Igbo-based patterns, embodying the postcolonial sentiments conveyed by the author, thus retaining its postcolonial status through the process of integrating cultural elements into Turkish. This method involves the strategic choice of words, phrases, and structures that mirror the original Igbo influences, ensuring that the translated text resonates with the same cultural depth and significance as the original.

The foreignization strategy employed appears to have effectively replicated the original effect in Turkish, prompting readers to recognize the origins of the text within the Igbo culture. This recognition not only enhances the reader's understanding of the cultural context but also encourages a deeper appreciation of the diversity and complexity inherent in postcolonial literature. Notably, both Achebe and Erbil employ similar techniques, with Achebe translating proverbs and idioms literally and employing calque technique for local names of foods, songs, and places. Erbil follows suit, adhering to the literary purpose of the author to unveil the African reality beneath the English-written text, accentuated by local usages. This alignment in translation techniques underscores their shared commitment to bridging cultural divides and preserving the authenticity of the source text, a fundamental goal in postcolonial translation practices. It is unsurprising that Achebe and Erbil share commonalities, as Achebe, being a postcolonial writer, also serves as a performing translator who amplifies the suppressed voices of his nation. His works often reflect a conscious effort to confront and counteract the cultural erasure imposed by colonialism, making translation a vital tool in his literary arsenal. Erbil, in her role as a translator for both Achebe and the nation, prioritizes foreignization over domestication, aligning with Achebe's approach to translation and his commitment to representing the silenced voices of his culture. This priority not only preserves the integrity of Achebe's narrative but also enhances the Turkish readership's exposure to and understanding of Igbo culture, fostering a greater sense of global cultural awareness.

In conclusion, the collaboration between Achebe and Erbil exemplifies the symbiotic relationship between author and translator, both dedicated to transcending linguistic and cultural barriers to convey the richness of postcolonial narratives. Through their shared commitment to foreignization, they ensure the preservation of linguistic and cultural authenticity, thereby amplifying the voices of the marginalized and reclaiming agency in the face of colonial hegemony. Their work highlights the importance of translation as a form of cultural preservation and resistance, underscoring its role in the broader postcolonial struggle for identity and self-representation. This study not only sheds light on the translation practices in postcolonial literature but also emphasizes the transformative power of literature in bridging cultural divides and fostering mutual understanding. In essence, the efforts of Achebe and Erbil underscore the potential of literature and translation to act as vehicles for cultural dialogue and resistance, promoting a more inclusive and diverse literary landscape.

By examining the nuanced strategies employed in these translations, this essay contributes to a greater understanding of how translators can navigate the complexities of cultural differences while remaining faithful to the spirit and intent of the original text. This analysis serves as a valuable resource for scholars, translators, and readers interested in the dynamic interplay between language, culture, and literature in postcolonial contexts. Ultimately, the study of Achebe's works and their translations into Turkish offers a compelling example of how literature can transcend linguistic boundaries and foster a deeper appreciation of cultural diversity, challenging readers to engage with and understand perspectives beyond their own.

Introduction

Throughout the years, colonizing powers have assumed the role of democracy/humanity distributors with the disguised intention of exploiting the natural and cultural sources of the targeted colonized territories. In order for the colonizers to be able to actualise their pre-contemplated plans, it has necessitated for them to apply several strategies and actions. These strategies and actions may, as witnessed in the history, encapsulate a wide scope of harm, permeating to the all aspects of the domestic human life in the targeted territory. Although there appear to be many deeds, the cultural and linguistic heritage of the domestic territories are not exempt from the scope of harmed notions. Indeed, literature and language might be asserted to have been the most aimed cultural aspects of the colonized territories. The colonizers have perceived the linguistic hegemony as a must to eradicate the accumulated cultural heritage commonly shared by the domestics, so that literary and religious traditions can be derailed. Therefore, imperial powers have accustomed to putting their native language in force so that the native people might be inculcated with the deluded and distorted realities. Deeming the necessity of indoctrinating the native into the delusion that the external force's cultural superiority is indeed a crystallized reality, the imperials' linguistic usages ought to be embraced. The use of the colonizers' languages does not only serve for the aspired cultural-wipe out and integrating the new one but also for cornering them to the confined linguistic barriers. The colonized natives who find themselves linguistically confined to the colonizers' languages are destined to suffer from the lack of cultural collective mindset in order to voice and challenge. With their native languages replaced by the colonizers' and cultures' being ripped away only to be reconstructed by the external one, the colonized natives end up in a double-suppressed situation in which any action to overcome the scaffolded cultural barriers is doomed to fade away. However, as the years have elapsed, scholars, critics and intellectuals who have blossomed up in a double-suppressed situation have engineered several strategies and approaches in order to overcome the strains under which the colonial experiences and the intellectual capacities of the natives have been silenced. Postcolonial literature might be stated to have a unique position in all the constituted intellectual movements by the scholars who have come through the colonialism. Postcolonial literature basically stands for all the collective literary works penned after the colonial process when it was at its climax. Harboring its unique characteristics, it is marked by the tension between the content written in English and the cultural-specific linguistic usages left in the native language of the colonized. Sprinkling the forgotten culture-specific elements into the silenced language, postcolonial

literature aims at revivifying and recalling the colonized peoples' cultural heritages. Within this scope, Chinua Achebe is one of the leading figures of the movement with his many masterpieces taking the colonial issue as their main theme. Having been born in the colonized tribe and educated in a Western world, Achebe mediates between two distinct worlds and cultures, yet, rather than rejecting the influence of these two different worlds on him, he attempts to melt them in the same pot, creating an art of his own (Gikandi, 1991). Achebe makes use of his accumulated cultural knowledge extracted out from two different cultures, which makes his works valuable. As Gikandi (1991) puts it:

Achebe is read and discussed more than any other African novelist, and his works have come to constitute important interpretative spaces in the critique of the colonial and postcolonial situation in Africa and in the continuing quest for postcolonial esthetic (p.29).

Scrutinized from different angles due to their stratified and rich contents, his masterpieces have been analysed in translation studies while mentioning the foreignization and domestication strategies. When perceived as a way of resistance to the colonizers, different strategies and approaches have come to be discussed. One of the most-addressed strategies seems to be foreignization strategy which was first crystallized by Schleiermacher and later on developed and enriched by Lawrence Venuti who has predicated the concept of foreignization on imperialism-related issues. Although Venuti has elaborated on foreignization strategy and tackled the issue in a much detailed manner, both Schleiermacher and Venuti might be stated to have considered the use of foreignization strategy in the similar perspective. That is, both scholars have one way or another thought that foreignization strategy may be utilized in order to enrich the target language with the unlike yet constructive foreign linguistic and cultural usages so that the target reader and culture are to be introduced to newly-crafted and accepted foreign patterns. Indeed, Schleiermacher came up with two distinct strategies, one of which is foreignization and the other one is domestication. As a counter strategy to foreignization, domestication stands for the integration of the foreign elements into the target text through the target text's linguistic and cultural patterns. Even though Schleiermacher is the first to come up with foreignization and domestication strategy, he handled the issue in a briefly-penned essay titled "On the Different Methods of Translating". Yet, Lawrence Venuti can easily be asserted to have taken the issue to the different fronts and examined foreignization strategy through unexplored perspectives. According to Venuti, the use of domestication and foreignization strategies can differ with different purposes that can be designed and pursued in any power relations and translator's choice of either strategy can locate him/her in either a visible or invisible position. Drawing on the literary history and politics, Venuti goes on to state that the use of domestication might be preferred by imperialism-related purposes whereas the foreignization strategy can be utilized as a way of resistance to the imperialism. According to him, a source text can be well distorted or twisted and re-designed with colonial-based intentions and re-write all the cultural and linguistic patterns in a way that the source culture is not to be realised. Yet, translator might not choose to resort to domestication strategy and erase all the cultural and linguistic foreign patterns. Through foreignization, self-centered mindset of the dominant language and culture is to be violated with the implementation of the foreign and local patterns, derailing the very concept of elitist hegemony (Venuti, 1995). Source text might very well be translated in a way that the target reader can be inculcated with the thought that what is being read has actually been extracted out of a different culture and a language. Indeed, as Collins (2008) states:

A translator has the power to present the translated as a resistance to domination by pre-existing hierarchies of knowledge or to dominate the translated, and the systems of knowledge symbolized by them, through incorporating them into the knowledge systems of the target language (p. 337)

With sprinkled foreign elements, the target reader might be pushed to his/her linguistic and cultural border, bestowing him/her a chance to confront with the living culture lurking behind what has been translated. Moreover, given the fact that postcolonial writers have encountered with two distinct foreign cultures and languages of the colonized and the colonizer, they have long been perceived as postcolonial

translators. Possessing and being well-versed at two different cultures and languages, postcolonial writers can be stated to be able to reflect the transition and metamorphosis inflicted by the colonizers' imperialistic purposes. Having most of the cultural elements taken from their mother tongues at their disposal, postcolonial writers who have been subjugated to speak the colonizers' languages can blend the cultural patterns in their native language with the colonizers' language, constituting a sort of hybrid language through which a cultural bilateral transition might be ensured. This paper, thus, aims at addressing the cultural and linguistic specific usages in Achebe's book named *The Arrow of God* within the scope of Venuti's translation concepts and comparing it to its Turkish translation by Nazan Arıbaş Erbil in order to elicit to what extent the expressions in question have or not been translated.

Literature Review

Postcolonial literature has basically evolved as a reaction to the long-developed colonial literature, which has been written by the colonizers' languages. Although the colonial mindset which is valid in many European countries can not only be limited to Britain/England, English language appears to be the most-utilized language in the colonized territories. In fact, due to the forced utilization in order to make away with all the other domestic languages, English has been named as a killer language (Nemecek, 2010). It might basically be explained with the fact that Britain is recorded to have colonized most territories ever, in which the languages spoken by the indigenous have been silenced or erased. Two of the individuals' experiences, who experienced a colonial-based and English-dominated education, are shared by Semali as:

Then, I went to school, a colonial school, and this harmony was broken. The language of my education was no longer the language of my culture. (...) By the time I was in fifth grade Swahili was no longer the medium of instruction. English had taken over and Kiswahili was only a subject taught once a week. Kichagga was not to be spoken at any time and if caught speaking we were severely punished. (Macedo, 2011, p. xii)

Being subjugated to the linguistic boundaries constructed by the imperial hegemony, the domestic people have long been subject to the lack of linguistic patterns with which it is gruesome to articulate their frustrations. Postcolonial literature, likewise, has also utilized English as a medium of expression in all the masterpieces penned by its distinguished authors and scholars. Even though the preference displayed by the postcolonial members to use English as a medium of expression might seem as a contradiction, the logic lurking behind might be explained as the postcolonial strategy to utilize the weapon of enemy against enemy. Even there appear to be some postcolonial authors who advocate the use of local language while writing a book, the most famous one of whom is without doubt Ngugi Wa Thiong'o, who criticizes those making use of English in the sphere of postcolonial literature. In his seminal work titled *Decolonizing the Mind*, Thiong'o states that: "Some are coming round to the inescapable conclusion that African literature can only be written in African languages" (Thiong'o, 1986, p.27). Yet, these opposite voices seem to have not acquired the upper-hand against English-preferring postcolonial authors. Given that speaking and writing in English enables authors to access to a wider range of readers, postcolonial authors seem to prefer English in order to get their voices resonated with wider audience. Moreover, postcolonial writers are known to sprinkle culture specific usages which have been previously rampant in the colonized culture, the main reason of which is to remind the reader of the subjugated and silenced culture underpinning the whole work. However, the accentuated culture specific usages tend to be written not in English but in the native language of the postcolonial author, so that the colonizer language is to be penetrated with the colonized language which pierces through with all the native characteristics of the language such as proverb, idiom and songs. Although there are many postcolonial authors claiming that the African literature can only be written in the African languages (Michelman, 1995), many authors like Achebe favors the use of English as a way of challenging the colonizers' mindsets. For instance, Chinua Achebe, as one of the most prominent postcolonial authors, is known with his well-esteemed books in which highly-integrated postcolonial linguistic patterns might be grasped. Indeed, Achebe himself claims that it is the use of English itself that gives postcolonial works their subversive power (Gikandi, 1991). He basically blends English

with his native Igbo language through the use of proverbs, idioms, songs and all the other verbally-conveyed expressions (Alhammad, 2011). Achebe does not seem to be hesitant to address the importance of idioms and proverbs not only in his own books but also in the whole Igbo culture and language. According to him, among the Igbo the art of conversation is regarded very highly and proverbs are the palm-oil with which words are eaten (Achebe, 1958). In fact, Achebe seems to have blended the Ibo imagery in his books. (Michelman, 1995). His African Trilogy which is made of three parts as Things Fall Apart, No Longer At Ease and the Arrow of God might be demonstrated as his seminal work, in which the colonized life in the Africa is thoroughly debunked with all the realities experienced by Igbo People. In the Arrow of God, which is at the center of this paper, the narrative basically tells the story of Umuari territory which is constituted with six different tribes with the intention of protecting the indigenous people from the external forces. Ezeulu, who is portrayed as the leader of the united tribes assumes the role of the supreme leader, making nearly all the significant decisions in Umuaru (Zahid, 2021). He is surprisingly portrayed as not someone holding a grudge against the British. To the contrary, he appears to be trying to comprehend the lifestyle and mindset of the colonizers. Yet, after being offered the position of designated official leader of Umuari by Britain, he turns the offer down which triggers a set of unfortunate events between the representatives of Umuari and Britain. In the Arrow of God, Achebe addresses the collapse, the comprehension predicated on prejudice and the vulnerability of the society (Avcu,2019). What makes the Arrow of God an essential work to internalize the postcolonial linguistic patterns portrayed by Achebe is the fact that it is predominantly marked with native poems, festivals, proverbs, idioms and domestic characteristics (Avcu, 2019). It might be stated that the quotidian life is portrayed in a detailed manner. In the same manner as proverbs, folklore stories incorporated by Achebe into the novel are very significant discursive elements in developing an alternative discourse to that of the colonizer (Salami & Tabari 2018, p.23). Reflecting the culture specific expressions with their natural surroundings and usages in a completely English-written book metamorphoses the colonial English language obligation into a space in which the author pierces through. As Zahid (2021) puts it forward:

The Arrow of God has become a major breakthrough in the socio-economic and cultural milieu of Africa as a vivid illustration of the voice and awareness created by the recovery of subconscious and troubled Africans in times of historical crisis (p.71)

Throughout the book, Achebe seems to have conveyed many culture specific expressions which are not translated in English even though the whole book is written in English. Given the fact that many postcolonial authors resort to untranslated native expressions in order to force the reader to conclude the fact that there is a silenced culture lurking behind the English text, Achebe's choices do hardly come as a surprise. Okuroğlu and Başkale (2019) state that:

He [Achebe] presents some words or proverbs in Igbo language to response the false accusations of white nations' descriptions of the colonial subjects as not having a proper language or culture of their own. It is obvious that Achebe uses English as a tool to show the underestimated existence of history, cultural values and strong sense of identity in Igbo society. (p.90)

The mentioned use of proverbs, idioms, songs and all the traditional elements carry the past cultural heritage of the ancestors of the Igbo people, clarifying the fact that the indigenous people also possess a clustered set of unique habits and cultures which have come to be solid and unified until the arrival of the colonists. Although the newcomers assume the superiority of English language and culture, Achebe essays to convey the message that what constitutes a culture is not an imported one but actually the valid one which is culturally and historically transmitted from generation to generation. For instance, on the use of many proverbs in Achebe's books, Alhammad (2011) claims that "proverbs are used to summarise and preserve ancestral wisdom. Achebe uses them to show the cultural background of the Igbo people before the arrival of colonisation." (p.37). Not only proverbs, idioms and songs but also the time expressions, semantic and collocational shifts in the Igbo language are present in the books of Achebe, which eventually

makes Achebe himself a translator who chooses to render which usages in English and which in Igbo (Altıntaş, 2015). As mentioned at the beginning of the literature review, Achebe's African Trilogy consists of three books, *Things Fall Apart*, *No Longer at Ease* and *Arrow of God*. Surprisingly, a detailed literature review would reveal the fact that whereas the first two books have been thoroughly studied in the field of translation before, handling their translation into Turkish, Arabic and French (see Altıntaş, 2015; Alhammad, 2011; Anyabuike, 2017), *Arrow of God* remains unaddressed. In the rest of the paper, *Arrow of God* is to be tackled with its Turkish translation within the scope of Venuti's foreignization strategy, thus, aspiring to contribute to the research vacuum present in Achebe's Trilogy.

Methodology

In this paper, qualitative research methodology has been adopted (Saldanha & O'Brien, pp. 188-194, 2013; Heigham & Croker, pp. 45-134, 2009). The original book titled "Arrow of God" written by Achebe has been compared to its Turkish translation titled "Tanrının Oku" and translated by Nazan Arıbaş Erbil. In order to scrutinize to what extent the translator has chosen to translate the culture-specific patterns such as idioms, proverbs, songs and names with foreignization strategy (Venuti, 1995), the targeted cultural patterns in the source text have been compared to their Turkish translations. Thus, a comprehensive textual analysis has been executed. For the sake of the reliability of the research, all of the proverbs and idioms have been included into the process with their Turkish translations. Following the comparison process, the chosen sentences have been inserted into the table (see: Table 1) with their Turkish translations next to them. Furthermore, songs and names have been analysed in different table (see: Table 2) in order to differentiate different methods applied while translating idioms, proverbs and songs, names.

Findings and Discussion

Since this paper's aim is to scrutinize to what extent Turkish translator has utilized the foreignization techniques, two different techniques seem to come to the fore when the source and target text are compared, one of which is literal translation and another one is calque. According to Vinay and Darbelnet, literal translation and calque might be regarded and included within the concept of foreignization (Munday, 2001). Throughout the book, between 46-50 domestic proverbs and idioms are used (Table.1). As discussed at the beginning of the paper, Achebe's literary style necessitates the usages of domestic cultural patterns in order to permeate his subjugated and silenced culture to the colonizer's language, that is, English. Indeed, a Nigerian writer Gabriel Okara states (1969) that:

A writer can use the idioms of his own language in a way that is understandable in English. If he uses their equivalents, he would not be expressing African ideas and thoughts, but English ones. (p.15-16)

Thus, it would not be improper to state that Achebe's literary style seems to be nested with the concept of foreignization, given that foreignization stands for the attempt to utilize the local elements in order to constitute a difference in the target language (Venuti, 1995). When the proverbs and idioms in question are compared to their Turkish translation, it has been observed that all of them have been translated with literal translation strategy, in a word for word method. Although some of the addressed proverbs and idioms have their Turkish equivalences in the language, the Turkish translator seems to have abided by Achebe's literary purpose and reflected the foreignness of the Igbo culture by not having chosen to go for their Turkish equivalences. Therefore, Turkish equivalence of any proverbs or idioms has not been located in the Turkish translation.

Table.1

If the lizard of the homestead neglects to do the things for which its kind is known, it will be mistaken for the lizard of the farmland. (p.7) ¹	Evin kertenkelesi, türünün yaptığı bilinen şeyleri ihmal edecek olursa tarla kertenkelesi olduğu sanılır. (s.29) ²
When an adult is in the house the she-goat is not left to suffer the pains of parturition on its tether.' That is what our ancestors have said. (p.7)	Evde bir yetişkin varken, dişi keçinin ipe bağlı bir halde doğum sancısı çekmesine izin verilmez. Atalarımız böyle demiştir. (s.29)
When we hear a house has fallen do we ask if the ceiling fell with it? (p.9)	Bir evin yıkıldığını duyduğumuzda tavanın çöktüğünü sorar mıyız?" (s.30)
When a man of cunning dies a man of cunning buries him. (p.9)	Kurnaz bir adam öldüğünde onu yine kurnaz bir adam gömer. (s.30)
We have a saying that a toad does not run in the day unless something is after it. (p.9)	Bizde bir deyiş vardır: Kurbağa, peşinde bir şey olmadığı sürece gündüz vakti koşmaz. (s.33)
The fly that has no one to advise it follows the corpse into the grave.(p.11)	Öğüt verecek kimsesi olmayan sinek ölüyü mezarına kadar takip eder. (s.40)
For when we see a little bird dancing in the middle of the pathway we must know that its drummer is in the near-by bush. (p.17)	Nitekim yolun ortasında dans eden küçük bir kuş gördüğümüzde, davulcusunun yakındaki çalılıkta olduğundan emin olabiliirdik. (s.57)
The inquisitive monkey gets a bullet in the face. (p.19)	Meraklı maymun yüzüne mermiyi yermiş.(s.61)
Unless the wind blows we do not see the fowl's rump. (p.25)	Rüzgar esmedikçe tavuğun kıcını görmüyoruz. (s.80)
A man who brings home ant-infested faggots should not complain if he is visited by lizards."(p.25)	Rüzgar esmedikçe tavuğun kıcını görmüyoruz. (s.80)
A man who brings home ant-infested faggots should not complain if he is visited by lizards. (p.25)	Eve karıncalarla dolu çalı çırpı getiren bir adam, kertenkelelerin gelmesinden yakınmamalı. (s.81)
But we have a saying that the very thing which kills mother rat prevents its little ones from opening their eyes. (p.25)	Ama bizde bir deyiş vardır: Anne fareyi öldüren şey, çocuklarının gözlerini açmasına engel olur. (s.82)
A man who knows that his anus is small does not swallow an udala seed. (p.30)	Anüsünün küçük olduğunu bilen bir adam udala çekirdeği yutmaz. (s.94)
The man who sends a child to catch a shrew will also give him water to wash his hand. (p.30)	Çocuğu fare yakalamaya gönderen adam elini yıkaması için ona su da verecektir. (s.94)
Did you expect what the leopard sired to be different from the leopard? (p.32)	Leopar soyundan gelenin leopardan farklı olacağını mı sanıyordun? (s.98)
But only a foolish man can go after a leopard with his bare hands. (p.36)	Ama ancak aptal bir adam bir leoparı çıplak elle kovalar. (s.111)
The death that will kill a man begins as an appetite. (p.38)	Bir adamı öldürecek olan ölüm, iştah uyandıran bir hevesle başlar. (s.116)
Tıpkı kendisi gibi davranan bir arkadaşın peşine düşen kişi,	That if a man sought for a companion who acted

¹ The version of Arrow of God analysed in this paper is an electronic version in which the font type and size differ than the printed version. Therefore, there might seem a page gap between the source text column and the Turkish translation column, given that the Turkish translation analysed here is a printed version. For the electronic version see: <https://kcepdf.co.ke/?s=arrow+of+god>

² In this column where the culture specific words are portrayed, there has not been any page reference inserted given that Achebe utilizes these word repetitively throughout the book.

yalnız kalmaya mahkumdu. (s.121)	entirely like himself he would live in solitude. (p.39)
Yemek pişirmeye diğerinden daha önce başlamış bir kadının illa ki daha fazla kap kakak kırmış olduğunu unutuyorsunuz. (s.129)	Woman who began cooking before another must have more broken utensils. (p.42)
Yaşlı bir kadının dans ederken durup aynı yeri parmağıyla ardı ardına gösterdiğini gördüğümüzde orada bir yerde uzun süre önce hayatının köklerine temas eden bir şey yaşandığından emin olabilirsiniz. (s.129)	When we see an old woman stop in her dance to point again and again in the same direction we can be sure that somewhere there something happened long ago which touched the roots of her life. (p.42)
Büyük bir adamın evinde hangi melodiyi çalarsan çal, onunla dans edecek biri mutlaka çıkacaktır. (s.129)	Whatever tune you play in the compound of a great man there is always someone to dance to it. (p.42)
Greeting in the cold harmattan is taken from the fireside. (s.48)	Soğuk harmattan mevisiminde selam ocaktan alınır. (s.145)
A man who visits a craftsman at work finds a sullen host. (s.48)	Bir ustayı işiyle uğraşırken ziyaret eden bir adam, sıkıcı bir ev sahibiyile karşılaşır. (s.145)
The lizard who threw confusion into his mother's funeral rite did he expect outsiders to carry the burden of honouring his dead? (p.53)	Annesinin cenaze törenini mahveden kertenkele, yabancıların ölüsüne saygı gösterme zahmetine girmesine bekleyebilir miydi? (s.160)
The offspring of a hawk cannot fail to devour chicks. (p.54)	Bir atmacanın yavrularından piliçleri yiyip yutmalarını beklenemez. (s.163)
When two brothers fight a stranger reaps their harvest. (p.56)	İki kardeş kavga ettiğinde hasadı bir yabancı toplar. (s.167)
A man who has nowhere else to put his hand for support puts it on his own knee. (p.56)	Bir adamın destek almak için elini koyabileceği hiçbir yeri yoksa kendi dizine koyar” derken bunu kastetmişlerdir. (s.170)
No matter how many spirits plotted a man's death it would come to nothing unless his personal god took a hand in the deliberation. (p.57)	Bir adamın ölümünü kaç ruh planlamış olursa olsun kişisel tanrısı bu karara katılmadığı sürece hiçbir işe yaramaz. (s.173)
A snake is never as long as the stick to which we liken its length. (p.57)	Bir yılan asla boyunu kıyasladığımız sopa kadar uzun değildir. (s.173)
If you thank a man for what he has done he will have strength to do more. (p.60)	Bir adama yaptığı şeyden dolayı teşekkür edersen daha fazlasını yapam gücü bulacaktır (s.180)
Unless the penis dies young it will surely eat bearded meat. (p.60)	Penis vakitsiz ölmedikçe sakallı et yiyeceği kesindir. (s.180)
As soon as we shake hands with a leper he will want an embrace? (p.61)	Bir cüzzamıyla el sıkıştığımız anda sizinle kucaklamak ister (s.182)
Until a man wrestles with one of those who make a path across his homestead the others will not stop (p.67)	Bir adam evinden yol geçirmeye kalkanlardan biriyle güreşene dek diğerleri durmazdı. (s.201)
Every lizard lies on its belly, so we cannot tell which has a bellyache.”(p.71)	Bütün kertenkeleler karnlarının üstüne yatar, o yüzden hangisinin karnı ağrısı çektiğini bilemeyiz. (s.214)
We are like the puppy in the proverb which attempted to answer two calls at once and broke its jaw. (p.77)	Atasözünde geçen, aynı anda iki çağrıya cevap vereyim derken çenesi ni kuran o köpek yavrusu gibi olduk. (s.235)
The noise even of the loudest events must begin to die down by the second market week. (p.80)	En fazla gürültü koparan olayların sesi bile ikinci Pazar haftasının sonunda illa ki yatışırdı. (s.241)
When a handshake passes the elbow it becomes another thing. The sleep that lasts from one market day to another has	Bir tokalaşma dirseği geçtiğinde başka bir şey olur. Bir Pazar gününden diğerine dek süren uyku ölümüne

<p>become death. The man who likes the meat of the funeral ram, why does he recover when sickness visits him? The mighty tree falls and the little birds scatter in the bush... . The little bird which hops off the ground and lands on an anthill may not know it but is still on the ground... . A common snake which a man sees all alone may become a python in his eyes... . The very Thing which kills Mother Rat is always there to make sure that its young ones never open their eyes... . The boy who persists in asking what happened to his father before he has enough strength to avenge him is asking for his father's fate... . The man who belittles the sickness which Monkey has suffered should ask to see the eyes which his nurse got from blowing the sick fire... . When death wants to take a little dog it prevents it from smelling even excrement" (p.93)</p>	<p>dönüşür. Cenaze yemeğindeki et yemeğinden hoşlanan adam, hastalık onu ziyaret ettiğinde neden iyileşir? Heybetli ağaç devrilince küçük kuşlar çalılığa kaçar. Yerden havalanıp karınca yuvasına konan küçük kuş belki farkında değildir ama hala yerdedir. Bir adamın tek başınayken gördüğü sıradan bir yılan onun gözüne piton yılanı gibi görünebilir. Anne fareyi öldüren şey, çocuklarının gözlerini asla açmamalarını garanti etmek için hep oradadır. İntikamını alacak denli güçlenmeden önce babasına ne olduğunu ısrarla sormaya devam eden çocuk, babasının kaderini çağırır. Maymunun yakalandığı hastalığı küçümseyen adam, hasta ateşini üfleyen bakıcısının gözlerine bakmalıdır. Ölüm, küçük bir köpeği almak istediğinde dışkının dahi kokusunu almasına engel olur. (s.282)</p>
--	--

Achebe, who appears to be quite successful at conveying the foreignness and uniqueness of his domestic Igbo culture, does not limit the cultural patterns to the proverbs and idioms and rather makes use of the place, food and song names found in the mother tongue spoken in Igbo culture. It is to be noted that postcolonial writers do also operate as translators, mediating between their silenced mother tongue and silencer English. Thus, even though Achebe translates proverbs and idioms found in Igbo culture with literal translation technique and writes them in English in a word for word method, he chooses to leave local song, food and place names written in Igbo language in a book, rest of which is written in English. It has been underlined before that postcolonial writers tend to resort to this approach quite often. Thus, it might be stated that these Igbo-written cultural patterns are translated with a calque strategy by Achebe. When their Turkish translations are taken into the consideration, it is seen that these Igbo-written usages have been left as is in the Turkish translation. The translator might be claimed to have preferred the calque strategy while rendering the mentioned Igbo-written patterns. These Igbo-written patterns are to be seen in Table 2. It ought to be mentioned that there is not any next-to-next translation section added in the below-demonstrated table given that translator has not done any translation rather than leaving the patterns as is.

Table.2

<i>Ozo</i>	<i>Obi</i>	<i>Afu-uzo</i>	<i>Ewo-okwo</i>
<i>Kome</i>	<i>Ogene</i>	<i>Iga</i>	<i>Ike-agwu-ani</i>
<i>Lebula toro toro</i>	<i>Onwa Atuo</i>	<i>Dibia</i>	<i>ogbazulobodo</i>
<i>Ego-neli</i>	<i>Alusi</i>	<i>Manila</i>	<i>Ekwe-ogbazulobodo</i>
<i>Kwo Kwo Kwo Kwo Kwo</i>	<i>Ofo</i>	<i>Onwa atu o-o-o</i>	<i>Ayaka</i>
<i>Ofo</i>	<i>Ikenga</i>	<i>Icheku</i>	<i>Ugoli</i>
<i>Iroko</i>	<i>Nno</i>	<i>Udala</i>	<i>Oso mgbada bu nugwu</i>
<i>Ani-Mmo</i>	<i>Kwenu</i>	<i>Arigbe</i>	
<i>Eze</i>	<i>Hem</i>	<i>Utazi</i>	
<i>Aru-Mmo</i>	<i>Nkwo</i>	<i>Ilo</i>	

<i>Nje-Nje</i>	<i>Eke</i>	<i>Onye ebuna uzo cho ayi okwu</i>
<i>Ifeoma</i>	<i>Ebenebe</i>	<i>Okwolo</i>
<i>Otimili</i>	<i>Nna Doh</i>	<i>Nwosi</i>
<i>Jigida</i>	<i>Chi</i>	<i>Eke nekwo onye uka</i>
<i>Egusi</i>	<i>Ngwu</i>	<i>Fiam</i>
<i>Asa</i>	<i>Ojukwu</i>	<i>Alo</i>
<i>Omu</i>	<i>Ajo Mmo</i>	<i>Ntu-nanya-mili</i>
<i>Ege nano</i>	<i>Okwe</i>	<i>Ego-nato</i>
<i>Ja Ja, Kulo Kulo</i>	<i>Nkwu</i>	<i>Ego nese</i>
<i>Okeakpa</i>	<i>E-e Nwaka Dimkplo</i>	<i>Ebunu</i>
<i>Afa</i>	<i>Nzu</i>	<i>Okra</i>
<i>Fim</i>	<i>Ukwa</i>	<i>Icheku</i>
<i>İchi</i>	<i>Ogalu</i>	<i>Ugani</i>
<i>Ndichie</i>	<i>Uli</i>	<i>Afa</i>
<i>İkolo</i>	<i>Ogbu</i>	<i>Ogulu-aro</i>
<i>Nte</i>	<i>Ugonachomma</i>	<i>Nte</i>
<i>Anwansi</i>	<i>Oti-anyia</i>	<i>Ekpili</i>

Conclusion

It ought to be stated that postcolonial literature encapsulates a wide range of books whose content and narrative are unique and enriched due to patterns visible in the intersection of two cultures. Blending the patterns of two cultures can hardly be envisioned without taking the issue of language into account. Therefore, the language issue has come to be discussed widely within the scope of postcolonial literature. Achebe, who happens to be one of the most prominent authors of the field, has written many pieces in which the harmony of two cultures and languages is ensured, thus, presenting a possible research field for the scholars working in the field of translation studies. Arrow of God, written by Achebe, appears to be one of the deepest works penned by him, harbouring both the African and English cultural patterns whose usages and frequency are well-calibrated in accordance with the postcolonial aims of the author. Yet, translators, as mediators between the ideologically-operating postcolonial authors and innocent readers, are of utmost importance in the African and postcolonial literature in the process of what and how to translate. Thus, a precise research delving into the translator's strategies in one of the prominent works of the leading postcolonial literature figure seems to be a vacuum requiring to be filled. As a result of the comparison conducted here, it is to be seen both the author Achebe and the translator Erbil share the same literary patterns and purposes to pursue. Given that a translator is – if otherwise dictated/determined-responsible for pursuing or achieving the same purpose as the author, Erbil might be stated to have accomplished her task of ensuring the same postcolonial sensitivity in the target text. Since the Turkish text is embedded with abundant Igbo-based patterns that embody the postcolonial feelings conveyed by the authors, the Turkish translation can be claimed to have been properly translated without losing its postcolonial status through the process of domesticating the cultural elements into the Turkish. Foreignization strategy seems to have provided what all needed to constitute the same effect in Turkish. All these techniques that ensure the usage of cultural patterns, prompt the reader to notice that what is being read has actually been produced out of the living yet silenced, unique but subjugated culture, that is, Igbo

culture. What happens to be more striking is the fact that the Turkish translator seems to have preferred the same techniques applied by Achebe while writing his book and mediating between two distinct cultures. Achebe, who translated the proverbs and idioms with literal translation, seems to have applied calque technique while translating the local names of the foods, songs and places. Likewise, the Turkish translator, Nazan Arıbaş Erbil seems to have clung to the literary purpose of the author in order to reveal the African reality lurking behind the English-written book with some holes formed by the local usages. Therefore, for the proverbs and idioms translated with literal translation by Achebe have been translated with the same technique while local names translated with calque by Achebe have been translated with calque by Nazan Arıbaş Erbil. Yet, it ought to not come as a surprise that the author and the translator have so many things in common, given that as a postcolonial writer, Achebe is also a performing translator who translates and voices the unspoken words suppressed by the colonizers. Achebe is a translator for his Nation. Erbil, on the other hand, is a translator for both Achebe and the Nation, yet, so long as she prioritizes foreignization over domestication.

REFERENCES

- Achebe, C. (2016) *Arrow of god*. New York, NY: Penguin Books.
- Achebe, C. (1989) *No longer at ease*. Oxford: Heinemann.
- Achebe, C. (2021) *Things fall apart*. Vancouver, B.C.: Langara College.
- Alhammad, S. (2011) 'Usage of Domestication and Foreignization in Arabic Translation Of China Achebe's Things Fall Apart', University of Salvord [Preprint], 37-38.
- Anyabuike, C. (2017) 'Foreignization and Domestication as Strategies in Translation and the Translation of Chinua Achebe's Things Fall Apart into French', *Journal of Social Sciences Review* [Preprint].
- Avcu, İ. (2019). Chinua Achebe'nin Afrika Üçlemesi: Parçalanma, Artık Huzur Yok, Tanrının Oku'nda Kültür ve Kimlik. *Atatürk Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi*, 23(1), 195-210.
- Gikandi, S. (1991) "Chinua Achebe and the Post-colonial Esthetic: Writing, Identity, and National Formation," *Studies in 20th Century Literature: Vol. 15: Iss. 1, Article 4*, 29-30 <http://dx.doi.org/10.4148/2334-4415.1263>
- Munday, J., (2001) 'Introducing translation studies: Theories and application' .London and New York: 23. Newmark, P., 1988. *A textbook of translation*. New
- Nemecek, R. (2010) 'The Role of English as a Colonial Tool Through the Ages - With an Especial Accent on Africa', Tomas Bata University [Preprint].
- Okuroğlu Özün, Ş., & Başkale, N. (2019). The Distortion of Cultural Identity in Chinua Achebe's Things Fall Apart. *Trakya Üniversitesi Edebiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, 9(18), 90-91. <https://doi.org/10.33207/trkede.597888>
- Okara, G. (1963) "African Speech, English Words." *Transition* 3.10. p. 15-16. *The Voice*. New York: Africana.
- Salami, A & Tabari, B. (2018). Things Fall Apart and Chinua Achebe's Postcolonial Discourse. *International Journal on Studies in English Language and Literature*. 20-23. 10.20431/2347-3134.0603004.
- Thiong'o, N. Wa (1986) *Decolonizing the mind: The politics of language in African literature*. 25-27, London: J. Currey.
- Venuti, L. *The Translator's Invisibility: A History of Translation*. 1995. Routledge.
- Zahid, S.H. (2021) 'Cultural Diversity in Igbo Life: A Postcolonial Response to Chinua Achebe's Arrow of God', *International Journal of Social Sciences*, 5(23), 70-71 doi:10.52096/usbd.5.23.5.5.

A HISTORY OF SLAVERY, RACE, AND ISLAM IN THE EYES OF CHOUKI EL HAMEL³

CHOUKİ EL HAMEL'İN GÖZÜNDEN KÖLELİK, İRK VE İSLAM TARİHİ

Yıl 4, Sayı 2, ss.67-70.

Year 4, Issue 2, pp.67-70.

Makale Türü: Kitap İncelemesi

Article Type: Book Review

Geliş Tarihi: 16.04.2024

Submitted: 16.04.2024

Kabul Tarihi: 21.07.2024

Accepted: 21.07.2024

DOI: 10.58851/africana.1469010

Atf Bilgisi / Reference Information

Eyigün, M. (2024). A History of Slavery, Race, and Islam in the Eyes of Chouki El Hamel, *Africana Dergisi*, 4 (2), 67-70. <https://doi.org/10.58851/africana.1469010>

Melek EYİGÜN

Dr., T.C. Cumhurbaşkanlığı Milli Saraylar Başkanlığı, eyigunmelek@gmail.com,
ORCID: 0000-0001-8968-7600

Abstract

"Black Morocco", written by Professor Chouki El Hamel, sheds light on the history of slavery in North Africa. It describes the enslavement of blacks, their integration into the political system in the name of Islam, and the role of male and female slaves in Moroccan history, with an emphasis on the period of Ismail Mawlay (1672-1727). The book deals with the history of slavery and racism in Morocco, which is at the centre of the intra-African enslavement policy between the north and west of the African continent, through the relations of religion, tradition and politics. The book analyses the issue of slavery within the specific political and social structure of the continent.

While "Black Morocco" reveals the reflections of a human tragedy that is thought to be a thing of the past in today's world, it also draws attention to the approach of religious scholars to slavery, race and gender issues from past to present.

The book shows that the struggle for survival of peoples whose rights to life have been restricted and who have been uprooted from their social identities can be a way and a procedure to uncover the cultural codes in their memory in order to rebuild themselves.

Keywords: North Africa, race, slave, gender, Morocco.

Öz

Profesör Chouki El Hamel tarafından kaleme alınan "Siyah Fas", Kuzey Afrika'daki kölelik tarihine ışık tutuyor. Siyahların köleleştirilmesini, İslam adına siyasi sisteme entegre edilmelerini ve kadın kölelerin Fas tarihindeki rolünü İsmail Mevlay (1672-1727) dönemine vurgu yaparak anlatıyor. Kitap, Afrika kıtasının kuzeyi ile batısı arasındaki Afrika içi köleleştirme politikasının merkezinde yer alan Fas'taki kölelik ve ırkçılık tarihini din, gelenek ve siyaset ilişkileri üzerinden ele alıyor. Kitap, kölelik meselesini kıtanın kendine özgü siyasi ve toplumsal yapısı içinde analiz ediyor.

"Siyah Fas", günümüz dünyasında geçmişte kaldığı düşünülen bir insanlık trajedisinin yansımalarını ortaya koyarken, geçmişten günümüze din âlimlerinin kölelik, ırk ve toplumsal cinsiyet konularına yaklaşımına da dikkat çekiyor.

Kitap, yaşam hakları kısıtlanan ve toplumsal kimliklerinden koparılan halkların hayatta kalma mücadelesinin, kendilerini yeniden inşa etmek için belleklerdeki kültürel kodları ortaya çıkarmanın bir yolu ve yordamı olabileceğini gösteriyor.

Anahtar kelimeler: Kuzey Afrika, ırk, köle, cinsiyet, Fas.

"Black Morocco" is a study that reveals the historical course of slavery, race and gender issues in North Africa in the context of the relationship between religion and politics. It traces the transmission of the subconscious from the past to the present. The study aims to reveal the silenced history of North African

³ Chouki El Hamel, *Black Morocco: A History of Slavery, Race, and Islam*, Cambridge University Press, 2014, 354 p.

slavery, and endeavors to reveal the demand for truth and justice of the living memory outside the official memory constructed by the power within the scope of remembering and forgetting. The author reflects his professional ethical concerns throughout the work by going beyond the historiography constructed in accordance with the modernity's understanding of history. Accordingly, he opens historical facts to discussion in the context of confronting the past and tries to present the necessity of this without pragmatic political concerns and free from prejudices.

In the introduction to the book, El Hamel presents his reasons for tackling the subject within the framework of humanitarian and emotional reasons, which not only arouses academic curiosity in the minds of the readers, but also encourages them to question human conscience and moral norms. Through a little slave girl he encounters in the house of a scholar in Mauritania, the author presents his thesis that slavery is rare but its effects are profound with the sincere warmth of a narrative beginning. He takes the reader on a journey from the footsteps of the present to the past. Thus, he increases the credibility of his thesis by establishing a logical relationship between the reliability of the source and all the data of scientific research methods.

In the first part, the author prepares the theoretical background of the subject by giving a general information about the concept of slavery before Islam and the provisions and practices related to slavery in the oldest known legal texts. He takes the Qur'an, the main text of Islam, followed by the Hadiths and the early tafsir corpus as primary sources. He states that the Qur'an and Hadiths contain provisions that create the ground for the abolition of racism, slavery and concubinage over time. He interprets the views of Islamic jurists and sectarian leaders from different periods on the subject. He then explains how the power structures that fed on these sources brought slavery, racism and concubinage to life in North Africa. He draws on a rich literature from Morocco's official state archive, local and foreign sources, travelogues and other secondary works. In order to challenge the traditional historiography of slavery in Islamic and Moroccan societies, which classifies blacks according to their genetic and physical characteristics, he sheds light on Islamic sources based on the chronological and epistemological framework and the methodology of Islamic sciences.

The book conceptually examines the religious and etymological origins of the words "race" and "slave", and questioned how they have been discussed in the historical process and in different understandings. One of the author's main arguments is that Islamic law, which claims that men have rights over the sexuality of female slaves, contradicts the Qur'anic verses on this subject. In this regard, each word in the verse is analyzed individually and a linguistic/semantic analysis is made.

While the author includes the views of Sunni teachings on slavery and the views of different sects in the early period of Islam, he also shares the views of heterodox religious sects. El Hamel's example of anti-slavery movements from Islamic history is the Kharijites, one of the generally accepted sects outside the orthodox understanding of Islam, known for their harsh interpretation of Islam and the extremism of their beliefs. He noted that the Kharijites, the first political-religious sect to emerge in the seventh century, were probably the first group to insist on the principle of social justice in the name of Islam. The author, who does not hesitate to instrumentalize different views to support his ideas in line with pragmatic goals, presents slavery in the context of racism from a broad perspective within the framework of all schools and belief groups in Islamic history.

El Hamel dates the reality of the enslavement of blacks in Africa as early as the seventh century. This may raise suspicions in the minds of readers that the author is trying to present Islamic history from a Western perspective or in a way that will convince Christians. However, the author's main objection to the enslavement of the people of the region who were defeated in the wars of the North African conquests that began in the seventh century is that the legitimacy of this practice is based on religion. El Hamel draws

attention to the paradox of the perpetuation of slavery and its traditions, which religion disapproved of and encouraged the gradual abolition of, in the name of preserving the power of the ruling power in the early Islamic conquests, which claimed to spread all the values encompassed by religion for the salvation of humanity. Author's point is reminiscent of the debates on the evolution of the purpose of the holy conquest movement, which had the mission of spreading the universal message of Islam, towards a political and commercial purpose.

From the example of Morocco, the author examines the religion-based political and social practices of enslavement movements in Islamic societies in the context of racialization. He pointed out that Islam explicitly rejects racism and argued that many commentators and Islamic jurists who interpreted the Qur'an served to legitimize the continuation of racism, not to overthrow its deep-rooted cultural prejudices. El Hamel's most important paradigm is the thesis that from the first Islamic conquests in North Africa, pre-Islamic racial prejudices were legitimized through religious arguments in order to preserve social and political order. In addition, the attempt of the political to shape the religious sphere for pragmatic reasons is revealed through the phenomena of slavery and race based on historical facts.

El Hamel presents the religious and mythological origins of the unity of the concepts of race, slavery and curse with striking anecdotes. He draws attention to the traditional and cultural structure invented through a myth. He questions the effort to associate the need for a founding mythology and tradition for the institutionalization of slavery with religion. The author strikingly demonstrates the need for a myth to legitimize the slavery of black Muslims in Islamic law, where disbelief is considered a justification for enslavement. This is an important observation that reveals the constructability of cultural collective memory and prejudices that serve to deny the black race their natural right to freedom. It is also noteworthy for revealing the fact that prejudices that harbor negative dogmatic convictions are the reasons that prepare the ideology of superiority underlying the mentality that exploits blacks as the "other".

In the second part, the author focuses on the intra-African history of slavery. He sheds light on the policies of Mawlay Isma'il through the relationship between power and religion. He also questions the role of the ulema in illegal enslavement, who were able to maintain their social and political status as long as they legitimized Mawlay Ismail's policies. He highlights the paradox of integrating the enslaved into the system by giving them an identity through Islamic rituals and rites, contrary to the message of Islam during this period.

One of the features that distinguishes this study from other studies on race and slavery in African history is the diversity of primary domestic and foreign sources on race and slavery practices during the reign of Mawlay Ismail. Within the framework of race and slavery, the book selects a meaningful example from North African society and presents the practices of slavery and concubinage in this period without detaching them from their connections in the historical process. The role of enslaved blacks in the background of power is revealed through soldiers, concubines, eunuchs and palace guards. It analyzes the role of the enslaved in the construction of future Moroccan society and politics. This approach makes the book notable for its contribution to other disciplines besides history, such as sociology, anthropology, political science, economics, and ethnographic research.

El Hamel contributes to African studies without reducing the criticisms of colonialism in different studies to anti-Westernism. Focusing on the fact that blacks were racially segregated in pre-colonial Moroccan society, he analyzes the foundations on which the colonial structures established in Africa were built. Tracing the relations of authority and exploitation in Africa, the author reveals how Westerners developed the slave trade that they found ready-made when they arrived in Africa in the fifteenth century and how they carried it across the Atlantic.

The book's examination of the claim that colonialism and the power and domination structures that developed accordingly actually have a structural context through the examples of Morocco and the West makes an important contribution to the studies in this field. The study can also be seen as important in terms of expanding the boundaries of historical knowledge on Africa. Based on the racist attitudes towards enslaved black men who were enslaved for the army during the reign of Mawlay Isma'il, as well as enslaved black women who were tasked with unlimited service to their male masters, the networks of tradition, power and masculine domination in Africa are revealed. Thus, a new perspective in understanding and narrating Africa is presented.

The practice of slavery in Morocco's history, which the author analyzes in the relationship between memory and space, is a very shocking example in terms of reflecting the paradox between the interests of Islamic society and its faith. By reconsidering African history, El Hamel opens the door for Africa to confront its own past and pushes the possibilities of a new historiography of sub-Saharan Africa. This quest leads El Hamel along the path opened by subaltern studies with the mission of healing the wounds of the past, revealing the truth, justice and sharing suffering. El Hamel's "Black Morocco", in which the courage to confront the past is revealed through Morocco, is reminiscent of Fanon's "Les Damnés de la Terre", in which he examines the exploited subalterns through France's past.

According to El Hamel, Islamic law, which consists of "male-dominated" and "male-approved" interpretations of the Qur'an and Hadith, has created a patriarchal legal discourse. El Hamel's approach to the issue is reminiscent of feminist historiography, which aims to expose the power relations between men and women, and the neglect of women in an exploitative system, which are among the basic assumptions of patriarchal thought.

The work contributes to African historiography by providing a basis for Africans to tell their own stories and connect with their own history. The book's re-problematization of the faith-based legal norms that feed the power structures and policies that are influential in the formation of African history and the previous studies in this field may bring a new perspective to the debates in this field.

Finally, the author analyzes how historical memory is embedded in the memory of subsequent generations and how it affects their lives. He shows how peoples whose rights to life have been curtailed and whose social identities have been fragmented have uncovered the cultural codes of their memory in order to rebuild themselves. Comparing the mystical music of the Gnawa people with the slave songs of America, El Hamel's book stands out among other works in this field by shedding light on the cultural legacy of slavery from a broad perspective, born out of shared suffering through the universal language of music.