



# Black Sea Journal of Public and Social Science

Volume 6 | Issue 1



ISSN: 2618 - 6640



BLACK SEA JOURNAL OF PUBLIC AND SOCIAL SCIENCE

(BSJ PUB SOC SCI)

  
**BS Journals**

Black Sea Journal of Public and Social Science (BSJ Pub Soc Sci) is a double-blind peer-reviewed, open-access international journal published electronically 2 times (January and July) in a year since January 2018. It publishes, in English and Turkish, full-length original research articles, innovative papers, conference papers, reviews, mini-reviews, rapid communications or technical note by the scientists on various aspects of both theoretical and empirical articles and case studies relating to education, sociology, political science, history, law in society and related disciplines and also covers articles on any fields of social science.

ISSN: 2618-6640

Phone: +90 362 408 25 15

Fax: +90 362 408 25 15

Email: [bsjsocsci@@blackseapublishers.com](mailto:bsjsocsci@@blackseapublishers.com)

Web site: <http://dergipark.gov.tr/bssocialscience>

Sort of publication: Periodically 2 times (January and July) in a year

Publication date and place: January 01, 2023 - Samsun, TÜRKİYE

Publishing kind: Electronically

## **EDITOR BOARDS**

### **EDITOR IN CHIEF**

Prof. Dr. İbrahim TELLİOĞLU, Ondokuz Mayıs University, TÜRKİYE

### **SECTION EDITORS\***

Prof. Dr. Aglaia (Litsa) LIOPA-TSAKALIDI, Institute of Western Greece, GREECE

Prof. Dr. Aleksandre MGHEBRISHVILI, Gori State University, GEORGIA

Prof. Dr. Anvarbek MOKEEV, Kyrgyz-Turkish Manas University, KYRGYZSTAN

Prof. Dr. Bozkurt KOÇ, Ondokuz Mayıs University, TÜRKİYE

Prof. Dr. Ferhad TURANLI, National University of Kyiv, UKRAINE

Prof. Dr. Giorgi SOSİASHVILI, Gori State University, GEORGIA

Prof. Dr. Lia AKHALADZE, Sokhumi State University, GEORGIA

Prof. Dr. Mirian MAKHARADZE, İvane Cavakhişvili Tbilisi State University, GEORGIA

Prof. Dr. Roin KARVELİSHVİLİ, İvane Cavakhişvili Tbilisi State University, GEORGIA

Prof. Dr. Zaza ŞAŞİKADZE, Shota Rustaveli State University, GEORGIA

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Akın TEMUR, Ondokuz Mayıs University, TÜRKİYE

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Burul SAGINBAYEVA, Kyrgyz-Turkish Manas University, KYRGYZSTAN

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Kakha N KVASHİLAVA, Sokhumi State University, GEORGIA

Asst. Prof. Dr. Arzu SECER, Cukurova University, TÜRKİYE

Asst. Prof. Dr. Didem ÇABUK, Suleyman Demirel University, TÜRKİYE

Dr. Ercüment YİĞİT, Marmara University, TÜRKİYE

---

\* The ranking is arranged alphabetically within the academic title

### **STATISTIC EDITOR**

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Taner TUNÇ, Ondokuz Mayıs University, TÜRKİYE

### **ENGLISH EDITOR**

Asst. Prof. Dr. Betül ÖZCAN DOST, Ondokuz Mayıs University, TÜRKİYE

### **TURKISH EDITOR**

Prof. Dr. Serkan ŞEN, Ondokuz Mayıs University, TÜRKİYE

## EDITORIAL DECLARATION

Dear authors and readers,

First of all, we would like to thank you for being our travel companion by writing, evaluating, and reading us about this broadcasting life we started six years ago. With these thoughts, we are especially thankful for researchers and academicians honoring with the articles, valuable scientists involved in editorial boards, and reviewers for their contributions to the evaluation processes through their opinions/ideas/contributions/criticisms. With this article, we wanted to inform you, our valuable stakeholders, about the development of The Black Sea Journal of Public and Social Science (BSJ Pub Soc Sci). The statistics of the BSJ Pub Soc Sci for the last five years are given below. Hope you will be with us in future issues.

Year	Articles	Cites	Cite Index*	CNA	CNC	CCI
2018	10	3	0.3	10	3	0.3
2019	14	4	0.29	24	7	0.29
2020	12	4	0.33	36	11	0.31
2021	13	23	1.77	49	34	0.69
2022	10	12	1.2	59	46	0.78

CNA= cumulative number of articles, CNC= cumulative number of cite, CCI= cumulative cite index

\*According to Scholar Google

### Rejection rate:

- 2020: 20%
- 2021: 19%
- 2022: 33%

**Average review time (days): 46**

**Average time from send to publish (days): 188**

## **REVIEWERS OF THE ISSUE\***

Prof. Dr. Lamia BENJELLOUN, Dalhousie University, CANADA

Prof. Dr. Müjdat AVCI, Osmaniye Korkut Ata University, TÜRKİYE

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Banu AKÇEŞME, Erciyes University, TÜRKİYE

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Hasan BAKTIR, Erciyes University, TÜRKİYE

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Mehmet ÖZMENLİ, Giresun University, TÜRKİYE

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Murat Özkan, Ordu University, TÜRKİYE

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Okay PEKŞEN, Ondokuz Mayıs University, TÜRKİYE

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ömer SUBAŞI, Atatürk University, TÜRKİYE

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Savaş EĞİLMEZ, Atatürk University, TÜRKİYE

Assist. Prof. Dr. Lahoucine AIT SAGH, Caddi Ayyad University, MOROCCO

Dr. Mehmet Nezir ÇEVİK, Ministry of National Education, TÜRKİYE

---

\* The ranking is arranged alphabetically within the academic title

Volume 6, Issue 1 (2023)

Table of Contents

Research Article

**1. THE ROLE OF THE FANTASTIC ELEMENTS AS A MEANS OF HEALING IN ATKINSON'S WHEN WILL THERE BE GOOD NEWS? AND ÜMIT'S THE DERVISH GATE** 

*(Atkinson'ın ne zaman iyi haber olacak? kitabında fantastik unsurların sosyal bir eleştirisi olarak rolü ve Ümit'in derviş kapısı)*

*Betul ENSARI.....1-11*

**2. THE ADVERTISING POSTER: WHAT CONTRIBUTION IN FRENCH LESSONS?** 

*(Reklam afişinin Fransızca derslerine katkısı nedir?)*


*Aboutayeb MOSTAFA.....12-20*

**3. THE HIDDEN SIDE OF THE COVID-19 EPIDEMIC PROCESS INCREASING DOMESTIC VIOLENCE** 

*(Aile içi şiddeti artıran Covid-19 salgın sürecinin gizli yüzü)*

*Bilal CEYLAN, Rahime ERDOĞAN, Ali BOZDEMİR, İsmail YURDAKUL, Hidayet TAŞ, Ela*

*ERDEN.....21-26*

**4. AN ASSESSMENT ON THE HISTORY AND GEOPOLITICAL IMPORTANCE OF SOUTH CAUCASUS** 

*(Güney Kafkasya'nın tarihi ve jeopolitik önemi üzerine bir değerlendirme)*

*Bastı BEKİROVA.....27-32*

**5. AN EVALUATION ON THE SOURCES OF TÜRK HISTORY OF THE MEDIEVAL EAST BLACK SEA** 

*(Orta çağ doğu Karadeniz Türk tarihinin kaynakları üzerine bir değerlendirme)*

*Bekir SARIYILDIZ.....33-39*





## THE ROLE OF THE FANTASTIC ELEMENTS AS A MEANS OF HEALING IN ATKINSON'S *WHEN WILL THERE BE GOOD NEWS?* AND ÜMIT'S *THE DERVISH GATE*

Betul ENSARI<sup>1\*</sup>


<sup>1</sup>Istanbul University, Faculty of Letters, Department of English Language and Literature, 34134, Istanbul, Türkiye

**Abstract:** This paper examines the relationship between the fantastic and trauma in the detective novels of Kate Atkinson and Ahmet Ümit within the theory of Comparative Literature. Based on Cathy Carruth's *Trauma Theory*, the paper aims to explore how Atkinson and Ümit employ fantastic elements such as ghosts and time-traveling in their detective novels to unmask the traumatic events rooted in the memories of the patriarchal cultures where they have been living. It is suggested that both Atkinson and Ümit lead the reader to discover the silenced narratives of marginalized people such as women, children, and men that do not belong to the male dominant ruling class in their societies by creating a fictional world where the ghosts help the characters to detect their personal and cultural wounds stemming from male-dominated social environments. Thereby, the writers offer some healing to the marginalized people by giving them a voice and also contribute to creating integrity and union within their societies.

**Keywords:** Fantastic, Trauma studies, Detective fiction, Ghosts, Patriarchal Cultures, Healing

\*Corresponding author: Istanbul University, Faculty of Letters, Department of English Language and Literature, 34134, Istanbul, Türkiye

E mail: ensari.betul@gmail.com (B. ENSARI)

Betul ENSARI  <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0425-7252>

Received: June 06, 2022

Accepted: October 20, 2022

Published: January 01, 2023

**Cite as:** Ensari B. 2023. The role of the fantastic elements as a means of healing in Atkinson's *When will there be good news?* and Ümit's *the dervish gate*. *BSJ Pub Soc Sci*, 6(1): 1-11.

### 1. Introduction

This paper aims to draw attention to the contribution of the fantastic in the articulation of trauma in the detective novels of Kate Atkinson and Ahmet Ümit namely *When Will There Be Good News?* (2008) and *The Dervish Gate* (2012). By examining the role of the fantastic elements employed in the detective novels, it is aimed to demonstrate that Atkinson (2008) and Ümit (2012) uncover the forgotten, silenced, and repressed histories of underrepresented members of their societies such as women, children, former soldiers, and minorities within the context of their novels. It is suggested that the ghost of the Highlander woman and the spirit of Shams lead both the detectives and the reader to revisit the traumatic events and discover untold narratives of the women and children under the patriarchal cultures where the writers have been living. By giving voice to the underrepresented groups in the fictional worlds where the detectives meet the ghost figures, the writers provide some healing at the personal and social levels.

To investigate how the ghost figures assist the detective figures to face their personal wounds and how they reveal the cultural traumas rooted in the memories of their societies, it is vital to discuss the ways the fantastic elements and detective fiction serve as a means of trauma narrative. To do so, the paper gives some insight into the relationship between the fantastic and trauma

and also explain the ways the writers use detective fiction as a site to detect traumatic experiences. Then it continues with the examination of the role of the ghosts as a means of healing in *When Will There Be Good News?* and *The Dervish Gate* respectively.

### 2. The Relationship between the Fantastic and Trauma

The fantastic, dating back to ancient myths, fairy tales, mysticism, and legends, stems from the Latin, phantasticus. In Greek, it reads "φαντασία", which means making something visible or manifest (Jackson, 8). According to Merriam-Webster Dictionary, fantastic is an adjective derived from the noun fantasy. The word enters the English language in the 14<sup>th</sup> century from Old French, fantastique, meaning "of imagination as a faculty, produced by the imagination, not real, [...]" (<https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/fantastic>). In the 16<sup>th</sup>-century Fantastic literature emerges and reaches its peak in the 19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> centuries.

Before discussing the social, historical, and cultural reasons behind the rise of Fantastic Literature, it is useful to mention the theory of Tzvetan Todorov, a French and Bulgarian literary theorist, and cultural critic concerning the fantastic. In *the Fantastic: A Structural Approach to a Literary Genre*, Todorov defines *the fantastic* as a



subjective term that stands between uncanny and marvelous. In other words, the fantastic mode sits at the point of maximum ambiguity between two poles such as "reality or dream" and "truth or illusion" (Todorov 25). He describes the fantastic mode as being typified by characters' "hesitation" when encountering an "uncanny phenomenon" as to whether they should interpret this according to "natural causes" or opt for the explanation of "supernatural causes" (24-26).

According to Todorov, hesitation or uncertainty is counted as the main feature of the fantastic by Todorov. When looking at the detective novels of Atkinson and Umit, both the detectives and the reader hesitate whether what the characters have been through is real or a dream. Both the detectives and the reader cannot be sure if they really met a ghost or if they were hallucinating. Based on these features of the fantastic mode, this paper suggests that Atkinson and Umit utilized fantastic elements to create an atmosphere where the reader keeps questioning what is true and what is right as well as what is real and what is a dream. Besides the epistemological purpose of the fantastic, in "Otherworlds: Fantasy and the Fantastic", Theodore Ziolkowski asserts that hesitation or uncertainty suggested as the main feature of the fantastic by Todorov "takes place only when the supernatural seems to be invading our world with its rules and laws" (Ziolkowski, 128). He also states that the fantastic disrupts our everyday world. Ziolkowski's statements reveal that the characteristics of the fantastic run parallel with the features of trauma.

First of all, both the fantastic and trauma raise a question of reality. In *The Body Keeps The Score* Van der Kolk explains that trauma survivors have hardship in remembering the traumatic event they have faced because our brains are programmed to protect us from life-threatening experiences. During a traumatic event, the brain records events differently from normal events. Therefore, the testimonies of survivors lack a chronicle order and details of the events. Survivors have blurry pictures and fragmented narratives about what happened to them. They suffer from loss of memory. This creates a sense of doubt for both the survivor and the listener. (Van der Kolk, *The Body Keeps the Score*, 1-60) Moreover, Kolk states that as a result of traumatic experiences some of his patients hallucinate, which also makes him ask what is true and what is not.

Our patients had hallucinations—the doctors routinely asked about them and noted them as signs of how disturbed the patients were. But if the stories I'd heard in the wee hours were true, could it be that these "hallucinations" were in fact the fragmented memories of real experiences? Were hallucinations just the concoctions of sick brains? Could people make up physical sensations they had never experienced? Was there a clear line between creativity and pathological imagination? Between memory and imagination? (Kolk, 38).

Similarly, Dori Laub also discusses the same question in *Testimony: Crises of Witnessing in Literature, Psychoanalysis, and History* where she analyses the testimonies of the Holocaust Survivors. Like the fantastic, traumatic experiences bring up the question of what is real. The second feature that both the fantastic and trauma have in common is their sudden appearance and invasion of the normal world. Roger Luckhurst defines trauma as "something that enters the psyche that is so unprecedented or overwhelming that it cannot be processed or assimilated by the usual mental process. We have, [...], nowhere to put it, and so it falls out of our conscious memory, yet is still present in the mind like an intruder or ghost" (Luckhurst, 499). Luckhurst associates a traumatic memory with a ghost due to its haunting nature and its return. Thus, like a painful memory of a traumatic moment, supernatural forces like ghosts and vampires come from the past and disorder the ordinary life of the hero. They are neither dead nor alive. Their in-between state is similar to traumatic experiences that are unclaimed. Like traumatic events, ghosts want to be heard and seen. They want their silenced truth to be uncovered and revealed.

In light of the information about the common features that trauma and the fantastic share, the contribution of the fantastic to trauma studies can be examined. In *Fantasy: A Literature of Subversion*, Rosemary Jackson suggests that the fantastic has been applied since the eighteenth century in Western literature in an attempt to unveil the repression of the capitalist patriarchal culture both on the level of personal and social. According to her: [...] the fantastic is to replace familiarity, comfort, *das Heimlich*, with estrangement, unease, and the uncanny. It is to introduce dark areas, of something completely other and unseen, the spaces outside the limiting frame of the 'human' and 'real', outside the control of the 'word' and of the 'look'. Hence the association of the modern fantastic with the horrific, from Gothic tales of terror to contemporary horror films. The emergence of such literature in periods of relative 'stability' (the mid-eighteenth century, late nineteenth century, mid-twentieth century) points to a direct relation between cultural repression and its generation of oppositional energies which are *expressed* through various forms of fantasy in art (Jackson, 104).

Thus, the fantastic serves the aim of the manifestation of the hidden or repressed at both personal and social levels to reflect traumatic events. According to her, the fantastic reveals what is lost and what is absent in the narrative of the dominant culture. She continues her argument as follows:

Freud is well aware of the countercultural effects of literature of the uncanny, and its transgressive function in bringing to light things that should remain obscure. The uncanny *expresses* drives which have to be *repressed* for the sake of cultural continuity (Jackson, 40).

Similarly, in *The Literature of Terror* David Punter remarks that in the eighteenth century the fantastic



appeared as a reaction to the dominant male discourse of the Enlightenment that reduced the human to the rational. Additionally, he claims that the key motifs employed in Gothic fiction such as paranoia, manipulation, and injustice and its central project of "understanding the inexplicable, the taboo, and the irrational" are nothing but a reflection of social trauma. By the same token, Varma regards the "'fantastic' in literature as 'the surrealistic expression of those historical and social factors which the ordinary chronicle of events in history does not consider significant'" (Devendra Varma, 217, *The Gothic Flame* (1957), quoted in *The Literature of Terror* by David Punter, pg. 15).

Who are those that are not considered as significant to be a part of the official history? In *Contemporary Women's Gothic Fiction* Gina Wisker answers this question stating the fact that historically many voices have been silenced and "discredited" including women's voices, the voice of the colonized, and the displaced or "resettled". Wisker underlines the power and knowledge relationship in writing history and establishing historical facts. According to her, postcolonial women's Gothic stories allow unheard voices to be heard and also offer the reader a different perspective. In doing so, these stories subvert established interpretations of historical events.

Likewise, in *Ghostly Matters*, Avery Gordon explains that certain individuals, things, or ideas that were banished in the past must be understood and the circumstances that marginalized and repressed them must be detected, because "the past always haunts the present" (viii). In the book, she traces the footprints of three women: Sabina Spielrein, Luisa Valenzuela, and Toni Morrison. Gordon claims that through their works these women signify what is missing and neglected in the history inscribed by male-dominated cultures. In this sense, according to Gordon, the ghost appears to remind us of the lost and the absent (Gordon, 15). But also, she remarks that it sometimes represents life, a path not to be taken or hope. She suggests that the ghost is alive and "[w]e are in relation to it and it has designs on us such that we must reckon with it graciously, attempting to offer it a hospitable memory *out of a concern for justice*" (Gordon, 64).

As the writers assert above, the fantastic enables writers to create a site for reflecting on traumatic memories at the personal and collective levels. Through supernatural elements like ghosts and vampires, the fantastic poses a challenge to the male-dominated official institutions that neglect and derecognize traumatic events that women, children, and marginalized groups face.

### 3. Fantastic Elements in the Detective Novels as a Means of Guidance and Healing

Keeping the close link between the fantastic and trauma in mind, it is also necessary to discuss the relationship between detective fiction and the fantastic and try to answer the following question: Why might Atkinson and

Ümit have combined the fantastic and detective fiction? Cynthia S. Hamilton's remark on the territory shared by detective fiction and the gothic gives some answers to this question. While examining Sara Paretsky's detective novels, she comes to this conclusion:

Both detective fiction and the gothic deal with the power of irrational impulses, both trace the impact of past crimes on the present, both suggest the unreliability of appearances and insubstantiality of what people take as reality, and both test the power of reason against what appear to be inexplicable forces and events. Both register the impact of trauma, but while the detective story concentrates on the therapeutic process that enables moving on, the gothic focuses on the definitive power of unclaimed experience (Hamilton, 144).

As discussed before, like a traumatic event that distorts the victim's world, the fantastic disturbs the order in the fictional world. Supernatural elements employed in fantastic literature intrude into the hero's world without any aim of scaring the hero or of taking revenge. Thereby they catch both the hero's and reader's attention and invite them to detect why and how supernatural things are happening. Are they real? At this point, detective fiction comes in. A detective figure tries to make sense of these invading supernatural forces to re-establish order. To do so, the detective looks for missing parts to solve the crime and reveals the absences, which can be identified as traumatic events and perpetrators of trauma. The detective's search for the crime and criminals unmasks social, cultural, and legal injustices that pave the way for a ghostly figure to return. However, the detective is not alone. He is guided by the ghost. As Avery Gordon asserts, the role of the ghost in the fantastic is not to frighten the hero or take revenge on the perpetrator. By contrast, its role is to criticize the dominant culture that keeps the truth hidden as well as to inspire and guide the hero to revisit and reveal untold narratives of the past. On the other hand, the role of the detective is to unveil traumatic wounds that need to be healed. Therefore, it is not wrong to say that both Atkinson and Ümit are aware of the fact that the fantastic and detective fiction co-operate in the demonstration of traumas that socially and culturally repressed, unheard, and marginalized people face.

It is helpful to start by displaying how Atkinson embeds fantastic elements in *When Will There Be Good News?* as a means of guidance and healing. The most striking fantastic element that Atkinson uses appears in the scene where Jackson Brodie meets a mysterious woman strolling in the wilderness of Yorkshire in snowy weather. Jackson Brodie is an ex-soldier and retired police officer. He has been working as a private detective; however, in this novel, he has one concern: to prove that Nathan is his own son by taking a pair of hair from him without the consent of his ex-wife and her new husband. After fulfilling his goal, he is about to return to London where he has been living with his new wife, Tina.

Taken aback by the woman's courage of being all alone,

Jackson offers her to give a ride with the intention of protecting her against any danger that she might encounter. Instead of accepting Jackson's offer, the woman warns him that he is on the wrong way. Without comprehending what she has meant, Jackson drives to the station and gets on the train that has been heading towards Edinburgh instead of London. When he notices that he has been on the wrong train, the train makes an accident. While lying at the hospital after the train crash where Jackson is deadly injured, he sees the strolling woman in his dream among other people who he knows are dead. His dream vision implies that the woman is a ghost that wanted to protect him by telling him that he was on the wrong way. At the end of the novel, Jackson still remembers her and wonders if she is "still walking the empty roads on the high tops in the snow and the wind and the rain" (Atkinson, 476). It is a mystery who she is. Why she was strolling alone in the wilderness on such a snowy day is also a mystery. What is more mysterious is why Atkinson would implement such a mystery in the novel. Why does she remind us of her at the very end of the novel? Another question that strikes the attention is that if the strolling woman is a ghost why would she appear to Jackson?

Atkinson's employment of the strolling woman as a ghost figure is important in her narrative for two reasons. Firstly, by implying that the strolling woman is a ghost, Atkinson shows the connection between the ghost and the past. As well known, ghosts come back to solve unresolved matters in the past. The way that the strolling woman dressed up suggests that she can be a Highlander. Her wandering in the wilderness of Yorkshire Dale evokes the idea that she resists the powers that want to silence the Highlander's story of being subjected to violence in the past. It can be said that the strolling woman is a metaphor for the traumatic memory of the past that Atkinson wants to keep alive.

Secondly, the image of the woman who is strolling/wandering fearlessly and all alone is stunning in the way that throughout the novel we have witnessed that the women and children are continuously threatened by some men. Her representation in the wilderness without any company reckons the terrible event that Joanna's mother and her siblings are murdered in the field on their return from a picnic home: On a summer day, Joanna's mother and her siblings are walking unaware of the danger that will cost their lives. They are defenceless in the field; they have nothing to protect themselves from the man holding the knife. There is none to see and help them while the man is slaughtering them one by one. Inspector Monroe has a similar experience: She is followed by a man in the park where she has brought her son to play. Even though she is a police officer and knows how to defend herself professionally, she, as a mother, feels helpless because being a woman with a child makes a difference. Likewise, Jackson's sister is murdered at night when she is walking home alone. With the portrayal of the strolling woman,

Atkinson might imply that women can wander freely and fearlessly only if they are ghosts. In this way, she criticizes social, cultural, and legal institutions that cannot promote women and children in a safe environment.

Concerning the question of why the ghost has appeared to Jackson, it is necessary to take a look at what kind of connection exists between the strolling woman and Brodie. It is also crucial to examine the way how Jackson reacts to the strolling woman to understand why she becomes visible to him. Jackson and the strolling woman are both from Yorkshire Dale, which is illustrated as a place where violence, inequality, and poverty are a part of daily life. Jackson is already haunted by the death of his sister and brother when he meets her. The strolling woman, instead of scaring him, helps him. She acts like guidance and warns him literally and symbolically by saying that he is on the wrong way. With a similar intention, Jackson offers her a ride to protect her. After the train crash, Jackson sees her among his dead relatives in his dream at the hospital. Although he can infer from the dream that she is a ghost, he is still concerned about her. In this respect, the representation of the relationship between the ghost and Jackson is quite different from the traditional representations of the reaction between the haunter and the haunted. It can be said that their relationship is based on a kind of witness and victim relationship. As a witness, Jackson does not ignore violence, economic hardships, and injustices existing in his community. As a soldier and police officer, he has always protected children and women. It was him that found Joanna hiding in the bushes where the man murdered her mother and siblings. This can be the motivation why the strolling woman wanted to help him. By assisting him, she might be willing to change the future of women and children.

It seems that Atkinson gives another dimension to the role of the ghost figure: hope, inspiration, and guidance. Since the ghost breaks the rules of linear time by existing in the present they can influence the future. Concerning the power of the ghost, in "The Ghosts of the School Curriculum: Past, Present, and Future" Kenway states, "The ghost leaves traces of the past by conjuring those who are already dead. It invokes the future by conjuring the presence of those who are not yet born. The ghost confuses linear time. In other words, past, present, and future no longer exist as discrete and consecutive points in time" (Kenway, 4). What aims do ghosts have in creating chaos and breaking the timeline? Kenway remarks that the aim the ghost has in returning from the dead is to share his/her insights and wants us to bring them to life. Likewise, Gordon asserts that the ghost is not only the representation of the past, they shed a light on our path to the future. In this vein, it can be said that the representation of the strolling woman, who walks fearlessly on the roads encourages us to create social, legal, and political changes that would stop traumatizing events from taking place. By reminding the strolling

woman at the end of the novel, Atkinson conveys the idea that women and children are waiting for reforms that will enhance safety and equality in their everyday lives.

It is also important to note that Jackson does not heed the strolling woman's advice, only later does he understand that she was right. She was right about him being literally on the wrong way. Symbolically, she was right that he was married to a fraud who took most of his money. She was right that there is no use in claiming Nathan since he never knows if he and Nathan would have a better relationship than he had with his daughter, Marlee. Besides, claiming that Nathan is his son might be traumatizing for Nathan, who thinks his father is somebody else. At the end of the novel, Brodie realizes that he has missed Reggie, which shows that he finally establishes the bond for which he has been looking. In this sense, the ghostly figure is portrayed as a wise person that helps the detective. Another point is that Brodie never turns inwards and confronts his traumatic past. He always looks outwards and dedicates himself to saving others. However, it is he, who needs to be saved.

Let's continue by examining the ways Ümit utilizes supernatural elements as a tool to pose a challenge to the male-dominated discourse. Similar to the function of the strolling woman in Atkinson's novel, Ümit employs the ghost of Shams as a means of social criticism as well as inspiration and hope. Like the strolling woman, Shams becomes a voice for the marginalized and undervalued ones, especially women, children, and people who define themselves politically as well as religiously different from the patriarchal ruling class in Konya. To do so, it is necessary to look closely at how Ümit introduces Shams to us and narrates his story.

Like the way Atkinson begins her novel with the murder scene of Joanna's mother and her siblings, Ümit also starts *The Dervish Gate* with a murder scene:

There was blood on the Stone, hatred in the hearts of the men, and a deep tranquillity in the full moon. An infant cried somewhere in the distance, an infant wriggling about in one of the houses. A tender young girl slept somewhere far afield, a tender girl's body slowly rotting in the earth. As the youngest of the seventh stabbed his knife into the man, the girl writhed in her grave. A smile spread across her face, which even death could not drain of its strength. As the youngest of the seven was thrusting in his knife, a final breath, till now kept knotted in the young girl's throat, was released with a rush of air, like a sigh of relief.

After this shocking scene, the reader is introduced to Karen Kimya, who runs a hotel investigation. Many questions concerning the murder scene are left unanswered: Who is the man killed by the seven men? Why do the seven men hate him? Who is the girl in the grave? Why does she feel relieved after the man's death? It seems that Ümit wants the reader to behave like a detective and gather clues to solve this puzzle interwoven with Karen's hotel fire investigation.

As the novel unfolds, it becomes clear that the man who

was murdered is Shams-i Tabriz and the girl in the grave is his young wife, Kimya. The seventh man represents Aladdin, the son of Mevlana. However, to grasp the message conveyed by the narrative structure of the detective fiction it is also vital to seek answers to the following questions as a reading detective: Why doesn't Ümit give the names of the victim and the perpetrators while narrating the murder? Why does he hide the name of the city where the killing took place?

The reason for this can be that Ümit refers to all victims who have been marginalized or/and murdered due to their non-conformist ideas and attitudes. By avoiding identifying the characters and the place of the killing, Ümit places emphasis on the murder, which signifies injustice and oppression that marginalized people have been facing because they refuse to conform to the dominant culture and class. Another question that needs to be discussed is why Ümit brought up the murder of a historical figure. What can his aim be in connecting Shams' story with Karen's contemporary narrative? It seems that by readdressing a historical event and combining it with a detective story and the elements of the fantastic, Ümit alerts the reader of taboos planted in our cultural memory. With the re-imagination of Shams' story within a detective story, Ümit questions if there can be more truths than the one unified truth about Shams' murder and the death of his young wife. Can there be other narratives about their stories different from the dominant narrative? By reinventing Shams as a ghostly character and placing him in a contemporary detective story where Karen is presented as a detective, Ümit encourages us to question the dominant value system that leads to social, historical, and cultural traumas.

Like the strolling woman in Atkinson's novel, the ghost of Shams is a reminder of traumatic events that want to be recognized and resolved. By scattering Shams' traumatic memories in Karen's contemporary narrative, Ümit shows that her narrative is thoroughly possessed by the story of Shams. The spirit of Shams can easily interfere with her life at any time and place as he pleases. The way he appears is similar to traumatic memories that come to the surface unexpectedly. As Van der Kolk asserts, traumatic memories cannot be located at any specific time and place (Van der Kolk "Trauma and Memory" 279). Since a traumatic event cannot be placed in any specific time and place, it is regarded as a "missed encounter" or "absence". It is this sense of absence that lends a traumatic event a ghostly trait and haunts the survivor or the witness for this very reason. In this respect, it is crucial to uncover the reasons why Shams returns. What is missing in the conventional discourse that narrates the relationship between Mevlana and Shams, which disturbs him? What is the absence that Ümit wants to show us through the ghost of Shams?

In order to demonstrate what is hidden by the dominant narrative, Ümit creates a multi-narrative context that provides different possibilities about what might have happened to Shams and how his wife, Kimya died. Like a

detective, Karen asks questions to Shams, Mennan, and İzzet Efendi about the truth. Additionally, she searches for information about the relationship between Shams and Mevlana in the articles and books. Karen's inquiry about the murder of Shams and Kimya's mysterious death unveils several missing pieces of information in the dominant narrative. One of the absences that Karen notices while reading the articles she has found is that these articles focus on only Rumi and give little credit to Shams despite his huge influence on Mevlana. She thinks that "Everyone showered Rumi with praise, while Shams always seemed to linger in the background like his sidekick." (Ümit, 109) Depending on her observations, she states that Shams had played such an important role in Mevlana's life, that I couldn't help but find it significant that he was not buried in the same mausoleum. It looked as if this dervish, though closer to Rumi than his own family, had been driven away by someone hoping to pretend he never existed. What's more, the green dome of Rumi's mausoleum was so obviously revered as a work of art, beside which, the humble mosque and mausoleum where Shams lay buried crouched as though forgotten among the neighborhood's taller, banal buildings (Ümit, 194).

Karen's comparison between Rumi's grave and Shams' also gives hints on how Shams has been treated by the locals of Konya. Thereby, it supports Karen's claim that Shams has been seen as if he were an unimportant person to Rumi. Besides Karen's analytic thinking, to unveil the absences in the dominant narrative, Ümit gives Shams a voice by creating another scene where two different narratives juxtapose. In the scene, while switching between channels, Karen sees a documentary about Mevlana and Shams. The presenter retells the story of Shams and Mevlana. While explaining how the Konyans welcomed Shams he asserts that "The city of saints acquired yet another great dervish." At that time the image of the presenter starts to become blurry as if the TV is going to break up. Karen notices Shams appearing at the door of the mosque. Once the presenter says that "[t]he people were overjoyed. The whole city was ecstatic" (Ümit, 151). Shams interrupts stating, "That is a lie!" He states that they are lying and asks her not to believe in them. He carries on as follows:

No one was overjoyed." [...] "Not the sultan, not the soldiers, not the Muslim theologians, and certainly not the people. They disliked me from the moment they saw me. They all hated me and wanted me out of Konya. They would have killed me without a second thought if they could have got away with it. All except Khüdavendigâr, and his eldest son, Bahaeddin (Ümit, 152).

In this scene, the ghost of Shams appears to illustrate the missing information and thereby challenges the dominant narrative. Another absence concerning Shams is his death. Whereas some believe that Shams left Konya for good after Kimya's death, others such as Mehmet Eflaki believe that he was killed and thrown into the well. To recreate Shams' story, Ümit offers the reader different

perspectives on the historical event benefiting from various sources. One of them is Annemarie Schimmel. Concerning Shams's death, Annemarie refers to Eflaki who "boldly states that he [Shams] was murdered- in connivance with Rumi's son Alaeddin, 'the pride of professors'" (Schimmel, 22). As noted in Ümit's novel, Eflaki tells that Alaeddin was one of the killers. Why did nobody do anything about this? Schimmel speculates the reason why Eflaki's claim has been doubted until recently as follows: "[...]; too strange seemed it that a member of the family should have committed such a crime" (Schimmel, 22). Schimmel reconstructs what happened on the night of 5 December 1248, which might have inspired Ümit, in this way:

Rumi and Shams talked till a late hour when someone knocked at the door and asked Shams to come out for some purpose. He went and was stabbed, and then thrown into the well opposite to the back entrance of the house-a well which still exists. Soltan Valad, informed about the action, hastened to take the body out of the well and bury it in a hurriedly-dug tomb nearby, which was covered with plaster and then with earth; later the maqam of Shams, his memorial, was erected there. Recent excavations in the maqam in the course of some repair have indeed proved the existence of a rather large tomb covered with plaster from the Seljuck era. Thanks to this discovery by Mehmet Önder [...] the truth of Aflaki's statement has been proved (Schimmel, 22).

Based on these alternative narratives, Ümit challenges the conventional narrative suggesting that "Shams left for an unknown place" with the depiction of the scene where Rumi was stabbed by the seven men right at the beginning of the detective novel. Concerning the reason why he was murdered, Annemarie Schimmel explains how shocking it is for the inhabitants of Konya to witness that their beloved sheik, Mevlana, neglects his religious and social duties and devotes his whole time to Shams, a wandering dervish, who rejects fitting into the Konya society (Schimmel, 20). Schimmel asserts that Shams feels the hatred of the community toward him because they thought that Shams took Mevlana from them. Therefore, he decides to leave the city, which leaves Mevlana heartbroken. His son Valid looks for Shams and finally brings him back to Konya. Schimmel notes that in the hope of keeping Shams close to himself, Mevlana married Shams to Kimya. She continues as follows: "Shams loved this Kimya deeply. A small room in Mowlana's house is given to the couple. When Jalaloddin's son, the learned Alaoddin, passed thereby, Shams rebuked him, telling him not to intrude upon his father's friends" (Schimmel, 21).

Ümit recreates similar speculations about Shams' death through a dialogue between Mennan and Karen. Mennan states that some jealous people continue spreading rumours about Mevlana and Shams even after his marriage with Kimya. He explains the role of Alaeddin in his killing stating that "[...] it is a shame, but Rumi's middle son, Alaeddin Çelebi, was also part of this gang of



provocateurs. Some say Alaeeddin was in love with Kimya, others say he was just jealous of how close Shams was to his father and older brother, Sultan Veled" (Ümit, 329). On the other hand, İzzet Efendi suggests another explanation in relation to why Shams was murdered by calling the killers as "a pack of blind believers". İzzet Efendi continues as follows:

the Qur'an was being taken too literally. Whereas every letter in that great book holds hundreds of different explanations, every word thousands of meanings. And because Shams had unravelled those hidden meanings, he had a grasp of the Qur'an that this pack of blind believers didn't. Then, because those ignorant people could understand neither Shams nor the Qur'an they became his enemies, declaring him a sinner and a heretic. [...] They became zealots. And whether Muslim, Jewish; or Christian- a zealot is a zealot, my girl (Ümit, 363).

Obviously, Shams, as Schimmel asserts, was a witty and hard-tongued person who could easily irritate the ruling class at the time. Besides becoming an intimate friend of Mevlana must have sparked jealousy in the family members including Alaeeddin, who regards him as an intruder as noted by Schimmel. Based on Shams' uncompromising characteristic traits, Ümit invents scenes where Shams deconstructs the dominant narrative that opposes their rigid understanding of the religion as the one unified truth. The scene where Shams asks Mevlana to buy him some wine is one of the examples of how Shams unveils the hypocrisy in the community at the time. Without any question Mevlana goes to buy wine for Shams, knowing that the high society in Konya at the time will have no more love and respect for him. By retelling the scene Ümit shows that some people at the time avoid drinking wine, but they spread gossip and bring other people's secrets into the light, which are both considered some of the biggest sins in the religion.

Additionally, the ghost of Shams challenges the mainstream idea that adores Mevlana for his poems about love. He displays that their kind of love is hypocritical by raising the question: Is it only love that brings peace to any community or society? Shams refuses this attitude stating that "God loves justice" (Ümit, 202). When Karen says that "The God I know takes pleasure from love, not punishment", he claims that in order to understand God "one must also know the god of Moses and Muhammad" (Ümit, 202). Through the depiction of Shams as Saifullah (The sword of God) and Mevlana as a symbol of love, Ümit conveys the idea that love and justice are two fundamental principles to building peace in society.

Another missing point in the conventional narrative that Ümit draws the reader's attention to is the story of Shams' young wife, Kimya from her point of view. Did she want to marry Shams? How did she die? Was she in love with Alaeeddin? After learning about the marriage of Shams with Kimya, Karen chases answers to these questions. In her dream, Karen transforms into Shams

again and finds herself in the woods where she, in the form of Shams, sees two young people have become one mind, one heart, one body (See, Ümit, 293). Burning with jealousy, she goes home to wait for the girl, who "fastened her buttons as rose from [her] side this morning, and opened them at the sight of another this evening" (Ümit, 295). When she asks the girl where she was she could not answer. After some struggle, Karen kills her. At that moment, "the silhouette of a young man" opens the door "frozen in front of it". He screams: "You have killed her. You've killed her! You have killed her and the baby in her womb!" (Ümit, 296). After waking up, she tries to make sense of the dream and asks herself if she killed the girl. Then she concludes that it was Shams who killed Kimya. She was just a witness in the form of his body. Did he really kill her? Inferring from what she had seen in her dream, she speculates that Shams wants to clean his guilty consciousness by getting in touch with her. She thinks that due to the murder he had committed, he was stuck in purgatory (Ümit, 298). With this scene, Ümit gives the reader an angle on a historical mystery, which leads the reader to question if the dream is real. Is it right what Karen has experienced?

After the dream, she is frustrated with Shams and she has more questions concerning Kimya. When Shams gets in touch with Karen again through a dream, he is surprised by Karen's accusations about him killing his young wife, Kimya. When Shams asks how she knows it, she says she has seen it with her own eyes. Shams explains himself as follows:

"You suppose your nightmares are real, but it's reality that is a nightmare. I did not kill Kimya, what killed her was her own sin." [...] "She went where I told her not to go," "She did what I told her not to do and saw who I told not to see. All I did was look into her eyes. But the poor girl took her neck into her own hands and fell to the ground. I never wanted her to die, never wanted to lose her [...]" (Ümit, 313).

Ümit provides both the reader and Karen with another account of the event. Shams claims that what Karen has seen is just a nightmare. It is not him that literally kills his wife, Kimya. However, he admits that he was angry with her and after looking into her eyes her neck was broken. Which one is real? Her dream? Or Shams' account? Ümit points out one question that goes beyond whose account is real. Through Karen's critical thinking he raises the question: Does Shams' explanation make him less responsible for her death? To learn more, Karen looks into some books about Mevlana and Shams. She cannot find any information on Kimya in most of the books except for Mehmet Eflaki's *The Feats of Knowers of God*. Karen states that poor Kimya's name appears only three times in the entire text only to clarify something about Shams. Ümit includes the paragraph about the death of Kimya narrated in Eflaki's book, which Karen thinks is not enough:

The bride of Shamseddin, Kimya Hatun, was a chaste and



beautiful lady. One day, the other women, including Sultan Veled's grandmother, went for a stroll in the vineyards. They took Kimya along with them, although without Shams's permission. When Shamseddin came home and couldn't find her, it was relayed to him that she'd gone out for a walk in the vineyards with the women and the grandmother. Shamseddin was furious. As soon as she arrived back home, she came down with a stiff neck straight away. She remained as rigid as a dry blade of grass, crying and moaning for three days' time, after which she passed on to the other side (Ümit, 322).

Karen cannot help questioning the social and cultural circumstances that led Kimya to death. She poses the question of how "a man had brought on the death of his wife because she had not listened to him. But even more curious was why a person so full of love, a model of compassion like Mevlana, would give a young girl of not even eighteen years of age to a sixty-year-old man as a wife in the first place" (Ümit, 322). In Eflaki's book there is no answer to these questions. The reason why Mevlana marries off Kimya to Shams is "to put a stop to all the rumour" (Ümit, 328). Taking this into account, Karen asserts that in this story Kimya is the victim. It seems that she was sacrificed for the sake of the love between two men. To fill the blank or maybe to kill her curiosity, Karen asks Mennan's thoughts about sixty-year-old Shams' marriage with Kimya, who is not even in her eighteens. Mennan defends the social and cultural norms stating that " [...] in those days that was the norm. And what girl would not want to give her right arm to marry such a noble man as Shams? What family would not be thrilled to have him as a son-in-law?" (Ümit, 328). Karen protests his answer by asking him if he would also marry off his daughter to a sixty-year-old man if time were different" (Ümit, 328). The dialogue between Mennan and Karen is remarkable in displaying social hypocrisy, which blurs what is right and what is wrong.

Since there is no account of Kimya in the books, Karen keeps digging and trying to be her voice. Karen's inquiry about Shams' life sheds light on the absence and the missing information about the mysterious death of his wife as well. Karen asks hard questions and thereby breaks taboos in a patriarchal culture where men and their decisions are hardly questioned. One of the scenes that exemplifies how male-dominated cultures hold onto their unified truth is the scene where Karen suggests İzzet Efendi that Alaeddin was in love with Kimya. Her death might have had a deep impact on him and drove him to commit the murder. She continues by stating that it would be unfair to "put all the burden on him" because according to Karen, Mevlana and Shams also had some responsibility for all the traumatic events that took place. She claims that Mevlana knew that Alaeddin and Kimya had feelings for each other and he still gave her to Shams. Similarly, Shams willingly married Kimya although he was way too old for her. She also adds that Eflaki's book attests that Shams had a part in her death. İzzet Efendi does not accept these accounts stating that "I don't

believe those great men were defeated by their desires. That cannot have happened. It's true that Shams could be ruthless, but only when it was called for and to those who deserved it. As for Rumi, he wasn't even capable of thinking evil thoughts, [...]" (Ümit, 364). Karen criticizes İzzet Efendi for being so sure of himself, especially admitting that he did not know what really happened. All the arguments that Karen suggests show that historical events are all constructed by the dominant culture of a particular society at a particular time.

However, the truth will return in the form of a ghost and claims to be heard. Even though Ümit does not employ Kimya's ghost to offer alternative narratives to the historical event buried without being questioned, he uses Karen to challenge the dominant culture, which avoids talking about Kimya, her marriage, and her death. As a reader, it becomes clear what the girl in the graveyard wants: To be recognized. To be heard. By following the traces of Shams' ghost, Karen uncovers Kimya's story.

Another point I would like to discuss is that Ümit employs the ghost of Shams to reflect the abuse and violence women have been exposed to in Konya since ancient times. By implementing Medusa's story in the contemporary detective narrative, Ümit readdresses the injustice that Medusa faced as a woman. According to a legend, Medusa is turned into a monster as a punishment by Athens because she has made love with Poseidon in the sacrilege. Another legend remarks that Medusa does not want to make love with him but she is forced. In another word, she is raped. By revisiting the traumatic story of Medusa, Ümit demonstrates that women have been subject to violence and rape since ancient times in Konya. Patriarchal culture in Konya is so deep that nobody tells the story of Medusa as rape or asks the question of why it is only Medusa who was punished and killed. What about Poseidon? Nobody asserts that it is unfair to punish only Medusa.

It seems that Ümit shows this unfairness by narrating her story at the beginning of the detective story and establishing a link between Medusa and Konya. Let's take a close look at the depiction of Medusa in the novel and how her story is told by the male characters. While Karen is entering Ziya's office, she realizes the image of Medusa on the path:

The path up to the door was paved with small brown and yellow stones. A few steps beyond I spotted a mosaic in the path. I couldn't make it out what it was, so I bent down for a closer look. At first, I fancied it was an enormous daisy. I squinted It was a bust. A head of curly hair. But wait, it wasn't hair, it was snakes! "Medusa!" I cried [...] (Ümit, 57). Inside Ziya's office, she spots another Medusa mosaic. This one is different from the first Medusa mosaic in two ways. Firstly, it is located on the wall directly behind Ziya's desk rather than on the floor. Secondly, the mosaic describes the warrior, Perseus, with the severed head of Medusa in his left hand and an enormous sword in his right. Ziya tells the Turkish version of the legend when Karen asks him:

Medusa falls in love with Poseidon, the god of the sea, and makes love with him. Due to the sacrilege committed in her temple, Athens changes her into a monster who can turn stone anyone that looks at her face. Ziya notes that some people think that Medusa did not want to make love with him stating that "That it would be more apt to refer to it as the rape of Medusa by Poseidon" (Ümit, 65). Ziya continues telling the legend: The townspeople were suffering from the monster because she was killing people when she descended on the town. They were looking for a hero to kill the monster. That hero would be Perseus. Once he rescued the townsmen, they "erected iconic statues of him all about the town. And this town, surrounded on all sides by these icons was given the name Ikonion" (Ümit, 66).

Ziya's tourism company adopts the old name of Konya and also chooses Medusa's head as the logo for their company. By naming his company Ikonion and making Medusa's head a logo, Ziya identifies himself with Perseus. His having Perseus mosaic behind his desk also empowers this claim. To some extent, it can be said that Ziya seems to be comfortable with the traditions of the ancient patriarchal culture that accuses women of being raped instead of the rapist. Or if Medusa was not raped but had an affair with Poseidon, it is still problematic because in this scenario it is only Medusa who was punished as depicted in the legend. Besides putting the mosaic of Medusa's head on the path where visitors can walk over seems humiliating/insulting. On the other hand, the mosaic of Perseus who is holding the head of Medusa hung on the wall signifies the domination of patriarchy over women.

The last reference to the legend is made in the scene of the accident where Karen sees Shams holding Ziya's head. The way Shams is holding Ziya's head resembles the way Perseus is holding Medusa's head. Through this scene, Ümit reverses the legend. He challenges the narration of Medusa by the male-dominated culture. This depiction of Shams with Ziya's head offers both the reader and Medusa justice even if it is a traumatic event that happened in ancient times. By rewriting this tragic end through the ghost of Shams, Ümit enables our traumatized memories to be healed. On the other hand, the ghost of Shams protects Karen and re-establishes justice by killing Ziya.

It is also vital to discuss why Ümit employs a controversial character as such Shams, who is blamed for playing a part in the death of his wife, Kimya, to establish justice in the novel. Shams is both portrayed as a cruel man, but a kind-hearted one. He causes his wife to die on the other hand he is represented as a man, who helps Karen to overcome her childhood trauma by becoming her imaginary friend. At the end of the novel, it is indicated that the ghost of Shams murdered Ziya and Cevdet. If not, they died in the accident. In both cases, the criminals are not punished by the law but by fate.

Besides healing cultural traumas by revealing untold narratives, the ghost of Shams also helps Karen to realize

that she wants to give birth to the baby that she has been carrying. Karen hesitates to have a child because she has been abandoned by her Sufi father at a very young age. Besides her boyfriend wants her to have an abortion. One of the reasons why Karen has traveled to Konya is to clear her mind. Shams criticizes her for not making her decision about having the baby as follows: "Will you give birth to the child or will you be coaxed to get rid of it by your surgeon lover? Will you live your own life or his?" (Ümit, 388). With this statement, he holds a mirror to Karen, who used to find herself in the positions where she had to hold a place at her either mother's side or her father's side (Ümit, 388). He supports Karen to have the baby even though he knows that Karen might be a single mother. By doing so, the ghost of Shams deconstructs the patriarchal culture. Also, Karen's mother motivates her to have the baby even if Nigel does not want him/her. Like her mother, Karen gathers her courage to raise her own child without a father if requires.

Interestingly enough, Shams and Karen's mother share the same ideas concerning patriarchal cultures that shape the mindset; impact the notion of reality and the moral values of right and wrong. While reading the life of Shams, Karen comes across the information that Shams was highly critical of his father. She learns that rather than following his teachings, he left home to shape his future (Ümit, 106-107). Similarly, Shams becomes tempered when he has noticed that Mevlana has still been reading old books including his father's Maarif. Shams cautions him saying: "For how long will you continue reading other people's books, Muhammed Jelalaeddin? [...] How long will you continue to seek out the mystery of yourself in the words of others? [...] let go of those worn-out words, leave them in the past. For it is only your own words that you will ever uncover the mystery of yourself" (Ümit, 160). By portraying Shams as a reformist person, Ümit invites us to question the principles and values imposed by the patriarchal cultures the reader lives in.

#### 4. Conclusion

To summarize this paper intended to show how Atkinson and Ümit integrate the fantastic into the detective stories with the aim of reflecting on the impacts of traumatizing events in the past at the personal and social levels. For instance, the strolling woman and Shams serve the aims of dismantling personal and historical traumas caused by the male-centered ruling class in their cultures. While the strolling woman is a reminder of the traumas that the Highlanders have been exposed to, Shams readdresses traumatic events that took place in the local history of Konya. Differently from the strolling woman in Atkinson's novel, Shams is one of the main characters in the novel and has a large impact on them due to his mysterious disappearance, unconventional relationship with Mevlana, and suspicious death of his wife. His traumatic personal history is linked to the cultural history of the nation. This is why it haunts the characters

in the novel as well as many people interested in Sufism. What makes the story of Shams haunting is that nobody speaks openly and honestly about how, why, and, by whom he was murdered. With the appearance of Shams' ghost, Karen starts to question many cultural and social perceptions. She discovers a lot of absences in the conventional narrative about Shams and his wife, Kimya. The attitude of the male characters about the marriage between Shams and Kimya makes Karen challenge the patriarchal culture that ignores the death of Kimya. Karen argues that Kimya was too young to run married to an old man and she blames social and cultural norms that are responsible for her death. The representation of Kimya and Medusa in Ümit's novel gives voice to women subjected to violence and abuse.

On the other hand, the strolling woman functions as a reminder of the historical traumas that the Highlanders experienced. The strolling woman and Brodie are both from New Yorkshire. Therefore, they share the everlasting traumas rooted in the social, cultural, and economical history of New Yorkshire. It is this shared traumatic experience that binds them together. She is also a reflection of the repressed women whose history of abuse and violence is denied. Therefore, it is claimed that at social levels, the strolling woman and Shams serve as a means of healing by telling their narratives, which also reflect the traumatic experiences of many women, children, and men who do not belong to the ruling class.

Besides the role of the ghostly figures in the manifestation of the traumatic memory of their local histories, how they help the detectives on a personal level is also explored. For instance, the strolling woman warns Jackson against his being on the wrong way whereas Shams assists Karen in recovering from her childhood trauma and gaining the courage to give birth to the baby despite Nigel. In this respect, they play the role of a healer and guide. Moreover, both Atkinson and Ümit help their detective struggling with their parental issues through the ghostly figures. Brodie comes across her on his way back from the school where he has met Nathan, whom Brodie claims his son. At the end of the novel, Brodie thinks of Nathan and Marlee. Then he realizes he has missed Reggie. That is perhaps what the strolling woman has been suggesting: He was wrong by insisting on being Nathan's father since there is no guarantee that they will have the bond that Brodie has been looking for. However, he manages to establish a bond with Reggie.

On the other hand, Karen feels depressed because she could give up neither Nigel nor the baby. By helping Karen face her childhood trauma, Shams provides a psychologically healthy environment for the baby to grow up. In this respect, both of the writers demonstrate that the ghostly figures are in touch with the detectives and inspire them directly or indirectly even if they are dead

Finally, the return of the ghost in Atkinson's and Ümit's novels also speaks to the reader as well. Their aim is not to take revenge, but to guide the reader to bring their

insights into life. By telling their denied stories, they offer some healing to the repressed ones. Also, they contribute to social integrity by demanding social changes to create a safe and equal society where each member is accepted and valued independently of their gender, nation, and religion.

#### **Author Contributions**

The percentage of the author contributions is present below. The author reviewed and approved final version of the manuscript.

---

	B.E.
C	100
D	100
S	100
DCP	100
DAI	100
L	100
W	100
CR	100
SR	100
PM	100
FA	100

---

C=Concept, D= design, S= supervision, DCP= data collection and/or processing, DAI= data analysis and/or interpretation, L= literature search, W= writing, CR= critical review, SR= submission and revision, PM= project management, FA= funding acquisition.

#### **Conflict of Interest**

The author declare that there is no conflict of interest.

#### **Acknowledgments**

I want to express my gratitude to my supervisor Assoc. Prof. Canan Şavkay, and my committee members namely Prof. Dr. Esra Melikoğlu and Assoc. Prof. Nejdet Neydim for their feedback and advice in the process of writing this article.

#### **References**

- Atkinson K. 2008. When will there be good news? A Novel. Little, Brown and Company, London, UK, 1<sup>st</sup> ed., pp. 352
- Atwood M. 1997. Alias Grace. Anchor, London, UK, 1<sup>st</sup> ed., pp. 468.
- Calogeras CR. 1982. Sleepwalking and the traumatic experience. *Int J Psychol Anal*, 63: 483-489.
- Caruth C. 1995. Trauma: explorations in memory. Johns Hopkins University Press, Baltimore, USA, 1<sup>st</sup> ed., 9780801850073.
- Caruth C. 1996. Unclaimed experience: trauma, narrative, and history. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins UP, Baltimore, USA, 1<sup>st</sup> ed., pp. 168.
- Felman S, Dori L. 1992. Testimony: Crises of witnessing in literature, psychoanalysis, and history. Taylor & Francis, London, UK, 1<sup>st</sup> ed., pp. 312..
- Gordon A. 1997. Ghostly matters: haunting and the sociological imagination. University of Minnesota Press, Minnesota, USA, 1<sup>st</sup> ed., pp. 272.
- Hamilton SC. 2015. Sara Paretsky: Detective fiction as trauma literature. Manchester University Press, Manchester, UK, 1<sup>st</sup> ed., pp. 200.

- Herman J. 1992. Trauma and recovery. Basic Books, New York, USA, 1<sup>st</sup> ed., pp. 304.
- Hogle, Jerrold E. 2002. Introduction: The Gothic in Western Culture. In: Jerrold EH editor. The Cambridge Companion to Gothic Fiction. Cambridge UP, Cambridge, UK, 1<sup>st</sup> ed., pp. 1-20. Print.
- Kenway J. 2016. The ghosts of the school curriculum: past, present, and future. *Australian Educat Res*, 35(2): 1-13.
- Luckhurst R. 2006. Mixing memory and desire: psychoanalysis, psychology, and trauma theory. In: Waugh P. editor. *Literary theory and criticism: an Oxford guide*. Oxford University Press, Oxford, UK, 1<sup>st</sup> ed., pp. 497-507. ISBN 9781405112185.
- McLewin AL, Muller TR. 2006. Childhood trauma, imaginary companions, and the development of pathological dissociation. *Aggres Viol Behav*, 11: 531-545.
- Punter D. 1980. The literature of terror: a history of gothic fictions from 1765 to the present day. Longmans, London, UK, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed., 978-0582237148.
- Schimmel A. 1993. The triumphal sun: a study of the works of jalaloddin rumi. State University of New York Press, New York, USA, 1<sup>st</sup> ed., pp. 513.
- Ümit A. 2012. The dervish gate. Everest Publications, İstanbul, Türkiye, 1<sup>st</sup> ed., 408.
- Van der K, Bessel A, Van der OH. The intrusive past: The flexibility of memory and the engraving of trauma. *Psychoanal Culture Traum*, 48(4): 425-454.
- Van der K, Bessel A. 2014. The body keeps the score: brain, mind, and body in the healing of trauma. Penguin Publishing Group, New York, USA, 1<sup>st</sup> ed., pp. 464.
- Van der K, Bessel A. van der Kolk, B. A. (1996). The complexity of adaptation to trauma: Self-regulation, stimulus discrimination, and characterological development. In van der K, McFarlane AC, Weisaeth L, editors. *Traumatic stress: The effects of overwhelming experience on mind, body, and society*. Guilford Press, New York, USA, 1<sup>st</sup> ed., pp. 182-213.
- Van der K, McFarlane AC, 2007. Traumatic stress: the effects of overwhelming experience on mind, body, and society. Guilford Press, New York, USA, 1<sup>st</sup> ed., pp. 596.
- Van der K, McFarlane, and Weisaeth. Trauma and Memory. 279-302.
- Wisker G. 2016. Contemporary women's gothic fiction. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Ziolkowski T. 1978. Otherworlds: Fantasy and the fantastic. *The Sewanee Rev*, 86: 121-129.



## THE ADVERTISING POSTER: WHAT CONTRIBUTION IN FRENCH LESSONS?

Aboutayeb MOSTAFA<sup>1\*</sup>


<sup>1</sup>University Ibn Zohr, Faculty of Letters and Human Sciences, 80000, Agadir, Morocco

**Abstract:** Our article aims to present an approach that focuses on the didactisation of advertising by proposing the key tools for successful teaching of French. These publicity documents can also be used for evaluation purposes. This being said, we are going to evoke examples of activities and approaches that a teacher of FLE can use in his class, notably in the Moroccan school with its socio-cultural specificities. The latter is an inseparable factor in the production and design of the advertising poster. Among other things, we propose an analysis of the construction of the poster at the iconic and textual level, based on a corpus composed of three advertising posters representing three different telecommunications companies: Maroc Telecom -INWI - Orange. We will review the contribution of the advertising image in French lessons. In addition, we will propose a model of methodology and approach conceived for a French course by referring to our problematic presented at the beginning of our work, namely: How to achieve a semiotic approach to the advertising poster in the French language classroom? This being said, the salient points of our study are: firstly, the semiology of the advertising image. Secondly, the cultural framework and intercultural pedagogy in relation to the advertising poster. Thirdly, advertising as a didactic support in the teaching/learning of FLE.

**Keywords:** FLE, Didactics, Advertising, Culture, Semiotics

\*Corresponding author: University Ibn Zohr, Faculty of Letters and Human Sciences, 80000, Agadir, Morocco

E mail: mostafaaboutayeb@gmail.com (A. MOSTAFA)

Aboutayeb MOSTAFA  <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6802-4936>

Received: July 19, 2022

Accepted: November 10, 2022

Published: January 01, 2023

Cite as: Mostafa A. 2023. The advertising poster: What contribution in French lessons? BSJ Pub Soc Sci, 6(1): 12-20.

### 1. Introduction

Given the almost stellar and high intensity of the image use in our daily lives, which contributes to a large extent to advertising communication, the latter is increasingly taking on a privileged place in language teaching/learning. Therefore, the interest of researchers: linguists, semiologists, sociologists or others is to analyse the rhetorical discursive strategies implemented by advertising as a means of communication.

This complex object, the advertising image-text, is a rich enough authentic support for a multiple and varied pedagogical exploitation for our learners, thus offering an ease of access to the underlying meanings of its contents. In this sense, our semiotic approach will highlight the advertising poster as a linguistic, iconic and socio-cultural code in the so-called educational methodology.

Indeed, advertising is an excellent means of conveying knowledge and know-how, it is a bridge between cultures and ways of life. It also becomes an effective tool when associated with language teaching. However, advertising is often absent from learning contexts in the school environment. As a result, the school on the one hand misses an excellent method to develop its teaching methodologies at the theoretical and practical level, and on the other hand it misses an opportunity to form a responsible citizen, capable of criticizing and rationalizing her attitudes. An active actor with regard to

what is offered and not just a passive consumer who accepts everything.

Actually, these authentic advertising materials help to motivate learners by arousing their interest through creativity. In addition, they allow for concrete learning that targets written and oral language skills. These commercials can also be used as a learning tool and as an assessment tool. Therefore, the activities programmed in relation to these media must be adapted to the level of the targeted learners and according to the expected objectives without neglecting the implicit messages that these commercials can convey. This last point is closely linked to the cultural context.

Researchers in the field of didactics and pedagogy are well convinced of the usefulness of this method in classroom practice. This new trend, called the action approach, puts learners in real situations based on their experiences and their desire to buy, which will satisfy and meet their needs.

Considering the above, it seems appropriate to devote part of our study to the intercultural parameter, which is an attractive perspective for foreign language learning. Since the acquisition of the latter requires the use of grammatical rules and linguistic skills in addition to the implementation of the cultural factor. This approach requires the learner to adjust to these assets in order to achieve the objectives set for language teaching/learning





in general and FLE in particular.

This said, our study is part of the didactics of the FLE, by highlighting the importance of advertising discourse in the practice of the FLE class.

## **2. Methodological Overview**

Our conception will be supported by a semiotic reading which will allow:

### **2.1. The Teacher**

To be more vigilant and active with regard to the learners' productions which convey a multitude of messages and signs with varied socio-cultural and/or psycho-pedagogical charges. In addition to this skill, the teacher must have a perfect command of the description, analysis and interpretation of the various works according to the appropriate scientific standards.

### **2.2. The Learner**

To apprehend a rational approach when reading teaching materials or even authentic productions. A procedure that will make him/her an active receiver with a censorship system that makes him/her an informed receiver instead of an inert one. To this is added the increase of his motivation through the use of the image in its advertising aspect, hence his pedagogical interest which is presented through his participation in the learning of FLE.

Therefore, our approach will focus on the following points:

- **Problematic:** In order to inform our research method and delimit our approach, we will opt for a clear and precise questioning. As a corollary, our problematic is the following: How to achieve a semiotic approach to the advertising poster in the EFL classroom?
- **Corpus:** Our problematic calls upon a corpus which is composed of three advertising posters representing the three big Moroccan telecommunication: MAROC TELECOM, INWI and ORANGE. The materials in question deal with a theme that is ubiquitous in the daily lives of learners, namely telecommunications.

Therefore, we will deal with the following salient points:

- The semiology of the advertising image.
- The relationship between the advertising discourse and the cultural framework.
- Advertising as a didactic support in the FLE classroom.

## **3. The Semiology of the Advertising Image**

### **3.1. Definition**

Semiology by definition is the study of linguistic signs, whether verbal or non-verbal. For (Littré and Hauréau, 1885) "the term semiology was related to medicine". It is a recent discipline that has taken its place in the social sciences with authors such as A.J. Greimas, R. Barthes, J. Baudrillard, G. Mounin and Umberto Eco (Greimas, 1984).

In linguistics, the appearance of Ferdinand De Saussure's "Cours de linguistique générale" provides another definition. It is thus "a science which studies the life of signs within social life; it would form a part of social psychology, and consequently of general psychology" (De Saussure, 1972). This linguistic aspect affects both the formal and conceptual sides.

Semiotics will expand its definition depending on the field in which it is used. For example, in the field of philology, it is a general science of communication. For this reason, Éric Buyssens considers semiology to be a "science that studies the processes we use to communicate our states of consciousness" (Buyssens, 1967). But (Greimas, 1984) proposes a broader definition by revealing its cultural dimension so that it becomes a total social fact.

### **3.2. The Rhetoric of the Image vs. the Motivation of the Learner**

For the vast majority of people "advertising sucks". However, it is the result of several ingredients that have been methodically put together for a very precise and meticulously identified purpose. It is a product that is far from being a simple heterogeneity of concepts from multiple fields. In fact, advertising is the equivalent of a crossroads where psychology, sociology, linguistics, ethnology and even marketing (market research) intersect. This complexity is strengthened by other elements that come into play, such as the graphic and symbolic element. To find its legitimacy, this panoply of sciences refers to the socio-cultural aspect.

The specificity of the advertising image lies in its metaphorical nature, which conveys a variety of meanings and ideas. It is a fertile field for semiotic study in its branch devoted to the denotative and connotative analysis of the fixed image. It became a branch proposed by (Roland, 1964) in his article entitled "Rhetoric of the Image". The semiology of advertising was then developed by (Floch, 2002).

The advertising image is both communicative and meaningful, a multiple of tasks that requires the learner as receiver to decode the broadcasted messages according to norms. The nature of the advertising poster used in the EFL classroom encourages a dialogical discourse between the learner and the teacher.

The nature of the advertising poster used in the EFL classroom encourages a dialogic discourse between the learner and the teacher. This dialogue is enriched by all the components of the advertisement such as: the image, the colours, the words, the framing etc. This approach adopted by the producer of the advertisement aims to convince and persuade the receiver.

Among the tricks used to perfect the structure of the image is the notion of lines of force, which aim to control the receiver's gaze by focusing it on the name of the product and the brand, which is why the composition and layout are among the basic tools. This usefulness leads to the orientation and even the hierarchisation of the visual reading of the poster by the learner.

Indeed, the consideration of social affection and group membership seems to be one of the winning cards in the game of seduction played by advertising. A latent necessity provoked by the brand that impresses the learner who takes the action of analysis without being aware of this emotional and socio-cultural influence.

And if we try the cognitive key by appealing to the signifier/signified paradigm, we will find that the learner is more motivated once faced with an iconic or linguistic representation. These signifiers act as a catalyst for him to interpret them through a series of codes and signifiers which structure both his unconscious and his imaginary.

In fact, when we talk about the analysis of an advertising poster in a language class, we are revealing two major aspects that contribute to the understanding of its true meaning. The first aspect is the interaction of different tools and messages within the advertisement; the second aspect is the implicit and symbolic discourse between the advertiser and the receiver in this case the learner.

As far as the context of the advertising medium is concerned, it can be divided into two types: The first type has a denotative function. It includes all the plastic, iconic and linguistic signs which aim to persuade the receiver to act positively. The second conjuncture is from a cultural (connotative) perspective. The renewed dialogue between the sender and the receiver must respect the norms, representations and stereotypes conveyed in the social discourse.

#### **4. The Cultural Framework and Intercultural Pedagogy**

It is obvious that advertising discourse is inseparable from culture. Although each belongs to a different domain, they are linked by a situation of enunciation which converges towards the same objective, namely the persuasion of the enunciator.

##### **4.1. The Conception of Culture**

From an anthropological point of view, the conceptual framework of culture is among the social foundations of human activity, and is considered a very fertile field dominated by the human sciences. The notion of culture has had several definitions which vary according to the angle from which it is treated. For (Hall, 1984) "*Culture is communication and communication is culture*". In other words, learners' behaviours are permeated by culture, it is ubiquitous in their actions and interactions.

These human relationships convey a body of knowledge linked to social groups. In other words, it is intercultural communication that originates in the very individuals who transmit it, for without them culture would not exist. It is within a social group that culture is produced and later transmitted to other groups through the various intellectual, economic and social interactions.

This sharing, which contributes to the development of culture and even to the creation of another culture, leads us to consider another definition of culture, which is in reality a mixture of cultures that come into contact

according to a dynamic process and a particular mode of interaction and interrelations. In this sense, (Abdallah-Pretceille, 1996) specifies that "*culturalism, by its systematic accentuation of the cultural variable, leads to a form of "cultural scientism", a form of dogmatism or even cultural fundamentalism which leads to the negation of the universal dimension of any individual.*

In order to delimit our definition of the notion of culture, which is still largely polysemous, we opt for an approach that takes into consideration its conception according to the domains that we will choose. Indeed, the conflict that arises during cultural exchange is not an obstacle to the cohabitation of the holders of multiple cultures.

Culture is linked to the language of a social group or society in the broadest sense, they form an inseparable duo, and it is through language that culture manifests itself.

In view of the different definitions mentioned, we can conclude that culture is a phenomenon of society, a process in perpetual development that is enriched by the relationships and interactions between social groups that are ambassadors and actors of their identities and their own culture.

##### **4.2. Intercultural Pedagogy**

Intercultural pedagogy is an approach that consists in the internationalisation of the teaching/learning of EFL in a classroom where the learners come from one or more cultures different from the one that is the subject of learning. By putting the cursor on the said pedagogy, we will define it as an educational methodology based on mutual respect between representatives of differentiated cultures. As a result, the classroom provides an attractive context for its learners to learn by exploiting their diversity. This requires the adoption of a didactic planning and pedagogical steering that takes into consideration the available tools and the expected objectives.

Consequently, a culturally heterogeneous class is assimilated to society in its ethnic, religious and linguistic diversity. In other words, it is society in its micro perspective that aims at forming citizens who accept the other whatever his origins or representations. This future social actor is indeed supposed to be tolerant and flexible in his interactions with individuals and societies. This skill enables him/her to resolve the differences that characterise his/her surroundings. This type of reflection "*leads to a questioning of identity (for all partners) as well as to a communicative activity. It is indeed a work on oneself as much as a work with others*". (Abdallah-Pretceille, 2005).

It is clear that the frequent interaction of languages within the EFL classroom highlights the impact of languages on learners. In other words, language is one of the constitutive facets of the speaking subject as it is part of the diversities between social classes. Therefore, the activities programmed in the learning sessions are assimilations of everyday life as they provide opportunities for learners to prepare for real life.

The set of interactions carried out to learn FLE calls upon the different international resources capable of managing social relationships of all kinds. Learners are actors in their own learning in a heterogeneous context that conglomerates a variety of languages, cultures and religions.

By virtue of the above, this valuable asset is rich in vectors of meaning such as didactic and socio-cultural factors that intersect and combine despite the differences that set them apart (Appadurai, 2001) suggests that we "*think of the configuration of cultural forms as fundamentally fractal, that is, as lacking Euclidean boundaries, structures or regularities*". Therefore, the introduction of the intercultural parameter is a promising way to learn the foreign language. The acquisition of the latter is not limited to the knowledge of grammatical and linguistic rules, but it also affects its cultural dimension which requires the learner to adapt to its specificities in order to achieve the objectives set for the teaching/learning operation.

#### 4.3. The Moroccan Socio-Cultural Context

It should be said that modern Moroccan culture is the result of a continuous evolution throughout history. It is an intertwining and interaction between its different components, for example: the plastic arts, cinema and literature without neglecting certain data, namely the colonial heritage in its linguistic aspect (the French language). This observation confirms the Francophone dimension of Moroccan culture, and therefore its educational system, which opts for a completely Napoleonic example through its centralised management and the rigid content of its programmes.

The current policy of the state is to change the present situation, especially that of the education system, which is determined in a state of consumption and dependence, to a state of creativity and autonomy. This policy aims at creating interactive relationships while preserving the identity of Moroccan society. Thus, cultural practice is not only a weak echo of a fundamentalist culture that is reduced to its ethical facet or its simplest ritualistic meaning; it is a whole process that takes into consideration the different activities and productions that are capable of facing the multiple challenges with theological, linguistic, intellectual references...

Clearly, there is no single or even dominant model of Moroccan culture. Several researches have endorsed the cultural diversity of Moroccan society which emanates from the variation of its communities characterised by their behaviors' which convey their own values and meanings. A reality that finds its place in its different public and private school cycles.

However, this specificity is far from being in its raw state, but rather in a dynamism of historical change joining the clan of the rest of the Maghreb countries. This situation which, according to (Moatassime and Berque, 1979)

*Allows us to conclude, in the light of many verifications, that the Maghrebian system is based on regularities - agrarian order, rhythms, cycles, itineraries and gatherings*

*- that nowhere do we find either direct or raw, but shaped by - the Islam of the Doctors - in a back-and-forth movement between the Arab East and the Mediterranean West.*

In other words, each society is part of an increasingly developing intercultural model, and this through a philosophical and historical tradition. This interactional relationship determines the place and characteristics of both these societies and their citizens.

Anthropologists have often said that an isolated culture is condemned to death. Moroccan culture was always open to other cultures. Its multicultural aspect contributed to the socialisation of its individuals by adapting to other cultures without losing their identities. Abdallah-Pretceille (2005) sees in this intercultural approach an adequate approach to the study of social mechanisms (in its macro aspect) and educational mechanisms (in its micro aspect): "It is the strategies, the manipulations, the dynamics, and not the structures, the characteristics or the categories that are the privileged objects of the intercultural approach".

Indeed, Moroccan culture is both simple and complex, clearly distinguished from other cultures by its unique characteristics. It is based on fundamental values that condition its dynamism. These values can be presented in three types: the logic of allegiance, the familiar dimension and the sacredness of dignity. This specificity has marked its educational system through its programmes, approaches and aims.

#### 5. The Pragmatic Perspective of the Advertising Poster

The object of our study is an integral part of the communication process, which implies subjectivity and intentionality.

Our corpus consists of three advertising posters representing three Moroccan telecommunication companies: Orange (Figure 1); Inwi (Figure2); Maroc télécom (Figure 3).



Figure 1. Orange: I want to live my passion for football.





Figure 2. Inwi: Call to discover all our good plans.



Figure 3. Maroc télécom: For a future of solidarity, equity and responsibility.

The operational objective of this semiotic analysis is the study of the poster as a whole composed of image and writing. These selected advertising posters are a set of connoted and denoted emblems and symbols. In visual semiotics, the image is seen as a self-sufficient unit of manifestation, as a whole of meaning, capable of being subjected to analysis. "The image is not constituted by the iconic or figurative sign alone, but weaves different materials together to form a visual message" (Joly, 2011). The design of the advertising poster is a matter of skill and rationality that aims at orienting the receiver towards a precise objective that manifests itself in its persuasion. In this article, we understand the functioning of the poster from a pragmatic perspective which, according to (Everaert-Desmedt, 2012), explains the meaning of signs and their action on the interpreter, in this case the learner.

## 6. The Socio-Cultural Challenge of Maroc Telecom

In order to highlight the socio-cultural aspect of the advertising poster, we will focus on one of the three components of our corpus, which is the Maroc Telecom poster (Figure 3).

It is obvious that "Advertising is a social phenomenon, an active agent of cultural evolution" (Cathelat, 1992). In this perspective the analysis will be carried out from a socio-cultural perspective. In other words, the learner will try to dismantle the signs of multiculturalism in the poster through the characters and the style, which offers a very interesting specificity for his advertising creation. Indeed, we are looking at a "globalisation" (Maalouf, 1998) through the different cultures represented by the children in the image. A strategy that will lead the learner to create a common bond, a culture that is not alien to their own and to individuals of different ethnicities, colours and societies.

Referring to the textual component "Maroc Telecom Group Annual Report 2010" (URL1) We can see that the international vision of the Maroc Telecom company is well and truly present in this advertisement. On the one hand, it targets Moroccan society with its cultural identity, and on the other hand, it appeals to a new culture that refers to westernisation and multilingualism. The latter concept aims to bring together a majority that is accessible to them through the means of communication of the modern world.

Consequently, the French language taught is impregnated by this multicultural intention, but with an influential privilege of French culture imposed by its language and the fashion of the characters' clothing. The use of this foreign language, which is intended above all for a Moroccan learner of mixed Arab and Amazigh culture, reflects a tendency on the part of the advertiser to arouse the social side of a part of the receivers who consider the French language as an index of prestige, luxury and modernisation. This obsession has remained rooted in the minds of the majority of Moroccans since the years of French colonisation, which explains the decision taken by the advertiser who is well convinced of the relevance of his choice which goes well with the linguistic prejudices of Moroccan society.

It is clear that the staging of the characters and the colours (blue, orange, green) as well as the marriage of the text and the visual were treated to seduce and attract the public towards the advertising object. Nevertheless, the context of the poster deals with cultural diversity, so the problem lies in the identity of the target audience, which remains difficult to define or categorise.

## 7. Integrating Advertising into a Language Course

We all know that mobile phones are ubiquitous among learners, and have become a necessity for them, even an obsession, as they use them. It is the most motivating

topical subject that can guarantee the participation of learners in the activity envisaged in class, following the example of the advertising posters that we propose as the corpus of our study, and which represent the telecommunication products belonging to three companies active on the Moroccan market.

The exploitation of advertising discourse seems to be a motivating way to learn French insofar as it takes into consideration the needs of the learners, what interests them to the benefit of their interests.

In terms of examples, the learners are called upon to critically read the different messages based on an observation grid proposed by the teacher. The methodology implemented by the teacher will mobilise a whole range of resources, including the discourse used and the various adapted didactic methods which will facilitate the task of both the teacher and the learners. The latter will try to deepen their understanding and improve their ability to interpret and critique the messages received. More than that, they will question the sincerity of the sender. The creation of such an "active" reception in the learner could be one of the skills to be set by the teacher.

By means of the main characteristics of the advertising poster studied, the learners will identify and analyse the determinants of the target group aimed at by the advertiser, i.e. its socio-cultural and psychological characteristics. Of course, the interpretation of the different textual and iconic signs remains a complex and complicated task in a classroom. In the French classroom, this type of activity using advertising posters allows learners to study all the discursive forms used (informative, mechanistic, suggestive, etc.) and particularly the construction of the language.

This method, for which the advertising poster is a support, allows the learner to study the discursive forms used, such as: informative and suggestive, particularly the construction of the messages conveyed, without obviously neglecting the means used by the speaker to defend their point of view. The latter is intended to incite the receiver to adhere to the advertisement.

The use of advertising as an authentic document is one approach among others recommended by educationalists. This tool, known as advertising, is one of the essential media in the teaching of foreign languages, which requires its didactisation by means of analysis and highlighting of its characteristics. This is an obvious fact that reinforces the importance of this pedagogical tool. In other words, opt for the mastery of communication skills. Indeed, the real value of advertising is that it offers wide possibilities for discussion and analysis that further encourage learners' creativity and teachers' enthusiasm. It "*seems to be a rich and interesting concept: rich because it is multifaceted, interesting because it is fascinating*" (Dao, 2009, p. 95).

Furthermore, the integration of advertising in a language course offers learners "*opportunities to approach a whole professional sector and lead them to carry out projects*

*where they produce media themselves*" (Marmisese and Bensa, 2005). That said, (Dolz and Schneuwly, 1998) advocate "designing didactic sequences based on the logic of textual genres" of which advertising is one of the didactically profitable elements with its specific combination of linguistic and iconic signs.

For (Fath, 2010) "*the advertising spot can become a valuable pedagogical tool*" insofar as it is a gateway to the cultural context of a given society with its values, norms and representations.

## 8. Methodology and Approach in a French Course

Advertising is presented as an assembly uniting iconic and linguistic signs, two distinct but inseparable components. It is the "image-text" (Spitzer, 1978, p. 54). This particularity opens several avenues for its pedagogical use in the language classroom.

### 8.1. The Images Used

All advertisements can be used for educational purposes, but modifications can be made to adapt them and make them suitable for teaching.

The analysis and interpretation of an advertising poster is based on two major axes: Iconographic and textual (Figure 1).

#### 8.1.1. The iconographic axis

- The immediate constituents of the image (the first elements that jump out at us).
- The meaning and representation of iconographic signs (lines, colours, logo).
- The scenic characteristics of the image (the different planes, the angles of the shot).
- The communicative relationship between the content presented (the product) and the receiver.
- The socio-cultural issue and its impact.

#### 8.1.2. The textual axis

- Identification of the words in the advertising text: brand name, slogan and their meaning at the denotative and connotative level.
- The rhetorical dimension of the discourse: metaphors / figures of speech in addition to the implicit.
- The message in its argumentative dimension: logical sequences and sales arguments.

#### 8.1.3. The actors

The learner is at the centre of the teaching/learning process. His/her act consists of the construction of his/her own learning (empowerment) under the guidance of the teacher.

## 8.2. Examples of Advertising Analysis

### 8.2.1. Example 1

#### The context

Among the criteria that contribute to the success of the advertisement is the right choice of context. A selection that targets the most relevant objects to be used with the primary objective of consolidating the growing reputation of the producer, and presenting the



product/service in a very "people" and worldly way.

The advertiser also capitalises on the product with different types of spots aimed at customers with good purchasing power. It is therefore reasonable to choose the best-known and most frequented channels to promote your models, and the quality of the high-end printing medium is highly recommended.

#### Visual signs

The analysis of the visual signs that make up the plastic message remains an infallible step, a must for a complete and fairly broad vision of the ad. These elements concern:

- The framework [...]
- The framing [...]
- The angle of the shot and the choice of the lens [...] o  
The composition [...]
- Layout, colour and lighting, shape, composition, texture (URL2).

For example, the placement of the elements, the fact of placing the product in line with the eye, immediately attracts the reader's attention. At the symbolic level, the chromatic codes and the choice of colours highlight the body and better present its curves and shapes, and also evoke art photography in a subjective way.

Indeed, the enhancement of the property is highly dependent on the textual aspect of a typeface whose ornamental perspective is a guarantee of aestheticism and attractiveness. In addition, the reader is influenced by the various iconic messages that have prepared him to accept and mentally integrate the rhetorical aspect. This multi-dimensional technique creates a set of cognitive abilities in the learner that facilitates both the coding and memorization of the product.

#### 8.2.2. Example 2

We propose here a pedagogical approach that can be carried out in an FLE class:

In an oral or written session, learners will work on the advertising poster by analysing its two components: iconic and textual. For the icon, learners will be asked to study figurative and non-figurative elements such as colours and composition, i.e. qualified (value-bearing) icons.

They will also resort to a triadic semiotic analysis by exploiting its three basic poles: the representamen as a trigger of the semiotic process, the interpreter and the object in order to deconstruct the advertising image and grasp its different meanings.

They will then try to show the socio-cultural side of the poster by pointing out the Moroccan context. To conclude the analysis, the learners will highlight the relationship between the textual and the visual and the contribution of this relationship to the success of the advertising poster.

#### 8.3. The Argumentative Strategy

For Figure 2 the argumentative strategy is carried out in three stages:

##### 8.3.1. The first stage

Which aims first of all to make the recipient aware of the product and then its learning (a cognitive option). In

order to achieve this objective, it is necessary to use framing in its notion of distance by focusing on the size of the image (the dimensions of the object).

##### 8.3.2. The second stage

This stage is designed to seduce and hook the learner by emphasising the emotional aspect (an affective option). The colours, shapes and fashions of the photos the advertiser chooses are not random, they all have significant affective dimensions. Of course, this is not without the socio-cultural frame of reference which is omnipresent in the advertising mind and which is considered to be the promising guarantor of the credibility of the ad.

##### 8.3.3. The third stage

Concludes the two previous stages. Its aim is to challenge the reader and expect a response from him or her by means of

- Stimulating the cognitive process via perception, memorization, reasoning and decision making.
- Inspiring the desire to buy the product and persuading the receiver to make the purchase.

The highlighted product and/or service becomes in a way the representation of an abstract implicit discourse, which goes beyond the image and refers more to the social clan by pushing the receiver to adopt the values propagated by the ad. This affective/emotional aspect deals in magnitude with the subjective function in relation to the objective one. In other words, to enhance the evaluative component of the product and its social perception (the search for belonging to a social class).

#### 8.4. The Main Phases of a French Course

The course is structured around three phases:

##### 8.4.1. Before the lesson

The teacher integrates the learner in the construction of the lesson by asking him/her to prepare a file on the chosen theme. For example: the effects of new communication technology on people's daily lives, based on the INWI advertisement.

The research carried out can occasionally deal with the lexical or semantic field that will be the framework of the activity envisaged in class. E.g.: a list of all the words related to communication.

##### 8.4.2. During the course

Getting the learners involved in the piloting and implementation of the course is not an easy task. To achieve this, the teacher first explains the process to be followed to analyse the poster, then recommends working in groups according to a clear grid covering shapes, colours, characters and words. Once this has been done, the results should be pooled and the clues noted on the board. The evaluation of the effectiveness of the analysed message is the final point to be discussed. During this evaluation questions can be asked such as:

- Did you like the product?
- Would you like to buy it?

##### 8.4.3. After the lesson

This last phase is seen as an extension of the oral work done in class, the learner is asked to continue his or her

written research individually at home. The suggested activities consist of:

- Reproduction of the subject sheet from the class session (for the more advanced learners)
- Collecting similar advertisements from competing brands.

To get more out of the product, the use of ICT is one of the best ways to manipulate the image. This step is supposed to be supported by the necessary linguistic work to improve learners' lexical competence.

In this sense, learners will use computers with image editing software to change elements of the text-image such as the frame or background, which will allow them to check the assumptions and answers they have made about the meanings of the advert.

## 9. Conclusion

In conclusion, we have mentioned a section on advertising in the French classroom in an attempt to present one didactic model among others. In other words, our proposal has covered the activities and the methodology adapted to the exploitation of this didactic support.

Thus, we have carried out a semiotic analysis of advertising posters which are both a means of expression for the advertisers as enunciators and a means of understanding and interpretation for the public, in this case the learners in the FLE classroom. Along the way, we became interested in other themes that we consider essential to our work, such as pragmatics and argumentative strategy, focusing on the textual, the visual, the socio-cultural and the image/text relationship. We found through our study that the socio-cultural factor is inseparable from the production and design of an advertising poster. Moreover it has an impact on the analysis and the choice of the type of advertising poster in an EFL classroom. The learner looks for situations in the learning situations that are similar to his or her real life experience. This procedure allows him to operate the signs which are familiar to him to use them in the various proposed pedagogical operations.

Finally, it should be noted that the contribution of the semiotic model to the field of didactics is manifested in the understanding of the different processes of description of actions used in the field of teaching. In other words, this model aims to highlight systems of meaning that are based on objective representations and rational operating rules.

## Author Contributions

The percentage of the author contributions is present below. The author reviewed and approved final version of the manuscript.

	A.M.
C	100
D	100
S	100
DCP	100
DAI	100
L	100
W	100
CR	100
SR	100
PM	100
FA	100

C=Concept, D= design, S= supervision, DCP= data collection and/or processing, DAI= data analysis and/or interpretation, L= literature search, W= writing, CR= critical review, SR= submission and revision, PM= project management, FA= funding acquisition.

## Conflict of Interest

The author declare that there is no conflict of interest.

## References

- Abdallah-Pretceille M. 1996. Pour un autre paradigme de la culture: De la culture à la culturalité, pour en finir avec « Babel ». In Education et communication interculturelle. PUF, Paris, France, pp: 208.
- Abdallah-Pretceille M. 2005. Pour un humanisme du divers. Dans VST - Vie sociale et traitements, no: 87, Paris, France, pp: 34-41.
- Appadurai A. 2001. Après le colonialisme. Les conséquences culturelles de la globalisation. Payot, Paris, France, pp: 85.
- Buysens E. 1967. La Communication et l'articulation linguistique. Presses Universitaires de Bruxelles, Brussels, Belgium, pp: 175.
- Cathelat B. 1992. Publicité et société. Payot, Paris, France, pp: 223.
- Dao TP. 2009. Message publicitaire et son utilisation dans la classe de français. ULE Université de Danang, Leviet Dung, France, pp: 95.
- De Saussure F. 1972. Cours de linguistique générale. Publie Par, Paris, France, pp : 408.
- Dolz J, Schneuwly B. 1998. Pour un enseignement de l'oral; Imitation aux genres formels à l'école. ESF éditeurs, Paris, France, pp: 114.
- Everaert-Desmedt N. 2012. Réception d'une œuvre d'art: la pensée iconique. Du récepteur ou l'art de déballer son pique-nique. URL: <http://ceredi.labos.univ-rouen.fr/public/?reception-d-une-oeuvre-d-artla.html> (access date: June 07, 2022).
- Fath NE. 2010. De l'apport interculturel du spot publicitaire en didactique du FLE. Sudlangues, 13: 1-12.
- Floch JM. 2002. Sémiotique, marketing et communication. Sous les signes, les stratégies. Formes sémiotiques. Presses Universitaires de France, Paris, France.
- Greimas AJ. 1984. Langue Française. Entretien, 61: 121-128.
- Hall ET. 1984. Le langage silencieux. Editions du Seuil, Paris, France, pp: 219.
- Joly M. 2011. L'image et les signes: Approches sémiologiques de

- l'image fixe, Ed 2. Nathan, Paris, France, pp: 61.
- Littré MPÉ, Hauréau B. 1885. Raimond Lulle, ermite, in Histoire littéraire de la France XXIX. Paris, France, pp : 618.
- Maalouf A. 1998. Les identités meurtrières. Grasset & Fasquelle, Paris, France, pp: 83-184.
- Marmisese S, Bensa A. 2005. L'Education aux médias de la maternelle au lycée. CCNDP, Paris, France, pp: 121.
- Moatassime A, Berque J. 1979. L'intérieur du Maghreb (XVe-XIXe siècles). Parcourir Les Collections, 20(80): 901-903.  
URL: [https://www.persee.fr/issue/tiers\\_0040-7356\\_1979\\_num\\_20\\_80](https://www.persee.fr/issue/tiers_0040-7356_1979_num_20_80) (access date: July 07, 2022).
- Roland B. 1964. Rhétorique de l'image. Communications, 4: 40-51.
- Spitzer L. 1978. La publicité américaine comme art populaire. Poétique, 34: 54.
- URL1: [https://www.iam.ma/Lists/Publication/Attachments/20/Rapport-Annuel-Maroc-Telecom-2010\\_MAI-2011.pdf](https://www.iam.ma/Lists/Publication/Attachments/20/Rapport-Annuel-Maroc-Telecom-2010_MAI-2011.pdf) (access date: June 07, 2022).
- URL2: <http://www.cours-photophiles.com/index.php/les-bases-techniques-photo/102-cadrage-et-composition> (access date: July 04, 2022).



## THE HIDDEN SIDE OF THE COVID-19 EPIDEMIC PROCESS INCREASING DOMESTIC VIOLENCE

Bilal CEYLAN<sup>1\*</sup>, Rahime ERDOĞAN<sup>1</sup>, Ali BOZDEMİR<sup>1</sup>, İsmail YURDAKUL<sup>1</sup>, Hidayet TAŞ<sup>1</sup>, Ela ERDEN<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Tarsus District Directorate of National Education, 33440, Tarsus, Mersin, Türkiye

**Abstract:** After COVID-19, which took hold of the world when the least expected, was declared as a pandemic, quickly made its presence felt throughout the world, and this sudden evolvement undoubtedly affected the family structure and intrafamilial relations the most. While the quarantine process was an opportunity for families which could not get around to each other in family relationships, the situation was not at all heartwarming for family members who had problems in intrafamilial relationships. Home became the most used place in the quarantine process means that families spend time together longer than usual. As families who had problems in pre-COVID-19 period had to spend more time together at the quarantine process, this situation made this difficult situation even more troublesome for family members who experienced violence in the home. This study was conducted to compare the restrictions and quarantine months applied in the Covid-19 continuum with the months before the restriction. The aim of the study is to determine the percentage increase in the number of domestic violence cases that mount during the months restrictions were imposed due to quarantine. The study was carried out with the official figures taken from the courthouse of Tarsus district of Mersin province. The study was completed by comparing the average of the domestic violence applications made to the Tarsus courthouse, in the average months of March, April, May and June, which are the months of restrictions, and the monthly average of cases in September, October, November, December, January and February, which are the months before the restrictions. In the comparison made, it was found that there was a % 129.48 increase in domestic violence numbers during the quarantine months when restrictions were applied. When the quarantine months are compared with the months in the previous year, it was determined that the increase was 276.84%.

**Keywords:** Quarantine, Pandemic, Domestic violence, Covid-19, Tarsus

\*Corresponding author: Tarsus District Directorate of National Education, 33440, Tarsus, Mersin, Türkiye

E mail: bilalim0842@hotmail.com (B. CEYLAN)

Bilal CEYLAN  <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1888-7450>  
Rahime ERDOĞAN  <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7530-4824>  
Ali BOZDEMİR  <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-7847-771X>  
İsmail YURDAKUL  <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4695-6318>  
Hidayet TAŞ  <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0769-8184>  
Ela ERDEN  <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-5659-917X>

Received: September 07, 2022

Accepted: November 10, 2022

Published: January 01, 2023

**Cite as:** Ceylan B, Erdoğan R, Bozdemir A, Yurdakul I, Taş H, Erden E. 2023. The hidden side of the covid-19 epidemic process increasing domestic violence. *BSJ Pub Soc Sci*, 6(1): 21-26.

### 1. Introduction

Domestic violence is a major problem that negatively affects the lives of family members and thus the social structure in both urban and rural life. Although this problem is a common problem not only in our country but also in all countries of the world, it is increasing rapidly every year. Violence is accepted as a public health problem that can be seen in all areas of human life and its prevalence is increasing in terms of the world. Domestic violence, on the other hand, is defined as an act carried out by one of the family members towards another family member, who shares the same house and has a kinship relationship, which disrupts the physical and psychological integrity of the individual subjected to violence and harms his/her personality. When the types of violence are examined, it is seen that domestic violence, which is applied by men against women and children, is stated as the most common type of violence regardless of variables such as geographical boundaries, economic development level and education level, and

violence is expressed as an important problem all over the world and cultures (Aksoy et al., 2013).

Domestic violence can be defined as any kind of aggressive behavior that a person exerts against his/her spouse, children, parents, siblings or close relatives (Akın, 2013). All kinds of aggressive behaviors include not only physical behaviors that constitute physical violence but also economic, emotional and sexual violence that occurs as a result of behaviors such as threatening, despising, humiliating and restricting economic freedom (Mor Çatı, 2015). Undoubtedly, women are the ones who are most exposed to domestic violence. Although there are quite sufficient legal regulations regarding domestic violence in Türkiye, violence continues to increase day by day. In particular, female children and women are exposed to physical, economic, psychological and sexual violence in the context of the nuclear family, extended family, on the street, at school and in business life, and the violence has very comprehensive consequences ranging from female



children's inability to read to women's inability to participate effectively in social life, to the unwanted marriages arising due to the increase of women's violence against their children and disabilities and deaths.

The epidemic caused by COVID-19, which has turned into a pandemic, still continues to have an effect all over the world. Many countries have implemented various measures such as social distancing, isolation and, in some cases, quarantine in order to control the epidemic despite the rapid spread of the virus and the absence of drugs or vaccines that have been proven to be effective. With social isolation measures and quarantine practices, there have been reports that crime rates in the society have decreased in various parts of the world, but domestic violence, violence against women and domestic violence have increased and concerns have been expressed in this regard (Toprak et al., 2020). Following the news in the media, the World Health Organization published a report in March 2020 that drew attention to this situation and included recommendations for the health systems of the countries (Time, 2020). Similarly, the Council of Europe reported an alarming increase in cases of domestic violence in a large number of council members during the COVID-19 pandemic. The aim of this study is to investigate how the COVID-19 process affects the family and domestic violence.

## **2. Significance of the Study**

The pandemic process, which increases its intensity more and more, undoubtedly increases the unknown and curious issues day by day. With this study, the effects of family and domestic violence, which are among the institutions most affected by this process, have been revealed. During the pandemic period, isolation at home has been recommended as the safest measure to protect from the virus and not to infect others. However, houses, which should be a safe area for everyone, are very risky places for individuals who are exposed to domestic violence. Those who committed violence and individuals who were exposed to it with the epidemic suddenly closed down in their houses and entered a process in which the risk of exposure to domestic violence increased even more by being stuck in an abusive relationship.

In this context, social isolation at home has made individuals who are exposed to domestic violence vulnerable to another danger while protecting them from a danger. It is known that the risk is higher especially for vulnerable groups such as women, children, elderly and disabled individuals. Women who were most exposed to domestic violence had more difficulty in reaching support mechanisms than ever before when they were locked in a house with men who committed violence 24 hours a day. Women call the helplines at the first opportunity they are alone, and they are afraid of being exposed to more violence if the violent man is aware of it (Mor Çatı, 2020). It is also reported that some individuals

who are exposed to domestic violence are afraid to go to hospitals due to the fear of COVID-19 contagion (Usher, 2020). Social isolation has also made it difficult for women to access social supports such as family or friends, and the traces of violence have been hidden in the house. In addition, women were dismissed due to the pandemic or forced to take unpaid leave. Economic losses/difficulties may have made it even more difficult to leave the violent spouse/partner and thus move away from violence (Washington Post, 2020).

## **3. Literature Review**

### **3.1. Definition of Domestic Violence**

The family, which should be a unit that meets the nutritional and care needs of individuals, gives a sense of trust, protects and improves physical and mental health, is often the only focus where all kinds of violence are nourished and applied (Aile, 2004). While the society is held responsible for the violence that takes place outside the family, the violence occurring within the family remains confidential, is accepted as a private life, and is often accepted as usual and legally (Dekeşeredy, 2004). Public awareness about domestic violence is very variable. There may be opinions in the form of not believing and denying the existence of such violence, as well as opinions that approve such violence. Violence is all of the individual or collective movements that cause people to be physically or mentally injured, injured and disabled. Domestic violence, on the other hand, refers to the realization of such a movement in the family. Domestic violence is largely directed at women and children, and the person who committed this violence is also a man. 90% of the physical and sexual violence reported by psychiatric patients was committed by family members. All of the behaviors that disrupt the mental and physical integrity of the child are defined as child abuse. Another frequently used concept in this field is child neglect. This means that parents do not meet the basic vital needs of children such as care, nutrition, shelter, warm-up, dressing, meeting their health and education needs, or do not adopt a wrong attitude and use contemporary information on these issues.

### **3.2. Causes of Violence**

The causes of violence are very diverse and complex. In terms of easy understanding, it is possible to collect the causes of violence in general and domestic violence in particular under three main headings: biological reasons, psychological reasons and social reasons.

### **3.3. Biological Causes of Domestic Violence**

Biological causes include some mental illnesses such as the effect of masculinity hormones, schizophrenia, paranoid schizophrenia, and some mental disorders such as antisocial personality disorder. The fact that the aggressive family members who commit violence are mostly men and that these aggressive behaviors start to decrease with advancing age suggests that masculinity hormones are effective in violent behavior. Delusions, hallucinations (seeing, hearing or smelling things that do



not really exist), schizophrenia that occurs with symptoms such as distancing from reality, loss of emotional responses, deterioration of social relations, and paranoid schizophrenia, which is a special type of this, where feelings such as suspicion, jealousy, and arrogance come to the forefront, are among the biological causes (Jackson 1999). Antisocial personality disorders, in which attitudes such as irresponsible, reactive and thoughtless behavior, showing unscrupulous and criminal behaviors and enjoying them are seen, are among the biological causes of violence.

#### **3.4. Psychological Causes of Domestic Violence**

Women who are constantly subjected to domestic violence, that is, beaten by their spouses, have not chosen to be like this. Most spouses who commit violence do not practice it in the early stages of family unity. When deep spiritual ties begin to form, then violent tendencies manifest themselves (Bilgel, 2006). The first attack of violence is a surprise for the abused spouse and is not interpreted in any way as a tendency to violence. But the truth is that the nature of violence tends to increase over time. Initial injuries are considered minor and insignificant, and the abused spouse believes that the abusive spouse does not intend to harm him/her. There is no significant change in their feelings towards their spouse. However, when the extent of violence progresses, the emotional bond of the violated spouse gradually weakens, the fear of encountering a greater attack of violence increases if he/she leaves his/her spouse. Added to this, the concern of not receiving support from social institutions, the spouse who has been subjected to violence finds himself/herself trapped in a devastating marriage trap. People who use violence continue to use violence if they think that the benefit they will receive from this violence is more than the cost of violence. Why do men beat up women? Because they can. For men, the gains of beating their spouses are to eliminate emotional pressures, find a way out of their disappointment, and ensure that their own desires come true. On the other hand, the cost is quite low. Because: Women cannot resist this because they are physically and economically vulnerable, society regards this phenomenon as a private domestic issue and the efforts of protective social organizations are limited. The most serious cost that the person who commits violence may face is the loss of the spouse through divorce, which is often controlled by increasing the use of violence.

#### **3.5. Social Causes of Domestic Violence**

Violence is a behavior that can be learned. The most important source of learning is the family of the person who uses violence. It has been shown that those who grow up in an environment where domestic violence is practiced in childhood and youth have a tendency to show violence. In addition, the acceptance of violence as a value judgment shared by the society and its transfer from generation to generation is also accepted as a social reason. The inadequacy of communication skills of societies, the habit of expressing emotions and thoughts

in provocative ways, unconscious accusations, false sense of honor and morality can also be counted among the social causes of violence. Socio-economic pressures such as poverty, being unlucky in the face of life, lack of expectations and acquired qualities may also cause violence. People with alcohol and substance addiction are more prone to violence as a result of the mental effects caused by these social factors and the addictive substances they use (Yetim, 2008; Yıldırım, 2013).

#### **3.6. Types of Domestic Violence**

Domestic violence can occur in different ways when its application and the people to whom it is applied are taken into consideration. As per its application: Physical, emotional (psychological) and economic violence can be mentioned.

#### **3.7. Physical Violence**

It is the most common form of domestic violence. Physical violence practices include shaking, beating, slapping, beating, throwing objects at the individual, hitting the walls, dragging the individual by the hair and to the ground, pushing, beating him/her with sticks and wood, tying the individual's hands, forcibly having sexual intercourse, walking onto the individual with sharp objects, and using the same to injure the individual, using firearms, and killing persons (Aktaş, 2006).

#### **3.8. Emotional Violence**

All of the actions that are performed without physical pressure such as yelling at the person, humiliating the person in front of others, hurting his/her pride, threatening to inflict physical violence, taking away the freedom of expression of the person's feelings and thoughts, forcing him/her to think and act as himself/herself, restricting the freedom of movement of the person, prohibiting communication with his/her family members or friends, restricting the freedom of dressing as the person desires, and disrupting his/her mental health are within the scope of emotional violence (Aksoy, 1999).

#### **3.9. Economic Violence**

Actions such as taking away the freedom of people to work and to provide income, preventing them from buying and selling goods, confiscating their income, and forcing them to work to provide income (Aksoy, 1999). According to the people to whom domestic violence is applied, it may be in the form of violence against spouses, children or elderly people at home. In terms of violence against spouses, it is more common for men to use violence against women.

#### **3.10. Domestic Violence during the Covid-19 Process**

During the pandemic period, isolation at home has been recommended as the safest measure to protect from the virus and not to infect others. However, houses, which should be a safe area for everyone, are very risky places for women, children and the elderly who are exposed to violence. Those who committed violence with the epidemic and those who were exposed to violence suddenly closed down at home and entered a process in which the risk of exposure to domestic violence

increased even more by being stuck in an abusive relationship. In this context, while social isolation at home protects from the risk of COVID-19, it has made it open to another danger. It is reported that the risk is higher especially for disadvantaged groups such as women, children, elderly and disabled. While women were locked in a house with men who committed violence for 24 hours in this process, they had more difficulty than ever in accessing support mechanisms. Women call the helplines at the first opportunity they are alone, and they are afraid of being exposed to more violence if the violent man is aware of it.

It is also reported that some women who are exposed to domestic violence are afraid to go to hospitals due to the fear of COVID-19 transmission. Social isolation also made it difficult for those who were exposed to violence to access social supports such as family or friends, and the traces of violence were hidden in the house. In addition, women who were most exposed to domestic violence were dismissed or forced to take unpaid leave due to the pandemic, and economic losses/difficulties made it more difficult to leave the violent spouse/partner and thus to get away from violence. With the widespread use of the Internet and technology in recent years, digital violence is on the agenda as a new form of gender-based violence. Digital violence is defined as the sending, publishing and persistent pursuit of materials such as insult, threat, hate, blasphemy or sexually explicit writing, image, etc. against women in the digital internet environment. It has been reported that the number of applications received due to digital violence in Türkiye has increased during the pandemic period and constitutes 11% of all notifications. This increase seems to be related to the increase in the use of technology in homes with staying at home to ensure social isolation. In addition to being limited to the spouse/partner who inflicts violence at home, it is reported that many factors such as a general fear and uncertainty about the epidemic in the society, psychological problems caused by increasing unemployment and economic difficulties, difficulties in accessing the health system, and an increase in alcohol consumption caused by isolation at home increase domestic violence. Previous epidemic and natural disaster experiences in the world similarly show that family violence increases during the epidemic process and, on the other hand, preventive and preventive activities decrease. In addition, it is stated that the increase in domestic violence incidents that increase after natural disasters can last up to one year after the end of the disaster.

#### 4. Method

As a result of the examination of the data shared on the internet, the basic data of the research were obtained by subjecting it to content analysis with literature review. In addition, the Tarsus example, which is an example related to this subject, was evaluated. In the Tarsus example, the main data of the study constitute the

number of monthly domestic violence applications received from the Tarsus Courthouse. By applying to Tarsus Courthouse with a petition, the monthly number of people who applied for domestic violence was requested. The number of domestic violence in March, April, May, June, July, August, September, October, November, December, January and February of the previous year was taken as the prequarantine period on a monthly basis. As for the quarantine period, the number of domestic violence in March, April, May and June was taken on a monthly basis due to the first Covid19 case announced on March 13 in Türkiye. The number of domestic violence officially received from the Tarsus Courthouse was divided into two periods as pre-quarantine and quarantine period. At the same time, these months were compared with the same periods of the previous year and averaged. These averages were compared and the percentage increase in the quarantine process was calculated.

#### 5. Findings and Interpretation

Even in the routine flow of life, when the situation is so dire, what kind of change occurs in domestic violence when life goes beyond the normal flow? How did the restrictions applied during the COVID-19 process affected the domestic violence cases, which is the main question of the study? Did it increase or decrease? It did. As a result of the research conducted to find the answer to this question, it has been determined that the general increase in domestic violence in Tarsus district during the COVID-19 process and the restrictions applied during the quarantine process is 129.48%, and the increase in family violence in the comparison of the quarantine months with the same months of the previous year is 276.84%.

The number of 12-month cases was determined and averaged before March, the month in which the restriction and quarantine applications started. Accordingly, there were a total of 2253 applications to the Tarsus courthouse for domestic violence incidents, 94 in March 2019, 101 in April 2019, 93 in May 2019, 92 in June 2019, 102 in July 2019, 89 in August 2019, 150 in September 2019, 293 in October 2019, 310 in November 2019, 302 in December 2019, 341 in January 2020 and 286 in February 2020. The monthly average of domestic violence cases in these 12-month months before the quarantine process is 187.75.

The first case of COVID-19 in Türkiye was announced by the Ministry of Health on March 16 2019 and restrictions and quarantine measures have been implemented almost everywhere and in all segments since then. In this study, since domestic violence cases are monthly, a four-month period was taken as the month in which the restrictions and quarantine process started, including March and June, which is the month in which the restrictions were lifted. In this case, there were 335 applications to the Tarsus courthouse in March, which was the month when the quarantine restrictions started, 237 in April, 382 in

May, and 478 applications in June, which was the month when the restrictions started to be relaxed. There were a total of 1432 applications in this four-month period where restrictions and quarantine measures were applied, and the monthly average of domestic violence cases in this four-month period was 358. Considering the monthly average rates, there was an increase of 129.48% in domestic violence cases in Tarsus district during the COVID-19 process. The ratio of the quarantine period and the months in which the restrictions were applied to the months in the previous year was 94 in March 2019, 101 in April 2019, 93 in May 2019, 92 in June 2019, and the average of these months was 94. When the quarantine months are calculated, it is 335 in March 2020, 237 in April 2020, 382 in May 2020, and 478 in June 2020. The average of the quarantine months is 358. When the same months of the two years were compared, there was an increase of 276.84% in domestic violence cases.

## 6. Conclusion and Recommendations

Undoubtedly, the COVID-19 Pandemic has deeply affected all segments of society and has negatively affected every condition related to human and human, which is the basic building block of society. This process, which completely affects the daily routine life activities of humanity, has caused the economic and economic activities to be affected negatively and even stopped. Global giant brands of the world have been incapacitated in this process and have had difficulty in producing solutions for a short time. Quarantine practices have locked people up in their homes, so to speak, and for the first time in the history of the world, humanity has witnessed house arrest in all countries. People are unable to do their daily work or even meet their daily needs.

The main subject of the study is the situation followed by domestic violence during the COVID-19 quarantine and restriction process. As the research clearly reveals, the COVID-19 process negatively affected almost all segments, as well as negatively affected family relations, and accordingly, triggered the increase in domestic violence. Individuals' staying indoors for a long time, not being able to meet their needs, not being able to fulfill their economic activities, stopping trade, and being prevented increased their feelings and caused people to experience the process of house arrest.

In this process, it was determined that the conflicts between the husband and wife increased in the family members who shared the same environment at home for a long time. The study clearly reveals that violence is increasing exponentially and rapidly day by day. The family, which constitutes the basic structure of the society, is one of the most affected institutions in this process. It has been determined that the cases of domestic violence during the quarantine months where the restrictions are applied increased by 129.48% and the increase in the quarantine months compared to the previous year is 276.84%.

As a suggestion for institutions to prevent domestic

violence:

It has been determined that as the time spent indoors with quarantine applications increases, domestic violence increases in parallel with this. In such cases, it should be known that there will be a general increase in domestic violence during curfews and it may be suggested to take measures by the competent authorities accordingly.

## Author Contributions

The percentage of the author(s) contributions is present below. The authors reviewed and approved final version of the manuscript.

	B.C.	R.E.	A.B.	İ.Y.	H.T.	E.E.
C	20	16	16	16	16	16
D	20	16	16	16	16	16
S	20	16	16	16	16	16
DCP	20	16	16	16	16	16
DAI	20	16	16	16	16	16
L	20	16	16	16	16	16
W	20	16	16	16	16	16
CR	20	16	16	16	16	16
SR	20	16	16	16	16	16
PM	20	16	16	16	16	16
FA	20	16	16	16	16	16

C=Concept, D= design, S= supervision, DCP= data collection and/or processing, DAI= data analysis and/or interpretation, L= literature search, W= writing, CR= critical review, SR= submission and revision, PM= project management, FA= funding acquisition.

## Conflict of Interest

The authors declare that there is no conflict of interest.

## Ethical Consideration

The research data were obtained from the Tarsus courthouse and there is no situation that requires ethical approval.

## References

- Aile Bakanlığı. 1998. Aile içinde ve toplumsal alanda şiddet. T.C. Başbakanlık Aile Araştırma Kurumu Başkanlığı, Ankara, Türkiye, <https://docplayer.biz.tr/7607513-T-c-basbakanlik-aile-arastirma-kurumu-baskanligi-aile-icinde-ve-toplumsal-alanda-siddet-ankara.html> (erişim tarihi: 15 Temmuz 2022).
- Akın M. 2013. Aile içi şiddet. İÜHFİM, 1: 27-42.
- Aksoy E, Çetin G, İnanıcı MA, Polat O, Sözen Ş, Yavuz F. 2013. Aile içi şiddet. Adli Tıp Ders Notları. <http://www.ttb.org.tr/eweb/adli/6.html> (erişim tarihi: 16 Temmuz 2022).
- Aksoy E, Çetin G, İnanıcı, MA, Polat O, Sözen MŞ, Yavuz F. 1999. Aile İçi şiddet, birinci basamak için adli tıp el kitabı. Türk Tabipler Birliği Yayın, Ankara, Türkiye, 1. Baskı, ss. 131-135.
- Aktaş MA. 2006. Aile içi şiddet; çocuğun ve kadının korunması. Elma Yayınevi, Ankara, Türkiye, 1. Baskı, ss. 34.
- Arat N. 1995. Türkiye'de kadın olmak. Say Yayınları, İstanbul. Türkiye, 1. Baskı, ss. 54.
- Başaran B. 2002. Kadına yönelik şiddete karşı mücadele sağlıklı toplum yaratma mücadelesidir. Hekimden Hekime Derg, 5(1): 1-25.

- Bilgel N, Orhan H. 2006. Aile içi şiddet. Bilgel N. Editör. Aile hekimliği. Medikal Tıp Kitabevi, Bursa, Türkiye, 1. Baskı, ss. 643.
- Brady K. 2000. The treatment and prevention of violence. In Proceeding of American Psychiatric Association 153rd Annual Meeting. May 13 - 18, 2000; Chicago, Illinois, USA, pp. 42.
- Chase KA, O' Leary KD, Heyman RE. 2001. Categorizing partner-violent men within the reactive-proactive typology. *J Consult Clin Psychol*, 69(3): 567-572.
- Dekeseredy W. 1993. Four variations of family violence: a review of sociological research. The Family Violence Prevention Division, [http://www.cyf.ca/100/private/famcon\\_famvio.htm](http://www.cyf.ca/100/private/famcon_famvio.htm). 5.7.2004 (erişim tarihi: 15 Temmuz 2022).
- Dixon L, Browne K. 2003. The heterogeneity of spouse abuse: a review. *Aggress Violent Behav*, 8(1): 107-130.
- Efe ŞY, Ayaz S. 2010. Kadına yönelik aile içi şiddet ve kadınların aile içi şiddete bakışı. *Anad Psikiyat Derg*, 11: 23-29.
- Jackson D, Susan. 1999. Issues in the dating violence research: a review of the literature. *Aggress Violent Behav*, 4: 233-247.
- Karaduman TA, Uyanık D, Karakaya Z. 1993. Şiddeti içselleştiren kadın profili: Türkiye için nicel yaklaşım. [www.Die.Gov.Tr/Tkba/English\\_TKBA/Makaleler.Htm-12k](http://www.Die.Gov.Tr/Tkba/English_TKBA/Makaleler.Htm-12k). (erişim tarihi: 16 Temmuz 2022).
- Mor Çatı. 2015. Şiddet nedir. Mor Çatı Kadın Sığınağı Vakfı, <https://morcati.org.tr/kadina-yonelik-siddet-nedir/#:~:text=Kad%C4%B1na%20Y%C3%B6nelik%20%59Eiddet%20Nedir%3F%20%2D%20Mor,ile%20erkek%20aras%C4%B1ndaki%20e%C5%9Fitsizlikler%20yatar> (erişim tarihi: 16 Temmuz 2022).
- Mor Çatı. 2020. Koronavirüs salgını süresince kadına yönelik şiddetle mücadele izleme raporu <https://www.sivilsayfalar.org/raporlar/mor-cati-koronavirus-salginisuresince-kadina-yonelik-siddetle-mucadele-izleme-raporu/> (erişim tarihi: 18 Temmuz 2022).
- Ticoll M. 2020. Family violence and people with a mental handicap. [Www.Hc-Sc.Gc.Ca/Hppb/Familyviolence/Html/Fvmentaleng.Html](http://www.Hc-Sc.Gc.Ca/Hppb/Familyviolence/Html/Fvmentaleng.Html) - 24k (erişim tarihi: 18 Mart 2020).
- Time. 2020. As cities around the world go on lockdown, victims of domestic violence look for a way out. <https://time.com/5803887/COVID-19-domestic-violence-victims/>. (erişim tarihi: 18 Mart 2022).
- Toprak Ergöner A, Biçen E, Ersoy G. 2020. COVID-19 salgınında ev içi şiddet. *Bull Leg Med*, 25(Sp): 48-57.
- Türkbay T, Akın R, Söhmen G, Söhmen T. 1999. Çocuk ve ergenlerde cinsel kötüye kullanımına klinik yaklaşım. Sevgi zihinsel yetersizlik. *Araş Eğit Haber Derg*, 2(1-2): 15-20.
- Türkbay T, Söhmen G, Söhmen T. 1998. Çocuk ve ergenlerde cinsel kötüye kullanım: klinik bulguları, olası sonuçları ve önleme psikiyatrisi. *Psikol Psikofarmakol Derg*, 6(1): 49-54.
- Usher K, Bhullar N, Durkin J, Gyamfi N, Jackson D. 2020. Family violence and COVID-19: Increased vulnerability and reduced options for support. *Int J Ment Health Nurs*, 29(4): 549-552.
- Washington Post. 2020. Layoffs from the COVID-19 are here: <https://www.washingtonpost.com/business/2020/03/11/layoffsCOVID-19/>. (erişim tarihi: 12 Mart 2022).
- Yetim D, Şahin M. 2008. Kadına yönelik şiddete yaklaşım. *Aile Hekimliği Derg*, 2(2): 48-53.





## GÜNEY KAFKASYA'NIN TARİHİ VE JEOPOLİTİK ÖNEMİ ÜZERİNE BİR DEĞERLENDİRME

Bastı BEKİROVA<sup>1\*</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Ondokuz Mayıs Üniversitesi, Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences, Department of History, 55139, Samsun, Türkiye

**Özet:** Güney Kafkasya Karadeniz ve Hazar Deniz'i arasında yer alan, Avrupa ve Asya'nın sınırında yerleşen dünyanın en zengin ve çok kültürlü bölgelerinden birisidir. Güney Kafkasya tarih boyunca ticaret ve göç yollarının en önemli dönüm noktası olmuştur. Bu sebeple bölge tarih boyunca her zaman birçok büyük devletlerin ilgi odağına olmuştur. Kafkasya uğruna çeşitli milletler farklı mücadeleler vermişlerdir. Bu özelliği sebebi ile tarihin en eski çağlarından beri Güney Kafkasya'da pek çok farklı topluluk yaşamıştır. Güney Kafkasya Avrupa ile Asya, İslam ile Hıristiyanlık, Türklük ile Slavlık arasında dağlık bir geçittir. Bu yüzden bölge tarih boyunca büyük imparatorlukların rekabet alanı olmuştur. Günümüzde de Kafkasya'nın bir koridor olarak önemi devam ediyor. Geçmişte olduğu gibi bugün de Kafkasya, üç büyük imparatorluğun devamı olan Türkiye, Rusya Federasyonu ve İran arasında tampon bir bölgedir. Başka bir deyimle Güney Kafkasya milletlerarası ve kültürlerarası bir kesişme noktasıdır.

**Anahtar kelimeler:** Güney Kafkasya, Azerbaycan, Gürcistan, Ermenistan


### An Assessment on the History and Geopolitical Importance of South Caucasus

**Abstract:** The South Caucasus is one of the richest and most multicultural regions in the world, settled between the Black Sea and the Caspian Sea, on the border of Europe and Asia. The South Caucasus has been the most important turning point of trade and migration routes during history. Because of this reason, the South Caucasus has always been the centre of attention of many great states during history. Different nationalities have struggled for the sake of the Caucasus. Due to this feature, many different communities have lived in the South Caucasus since the oldest ages of history. The South Caucasus is a mountainous pass between Europe and Asia, Islam and Christianity, Turkism and Slavlik. Therefore, the region has been the competition area of great empires during history. Nowadays, the importance of the Caucasus as a corridor continues. Today, as in the past, the Caucasus is a buffer area between Türkiye, the Russian Federation and Iran, the continuation of the three great empires. In other words, the South Caucasus is an international and intercultural point of intersection.

**Keywords:** South Caucasus, Azerbaijani, Georgia, Armenia

\*Sorumlu yazar (Corresponding author): Ondokuz Mayıs Üniversitesi, Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences, Department of History, 55139, Samsun, Türkiye

E mail: nazlibakirova@gmail.com (B. BEKİROVA)

Bastı BEKİROVA  <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-8212-6963>

**Gönderi:** 23 Kasım 2022

**Kabul:** 19 Aralık 2022

**Yayınlanma:** 01 Ocak 2023

**Received:** November 23, 2022

**Accepted:** December 19, 2022

**Published:** January 01, 2023

**Cite as:** Bekirova B. 2023. An assessment on the history and geopolitical importance of South Caucasus. BSJ Pub Soc Sci, 6(1): 27-32.

### 1. Giriş

“Kafkas” veya “Kafkasya” adı tarihte ilk kez eski Yunan düşünürlerinden Aiskhylos’un M.Ö. 490’lı yıllarda kaleme aldığı, “Zincire Vurulmuş Zevk ve Eğlence” adlı eserinde kullandığı “Kavkasos Dağı” deyimile ortaya çıkmıştır. Kafkasya eski Yunanlılardan Romalılara kadar “Kavkasus”, Rönesanstan sonra ise Humanistlerin eserlerinde, “Caucasus”, “Caucasia”, “Caucasie”, adlarıyla nitelendirilmiştir (Demir, 2003). Güney Kafkasya bölgesini, Ruslar “Zakavkazya”, İngilizler “Transcaucasus”, Osmanlı ve Araplar “Mavera-i Kafkasya” adlandırmışlar ve Güney Kafkasya anlamından daha çok “Kafkas Ötesi” anlamını kullanmayı tercih etmişler (Acar, 2005).

Kafkasya Karadeniz ve Hazar Deniz'i arasında yer alan, Avrupa ve Asya'nın sınırında yerleşen dünyanın en zengin ve çok kültürlü bölgelerinden birisidir. Akdeniz, Ege Denizi, Marmara Denizi, Boğazlar, Karadeniz, Azak Denizi sayesinde Doğu ve Batı arasında tüm bağlantıları

sağlamaktadır. Kafkasya Asya, Avrupa ve Afrika kıtalarını birbirleri ile buluşturan önemli bir geçiş noktasıdır. Dolayısıyla bölge her zaman büyük devletlerin çıkar ve çatışma noktası olmuştur. Güney Kafkasya ilk çağlardan beri dünya halklarının dikkatini çeken çok önemli bir jeopolitik yapıya sahip olmuştur. Bu sebepten de çok önemli ticaret kavşaklarının merkezi olmakla, yüzyıllardır önemini hiç kaybetmemektedir.

Güney Kafkasya Büyük Kafkas Dağları'nın en yüksek zirvelerinden başlayarak, Küçük Kafkas Dağları'nın güney eteklerine kadar uzanmaktadır. İnsan yaşamı için elverişli iklimiyle birçok topluluğun akınlarına uğrayan bölge, doğuda Hazar Denizi, batıda Akdeniz ve Karadeniz, kuzeyde Büyük Kafkas Dağları, Kuban ve Kuma nehirleri, güneyde Türkiye ve İran ile sınırlanmıştır. Güney Kafkasya, Kırım'ın doğusundaki Taman Yarımadası'ndan Hazar Denizi'nin batısındaki Abşeron Yarımadası'na kadar uzanmaktadır. Güney Kafkasya veya bir diğer adıyla Transkafkasya'da üç bağımsız devlet



bulunmaktadır: Azerbaycan, Gürcistan ve Ermenistan. Azerbaycan Gürcistan ve Ermenistan farklı dil, din ve etnik gruplara sahip ülkelerdir. Fakat tarih, coğrafya ve ekonomik bağlar bu üç ülkeyi aynı bölge olarak tanımlamaya olanak sağlıyor. Buna rağmen, Kuzey Kafkasya'yı coğrafi olarak Avrupa kıtasına dahil ederken Güney Kafkasya'yı ise Asya kıtasına dahil ediyorlar. Ancak siyasi açıdan Kafkasya bir bütün olarak Avrupa kıtasına dahildir (Sapmaz, 2008).

Güney Kafkasya batısı Karadeniz doğusu Hazar denizi gibi iki önemli su havzasıyla sınırlanan, kuzeyi dünyaca meşhur dağlarıyla çevrili oldukça önemli jeopolitik konuma sahip olan bir bölgedir. Tarih boyunca birçok farklı kavmin yaşadığı bu bölgede pek çok farklı kültür izi görebilmekteyiz. Güney Kafkasya, coğrafi konumu dolayısıyla birçok büyük devletin hakimiyet kurmaya çalıştığı bir bölgedir. Tarih boyunca pek çok kavme ev sahipliği yapmış olan Güney Kafkasya, XVI. yüzyıldan itibaren sıcak denizlere inme niyetinde olan Rusya tarafından işgal edilmeye çalışılmıştır.

Güney Kafkasya birçok etnik unsurun, dilin, dinin, kültürün bir arada yaşadığı bir coğrafyadır. Aynı zamanda Hazar Denizi ile Orta Asya petrolünün merkezi ve bu petrolün dünya pazarlarına ulaştırılması konumundadır. Tüm bu ayrıcalıkları nedeniyle Güney Kafkasya tarih sahnesinde pek çok farklı devletleri karşı-karşıya getirmiştir. Bölge uğruna eski zamanlardan bugüne birçok güçlü devletler savaş mücadeleleri vermiştir.

Çarlık Rusya'sı Güney Kafkasya'nın işgali için uzun yıllar güc mücadelesi vermiştir. Yüzyıllar boyunca devam eden mücadelenin sonucunda XIX. yüzyılın başlarında Çarlık Rusya'sı Güney Kafkasya'yı işgal etmiştir. Ruslar XVI. yüzyıldan beri hayalini kurduğu Güney Kafkasya'yı ele geçirme arzusunu 1828 senesinde tümüyle hayata geçirmiştir. Rusya Güney Kafkasya'da yaklaşık iki asır kadar hakimiyetini devam ettirmiştir. 1991 senesinde Sovyetler birliği dağılmış ve Güney Kafkasya devletleri Azerbaycan, Gürcistan ve Ermenistan bağımsızlığını ilan etmiştir.

Bu çalışmamızda Güney Kafkasya bölgesi ile ilgili genel bilgilere yer verilmektedir. Bu anlamda, Kafkasya isminin kökeni, Kafkasya'nın coğrafi yapısı, tarihi ve coğrafi geçmişi, jeopolitik ve stratejik önemi ile ilgili bahsedilmiştir. Ayrıca çalışmamızda, Rusya'nın Kafkasya'ya karşı yüzyıllardır duyduğu ilgi, Güney Kafkasya'yı işgali ve burada yaptığı antlaşmalar, yerleşme süreci, incelenmiştir.

## 2. Güney Kafkasya'nın Tarihi Coğrafyası

Kafkasya Avrupa ve Asya kıtalarını birbirlerinden ayıran, Karadeniz ve Hazar Denizi arasında yerleşen dünyanın en eski ve oldukça elverişli yaşam ve kültür merkezlerinden biridir (Özgül ve Ceylan, 2017). Kafkasya tarih boyunca ticaret ve göç yollarının en önemli dönüm noktası olmuştur (Kantarci, 2006). Aynı zamanda bölge oldukça önemli kültürlerin kesiştiği noktada bulunmaktadır. Kafkasya Asya, Avrupa ve Afrika

kıtalarını birbirleri ile buluşturuyorken, Karadeniz ve Hazar Denizi arasında ise bir nevi kara boğazı rolünü oynamaktadır. Bölgenin yüzölçümü yaklaşık 450.000 km<sup>2</sup>'dir. Kafkasya güneyde Türkiye ve İran, kuzeyde Kuban ve Kuma ovası, doğuda Hazar Denizi, batıda ise Karadeniz ile çevrelenmiştir. Bir coğrafi bölge olarak ise Kafkasya, Hazar Denizi'nin batısındaki Abşeron Yarımadasından, Karadeniz'in kuzey doğusundaki Taman Yarımadasına kadar uzanıyor (Kaşıkçı ve Yılmaz, 1999). Büyük Kafkas dağları Taman Yarımadasından başlayarak Abşeron Yarımadası'na kadar uzanıyor. Bu dağ silsilesinin her iki tarafının irtibatını sağlayan esas geçit bağlantısı Hazar Denizi'nin batı kıyısında bulunan, aynı zamanda Dağıstan ve Azerbaycan arasında bağlantıyı sağlayan Derbent Geçidi (Saydam, 1997) ile Kuzey Osetya ve Güney Osetya'yı birbirine bağlayan Daryal Geçidi'dir (Tezcan, 2012). Bu dağlar bölgenin en büyük yüksekliği olmakla birlikte, Kafkasya'yı Kuzey ve Güney şeklinde iki coğrafi bölgeye ayırıyor.

Kafkasya olarak ilk defa, M.Ö 479 tarihinde, isimlendirilmeye başlanan, tarihi ve mitolojik zenginlikleri ile tanınan (Yanar, 2002) bölgenin Kuzey Kafkasya kısmı XIX. yüzyıldan başlayarak günümüzde de Kuzey Kafkasya Rusya Federasyonu hakimiyetindedir. Güney Kafkasya'da ise üç bağımsız cumhuriyet yer almaktadır: Azerbaycan, Gürcistan ve Ermenistan.

Güney Kafkasya Karadeniz ve Hazar Deniz'i arasında yer alıyor. Aynı zamanda bölge Avrupa ve Asya'nın sınırında yerleşmekle dünyanın en önemli tranzit geçit merkezlerinden biri konumundadır. Yerleştiği coğrafi konum dolayısıyla Güney Kafkasya tarih boyunca ticaret ve göç yollarının en aktif kullanıldığı bölge özelliğini taşımıştır. Ticaret ve göç yollarının merkezi haline gelmesi bölgenin tarih boyunca her zaman birçok büyük devletlerin ilgi odağına çevrilmesine sebebiyet vermiştir. Sonuç olarak tarih boyunca Kafkasya uğruna çeşitli milletler farklı mücadeleler vermişlerdir. Çeşitli milletlere ev sahipliği yapmış bölge de tarihin en eski çağlarından beri pek çok farklı topluluk yaşamıştır. Yüzyıllar boyunca büyük imparatorlukların rekabet alanı olmuş Güney Kafkasya günümüzde de dünya devletleri için önemini devam ettirmektedir. Güney Kafkasya, üç büyük imparatorluğun devamı olan Türkiye, Rusya Federasyonu ve İran arasında tampon bir bölgedir (Sapmaz, 2008). Başka bir deyimle, söyleyecek olursak Güney Kafkasya milletlerarası ve kültürlerarası bir kesişme noktasıdır.

Avrupa ve Asya arasında bir geçit oluşturan Güney Kafkasya, yüzyıllardır ticaret yollarının kesiştiği daima önemini koruyan bir ticaret merkezi konumundadır. Aynı zamanda Güney Kafkasya Orta Asya'ya açılan bir kapıdır. Güney Kafkasya, Akdeniz-Ege Denizi-Boğazlar ve Marmara Denizi- Karadeniz-Azak Denizi gibi birbirlerine bağlı denizlerin oluşturdukları bir su koridorunun doğu ucunda bulunmaktadır. Bu coğrafi özellikleri yanısıra Güney Kafkasya Hazar denizi ile de çok büyük koridor bağlantıları olan konumdadır. Fırat ve Dicle ırmakları da bu koridoru ortaya çıkaran, Hazar Denizi ile Karadeniz ve

Akdeniz'in, Hint Okyanusu'na kolaylıkla bağlanmalarını sağlıyor. Güney Kafkasya bu özelliği ile "kuzey-güney" ve "doğu-batı" arasında bir köprü ve hamle yeridir (Kantaracı, 2005). Eski zamanlardan beri Güney Kafkasya önemli bir geçiş noktası olmakla birlikte aynı zamanda Basra Körfezi'ni kontrol eden stratejik bir konuma da sahiptir (Can, 1996). Tarih boyunca çok büyük öneme sahip olan Tarihi İpek Yolu'nun en önemli kollarından birisi de Kafkasya'dan geçiyordu. Tüm bu sebeplerden ötürü, eski zamanlardan beri pek çok millet Kafkasya'ya sahip olmak, bu yerlerde söz sahibi olmak için çeşitli mücadeleler vermişlerdir. Yukarı da bahsettiğimiz gibi önemli yolların merkezi konumuna gelen Kafkasya çevredeki devletlerin ilgi odağı olmuştur. Güney Kafkasya'nın tarihini incelediğimiz zaman görüyoruz ki tarih sahnesine ismini kazımış birçok büyük devlet bu yerlere hâkim olmak uğruna uzun süreli savaşlar vermiştir. Özellikle de tarih boyunca Bizanslılar, Sasaniler, Osmanlılar, İranlılar ve Ruslar bu bölge uğruna verdikleri mücadelelerle seçilmişlerdir (Saray, 1988). Kafkasya bölgesi tarih boyunca farklı kavimlerin göç ve mücadele hareketlerinin şahidi olmuştur. Hint-Avrupaî, İranî ve Turanî kökenli milletler Kafkasya topraklarında bir arada bulunmuştur. Kafkasya topraklarında yaşayan halklardan biri de Türkler olmuştur (Kafkasya'nın pek çok millete ev sahipliği yaptığı konusunda bkz. Diuna, K'avk'asia: mogzaurobis shtabech'dilebani, gv.2; Kafkasya, kıtaların birbirleri ile ulaşımını sağlamada en önemli hat üzerinde yer almaktadır. Rusya bölgesinden Akdeniz'e doğru geçen yolun üzerinde olması ve Orta Doğu ile Basra körfezine kadar olan hat boyunca geçiş noktası olması Kafkas coğrafyasını da cazip hale getirmektedir. Bkz. Alexandre Grigoriantz, Kafkasya Halkları Tarihi ve Etnografik Bir Sentez, çev. Doğan Yurdakul, Yeni Binyıl Yayınları, İstanbul 1999, s.16) (Mert, 2004; Ceylan, 2009; Kılıç, 2015; Tellioğlu, 2017). Güney Kafkasya en eski Türk kavimlerinden olan Kimmerler (Ökmen, 1973), İskitler, Alanlar, Hun, Avar, Hazar, Peçenek, Uzların ve Roma ve Bizans'ın hakimiyeti altında kalmıştır. İdil-Ural arası Türklerin batıya göç ederken en çok kullandığı güzergâhlardan birisi olmuştur. Bölgede pek çok küçük kabilenin varlığı İlk çağlardan itibaren dikkat çeken bir husustur (Aydın, 2005; Yeşilot, 2005; Demirağ ve Karayeli, 2006; Demirtepe, 2008; Kasım, 2009; Tellioğlu, 2017). Daha sonralar ise bölgedeki hakimliğini sürdüren güçler Sasaniler, Araplar, Emeviler, Büyük Selçuklular, Anadolu Selçukluları, Kıpçaklar, Moğollar, Altınordu, İlhaniler, Safeviler olmuşlardır. Bu devletlerin her biri bölge için çeşitli mücadeleler vermiştir. Bu mücadeleler yakın dönemlerde ise Osmanlı Devleti, İran ve Rusya ile devam etmiştir. 50'nin üstünde farklı millet ve halkın yaşadığı Kafkasya bölgesinde Müslümanlık ve Hıristiyanlık en yaygın dinlerdendir (Pamuk, 1995).

Kafkasya'nın uzun yıllar boyu sürekli çatışma ve mücadelelere şahit olmasının esas sebebi hiç şüphesiz ki, onun coğrafi konumu olmuştur. Kafkasya'nın coğrafi konum sadece büyük çatışmalara sahne olmakla

kalmamış, bunun dışında bölgedeki dini ve etnik zenginliğe de getirip çıkarmıştır. Tarih boyunca büyük güçlerin hakimiyet kurduğu Güney Kafkasya her devletten belli bir mirası da kendinde taşımaktadır. Coğrafi olarak bölgenin dağlık ve geçit vermez olması burada yaşayan çok farklı kültürlerin devamlılıklarını sürdürmesine olanak tanımıştır. Bu coğrafi konum bölgede yaşayan halkların kimliklerini korumalarına yardım etmekle birlikte, aynı zamanda bu yapısından dolayı çatışmaların ve tarihi husumetlerin de sürmesine sebep olmuştur (Demir, 2007). Kafkasya'nın jeopolitik önemini artıran bir diğer unsur ise bölgedeki petrol ve doğalgaz servetleri ve bu servetlerin taşınması için gerekli olan enerji hatlarıdır.

Güney Kafkasya için yapılan mücadeleler ilkçağlardan itibaren başlamış ve orta çağda da devam etmiştir. Orta çağda birçok farklı devletler ve milletler Kafkasya'ya sahip olmaya çalışmışlar, ama uzun süreli başarıyı elde edememişler. Güney Kafkasya üzerindeki hakimiyet uzun süre Sasaniler, Bizans ve Hazarlar arasında el değiştirmiştir. Bu devletler arasındaki mücadeleler uzun süre devam etmiştir. Bu mücadeleler sırasında Hazarlar Kafkasya'nın güneyinde, Bizans ve Sasaniler ise kuzeyinde yerleşseler de hiçbir zaman kalıcı başarılar elde edemediler. Sasaniler'den sonra Güney Kafkasya'da hakimliği Araplar üstlenmeye çalıştılar. Fakat İslam orduları farklı coğrafi bölgelerde elde ettikleri büyük başarılarını burada tekrarlayamadılar. Hatta, Emevi kumandanı Mervan Muhammed El-Cezire 737 yılında Hazarları mağlup etti ve başkent El-Beyda'ya kadar ilerledi. Fakat bu kadar ilerlemeye rağmen Kafkasya bölgesi İslam hakimiyetine tümüyle girmedi (Çoğ, 2009). Devamlılığı olmamasına bakılmaksızın, Araplar Güney Kafkasya'da İslam nüfusu tesis edebilmişlerdi. Buraya gönderilen Emevi, daha sonrasında ise Abbasi valileri zamanla kendi sülalelerine bağlı olan hakimiyet kurmuşlardı. Bu sülaleler halifenin ruhani liderliğini tanıyorlardı, ama siyasi bakımdan tamamen bağımsız idiler (Caferoğlu, 1932). Güney Kafkasya üzerinde en fazla tesiri olan diğer imparatorluklara Selçukluları ve Moğolları'da örnek verebiliriz.

XVI. yüzyılın ortalarına gelindiğinde Güney Kafkasya durumlar oldukça karışmaya başlamıştı. Coğrafi konumu gereği Güney Kafkasya'da liderlik uğruna iki büyük güç mücadele halindeydi: Osmanlı Devleti ve Safevi İmparatorluğu. Bu dönem Ruslar bölgedeki siyasi dengeleri değiştirebilecek kadar önemli konuma sahip olmaya başlıyorlardı (Saydam, 2014). Osmanlı ve Safeviler başlangıçta Rus tehlikesini yeteri kadar anlayamadılar. Halbuki Güney Kafkasya Rusya için oldukça önemli jeopolitik konuma sahipti. Çarlık Rusya'sı sıcak denizlere inme politikasını gerçekleştirmek için Güney Kafkasya'nın işgalini çok önemsiyordu (Guliyeva, 2004). Bu yolda ilk adımı Ruslar XVI. yüzyılda atmış oldular. Uzun yıllar Rusya'nın Volga boyunca Hazar Denizi'ne ve Karadeniz'e inmesini engelleyen Kazan 1552 senesinde Rusya tarafından işgal edilmişti (Kurat, 1978). Kırım Hanı Devlet Giray Kazan'ı kurtarmaya çalışsa da

bunda başarılı olamamıştı. Hatta 1556 yılında Astarhan Hanlığı da Rusya tarafından zapt edilmişti. Bununla da Ruslar Kafkasya'ya yönelik ilk adımlarını atmaya başlamışlardı (Gökçe, 1979). Böylece, Rusya tarihinde yeni bir devir başlamış oldu.

Kazan'ın Ruslar tarafından işgali Ruslara Kafkasya'nın kapılarını açmıştı. Daha sonrasında Astarhan'ın işgali ise Ruslar için büyük bir önem taşıyordu (Mustafazade, 2001). Çünkü Hazar Denizi'nin kuzeyinden geçen ticaret yolları kontrol altına alınmıştı. Bölgedeki Türk nüfusunun oldukça yoğun olduğunu çok iyi bilen Rusya, yavaş yavaş Hazar kıyılarına doğru sokulmaya başlamıştı. Rusya bu adımla Ortadoğu tarihinde etkinliğini hissettirmeye başlamış oldu. Rusya artık sıradan bir devlet değil, imparatorluk olmaya başlamıştı.

XVII. yüzyıl boyunca Rusya'nın Kafkasya politikasında çok önemli bir değişiklik olmadı. XVII. yüzyıl daha çok Rusya'nın ilerideki büyük zaferlerine hazırlık yılları olarak geçmiştir. Dönemin diğer büyük devletlerinden biri olan Osmanlı Devleti ise İran ile yaptığı savaşlarda iyice yıpranmıştı. Bu dönem Güney Kafkasya'da varlığını sürdüren Azerbaycan Hanlıkları ve Gürcistan ise Osmanlı Devleti ve İran arasında devam eden bu savaşlar sırasında sık-sık el değiştirmekten yorulmuştu. Rusya'nın Güney Kafkasya'yı işgali esnasında Azerbaycan Türkleri Ruslara karşı büyük mücadeleler verirken (Esedov ve Kerimova, 1993), Gürcistan için ise bunu söylemek pek mümkün değildi. Çünkü Ruslar da Gürcüler gibi Hıristiyan topluluklardı. Bu sebepten de aralarındaki ilişki daha sıcaktı. Hal böyleyken, ilerleyen yıllarda Gürcüler Kafkasya'yı ele geçirmeye çalışan Rusların himayesini kolaylıkla kabul etmişlerdi ve Gürcistan 1801 yılında Rusya tarafından işgal edilmiştir (Pamuk, 1995).

XIX. yüzyılın başlarından itibaren Rusya artık yüzyıllardır uğruna savaştığı Kafkasya'yı tamamen ele geçirmeyi başardı. Ruslar bölgeyi ele geçirmeye çalışırken Azerbaycan'da Bakü, Nahçıvan, Derbent, Revan, Karabağ, Quba, Gence, Şeki, Şirvan, Lenkeran ve b Azerbaycan Hanlıkları varlığını sürdürmekteydi ve bu hanlıklar Rus istilasına karşı sonuna kadar mücadele etmişlerdi (Resulzada, 1990). Fakat sonuç itibari ile bu hanlıklar XIX. yüzyılda daha güçlü olan Rus kuvvetleri tarafından ele geçirildiler. I. Petro'dan sonra hakimiyete geçmiş çar I Aleksandr'ın zamanında da Ruslar Kafkasya'ya yerleşmeye devam etmişler ve onların bu bölgedeki nüfuzları oldukça artmıştır (Demir, 2003). 1828'de Rusya ve İran arasında bağlanan "Türkmençay Antlaşması"ndan sonra Rusya Güney Kafkasya'ya (Azerbaycan ve Gürcistan'a) kesin olarak yerleşmiştir (Bakıxanov, 2001). Çarlık Rusya'sı yaklaşık bir asır kadar Güney Kafkasya'ya hâkim olmuştur ve bu hakimiyetin ardından Birinci Dünya Savaşı ve Rusya'da 1917 senesinde Bolşevik devriminin başlaması Çarlık Rusya'sının devrilmesine neden olmuştur (Kurat, 1990). Buna karşılık Rusya'da iç çekişmeler artmış ve senelerdir bağımsızlık bekleyen halklar bu yol uğruna mücadeleler vermeye başlamışlardır. XX yüzyılın başlarında Güney Kafkasya'da yaşayan üç millet bağımsızlık hedeflerine ulaşmak için

Rusya'da baş veren devrimi fırsat bilmişti. 26 Mayıs 1918 senesinde Güney Kafkasya'da Gürcistan ardından ise Azerbaycan ve Ermenistan Cumhuriyetleri bağımsızlıklarını ilan ettiler (Şimşir, 2002).

Her ne kadar Güney Kafkasya'daki bu üç devlet bağımsızlığını ilan etseler de onların hem arazice hem de nüfusça küçük olması toplumda yerlerini almalarına engel oluyordu (Kazımzade, 1981). Milliyetler Cemiyeti Örgütü Nezdinde yeterli kadar destek görmeyen bu üç cumhuriyet için ayakta durmak oldukça zorlayıcıydı. Böylece yeni kurulmuş Azerbaycan, Gürcistan ve Ermenistan Cumhuriyetleri güçlü bir korumaya ihtiyaç duyuyordu. Dünya ülkeleri ise Birinci Dünya Savaşı'ndan yeni çıkmış ve oldukça yorgundu. Bu genç cumhuriyetler kendinden daha büyük olan güçlü devletlerin verdikleri siyasi savaşlar arasında sadece kullanılıyorlardı. İngiltere, Fransa, Rusya, Almanya ve Türkiye gibi daha büyük devletler bölgeye sahip olma adına genç devletlerle bazı antlaşmalar yapmaya çalışmışlardır (Azerbaycan Gazetesi, 1919). Fakat çok kısa bir sürede Sovyet Rusya'sı tekrar torparlanmaya ve eski gücüne yeniden kavuşmaya başlamıştı. Moskova ve Kars antlaşmalarından sonra ise Kafkasya'daki egemenlik yeniden Rusya'nın eline geçmişti. Bu antlaşmalarla Bakü petrolü ve Batum limanı dahil Güney Kafkasya'nın tüm stratejik noktaları ve doğal zengin kaynakları yeniden Bolşevik Rusyası'nın eline geçti (Resulzada, 1996).

Güney Kafkasya Cumhuriyetleri yaklaşık 2 sene kadar bağımsız kaldılar. 1920 senesi itibari ile XI Kızıl Ordu tarafından sırasıyla Azerbaycan, Ermenistan ve Gürcistan tekraren işgal edilerek, Sovyet Rusya'sına birleştirildi. Bu işgalin hemen ardından Güney Kafkasya Cumhuriyetleri aşamalı olarak Sovyetleştirilmeye başlandı.

Güney Kafkasya yaklaşık olarak iki asır kadar Rusya'nın işgali altına kalmış Sovyetler Birliği dağıldıktan sonra 1991 senesinde, halihazırda Güney Kafkasya'nın üç bağımsız devleti olan Azerbaycan, Gürcistan ve Ermenistan bağımsızlıklarını ilan etmişlerdir.

### 3. Sonuç

Coğrafi konumu dolayısıyla büyük güçlerin ilgi odağına çevrilen Kafkasya bölgesi XVI. yüzyıldan itibaren Çarlık Rusya'sının sıcak denizlere inme planlarının bir parçası haline gelmiştir. Rusya için Güney Kafkasya'nın konumu oldukça önemliydi ve yüzyıllar boyunca regiona hakimliği ele almak adına birçok güçlü devletle verdiği mücadelelerle seçilmiştir. Rusya tarihinin neredeyse büyük bir bölümü Baltık Karadeniz ve Hazar Denizi havzalarına ulaşmak için verdiği büyük mücadelelerle geçmiştir. Güney Kafkasya'da XIX. yüzyılın ortalarından itibaren büyük güçler hakimiyet için savaş mücadeleleri vermiştir. Özellikle de Rusya, sıcak denizlere inme siyaseti için Güney Kafkasya'ya her zaman büyük ölçüde önem vermiştir. Rusya Güney Kafkasya'yı işgal etmek için uzun süre hamleler yapmıştır. XIX. yüzyılın başlarından itibaren Rusya artık Kafkasya'yı tamamen ele geçirmeyi başarmıştır.

Rusya'nın Güney Kafkasya uğruna uzun müddet savaştığı



devletlerden biri Osmanlı Devleti, bir diğeri ise İran olmuştur. En nihayetinde Çarlık Rusya'sı XIX yüzyılda Güney Kafkasya'yla ilgili olan hedefine ulaşmış, bölgeyi tam anlamıyla ele geçirmeyi başarmıştır. 1801 senesinde Güney Kafkasya'nın eski sahiplerinden biri olan Gürcistan Rusya'nın hakimiyeti'ni kabul etmiştir. Ardından geçen 27 sene boyunca Rusya Güney Kafkasya'nın bir diğeri eski sahiplerinden biri olan Azerbaycan'ı ele geçirmek için savaşmıştır. 1828 senesinde İran ve Rusya arasındaki anlaşma gereği Rusya Güney Kafkasya'da hakimiyeti tam anlamıyla ele almıştır. Rusya'nın Güney Kafkasya'daki hakimiyeti XX. yüzyılın sonlarına kadar devam etmiştir. 1991 yılında Sovyetler Birliği dağılmış ve Güney Kafkasya devletleri bağımsızlıklarını ilan etmişlerdir.

Güney Kafkasya tarih boyunca ticaret ve göç yollarının oluşturmanın yanısıra kıtaların ve kültürlerin keşiştiği önemli bir kavşak noktası olmuştur. Doğu ve Batı arasında bir köprü oluşturan bu region aynı zamanda Avrasya coğrafyasının en hassas bölgesi olmuştur. Bu sebeptendir ki, Güney Kafkas siyasi ve ekonomik açılardan her zaman tüm dünyanın ilgisi çekmiş ve çekmeye de devam etmektedir. Geçmişte olduğu gibi, bugün ve yarın da jeopolitik ve jeostratejik önemini kaybetmeyen Güney Kafkasya her zaman güçlü ve büyük devletlerin ilgi odağı olacaktır.

#### Katkı Oranı Beyanı

Yazarın katkı yüzdesi aşağıda verilmiştir. Yazar makaleyi incelemiş ve onaylamıştır.

	B.B.
K	100
T	100
Y	100
VTI	100
VAY	100
KT	100
YZ	100
KI	100
GR	100
PY	100
FA	100

K= kavram, T= tasarım, Y= yönetim, VTI= veri toplama ve/veya işleme, VAY= veri analizi ve/veya yorumlama, KT= kaynak tarama, YZ= Yazım, KI= kritik inceleme, GR= gönderim ve revizyon, PY= proje yönetimi, FA= fon alımı.

#### Çatışma Beyanı

Yazar bu çalışmada hiçbir çıkar ilişkisi olmadığını beyan etmektedirler.

#### Kaynaklar

- Acar DŞ. 2005. Soğuk Savaş Sonrası Dönemde Kafkaslar ve Güvenlik Sorunları. Stratejik Araş Derg, 5: 165.
- Aydın M. 2005. Üç Büyük Gücün Çatışma Alanı: Kafkaslar. Gökkuşbu Yayinevi, İstanbul, Türkiye, pp: 266.
- Azerbaycan Gazetesi. 1919. 28 Mayıs 1919, No: 110.
- Bakıxanov AA. 2001. Gülistan-i İrem. Azerbaycan Bilimler Akademisi Yayınları, Bakü, Azerbaycan, pp: 234.
- Caferoğlu A. 1932. Azerbaycan Tarihine Umumi Bir Bakış. Azerbaycan Yurt Bilgisi, 1: 8.
- Can S. 1996. Jeopolitik Açısından Kafkasya: Avrasya Dosyası, Cilt III. ASAM Yayınları, Ankara, Türkiye, pp: 209.
- Ceylan A. 2009. Kafkaslarda Erken Dönem Türk İzleri. II. Uluslararası Kafkasya Tarih Sempozyumu, 15-17 Ekim 2009, Kars, Türkiye, pp: 109.
- Çog M. 2009. VII-X Yüzyıllarda Güney Kafkasya'da İslam Hakimiyeti. Serander Yayinevi, Trabzon, Türkiye, pp: 66.
- Demir AF. 2003. Türk Dış Politikası Perspektifinden Güney Kafkasya. Bağlam Yayıncılık, İstanbul, Türkiye, pp: 59.
- Demir AF. 2007. Çatışma Bölgesi Olarak Kafkasya-En Önemli Çatışma Noktaları ve Çözüm Önerileri, Kafkasya'da Beklentiler ve Olanaklar-Bölgesel Güç ve Garanti Etkeni Olarak Türkiye'nin Rolü. Konrad Yayınları, Ankara, Türkiye, pp: 15.
- Demirağ Y, Karayeli C. 2006. Geçmişten Günümüze Dönüşen Orta Asya ve Kafkasya. PALME, Ankara, Türkiye, pp: 310.
- Demirtepe MT. 2008. Orta Asya ve Kafkasya'da Güç Politikası. Uluslararası Stratejik Araştırmalar Kurumu, Ankara, Türkiye, pp: 322.
- Esedov F, Kerimova S. 1993. Çarizmi Azerbaycana Getirenler. Gençlik Yayınları, Bakü, Azerbaycan, pp: 30-35.
- Gökçe C. 1979. Kafkasya ve Osmanlı İmparatorluğunun Kafkasya Siyaseti. İstanbul Kitabevi, İstanbul, Türkiye, pp: 30.
- Guliyeva V. 2004. Rusların Ermenileri Güney Kafkasya'ya Yerleştirme Siyaseti ve Azerbaycan Topraklarının parçalanması. Karadeniz Araşt, 2: 7-12.
- Kantarıcı H. 2005. Kafkasya Jeopolitiğinde Kriz Alanları ve Güç Mücadelelerinin Türkiye'ye Etkileri. 2023 Derg, 53: 33.
- Kantarıcı H. 2006. Kısaçtaki Bölge Kafkasya. IQ Kültür Sanat

- Yayıncılık, İstanbul, Türkiye, pp: 16.
- Kasım K. 2009. Soğuk Savaş Sonrası Kafkasya. Uluslararası Stratejik Araştırmalar Kurumu, Ankara, Türkiye, pp: 292.
- Kaşıkcı N, Yılmaz H. 1999. Aras'tan Volga'ya Kafkaslar (Ülkeler-Şehirler-İz Bırakanlar). Türk Yayınları, Ankara, Türkiye, pp: 8.
- Kazımzade F. 1981. The Struggle for Transcaucasia 1917-1921. Hyperion, 1981: 112.
- Kılıç S. 2015. Kafkasya'ya Dair (1916-1917) Osmanlı İstihbaratının Yayımladığı Bir Rapor. Tarih Magomedov Derg, 34(58): 687-714.
- Kurat AN. 1978. Rusya Tarihi. TTK Yayınları, Ankara, Türkiye, pp: 157-159.
- Kurat AN. 1990. Türkiye ve Rusya. Kültür Bakanlığı Yayınları, Ankara, Türkiye, pp: 458-463.
- Mert O. 2004. Türkiye'nin Kafkasya Politikası ve Gürcistan. IQ Yayınları, İstanbul; Türkiye, pp: 16.
- Mustafazade T. 2001. XVIII Yüzyıl-XIX yüzyılın başlarında Osmanlı-Azerbaycan İlişkileri. Bilim Yayınları, Bakü, Azerbaycan, pp: 111.
- Ökmen M. 1973. Herodotos: Herodot Tarihi. Remzi Kitabevi, İstanbul, Türkiye, pp: 26.
- Özgül O, Ceylan N. 2017. Eskiçağda Kafkasya Geçitleri (Daryal ve Derbent). Akad Tarih Düşün Derg, 4: 13-30.
- Pamuk M. 1995. Kafkasya ve Azerbaycan'ın Dünü-Bugünü ve Yarını. Harp Akademileri Komutanlığı Yayınları, Ankara, Türkiye, pp: 149.
- Resulzada ME. 1990. Azerbaycan Cumhuriyeti (Keyfiyet-i Teşekkülü ve Şimdiki Vaziyet). İrfan Yayıncılık, İstanbul, Türkiye, pp: 11.
- Resulzada ME. 1996. Azerbaycan Problemi. Azerbaycan Kültür Derneği Yayınları, Ankara, Türkiye, pp: 17-18.
- Sapmaz A. 2008. Rusya'nın TransKafkasya Politikası ve Türkiye'nin Etkileri. Ötüken Yayınları, İstanbul, Türkiye, pp: 21.
- Saray M. 1988. Kafkas Araştırmalarının Türkiye İçin Önemi. Kafkas Araştırmaları 1, İstanbul, Türkiye, pp: 7-9.
- Saydam A. 1997. Kırım ve Kafkas Göçleri (1856-1876).TTK Yayınları, Ankara, Türkiye, pp: 12.
- Saydam A. 2014. Rusya'nın Kafkasya'yı İşgali. Ondokuz Mayıs Üniv Eğitim Fak Derg, 5(1): 239-257.
- Şimsir S. 2002. Azerbaycan'ın İstiklal Mücadelesi. IQ Kültür Sanat Yayıncılık, İstanbul, Türkiye, pp: 19.
- Tellioglu İ. 2017. Kafkasya'da Türk Varlığı'nın Başlangıcı Üzerine. Uluslararası Tarih Araş Derg, 2: 558-575.
- Tezcan M. 2012. Klasik ve Orta Çağ Dönemlerinde Karadeniz ve Kafkasya. Serander Yayınları, Trabzon, Türkiye, pp: 282.
- Yanar S. 2002. Türk-Rus ilişkilerinde Gizli Güç Kafkasya. IQ Kültür Sanat Yayıncılık, İstanbul, Türkiye, pp: 34.
- Yeşilot O. 2005. Değişen Dünya Düzeninde Kafkasya. Kitabevi Yayınları, İstanbul, Türkiye, pp: 229.



Open Access Journal  
e-ISSN: 2618 – 6640

Araştırma Makalesi (Research Article)

Cilt 6 - Sayı 1: 33-39 / Ocak 2023  
(Volume 6 - Issue 1: 33-39 / January 2023)

## ORTA ÇAĞ DOĞU KARADENİZ TÜRK TARİHİNİN KAYNAKLARI ÜZERİNE BİR DEĞERLENDİRME

Bekir SARIYILDIZ<sup>1\*</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Independent Researcher, 28200, Giresun, Türkiye

**Özet:** Tarihi kaynaklar ışığında Doğu Karadeniz'deki Türk varlığının tarihi temellerini çok derinlere götürmek mümkündür. Orta Çağ'da ise Doğu Karadeniz'deki Türk varlığı hakkındaki bilgiler Selçukluların Anadolu'ya temasıyla önem kazanmaktadır. Selçukluların Kafkaslara ve Doğu Anadolu'ya gelmesiyle birlikte bölgedeki Gürcü ve Ermeni kaynakları Selçuklulardan bahsetmeye başlamıştır. Aynı şekilde Anadolu'yu yöneten Bizanslılar ile bölgeyle yakından ilgilenen Araplar ve Süryanilerde bölgede gerçekleşen Türk faaliyetleri hakkında mühim kayıtlar tutmuşlardır. Orta Çağ tarihi kaynakları incelendiğinde, Selçukluların Doğu Karadeniz'in Çoruh boylarında ve Kelkit havzasında faaliyetleri hakkında önemli kayıtlar bulunmaktadır. Ancak Doğu Karadeniz kıyılarına ulaşan Türkler hakkında bilgiler başlangıçta karamlıktadır. İlerleyen dönemde ise Doğu Karadeniz vadi ve sahillerindeki Türkler hakkında tarihi kaynakların yardımıyla önemli bilgiler edinilebilmektedir. Kaynaklardaki kayıtlar çoğunlukla Kelkit Havzası'ndaki Türk siyasi teşekkülleri ve Doğu Karadeniz dağlarının kuzeyini kendilerine yurt edinen Türk beylerinin, Trabzon Rum Devleti ile olan mücadelelerini konu almaktadır.

**Anahtar kelimeler:** Doğu Karadeniz, Türkler, Kelkit, Çoruh

### An Evaluation on the Sources of Türk History of the Medieval East Black Sea

**Abstract:** In the light of historical sources, it is possible to take the historical foundations of the Türk presence in the Eastern Black Sea Region much deeper. In the middle Ages, the information about the Türk presence in the eastern Black Sea comes to light with the Seljuks reaching Anatolia. With the contact of the Seljuks to the Caucasus and Eastern Anatolia, Georgian and Armenian sources in the region begin to talk about the Seljuks. Likewise, the Byzantines, who ruled Anatolia, and the Arabs and Assyrians, who were closely interested in the region, kept important records about the Türk activities in the region. When the sources of Medieval History are examined, there are important records about the activities of the Seljuks in the Çoruh tribes of the Eastern Black Sea Region and around Kelkit. However, the information about the Türks who reached the eastern Black Sea coasts was initially in the dark. In the following period, important information can be obtained about the Türks in the Eastern Black Sea valleys and coasts with the help of historical sources. These sources, on the other hand, are mostly about the struggles of the Türk political organizations in the Kelkit Basin and the Türk beys, who made the north of the Eastern Black Sea Mountains their home, with the Empire of Trabzon.

**Keywords:** Eastern Black Sea, Türks, Kelkit, Çoruh

\*Sorumlu yazar (Corresponding author): Independent Researcher, 28200, Giresun, Türkiye

E mail: bkrsariyildiz@gmail.com (B. SARIYILDIZ)

Bekir SARIYILDIZ <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4229-3457>

**Gönderi:** 09 Kasım 2022

**Kabul:** 23 Aralık 2022

**Yayınlanma:** 01 Ocak 2023

**Received:** November 09, 2022

**Accepted:** December 23, 2022

**Published:** January 01, 2023

**Cite as:** Sariyıldız B. 2023. An evaluation on the sources of Turk history of the medieval east black sea. BSJ Pub Soc Sci, 6(1): 33-39.

### 1. Giriş

Türklerin eskiçağlardan itibaren Anadolu ve Doğu Karadeniz'e geldiği, bir kısmının bölgede varlıklarını devam ettirdiği gibi diğer kısmının da çeşitli sebeplerle buraları terk ettiği bilinmektedir. Orta Çağ tarihi sürecine Bizans İmparatorluğu hâkimiyeti altında giren Doğu Karadeniz'de, Bizanslı idarecilerin askeri amaçlarda kullanmak üzere Trabzon-Gümüşhane havzasına Türkleri getirmesiyle, Doğu Karadeniz'deki Türk varlığından yeniden haberdar olunmaktadır. Benzer bir durumda, Abbasilerin Bizans hududu boyunca oluşturdukları savunma cephelerinde çoğunlukla Türklere yer vermesiyle, bölgedeki Türkler hakkında bilgilerin artmasıyla görülmektedir. Doğu Karadeniz'deki Türklerden bahseden Orta Çağ tarihi kaynaklarından takip edilebildiği kadarıyla Türklerin bölgedeki faaliyetleri çoğu zaman başka otoriteler altında ve sınırlı

seviyededir. Türklerin Anadolu ve Doğu Karadeniz'deki asıl faaliyetleri ise Selçukluların otoritesi altında Anadolu'ya gelmeleriyle başlamıştır (Bury, 1912; Vasil'ev, 1923; Sevim, 1988; Ökmen, 2007; Tellioglu, 2007; Turan, 2008; Yargılaş, 2011; Yinanç, 2018). Selçukluların Anadolu'ya XI. yüzyılın ilk çeyreğinden itibaren yaptığı ilk seferlerle, Doğu Karadeniz Türk tarihinin Orta Çağ döneminde önemli bir süreç başlamıştır. Selçukluların, Anadolu'ya başlattığı ilk seferlerden, Doğu Karadeniz'e yönelik yapılan ilk akınlara ve akabinde Türklerin Anadolu'da kontrolü sağlamasıyla, kaynaklar bölgenin Türk tarihi hakkındaki daha detaylı ve kapsamlı bilgiler vermeye başlamıştır. Bu kayıtlara göre, Selçuklu hâkimiyetinin ilk yıllarında Doğu Karadeniz'deki Türk varlığı çoğunlukla Kelkit Havzası ve Çoruh boyları civarlarında yoğunluk kazanmıştır. Bununla birlikte Selçuklular zamanında Anadolu'nun en



uç noktalarına kadar temas eden Türkler, kısa sürede bölgeye yerleşerek teşkilatlanmaya başlamışlardır. Lakin Türklerin Doğu Karadeniz'deki yerleşiminin genişlemesi iki yüzyıllık bir sürece yayılmıştır. Nitekim Anadolu tarihinde önemli bir yere sahip Moğol istilası ile baskıdan kurtulmak isteyen Türklerin Doğu Karadeniz dar geçitleri ve vadileri gibi ulaşılması oldukça zahmetli yerlere sığınmasıyla, bölgedeki Türk tarihinin seyrinde önemli değişiklikler yaşanmaya başlamıştır. Anadolu'da Moğol idaresinin çözülmeye başladığı dönemde ise, bölgede önemli bir nüfusa ulaşan ve geniş arazilerde faaliyet gösteren Türkler, Doğu Karadeniz'de teşkilatlanarak Türk siyasi teşekküllerini kurmaya başlamıştır (Bedrosian, 1985; Cahen, 1988; Sevim, 1988; Andreasyan, 2000; Sevim, 2006; Temelli, 2013).

Selçukluların Anadolu'ya ilk adımı atmasıyla başlayan ve bölgenin Türk yurdu haline gelmesi ile sonuçlanan sürecin en önemli tanıkları ise dönemin tarihi kaynaklarıdır. Bu kaynaklar ise çoğunlukla bölgeyle yakın ilişkiler içerisindeki Gürcü ve Ermenilere, Doğu Karadeniz'in eski idarecisi olan Bizanslılara ve Abbasilerin Anadolu'daki ordularında önemli zaferler kazanan Türkler hakkında bilgi veren Araplara aittir. Türklerin, Anadolu'nun fethi ve bölgede gerçekleştirdikleri faaliyetler ile ilgili kayıtlara Türk kaynaklarının da eklenmesiyle bölgenin Türk tarihi hakkında bilgi veren kaynaklar ciddi bir hacme ulaşmıştır. Böylece Ermeni, Gürcü, Bizans (Grek), Arap, Türk ve az sayı da farklı milletlerden seyyahlara ait kayıtlar ile Orta Çağ'da Doğu Karadeniz'deki Türkler hakkında detaylı ve önemli bilgiler öğrenilmeye başlanmıştır. Bu araştırma da Orta Çağ boyunca Türklerin Doğu Karadeniz'e gelişi ve bölgedeki Türk faaliyetlerinin tarihi gelişimi hakkında bilgi veren kaynaklar tasnif edilerek, bölgedeki Türk tarihinin daha iyi anlaşılması gayesiyle kaynaklardaki önemli bilgiler bir araya getirilerek değerlendirilmeye çalışılmıştır.

## 2. Gürcü ve Ermeni Kaynakları

Gürcü kaynakları içerisinde Gürcistan Tarihi ismiyle tanınan K'art'lis Chovreba adlı eser, XVIII. yüzyılda Gürcü Kralı Vahtang'ın emri ile bir araya getirilmiştir. Anonim bir yıllık olan Gürcistan Tarihi, eski çağlardan XIX. yüzyılın başlarına kadar olan kısmı Marie-Félicité Brosset tarafından 1849 yılında iki cildi ve 1851 yılında ise üçüncü cildi yayınlanmıştır. Gürcistan tarihi hakkında eski çağlardan XIX. yüzyıla kadar kapsayan süre hakkındaki en önemli kaynak olarak kabul edilen K'art'lis Chovreba, Kıpçaklarla başlayan Türk-Gürcü ilişkileri hakkında son derece mühim bilgiler vermektedir. İlim âlemi tarafından Ön Türklerden olduğu kabul edilen Kimmerlere kadar olan tarihi derinliğinin yanı sıra Makedonyalı Aleksandros'un doğu seferi sırasında Çoruh havzasında karşılaştığı Kıpçaklar hakkında temel bilgi kaynağı olan eser, Selçukluların Kafkasya seferleri, Anadolu'nun Türkleşmesi, Doğu Karadeniz'e yönelik akınlar ve Türkiye Selçukluları ile ilgili de oldukça önemli bilgiler ihtiva etmektedir. Eser ayrıca Türklerin batıya

göçünün Anadolu'da yaşayan Hristiyan halklar üzerindeki etkisi ve bölgedeki Türk teşekkülleri hakkında verdiği haberler sayesinde oldukça değerli bilgiler sunmaktadır. K'art'lis Chovreba adlı anonim yıllığın ilkçağlardan 1212 yılına kadar olan kısmının Türkçe'ye tercümesi Hrand D. Andreasyan tarafından yapılmıştır (Merçil, 2003; Tellioglu, 2007).

Urfalı rahip Mateos'un yazdığı Vekayi-name adlı eser, 952-1136 yılları arasında Ermeni, Süryani, Arap ya da Bizans kaynakları ile karşılaştırıldığında diğerlerinde rastlanılmayan pek çok olayı bizlere bildirmesiyle öne çıkan bir eserdir. Kaynak, müellifin öğrencisi Grigor adlı bir papaz tarafından tutulan 1137 yılından 1163 yılına kadar olan tarihi kayıtları da içerisinde barındırmaktadır. Eserin kapsadığı tarihlerdeki olayların büyük kısmına bizzat şahit olan Mateos, şahit olmadığı olayları da tanıklarından dinleyerek eserine eklemiştir. Eserin 1858 yılında E. Dulaure tarafından Fransızca tercümesi yayımlanmış, Papaz Grigor'un kayıtlarının ilavesiyle birlikte Hrand D. Andreasyan tarafından Türkçe'ye çevrilmiştir.

Selçukluların Anadolu'ya geliş süreci ile ilgili en önemli Ermeni kaynağı olan Mateos'un kayıtları, Selçukluların Anadolu'ya düzenlediği 1018 yılındaki seferden itibaren bizlere detaylı bilgiler sunmaktadır. Eser de ayrıca Türklerin 1136 yılına kadar Anadolu'da gerçekleştirdiği faaliyetler hakkında da ayrıntılı bilgiler bulmak mümkündür. 1048 yılından itibaren Selçukluların Doğu Anadolu'da Bizans ile mücadelesi hakkında detaylı bilgiler veren eserin, Doğu Karadeniz tarihi açısından önemi, Selçukluların Kelkit havzasındaki faaliyetleri ile Danişmendlilerin Anadolu ve Karadeniz'deki faaliyetleri ve mücadelelerinin yanında, diğer Türk siyasi teşekküllerinin Bizans ve Haçlılarla olan ilişkileri hakkında verdiği bilgilerdir (Andreasyan, 2000).

Lasdivertli Aristakes, Anadolu'nun fethinde müşahede ettiği olayları Tarih adlı eserine kaydetmiştir. Aristakes'in Selçukluların Doğu Anadolu'daki faaliyetleri, Karadeniz ve Kafkaslardaki Bizans savunmasının kırılması hakkındaki kayıtları, bölgedeki askeri durumu göz önüne sermesi açısından son derece kıymetlidir. Eserin Doğu Karadeniz'deki Türklerle ilgili içerdiği ilk önemli bilgi, İbrahim Yınal'ın 1048 yılındaki sefer sırasında Selçuklu ordularından bir kuvvetin Artvin'den İspir'e kadar olan bölgede Ermenilere ağır kayıplar vermesidir. 1054 yılında ise Tuğrul Bey'in Anadolu üzerine çıktığı seferle, Doğu Anadolu üzerinden Anadolu'ya giren Selçuklu kuvvetlerinin bir kısmının kuzeye doğru yönelerek Kars-Pasin civarlarından Bayburt havalisine ve Kelkit havzası boyunca Canik Ormanları'na kadar olan bölgelerde faaliyetlerde bulunarak karşılarına çıkan Bizans kuvvetlerini mağlup etmesi bölgedeki Türkler hakkındaki verilen önemli bilgilerdendir (Bedrosian, 1985; Aslan, 2019; Tellioglu, 2020).

XIII. asır ortalarında Karabağ'da doğan Stephannos Orbelian, 1285 yılında Karabağ başpiskoposu olmuş, makamı ve görevinin gereği olarak mensubu bulunduğu

Orbelyan ailesinin tarihini yazma çabasına girmiştir. Siounie (Karabağ) Vilayeti Tarihi, Türk tarihi açısından oldukça önemli diğer bir Ermeni kaynağıdır. Siounie Vilayeti Tarihi müellifi Stephannos, çoğunlukla Ermenistan ve Gürcistan tarihi hakkında bilgi vermektedir. Eserin Orta Çağ Türk tarihi açısından önemli kılan hadiseler ise, Selçuklu Sultanı Melikşah'ın Ermenistan'a gelişi, Sultan Alparslan'ın Kars'ı fethetmesi, Kıpçak Türklerinin Gürcistan'ın Kafkaslar dışına açılımında katkısı, Trabzon Rum Devleti'nin kuruluşu ve Moğol istilasının Doğu Anadolu'da yarattığı etki gibi olaylar hakkında kaydettiği bilgilerdir (Orbelian, 1864).

XIII. Yüzyıl Ermeni müellifleri içerisinde ayrı bir öneme sahip olan Vardan Vardapet'in dini ve coğrafi eserlerinin yanı sıra şöhretini borçlu olduğu Türk Fetihleri Tarihi adlı bir eseri de bulunmaktadır. Kaynak 889-1269 yılları arasında Bizans'ın doğu eyaletlerinde ve Anadolu'da gerçekleşen olaylarla ilgili bilgilerle başlamaktadır. Eser de özellikle yazarın şahit olduğu Moğol istilası zamanı ve Türklerin Anadolu'daki fetih ve faaliyetleri hakkında verdiği bilgiler, Anadolu Türk tarihi açısından son derece kıymetlidir. Tanıklık ettiği bu olayların yanı sıra Moğol cihangiri Hülâgu Han'ın kurultayına davet edilmesiyle de Anadolu'nun fetih dönemi gibi Moğol istilası devri çalışmalarına da yarar sağlayacak bir kaynaktır. Eserin Anadolu Türk tarihi açısından önemi, Moğolların Anadolu'ya yönelmesiyle başlamaktadır.

Müverrih Vardan, Malazgirt savaşı öncesi dönemde Anadolu'da gerçekleşen bazı olaylar hakkında verdiği bilgiler de, Çağrı Bey'in batı seferleri, Danişmendlilerin, Haçlılarla mücadelesi gibi olaylarda görülen kronoloji hataların yanında olaylar anlatılan kişilerin adlarındaki farklılıklar sebebiyle bazı kuşuklara meydan vermektedir. Bunun yanı sıra Moğol istilası dönemine şahitlik etmesi bakımından Vardan'ın eseri, Moğolların Gürcistan, Kafkaslar ve Anadolu'daki faaliyetleri hakkındaki bilgilerle, diğer kaynaklarda noksan kalan pek çok konuyu tamamlamaktadır. Vardan'ın eserini 1851 yılında Brosset ve 1860 yılında Eduard Dulaurier çalışmalarında kullanmışsa da eserin ilk müstakil nüshaları 1861 yılında J. N. Emin tarafından Moskova'da yayımlanmıştır. Dulaurier tarafından Fransızca'ya çevrilen eser, aynı nüshanın M. K. Ayas'ın tercümesiyle ilk defa Türkçe olarak yayımlanmıştır. Hrand D. Andreasyan, Vardan'ın tarihini 1937 yılında ayrıntılı şekliyle tekrar yayımlamıştır. (Vardan, 1937; Vardan, 2017).

Okçu Milletin Tarihi adlı eseri kaleme alan Aknerli Grigor, XIII. asır Ermeni tarihçileri arasında sayılmaktadır. Grigor, Moğolların, 1240-1273 yılları arasında Doğu Anadolu'da ve kısmen Kelkit havzasındaki faaliyetleriyle ilgili verdiği bilgilerin yanı sıra Doğu Karadeniz'e yayılmaya çalışan Gürcülerin bu dönemde içinde buldukları durum hakkında da ayrıntılı bilgiler vermektedir. Aknerli Grigor'un eseri çeşitli dillere tercüme edilmiştir. Bu eser Hrand D. Andreasyan tarafından Türkçe'ye kazandırılmıştır (Andreasyan, 2012).

### 3. Bizans Kaynakları

Bizans kaynakları çoğunlukla XI. yüzyılın sonlarından itibaren Anadolu'daki Türk faaliyetleri hakkında bilgiler içermektedir. Bizans tarihçilerinin bölge hakkında olaylara bakış açıları Anadolu hakkında bilgi veren diğer tarihçilerden nazaran daha zayıftır. Olaylara çoğunlukla üst bir gözden bakan Bizans tarihçileri, Bizans-Selçuklu mücadelelerinde aleyhte gelişen durumlar hakkında olayları bile kendilerine göre yorumlamalarına rağmen Türkiye Selçukluları tarihi açısından birinci derecede öneme sahiptirler (Telliöglü, 2020).

Bizans tarihçisi İonnes Skylitzes, 811-1057 yılları arasında kapsayan bir kronik yazmıştır. Skylitzes'in eserini önemli kılan husus günümüze ulaşmamış kaynaklardan elde ettiği bilgileri kaydetmesidir. Bizans İmparatoru II. Basileios (976-1025) zamanındaki olaylar hakkında mühim kayıtlara sahip olan eser, Türklerle Bizanslılar arasında 1071 yılından önce gerçekleşen mücadelelerle ilgili önemli bilgiler vermektedir. Eserin Doğu Karadeniz için önemi ise Malazgirt öncesi dönemde Selçukluların Kelkit havzasındaki etkisi ve Şebinkarahisar üzerinde oluşan Türk baskısı hakkındaki kayıtlardır (Telliöglü, 2007).

Mikhael Attaleiates, 1034 yılından başlayarak 1080 yılına kadar gerçekleşen olayları Tarih adlı eserine kaydetmiştir. Aynı zamanda Bizans devlet adamı da olan Mikhael Attaleiates, eserinde özellikle doğrudan şahit olduğu Malazgirt savaşı ve sonrasında gerçekleşen olaylar hakkında önemli bilgiler vermektedir. Eser ayrıca Selçukluların Anadolu'da ilerleyişinin yanında, Khaldia (Trabzon havalisi) ve Şebinkarahisar çevresindeki Türk baskısı, Bizans İmparatorluğu'nun Anadolu'da yaşadığı iç ve dış sıkıntıları göstermesi hakkında verdiği bilgilerle önem kazanmaktadır (Attaleiates, 2008).

Bizans İmparatoru Aleksios Komnenos'un kızı olan Anna Komnena'nın kaleme aldığı Alexiad adlı eser, Malazgirt savaşı sonrası Türklerin Doğu Karadeniz bölgesindeki faaliyetleri hakkında önemli bilgiler vermektedir. Bölgedeki Türklerin, Bizans ve Haçlılarla mücadele ettiği dönem hakkında bilgiler veren Anna Komnena, Selçukluların Doğu Karadeniz'e kadar uzanan seferleri, Haçlıların Anadolu'da Türklerle ilk kez karşılaşmaları, Bizanslıların Türklerle yaptığı mücadeleler ve Büyük Selçuklu Devleti ile Türkiye Selçukluları arasındaki olan ilişkilerin seyrini 1118 yılına kadar ayrıntılı olarak anlatmaktadır. Bu vekayinâme Bilge Umar tarafından Alexiad ismiyle Türkçe'ye tercüme edilmiştir (Komnena, 2021).

Bizans sarayında önemli bir devlet adamı olan Niketas Khoniates Tarih adlı bir eser kaleme almıştır. Niketas Khoniates naklettiği olayların çoğuna şahit olmuştur. Eser de, XII. yüzyılda özellikle Türkiye Selçuklu Sultanı Mesud zamanında Anadolu'nun durumu, Bizans ile Danişmendlilerin münasebetleri, Kelkit havzasındaki Türk beyleri ve Trabzon Rum Devleti'nin kuruluşu hakkında önemli bilgiler bulunmaktadır. Niketas Khoniates eseri, ilk defa 1850 yılında Hieronymus Wolf yayımlanmıştır. Çeşitli dillere tercümesi yapılan eserin



Ioannes Komnenos ve Manuel Komnenos dönemleri ile ilgili bölümleri Türkçe'ye çevrilmiştir (Demirkent, 2004). Mikhail Psellos, 1018 yılında İstanbul'da doğmuş ve aynı yüzyılın son çeyreğinde ölmüştür. Zamanının en önemli bilgini ünvanını alan Psellos, Bizans sarayında önemli mevkilerde bulunmuştur. Psellos, yaşadığı dönemde şahit olduğu olayların yanında çevresinde cereyan eden olayları Khronographia adlı eserinde kaleme almıştır. II. Basileios'un 976 yılında tahta çıkışından 1077 yılına kadar devam eden yüzyıllık süre hakkında önemli bilgi veren Psellos, Bizans sarayında gelişen olayların yanında Sultan Alparslan zamanındaki Selçuklu akınları ve ilerlemelerine karşı Gürcistan ve Doğu Anadolu'nun vaziyeti hakkında da önemli bilgiler vermektedir. Eserin Doğu Karadeniz açısından önemiyse Kelkit havzasında ve Şebinkarahisar'daki Bizans kuvvetlerinin durumu ile ilgili verdiği bilgilerdir. Khronographia adlı eser Işın Demirkent tarafından Türkçe'ye kazandırılmıştır (Demirkent, 1992).

Trabzon Rum Devleti döneminin en önemli manastırlarından biri olan Vazelon Manastırı'na ait Vazelon Aktaları, XIII. ve XV. Yüzyıl arası dönemde Trabzon havalisinin sosyal ve ekonomik tarihi açısından son derece kıymetli bilgiler veren belgelerdir. Vazelon kayıtlarındaki kişi adları, bölgede yaşayan halkın kimliğine ilişkin bazı ipuçları vermektedir. Ayrıca manastıra ait kayıtları, XIV. yüzyılın başlarında itibaren gerçekleşen Türk akınları neticesinde tutsak alınan Trabzon halkı ile ilgili verdiği bilgiler doğrultusunda, bölgenin siyasi olaylarını da aydınlığa kavuşturmaktadır. Vazelon Aktaları, 1927 yılında F. İ. Uspenski tarafından yayımlanmıştır (Keçiç, 2013).

Michael Panaretos'un Chronique de Trebizonde adlı eseri, Doğu Karadeniz'deki Türk tarihi açısından oldukça önemli bir eserdir. Panaretos, III. Aleksios Komnenos döneminde II. Ioannes zamanından başlayarak Trabzon Rum Devleti odaklı bilgiler veren bir kronik kaleme almıştır. Eser de XIII. yüzyılın sonlarından başlamak üzere Doğu Karadeniz'deki Türkler hakkında önemli bilgiler bulmak mümkündür. XIV. yüzyıl boyunca Türklerin, Trabzon Rum Devleti ile ilişkileri boyutunda önemli bilgiler öğrenebildiğimiz kronik özellikle Panaretos'un III. Aleksios'un hükümdarlığı zamanında Türklerle girilen çatışmalarda bizzat şahit olduğu olayları kaydetmesi açısından değer kazanmaktadır.

Eserin Doğu Karadeniz'deki Türkler açısından önemi II. Ioannes Komnenos zamanında ilerlemeye devam eden Çepni Türklerinin 1297 yılında itibaren Ordu'yu ele geçirmeleri ve doğuya doğru genişlemelerini sürdürdükleri ile ilgili verdiği bilgilerle başlamaktadır. Çepni Türklerinin Ordu yöresinde teşkilatlanarak Hacımiroğulları'nı kurmasıyla, Trabzon Rum Devleti üzerine yapılan seferler hakkında önemli kayıtlar bulunan eserde, Trabzon'un güneyindeki Türklerle girilen mücadeleler hakkından da mühim bilgiler bulunmaktadır. Ayrıca 1336 yılından itibaren Trabzon Rum Devleti'nin hanedan ailesi Komnenosların Türklerle akrabalık kurmak için yaptığı evlilikler, Hacımiroğulları

ile Taceddinoğulları mücadelesi, Giresun'a kadar olan batı topraklarının kaybı ve Giresun'da Çepnilerle yaşanan mücadeleler eserde ayrıntılı bir şekilde ele alınmıştır. Eser sahip olduğu bu kayıtlarla Türklerin Doğu Karadeniz'deki faaliyetleri ve Trabzon Rum Devleti'nin bu durum karşısında izlediği politika hakkındaki tek bilgi kaynağıdır (Demirkent, 2004).

#### 4. Türk-İslam Kaynakları

El-Kâmil fi't-Tarih adlı bir eseri kaleme alan İbn'ül Esir, İslam ülkelerinin 1231 yılına kadar olan dönemini içeren bir kaynak hazırlamıştır. Oğuz göçü ile başlayıp Anadolu Türk tarihi hakkında önemli bilgiler veren kaynak, Selçukluların 1048 yılında Trabzon havalisine düzenledikleri akınlar, Danişmendlilerin Anadolu'daki faaliyetleri ve Türkiye Selçuklu Devleti ile Gürcü Krallığı arasındaki mücadelelerden bahsettiği gibi Gürcü kaynaklarını teyit etme noktasında büyük önem taşımaktadır (Ağırakca ve Özyayın, 1987).

Nasreddîn Hüseyin b. Muhammed İbn-i Bîbî, El Evamirü'l-Ala'ie Fi'l-Umuri'l-Ala'ie adlı eserinde Türkiye Selçukluları ve Moğol istilası zamanı hakkında önemli bilgiler vermektedir. İbn-i Bîbî'nin kayıtları, Türkiye Selçuklu Sultanı Gıyaseddin Keyhüsrev'in tahta çıkmasından Gıyaseddin Mesud'un İlhanlılardan Diyarbakır çevresini iktâ almasına kadar geçen zamanla ilgili en önemli bilgi kaynağıdır. Aynı zamanda divân kâtibi olan İbn Bîbî, kaleme aldığı eserde resmî devlet belgelerini de kullanmıştır. Müellifin kaydettiği bilgilere çoğunlukla şahit olması veya olayların yakın tanıklarından bizzat dinlemesi eserin kıymeti arttırmaktadır. El Evamirü'l-Ala'ie Fi'l-Umuri'l-Ala'ie'de, Türkiye Selçukluları, Moğol istilası, Selçuklu-İlhanlı ilişkileri gibi temel konuların yanı sıra Anadolu'nun siyasi, sosyal, idarî, iktisadî ve kültürel durumu hakkında da önemli bilgiler bulunmaktadır. Eserin Doğu Karadeniz için önemi ise Doğu Karadeniz'deki Türklerin faaliyetleri, Türkiye Selçuklularının Trabzon Rum Devleti ve Gürcü Krallıklarıyla olan mücadelesi hakkında verdiği ayrıntılı bilgilerdir (Yınanç, 2007).

Mevlânâ İbn-i 'Alâ tarafından yazılı hale getirilen ancak Tokat Kalesi dizdarı Ârif Ali tarafından yeniden elden geçirilmiş şekliyle günümüze ulaşan Danişmendnâme adlı eser, Melik Dânişmend Gazi'nin doğumu, çocukluk ve yetişme devresiyle başlayıp daha sonra XI. yüzyılın ikinci yarısından itibaren İç ve Kuzey Anadolu bölgelerini kendisine harekât sahası olarak seçen Danişmendlilerin kuruluşu ve bulunduğu bölgeyi fethetme sürecini, Bizans ve Haçlılar ile olan mücadelelerini ve Trabzon Rum Devleti ile girilen Doğu Karadeniz'de hakimiyet kurma çabaları hakkında önemli bilgiler ihtiva etmektedir (Demir, 2004).

Kerîmüddin Mahmud Aksarayî'nin Müsâmeret ül-Ahbâr adlı eseri, Türkiye Selçukluları hakkında bilgi veren başka önemli bir kaynaktır. Aksarayî'nin, İlhanlıların Anadolu valisi Timurtaş'a sunduğu Müsâmeret ül-Ahbâr, ilk defa Barthold tarafından ilim âlemine tanıtılmıştır.

Eserin giriş kısmında Hz. Muhammed'in hayatı ile başlayarak Hulefâ-i Raşidin, Emevi, Abbasiler ve Büyük Selçuklular hakkında bilgiler bulunmaktadır. Eser, XIII. asrın ikinci yarısından başlayarak Türkiye Selçuklularının ve İlhanlıların Anadolu'daki faaliyetleri ile ilgili önemli bilgiler verdiği gibi Doğu Karadeniz'i ilgilendiren Kelkit Havzası'nda gerçekleşen bazı olaylar hakkında da mühim bilgiler bulmak mümkündür (Öztürk, 2000).

İbn-i Batûtâ, Arap Yarımadası, Mezopotamya, Doğu Afrika, Kuzey Türk Şehirleri, Doğu Asya ve Endülüs gibi pek çok ülkeyi gezmesi ve buralar hakkında bilgiler vermesi sayesinde Orta Çağ'ın en önemli seyyahları arasında yerini almıştır. İbn-i Batûtâ'nın kaydettiği seyahatnâme Anadolu Türk tarihi açısından bakıldığında önemli bir Orta Çağ Türk Tarihi bilgisine sahiptir. İbn-i Batûtâ'nın Anadolu'ya geldiği dönemde Türkiye oldukça hareketli ve önemli olaylara tanık olmaktadır. Bu dönem de Moğol istilasının getirdiği asayişsizlikle baş etmeye çalışan Türkiye Selçuklularının aynı zamanda Anadolu'nun yönetimini de Moğollara bırakmak zorunda kaldığı ve siyasî karışıklıkların yaşandığı bir süreç yaşanmaktadır. Bunun yanı sıra seyahatname de, Anadolu'daki Türk beyliklerinin kendi aralarındaki mücadeleleri hakkındaki bilgilere de rastlanmaktadır. (Aykut, 2004).

Aziz b. Erdeşir-i Esterâbadî, 1394 yılında Timur'un elinden kaçarak Kadı Burhaneddin'e sığınmış ve kaleme aldığı kitabını 1398 yılında Kadı Burhaneddin'e ithaf etmiştir. Esterâbadî'nin kaleme aldığı Bezm u Rezm adlı eserin başlıca konusu Kadı Burhaneddin ve çevresinde gelişen olaylardır. Eser, Eretnalılar dağılmasından sonra Sivas çevresine hâkim olan Kadı Burhaneddin'in Eretnalılar'daki naipliği ve bağımsızlığını ilan ederek yaşadığı olaylara şahitlik etmesi açısından kıymet kazanmaktadır. Bezm u Rezm adlı eserin Doğu Karadeniz Türk tarihi açısından önemi ise Kadı Burhaneddin'in çevresindeki beyliklerle, özellikle Kelkit havzasındaki Türk beylikleriyle ve Türk beyliklerinin Trabzon Rum Devleti ile ilişkileri, Hacıemiroğulları-Taceddinoğulları çatışmaları ve Doğu Karadeniz'de yapılan Türk fetihler hakkındaki verdiği bilgilerdir. 1928 yılında Köprülü (1943) tarafından tıpkıbasımı yapılan Bezm u Rezm adlı eser Mürsel Öztürk tarafından Türkçe'ye kazandırılmıştır (Erdeşir, 2014).

Ebu Bekr-i Tihranî'nin 1470-1471 yıllarında Akkoyunlu hükümdarı Uzun Hasan'a atfettiği Kitab-ı Diyarbekriyye adlı eser, Akkoyunlu ve Karakoyunlu Türkleri hakkında yazılmış tek tarihi kaynaktır. Müellif eserinde Uzun Hasan'ın soyu ve atalarından bahsettikten sonra ilk hükümdar Kara Osman Bey'den başlayarak Akkoyunlu tarihi hakkında detaylı kayıtlar tuttuğu gibi Osmanlı-Akkoyunlu mücadelelerine kadar geçen döneme kadar bizlere önemli bilgiler vermektedir. Eserde, Akkoyunluların Kelkit havzasındaki faaliyetleri, Akkoyunluların, Erzincan Emirliği ve çevresinde gerçekleşen olaylar, Akkoyunluların ve Mutahharten'in Bayburt ve Şebinkarahisar havalisindeki faaliyetleri,

Kelkit Vadisi'ndeki Türklerin Trabzon Rum Devleti'yle girdiği mücadeleler ve Akkoyunluların Trabzon Rum Devleti ile olan ilişkileri gibi bölge tarihi açısından önemli konular hakkında detaylı bilgiler mevcuttur (Öztürk, 2014).

## 5. Diğer Dillere Ait Kaynaklar

Gregory Abu'l Farac (Bar Hebraeus) yirmi iki yıl İlhanlı Hanı Hülâgu'nun yanında bulunarak, 1292 yılına kadar uzanan bir eser kaleme almıştır. Yazar, XII. yüzyılın sonuna kadar çoğunlukla İslam kaynaklarından yararlandığı eserini 1297 yılında bitirmiştir. Abu'l Farac'ın Süryani, Arap ve Fars kaynaklarından yararlandığı kroniği bir derleme olarak görülebilir. Kaynak, Türklerin Anadolu'daki ilk fetihleri, Anadolu'daki Türk beyliklerinin faaliyetleri ve Kelkit havzası boyunca Türk beylerinin gerçekleştirdiği bazı olaylar hakkında önemli bilgiler barındırmaktadır (Doğrul, 1999).

Ruj Gonzales de Clavijo, XV. yüzyılın başlarında İspanya Kralı III. Enrique tarafından Timur'a elçi olarak gönderilmiştir. Ankara savaşının hemen ardından Doğu Karadeniz'i de kapsayan topraklardan geçen Ruj Gonzales de Clavijo, yolculuğu boyunca yaşadığı olayları seyahatnamesine kaydetmiştir. Doğu Karadeniz kıyılarında çoğunlukla deniz yoluyla ilerleyen seyyah, Trabzon'dan itibaren yaya olarak Gümüşhane taraflarına gitmiştir. Seyyah, Doğu Karadeniz'deki pek çok kıyı yerleşiminin siyasi ve sosyal yapısı, XV. yüzyılın başlarında Doğu Karadeniz kıyılarındaki Türkler, Trabzon Rum Devleti, Ceneviz ve Venediklilerin birbirleriyle veya kendi aralarında cereyan eden mücadeleleri ile ilgili olarak verdiği bilgilerle karanlıkta kalan pek çok konuyu aydınlatmaktadır. Seyahatname, Hacıemiroğulları'nın hâkimiyet alanı ve Trabzon Rum Devleti'nin çevresindeki topraklarda bulunan Türkler hakkında verdiği bilgilerle Doğu Karadeniz Türk tarihi açısından önemli bir yere sahiptir (de Clavijo, 2008).

## 6. Sonuç

Kaynakların verdiği bilgilere göre, Türklerin eskiçağlardan itibaren Doğu Karadeniz'de yaşadığı bilindiği gibi, Orta Çağ'da da bölgedeki varlıkları devam etmektedir. Orta Çağ'ın Bizans İmparatorluğu idaresi altında geçen döneminde, Anadolu'daki Türkler hakkındaki bilgiler son derece sınırlıyken, Doğu Karadeniz'deki Türkler ile ilgili bilgiler ise karanlıkta kalmaktadır. Kaynaklardaki bu bilgi karanlığı, Selçukluların XI. yüzyılın başlarından itibaren Anadolu'ya ulaşmasıyla aydınlanmaya başlamıştır. Selçukluların Kafkaslar ve Doğu Anadolu'ya ulaşmasıyla bölgedeki Gürcü ve Ermeni kaynakları Selçuklular hakkında önemli bilgiler vermeye başlamaktadır. Orta Çağ Doğu Karadeniz tarihi kaynakları, Selçukluların Anadolu'yu fetih döneminde daha çok Doğu Karadeniz'in Çoruh boylarında ve Kelkit havalisinde faaliyetleri hakkında önemli bilgiler vermesi, Türklerin Doğu Karadeniz'deki

ilk faaliyetlerine bu bölgelerden başlamasıyla açıklanabilir.

Selçukluların Anadolu'daki ilerlemesinin devam ettiği süre içerisinde, Arap ve Bizans kaynakları Anadolu'da ve Doğu Karadeniz'deki Türklerden daha fazla bahsederek, Türklerin bölgedeki faaliyetleri hakkında değerli bilgiler vermektedir. İlk Türk beyliklerinin kurulması ve faaliyet alanlarının Doğu Karadeniz vadileri ve kıyılarına kadar ulaşmasıyla, kayıtlar Doğu Karadeniz'in genelini kapsamaya başlamıştır. Trabzon Rum Devleti'nin kuruluşundan itibaren ise hâkimiyet ideali Doğu Karadeniz olan Komnenosların karşısındaki yegâne gücün Türkler olması, Doğu Karadeniz'deki Türklerin, Trabzon Rum Devleti'nin resmi kayıtlarında önemli bir yere sahip olmasına neden olmuş bu durum ise bölgedeki Türkler hakkında detaylı bilgiler öğrenmemize yardım etmiştir. Nitekim bu kayıtlar ile bölgedeki Türklerin Trabzon Rum Devleti'yle mücadeleleri ve Türk beylerinin kurdukları siyasi teşekküller hakkında eşsiz ve son derece mühim bilgiler öğrenilmektedir. Ayrıca Moğol istilası zamanı ve sonrasında tutulan tarihi kayıtlarda, Kelkit havzasındaki Türk siyasi teşekkülleri ve Doğu Karadeniz dağlarının kuzeyini kendilerine yurt edinen Türk beylerinin, Trabzon Rum Devleti ile münasebetleriyle ilgili teferruatlı bilgiler bulmak mümkündür.

Özetle Orta Çağ Doğu Karadeniz Türk tarihinden bahseden kaynaklar, Selçukluların Anadolu'yu fetih sürecinde, Doğu Karadeniz'deki Türkler hakkındaki bazen yerinde bazen ise nakil yoluyla çeşitli bilgiler vermeye başlamıştır. Bu bilgi birikimi, ilk Türk beylikleri ve Moğollar devrinde ise önemli bir seviye ulaşmıştır. Ancak bu döneme kadar olan kaynaklar incelendiğinde, özellikle Gürcü ve Ermeni yazarlarda mekân yani memleket odaklı bir tarih yazıcılığının ön planda olduğu görülmektedir. Panaretos'un eseri istisna tutulursa Bizans (Grek) ve Araplara ait kaynaklarda ise bölgede ciddi bir olay yaşanmadığı sürece kaydedilen bilgiler çoğu zaman yüzeyseldir. Doğu Karadeniz tarihi hakkında bilgi veren Türk kaynaklarının önemi ise Moğol istilasından itibaren arttığı gibi Doğu Karadeniz'deki Türk beylerinin aralarındaki mücadeleleri ve Osmanlıların bölgeye ilk teması ile ilgili önemli bilgiler barındırmaktadır.

#### Katkı Oranı Beyanı

Yazarın katkı yüzdesi aşağıda verilmiştir. Yazar makaleyi incelemiş ve onaylamıştır.

	B.S.
K	100
T	100
Y	100
VTI	100
VAY	100
KT	100
YZ	100
KI	100
GR	100
PY	100
FA	100

K= kavram, T= tasarım, Y= yönetim, VTI= veri toplama ve/veya işleme, VAY= veri analizi ve/veya yorumlama, KT= kaynak tarama, YZ= Yazım, KI= kritik inceleme, GR= gönderim ve revizyon, PY= proje yönetimi, FA= fon alımı.

#### Çatışma Beyanı

Yazar bu çalışmada hiçbir çıkar ilişkisi olmadığını beyan etmektedirler.

#### Kaynaklar

- Ağrakca A, Özaydın A. 1987. İbnü'l Esir: El Kamil Fi't-Tarih tercümesi. Bahar Yayınları, İstanbul, Türkiye, pp: 6200.
- Andreasyan HD. 2000. Urfalı Mateos Vekayi-Namesi (952-1136) ve Papaz Grigor'un Zeyli (1136-1162). TTK Yayınları, Ankara, Türkiye, pp: 411.
- Andreasyan HD. 2012. Aknerli Grigor: Moğol Tarihi. Yeditepe Yayınevi, İstanbul, Türkiye, pp: 57.
- Aslan İ. 2019. Ermeni Bir Rahibin Gözünden Selçuklular ve Anadolu'nun Fethi: Lastivertli Aristakes. Post Yayınları, İstanbul, Türkiye, pp: 128.
- Attaleiates M. 2008. Tarih. Çeviren: Bilge Umar. Arkeoloji ve Sanat Yayınları, İstanbul, Türkiye, pp: 326.
- Aykut AS. 2004. İbn-i Batûtâ Ebû Abdullah Muhammed Tanci: İbn-i Batûtâ Seyahatnâmesi. Yapı Kredi Yayınları. İstanbul, Türkiye, pp:1112.
- Bedrosian R. 1985. Aristakes Lastivertci's History. Sophepe Pty Ltd, New York, US.
- Bury JB. 1912. A History of the Eastern Roman Empire. Macmillan and Co. Londra, UK.
- Cahan C. 1988. Türklerin Anadolu'ya İlk Girişi. TTK Yayınları, Ankara, Türkiye.
- de Claviyo RG. 2008. Timur'un Hayatı, Kadiz'den Semerkand'a Seyahatler. Çeviren: Zeynep Ertan. Pozitif Yayınları. İstanbul, Türkiye, pp: 276.
- Demir N. 2004. Dânişmend-nâme. Akçağ Yayınları, Ankara, Türkiye, pp: 583.
- Demirkent I. 1992. Mihail Psellos'un Khronographia'sı. TTK Yayınları, Ankara, Türkiye, pp: 322.
- Demirkent I. 2004. Niketas Khoniates'ın Historiası (1195-1206)- İstanbul'un Haçlılar Tarafından zaptı ve yağmalanması. Dünya Yayıncılık, İstanbul, Türkiye.
- Doğrul ÖR. 1999. Gregory Abu'l-Farac (Bar Hebraeus): Abu'l-Farac Tarihi. II. TTK Yayınları, Ankara, Türkiye, pp: 337.
- Erdeşir EAB. 2014. Bezm u Rezm. Çeviren: Mürsel Öztürk. TTK Yayınları, Ankara, Türkiye, pp: 530.
- Keçiç M. 2013. Trabzon Rum İmparatorluğu ve Türkler 1204-1404. TTK Yayınları, Ankara, Türkiye, pp: 426.

- Komnena A. 2021. Alexiad. Çeviren: Bilge Umar. İnkılap Kitapevi, İstanbul, Türkiye, pp: 496.
- Köprülü MF. 1943. Anadolu Selçukluları Tarihi'nin Yerli Kaynakları. Belleten. VII/27. TTK Yayınları, Ankara, Türkiye, pp: 379-521.
- Merçil E. 2003. Gürcistan Tarihi. TTK Yayınları, Ankara, Türkiye, pp: 472.
- Orbelian S. 1864. Histoire de la Sionie. nşr. Marie-Félicité Brosset. Imprimerie de l'Académie Impériale de Sciences. Saint-Petersburg, Russia.
- Ökmen M. 2007. Herodotos. Türkiye İş Bankası Yayınları, İstanbul, Türkiye.
- Öztürk M. 2000. Kerimüddin Mahmud Aksarayî: Mûsâmeret ül-Ahbâr. TTK Yayınları, Ankara, Türkiye, pp: 282.
- Öztürk M. 2014. Ebu Bekr-i Tihranî: Kitab-ı Diyarbekriyye. TTK Yayınları, Ankara, Türkiye, pp: 418.
- Sevim A. 1988. Anadolu'nun Fethi Selçuklular Dönemi. TTK Basımevi. Ankara, Türkiye, pp: 286.
- Sevim A. 2006. Azîmi Tarihi. TTK Yayınları, Ankara, Türkiye, pp: 318.
- Telliöğlü İ. 2007. Osmanlı hâkimiyetine kadar Doğu Karadeniz Bölgesinde Türkler. Serander Yayınları, Trabzon, Türkiye, pp: 232.
- Telliöğlü İ. 2020. Fethedilenlerin Gözüyle Anadolu'nun Fethi. Bilge Kültür Sanat, İstanbul, Türkiye, pp: 136.
- Temelli M. 2013. İbnü'l Esir: El Kamil Fi't-Tarih Büyük Selçuklu Devleti Tarihi. Ark Kitapları, İstanbul, Türkiye, pp: 512.
- Turan O. 2008. Selçuklular tarihi ve Türk İslam medeniyeti. Ötüken Neşriyat, İstanbul, Türkiye, pp: 544.
- Vardan M. 1937. Türk Fütuhâtı Tarihi. Çeviren: H. D. Andreasyan. Tarih Semineri Dergisi, I-II: 154-244.
- Vardan M. 2017. Türk Fetihleri Tarihi. Çeviren: Hrant D. Andreasyan. Post Yayınevi, İstanbul, Türkiye, pp: 128.
- Vasil'ev AA. 1923. Struggle with the Saracens (867-1057). The Cambridge Medieval History. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK.
- Yarlıgâş O. 2011. Ksenophon: Anabasis onbinlerin dönüşü. Kabalıcı Yayınevi, İstanbul, Türkiye, pp: 407.
- Yınanç MH. 2007. İbn Bibî - Selçuknâme. Kitapevi Yayınları, İstanbul, Türkiye, pp: 275.
- Yınanç MH. 2018. Türkiye tarihi Selçuklular Devri. TTK Yayınları, Ankara, Türkiye, pp: 428.