

MIDDLE EAST JOURNAL OF REFUGEE STUDIES

Cilt/Volume: 6 • Sayı/Number: 2 • Güz/Autumn 2021

ISSN: 2149-4398 • eISSN: 2458-8962

Middle East Journal of Refugee Studies uluslararası ve hakemli bir dergidir.

Yayımlanan makalelerin sorumluluğu yazarına / yazarlarına aittir.

Middle East Journal of Refugee Studies is the official peer-reviewed, international journal of the International Refugee Rights Association. Authors bear responsibility for the content of their published articles.

Uluslararası Mülteci Hakları Derneği Adına

İmtiyaz Sahibi ve Sorumlu Yazı İşleri Müdürü

/Owner and Chief Executive Officer

Av. Abdullah Resul Demir

Genel Yayın Yönetmeni/Executive Editor

Süleyman Kurt

Baş Editor/Editor-in-Chief

Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Fatih Kucur

Editörler/Editors

Mehmet Talha Güvençer

Fatma Kurt

Selin Buğa

Danışma / Hakem Kurulu/Editorial Advisory Board

Prof. Dr. Yusuf Adıgüzel (Sakarya Üniversitesi)

Prof. Dr. Esin Küntay (Mimar Sinan Güzel Sanatlar Üniversitesi)

Prof. Dr. Orhan Koçak (İstanbul Üniversitesi/Cerrahpaşa)

Doç. Dr. Osman Akgül (İstanbul Üniversitesi)

Doç. Dr. Mustafa Otrar (Marmara Üniversitesi)

Doç. Dr. Yusuf Alpaydın (Marmara Üniversitesi)

Doç. Dr. Mehmet Fatih Aysan (Marmara Üniversitesi)

Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Fatih Kucur (İstanbul Üniversitesi/Cerrahpaşa)

Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Şevket Ercan Kızılay (Düzce Üniversitesi)

Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Mehmet Ali Bolat (İstanbul Sabahattin Zaim Üniversitesi)

Redaktör/Galley Proof

Ceren Kaya

Tasarım ve Uygulama/Graphic Design

Bilimon Medya ve İletişim A.Ş

Yayın Türü/Type of Publication

Uluslararası Süreli Yayın/International Periodical

Yayın Dili/Language of Publication

Türkçe ve İngilizce/Turkish and English

Yayın Periyodu/Publishing Period

Altı ayda bir Haziran ve Aralık aylarında yayımlanır/Biannual (June&December)

Baskı ve Cilt/Press

Peak Ajans

Adres: Fulya Mah. Prof.Dr. Bülent TARCAN Cad. No:14 D:6 Şişli/İstanbul



İletişim/Correspondence

Uluslararası Mülteci Hakları Derneği

Ali Kuşçu Mah. Büyük Karaman Cad. Taylasan Sok. Toprak Apt. K: 1 Fatih İstanbul

Telefon: +90 (212) 531-2025 **Web:** <http://mejrs.com/> **Elektronik posta:** admin@mejrs.com

İçindekiler / Table of Contents

MAKALELER / ARTICLES

Challenges in A Host Country: A Study on Rohingya Refugees in Bangladesh / **Sığımlan Ülkedeki Zorluklar: Bangladeş'teki Rohingya Mültecileri Üzerine Bir Araştırma**.....05
Rahmat ULLAH - Md Mostafa FAISAL

Integration Policies Implemented for Migrants in Welfare States / **Refah Devletlerinde Göçmenlere Yönelik Uyum Politikaları**.....21
Çiğdem ULUDAĞ GÜLER

KİTAP İNCELEMESİ / BOOK REVIEW

Göç, Kültür, Kimlik / **Migrancy, Culture, Identity**.....53
Furkan DÜZENLİ

Yazarlara Notlar / **Instructions for Authors**.....58

Challenges in A Host Country: A Study on Rohingya Refugees in Bangladesh

Rahmat ULLAH^a

Md Mostafa FAISAL^b

Abstract

The Rohingya is a Muslim minority of Myanmar's Rakhine state now; they are often called the most persecuted nation globally. Due to state-sponsored persecution, this minority group crossed the border to Bangladesh, while others took to the sea to reach Indonesia, Malaysia, and Thailand. Bangladesh is the biggest host country of Rohingya, where more than 1 million refugees live now. This study aims to explore their problems in the refugee camps of Cox's Bazar in Bangladesh. Primary data of this study were collected from 21 Rohingyas, local peoples and social workers through open-ended structured and semi-structured questions. This paper concludes that the Rohingya refugees face various challenges in housing, food, education, security, and health care issues in the camps area in Bangladesh.

Keywords

Rohingya • Refugee • Host Country • Bangladesh • Myanmar

^a Rahmat ULLAH, Assist. Prof, Dr., Istanbul Gelisim University, Department of Political Science and International Relations, rullah@gelisim.edu.tr ORCID ID: 0000-0002-1548-5966

^b Md Mostafa FAISAL (Dr), Gazi University, parvezsm129@yahoo.com, ORCID ID: 0000-0002-0066-6721

Sığınan Ülkedeki Zorluklar: Bangladeş'teki Rohingya Mültecileri Üzerine Bir Araştırma

Rahmat ULLAH^a

Md Mostafa FAISAL^b

Öz

Rohingya, Myanmar'ın Rakhine eyaletinin Müslüman bir azınlığıdır ve şimdi dünyanın en çok zulme uğrayan etnik grubu olarak adlandırılmaktadırlar. Devlet destekli zulüm nedeniyle, bu azınlık grubunun birçoğu Bangladeş sınırını geçerken, bazıları Endonezya, Malezya ve Tayland'a ulaşmak için denize açılmaktadırlar. Bangladeş, şu anda 1 milyondan fazla Rohingya mültecilerine ev sahipliği yapan bir ülkedir. Bu çalışmanın amacı, Bangladeş'in Cox's Bazar'daki mülteci kamplarındaki sorunları araştırmaktır. Bu çalışmanın birincil verileri, açık uçlu yapılandırılmış ve yarı yapılandırılmış sorular aracılığıyla Rohingya mültecileri, yerel halkı ve sosyal yardım çalışanlarından toplam 21 kişiden toplanmıştır. Bu makale, Rohingya mültecilerinin Bangladeş'teki kamp alanlarında barınma, gıda, eğitim, güvenlik ve sağlık konularında çeşitli zorluklarla karşı karşıya olduğu sonucuna varmaktadır.

Anahtar Kelimeler

Rohingya • Mülteci • Ev Sahibi Ülke • Bangladeş • Myanmar

^a RRahmat ULLAH, Dr. Öğr. Üyesi, İstanbul Gelişim Üniversitesi, Siyaset Bilimi ve Uluslararası İlişkiler Bölümü, rullah@gelisim.edu.tr, ORCID ID: 0000-0002-1548-5966

^b Md Mostafa FAISAL (Dr), Gazi Üniversitesi, parvezsm129@yahoo.com, ORCID ID: 0000-0002-0066-6721

Başvuru Tarihi: : 8 Ocak 2022

Kabul Tarihi: : 28 Ocak 2022

Copyright © 2020 • **Uluslararası Mülteci Hakları Derneği** • <http://mejrs.com>

ISSN 2149-4398 • **eISSN** 2458-8962

Güz 2021 • 6(2) • 5-19

The Rohingya Muslim ethnic group in Arakan has been subject to persecution by the Myanmar military and Buddhist Maghs. Myanmar authorities consider this ethnic group an illegal settler from previous British India, which is now Bangladesh. Bangladesh witnessed some influx of Rohingya refugees in 1978, 1992, 2012 and 2017 due to state-sponsored persecution in Myanmar. The history of discrimination towards Rohingyas primarily started in 1784 when Burmese occupation began in the Arakan and Buddhist community ultimately became more potent in this region (Hossain, 2010:12). And after independence, the remarkable journey of the Myanmar government with all communities became disrupted due to the military rule of General Ne win in 1962. General Ne Win declared Rohingyas as illegal migrants and took their citizenship rights in 1982 by an unlawful citizenship act. After the last influx of 2017, most Rohingya people fled to Bangladesh from the Rakhine state (Ansar and Md. Khaled, 2021:2–3; Babu, 2020:8). The International community always ensured aid, but they have failed to make sustainable repatriation. This persecuted community now lives in different camps in Bangladesh and faces difficulties in every step of their daily life. This study aims to examine the question, “What kind of reality do the Rohingyas face in the camp? Based on this research question, this study discussed a short history of Rohingya refugees’ discrimination and identified the problems of shelter, protection, education, health, nutrition, employment, and the relation with the host community in Bangladesh.

Methodology

This study is a qualitative research based on primary and secondary data. Preliminary data were collected between 29th January and 8th February 2018 from Cox’s Bazar, Bangladesh. A total of 21 people from both communities were interviewed using an interview form consisting of open-ended structured and semi-structured questions. In addition to the community people, a few NGO staff were also interviewed. Refugees were interviewed in Chittagong’s local language, while the Bengali language was used for host community members and English for NGO staff. The interviewees of this research were selected from the Kutupalong camp, which is the largest camp in Ukhia Upazila of Cox’s Bazar. Moreover, to increase the reliability and validity of the interview information, some interviews were taken from the Teknaf municipality area, and two interviews were taken from Rohingya students who are doing post-graduation in Turkey. The interviewers were 14 to 55 years old. Among the interviewers, under eighteen respondents who have expelled students from Bangladeshi school, interviewed particularly to investigate their experiences at schools where they had been receiving co-education with local pupils. Secondary data were collected and used from recent publications, journals, books, research reports and newspaper articles. This study used the content analysis method to analyze the data collected from primary and secondary sources.

History of the Persecution to Rohingya in Myanmar

The Rohingya people were first residing in the western Rakhine state from the beginning of the 8th century. Primarily they came as a merchant and aimed to spread the religious views of Islam. They ruled the Rakhine state and some parts of Bangladesh and India from the bargaining of the Maruk-U dynasty in 1430 until the Burmese occupation of 1785 (Ali, 1985:866). Two communities, Rohingya and Buddhist Magh were living together for hundreds of years with communal harmony, but after the Burmese rules started, at the time of Buddhist Magh's leader Ga Than De, the Burmese soldiers, along with local Buddhist Maghs, destroyed Muslim's mosques, temples, shrines, libraries and the famous Royal Library of Mrauk-U as well. About 30000 Rohingya Muslims fled from Arakan to Chittagong due to persecution (Faisal, 2020:751). In 1826 Arakan was annexed under British India, and their full control over Burma was ensured in 1885 (Slim, 2012:147). Muslim Rohingya again faced discrimination for the divide and rule policy from British authority. But during the Second World War, the Rohingya Muslims were in favour of the British force, and Myanmar was with Japanese forces. British forces withdrew from Myanmar due to airstrikes in March and April 1942. At the same time, the 'Burma Independence Army' along with Japanese forces and local Buddhist Maghs, attacked Muslim villages in March and April 1942. More than 100,000 Muslim Rohingya were killed by them, and about 80,000 fled from Rakhine state to the Chittagong division of British India (Ullah, 1995:107). But after Hiroshima and Nagasaki incident, Japanese soldiers were surrendered on 2nd September, and Burma again came under the control of the British forces. During this period, due to communal riots and persecution, the Rohingya pushed to the north, and Buddhist Maghs took over the southern half of the Rakhine state. After the end of the Second World War, British authority accepted the autonomy of the Rohingya Muslim community.

In 1947-48, Muslim and Burmese leaders jointly worked for the Independence of Burma. However, Muslims of Arakan show interest in joining with Pakistan. But, Mohammad Ali Jinnah, the then leader of Pakistan, ensured that the Burmese authority would protect Arakan Muslim's identity and fundamental rights like the other ethnic community. After the independence in 1948, communal unrest has been started in Arakan. A Muslim militant organization also formed by Jafar Kawal, Mohammad Abbas and Qassirn Raja demanded a separate Muslim country. In 1954, the Burmese Prime Minister declared Rohingya as an indigenous ethnic community with all fundamental rights like other ethnic groups. Rohingya leaders from Arakan participated and won the 1956 and 1960. During this time, Rohingya leader Mr Sultan Mahmud was appointed as Health Minister of the Burmese government. Prime minister U Nu had taken some initiatives to protect the Rohingya community from Buddhist Magh's torture in the Arakan area. But all the processes failed when Military chief General Ne Win seized power by a bloodless coup in 1962 (Yeger, 1972:99).

General Ne Win primarily destroyed the economic strength of Rohingyas and expelled all Rohingyas from a government job. All the Muslim organizations were banned in 1964 by the military government. Prominent Muslim persons were arrested without any warrant. They were also harassed by law enforcement agencies and judges. The most notorious bloody operation led by the Burmese military named “The King Dragon” started in February 1978 (Chan, 2005). Military forcibly arrested Muslims Rohingya; led gang rape, torture and killing in the Rakhine state. Thousands of Rohingya were killed, and about 300,000 fled to Bangladesh. In refugee camps, there are more than 40,000 Rohingya died, and some went to the Middle East, Pakistan, and Malaysia (Smith, 1991:241). The Rohingya Muslims lost their citizenship due to unlawful discriminatory citizenship laws. The election was held under State Law and Order Restoration Council (SLORC) in 1992. They arrested Muslim candidate Mr Qashim and punished him for 14 years. Besides, 5 Muslim candidates won the election, but SLORC refused to accept the result. The military and Magh’s attacked Muslim villages; mosques and madrasas were damaged as well, thousands of Muslims were arrested and tortured, and so many women were raped and killed. By April, 300,000 above people crossed the border and have taken shelter in Cox’s Bazar, Bangladesh (Hossain, 2010:18–19).

The third-largest massacre in Arakan was held from June to October 2012 when Buddhist Maghs claimed that 3 Rohingya youth raped a Buddhist girl (Human Rights Watch, 2012:20). Their systematic attempt at ethnic cleansing forced the Rohingya Muslims either leave the state or enter the refugee camps in the Arakan area. About 300 people were killed, and 140,000 fled from Rakhine state to Bangladesh. Several mass killings were held in 2014, 2015 and 2016. The enormous refugee influx began on 25th August of 2017 when some Arakan Rohingya Salvation Army (ARSA) members attacked Burmese security forces and killed 12 polices (Lynn, 2017). From 25th August 2017 (Ullah et al. 2021:6) to the end of 2018, more than 620,000 Rohingya refugees crossed the border and took shelter in Bangladesh (Mohajan, 2020). Buddhist Maghs and military destroyed about 350 above villages in Rakhine state; houses were looted and gang-raped committed (Wright and Westcott 2017). Myanmar Military and Magh’s killed 24,000 Rohingya people, including 730 children, and about 17,718 women were raped (Kartal, 2018).

Findings and Discussion

Bangladesh has a long history of hosting Rohingya refugees from the Rakhine State of Myanmar. From the first influx in 1948 to the recent influx of 2017, Bangladeshi people showed tremendous sympathy and helped the Rohingya refugees. After the 2017 incident in Arakan, the Bangladesh government opened the border and provided them primary

health care, food, and shelter. Bangladeshi social and humanitarian foundations local people provided food, tents, and protection from the beginning of the crisis. Sheik Hasina, Prime Minister of Bangladesh, stated: “We have the capacity to feed Bangladesh’s 160 million people, and we have sufficient food to feed the 700,000 refugees” (Sajjad, 2020). Existing data show that 86% of Teknaf’s population, mostly hosting the refugees, was involved in emergency relief and housing for new arrivals. But, as Bangladesh hosting Rohingya’s for a long time, and as there are no specific successful initiatives by Myanmar and the International authority about repatriation, insecurity, tensions, mismanagement, and other problems are arising in the refugee camp area (Ahmed et al., 2021), the local community is irritated by the negative impact of refugees and the uncertain repatriation process. Now, Rohingya refugees face some challenges in their daily lives in the camp and the local area.

Limited Education Right

The education right of Rohingya children, severely restricted in the refugee camp area of Cox’s Bazar, Bangladesh. Rohingya children got primary education right in 1997 and post-primary right in 2013. The Government of Bangladesh, the UN and NGOs provide education to Rohingya children (Hossain, 2021:118–21). But they are deprived of secondary, college and higher education. The Bangladesh Prime Minister’s office sent a notice to Cox’s Bazar district to take the initiative against illegal Rohingya students in different schools. At the beginning of January 2019, the local school administration expelled many Rohingya students. Among the expelled students, some were achieved A+ in the junior secondary certificate (JSC) exam. Many graduate students came to Bangladesh and failed to continue their masters in Bangladeshi Universities. A Rohingya University student stated:

I think that formal education is essential for the Rohingya Children because they have to save future generations and guide them. Moreover, they are the leaders of the future generation. Especially in the refugee camp, many children are not receiving education. These children have to know how to communicate with each other, and they have to know what is wrong and what is proper, thus why formal education is vital for them. (In-depth interview, from Rohingya Boy, Ankara, Turkey)

Many graduates and collage passed students came to Bangladesh in 1992, 2012 and 2017. But their Higher education is prohibited in Bangladesh. A Rohingya post-graduate student said:

My family came to Bangladesh in 1990. But I have born in Bangladesh. Later, I obtained Bangladeshi birth certificates and passports, which permitted me to study like other Bangladeshi nationalities. But this process is illegal. I had no way except to reach my dream. After my secondary college education, I came abroad for my higher

education. I was afraid that if someone knew about my previous identity, my career would destroy. (In-depth interview, Rohingya Boy, Istanbul, Turkey)

A Rohingya girl named Rahima Akhter Khushi is now 20 years old, born and raised in the Cox's Bazar refugee camp. Her parents fled here from Myanmar in 1992s. According to Rohingya post:

Rahima Akter Khushi completed her secondary and higher secondary exam with excellent Bangladeshi school and college results. She was a student of the second semester of the first year, Law department at Cox's Bazaar International University till 5th September 2019. She was also famous as an NGO worker and creative social works. After her interview with AP News, which highlighted the dream of being a Rohingya refugee girl, she was criticized by social media and the local newspaper of Bangladesh, as the Bangladesh government's stance against formal education for Rohingya refugees. Finally, she was expelled from her University; even before and after the discharge from Cox's Bazaar International University, she has received death threats on social media. (Kumar, 2019; *The Rohingya Post*, 2019)

Her sister Selina Akter became the next victim who was suspended from Cox's Bazar Municipality Preparatory High School for the same reason. According to the news of Rohingya vision: "*Selina Akhter, daughter of Abdul Aziz and Minara Begum, was studying in standard nine and received her suspension letter on 11th September 2019 sent by the principal pursuant to Mayor's order.*" (Sailor, 2019).

Bangladeshi students avoid Rohingya students, as well. The researchers talked some students those who studied together with Rohingya students. An 18-year-old Bangladeshi college student said:

I never thought Rohingya students would become my best friend in my class. I always try to avoid them, but they have good relations only with Rohingya students. They are very aggressive and make quarrels with us. So, my family advised me to avoid them. (In-depth interview, a Bangladeshi college student from Teknaf, Cox's Bazar)

Lack of Food, Shelter and Protection

The Bangladeshi government local agencies and international NGOs are working to ensure food for almost 1 million refugees. But some people think this food is not enough for their family (Uddin, 2018). An old Rohingya respondent said, "*There are 11 members in my family, but I am getting less food than we need. Every day we are facing food crisis.*" (In-depth interview, Rohingya Man, Kutupalong expansion camp, Cox's Bazar).

Due to the illegal syndicate system, some selected people receive more food packets and most of the time, they sell extra foods and share 50% of the money with the syndicate

members. The RRRC tries to control everything, but these are continuously happening out of visibility. A 52 years Rohingya woman responded, “*One of my neighbors received a lot of packets every day. But we are facing food crisis for the overpopulated family, some people are selling their extra packets out of the camps.*” (In-depth interview, Rohingya Woman, Kutupalong expansion camp, Cox’s Bazar).

After the influx of 2017, the government made a temporary shelter for Rohingya refugees. Most of the family has about ten members. No matter how many people live in the house, the size of the house remains the same. Many refugees have adapted by dividing the 100 square foot (9-10 square meter) space into two rooms or extending a ‘veranda’ into the passageway between sheds to provide shade and ventilation. It’s pretty tough to live in these tiny houses with all family members together. A Rohingya told that,

We are 11 members and living in a weak-structured poor house—my house is made of immature bamboo and plastic. Unfortunately, we have no privacy, even my teenage boys and girls living together, which is pathetic. In Myanmar, I had a brick house, and every child had a separate room. Then he continued crying. (*In-depth interview, Rohingya Man, Kutupalong expansion camp, Cox’s Bazar.*)

An NGO worker of the shelter sector responds, “*Sometime government and private NGOs using immature bamboo and plastic which create problems. During the rainy season and cyclone, their shelter easily collapsed. Landslides is another problem in this camp*”. (In-depth interview, NGO worker of shelter sector, Kutupalong expansion camp, Cox’s Bazar).

Sexual Harassment and Lack of Privacy

Security for women is another problem for the Rohingya people in the camps. Refugee women often get raped by manipulating them. They faced sexual harassment by local community members and the Rohingya community leaders (Akhter and Kusakabe, 2014:225–46). They are usually called “Illegal Migrants”, but they can’t protest. Thousands of stories are happening in Rohingya refugee camps each month about how women are raped and face sexual abuse. Family members, including their parents, ignored the women who had been raped. Most of the time, Husbands refuse his wife. After, they are kidnapped and then raped again. Some camp leaders and Imam arrange for their marriage, particularly for pregnant women and girls; most of the time, the older man gets to marry who has one or more wives.

A 28-year-old girl said:

Early marriage is expected in the camps for girls, but I am not married until now. When I was twelve years, I was kidnapped and raped by a camp leader who was Rohingya.

That night I was going to the toilet with my oil lamp. Suddenly someone attacked me, and I had seen him before. He hit me on the head, and I lost my consciousness . I forget everything after being kidnapped. My family member rescued me later. (In-depth interview, Rohingya Woman, Kutupalong expansion camp, Cox's Bazar)

According to Farzana (2017:128):

Women are vulnerable to sexual assaults and harassment in the camps. Men from the villages, camp authorities, other refugees and security personnel belong to the group of men who commit sexual assaults and harassment. Besides Rohingya, women become easy targets for wealthy local Bangladeshi men.

Another Rohingya women said,

One night I was abducted and raped by host community members. When I came back, my husband refused to receive me. Finally, I became isolated from my family. Later, one religious leader arranged my marriage with 65 years old Rohingya people who has already two wives. (In-depth interview, Rohingya Woman, Kutupalong expansion camp, Cox's Bazar)

Some child prostitution was found inside the camp, and the young girls and women being taken into the area nearby Teknaf, Cox Bazar and Chittagong (Pittaway, 2008:91) Sometimes girls were trafficked to Dhaka, Kolkata in India, and Kathmandu in Nepal. After being refused by family, many women avoid marriages with older men. Some of them were involved with prostitution in various hotels and the locality. So, the possibility of HIV/AIDS is massive here. Sometimes foreign men and NGOs also engaged with such events. Most of the time, the buyers use NGO's private cars to traffic women for prostitution. These kinds of personal vehicles are safe to transfer Rohingya girls from camps. A host community member in Teknaf said: "*Rohingya girls left refugee camps with NGOs people for advanced treatment. After exit from the camp, they met buyers and engaged in prostitution.*" (In-depth Interview, Bangladeshi local Businessman, Teknaf Cox's Bazar).

BBC News (2018) reported how Rohingya children were trafficked for sexual purposes to Cox Bazar and other areas from the refugee camps,

Local Bangladeshi men and women are behind this and act as the girls' pimps. The pimps also told the BBC's undercover team that mostly Bangladeshi men are the buyers, but some foreign men exploited the girls. The secret team had police support when they acted as buyers, and when the police revealed themselves, the girls appeared torn between poverty and prostitution.

Poor Health and Sanitation Service

Accessible medical staffs are not adequate to satisfy the demand, with the regular number of exams being four times less than the global standards. In addition, there is a severe shortage of health care workers for women. Some vaccination programs are available, but those aren't enough at all. A Rohingya girl said: *"I went hospital for my emergency treatment, but I have to wait more than 3 hours for my serial. Doctors and other stuffs aren't enough to cover properly."* (In-depth interview, From Rohingya girl, Kutupalong expansion camp, Cox's Bazar).

The water, sanitation, and hygiene systems are indigent and temporary. For collecting drinking water, women need to wait 10-40 minutes. Approximately 98% of people have no separate toilet. Many toilets aren't working correctly (Barua and Karia, 2020:1). Women have no privacy whatsoever, and all use the same toilet. Rohingya woman responds: *"One latrine used by 38 peoples. It is not good now because so many people use it, and it has a terrible smell. My children suffered bouts of diarrhea."* (In-depth interview, From Rohingya women, Kutupalong expansion camp, Cox's Bazar).

Sometimes refugees feel racism or misbehaved by healthcare staff or doctors. A Rohingya girl said: *"One day I went hospital and a doctor showed misbehave with me. I astonished and protested his hate speech; he told me to stop because I am Rohingya.... At that day I hurt and cried a lot."* (In-depth interview, from Rohingya girl, Kutupalong expansion camp, Cox's Bazar).

Restriction on Movement and Employment

Freedom of movement outside the camp is limited and confined. Bangladesh government officially banned their jobs outside the centre. For this limitation, most of the Rohingya family facing an economic crisis. A Rohingya refugee respondent: *"we are 12 members in our family. My sons are also capable for work. But we have no job. There are some jobs outside the camps, but these are prohibited for us."* (In-depth interview, From Rohingya Man, Kutupalong expansion camp, Cox's Bazar).

Often Rohingya people disregard the laws and regulations of the government. A significant number of refugees leave camp for jobs or any other work. So, police sometimes arrest them from their workplaces outside of the camp. Many young boys living in the camp can't go outside for a job. Their family came to Bangladesh after the 1992's. One of the 25 years old young Rohingya man said: *"After the massacre of 1992, my family came to Cox's Bazar. I was born here and went to the informal education center. I have never gone out of the camp,*

and my world is limited in here." (In-depth interview, From Rohingya Man, Kutupalong expansion camp, Cox's Bazar).

Negligence by Host Community and Law Enforcement Agency

Primarily refugees are welcomed by the local community, but the present scenery is different. As they live in highly populated camps and face various social and economic crises, they often go to the locality for work or other purposes. As the Rohingya crisis has no probable solution yet, local people are now trying to neglect them. Now refugees are facing negligence from the host community and law enforcement agencies. A local shopkeeper of Teknaf said: *"when the refugees came to Bangladesh in 2017, I have distributed dry foods and money. But now I am very angry about Rohingya people for their activities and behaviour."* (In-depth interview, host community member from Teknaf, Cox's Bazar).

Primarily Bangladeshi people shared their home and land. But some months later, the situation became changed. Another host community member responded: *"when they came after the influx of 2017, I shared my home with a Rohingya family. But unfortunately, one day, my son and wife were beaten by them. Now I can't tolerate them for their aggressive behaviour."* (In-depth interview, host community member from Teknaf, Cox's Bazar).

Now, most local Bangladeshi avoid and neglect Rohingya people due to their misbehaving and illegal activities.

In Teknaf and Ukhia, many Rohingya families and Bangladeshi communities live together. But as a neighbour, Bangladeshi people avoid them. Only a few people talk to them. A local schoolteacher said: *"I never think a Rohingya will become my best friend or neighbor. Our local language is same, but socialization and culture are different. Other members of our family also try to avoid them."* (In-depth interview, host community member from Teknaf, Cox's Bazar).

On the other hand, relations between Rohingya refugees and law enforcement agencies are not satisfactory. There are many clashes against police in the camps. Police and law enforcement agencies sometimes killed Rohingya gang leaders. A Bangladeshi respondent said: *"If the Rohingya peoples are really convicted, the government should take the initiative under the law of Bangladesh and the United Nations. But I never support extra judicial killing."* (In-depth interview, host community member from Teknaf, Cox's Bazar).

Amnesty international called Bangladeshi authorities to stop the extrajudicial killing in the camp area. But Bangladesh government rejects extra-judicial killing reports (Kamruzzaman, 2019).

Conclusion

The Rohingya Muslims in Myanmar's Rakhine State have suffered severe and systematic human rights abuses from the past seven decades. The British pledged them for an independent nation. But sadly, a 1982 illegally controversial law on citizenship took away their citizenship rights. Myanmar officials, security forces, police and local actors from Rakhine have engaged in systematic brutality, acts of torture, illegal detention, rape, and other crimes that inflict significant physical and mental harm. Rohingya Muslims compel to flee their country because of their persecution. The international community has consistently raised its voice for the Myanmar authority's violent assault on Rohingya Muslims, but they have taken limited legal actions. Despite being a small developing country, Bangladesh has sheltered many Muslim refugees from Myanmar (Hossain and Alam, 2010:89–108). The government of Bangladesh and other national and international organizations are working together to develop daily lives and repatriation of the Rohingyas. Despite their combined activities, Rohingya refugees face many difficulties and neglect in their everyday lives, such as neglect and abuse from the host community, unlawful detention, assault, rape and law enforcement agencies' extra-judicial killings. Many families have a scarcity of food. Temporary houses are fragile, lack of privacy for women, sexual harassment, limited right to education, poor health service, sanitation problem, lack of drinking water, restricted movement, and lack of employment. The repatriation process of the Rohingya stopped twice after the 2017 influx. Myanmar was purposely trying to ignore the issue. Successful repatriation can only address the Rohingya refugee problem.

This study suggests that; the United Nations, the European Union, ASEAN and the United States should use diplomatic instruments and build leverage to compel Myanmar to take back its people and maintain security like other ethnic groups. National and international humanitarian organizations should provide more assistance. A fair management procedure is needed to distribute food and other opportunities. The Bangladeshi government should organize and assist the healthcare centers inside the camp established by different NGOs and countries. Access to education for Rohingya should extend up to graduate level. Bangladeshi law enforcement agencies must stop extra-judicial killings.

References

- Ahmed, S., Simmons, W. P., Chowdhury, R. and Huq, S. (2021). The Sustainability–Peace Nexus in Crisis Contexts: How the Rohingya Escaped the Ethnic Violence in Myanmar, but Are Trapped into Environmental Challenges in Bangladesh. *Sustainability Science*, 16(4). p.1201–13. doi: 10.1007/s11625-021-00955-6.
- Akhter, S. and Kusakabe, K. (2014). Gender-Based Violence among Documented Rohingya Refugees in Bangladesh, *Indian Journal of Gender Studies*, 21(2), p.225–46. doi: 10.1177/0971521514525088.
- Ali, M. M. (1985). *History of the Muslims of Bengal*. Riyadh: Imam Muhammad ibn Sa’ūd Islamic University.
- Ansar, A. and Abu F. Md. K. (2021). From Solidarity to Resistance: Host Communities’ Evolving Response to the Rohingya Refugees in Bangladesh. *Journal of International Humanitarian Action*, 6(1), p.1-14. doi: 10.1186/s41018-021-00104-9.
- Babu, K. E. K. (2020). The Impacts and Challenges to Host Country Bangladesh Due to Sheltering the Rohingya Refugees (edited by M. W. Scott). *Cogent Social Sciences*, 6(1). doi: 10.1080/23311886.2020.1770943.
- Barua, A. and Karia, R. H. (2020). Challenges Faced by Rohingya Refugees in the COVID-19 Pandemic. *Annals of Global Health*, 86(1), doi: 10.5334/aogh.3052.
- BBC News. 2018. The Rohingya Children Trafficked for Sex. BBC News Website, March 20. (Online) <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-43469043> accessed on 05/05/2021.
- Chan, A. (2005). The Development of a Muslim Enclave in Arakan (Rakhine) State of Burma (Myanmar). *SOAS Bulletin of Burma Research*, 3(2). p.396–420.
- Faisal, Md. M. (2020). The Rohingya Refugee Crisis of Myanmar: A History of Persecution and Human Rights Violations. *International Journal of Social, Political and Economic Research*, 7(3). s.743–61. doi: 10.46291/IJOSPERvol7iss3pp743-761.
- Farzana, K. F. (2017). *Memories of Burmese Rohingya Refugees: Contested Identity and Belonging*. USA: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Hossain, A. N. M. Z. (2021). Preparedness for Education to Rohingya Refugee Children in Bangladesh: Potentials and Challenges to Citizenship Education. *Journal of Social Science Education (JSSE)*. 20(2), doi: 10.11576/jsse-3980.
- Hossain, D. and Alam, Md. F. (2010). Response of the State.” Pp. 89–108 in *The Plight of the Stateless Rohingyas: Responses of the State, Society & the International Community*. (edited by I. Ahmed. Dhaka). Bangladesh: University Press Ltd.

Human Rights Watch (2012). *The Government Could Have Stopped This: Sectarian Violence and Ensuing Abuses in Burma's Arakan State*. Human Rights Watch. <https://www.hrw.org/report/2012/07/31/government-could-have-stopped/sectarian-violence-and-ensuing-abuses-burmas-arakan> accessed on 15/06/2021.

Kamruzzaman, Md. (2019). *Bangladesh Rejects Amnesty Report on Rohingya Killings*, Anadolu Agency, May 11. <https://www.aa.com.tr/en/asia-pacific/bangladesh-rejects-amnesty-report-on-rohingya-killings/1636457> accessed on 20/06/2021.

Kartal, A. G. (2018). *New Report: Myanmar Army Killed over 24,000 Rohingya*, Anadolu Agency, August 19. <https://www.aa.com.tr/en/asia-pacific/new-report-myanmar-army-killed-over-24-000-rohingya/1235442> accessed on 26/05/2021.

Kumar, S. (2019). *Akter, 20, Expelled from University for Being Rohingya*, Aljazeera, September 17. <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2019/9/17/akter-20-expelled-from-university-for-being-rohingya> accessed; on 25/04/2021.

Lynn, K. Ye (2017). *12 Killed in Rohingya Militant Attacks in Myanmar West*, Anadolu Agency, August 25, <https://www.aa.com.tr/en/asia-pacific/12-killed-in-rohingya-militant-attacks-in-myanmar-west/893434> accessed on 18/07/2021.

Mohajan, H. K. (2020). *History of Rakhine State and the Origin of the Rohingya Muslims*. *The Indonesian Journal of Southeast Asian Studies (IKAT)* 2(1), p.19–46. doi: 10.22146/ikat.v2i1.37391.

Pittaway, E. (2016). *The Rohingya Refugees in Bangladesh : A Failure of the International Protection Regime*. in *Protracted displacement in Asia: no place to call home, Law, ethics and governance*. (edited by H. Adelman). London; New York: Routledge.

Sailor, NAF. (2019). *Khushi's Sister Next Victim of 'No Education for Rohingya*. *Rohingya Vision*. (<https://rohingyavision.com/khushis-sister-next-victim-of-no-education-for-rohingya/> accessed on 08/06/2021).

Sajjad, T. (2020). *A Bangladesh Hosts over a Million Rohingya Refugees, a Scholar Explains What Motivated the Country to Open up Its Borders*. *The Conversation*. <http://theconversation.com/as-bangladesh-hosts-over-a-million-rohingya-refugees-a-scholar-explains-what-motivated-the-country-to-open-up-its-borders-133609> accessed on 03/07/2021.

Slim, W. (2009). *Defeat Into Victory: Pan Military Classics Series*. London: Pan.

Smith, M. (1991). *Burma: Insurgency and the Politics of Ethnicity*. 2nd edition. Dhaka: Zed Books.

The Rohingya Post. (2019). Refugee Girl Expelled from University for Being Rohingya in Bangladesh, The Rohingya Post, July 9. <https://www.rohingyapost.com/refugee-girl-expelled-from-university-for-being-rohingya-in-bangladesh/> accessed on 15/06/2021.

Uddin, N. (2018). Rohingya Refugees in Bangladesh: Five Challenges for the Future. South Asia@LSE. <https://blogs.lse.ac.uk/southasia/2018/11/21/rohingya-refugees-in-bangladesh-five-challenges-for-the-future/>, accessed on 06/07/2021.

Ullah, N. M. H. (1995). History of Rohingya Nation (Rohingya Jatir Itihas). Dhaka: Bangladesh Co-operative Book Society, LTD.

Ullah, S. M. A., Asahiro, K., Moriyama, M. and Tani, M. (2021). Socioeconomic Status Changes of the Host Communities after the Rohingya Refugee Influx in the Southern Coastal Area of Bangladesh. Sustainability (Switzerland), 13(8), p.1-28. doi: 10.3390/su13084240.

Wright, R. and Westcott, B. (2017). At Least 270,000 Rohingya Flee Myanmar Violence in 2 Weeks, UN Says, CNN. August. <https://www.cnn.com/2017/09/08/asia/rohingya-myanmar-refugees-drowning/index.html> accessed on 03/07/2021.

Yeger, M. (1972). The Muslims of Burma: A Study of a Minority Group. Germany: Otto Harrassowitz.

Integration Policies Implemented for Migrants in Welfare States

Çiğdem ULUDAĞ GÜLER^a

Summary

There is a profound interaction between immigration and welfare state. In the process of rebuilding Europe after World War II, Western European countries received labor migration flows. This process not only became the key to economic growth, development and contributed to social welfare, but also strengthened the welfare states as well. The consolidation of the welfare state has increased the amount of aid available to immigrants. There is no common immigration or integration policy that would fit each state's needs due to the fact that every country has its unique migration history and welfare state structure. Methods of receiving and managing immigration differs from one country to another. This study aims to show the extent of integration policies concerning immigrants in welfare states through analyzing examples of countries that play a dominant role in the welfare state models and display problems immigrants face in host countries regarding integration. The scale and structure of the welfare state models existing among countries have an extremely decisive role in defining their attitudes towards immigrants. In America, known as one of the leading countries that have adopted the Liberal model and it is best known as a country of immigrants, practices in the field of integration of immigrants have been linked to language learning. Many aspects of burdens and policy development regarding immigrants have been left to market mechanisms. In the Scandinavian model which is based on universal principles, equal service is provided to everybody and various harmonization policies are implemented for immigrants. Ensuring social peace and high standards of living in society as a whole has been made possible through providing a fair service to everyone. In the conservative model, which is based on individual empowerment, premiums, and social insurance, welfare policies were mostly based on merit. Majority of aid and services provided to immigrants were in proportion to benefits of their labour. In countries like Turkey, which integrated into welfare state systems later, migration and integration policies began to take place within the framework of the EU accession process and have been shaped to a large extent by Syrian immigrants.

Keywords

Welfare State • Immigrant • Adjustment and Integration • America • Germany • Sweden • Turkey.

^a Çiğdem ULUDAĞ GÜLER, Istanbul University, Faculty of Economics, Department of Labor Economics and Industrial Relations, cigdem.uludag@istanbul.edu.tr, ORCID ID: 0000-0002-0217-3963

Received: January 24, 2022

Accepted: March 17, 2022

Copyright © 2020 • International Refugee Rights Association • <http://mejrs.com>

ISSN 2149-4398 • eISSN 2458-8962

Autumn 2021 • 6(2) • 21-52

Refah Devletlerinde Göçmenlere Yönelik Uyum Politikaları

Çiğdem ULUDAĞ GÜLER^a

Öz

Göç ve refah devleti arasında yoğun bir ilişki bulunmaktadır. II. Dünya Savaşından sonra Avrupa'nın yeniden inşası sürecinde Batı Avrupa ülkeleri işçi göçü ithal etmiştir. Bu süreç ekonomik büyüme, kalkınma ve sosyal refahı artırmanın anahtarı olmak ile birlikte refah devletlerini de güçlendirmiştir. Refah devletinin güçlenmesi göçmenlere yönelik yardımları artırmıştır. Her ülkenin gerek kendi göç tarihi gerekse refah devlet yapısından ötürü ortak bir göç politikası ya da uyum politikası söz konusu değildir. Ülkeden ülkeye göçü kabul etme ve göçü yönetme şekli farklılıklar göstermiştir. Bu çalışma refah devlet modellerinde baskın olan ülke örnekleri üzerinden refah devletlerinde göçmenlere yönelik uyum politikaların ne düzeyde olduğu ve bu ülkelerde göçmenlerin uyumla ilgili sorunlarının neler olduğunu ortaya koymayı amaçlamaktadır. Ülkelerin içinde buldukları refah devletleri göçmenlere yönelik tutumlarında son derece etkili olmuştur. Liberal modelin öncü ülkelerinden ve göçmen ülkesi olarak bilinen Amerika'da göçmen uyumuna yönelik uygulamalar daha çok dil öğrenme ile ilişkilendirilmiştir. Göçmenlere yönelik birçok yük ve politika piyasaya devrolmuştur. Evrensel prensibe dayalı İskandinav modelde herkese eşit hizmet sağlanıp, göçmenlere birçok uyumlaştırıcı politika gerçekleştirilmiştir. Toplumsal huzur ve iyi yaşam standartlarının toplumun yekûnunun de görülmesi herkese adil hizmet sağlama ile gerçekleştirilmiştir. Bireysel yapılanma, prim ve sosyal sigortayı esas alan muhafazakâr modelde daha çok refah politikaları hak ediş üzerinden yürümüştür. Sağlanan birçok yardım ve hizmet göçmen emeğinden faydalanma nispetinde olmuştur. Türkiye gibi refah devleti sistemlerine sonradan dâhil olabilmiş ülkelerde ise göç ve uyum politikaları AB girme süreci ile oluşmaya başlamış ve Suriyeli göçü ile büyük ölçüde şekillenmiştir.

Anahtar Kelimeler

Refah Devleti • Göçmen • Uyum ve Entegrasyon • Amerika, Almanya • İsveç • Türkiye.

^a Çiğdem ULUDAĞ GÜLER, İstanbul Üniversitesi, İktisat Fakültesi, Çalışma Ekonomisi ve Endüstri İlişkileri Bölümü, cigdem.uludag@istanbul.edu.tr, ORCID ID: 0000-0002-0217-3963

Introduction

Migrations have profoundly affected the processes that shaped world history. Migration policies have been shaped by history of migrations starting from slave trade in the colonial period, migrations to the Americas, migration of citizens during the nation-state building in the early 1900s, labor migration to Europe in the 1960s, migration of women and children in the 1970s with the policy of family reunification and refugee movements stemming from the political tensions in the Middle East after 2000s.

In some cases, migration takes place as a result of perceived demand in the host country and depending on a policy pursued, while in some cases it occurs as an involuntary response to political or geographical factors. In forced migration, since most immigrants are forced to leave their homes without preparation or knowledge, they face various barriers such as language problems, low education level, and inability to have equivalent documents. Therefore, they experience many problems such as exploitation, discrimination, exclusion, inability to access basic services, human trafficking, being forced into prostitution, exposure to violence, smuggling, being exploited by crime syndicates or being forced to work for illegal organizations. The fact that people migrate to escape from torture, oppression and violence has led to the adoption of various international regulations to deal with this issue. For this reason idea of establishing a common immigration and integration policy has gained momentum. Although the impossibility of establishing a common immigration policy has led to the adoption of many different independent immigration policies, what they have in common is a legal regulation that is respectful of the rights and dignity of every human being. (Human Rights Watch, 2010).

International migration is undoubtedly one of the most important factors that has shaped the economic, political, social and cultural structure of Europe in the 21st century. Globally, 91.9 million immigrants have sought asylum in 132 countries. While 90% of the world's migrants move voluntarily for economic reasons, 10% have sought asylum to escape from persecution and violence (Heilbrunn & Iannone, 2019). The destination of most of these migrations was America and Western European countries. When we look at the process of Europe as a destination country in international migrations, migratory movements can be summarized as three major historical waves: worker migrations, migrations created by family reunifications, and forced migrations involving refugees/asylum seekers. Welfare states in developing countries have developed in proportion to arrival of migrant workers and their contribution to labour. This study aims to analyze the level of contribution of immigrant labor in welfare states and tries to find an answer to the following questions: what kind of integration and adaptation policies were adopted and how these policies differed according

to the countries. A comparison of welfare states model was conducted using experiences of leading countries in the subject matter.

1. Concept of Welfare State and Classification

The state is one of the most essential and long-established institutions in the history of humanity (Coşkun, 1997, p.15). There are many different definitions of the formation and content of the State. State is a political and social organization established by a nation to govern itself. They are institutions organized according to different services supplied to govern the relations between people. Aforementioned various organized institutions work in an integrated manner and serve as an integral part of an entire organism. As a whole, the fact that one part of the system fails in this mission hinders the functioning of other parts (Banarlı, 2007, p.9). Generally speaking, the objectives of the state structure can be summarized as follows: To ensure social order, justice, and well-being and to maintain peace among its people settled on a certain piece of land (Meray, 1965, p.154).

Throughout history, people's philanthropic ideas, depending on their beliefs, have created a sense of responsibility to help and support those in need around them. After the 19th century, this notion of responsibility for helping others has started to become a responsibility of the state (Ersöz, 2003, p.121). After this century, governmental and voluntary organizations have been included in welfare state practices. Social assistance and support provided by the family and society have been incorporated into services offered by states in their move to become a social state. This process strengthened the social aspects attributed to state apparatus and transformed the state into a welfare state. When the classical economic theory lost its functionality, and the states abandoned the liberal state view and assumed the function of an interventionist state, the concept of the state evolved as a social state or welfare state (Gümüş, 2018, p.35).

In post-World War II era, welfare state started to manifest itself especially in response to changes occurred in business relations. States have commenced to intervene in the market as they dropped the idea to solely execute police powers. Welfare states not only interferes with the labor market, but also provides individuals with minimum income, ensure their access to basic foodstuffs, basic services such as housing, health, education, and grants equal political rights for every citizen. However, in line with social security programs, it aims to redistribute income through taxes in order to ensure fair distribution of income, to make national health services accessible to everyone, to ensure absolute welfare by controlling family benefits, pensions and other social risks (Wilensky, 1975, p.1).

According to another formulation, the welfare state consists of three components. First of all, the state should provide a minimum income guarantee to all individuals. Secondly, sickness, disability, elderliness, death, and unemployment should be also covered under the umbrella of social security, albeit in a limited way. Thirdly, the state should provide a decent standard of living to all citizens, regardless of class or status (Briggs, 2006, p.16).

Welfare state is a state system that strives to ensure the well-being of everyone and, above all, the well-being and welfare of society as a whole. While the rule of law attributes importance to values such as freedom, right to life and property, the social state attaches importance to the security of living, job or income guarantee and the preservation of work force. The welfare state is intertwined with the concept of "social integration". It is essential for integration that the plurality becomes singular, the differences in the society are smoothed out, inequalities are eliminated, conflicts are minimized and unified without destroying the freedoms of the individuals. Social welfare can only be achieved by creating a classless society (Huber, 1970, p.23-39).

Wars, famines and epidemics caused the deterioration of the feudal structure prevalent in the Middle Ages. The deterioration of the feudal structure made interventions necessary. Following the rise of the industrial revolution, feudal principalities lost their power; migration of peasants from feudal villages to industrial cities began; business relations changed and administration was transferred from feudal structures to more systematic state administrations (Ersöz, 2003, p.123).

Due to effects of the Great Economic Depression of 1929, the classical economic view was destroyed and the Keynesian economics era started. The situation emerged after World War II invalidated the views of the classics and the liberal view began to lose its power. The Keynesian model, which required state intervention, made its debut and the state transitioned from an entity that solely executes police powers to an entity that functions as an interventionist state (Işıklı, 1987, p.19).

The Keynesian era has been referred to as the golden age of the welfare state. In Western countries, state apparatus strived to ensure economic growth, low inflation, full employment, trade balance, and fair income distribution via economic policies. In addition, the state aims to protect its citizens against risks such as unemployment, disability, maternity, senility and death by imposing higher taxes (Kocabaş, 2004, p.12).

In order for the welfare state to function, it is important to create social welfare and justice, to ensure fair income distribution, to eliminate poverty, and to establish a life order

befitting human dignity. To achieve this, a life order suitable for the family, morals and culture of the society, equality of opportunity, equality before the law, a minimum income for everyone, the right to collective bargaining, social security for those in need of protection, equal educational opportunities, protection of women and children in need of protection, dissemination of social participation, eradication of poverty is important. (Yazgan,1975, p.32; Göze, 1980, p.187; Seyyar, 2002, p.171).

Esping Andersen introduced a widely accepted three classification schemes for the welfare state: the liberal model, the conservative model, and the social-democratic model. In the welfare state classifications, each state or social class has made different definitions of the welfare state. The perspectives of states on the welfare state differed according to their economic indicators, social structures and arguments they use to provide welfare state. In each model, the market, the state, and the family assume different roles in providing the welfare state (Pierson & Castles, 2006, p.167).

Table 1: Esping-Andersen's Welfare State Classification

Liberal Welfare Regime	Conservative Welfare Regime	Social Democratic Welfare Regime
America	Germany	Sweden
Canada	France	Norway
Australia	Italy	Denmark
Switzerland	Austria	Finland
Japan	Belgium	Netherlands

Kaynak: Esping-Andersen, G. (1990). *The Three Worlds of Welfare Capitalism*, UK: Polity Press.

The liberal welfare regime is listed at the bottom of the welfare state typology. America, Canada and Australia are prominent examples of this group of countries. The foundation of this model is based on liberal and free market economy While government intervention is kept limited, the private sector is seen as a welfare provider. In this model, it is essential for the state to keep wages and taxes low, to encourage the private sector, to increase employment while reducing unemployment and to keep the number of people who will benefit from social aids low in order to maintain order (Özdemir, 2007, p.140).

In countries that adopt liberal welfare regime, public sector employment is low and private sector employment is above average. The rate of women's participation in the labor force is quite high compared to countries in the other model. In these countries, where unions are weak, there are large differences in wages. Countries in this model only provide a minimum income guarantee. Because of their limited intervention, these states define them as "night-watchman state". Except for the national health services, the state only selects those in need and provides a minimum level of income guarantee to these people only if it determines that they are not working and in need (Özdemir, 2007, p.37).

The conservative welfare regime ranks in the middle in the classification scheme for the welfare state. Among the leading countries in this model are Germany, France, Italy, and Austria. Germany is generally regarded as a reference in the evaluations concerning this model. In conservative model, the influence of religion is intense and the family has great responsibilities (Pierson, 1999, p.778). Social security is extremely important in countries that adopt this model. Instead of offering new job opportunities as a solution to people who have lost their job or income for various reasons, relief measures and compensatory policies are pursued (Arin, 1996, p.63).

The Social Democratic Welfare Regime ranks at the top of the classification scheme for welfare state. This model includes countries such as Sweden, Norway, Denmark, the Netherlands and Finland. The social democratic welfare regime is also called "universal welfare regime", "modern welfare regime" or "Scandinavian Model". Sweden is the leading country in this model. For this reason, it is also known as the "Swedish Model" (Özdemir, 2007, p.141). This model has three main features: universal income guarantee, social insurance, and provision of highly advanced services. There is a high rate of social state expenditures and social rights are guaranteed at a high level. The state is seen as the main social state provider. Model ensures equality and high standards and includes everyone. Most of the state's social service expenditures are covered by taxes. Therefore, the level of taxes is high (Özdemir, 2007, p.141; Pierson & Castles, 2006, p.169). These countries are also referred to as happy countries because of their anti-poverty policies, successful investments, social policy implementations aimed at young people more than the elderly, and successful social policy investments (Andersen, 1996, p.34, 14).

Based upon Esping-Andersen's triple classification with subtle contributions, typology offered by Nick Adnett and Stephen Leibfried came to fore. While Adnett adds Latin Basin maintains Esping-Andersen's triple classification scheme and adds a fourth category of welfare state model. As Pereirinha points out, Leibfried's welfare state model uses a more comprehensive scheme.

Leibfried, based on social policy regimes, proposes a four welfare state classification model based on the European Union member states.

1. Scandinavian welfare states (Modern welfare state)
2. Bismarck countries model (Institutional welfare state)
3. Anglo Saxon model (Residual welfare state)
4. Latin Rim welfare states model - Southern European Welfare State (denoted with the term “rudimentary welfare state”) (Yılmaz, 2006, p.23).

Within the framework aforementioned classification, Southern European Welfare State - Latin Rim welfare states model (Rudimentary Welfare State) which is also referred to as the Solidarity Model, argues that social responsibilities should be solved by family members or people close to the family (Şenkal & Sariipek, 2007, p.156).

Greece, Portugal, Spain, Italy, and Turkey are included in this model. According to Rudimentary Welfare State model, family and kinship relations play a primary role in providing social policy and social welfare within the framework of the market-state-family tripartite structure. “Family” alone is the bearer of this model. In these countries, traditional aid structures and family solidarity are quite profound. On the other hand, the social conditions and institutional structure of the welfare state are insufficient (Çelik, 2006, p.62). Another unique feature of this model in terms of social policy practices is that the social protection network is inadequate and fragmented. The limited social benefits, the lack of national social protection, the disorganization and gaps in the social protection network characterises the basis of this model (Keyder, 2007, p.133).

2.Harmonization and Integration Policies

The potential effects of immigrants on host countries are substantial for many relationship networks such as interactions brought by cultural differences and similarities, cohesion, exclusion, compromise, competition, favouritism, discrimination, and conflict. For this reason, countries that take in immigrants carry out integration and integration studies in order to manage aforementioned effects (Aydemir & Şahin, 2018, p.126). Each state accepts immigrants with different dynamics and criteria and applies different integration policies. Social cohesion is related to many issues such as education, housing, health, right to work, and social security (Özgüler, 2018, p.1-3).

One of the most widely accepted definitions of harmonization has been adopted by the

United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNCHR). According to this definition, harmonization; “is considered as a dynamic, multifaceted and bilateral act with three interrelated legal, economic and socio-cultural dimensions. It is a bilateral situation in which refugees/immigrants adapt to the host community without giving up their own cultural identity, and the host society, together with its institutions, accepts refugees/immigrants and meets their needs”. The concept of integration, on the other hand, is more ambiguous, and in some respects there is a parallel with the concept of assimilation. Integration is defined as a sociological concept; “It is the process of learning social norms and values that allow a person or group to be a member of a larger group”. In terms of individuals or groups, it interferes with many areas such as adaptation, school, culture, education, profession and working standards (Çağlar & Onay, 2015, p.40).

The success level of immigrants in the integration process varies and depends on many factors such as age, gender, education level, language ability, ethnicity, religion, socio-economic status, socio-psychological acceptance role in, the way the migration takes place (voluntary or compulsory), the ethnic structure of the settled region, and the potential to accept migration (Seker, 2015, p.15). Even though immigrants are willing to adapt, they have to struggle with many problems in many parts of the world such as discrimination, social exclusion, xenophobia, racism, marginalization, poverty, unfair income distribution, unregistered life and informal work. For this reason, the integration and cohesion policies implemented by the states aim to contribute to solving these problems. After the 2000s, many countries focused on the integration process. In order to achieve success in integration, especially in the context of human rights, many countries firstly have taken many positive steps to protect migrant workers with visa extension, granting regular migrant status, and implementing labour mobility programs. In many countries, migrant workers are allowed to access basic services such as health and education, regardless of their status. Various regulations regarding employment in basic services have been adopted. Furthermore, providing immigrants with social protection, the right to be protected from discrimination and xenophobia, the right to freedom of association and collective bargaining, equal pay for equal work, income security, and the right to a decent job are other factors that contribute to cohesion. Aligning immigration and employment policies while detecting and developing migrant workers' skills and adopting employment policies and programs to take into account the specific needs of vulnerable migrant workers, particularly women, youth, domestic workers and low-wage migrant workers should also be mentioned. Specific measures should be taken to prevent, report and address all kinds of exploitation and abuse and to provide effective remedies¹.

¹Uluslararası Çalışma Örgütü. Göçmen işçiler için insana yakışır iş sağlamaya yönelik çabaları artırma çağrısı. https://www.ilo.org/ankara/areas-of-work/dw/WCMS_789022/lang--tr/index.htm, 23.12.2021.

Another factor related to cohesion is the new working patterns brought by the capitalist system. Mechanization and factory-type production paved the way for the organization of work outside the home. In countries where the service sector is developed, the employment of women and youth has increased with the spread of flexible working patterns. The increase in employment of women has brought to mind the question of who will do the domestic work. Although these works are carried out by members of the household, most of the time they are also done by employees rather than family members (Erdem & Sahin, 2010). In Europe, especially with the effect of neo-liberal policies, social services have been transferred to the market (Browne & Braun, 2007). European working women with children tended to purchase services for their domestic chores. In response, migrant women have started to migrate to developed countries to work for low wages. In 2003, Ehrenreich and Hochschild's book "Global Woman: Nannies, Maids and Sex Workers in the New Economy" described their migration to first world countries for babysitting as **"a global heart transplant"** where poor children are sacrificed in order to provide care for rich children" (Deniz, 2018, p.290).

After the disintegration of the Soviet Union, the migration flows from Eastern European countries to Western Europe began. Most of the immigrants that have left their countries work in hard conditions for low wages in capitalist agricultural fields and research institutes. Many were treated as "unqualified" because of language problems and because they came from different cultures and regions. (Blaschke, 1994). Reducing informal work is among the most important goals in European Union countries. In these countries, about 5% of the population works informally in the economy. As of 2015, Austria has the lowest informal economy with 8.2%, while Bulgaria has the highest informal economy with approximately 30.6%. While the informal economy in Eastern and Southern European countries (except the Czech and Slovak Republics) is above the European Union average, it is below the average in Western Europe and Scandinavian countries. Informal employment is more common especially among immigrants and even more among female immigrants (Oğuz & Şahin, 2020).

In Europe, the ratio of women immigrants and foreign women in unregistered employment is increasing on a daily basis. While 25% of female immigrants work in domestic services such as housekeeping, child and elderly care, 11% work in personal care services (e.g hairdressers, cosmeticians). Registering informal workers not only provides security but also improves their working conditions. This also contributes to equal opportunity (Williams, Nadin, & Windebank, 2012).

Policies adopted in the field of employment of women immigrants mostly aim to save them from informal employment, to improve their working conditions, to solve their

problems regarding integration and social inclusion practices for immigrants, to make them gain qualifications through vocational training practices, to increase their workability, and to include them in the social safety net. Solving employment and social security problems is among the priorities of the European Union and OECD countries (Koçak & Gündüz, 2016, p.77).

3.Comparison of Integration and Integration Policies for Immigrants in Welfare States

The importance of social policy gained momentum at the end of the 19th century, due to conditions of post-World Wars era, i.e. the labour movements brought by industrialization along with the capitalist order, worker-employer relations, workers' rights and the formation of the political order. Exploitation of the working class, inequalities and poverty issues were especially influential in the first formation period of the welfare state. The second stage was marked by the heavy burden and difficult living conditions caused by the World Wars in the 1930s-1940s. The third stage of the welfare state covers the years 1950-1970. The effectiveness of Keynesian policies implemented during this period, economic growth, and the strengthening working class laid the groundwork for defining this period as the golden age of the welfare state. In this period, the most far reaching welfare state policies were implemented. The years after the 1970s were defined as the last period of the welfare state. The oil crisis of 1973 caused economic contraction, regression in rights, and reduction of welfare state practices. This period, in which neoliberal policies gained predominance, is also referred as the period marked by the decline of social policy (Şenkal, 2005, p.233; Baştürk, 2010, p.530).

Neoliberal policies, which were put into practice specifically after the end of the Keynesian period, have induced several countries to implement strict monetary policies and tight border controls. Countries have started to limit their immigration acceptance levels according to countries of origin. Except for Western European countries, states have distanced themselves from immigration outside their borders. This situation not only fuelled illegal immigration but also opened the door to discrimination. The media's depicting of immigrants as a source of "fear", "danger" and "crime" and the strict customs strategies implemented by Western European countries have very easily labelled immigrants as "different", "other", "foreigner" and "terrorist". This situation casts a shadow on cohesion and integration (Güllüpinar, 2014, p.2).

Many developed and developing countries in the world had to respond to immigration movements and asylum requests. The economic stability of the host countries, social state programs they implement, the attitudes towards human rights have increased the number of

immigrants/refugees. Countries that have been exposed to international migration build their migration policies in 4 stages which can be listed. As follows:

- Protection
- Regularity
- Cooperation
- Integration (Taş, Koçar & Çiçek, 2017, p.1376).

Considering the inevitability of migration movements and the increase in their density with each passing day, the main goals pursued by governments are managing migration successfully, minimizing negative impacts of migration, and turning migrant labour, experience and capital into positive input for economic growth and development. Due to the dynamic nature of migration, strategic migration management is extremely important in terms of evaluating the opportunities and threats emerged by migration. For this reason, inclusion of immigrants in the labor market has been a priority in the integration studies conducted with immigrants. Cohesion policies have been expanded in this context (Öztürk & Tekiner, 2017, p.153).

One of the most important factors in terms of cohesion and integration is to prevent discrimination. For this reason, the Council of Europe has enacted a convention to prevent discrimination. The Council states that with this convention, citizens are protected against this discrimination regardless of their ethnic origin, race, gender, age, disability, homeland, religion, belief, and sexual preference (Howard, 2006).

Along with preventing discrimination, it is important to provide immigrants with means so that they can continue their lives and to enact legal instruments regarding citizenship or status. The conception of the welfare state is shaped by the unique conditions of each country on the basis of citizenship rights and social contract. This understanding provides the nation-state with mechanisms to regulate the interaction between labour and capital, and balance immigrant-citizen concepts. This balancing mission contributes to regulate the market and determine citizenship rights (Atasü-Topcuoğlu, 2019, p.945).

In this study, the literature on the concept of social welfare state and its classifications is included, and the developed countries that receive immigration are grouped according to regime types. In this context, Turkey has been compared with the dominant country example in each model included in the welfare state models. While making this comparison, the welfare state classification is taken into account, and what these countries do regarding

their cohesion and integration policies in relation to the model they are in. According to the literature review, adaptation and integration studies for immigrants started with the demand of immigrant labor and the policies made in general progressed in the focus of the labor market. All regulations, such as laws and policies facilitating the inclusion of immigrants in the labor market, learning a language, getting a job, improving educational conditions, and preventing discrimination have been made to ensure full economic and social participation of immigrants. In the last part of the study, the comparison made in the selected countries was examined from this perspective.

3.1. America;

America, the most prominent example of countries that have adopted liberal welfare regimes, is referred to as the country of immigration. America, Canada, Australia and majority of Western European countries were established as a result of immigration or developed thanks to immigrant labour. Migrant workers that they accept periodically or the intense migration movements they are exposed to have underlined the need for these countries to make a series of legal and institutional arrangements for immigration and immigrants (Zincone, Caponio, & Carastro, 2006).

The United States of America (USA), the country of immigrants, has a population of 308,745,538 according to the last population census conducted in 2010. While 280,629,097 of this population is white, 38 million of them are black. Hispanics are the second most populous group with a population of 47 million, following Blacks². Due to increase in production during and after the colonial period, the need for cheap labour has turned this place into a country of immigrants. It has hosted many different immigrant communities, primarily from Europe or Canadian, from the Asian and South American continents, especially Mexican immigration. A wide range of immigrant groups gathered under the umbrella of the United States of America, which was founded in 1786. Between 1880 and 1890, waves of immigration intensified. With the intensification of immigration, the fact that the majority of immigrants were of Southern European origin became a concern for the United States, and it has started to adopt a more restrictive attitude towards accepting immigration. In 1907, a “migration commission” was established to be more selective in terms of accepting immigration (Güler, 2020, p.258). Although being seen as a nation of immigrants, the United States restricted its flexible immigration policies after the 2001 terrorist attacks on the Twin Towers and eased deportation procedures (Koven, & Götzke, 2010).

² <https://www.census.gov/data/datasets/2010/demo/popest/modified-racedata-2010.html>, 05.01.2022.

Various groups and specifically Africans that have brought as slaves during the colonial period could not benefit equally from housing and employment opportunities and were exposed to discrimination. In 1961, President Kennedy gave statements and adopted measures in order to ensure that there would be no discrimination in recruitment process on the basis of race, language, religion, and gender. Policies implemented to redress discrimination were not only applied to African Americans, but also to Hispanics, Native Americans and Asians (Joppke, 1999).

It is of utmost importance to being able to speak the common language spoken in the country during the harmonization and integration process. For this reason, learning and speaking English in America is one of the subjects that has a prominent position. While the first-born Jews speak English as well as Hebrew, the second generation can understand Hebrew, but the third generation speaks only English and does not know Hebrew at all. In this case, it needs to be underlined that assimilation, not integration, is enforced in America (Levine, 2021).

3.2. Germany;

Germany, one of the most dominant countries that have conservative welfare regimes, plays a cultish feature in the metaphor of the immigrant country as well. It drew attention and made a name for itself with its family benefits, child benefit applications, and strong insurance schemes. Germany opened its doors to immigrants in the rebuilding process and benefited greatly from immigrant labour. Country welcomed migrant workers in order to fill the shortage of workers in low-status, low-paid, unsanitary, manual labour and physically challenging jobs, especially in jobs that the German people did not want to work. While the migration process took place in the form of individual initiatives during the 1950s, it was regulated by interstate bilateral agreements after the 1960s. Bilateral labour migration agreements were signed with Italy, Spain and Greece in 1955, Turkey in 1960, Morocco in 1961 and 1964, Portugal in 1963, Tunisia in 1964, and Yugoslavia in 1968. Since 1973, migration movements have continued through "family reunification" or "family formation". Immigrant families who came within the framework of worker migrations and family reunifications constitute the current immigrant profile of Germany. The population of Germany stands at 82,793,000 people according to 2018 data. 10,915,455 of the population consists of immigrants. At the end of 2019, Germany hosts approximately 1.15 million refugees and 309,000 asylum seekers. It is the country that hosts the most refugees going to Europe. Syrians make up half of the refugees it has accepted³ (Ulutaş, 2013)⁴

³ "Population by nationality and sex (quarterly figures)". (Çevrimiçi) <https://www.destatis.de/EN/Themes/Society-Environment/Population/Current-Population/Tables/liste-current-population.html> , 02.12.2019.

⁴ UNCHR: Germany. (Çevrimiçi) <https://www.unhcr.org/germany.html?query=germany>, 23.01.2022).

Immigrants are required to pass an integration test before they are granted entry into Germany. Through this test, it is tested how well immigrants can adapt, to which degree they can act as a European and how western they can think. 600 hours of language learning lessons are given along with citizenship lessons. Thus, the door to full integration is opened. While German policy on foreigners draws the boundaries of how integration can take place, the German Federal Office for Immigration and Refugees is the main coordinator of these policies (Snyder, 2006).

It is essential for immigrant ethnic groups to abandon their past in order to fully integrate into host society. The individuals who are not connected to their past will adapt better to where they have gone. Family reunifications in countries such as Germany, which receive huge amount of immigration, reveal that assimilation practices do not really serve their intended purpose. This proves that immigrants do not actually forget their own culture (Guler, 2020). In this model, where social insurance and social security networks play an active role, individuals can benefit from the system via premiums they pay. While the family and child assistance provided to migrant workers and their families through family reunifications benefited the immigrants, it was perceived as an exploitation of their rights by the native citizens of the country. This situation disrupted the harmony between immigrants and native Germans (Diehl & Blohm, 2003).

"Immigration and Refugees Bureau" deals with applications of foreign persons in Germany. Although the German government implements policies to limit immigration, it acts generously towards qualified entrepreneurs and facilitates their entry into the country by implementing an open door policy. In particular, the entry of qualified and eligible people from India to the country is carried out with the Green Card programme. In the recent period in which technology and innovation are trending, the government aims to attract a qualified workforce to the country, especially in the sectors such as software development and information technologies (Amrute, 2016).

At the 13th Integration Summit, the German Chancellor announced the five-stage national action plan. At this summit, the social integration strategy for foreigners and immigrants living in Germany was elaborated. In the first stage, outreach and information campaigns are implemented in order to attract qualified workforce to the country, while the second stage consists of language learning, recognition of diplomas, and consultancy services related to daily life. In the third stage, the difficulties faced in participating in social life are eliminated and entry to the employment market and participation in civil society activities are supported. The fourth stage includes strategies that encourage participation in fields such as culture, health, sports and media and multi-diversity, and finally in the fifth stage includes measures

to strengthen social belongingness and cohesion.⁵

Although Germany is willing to accept immigration, it is sensitive about social cohesion. It is important not to disturb the peace of the German people while profiting from immigrant labour at a high capacity. Therefore, the German language proficiency of the immigrants, whose admission procedures are continue, is tested before they arrive in Germany, and after they are settled in Germany, immigrants are required to take both citizenship and language education. Citizenship education is among the most essential aspects of immigration process that German Government considers as essential for integration. Immigrants are given information on following issues: What do Germans like? What are their daily routines? What kind of attitudes are deemed to be offensive in society? ⁶.

3.3. Sweden;

It is remarkable that Sweden, one of the exemplary countries of the Scandinavian model, is more constructive and flexible in its approach to immigrants in comparison with other European countries. This feature indicates that it adopts a universal model. This model does not discriminate in terms of admission to the country, giving status to immigrants and providing social support. According to OECD data, the proportion of the immigrant population in the total population in Sweden has approached 16% (OECD, 2016). Wide social rights, good working conditions, high income level, abundant welfare practices have brought Sweden to the top of the welfare state rankings. It has adopted a universal approach in its welfare practices and migrant workers have also been treated like their citizens. This has led many people to seek immigration to Sweden for political or economic reasons (Messina, 2002; Borevi, 2012).

The idea of providing a labour force via immigrants for Sweden, which wanted to develop its industry after the Second World War, paved the way for the emergence of flexible immigration policies. Policies that facilitate the entry of immigrants into the country were supported. Thanks to its flexible approach; Sweden received qualified labour migration first from Scandinavian countries such as Finland, Denmark, Norway, and then from all over Europe, and thus, it reduced production costs and reached a level where it can compete with European markets. (Scott, 1999; Riniolo, 2016, p.8). By the 1970s, the wages of immigrants were reduced and more restrictive policies were implemented vis-à-vis immigrants (Rooth,

⁵ “Almanya’da uyum için beş aşamalı plan”. (Çevrimiçi) <https://www.dw.com/tr/almanyada-uyum-i%C3%A7in-be%C5%9F-a%C5%9Famal%C4%B1-plan/a-56820687> , 20.01.2022.

⁶ <http://earsiv.medeniyet.edu.tr:8080/xmlui/bitstream/handle/123456789/390/06.03.%20TezRukiye%20%281%29.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y>, 10.12.2021

1999). Native (Swedish) workers have started to be employed instead of migrant workers in enterprises. With the transition from industry to the services sector, the entry of skilled labour migrants into the country has been facilitated. Authorities focused on language learning and integration in order to benefit from skilled immigrant labour force. Equality, freedom of choice, and support for partnerships are prioritized in order to obtain effective and productive results from integration (Alonso & Fonseca, 2012, p.9).

The economic crises in the former Yugoslavia during the 1990s and the ethnic conflicts and wars in the Balkans resulted in immigration to Sweden. The Swedish government accepted these immigrants by adhering to the 1951 Geneva Convention and implemented programmes for immigrants via the Swedish Immigration Agency. The Swedish government focuses on integration in order to benefit from qualified labour force. It is assumed that immigrants will work more effectively when the language proficiency problem is solved. Sweden has transferred the integration issue to the municipalities. For this reason, implementation differs from region to region. The Ministry of Integration and Gender Equality was established to prevent discrimination in recruitment and facilitate integration to the society. The cohesion and social peace play a prominent role in the activities of this ministry. Thanks to these policies, public peace and living standards are high in Sweden. Treating everyone in an equal manner and providing services is seen as the biggest contributing factor to this success (Alexander, 2003, p.420).

Although Sweden has been able to develop a successful migrant admission system compared to many European countries, there has been an increase in discrimination and exclusion against immigrants in housing and employment after the 1990s. In addition to spread of racism, Islamophobia and discrimination which had begun to increase their impact in the world, the influx of Syrian refugees after 2015 led to a visible increase in racist approaches in the country. Immigrants began to be discriminated against in terms of employment, working conditions and wages. In this process, immigrants were the group most affected by negative effects of discrimination (Carlsson, 1970). In the system where being Swedish considered to be sufficient to obtain welfare-state benefits, blood and citizenship ties are not obligatory, but it has been underlined that the generous attitude in the acceptance of immigrants and the services provided to immigrants should be changed, especially after the 2014 general elections. The fact that Sweden is the country that receives the highest number of asylum applications among EU countries supports these claims. In recent years, Sweden has narrowed the processing of immigration applications and granted short-term residence and work permits to labor migrations, and has started to decrease the provision of social welfare services (Kupsky, 2017).

3.4. Turkey;

Immigration to Turkey started with citizen migrations which was deemed as the legacy of the Ottoman Empire. Since the first years of the Republic, it has become a country of immigration with the effect of the policies carried out in the nation-state building process (Erder, 2007, p.23). From the establishment of the Republic until the 2000s, the country accepted immigrants or citizens from many countries, especially from Greece, Balkan countries, Germany, Bosnia, Kosovo, Bulgaria and Macedonia (Yılmaz & Uludağ Güler, 2020, p.3887). After the 2000s, due to the political turmoil and economic problems in Turkey's neighbouring countries, irregular migration flows to Turkey have started from Afghanistan, Iran, Iraq, and finally Syria (Pusch & Wilkoszewski, 2010, p.29). Political events that took place in the world due to social, political and economic reasons have reached massive proportions by expanding their field after globalization. In 2011, many popular movements against governments or power in Arab countries gained momentum. One of the most well-known among them is undoubtedly the Arab Spring, which started in Tunisia in 2011 and spread to other countries (Uludağ Güler, 2019, p.104).

After the 1980s, with the disintegration of the Soviet bloc, migration movements intensified due to the deepening poverty and unemployment. Turkey has become the preferred destination especially for women immigrants. Women from Ukraine, Moldova and Romania started to do sex work as well as shuttle trade, office work, agriculture, light industry, entertainment sector and home care work (Erder & Kaska, 2011).

Inspired by the United Nations' Palermo Protocol (Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons Especially Women and Children), Turkey defined human trafficking as a crime in 2002. After 2004, status of "victim" was defined and protection mechanism was created. In 2006, its scope was extended by amending both the "human trafficking" and "forced prostitution" laws. Thus, the country aimed to prohibit the forced labour of women immigrants in the prostitution sector in the context of decent works worthy of human dignity (Coşkun, 2014). Throughout migratory movements to Turkey that have diversified over time, immigrants have turned to new business areas such as interpretation, clerical work, modelling and designing. They entered Turkey mostly with a tourist visa and worked informally, deprived of all social and economic security (Kaşka, 2007, p.231).

Domestic works are placed near the top of list in Turkey, as in other countries, where women immigrants find work. Women's entry into the labor markets has been facilitated with the spread of the service sector, the change in the gender-based division of labor, the differentiation of gender roles, the intensification of the flexible working model, and the

increase in dual-income families. The fact that women are in the labour market has made it a necessity to get support from outside for domestic work. The idea of employing migrant women to reduce costs by not paying for shelter has paved the way for them to concentrate on this area (Ramirez-Machado, 2003). In addition, the nature of the job is flexible, often there is no notion of overtime working, there is a lack of leave and break periods, many works are expected to be done within this scope, and women immigrants are often excluded, abused, subjected to violence and sexual harassment while performing this service. Because of these reasons, there has been a growing need for regulation. Within the scope of ILO Convention No. 189 on "Decent Work for Domestic Workers", provisions were drafted to cover the specified problem areas. Accordingly, the definitions of domestic work and domestic worker are primarily included in the Convention, and the concept of domestic work and domestic worker were provided with a conceptual basis in Turkey and in many countries (Yıldırım & İslamoğlu, 2014, p.112). This situation will not only improve the working conditions of immigrants, but also will reduce the economic discrimination against them.

Prohibitions on employment in domestic work for immigrants in Turkey were abolished in 2003 with the adoption of the "Law No. 4817 on Work Permits of Foreigners". In addition to the pressures of the European Union, the expression of the problems of migrant workers in many areas made it necessary to make legal arrangements in this area. Thus, Turkey has made important legal arrangements for migrant workers after 2011. According to the "United Nations Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of their Families" ratified by Turkey in 1999, migrant workers are required to be treated equally with citizens (Demirdizen, 2013, p.331).

Although the law enacted for work permits of foreigners wanted to secure the rights of foreigners, most of the working foreigners could not benefit from this law due to the informal nature of domestic work, the fact that the immigrants do not possess legal papers, and their processing takes a long time due to the complex structure of the law. In addition to the problems of previous immigrants, due to Syrian migration flows that started in 2011, the "Law No. 6735 on International Labour" was put into effect on 13.08.2016, aimed at solving the problems of foreigners who are already working or wish to work in labour market (Uğur & Yanık, 2016).

Until 2011, Turkey did not have an immigration policy or an integration policy that could be applied to immigrants. As a matter of fact, Turkey has not faced many problems in terms of social cohesion and harmonization of immigrants until this year. While the migrants it received during and after the proclamation of Republic were mostly citizen migrations or a limited number of migrations, it was exposed to mass migration with the open door policy

implemented by Turkey after 2011. This situation has compelled Turkey to adopt a permanent and clearly defined regulation on immigration and integration.

In the first years, the concept of “guest” was at the forefront and the social acceptance among the people, who acted with a high sense of tolerance and empathy, towards Syrians was at a very high level (Yıldırım, İslamoğlu & İyem, 2017:112). As a result of the protracted war and the increase in the number of people arriving, tolerance gave way to dissatisfaction, especially as most of the immigrants were young men. 53.8% of those coming from Syria are men and 46.2% are women. The ratio of Syrian men between the ages of 15-64 to overall number of Syrian men coming to Turkey is 59.89%⁷.

Dissatisfaction with the existence of Syrians was sometimes expressed orally and sometimes in a physical manner. The "us" phenomenon, which is unique to community-type societies such as Turkey, has prepared the ground for the Syrians to be easily positioned as the "other" (Cetin, 2016, p.201). Considering the obstacles to integration, opponents argued that the Syrians are culturally different from the Turks, they have a different language and culture. Even if they share the same religion with the Syrians, they differ in many aspects such as sanitation, hygiene, child marriage, the way of communication, and table manners (Gözler Çamur, 2017, p.93). The people living in border provinces were among the most disturbed by the presence of Syrians. So much so that the number of Syrians in some border provinces exceeded the number of the native population of the province. This situation caused discomfort among native population (Harunoğulları & Cengiz, 2016, p.310).

Conflicts between neighbours in border provinces and polygamous marriages constitute another stumbling block for social cohesion. In general, it has been observed that there is an increase in the number of divorces due to the increase in marriages with Syrian women in border cities (Ekici & Tuncel, 2015, p.18). Most of the marriages between the citizens of both countries took place on a voluntary basis. Young Syrian women were married to elderly men or disabled people in exchange for a small fee, in the hope that their "life would be saved", or they had to marry Turkish citizens as second or third wives. Syrian women who sought asylum in Turkey were used for cheap labour, prostitution and second marriages. They were excluded from society because they disrupted the unity of family and caused the failure of some marriages (Cengiz, 2015, p.116). In the early years, the Syrians, who behaved in a calm manner and in harmony due to their gratitude and the psychology brought by the forced

⁷ Uyum Strateji Belgesi ve Ulusal Eylem Planı: 2018-2023, Republic of Turkey, Ministry of Internal Affairs, Directorate General of Migration Management. (Çevrimiçi) http://www.goc.gov.tr/icerik6/gecici-korumanin-unsurlari_409_558_1095_icerik. 05.01.2022.

migration, started to get involved in criminal activity over time. This has led to distrust and prejudice against Syrians (Tunç, 2015, p.45)

The legal and institutional framework of migration management in Turkey was drawn within the scope of the Eleventh Development programme, as the Syrians' return scenario not being realized and it appeared that their presence would be permanent. Pursuant to this plan, the "Project of Supporting a Development-Sensitive and Harmonious Migration Policy Framework in Turkey" carried out in cooperation with the General Directorate of Migration Management and the Swiss Undersecretariat of Migration during 2015-2017 aimed to develop a development-oriented migration policy in Turkey. Project aims to maximize positive ripple effect on development of integrating immigrants into society In Turkey, new regulations are being made in order to make faster, more effective and analytical regulations and applications on migration, and institutional formations have been realized in this context. The most important of these regulations is the "Foreigners and International Protection Law" numbered 6458 and the "Republic of Turkey Ministry of Internal Affairs General Directorate of Migration Management" established in the context of this law. The purpose of establishing this General Directorate; It continues its activities in order to carry out the necessary business and procedures for the entry, exit and deportation of foreigners to Turkey, to provide international protection status such as refugees, asylum seekers, temporary protection, and to combat human trafficking⁸.

Cohesion Strategy Document and National Action Plan (2018-2023) have been prepared under the coordination of the Ministry of Interior, General Directorate of Migration Management, and public institutions and organizations, municipalities, international organizations, non-governmental organizations are supposed to work in an integrated manner to implement the policies prescribed in this plan. According to this action plan, 6 themes were determined under the umbrella of harmony, namely social cohesion, information, education, health, labour market and social support (social services and aids). One of the most important factors in integration is undoubtedly language learning and education. Studies on the education of immigrants in Turkey in this regard are carried out under the coordination of the Ministry of National Education (MEB), the Council of Higher Education (YÖK) and the General Directorate of Migration Management⁹. Besides education, employment is an important issue for full integration. In this regard, legal arrangements have been made concerning the work

⁸ Özel İhtisas Komisyonu RAPORU, <https://www.sbb.gov.tr/wpcontent/uploads/2020/04/DisGocPolitikas%C4%B1OzelIhtisasKomisyonuRaporu.pdf> , 23.01.2022.

⁹ Uyum Strateji Belgesi ve Ulusal Eylem Planı: 2018-2023, Republic of Turkey, Ministry of Internal Affairs, Directorate General of Migration Management. (Çevrimiçi) <https://www.goc.gov.tr/kurumlar/goc.gov.tr/Yayinlar/UYUM-STRATEJI/Uyum-Strateji-Belgesi-ve-Ulusal-Eylem-Plani.pdf>., 23.01.2022.

permits issued for immigrants. Social support stands out as one of the most prominent aspect of welfare state practices. Social services and aids are the support provided to cover the needs of immigrants when they first come to the country and for their continuing needs, although they may change in forthcoming periods. In this framework, social services and assistance are provided to immigrants as well as citizens of the country in case of need (Uludag Güler, 2021, p.148).

Conclusion

Global migration has been one of the most prominent factors shaping contemporary societies and still maintains its relevance. The integration of immigrants and refugees, i.e., their full membership in a society, is closely related to the development of those countries. Especially after the World Wars, the contribution of immigrant labour in the process of re-emergence of growth and expansion is cannot be ignored. Reaping the benefits of immigrant labour and ensuring full integration have been associated with providing immigrants with basic rights such as housing, education, health, employment, freedom of movement, participation in public affairs and political rights. While the best way to benefit from migrant labour is to employ them, economic integration actually contributes to psychological, sociological and cultural harmony.

The scale and structure of the welfare state models existing among countries have an extremely decisive role in defining their attitudes towards immigrants. Countries in the liberal model, where freedom and individuality play a central role and social state practices are largely transferred to the market, have been restrictive in accepting immigration after the 2000s. In America, one of the most prominent countries of the liberal model, and whose the majority of population is immigrants, programs implemented to ensure social cohesion for immigrants are mostly associated with language learning. Degree of an individual's cohesion and happiness is proportional to his/her level of English proficiency, and ability to speak fluently means better job opportunities. People's quality of life and harmony are completely in their own hands. Individual effort is extremely important for social harmonization and integration. Many aspects of burdens and policy development regarding immigrants have been left to market mechanisms. Due to these features, the theme of freedom, which is at the core of the liberal model, has brought individualism to the fore in terms of providing social welfare and left the harmony to the free will of the people.

In the Scandinavian model, which is founded upon universal principles, equal service is provided to everyone regardless of class, and many harmonization policies have been implemented for immigrants. Social peace and good living standards are ensured in the

society as a whole, by providing fair service to everyone. Scandinavian countries, with their low levels of unemployment, fair income distribution, and high living and working standards, have been one of the attractive places for immigrants due to these features. They have managed to balance the income levels among society with the help of high taxation and provide social welfare services to many people without utilising income tests. They have adopted a moderate and flexible attitude towards the issue of accepting immigration.

In the conservative model, which is based on individual empowerment, premiums, and social insurance, welfare policies were mostly based on merit. Majority of aid and services provided to immigrants were in proportion to benefits of their labour. The premium term and premium amount paid for insurance determine the extent insured people will benefit from the welfare state. If immigrants want to live and work in better conditions, they need to learn German better and integrate fully into society. For this reason, they are subjected to language training and integration courses. Citizenship procedures are not carried out for those who cannot pass the courses.

In countries like Turkey, that were late to adopt a welfare state systems and considered to be in the Southern European welfare state classification, income distribution injustice, unemployment and poverty are at high levels, while the level of education, women's participation in employment, welfare state aids are at a very low level. In these countries, immigration policy that started to take shape with the process of accession to European Union. In Turkey, the institutions and processes related to migration have been shaped to a large extent by the Syrian migration. The activities of the Department of Integration and Communication under the General Directorate of Migration Management contribute to the harmonization process. The Integration Strategy Document and the National Action Plan (2018-2023) have developed strategies to empower immigrants living in Turkey, contribute to their ability to manage their life in an independent manner and their integration into society.

Integration policies in welfare state regimes differ according to the economic system, perspective on the integration of immigrants and the criteria to which they are attached, but what they have in common is a shared belief that cohesion and integration contribute to social peace and economic growth. It is essential to strengthening the international responsibility of sharing mechanisms for the effective implementation of policies in the field of social cohesion. The governments of these countries depict immigrants as a source of "danger", "fear" and "crime" with the strict border control strategy they implement. These strategies, which largely determine the ideological framework of the media on immigrants, label the existing immigrants to be integrated as "other", "different" and "foreign" and hinder social cohesion. Negative perceptions especially towards immigrants should be changed.

Institutional framework, harmonization and integration, legislative, and institutional capacity based on human rights work not only for the protection of immigrants, but also for the cohesion and integration of individuals with society, participation in social life, their participation in employment, and their use of basic services. It is extremely important to integrate the immigrants into the society and pay regard to public acceptance and satisfaction in this process. Integration is a two-sided process and mutual cohesion and consent are essential.

Bibliography

- Alexander, M. (2003). Local policies toward migrants as an expression of HostStranger relations: A proposed typology. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 29(3), 411–30.
- Alonso, S. & Fonseca, S. C. (2012). Immigration, Left and Right, Party Politics, 18(6), 865–884.
- Amrute, S. (2016). *Encoding Race, Encoding Class: Indian IT Workers in Berlin*. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.
- Andersen, G. E. (1996). “After the Golden Age? Welfare State Dilemmas in a Global Economy”, *Welfare States in Transition: National Adaptations in Global Economies*, (Ed.: Gosta Esping–Andersen), London, Sage Pub.
- Andersen, G. E. (2002). “Towards the Good Society, Once Again?”, *Why We Need a New Welfare State?*, (Ed.: Gosta Esping–Andersen), New York, Oxford University Press.
- Arın, T. (1996). “Refah Devleti: Bir Analiz Çerçevesi”, *Türkiye’de Bütçe Harcamaları, IX. Türkiye Maliye Sempozyumu*, İstanbul: İstanbul Üniversitesi İktisat Fakültesi Yayınları.
- Atasü-Topcuoğlu, R. (2019). Avrupa’da Refah Devleti Çözünürken Uluslararası Göç ve Yeni Sağın Yükselişi: İsveç ve Almanya Örnekleri. *Çalışma ve Toplum*, 61(2).
- Aydemir S. & Şahin, M. C. (2018). Zorunlu-Kitlesele Göç Olgusuna Sosyolojik Bir Yaklaşım: Türkiye’deki Suriyeli Sığınmacılar Örneği, *Dini Araştırmalar*, 21(53), 121–148.
- Banarlı, N. S. (2007). *Devlet ve Devlet Terbiyesi*, İstanbul: Kubbealtı Yayınevi.
- Baştürk, Ş. (2010). “Uyum”Dan “Dışlanma”ya: Yirmi Birinci Yüzyılda Göçmenler ve Sosyal

Politika, Sosyal Siyaset Konferansları Dergisi, (57), 515-548.

Blaschke, J. (1994). East-West migration in Europe and the role of international aid in reducing emigration. In *Aid in Place of Migration?: Selected Contributions to an ILO-UNHCR Meeting* (p. 73). International Labour Organization.

Borevi, K. (2012). "Sweden – the flagship of multiculturalism" G. Brochmann & A. Hagelund, (Der.), *Immigration policy and the Scandinavian welfare state 1945–2010*, Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Briggs, A. (2006). *The Welfare State in Historical Perspective*, V. 2. Der. Francis Castles, Cambridge, UK.

Browne, C. V. & Braun, K. L. (2007). "Globalization, Women's Migration, and the Long-Term-Care Work Force", *The Gerontologist*, 48 (1), 16–24.

Carlsson, S. (1970). *Svensk Historia*, (2), Bonniers, Stockholm (in Swedish).

Cengiz, D. (2015). Zorunlu Göçün Mekânsal Etkileri ve Yerel Halkın Algısı; Kilis Örneği, *Turkish Studies*, 10(2), 101-122.

Cengiz, D. (2015). Zorunlu Göçün Mekânsal Etkileri ve Yerel Halkın Algısı: Kilis Örneği", *Turkish Studies International Periodical For the Languages, Literature and History of Turkish or Turkic*, 10(2), 101-122.

Coşkun, E. (2014). Türkiye'de göçmen kadınlar ve seks ticareti. <https://dspace.ceid.org.tr/xmlui/handle/1/64>.

Coşkun, İ. (1997). *Modern Devletin Doğuşu*, İstanbul: Der Yayınları.

Çağlar, A. & Onay, A. (2015). Entegrasyon/uyum: kavramsal ve yapısal bir analiz. İçinde B. D. Şeker; İ. Sirkeci & M. M. Yüceşahin (Eds.), *Göç ve Uyum* (pp. 33-64), London: Transnational Press.

Çelik, A. (2006). *AB Sosyal Politikası: Uyum Sürecinin Uyumsuz Alanı*, İstanbul: Kitap Yayınevi.

Çetin, İ. (2016). Türkiye'de Suriyeli Sığınmacıların Sosyal ve Kültürel Entegrasyonu,

- Sosyoloji Dergisi, 34, 197-222.
- Demirdizen, D. (2013). Türkiye'de Ev Hizmetlerinde Çalışan Göçmen Kadınlar: Yeni Düzenlemelerle Yarı Köle Emeğine Doğru mu?. *Çalışma ve Toplum*, 38(3).
- Deniz, A. (2018). Türkiye'ye Filipinli Dadı Göçü: Aracı Firmaların Rolünü Anlamak, *Coğrafi Bilimler Dergisi*, 16 (2) , 289-301.
- Deniz, R. (2020). 1789'dan 2020'ye Fransa'nın Göç Politikaları. İstanbul Medeniyet Üniversitesi Lisansüstü Eğitim Enstitüsü Uluslararası İlişkiler Anabilim Dalı Yüksek Lisans Tezi.
<http://earsiv.medeniyet.edu.tr:8080/xmlui/bitstream/handle/123456789/390/06.03.%20TezRukiye%20%281%29.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y> , 10.01.2022.
- Diehl, C. & Blohm, M. (2003). "Rights or Identity? Naturalization Processes among "Labor Migrants" in Germany", *International Migration Review* 37 (1), 133–62.
- Ekici, S. & Tuncel, G. (2015). Göç ve İnsan, *Birey ve Toplum*, 5(9), 9-22.
- Erdem, Z. & Şahin, L. (2010). Ülkemizde Ev Hizmetlerinde İstihdam Edilen Yabancı Uyraklı İşgücünün Çalışma Koşulları: İstanbul İli Üzerine Bir Alan Araştırması, *Journal of Social Policy Conferences*, (57) , 281-325.
- Erder, S. & Kaşka, S. (2011). Turkey in the New Migration Era: Migrants between Regularity and Irregularity. Paçacı-Elitok, S. ve Straubhaar, T. (ed). *Turkey, Migration and the EU: Potentials, Challenges and Opportunities*. Hamburg: Hamburg University Press. 113-132.
- Erder, S. (2007). "Yabancısız Kurgulanan Ülkenin Yabancıları", A. Arı (Drl), Türkiye'de Yabancı İşçiler. İstanbul: Derin Yayınları. 1-82.
- Erder, S. (2007). "Yabancısız Kurgulanan Ülkenin Yabancıları", A. Arı (Drl), Türkiye'de Yabancı İşçiler. İstanbul: Derin Yayınları. 1-82.
- Ersöz, H. Y. (2003). "Doğuşundan Günümüze Sosyal Politika Anlayışı ve Sosyal Politika Kurumlarının Değişen Rolü," *İstanbul Üniversitesi Dergisi*, 53(2).
- Esping-Andersen, G. (1990). *The Three Worlds of Welfare Capitalism*, UK: Polity Press.

- Göç İdaresi Genel Müdürlüğü (05.02.2020). Geçici Korumanın Unsurları,Erişim Tarihi: 05.02.2020,http://www.goc.gov.tr/icerik6/gecici-korumanin-unsurlari_409_558_1095_icerik.
- Göze, A. (1980). Liberal Marxist Faşist ve Sosyal Devlet Sistemleri, İstanbul: İstanbul Üniversitesi Yayınları.
- Gözler Çamur, E. (2017). İzmir’de Türk Çalışanların Suriyeli İşçiler Algısının Sosyal Psikolojik Analizi, Meltem İzmir Akdeniz Akademisi Dergisi, 1, 92-94.
- Güler, H. (2020). Göç ve Entegrasyon: Türkiye’de “Uyum” Ama Nasıl?. KAÜİİBFD, 11 (Additional Issue 1), 245-268.
- Güllüpınar, F. (2014). Almanya’da Göçmen Politikaları ve Türkiyeli Göçmenlerin Trajedisi: Yurttaşlık, Haklar Ve Eşitsizlikler Üzerine. Anadolu Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi, 14(1), 1-16.
- Gümüş, İ. (2018). Tarihsel Perspektifte Refah Devleti: Doğu, Yükseliş ve Yeniden Yapılanma Süreci. Journal of Political Administrative and Local Studies, 1(1), 33-66.
- Harunoğulları, M. & Cengiz, D. (2016). Suriyeli Göçmenlerin Mekânsal Analizi: Hatay (Antakya) Örneği, TUCAUM, 309-318.
- Heilbrunn, S. & Iannone, R. L. (2019). Refugee Entrepreneurship A Case-based Topography, Edited by Sibylle Heilbrunn, Jörg Freiling and Aki Harima, Palgrave, Macmillan.
- Howard, E. (2006). “The Case for a Considered Hierarchy of Discrimination Grounds in EU Law,” Maastricht Journal of European and Comparative Law, 13(4): 445-470.
- Huber, E. R. (1970). Modern Endüstri Toplumunda Hukuk devleti ve Sosyal Devlet, (Translator: Tugrul Ansay), Ankara Üniversitesi Siyasal Bilimler Fakültesi Dergisi, 28-39.
- Işıklı, A. (1987). Bir Başka İktisat, 2. Edition, İstanbul: Alan Yayıncılık.
- Joppke, C. (1999). Immigration and the Nation-State: The United States, Germany, and Great Britain. New York: Oxford University Press.

- Keyder, Ç. (2007). *Memalik-i Osmaniye'den Avrupa Birliği'ne*, İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.
- Kocabaş, F. (2004). "Endüstri İlişkilerinde Dönüşüm," (Unpublished Master Thesis), Kutahya: Dumlupınar University, Institute of Social Sciences.
- Koçak, O. & Gündüz, D. (2016). Avrupa Birliği Göç Politikaları ve Göçmenlerin Sosyal Olarak İçerilmelerine Etkisi, *Yalova Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 7(12), 66-91.
- Koven, S. G. & Götzke, F. (2010). *American Immigration Policy: Confronting the Nation's Challenges*. New York: Springer.
- Kupsky, A. (2017). "History and changes of Swedish migration policy", *Journal of Geography, Politics and Society*, 7(3), 50–56.
- Kurthen, H. (1998). "Fiscal Impacts of Immigration on the American and German Welfare States", H. Kurthen, J. Fijalkowski ve G. G. Wagner (Der.) *Immigration, Citizenship and the Welfare State in Germany and the United States, Part A: Immigrant Incorporation*. Stamford, CT: JAI Press.
- Levine, R. A. (2021). Göçmenlerin Asimilasyonu: Neden Amerika Asimile Edebiliyorda, Fransa Edemiyor? Translator: M. Y. Alptekin, *İMGELEM*, 5(8): 125-154.
- Meray, S. (1965). *Devletler Hukukuna Giriş*, Ankara Üniversitesi Siyasal Bilimler Fakültesi Yayınları, Ankara.
- Messina, A. M. (2002). *West European immigration and immigrant policy in the new century*. Greenwood Publishing Group.
- Oğuz, S. & Şahin, M. (2020). "Avrupa Birliği ve Diğer Ülkelerde Göçmen-Kayıt Dışı İstihdam İlişkisi", *Kayıtlı İstihdama Geçiş Programı Birinci Faz Etki Analizi Çalışması, Uluslararası Çalışma Örgütü*.
- On Birinci Kalkınma Planı, <https://www.sbb.gov.tr/wpcontent/uploads/2020/04/DisGocPolitikas%C4%B1OzelIhtisasKomisyonuRaporu.pdf> , 23.01.2022.
- Özdemir, S. (2007). *Küreselleşme Sürecinde Refah Devleti*, İstanbul: İstanbul Ticaret Odası Yayınları.
- Özgüler, V. C. (2018). Göç ve Uyum Politikaları. *GSI Journals Serie B: Advancements in*

Business and Economics, 1(1), 1-10.

Öztürk, C., & Tekiner, M. A. (2017). Stratejik Göç Yönetimi Çerçevesinde Türkiye’de Göç İdaresi Genel Müdürlüğü’nün Konumu. Güvenlik Çalışmaları Dergisi, 19(1), 143-159.

Pierson, C. & Castles, F. G. (2006). The Welfare State Reader, V. 2, USA, Policy Press.

Pierson, C. (1999). “Contemporary Challenges to Welfare State Development”, Political Studies.

Pusch B. & Wilkoszewski, T. (2010). Türkiye’ye Uluslararası Göç, Toplumsal Koşullar – Bireysel Yaşamlar. (Translator: M. Çomak-Özbatur). İstanbul: Kitap Yayınevi.

Ramirez-Machado, J. M. (2003). “Domestic Work, Conditions of Work and Employment: A Legal Perspective”, Conditions of Work and Employment Series No.7, ILO, Geneva http://www.ilo.int/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_protect/---protrav/---travail/documents/publication/wcms_travail_pub_7.pdf.

Rimolo, V. (2016). Sweden: a Country of Opportunities and Constraints For Migrant Integration. Paper Ismu, 1-22.

Rooth, D. O. (1999). Refugee migrants in Sweden, Educational Investments And Labour Market Integration. Lund Economy Studies number 84, Lund.

Scott, K. (1999). The migrant experience: changing employment and income patterns in Sweden, 1970-1993. Lund Studies in Economic History 9, Lund University Press, Lund.

Seyyar, A. (2002). Sosyal Siyaset Terimleri, İstanbul, Beta Basım Yayım.

Snyder, Loni Diane, (2006). The New “Integration” Tests and Materials in the Netherlands, Germany, Baden-Wurttemberg, and the United Kingdom: The Muslim Other and The Change From Multiculturalism to Assimilation", Master Thesis, Bosphorus University.

Şeker, B. D. (2015). Göç ve Uyum Süreci Psikolojik Bir Değerlendirme, İçinde B. D. Şeker; İ. Sirkeci & M. M. Yüceşahin (Eds.), Göç ve Uyum (pp. 9-21). London: Transnational Press.

Şenkal, A. & Sarıpek, D. B. (2007). “Avrupa Birliği’nin Karşılaştırmalı Refah Modelleri

- ve Sosyal Politikada Devletin Değişen Rolü”, Kocaeli Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi, 14(2).
- Şenkal, A. (2005). Sosyal Politika ve Sosyal Vatandaşlık: Kölelikten Sosyal Vatandaşlığa (Avrupa Birliği Sosyal Vatandaşlık Örneği), Sosyal Siyaset Konferansları Dergisi, (50), 225-258.
- Taş, İ. E., Koçar, H. & Çiçek, Y. (2017). “Mülteci Sorununun Çözümüne İlişkin Yeni Bir Yapılanma: Göç İdaresi Genel Müdürlüğü”, Süleyman Demirel Üniversitesi İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Fakültesi Dergisi, 22, 1369-1383.
- Tunç, A. Ş. (2015). Mülteci Davranışı ve Toplumsal Etkileri: Türkiye’deki Suriyelilere İlişkin Bir Değerlendirme, TESAM Akademi Dergisi, 2(2), 29-63.
- Uğur, S., & Yanık, E. C. (2016). Ev Hizmetlerinde Göçmenlerin İstihdamına Yönelik Sorunlarının Değerlendirilmesi. Çalışma İlişkileri Dergisi, 7(2), 65-77.
- Uludağ Güler, Ç. (2020). Sosyoekonomik Perspektiften Türkiye’de Geçici Koruma Statüsündeki Suriyeliler: Fatih İlçesi Örneği, İstanbul Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü (Yayımlanmamış Doktora Tezi), 2020.
- Uludağ Güler, Ç. (2021). Sosyal Politika Bağlamında Göç İdaresi Genel Müdürlüğü, Sosyal Politikada Güncel Gelişmeler: Türkiye’deki Kurum ve Kuruluşların Faaliyetleri, Ed. Muhammet Enes Kayagil & Murat Kalkan, Filiz Kitabevi, İstanbul. (International Book Chapter).
- Ulutaş, Ç. Ü. (2013). “Almanya’yı Temizliyorum”1: Almanya’da Göçmen, Kadın ve Temizlikçi Olmak, Çalışma ve Toplum, (2), 235-258.
- Wilensky, L. H. (1975). The Welfare State and Equality, England, California University Press.
- Williams, C., Nadin, S. & Windebank, J. (2012). Evaluating the Prevalence and Nature of Selfemployment in the Informal Economy: Evidence from a 27-nation European survey. European Spatial Research and Policy. 19(1), 129-142.
- Yazgan, T. (1975). Gelir Dağılımı Açısından Sosyal Güvenlik, İstanbul: İstanbul İktisat Fakültesi Yayınları.
- Yıldırım, S. & İslamoğlu, E. (2014). “İnsana Yakışır İş” Kavramı Bağlamında Türkiye’de

Ev Hizmetinde Çalışan Kadınlar. SGD-Sosyal Güvenlik Dergisi, 4(2), 145-175.

Yıldırımalp, S., İslamoğlu, E. & İyem, C. (2017). Suriyeli Sığınmacıların Toplumsal Kabul ve Uyum Sürecine İlişkin Bir Araştırma . Bilgi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi, (2) , 107-126.

Yılmaz, B. & Uludağ Güler, Ç. (2020). Türkiye’de Suriyeli Göçmenlerin Toplumsal Kabulünün Z Kuşağı Açısından İncelenmesi (Üniversite Öğrencileri Üzerine Uygulamalı Bir Araştırma). Social Sciences Studies Journal (Sssjournal).

Yılmaz, G. A. (2006). OECD Ülkeleri ve Türkiye’de Sosyal Devlet ve Sosyal Harcamalar, İstanbul: Arıkan Yayınları.

Zincone, G., Caponio, T., & Carastro, R. (2006). Integration indicators. Promoting Equality in Diversity: Integration in Europe.
<https://www.destatis.de/EN/Themes/Society-Environment/Population/Current-Population/Tables/liste-current-population.html>, 02.12.2019.

“Almanya’da uyum için beş aşamalı plan”. (Çevrimiçi) <https://www.dw.com/tr/almanyada-uyum-i%C3%A7in-be%C5%9F-a%C5%9Fama1%C4%B1-plan/a-56820687>, 15.01.2022.

“Göçmen işçiler için insana yakışır iş sağlamaya yönelik çabaları artırma çağrısı”. (Çevrimiçi) https://www.ilo.org/ankara/areas-of-work/dw/WCMS_789022/lang--tr/index.htm. 02.01.2022.

Uyum Strateji Belgesi ve Ulusal Eylem Planı: 2018-2023, Republic of Turkey, Ministry of Internal Affairs, Directorate General of Migration Management. (Çevrimiçi) <https://www.goc.gov.tr/kurumlar/goc.gov.tr/Yayinlar/UYUM-STRATEJI/Uyum-Strateji-Belgesi-ve-Ulusal-Eylem-Plani.pdf>, 08.01.2022.

UNCHR: Germany. (Çevrimiçi) <https://www.unhcr.org/germany.html?query=germany>, 23.01.2022.

Göç, Kültür, Kimlik

Furkan DÜZENLİ^a

Migrancy, Culture, Identity

Chambers, Iain (2005), Göç, Kültür, Kimlik, Ayrıntı Yayınları, İstanbul, 191.

Iain Chambers, Göç, Kültür, Kimlik isimli eserinde bahsi geçen üç kavrama farklı bir bakışla yaklaşıyor. İnsanların kimliklerinin; göç, kültür, tarih, zaman, dil, algı ve anlayış ile zihin dünyalarının nasıl önemli bir parçası olduğunu ortaya koyan Chambers, türü, nedeni veya sonucundan bağımsız olarak göç eden bireyin yerinden edilmiş olma duygusunu, yaşanılan hayat içerisinde her bireyin nasıl göçmen olabileceğini anlatıyor. Takip ettiği tartışma sürecini modern dünyanın kültür büyütecisi ile konuya yaklaşarak ortaya koyuyor.

Chambers edebi yönünü ön plana çıkardığı eserini, Friedrich Nietzsche, Martin Heidegger, Michel Foucault, Edward Said, Hannah Arendt, Walter Benjamin ve daha bir çok isimden yaptığı alıntılarla şiirsel bir dil üzerine inşa ediyor. Alıntı yapılan tanınmış yazarların hem menşeleri hem de kullandıkları dillerdeki farklılık ve dolayısıyla zenginlik, esere ayrıca derinlik katıyor. Göç, Kültür, Kimlik bu özelliği nedeniyle yayınlandığı ilk tarih üzerinden uzun bir zaman geçmesine rağmen literatürdeki önemli yerini hala koruyor.

Kimlik ve göçmenlik arasındaki ilişkiyi ikna edici argümanlarla tartışan Chambers, oldukça dinamik olan göç süreçlerinin modernist bakış açısını nasıl sarstığını, öteki ile olan ilişkiyi, farklı dillerin birbirleriyle olan zıtlığını, merkez-çevre karşıtlığında parçalanmış dünyanın savrulmuşlarını göç manzaraları üzerinden okuyor.

Türkçeye sadece Göç, Kültür, Kimlik kitabı çevrilen Chambers, Napoli'deki Istituto Universitario Orientale'de sosyoloji profesörü olarak görev yapmaktadır. Şehirleşme, popüler kültür, göç ve kimlik olguları dahil, postmodernizm ve postkolonyalizm üzerine çalışan Chambers'ın *Urban Rhythms: Pop Music and Popular Culture* (1985); *Border Dialogues:*

^a Furkan DÜZENLİ, Öğretim Görevlisi, Düzce Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Meslek Yüksekokulu/ Lecturer, Düzce University, Vocational Academy, furkanduzenli@duzce.edu.tr, ORCID ID: 0000-0001-7044-3403

Journeys in Postmodernity: The Metropolitan Experience (1990); Culture after Humanism: History, Culture, Subjectivity (2001); Postcolonial Interruptions, Unauthorized Modernities (2017); La Questione Mediterranea (2019) eserleri de bulunmaktadır.

Bir sınırdan diğer sınıra yolculuk yaparken ve farklı dünyalardan geçerken; New York, Londra, Paris, Barcelona, Berlin ve Napoli (Chambers, 2005: 65); yazılan Göç, Kültür, Kimlik okuyucusuna Heidegger'in alıntısıyla; evsizliğin dünyanın kaderi olmaya doğru gittiği hissini oldukça keskin bir şekilde hissettiriyor. Chambers, evsizliği Meksika sınırı yakınlarındaki Tijuana çevresinden başlayarak anlatıyor fakat orada kalmıyor. Okuyucu yazarla birlikte coğrafyaları dolaşiyor.

“Eve Dönüşün İmkansızlığı” ismi verilen birinci bölümde yazar; kültürel sınırları, evsizliği, göç etmeyi ve modernleşmeyle birlikte başka bir yer, başka bir dünya ve başka bir gelecek ihtimalini gözler önüne seriyor. Literatürde göç kavramı çaresizliği veya son çareyi akla getirmektedir. Özellikle Türkiye gibi göç süreçlerinin geçiş noktasında bulunan ülkelerin tarihlerinde oldukça canlı olan bu anlayış, dünyanın geri kalanı için aynı derecede önemli olmamaktadır. Chambers sözü Meksika sınırı ile başlatıyor çünkü Meksika sınırı bir fragmandır; dünyanın göz ardı ettiği bölgelerde neler olup bittiğini aydınlatacak, görülmeyeni görünür kılacak birer işaret fişegi. Yazarın fragman metaforunu kullanmasının bir diğer nedeni ise; beşerin unutkanlığı, tarihin ekinler gibi ekilip biçilmesi, kurgulanıp yeniden yazılması ve zamanın bazı gerçekleri değiştirme kabiliyetidir. (Chambers, 2005: 13) Chambers, ilerleme ve gelişme adı altında insanın hafıza tablolarının (Chambers, 2005: 18) yeniden yazılmasının dili, düşüncüyü, anlama kabiliyetini değiştirdiğini ifade ediyor ve bu tabloların yeniden yazılmasının yolunun ancak eleştirel düşünceden geçeceğini ifade ediyor.

İkinci bölümde “Göç Manzaraları” aktarılıyor. Göç sürecini geri dönülecek bir yuvanın bulunmaması ile açıklayan Chambers, yazmanın okumak, izlemek veya dinlemek gibi seyahat etmek olduğunu iddia ediyor. Şiirsel üslubunu fazlasıyla hissettiren yazar her bir bölümde değişen dinamikleri bir araya getiriyor ve kavramları hem birer metafor olarak hem de birer araç olarak kullanıyor.

“Sayfanın Üzerinde Gezinmek”, “İmal Bakış”, “Yabancımanın Not Defteri”, “Köksüzlüğe Kök Salmak”, “Maruz Kalmak” ve “Sınır” gibi alt başlıkların kullanıldığı ikinci bölümün en önemli kavramı olarak “öteki” ile karşılaşmaktadır. Bireyin “başka bir yerde” yaşamasının kendisini farklı kimliklerle karşılaştırdığı, farklılıkları gördüğü ve bazen o farklıya benzediği, bazen de kendisine benzettiği, fakat tamamen yok olmayan iki farkın bir arada yaşayabildiği (Chambers, 2005: 32) bir dünya kurulduğunu ifade eden Chambers, hayatın içinde ötekinin olmasının aslında yerlinin merkezde kalmamasına neden olduğunu söyler. Değişime yön

veren göçerdir; öyle ki modern metropol figürünü oluşturan da yine göç eden bireylerdir. (Chambers, 2005: 38)

Nietzsche'nin "olgular yoktur sadece yorumlar vardır" sözünü hatırlatan Iain Chambers, bir diğer atfı da Ashis Nandy'nin Yerli Halk Hikayesi'ne yapıyor. İlk defa domuzla karşılaşan köylülerin verdikleri tepkilerin anlatıldığı hikayede, köylülerin yeni bir deneyime ne kadar kapalı oldukları ve zihinlerinde var olan kategorilerin dışına neden çıkmadıkları anlatılıyor. (Chambers, 2005: 44) Bu hikaye üzerinden Chambers, Batı'nın ikiyüzlülüğünü de eleştiriyor. Çingenelerin kapatıldıkları barakalardan söz edilmeyorken, Holocaust'un Batı'nın içsel "öteki"sinin en güçlü simgesi konumunda olmasının, modernitenin ve dolayısıyla Batı'nın anlayışından arızı bir sapma olmayacağı, tam olarak bu anlayışın için bir unsuru olduğunu ifade ediyor. Chambers böylece beşinci bölümde detaylandıracağı tartışmaya da kapı aralamış oluyor.

Üçüncü bölümde bir başka metafor karşılıyor okuyucuyu: Walkman. Bugün kullanımı çok eskilerde kalan, yerini çok daha özgür(!) imkanlara sahip internet teknolojiye kaptıran walkman, Chambers için göçebeliliğin önemli bir simgesidir. (Chambers, 2005: 68) "İşitsel Yürüyüş" ismi verilen bu bölümde toplumsallığa açık bir reddiye olarak görülen walkmanın ikili bir işleve sahip olduğu iddia ediliyor. Walkman bireyi kendisi dışında var olan dünyadan uzaklaştırdığı gibi yine kendisi ile aynı düşünceleri paylaşan bireylerle bağlantı kurmaya da itmektedir.

Chambers'ın Walkman özelinde ifade ettiği bakış açısı, bugün Youtube, Spotify veya benzeri uygulama ve platformlar için de elbette kullanılabilir. Bireyin geçmişe oranla göç hareketleri içerisinde daha fazla yer aldığı günümüzde, duygu ve düşünce dünyalarına konulan sınırların farkına varmasının ne kadar zaman alacağı ve ne şekilde gerçekleşeceği henüz bilinmemektedir. Günümüzde kamusal alanın böylesi bir özelleştirme yaşaması sorgulanması gereken bir durumdur.

Dördüncü bölümde bir gerçeklik inşası üzerinde duran Chambers, "Arzulayan Makineler" ismi ile gerçek dünya ile yapay dünya arasında ortadan kalkan sınırlara dikkat çekiyor. Hem bir son hem de yeni bir başlangıç olarak görülen bilgisayarın aslında modern dünyada önemli bir müphemlik metaforu olduğunu anlatan yazar, o günün sınırlılığı içerisinde kontrolsüz otoriteye sahip olmaya başlayan verinin (datanın) gerçeğin yerini aldığını ifade ediyor. Yazıldığı tarih dikkate alındığında henüz metaverse dünyasının literatürde yer almadığı göz önünde bulunmalıdır. Buna rağmen elbette gelişmenin bu noktalara varacağını bilemeyecek olan Chambers, yine de "veri dalgalarında sörf" yapıldığını ve "ağ ulusu"nun artık ortaya çıktığını ifade etmektedir. Siber dünyada "bedensiz sevinç" mıntıkasının oluşumunda

bahseden Chambers bu yönü ile önemli bir gelecek vizyonu çizmektedir. (Chambers, 2005: 81) Bugünden bakıldığında bir çok parçanın yerine oturduğu, verinin öneminin anlaşıldığı günümüzden yaklaşık otuz yıl önce bu öngörüü ortaya koyabilmek önemli bir adımdır.

Chambers'a göre simülasyon, hız, eşzamanlılık yasaları altında imgeler mutasyona uğramıştır ve anlam göçmenleşmektedir. (Chambers, 2005: 83) Var olan bu göç süreci içerisinde birey metropolde vardığı anlam yargılarına taşrada başkalaşmaktadır. Yine bilgisayar karşısında makineyle yüzleşen bireyin zihin dünyasının temeli değişmektedir. Mesela yarım saatlik mesafede yer alan bir mekan metropol için yakinken, taşrada uzak kabul edilmektedir. Yaşanılan hayat içerisinde sosyalleşme olarak ifade edilen ilişkiler bütünü makine dünyasında, ki bugün sosyal medya olarak adlandırılabilir, bireyselleşme olarak algılanmaktadır.

Daha önce merkez-çevre noktasında kapıyı aralayan Chambers, beşinci bölümde parçalanmış dünyayı mercek altına alıyor. Merkez-çevre diyalektiği ile çoğulculuk ve kolektif düşünce üzerinde duran yazar, özellikle sömürgecilik dönemleri sonrasında kültür ve kimliğe dair farklı bakış açılarının ortaya çıkması, kültürün manipülasyon aracı olarak kullanılması, bireyin hayatı boyunca, yani göç hareketleri sonucunda, kimliğini oluşturması gibi süreçleri bu bölümde ele alıyor.

Kültür, bir mücadele alanıdır. Küreselleşme üzerinden okunmaması gereken tam olarak ulusal olanı vurgulamak üzere kullanılan kültür, ötekini anlamının da ön kabulüdür. Kendisinden tamamen vazgeçerek ötekini anlayamaz birey; öteki ile karşılaştırılırken kullanılan kültür tam olarak bu noktada devreye girer. Dilin düşünceyi konumlandırması, anlam dünyasını inşa etmesi ve kelimelerin yeni anlamlara gelmesi bu gelişme sürecinin sonucudur. Chambers bu gelişme ve değişmeyi rock müzik üzerinden okumaktadır. (Chambers, 2005: 102) Kültürel bir müzik ekonomisinin ortaya konulduğunu anlatan Chambers, bunun merkez-çevre ayrımı etrafında örgütlenen soyut kutuplaşma ve konumlanmaların ötesine nasıl geçileceği konusunda yol gösterici olacağını ummaktadır. Chambers, “otantiklik” ve “sahtelik” gibi iki kutba ayrılan merkez-çevre ikiliğinin, tabi bu diyalektiğin müzik kültürü üzerinden örneklendirildiği unutulmamalıdır, insanlık tarihini geliştirmeyeceğini düşünmektedir.

“Haritasız Şehirler” ismi verilen altıncı bölüme gelindiğinde Iain Chambers iddialarını toparlamaya başlamaktadır. Kültür endüstrisini “getto” kavramı üzerinden okuyan yazara göre; Üçüncü Dünyalıların metropol gettolarında açık sınırının altında yaşamaya çalıştıkları hayat, mevcut kültür dünyasına katılma veya dışlanma ile birlikte öfke, neşe, gurur ve acı ile toplumsal gerçekliğin dönüşümünün sembolleri olmaktadır. (Chambers, 2005: 120)

Bu anlayışa göre endüstri, ticaret ve kentleşme, çağdaş kültürlerin, çağdaş kimliklerin ve çağdaş hayatların üretiminin dışında değil bütün bunların içinde bulunan unsurlardır. Yine unutulmamalıdır ki bu tartışma modernite süreçlerinin başından günümüze kadar yapılagelmektedir. Bugün dahi var olan ve eleştirilen noktadır ki; teknolojinin eleştirisi teknoloji araçlarıyla gerçekleştirilmektedir. Güncel bir örnekle; kapitalizm eleştirisinin kullanılan “Apple” marka akıllı telefon ile ve “Twitter, Facebook veya benzeri bir uygulama” üzerinden gerçekleştirilmesi, kitlelere ulaştırılması bireyin hayatının çerçevesi demektir. Chambers’a göre birey, böylece hem sosyal hayattan kendisini dışlayarak hem de kendisini bu hayata açılarak var olmaktadır. (Chambers, 2005: 126)

“Yara ve Gölge” isimli son bölümde Iain Chambers, eserin başından beri takip ettiği yolculuğunda, bireyi insanlığın kültürel mirasıyla karşıya getirdiğini söylüyor. Bireyin; seyahat, göç ve hareket ile bu mirasın sınırlarında dolaştığını ve bir meydan okumayla karşılaştığını hatırlatıyor; bireyin bu meydan okumaya vereceği cevap ile duracağı noktayı belirleyeceğini ifade ediyor. Ya bulunduğu noktada kalacak ya da ortaya koyacağı sorularla tarihe yön verecektir. Böylece tarih anlayışını da sorgulayan Chambers’a göre tarih sadece geçmiş yazmak ve öğrenmek değildir, aynı zamanda geçmiş tecrübe etmek demektir. Tecrübelerle birlikte tarih yazımı ile birey geçmiş defnedir. (Chambers, 2005: 159) Defin işlemi ile birlikte insanlık bu tecrübe üzerine yeni medeniyetleri şerefli bir anıt gibi dikebilecektir.

Iain Chambers Göç, Kültür, Kimlik isimli bu eserinde eski konulara yeni bir okuma sunmanın ötesine geçiyor. Bu üç farklı ve değişime açık konuyu bir araya getirerek, göçmeni yer değiştiren kimse noktasındaki sığ tanımından çıkarıyor, bugün her an göçmen olmakla karşı karşıya olan okuyucusunu da kendi kimlik değişimlerini takip etmesi gerçeğiyle yüzleştiriyor. Akademik üslubun ağırlığının hissedildiği kitapta, Chambers’ın verdiği alıntı ve atıflar konuyla ilgili detaylı okumalara da kapı aralıyor. Göç ve kültür konuları üzerinde çalışan, düşünce, dil ve tarih alanlarıyla ilgilenen okuyucuların Göç, Kültür, Kimlik eserini bu bakış açısıyla okuması gerekiyor. Ötekinin dışlanmadan öteki olarak, dil, din, düşünce ve sosyal hayatın bir rengi olarak kalması gerektiğini; bunu yaparken ötekini kendi dünyamıza indirmeden, kendimizi aşarak, kendimizin ötesinde ve kendimizden ayrı olarak bir ilişki geliştirmek gerektiğini hatırlatıyor. Kitap içerisinde yer yer tercümeden kaynaklı, okumayı ve anlamayı zorlaştıran ifadelerle bulunsa da eser konuya ilgi duyanlar için önemli bir başucu kitabı olmaktadır. Ayrıca kitabın sonunda bulunan kaynakça detaylı okumalar için rehber niteliğindedir.

YAZARLARA NOTLAR

Çalışma Göndermek

Middle East Journal of Refugee Studies (MEJRS) dergisinde;

- Türkçe ve İngilizce dillerinde hazırlanan çalışmalar değerlendirme süreçlerine alınmaktadır.
- Yayına kabul edilen Türkçe çalışmanın yazarından/yazarlarından geniş İngilizce özet hazırlamaları beklenmektedir. Geniş İngilizce özetle kaynakçada yer alan her bir referansa atıf yapılması gerekmektedir. Türkçe çalışmalar için talep edilen geniş İngilizce özet, yayım kabulü alındıktan sonra gönderilmelidir.
- Yazarlardan katılım bedeli alınmamaktadır.

Middle East Journal of Refugee Studies (MEJRS) dergisinde aşağıdaki ilkelere uygun çalışmalar yayımlanır.

- Mültecilik konusu ile ilgili nicel, nitel, tekdenekli veya karma araştırma deseni kullanılarak hazırlanan çalışmalar,
- Mültecilik konusunda son dönem alanyazını kapsamlı biçimde değerlendiren literatür analizi, metaanaliz veya metasentez çalışmaları,
- Mültecilik konusunda pratik olarak uygulanabilecek model önerileri sunan çalışmalar veya benzeri özgün nitelikteki yazılar.

Çalışma Değerlendirme Süreçleri

Middle East Journal of Refugee Studies (MEJRS) dergisine gönderilecek çalışmalar [Yazım Kuralları](#)na uygun olarak hazırlanmalıdır. Gönderilen çalışmalar Editör tarafından öncelikle amaç, konu, muhteva, sunuş tarzı ve yazım kurallarına uygunluk yönlerinden incelenmektedir. Çalışmalar ikinci aşamada Alan Editörü tarafından değerlendirilir.

Middle East Journal of Refugee Studies (MEJRS) dergisindeki editöryal ön değerlendirme kriterleri şu şekildedir:

Nicel çalışmalar için;

- Tek sürekli değişken veya iki sürekli değişken barındırıp sadece veya ağırlıklı olarak frekans, yüzde, fark ve ilişki istatistiklerine dayalı çalışmalar çalışmanın kapsamına göre değerlendirilmektedir.
- Tek sürekli değişken veya iki sürekli değişken barındırıp tekli veya çoklu regresyon, yol (path) analizi, clustur analizi gibi ileri istatistikler kullanılarak hazırlanan çalışmalara öncelik verilmektedir.

Ölçme aracı geliştiren çalışmalar için;

- Sadece ölçme araçları geliştirmeyi raporlayan çalışmalar, geliştirilen ölçme aracının otantikliği, kapsamı, geliştirilen grubun niteliği, geçerlik ve güvenilirlik işlemlerinin yetkinliği vb. ölçütler dikkate alınarak değerlendirilmektedir.
- Geliştirilen ölçme aracını bir araştırmada kullanarak raporlayan çalışmalara öncelik verilmektedir.

Deneysel çalışmalar için;

- Araştırma verileri nitel verilerle desteklenmiş deneysel araştırmalara öncelik verilmektedir.

Nitel çalışmalar için;

- Nitel araştırmalar için araştırma sürecinin geçerlik ve güvenilirlik koşullarının sağlanmış olmasına ve verilerin derinlemesine analiz edilmiş olmasına önem verilmektedir.

Betimsel/Kuramsal çalışmalar için;

- Dergide mültecilik ile ilgili temel sorunları ortaya koyan ve bunlara çözüm önerileri getiren analitik çalışmaların yayımlanması hedeflenmektedir. Diğer taraftan bu kapsama giren çalışmaların kitap bölümü tarzında olmaması beklenmektedir.

Karma (mixed) desenli çalışmalar için;

- Karma desende olan çalışmaların yayımlanma oranı daha yüksektir. Bununla birlikte karma çalışmalarda niçin ve hangi karma metodolojinin kullanıldığının tekniği

ile beraber açıklanması beklenmektedir. Karma desenli arařtırmalarda arařtırmanın nicel ve nitel kısımları ayrı ayrı deęerlendirilir. Nicel ve nitel kısımların ayrı ayrı yukarıdaki kıstasları karřılaması beklenir.

Ayrıca;

- Alanda çok sık kullanılan ölçme araçlarına dayalı çalışmaların ve oldukça yoğun biçimde çalışılmış konularla ilgili arařtırmaların yeni bir yönelim ortaya koymaları beklenmektedir.
- Yüksek lisans ve doktora tezlerine dayalı çalışmalarda dilimlenme yapılmaması beklenmektedir.
- Bütün arařtırma türleri için verilerin güncellięine önem verilmektedir. Arařtırma verilerinin toplanması üzerinden 5 yıl veya daha fazla süre geçmiş ise arařtırmaların güncellięini kaybettięi yönünde görüş bildirilmektedir.
- Ön deęerlendirmesi tamamlanan çalışmaların Yetkilendirilmiş Yazarına deęerlendirme neticesi bildirilir. Yukarıda belirtilen ilkelere uygun bulunan çalışmalar hakem deęerlendirme sürecine alınır.
- Gönderilen bir çalışmanın editöryal deęerlendirmesi en geç 40 gün içerisinde tamamlanmaktadır.
- Hakem deęerlendirme sürecine alınan çalışmalar alanda uzman iki hakeme gönderilir.
- Eęer hakemlerin raporlarında çalışma ile ilgili görüş ayrılıęı söz konusu olursa, üçüncü bir hakemin görüşüne başvurulur.
- Hakem deęerlendirme süreci, řu anki yoğunluk göz önüne alındığında yaklaşık 3-4 ay sürmektedir. Bu süre, ilgili alandaki hakemlerin iş yükü nedeniyle uzayabilmektedir.
- Hakem raporları gizlidir. Yazarlar çalışmalarını deęerlendiren hakemlerin kim olduğunu bilmemektedirler. Hakemler de deęerlendirdikleri çalışmanın yazarını/yazarlarını bilmemektedirler.
- Yazar/yazarlar; hakemlerin, Alan Editörünün ve Editörün eleřtirilerini, önerilerini ve düzeltme taleplerini dikkate almak zorundadırlar. Yazar/yazarlar, eleřtirilerden ve önerilerden katılmadıęı hususları gerekçeleriyle izah etmelidir/etmelidirler.

Middle East Journal of Refugee Studies (MEJRS)'de hakem deęerlendirme süreçlerinin detayları ve ilkeleri için [Hakemlere Notlar](#) bölümüne bakılabilir.

Hakem deęerlendirme raporlarının sonularına dayalı olarak Editör;

- alıřmanın kabulüne,
- alıřmanın, hakem raporlarında belirtilen hususlara gre dzenlendikten sonra yeniden deęerlendirmeye alınabileceđine veya,
- alıřmanın reddine karar verir.
- Yayımaya kabul edilen alıřmaların sreleri ařađıda belirtilmiřtir.
- Yayımaya kabul edilen alıřmaların hakem deęerlendirme raporları ve editryal deęerlendirmeleri Yetkilendirilmiř Yazara gnderilir.
- Yetkilendirilmiř Yazarın ilgili raporlara gre dzenleyerek Editre ilettiđi alıřma Editr tarafından kontrol edilerek tashih srecine alınır.
- Yetkilendirilmiř Yazara alıřmasıyla ilgili tashih notları gnderilir.
- Tashih sreci tamamlanan alıřmalar tasarıma ynlendirilir.
- Mizanpajı ve tasarımı tamamlanan alıřmalar Yetkilendirilmiř Yazar tarafından son kez kontrol edilir.
- Bu sreleri tamamlayan alıřmalar ncelikle DOI numarası atanarak [Online-First](#) olarak yayımlanır.
- OnlineFirst olarak yayımlanan makaleler yayım srecine alınır ve ilgili sayıda basılır.



INSTRUCTIONS FOR AUTHORS

Manuscript Submission

Contributors submitting their work to *MEJRS* should be informed that articles should include the following:

- Quantitative, qualitative, or mixed research methods,
- Comprehensive literature reviews, meta-analysis, or meta-synthesis,
- Model proposals, clinical experimental research model, or original writings of similar quality.

Editorial and Review Process

MEJRS gives priority to current studies using advanced research and statistical methods and techniques. The Journal's main criteria for publication are original contribution to the field and competency in methodology.

Manuscripts are first assessed by the Editorial Board for purpose, topic, content, presentation style, and mechanics of writing. During this preliminary assessment, the Editorial Board guidelines are as follows:

For Quantitative Research

Quantitative research based on a single variable or that mainly analyses frequency, percentage, difference, and correlational statistics is usually assessed in a preliminary assessment according to its contents. Quantitative research including multiple regressions, path and cluster analysis, or other advanced research and statistical methods is given priority.

For Studies Developing a Measurement Tool

The authenticity, scope, quality of the group worked on, and efficiency of the reliability and validity of studies are taken into consideration to decide whether the measurement tool can be published independently. The Editorial Board encourages contributors to send their manuscripts if the developed measurement tool is used in a study in which the findings are reported.

For Experimental Research

Findings must be supported, detailed, and further elaborated on with qualitative data.

For Qualitative Research

The reliability and validity studies and in-depth analysis of the data is of utmost importance.

For Descriptive Studies

The journal aims to publish analytical studies identifying and proposing solutions to the key issues related to refugee issues. However, such studies should not resemble a book chapter based only on a literature review.

Mixed Research Designs

Such studies have a higher likelihood of being published. Mixed research design studies should justify why and how the author adopted the research design used. Qualitative and quantitative sections are analyzed separately and are expected to meet the criterion described above.

Please Note

- The Editors emphasize that *MEJRS* articles should not include studies based on very frequently used measurement tools or on research topics that have been overly examined, unless they propose an innovative approach to the topic in question.
- Manuscripts based on thesis-related research should include all data used in the thesis. *MEJRS* does not publish any article including unethical practices such as sliding.

- *MEJRS* believes that the data collection process for original research should have been done in the last 5 years.

Editorial and Review Process

- Manuscripts are assigned a reference code and recorded in ScholarOne Manuscript.
- After the submission, authors are sent a confirmation of receipt by email.
- Manuscripts are evaluated by the Editorial Board following the submission.
- Manuscripts that meet the criteria for *MEJRS* proceed to the next stage, which is reviewer evaluation.
- Manuscripts that do not meet the *MEJRS* criteria are notified of the decision with the relevant justification for rejection.
- Receipt of manuscripts and Editorial Board decisions may take approximately 40 days.
- Manuscripts are sent to two specialists in the relevant field.
- If the reviewers differ in opinion about the quality of your work, the paper will be referred to a third reviewer.
- The Editorial Board and referee reviews take approximately 3-4 months to complete. This time may be extended depending on the availability of referees in your sub-discipline.
- Reviewer reports are kept confidential. We adopt a double-blind peer-review evaluating process.
- Authors must be attentive to the criticisms, suggestions, and corrections of the referees and the Editorial Board. In case of disagreement with the reports, authors must explain why they do not agree with the points made by the reviewers.
- For more details of the review process, visit the [Notes for Reviewers](#) page.
- There are three possible results for a manuscript:
 - Acceptance with minor or major revisions
 - Reject and Resubmit process
 - Rejection

Manuscripts go through the following stages once accepted for publication:

- Reviewer reports and Editorial Board reports are sent to the author.
- Authors revise their manuscripts according to the reports, and the Editorial Board reviews the revised manuscripts before they advance to the proofreading stage.
- Authors are sent the proofreading notes.
- When proofreading is complete, manuscripts advance to the formatting and pagination stage.
- Following the pagination process, authors are asked to conduct a final check of their manuscripts.
- After completion of these processes, manuscripts are initially published on [OnlineFirst](#). As each article is assigned a DOI, this version could be treated as the authentic version.
- Printing of the manuscript in the journal may take approximately 5-6 months, depending on the workload involved in the journal.