e-ISSN: 2757-9549

İNGİLİZ DİLİ VE EDEBİYATI ARAŞTIRMALARI DERNEĞİ

ENGLISH LANGUAGE AND LITERATURE RESEARCH ASSOCIATION OF TÜRKİYE

IDEAS:
Journal of English Literary Studies

April 2024

Volume: 4

Number: 1

e-ISSN: 2757-9549

İNGİLİZ DİLİ VE EDEBİYATI ARAŞTIRMALARI DERNEĞİ

ENGLISH LANGUAGE AND LITERATURE RESEARCH ASSOCIATION OF TÜRKİYE

IDEAS:
Journal of English Literary Studies

April 2024

Volume: 4 Number: 1

IDEA:
İngiliz Dili ve Edebiyatı Araştırmaları Derneği
English Language and Literature Research Association of Türkiye

IDEAS: Journal of English Literary Studies

Owner
Prof. Dr. Işıl BAŞ (in the name of English Language and Literature Research Association of Türkiye)

Editor-in-chief
Prof. Dr. Mehmet Ali ÇELİKEL, *Marmara University*, Türkiye

Editorial Board
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Rahime ÇOKAY NEBİOĞLU, *Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli University*, Türkiye
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Seda ARIKAN, *Fırat University*, Türkiye
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Önder ÇAKIRTAŞ, *Bingöl University*, Türkiye
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Nazan YILDIZ ÇİÇEKÇİ, *Karadeniz Technical University*, Türkiye
Assist. Prof. Dr. Kübra KANGÜLEÇ COŞKUN, *TOBB University of Economics & Technology*, Türkiye
Assist. Prof. Dr. Şafak HORZUM, Kütahya Dumlupınar University, Türkiye
Assist. Prof. Dr. Reyhan ÖZER TANİYAN, *Pamukkale University*, Türkiye
Assist. Prof. Dr. Ayşegül TURAN, *İstanbul Kültür University*, Türkiye
Assist. Prof. Dr. Serhat UYURKULAK, *Fenerbahçe University*, Türkiye
Dr. Aylin ALKAÇ, *Boğaziçi University*, Türkiye

Language Editors
Assist. Prof. Dr. Serhat UYURKULAK, *Fenerbahçe University*, Türkiye
Dr. Aylin ALKAÇ, *Boğaziçi University*, Türkiye

International Advisory Board
Prof. Dr. Zekiye ANTAKYALIOĞLU, *İstanbul Aydın University*, Türkiye
Prof. Dr. Ünal AYTÜR, *Independent Scholar*, Türkiye
Prof. Dr. Işıl BAŞ, *İstanbul Kültür University*, Türkiye
Prof. Dr. Zbigniew BIALAS, *University of Silesia in Katowice*, Poland
Prof. Dr. Ronald BOGUE, *University of Georgia*, United States
Prof. Dr. A. Deniz BOZER, *Hacettepe University*, Türkiye
Prof. Dr. Maria DiBATTISTA, *Princeton University*, United States
Prof. Dr. Victor KENNEDY, *University of Maribor*, Slovenia
Prof. Dr. Katerina KITSI-MITAKOU, *Aristotle University of Thessaloniki*, Greece
Prof. Dr. Alan MUNTON, *University of Exeter*, United Kingdom
Prof. Dr. Alexandra POULAIN, *University of Sorbonne Nouvelle - Paris 3*, France
Prof. Dr. Adrian RADU, *Babeş-Bolyai University*, Romania
Prof. Dr. Gülşen SAYIN, *Atlas University*, Türkiye
Prof. Dr. Atilla SİLKÜ, *Ege University*, Türkiye
Prof. Dr. Rezzan SİLKÜ, *Ege University*, Türkiye
Prof. Dr. Özlem UZUNDEMİR, *Çankaya University*, Türkiye
Prof. Dr. İbrahim YEREBAKAN, *Recep Tayyip Erdoğan University*, Türkiye
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Nil KORKUT NAYKI, *Middle East Technical University*, Türkiye
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Özlem ÖĞÜT YAZICIOĞLU, *Boğaziçi University*, Türkiye

Technical Service
Assist. Prof. Dr. Şafak HORZUM, *Kütahya Dumlupınar University*, Türkiye

e-ISSN: 2757-9549

Journal Website: https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/ideas

Type of Publication: Periodical

Address: Doğuş Mah. Bağlar Cad.
No: 118/17 Çankaya-Ankara
06660 Türkiye

ideas.ejournal@gmail.com

Date of E-Publication: **23 May 2024**

About and Aim

IDEAS: Journal of English Literary Studies

- is an electronically published, scientific, international, peer-reviewed, semi-annual journal devoted to literary studies in English;
- aims to supply a highly qualified academic platform for the exchange of diverse critical and original ideas on any aspect of literatures written in English, cultural studies, and literary theory;
- has consecutive issues of each (annual) volume that are published in April and October every year.

Focus and Scope

IDEAS: Journal of English Literary Studies

- contributes to high-quality scholarly studies which address the canonical and contemporary issues in literatures and media produced in English;
- is published by the English Language and Literature Research Association of Türkiye (IDEA);
- considers submissions of original research articles, interviews, and book reviews for blind review and publication;
- accepts submissions written only in English (only abstracts both in English and in Turkish);
- accepts submissions from authors who either have their PhD degrees or are at least enrolled in a PhD programme currently;
- limits original research articles and interviews to 4000-6000 words and books reviews to 1000-1500 words (including notes and bibliography);
- is indexed in the MLA International Bibliography, ERIH PLUS, EBSCO, Asos İndeks, and Google Scholar; and also listed in the MLA Directory of Periodicals.

Ethics and Blind Peer Review

IDEAS: Journal of English Literary Studies

- adopts open access policy;
- supports the Budapest Open Access Initiative that was signed on Sept. 12, 2012;
- uses the double-blind review method in the review process of all studies;
- keeps the identities of the authors and reviewers confidential;
- expects all parties to hold the ethical duties and responsibilities which are written in light of the guides and policies made by the Committee on Publication Ethics;
- obliges each study to be detected for plagiarism for the integrity of the study;
- checks all the submissions for plagiarism by means of iThenticate software.

Referencing and Citation Style

IDEAS: Journal of English Literary Studies

- considers it to be an obligation for the accepted studies to have correct and complete references and attributions;
- demands in-text and bibliography citations to be prepared in accordance with the latest MLA Referencing Style Guide (9th Edition);
- wants authors to prepare their submissions according to the *IDEAS* Template which is available on the journal website.

Fee

IDEAS: Journal of English Literary Studies

- claims no fees for article blind review or printing and for access to articles;
- never asks for any publication fees from any author, library, or reader for articles.

https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/ideas

Reference Guidelines

IDEAS: Journal of English Literary Studies demands in-text and bibliography citations to be prepared in accordance with the latest MLA Referencing Style Guide (9th Edition). The exemplary reference guidelines are provided below:

Books with One Author

Last Name, First Name. *Title of Book*. Publisher, Publication Date.

Gleick, James. *Chaos: Making a New Science*. Penguin, 1987.

Books with More than One Author

Last Name (of First Author), First Name (of First Author), and Full Name (of Second Author). *Title of Book*. Publisher, Publication Date.

Gillespie, Paula, and Neal Lerner. The Allyn and Bacon Guide to Peer Tutoring. Allyn and Bacon, 2000.

- Use "et al." for more than three authors.

Two or More Books by the Same Author

List the works alphabetically. Remember to ignore articles like "a, an, the."

Palmer, William J. *Dickens and New Historicism*. St. Martin's, 1997.

---. *The Films of the Eighties: A Social History*. Southern Illinois UP, 1993.

Translations

Foucault, Michel. *Madness and Civilization: A History of Insanity in the Age of Reason*. Translated by Richard Howard, Vintage-Random House, 1988.

Howard, Richard, translator. *Madness and Civilization: A History of Insanity in the Age of Reason*. By Michel Foucault, Vintage-Random House, 1988.

Edited Book and Edition

Bronte, Charlotte. *Jane Eyre*, edited by Margaret Smith, Oxford UP, 1998.

Crowley, Sharon, and Debra Hawhee. *Ancient Rhetorics for Contemporary Students*. 3rd ed., Pearson, 2004.

Peterson, Nancy J., editor. *Toni Morrison: Critical and Theoretical Approaches*. Johns Hopkins UP, 1997.

Hill, Charles A., and Marguerite Helmers, editors. *Defining Visual Rhetorics*. Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 2004.

CC BY

Book Chapters

Last name, First name. "Title of Essay." *Title of Collection*, edited by Editor's Name(s), Publisher, Year, Page range of entry.

Harris, Muriel. "Talk to Me: Engaging Reluctant Writers." *A Tutor's Guide: Helping Writers One to One*, edited by Ben Rafoth, Heinemann, 2000, pp. 24–34.

Wallenhorst, Nathanaël. "Dating Debate." *Handbook of the Anthropocene*, edited by Wallenhorst and Christoph Wulf, Springer, 2023, pp. 349–358.

Articles

Author(s). "Title of Article." *Title of Journal*, Volume, Issue, Year, pages.

Duvall, John N. "The (Super)Marketplace of Images: Television as Unmediated Mediation in DeLillo's White Noise." *Arizona Quarterly*, vol. 50, no. 3, 1994, pp. 127–153.

Review of a Book

Review Author. "Title of Review (if there is one)." Review of *Book/Performance Title*, by Author/Director/Artist. Title of Periodical, Day Month Year, page.

Seitz, Matt Zoller. "Life in the Sprawling Suburbs, If You Can Really Call It Living." Review of *Radiant City*, directed by Gary Burns and Jim Brown. *New York Times*, 30 May 2007, p. E1.

Weiller, K. H. Review of *Sport, Rhetoric, and Gender: Historical Perspectives and Media Representations*, edited by Linda K. Fuller. *Choice*, Apr. 2007, p. 1377.

Poems and Short Stories

Burns, Robert. "Red, Red Rose." *100 Best-Loved Poems*, edited by Philip Smith, Dover, 1995, p. 26.

Kincaid, Jamaica. "Girl." *The Vintage Book of Contemporary American Short Stories*, edited by Tobias Wolff, Vintage, 1994, pp. 306–307.

Volumes

Quintilian. *Institutio Oratoria*. Translated by H. E. Butler, vol. 2, Loeb-Harvard UP, 1980.

Quintilian. *Institutio Oratoria*. Translated by H. E. Butler, Loeb-Harvard UP, 1980. 4 vols.

Dissertations

Bile, Jeffrey. *Ecology, Feminism, and a Revised Critical Rhetoric: Toward a Dialectical Partnership*. 2005. Ohio University, PhD dissertation.

Referees of Vol. 4 No. 1

Prof. Dr. Zekiye ANTAKYALIOĞLU, *İstanbul Aydın University*, Türkiye
Prof. Dr. Zeynep Zeren ATAYURT FENGE, *Ankara University*, Türkiye
Prof. Dr. Evrim DOĞAN ADANUR, *Fenerbahçe University*, Türkiye
Prof. Dr. Mukadder ERKAN, *Atatürk University*, Türkiye
Prof. Dr. Faruk KALAY, *Aydın Adnan Menderes University*, Türkiye
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Belgin BAĞIRLAR, *Aydın Adnan Menderes University*, Türkiye
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Mesut GÜNENÇ, *Aydın Adnan Menderes University*, Türkiye
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Özlem KARADAĞ, *İstanbul University*, Türkiye
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Murat ÖĞÜTCÜ, *Adıyaman University*, Türkiye
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Işıl ŞAHİN GÜLTER, *Fırat University*, Türkiye
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Gamze SABANCI UZUN, *İstanbul Aydın University*, Türkiye
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Zümre Gizem YILMAZ, *Social Sciences University of Ankara*, Türkiye
Assist. Prof. Dr. Emine ŞENTÜRK, *Akdeniz University*, Türkiye

IDEAS: Journal of English Literary Studies
Vol. 4, No. 1, 2024

CONTENTS

Editor's Preface

Mehmet Ali ÇELİKEL……………………………………………………………………………vii-viii

Original Research Articles

Analysing Sartrean Inter-subjectivity and the Concept of the Look in *Macbeth*

Masoomeh RAHMANI GOLDAREH & Fazel Asadi AMJAD……………………………………..1-12

A Comparative Analysis of Existentialism and Mysticism in Line with Jungian Individuation in Virginia Woolf's and Iris Murdoch's Selected Works

Aleyna DURMUŞ……………………………………………………………………………...13-26

Agency of Urban Space and David Greig's *San Diego* as Soft City

Ömer Kemal GÜLTEKİN……………………………………………………………………...27-36

Book Review

***İklimkurgu: İklim Değişikliği, Antroposen'in Poetikası ve Ekoeleştirel İzler*, by Kerim Can Yazgünoğlu**

Başak AĞIN…………………………………………………………………………………..37-41

Corrigendum

Corrigendum to "A Critique of Exaggerated Libertinism in Thomas Shadwell's *The Libertine*"

Şafak HORZUM………………………………………………………………………………..42

IDEAS: JOURNAL OF ENGLISH LITERARY STUDIES
EDITOR'S PREFACE – EDİTÖR'ÜN ÖNSÖZÜ
2024, VOL. 4, NO. 1, vii-viii

English Language and Literature
Research Association of Türkiye

Editor's Preface

I, once again, feel privileged to be writing for yet another issue of *IDEAS: Journal of English Literary Studies*. This is our seventh issue, which marks the beginning of our journal's fourth consecutive year in academia as an online journal. With full commitment to this journal, we have had new members on our editorial board. Assoc. Prof. Dr. Seda Arıkan from Fırat University, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Nazan Yıldız Çiçekçi from Karadeniz Technical University, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Önder Çakırtaş from Bingöl University, Assist. Prof. Dr. Ayşegül Turan from İstanbul Kültür University and Assist. Prof. Dr. Serhat Uyurkulak from Fenerbahçe University have joined our editorial team. They have given additional motivation and energy to our already productive and elaborative board.

I am also very happy to share the news that *IDEAS: Journal of English Literary Studies* is now indexed in ERIH Plus as of this present issue. Another good news I want to share is that our journal is under monitoring process for ASCI (Asian Science Citation Index) at the moment.

The seventh issue of the *IDEAS: Journal of English Literary Studies* includes three articles, one book review, and one *corrigendum*. Masoomeh Rahmani Goldareh and Prof. Dr. Fazel Asadi Amjad from Kharazmi University are included in this issue with an article entitled "Analysing Sartrean Inter-subjectivity and the Concept of the Look in *Macbeth*." They argue that Shakespeare and Sartre share a particular connection in that Shakespeare's tragic characters exemplify existential themes. Rahmani Goldareh and Amjad explore the interactions between two consciousnesses, or Sartrean inter-subjectivity, as portrayed in *Macbeth*, focusing on the dynamics between its tragic heroes and other characters. Outlining Sartre's concepts of inter-subjectivity and the Look, Rahmani Goldareh and Amjad examine these ideas within the context of Shakespeare's *Macbeth*.

The second article submitted to the journal for this issue is by Aleyna Durmuş from Muğla Sıtkı Koçman University. The title of her article is "A Comparative Analysis of Existentialism and Mysticism in Line with Jungian Individuation in Virginia Woolf's and Iris Murdoch's Selected Works." Durmuş studies a period characterised by social upheaval and existential concerns, pointing out that modernist writers aimed to express and mitigate the pervasive sense of lost meaning among the transitions of the twentieth century. By presenting a comparative analysis of Woolf's *Between the Acts* and Murdoch's *The Bell*, the article examines themes of self-exploration and integration amidst prevalent angst and chaos. This interdisciplinary analysis, merging psychology, philosophy, and literature, highlights Woolf's and Murdoch's explorations of human existence within the modernist framework.

CC BY

Ömer Kemal Gültekin from Mehmet Akif Ersoy University contributes to this issue with an article entitled “Agency of Urban Space and David Greig’s *San Diego* as Soft City.” Gültekin argues that the agency of space is a significant phenomenon as it affects and interacts with every entity within it, giving it a unique influence. Urban space, in particular, is where human and spatial interactions are most intense. Billions of people live in urban environments, which shape their lives not only physically but also in terms of identity. Gültekin analyses how characters are influenced by the city in David Greig’s *San Diego* to illustrate the special relationship between urban space and people by examining spatial theories and spatial agency before drawing conclusions about this relationship.

Başak Ağın from TED University reviews Kerim Can Yazgünoğlu’s Turkish book entitled *İklimkurgu: İklim Değişikliği, Antroposen’in Poetikası ve Ekoeleştirel İzler* (Climate Fiction: Climate Change, the Poetics of the Anthropocene, and Ecocritical Traces). Ağın underlines the author’s questions as to whether the global climate crisis dooms us to nothingness, extinction, or death. Emphasising the deep connection and mutual vulnerability between the human species and the nonhuman environment, Ağın indicates that Yazgünoğlu concludes his monograph with poignant words: “Climate fiction is the voice of the climate tragedy; it is a lament to the earth” (180).

Last but not least, a *corrigendum* is added to this issue for a typo correction in Şafak Horzum’s article entitled “A Critique of Exaggerated Libertinism in Thomas Shadwell’s *The Libertine*” published in the sixth issue.

I would like to express, as always, my gratitude not only to all the contributors to this issue, but also to all members of the editorial board: Assoc. Prof. Dr. Rahime Çokay Nebioğlu from Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli University, Assist. Prof. Dr. Kübra Kangüleç Coşkun from TOBB University of Economics & Technology, Assist. Prof. Dr. Reyhan Özer Taniyan from Pamukkale University, Assist. Prof. Dr. Şafak Horzum from Kütahya Dumlupınar University, Dr. Aylin Alkaç from Boğaziçi University, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Seda Arıkan from Fırat University, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Nazan Yıldız Çiçekçi from Karadeniz Technical University, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Önder Çakırtaş from Bingöl University, Assist. Prof. Dr. Ayşegül Turan from İstanbul Kültür University and Assist. Prof. Dr. Serhat Uyurkulak from Fenerbahçe University for their distinguished work in producing this issue.

Finally, we are all indebted to our referees in this issue in keeping this issue’s quality at the same academic level as the previous ones with their immaculate feedback to the authors.

Prof. Dr. Mehmet Ali ÇELİKEL
Editor-in-Chief
Marmara University, Türkiye

IDEAS: JOURNAL OF ENGLISH LITERARY STUDIES
RESEARCH ARTICLE – ARAŞTIRMA MAKALESİ
DOI: 10.62352/ideas.1431590
2024, VOL. 4, NO. 1, 1–12

English Language and Literature
Research Association of Türkiye

Analysing Sartrean Inter-subjectivity and the Concept of the Look in *Macbeth*

Masoomeh RAHMANI GOLDAREH & Fazel Asadi AMJAD

Kharazmi University, Iran

Abstract: Shakespeare and Sartre have a specific bond in that the Bard portrayed the kind of tragic characters that can be the embodiment or conceptualisation of existential notions. The present research intends to investigate the relations of two consciousnesses or the Sartrean inter-subjectivity as depicted in *Macbeth* and between its tragic heroes and others. Others have a great impact on Macbeth's consciousness and his process of self-formation. When he chooses to commit murder, he attempts to conceal his crimes from others to shun the heavy sense of shame and self-disgust (guilt) created through what Sartre calls the concept of the Look and its alienating effect upon the individual. Macbeth's social self *(being-for-others*), which is portrayed in his outward relations with others, is in stark contrast with his subjective self (*being-for-itself*), which is displayed in his myriad reflections in his soliloquies and asides. The Macbeths assume a mask to conceal their real self from others' consciousnesses. This article first explains the concepts of inter-subjectivity and the Look in Sartre's philosophy, and then it discusses the same notions in the context of Shakespeare's *Macbeth*.

Keywords:

Sartre,
Inter-subjectivity,
The Look,
Macbeth,
Shame,
Guilt

Article History:

Received:
04 Feb. 2024

Accepted:
04 Apr. 2024

Sartrecı Öznelerarasılık ile Bakış Kavramının *Macbeth* Oyununda İncelemesi

Öz: Shakespeare ve Sartre arasında, Shakespeare'in varoluşsal kavramların bedenlenmesi veya kavramsallaştırılması olarak ele alınabilecek trajik karakterleri tasvir etmesi açısından özel bir bağ vardır. Bu çalışma, Macbeth oyununda tasvir edildiği şekliyle ve oyundaki trajik kahramanlar ile diğer karakterler arasındaki iki bilinç veya Sartrecı öznelerarası ilişkileri incelemeyi amaçlamaktadır. Diğer karakterler Macbeth'in bilinci ve kendini oluşturma süreci üzerinde büyük etkiye sahiptir. Cinayet işlemeyi seçtiğinde, Sartre'ın Bakış kavramı ve bunun birey üzerindeki yabancılaştırıcı etkisi olarak adlandırdığı şeyin yarattığı ağır utanç ve kendinden tiksinme (suçluluk) duygusundan kaçınmak için suçlarını diğerlerinden gizlemeye çalışır. Macbeth'in başkalarıyla dış ilişkilerinde tasvir edilen toplumsal benliği (başkaları için varlık), tiradlarda ve aparlarda gözlemlenip sayısız düşüncesinde sergilenen öznel benliğiyle (kendisi için varlık) tam bir tezat içindedir. Macbethler gerçek benliklerini başkalarının bilinçlerinden gizlemek için bir maskeye bürünürler. Bu makalede öncelikle Sartre'ın felsefesindeki öznelerarasılık ve Bakış

Anahtar Sözcükler:

Sartre,
Öznelerarasılık,
Bakış,
Macbeth,
Utanç,
Suçluluk

Makale Geçmişi:

Geliş Tarihi:
04 Şubat 2024

Kabul Tarihi:
04 Nisan 2024

CONTACT: Masoomeh Rahmani Goldareh (https://orcid.org/0009-0003-2757-1591)
PhD Candidate in English Literature, Department of Foreign Languages,
Kharazmi University, Iran, m.rahmani58@khu.ac.ir

Fazel Asadi Amjad, Prof. Dr. (https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3600-1008)
Department of Foreign Languages, Kharazmi University, Iran, asadi@khu.ac.ir

kavramları açıklanmakta, daha sonra aynı kavramlar Shakespeare'in *Macbeth* oyunu bağlamında tartışılmaktadır.

How to Cite: Rahmani Goldareh, Masoomeh, and Fazel Asadi Amiad. "Analysing Sartrean Inter-subjectivity and the Concept of the Look in *Macbeth*." *IDEAS: Journal of English Literary Studies*, vol. 4, no. 1, 2024, pp. 1–12.

Introduction

The tragic characters of William Shakespeare (1564–1616) can be surveyed in the light of Jean-Paul Sartre's (1905–1980) existential concepts. The specific bond between the Bard and Sartre is so close that it seems Shakespeare used existentialism in the depiction of his characters before its later introduction by the existentialists. The present paper intends to examine Sartre's concept of the Look and inter-subjectivity or relations of two consciousnesses in the tragedy of *Macbeth* (1606). Macbeth's consciousness is affected by some outside factors like the witches or the consciousness of his wife as well as by the various opinions of others, or in fact, by their consciousness. Sartre argues that others have a great role in constructing one's self-identity by categorising, judging, and objectifying one. Thus, in every human being, there is an aspect that Sartre calls 'being-for-others' which is at the total mercy of others, and one has no control over it.

Macbeth's being-for-others is in stark divergence from his being-for-itself since he is greatly influenced by the consciousnesses of others and their opinions about him. He does his best to maintain the good reputation he has acquired as the result of his victorious valour exhibited in battles. The moral scruples he displays before the first murder, which are expressed in his myriad soliloquies or asides such as the one at the beginning of Act 1 Scene 7, are in part due to the significance of others' attitudes towards him and their heavy impact on his mentality. Hence, after murdering Duncan and committing subsequent massacres, Macbeth and his wife, who is his accomplice in the first murder, try to conceal their crimes by assuming a false face to deceive others and to avoid the sense of shame and self-disgust resulting from others' look and knowledge of their deeds. Thus, they exhibit a different being-for-others from their real subjective self. This hypocritical mask does not last for long and soon their real face becomes known to others: Macbeth encounters the reality of his new self and the absurdity of his life and futile endeavours.

This study is significant due to the considerably little amount of existential critical considerations of Shakespeare's works, and in fact, it provides a novel perspective for looking at Shakespeare's tragedies. In the following sections, the concepts of inter-subjectivity and the Look will be defined as they feature in Sartrean existential

philosophy, and then these notions will be discussed in the context of the play and in the relationships that its characters have with one another. This study will reveal how Macbeth transforms his subjectivity under the impact of others and how crucial the latter is in his process of self-formation and self-identity. Relatedly, Macbeth's torture by the force of his conscience can partly be due to the shame he feels thinking that others might be informed of his pernicious deeds and that they might retaliate against him.

Sartre's Concepts of Inter-subjectivity and the Look

Others have a significant impact on constructing one's self-identity by categorising, judging, and objectifying the individual. The concepts of "inter-subjectivity" or relations with others are critical for one's self-formation process. "Inter-subjectivity" refers to the idea that individuals do not live isolated in a vacuum and that they exist in a state of constant interaction with others, and thus our sense of self is shaped by these relationships. According to Sartre, we are not isolated individuals but rather exist in a web of social relationships that influence our thoughts, feelings, and actions. This means that our sense of identity is not fixed or pre-determined but it constantly evolves in response to our interactions with others.

The specific aspect of being that Sartre introduces to refer to the interactions of two subjectivities is being-for-others (Sartre 475). While a consciousness may view another consciousness as an object or as a subject and yet still treat it like an object, the only way to perceive the subjective presence of others is through the concept of the Look. Sartre provides the dramatic example of a man who is peeping through a keyhole and since he is concentrating on his own activity, he is not aware of his own objectivity at that moment and thus he behaves like a pure subject. Now, "upon hearing a footstep, his attention suddenly turns from his activity towards himself and his being seen by the other, and thus he responds with feelings of shame and self-disgust which had been absent prior to the presence of other" (Detmer 94). Sartre's theory of the Look solves the traditional philosophical "problem of other minds" by claiming that we can experience the subjectivity of others directly by becoming an object for others. Others can give us a feeling of shock and alienation since we are completely at the mercy of their look, objectifying and alienating judgments, and only through their look can we have access to our objectivity.

Sartre believes that the self as a kind of agent or subject is independent of the look of others, and there is a duality or split between the two dimensions of the self (for-itself and for-others) which cannot be reconciled, and this results from our lack of complete knowledge of others' image of us and the mutual exclusiveness of these two modes of self. Self-estrangement or self-alienation is the result of this gap when our own self-image is totally different from the image others have of us, and we usually give greater weight to our objectified self-image!

Self-identity is always a social process; our actions are socially negotiated and they assume meaning only in a social context and through the judgments of others; thus, inter-subjectivity is an ontological fact and since we need others for our self-identity, we must respect their freedom. If they were our slave, they could not give us any sense of self-identity (self-identity given to us un-freely by a slave does not have any value). Total self-awareness comes about as a result of appropriate social relations. Now, let us examine the above concepts in the context of the play and the relationship between Macbeth and his surroundings.

Inter-subjectivity and the Concept of the Look in *Macbeth*

The concept of "inter-subjectivity" or relations with others is so important in Sartre's existential philosophy that he introduces a specific dimension of human self or "being-for-others" to account for it. In fact, others have a central role in our process of self-formation and recognition of identity. If we objectify them and do not respect their freedom, they cannot confirm our sense of self and identity. According to Sartre, through the concept of the Look, others can also objectify and alienate us so that we may have a sense of shame and self-disgust at our own choices and actions if they are not socially, culturally, or morally appropriate. All these notions can be investigated through a meticulous examination of the tragedy of Macbeth and his relationship with his wife and other characters.

At the beginning of the tragedy, while Macbeth and Banquo return towards Duncan from their victorious battle, they are confronted with the Weird Sisters who exert their first ominous impact upon Macbeth's consciousness by planting in his mind the seeds of an unruly ambition by predicting his destined future. Macbeth becomes so glad and confused that he immediately writes a letter to his wife informing her about the witches' prophecies; in fact, this action merely gives Lady Macbeth ample opportunity to make plans to suppress "the milk of human kindness" in Macbeth and to persuade him to commit regicide. "The frankness of the letter betrays a character that, notwithstanding his endostatic manliness, is psychologically dependent on his wife" (Piotr Sadowski qtd. in Bloom 156). Although Macbeth is entirely free to disregard her temptations, he is finally provoked to commit murder when his manliness and valour are questioned by his wife. "Unlike Lady Macbeth's desire to be a man which is seen as a transcendence of feminine and fragile nature, Macbeth's subordination to Lady Macbeth is seen as a degradation, the feminization of his masculine virtue which leads ultimately to the loss of his manhood" (Howell 15). Hence, it can be said that his consciousness is heavily influenced by two outside factors: the witches' equivocal prophecies and his wife's powerful temptations. "She is the motivator who Macbeth needs to drive him on towards the throne of Scotland" (Huang 93). Of course, he does not make this choice easily and vacillates a lot before reaching a decision; but what matters is the outcome, not the route.

The first dominant opinion which others have of Macbeth and his self or identity at the beginning of the play is that of a brave honest hero to whose valour Scotland owes. The captain who returned from the battle speaks enthusiastically about Macbeth's sacrificial courage, particularly in the destruction of the traitorous Macdonwald, and Duncan praises his valour abundantly. As Daniel E. Hughes suggests, "[w]ere it not for the prophecies of the witches, which pique his interest, we should have no reason to suspect Macbeth's loyalty" (846). Part of the struggle Macbeth has within himself before yielding to the execution of the first murder is due to his reluctance to lose this positive view that others have of him so easily. He states reluctantly to his wife about the perpetuation of their plan:

> We will proceed no further in this business:
> He hath honoured me of late, and I have bought
> Golden opinions from all sorts of people,
> Which would be worn now in their newest gloss,
> Not cast aside so soon. (I.vii.31–35)

Macbeth knows that others deem him a courageous and loyal warrior, and the high rank recently bestowed on him by Duncan satisfies his ambition to some extent. It is a pity to lose this status so soon through regicide. Hence, when he commits the murder of Duncan, he and his wife decide to display a being-for-others that is quite different from their real subjective self which they have created for themselves through choosing evil. They assume a guise of honesty, kindness, and friendliness to beguile others and sustain the good view that others previously had of Macbeth. But they themselves realise that this identity is a counterfeit and belongs to the past; besides, since Macbeth kills others and makes them his slaves, they cannot confirm his self-identity.

Macbeth acknowledges that others are very influential on his idea about his self and that they make up a significant portion of his identity which cannot simply be disregarded or discarded. As Andy Mousley in *Re-Humanising Shakespeare* (2007) asserts,

> The self thus also becomes "dangerous" and a source of anxiety. As in *Othello* and *The Merchant of Venice*, "others" are or become part of the self, and the boundaries separating outsiders from insiders are fragile. This means that the "self" is itself not a safe place and that interiors, such as the castle, are not immune from the wildness and instability associated with the heath and the witches. (103)

Even though others' attitudes are very significant for Macbeth, these opinions do not have enough compelling force to hamper him from committing murder since the power of ambition is greater in him. However, his later unceasing efforts to camouflage his evil deeds prove that he is trying to flee from the anger and retaliation of others.

Others and their outlook are also very consequential in Macbeth's process of self-formation in terms of what Sartre calls the concept of the Look as he feels great shame and self-disgust thinking about the possibility that others find out what he is going to do. As early as Act 1 Scene 4, when Duncan declares that "signs of nobleness, like *stars*, shall

shine on all deservers" and he obliquely refers to Macbeth, the latter himself points out in his aside:

> . . . *Stars*, hide your fires;
> Let not light see my black and deep desires.
> The eye wink at the hand; yet let that be
> Which the eye fears, when it is done, to see. (I.iv.50–53; emphasis added)

Ironically both characters use the word "stars" which may reveal not the sign of nobleness in Macbeth's demeanour but treason, and his obsession with the words "eye" and "hand" shows his fear of the penetrating gaze of others and their power of judgment and objectification. Even Lady Macbeth who has no moral scruples like those of Macbeth is afraid of the gaze and judgment of others:

> . . . Come thick night,
> And pall thee in the dunnest smoke of hell,
> That my keen knife see not the wound it makes,
> Nor heaven peep through the blanket of the dark
> To cry, "Hold, hold". (I.v.48–52)

She desires to flee from others' looks including even that of heaven and from the very knife that is going to be utilised for the murder, and even from Macbeth's and her own conscience. Meanwhile, when in Act 1 Scene 7 Macbeth meditates about the probable consequences of the murder of Duncan, he again thinks of others' judgments and is afraid of it:

> . . . But in these cases,
> We still have judgement here, that we but teach
> Bloody instructions, which being taught, return
> To plague th'inventor. (I.vii.7–10)

Examples of Macbeth's anxiety over the judgmental look of others are abundant in the play, another one of which is that before the murder of Duncan, when his imagination stages the murder in his mind through an illusory dagger, he visualises a dark bloody night full of witchcraft and wickedness, and wishes the earth not to witness his crime:

> . . . Thou sure and firm-set earth,
> Hear not my steps, which way they walk, for fear
> Thy very stones prate of my whereabout,
> And take the present horror from the time,
> Which now suits with it. . . . (II.i.56–61)

Macbeth has even lost the support of nature: "Nature is no longer an ally or source of protection for the man that he is become" (Boleyn 10). He not only shuns the penetrating gaze of others on the wickedness of his act, but he also abstains from this gaze in his own conscience which torments him so much. Consequently, he attempts to equivocate to escape from the plaguing look of conscience. The phrase "the eye wink at the hand" denotes an impossible act that cannot be done, but what does Macbeth suggest by using this phrase? Lamia Kabal remarks that

> He wants to be successful; he wants to see the result of the murder, yet does not want to set eyes on his act. Then he could shut the self-objectified critical gaze witnessing the action of the "hand" which makes him a "contemptible" man who is not anywhere near the ideal figure his eyes would like to perceive: his crime is not something he wants to share with his better self. (862)

After he finally carries out the murder albeit reluctantly, he again imagines that his hands are plucking out his eyes; this illusory vision denotes his strong desire to evade and suppress the reproaching gaze of his own eyes which are witness to his malicious deed. The fact that immediately after the first murder he is afraid of any noise and is obsessed with washing the blood from his hands denotes his strong fear of the gaze of others and their knowledge of his guilt. Lady Macbeth first believes that a little water may wash away the blood and the resulting accusation, but later she also becomes obsessed with the removal of the blood from her hands and the impossibility of such a wish.

After the appearance of Banquo's ghost at his feast, Macbeth perceives that he could no longer conceal his crimes from the judging view of others and that his shameful exposure is inevitable. He points out: "If charnel-houses and our graves must send / Those that we bury back, our monuments / Shall be the maws of kites" (III.iv.68–70). The grave no longer veils the body of the dead from the look of the living, and thus it betrays the murderer. Macbeth still tries to evade his exposure; he imagines that Banquo's ghost is looking at him accusingly and 'shakes its gory locks' to reproach him for his crime in front of others (III.iv.48–49). However, Macbeth attempts to comfort himself by considering that since the ghost "has no speculation in [its] eyes" (III.iv.93), it cannot look at him with a penetrating and accusing gaze. This comfort, however, is in vain: "The blankness of their gaze serves as a speculum (Latin for mirror), reflecting and exposing a 'truthful' image of himself and the guilt he has been trying to conceal from the world and himself" (Kabal 863).

The strategy that the Macbeths apply to flee from the sense of shame and self-disgust resulting from their heinous actions is assuming a false face to delude others into still regarding them as honest and virtuous people. Therefore, their being-for-others is in stark contrast with their real subjective self. As Duncan states, "There's no art / To find the mind's construction in the face" (I.vi.12–13). Lady Macbeth advises his husband to assume a bogus face to beguile others: ". . . bear welcome in your eye, / Your hand, your tongue; look like the innocent flower, / But be the serpent under't" (I.v.62–64). They exhibit an atmosphere of profound hospitability for Duncan in their house so that he regards the place as "a pleasant seat" (I.vi.1). And when Macbeth finally decides to commit the act of murder, he himself refers to the discrepancy between his subjective self and his being-for-others or social self: "Away, and mock the time with fairest show: / False face must hide what the false heart doth know" (I.vii.82–83). When later he finds himself and his wife in the perilous situation of being betrayed for their heinous actions and this fear intensifies his stress and self-torture, he says:

> Unsafe the while, that we must lave
> Our honours in these flattering streams,
> And make our faces vizards to our hearts,
> Disguising what they are. (III.ii.33–36)

The instances of the false guise of being-for-others that the Macbeths display for the public are so frequent in the play that only a few of them can be investigated here. When others are informed about the murder of Duncan, Macbeth, appearing so mournful, announces that he immediately killed Duncan's guards who were apparently his murderers, and that he did that out of his deep love and loyalty toward Duncan:

> Who can be wise, amazed, temperate and furious,
> Loyal and neutral, in a moment? No man.
> The expedition of my violent love
> Outrun the pauser, reason. . . . (II.iii.108–111)

He stresses his losing reason, patience, and self-restraint due to his ardent love for Duncan. When he decides to kill Banquo through two hired murderers who must "mask the business from the common eye for sundry weighty reasons," he conceals it even from his wife and demands her to pay special attention to Banquo during the feast, and she advises him to show a happy and bright face in front of others. The bond between Macbeth and his wife gets weaker toward the end of the play and they become more alienated from one another. According to Andrew C. Bradley in *Shakespearean Tragedy*, "[t]hinking of the change in him, we imagine the bond between them slackened, and Lady Macbeth left much alone" (375). During the banquet, Macbeth again hypocritically appears to be frustrated at the strange absence of Banquo from the feast while he knows that Banquo is now dead because of his own command:

> Here had we now our country's honour roofed,
> Were the graced person of our Banquo present,
> Who may I rather challenge for unkindness
> Than pity for mischance. (III.iv.38–41)

Lady Macbeth manages to avert his betrayal during the banquet by assuming a double face and attributing his fits of madness to an old illness rather than the observation of Banquo's ghost. The scene where Banquo's ghost appears is one of the most interesting scenes of the play since in it, Macbeth reveals both his being-for-itself and his being-for-others simultaneously. He behaves normally when the ghost is absent, but when it reappears, he loses his mind and is unable to camouflage his subjective self under the cover of his being-for-others, and thus he exposes himself:

> [His real self to the ghost:] Avaunt, and quit my sight! Let the earth hide thee. (III.iv.91)
>
> [His disguised self:] Do not muse at me, my most worthy friends,
> I have a strange infirmity, which is nothing
> To those that know me. Come, love and health to all[.] (III.iv.83–85)

As we get closer to the end of the play, after the ambiguous assurance he receives from the witches about his invincibility, and when their heinous deeds are discovered by the

public, the Macbeths show less effort in concealing their intentions and actions under the guise of a virtuous being-for-others.

From the above discussion, it is concluded that others' opinions are significant for Macbeth, but he increasingly perceives that he cannot veil his crimes from others as they start to question his loyalty and honour, and this creates a sense of alienation and fear in him. Of course, the sense of fear and remorse from his first murder presents itself even before it receives any suspicion from others; he appears after the murder of Duncan exactly like a human being (and not a demon) that has done a terrible thing to his own soul and self and hence is extremely shocked due to its recognition. As E. A. J. Honigmann notes, "he sees the blood on his hands, and he scarcely knows whether it is Duncan's blood or his own, just as he seems confused as to whether he has murdered Duncan, or Sleep, or himself" (128). All in all, shortly after the murder of Duncan, his sons seem to be suspicious of Macbeth's probable role in the murder:

> MALCOLM . . .
> To show an unfelt sorrow is an office
> Which the false man does easy. . . . (II.iii.136–137)
>
> DONALBAIN . . .
> . . . Where we are,
> There's daggers in men's smiles; the near in blood,
> The nearer bloody. (II.iii.139–141)

Also Banquo, despite being his old friend and present adviser, was similarly suspicious of his probable function in the murder: "Thou hast it now, King, Cawdor, Glamis, all / As the weïrd women promised, and I fear / Thou played'st most foully for't" (III.i.1–3). Or let us take the ironic comments of Lennox on the intelligence of Macbeth in arranging everything so that his crimes could remain cloaked, and the blame would fall on others:

> Things have been strangely borne. The gracious Duncan
> Was pitied of Macbeth; marry, he was dead.
> And the right-valiant Banquo walked too late,
> Whom you may say, if't please you, Fleance killed,
> For Fleance fled: men must not walk too late.
> . . .
> He has borne all things well[.] . . . (III.vi.3–17)

In the conversation between Malcolm and Macduff, Malcolm speaks about the wickedness of Macbeth clearly: "This tyrant, whose sole name blisters our tongues, / Was once thought honest" (IV.iii.12–13). He declares that under the tyrannical sovereignty of Macbeth, no one in Scotland can live securely and that he is assassinating everyone who opposes his authority:

> . . . The dead man's knell
> Is there scarce asked for who, and good men's lives
> Expire before the flowers in their caps,
> Dying or ere they sicken. (IV. iii. 170–173)

When Macbeth ruthlessly massacres Macduff's innocent family and commits his subsequent bloody deeds, he no longer attempts to display a different being-for-others since it does not function anymore. His wife in the sleepwalking scene also betrays their crimes by unconsciously revealing them in her utterances, and finally, she commits suicide to end her torture. After his being-for-itself becomes known to everyone, Macbeth loses his former friends and faithful subjects, and now all obey him due to dread, not respect or love. He gets entirely isolated from people and feels the unfitness of the robe of power on his body:

> CAITHNESS . . .
> Some say he's mad; others, that lesser hate him,
> Do call it valiant fury; but for certain,
> He cannot buckle his distempered cause
> Within the belt of rule.
>
> ANGUS Now does he feel
> His secret murders sticking on his hands;
> . . .
> Those he commands move only in command,
> Nothing in love. Now does he feel his title
> Hang loose about him, like a giant's robe
> Upon a dwarfish thief.
>
> MENTEITH Who, then, shall blame
> His pestered senses to recoil and start,
> When all that is within him does condemn
> Itself for being there. (V.ii.13–25)

The image of the unfitness of the robe of power has been mentioned several times in this tragedy, and it denotes its significance from Shakespeare's point of view. Menteith refers to an interesting fact about Macbeth: Even his own self denies belonging to him and his madness results from this chaos in self-identity. Macbeth either kills others or makes them his slaves so that no one can confirm his identity, and thus his self-identity is at potential risk: He cannot know himself and does not know what kind of person he really is. When his hypocritical guise does not operate anymore, he encounters the reality of his new self and the futility of his whole life and endeavours. He laments after his wife's death:

> Tomorrow, and tomorrow, and tomorrow,
> Creeps in this petty pace from day to day,
> To the last syllable of recorded time;
> And all our yesterdays have lighted fools
> The way to dusty death. . . . (V.v.18–22)

Macbeth betrays his deep grief over his new self and absurd life, and as Asloob Ahmad Ansari in *The Existential Dramaturgy of William Shakespeare* asserts, "[l]ife as an absurd phenomenon, not reducible to any logical coherence or pattern, and with anti-reason as its substratum, is what is projected unmistakably in this soliloquy" (136). However, he decides not to flee from his enemies and thus fights to the last moment although he discerns that he has been tricked by the witches' equivocal comments, and he has ruined his whole life.

Conclusion

This article discussed the issue of Sartrean inter-subjectivity and the concept of the Look in the tragedy of *Macbeth*. Macbeth, affected by the ambitious prophecies of the Weird Sisters and the persuasive consciousness of his own wife, decides to gain power through regicide. Sartre considers the look of others as objectifying and alienating which causes in one the sense of shame and self-disgust. The Macbeths are confronted with such feelings as a result of their awareness of others' presence or the presence of their own conscience; hence, they attempt to conceal their first and subsequent crimes from the objectifying look of others by assuming a being-for-others that is different from their real self or their being-for-itself. In this way, they try to shun the sense of shame. As Ewan Fernie in her *Shame in Shakespeare* (2002) asserts, "[w]hat the moral or religious person feels to be shameful is what is wicked or impious, rather than what is simply dishonorable and degrading. This sense of shame is also tragically lacking in the protagonists in *Macbeth*, although it reasserts itself in dreams" (226). The feeling of shame in the Macbeths is not spiritual but secular, and it is due to the loss of honour and grace in the eyes of others and not to the loss of faith and grace before God.

They try various strategies to hide their guilt from others, but when their tactics and guise are not useful anymore, they face the reality of their heinous deeds and the futility of their life. They lose their former friends and are obliged to accept death. Since Macbeth kills many people or makes them his slaves, they do not confirm his self-identity, and in the last stage of his life, Macbeth is so despondent that he cannot know himself and he feels like a stranger. He shuns the wicked identity that he has devised for himself.

From the above discussion, it can be concluded that others' presence can have both positive and negative impacts on one's identity formation. By sensing the presence of others, we can pay more attention to our behaviours and to the right and acceptable ways of conduct. However, it may cause some people to get obsessed with this fact or assume a hypocritical guise to hide their actions from others. And in the Macbeths, the second alternative occurred.

Works Cited

Ansari, Asloob Ahmad. *The Existential Dramaturgy of William Shakespeare*. The Edwin Mellen, 2010.

Bradley, Andrew C. *Shakespearean Tragedy Lectures on Hamlet, Othello, King Lear, Macbeth*. 2nd ed., Macmillan, 1924.

Bloom, Harold. *Bloom's Modern Critical Interpretations William Shakespeare's* Macbeth. New edition, Infobase, 2010.

Boleyn, Vivian. *The Existential Macbeth*. Ball State University, 8 May 1972, https://cardinalscholar.bsu.edu/server/api/core/bitstreams/57e3ec54-7ed4-46fe-af81-aaa80c6dfdac/content. Accessed 4 Feb. 2024.

Detmer, David. *Sartre Explained from Bad Faith to Authenticity*. Carus, 2008.

Fernie, Ewan. *Shame in Shakespeare*. Routledge, 2002.

Honigmann, E. A. J. *Shakespeare: Seven Tragedies Revisited: The Dramatist's Manipulation of Response.* Palgrave, 2002.

Howell, Maria L. *Manhood and Masculine Identity in William Shakespeare's* The Tragedy of Macbeth. UP of America, 2008.

Huang, Min. "A Battle Against One's Soul: An Analysis of Lady Macbeth's Functions as the Other Self to Macbeth." *International Journal of English Linguistics*, vol. 12, no. 5, 2022, pp. 89–94. doi:10.5539/ijel.v12n5p89.

Hughes, Daniel E. "The 'Worm of Conscience' in *Richard III* and *Macbeth*." *The English Journal*, vol. 55, no. 7, 1966, pp. 845–52. doi:10.2307/812167.

Kabal, Lamia. "Macbeth's Conscience and Moralizing Imagination." *International Journal of Social Sciences and Education Research*, vol. 1, no. 3, 2015, pp. 851–64. doi:10.24289/ijsser.279163.

Mousley, Andy. *Re-Humanising Shakespeare: Literary Humanism, Wisdom and Modernity*. Edinburgh UP, 2007.

Sartre, Jean-Paul. *Being and Nothingness*. Translated by Sarah Richmond. Routledge, 2018.

Shakespeare, William. *The Arden Shakespeare Complete Works*. Edited by Richard Proudfoot et al. The Arden Shakespeare, 2021.

Disclosure Statements

- The authors of this article confirm that this research does not require a research ethics committee approval.
- The authors of this article confirm that their work complies with the principles of research and publication ethics.
- No potential conflict of interest was reported by the authors.
- This article was screened for potential plagiarism using a plagiarism screening program.
- Contribution rate: 1st author=80% – 2nd author=20%.

IDEAS: JOURNAL OF ENGLISH LITERARY STUDIES
RESEARCH ARTICLE – ARAŞTIRMA MAKALESİ
DOI: 10.62352/ideas.1451795
2024, VOL. 4, NO. 1, 13–26

English Language and Literature
Research Association of Türkiye

A Comparative Analysis of Existentialism and Mysticism in Line with Jungian Individuation in Virginia Woolf's and Iris Murdoch's Selected Works

Aleyna DURMUŞ

Muğla Sıtkı Koçman University, Türkiye

Abstract: Against the backdrop of transitions that were witnessed throughout the era, the twentieth century was marked by social unrest and existential concerns. In an era identified as a rupture from the linearity of history, modernist writers sought to communicate and compensate for the loss of meaning that was immanent, attempting to address the multifaceted and intricate nature of the human condition. There emerged the exploration of the individual standing for the community, the dynamic of which can be traced in most of Virginia Woolf's novels in the first part of the twentieth century. It is in the following wave of literary works where this existentialist viewpoint the individual was grappling with branches out into the mystical, a recurrent theme in Iris Murdoch's works. The comparative analysis of these writers' selected works, notably Woolf's *Between the Acts* and Murdoch's *The Bell*, thus, explores the themes of the process of self-exploration and integration against the prevailing sense of angst and chaos. With an interdisciplinary comparative analysis combining psychology, philosophy, and literature, the article seeks to shed light on Woolf's and Murdoch's explorations of human existence and their projections in the modernist scheme. Murdoch's philosophical framework, her insights into the mystical aspects of existence, Woolf's narrative techniques, and the tracing of certain imageries existent in the novels lay the groundwork for tracing the "night sea journey" of the hero: a process of transformation of the individual from solipsistic standpoint to a broader, Platonic understanding of the world, the modern hero's journey from existential fragmentation to mystical integration.

Keywords:

20th-century British novel, Existentialism, Mysticism, Virginia Woolf, Irish Murdoch

Article History:

Received:
13 Mar. 2024

Accepted:
04 May 2024

Virginia Woolf'un ve Iris Murdoch'un Seçili Eserlerinde Jungcu Bireyleşme Süreci Bağlamında Varoluşçuluk ve Mistisizmin Karşılaştırmalı Analizi

Öz: Dönem boyunca tanık olunan geçiş süreçlerinin arka planında, toplumsal huzursuzluk ve varoluşsal kaygılar yirminci yüzyıla damgasını vurmuştur. Tarihin doğrusallığından bir kopuş olarak tanımlanan bu dönemde, modernist yazarlar, insanlığın içinde bulunduğu halin çok katmanlı ve karmaşık doğasını ele almaya çalışarak, içkin olan anlam kaybını ifade etmeye ve bu kaybı telafi etmeye çalışmışlardır. Yirminci yüzyılın ilk yarısında Virginia Woolf'un pek çok romanında dinamiği izlenebilen, toplumu temsil eden bireyin keşfi bu dönemde ortaya çıkmıştır. Bireyin mücadele

Anahtar Sözcükler:

20. yüzyıl İngiliz romanı, Varoluşçuluk, Mistisizm, Virginia Woolf, Irish Murdoch

CONTACT: Aleyna Durmuş, Res. Assist. (https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6750-4244)
Muğla Sıtkı Koçman University, Department of Western Languages and Literatures,
Muğla, Türkiye, aleynadurmus@mu.edu.tr

CC BY

ettiği bu varoluşçu bakış açısının Iris Murdoch'un eserlerinde tekrar eden bir tema olan mistik olana doğru dallanıp budaklandığı nokta ise bir sonraki edebî eser dalgasıdır. Woolf'un *Perde Arası* ve Murdoch'un *Çan* adlı eserleri başta olmak üzere, bu yazarların seçilmiş eserlerinin karşılaştırmalı analizi, yaygın olan kaygı ve karmaşa duygusuna karşı bireyin kendini keşfetme ve bütünleşme süreci temalarını ele almaktadır. Psikoloji, felsefe ve edebiyatı birleştiren disiplinler arası karşılaştırmalı bir analizle, bu makale Woolf ve Murdoch'ın insan varlığına ilişkin keşiflerine ve bunların modernist şemadaki izdüşümlerine ışık tutmayı amaçlamaktadır. Murdoch'un felsefi çerçevesi, varoluşun mistik boyutlarına dair içgörüleri, Woolf'un anlatım teknikleri, romanlarda var olan çeşitli imgelerin keşfi, kahramanın "gece deniz yolculuğu"nun izini sürmek için uygun bir zemin sağlamaktadır: bu, bireyin solipsistik bakış açısından daha geniş, Platonik dünya anlayışına doğru bir dönüşüm süreci, modern kahramanın varoluşsal parçalanmadan mistik bütünleşmeye doğru yolculuğudur.

Makale Geçmişi:

Geliş Tarihi:
13 Mart 2024

Kabul Tarihi:
04 Mayıs 2024

How to Cite: Durmuş, Aleyna. "A Comparative Analysis of Existentialism and Mysticism in Line with Jungian Individuation in Virginia Woolf's and Iris Murdoch's Selected Works." *IDEAS: Journal of English Literary Studies*, vol. 4, no. 1, 2024, pp. 13–26.

Introduction

The twentieth century was an era of expediated social, economic, political change and innovations, some of which were heralded from the previous century, while others were simply unforeseen ones. The medium of literary modernism mirrored the playground for experimentations and multidisciplinary explorations in psychology, philosophy, sociology as it came to be emblematic of the time. Modernist writers, under the influence of war as well as the lost national and individual identity that was deeply rooted in the previous century, sought to portray this sense of a world and history of meaning gone missing. Mentioning the modern individual's search for meaning, Jung states that

> the values and strivings of those past worlds no longer interest him save from the historical standpoint. Thus he has become "unhistorical" in the deepest sense and has estranged himself from the mass of men who live entirely within the bounds of tradition. Indeed, he is completely modern only when he has come to the very edge of the world, leaving behind him all that has been discarded and outgrown, and acknowledging that he stands before a void out of which all things may grow. (*Modern Man* 197)

Opposed to the traditional paths and tools not applicable to the novel condition, modern individuals refused to shoulder the burden of the past, relics of the past; instead, they were engaged in other, newer, and more authentic ways that were unfamiliar to the past and that could render the complexities of the reality and the human experience somewhat

comprehendible in the face of prevailing chaos and despair. The modern stage is characterised, in Iris Murdoch's (1919–1999) words, by a reigning "anxious modern consciousness" succeeded by "deep confidence" in religion and society (*Existentialists* 234). In this regard, Virginia Woolf's (1882–1941) *Between the Acts* (1941) and Murdoch's *The Bell* (1958), among others, probe into the theme of integrated, unitary identity very much like the discovery of a long-lost pearl in the twentieth century. Even though the main argument of the article will be supported with other works of fiction and nonfiction by the same authors along with the exploration of certain imageries as baselines, the aforementioned novels stand as ultimate testimonies to the fabric of narrative that explores the intricate and profound themes such as post-war existentialism. Woolf's stream-of-consciousness technique reveals the thread-like nature that is the existential experience of individual in a community, or *vice versa*, expounding on each component of the reality that it manifests in great detail. Murdoch, on the other hand, creates a universe where the mystical and the existential come together with the adoption of her background in philosophy that offers deeper insights and readings into the main challenges that stand at the nexus of self-discovery and the mystery of the cosmos. Murdoch's fiction possesses Woolfian echoes in its structure, narrative, and style. The common vantage point of the Jungian individuation that the characters from both writers' works are confronted with will be supported by relevant theoretical analysis of the solipsistic existential anxieties of the individual, both spatial and temporal. This study will also attempt to unveil the rich tapestry of these works by analysing the imagery of the net. Combining these two authors' writings, there emerges a world that is not content with the surface reality and conventional stories told about the human experience but digs deeper at the meaning of the human soul. The call of the bell and the quest for individuation are then explored in a modernist framework, from existential outbursts of a missing creator to a panoramic integration and inter-connectedness with the external world.

Woolf's writing falls roughly under the early twentieth century while Murdoch's covers the mid-twentieth century and can be classified as post-war fiction. Even though Murdoch started publishing in the 1950s, a few years after Woolf's passing away, there is a connection between the two writers, where the former can be observed to continue a modernist tradition which can be evidenced by the common usage of certain experimental, thematic, and stylistic parallels across their writings. Both authors found themselves drawn to the subjective realities of their characters, the intricate details of interpersonal relations, as well as the scrutinising of philosophical concepts. Citing Erich Auerbach, Peter Edgerly Firchow traces the portrayal of consciousness or subjectivity in fiction and concludes that its initiation dates back to the writings in early nineteenth-century France, and that this legacy was carried onwards by novelists such as Henry James (1843–1916), James Joyce (1882–1941), and Woolf in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries (160). Connecting this tradition with Murdoch, he further remarks, "that Murdoch wants her readers to be aware that she too is writing in this tradition is

evident from her playful allusion near the beginning of *The Bell* to Woolf's classic essay on the 'new' way to depict character in fiction" (160). Building on the analogies that will be expounded on in the following sections of this analysis, he draws style similarities. At the beginning of the novel, Dora gets on a train and enters into a compartment with a bundle of people of different ages and genders, and Firchow, tracing the modernist writer's influence, states that the situation is symbolic of a "'Woolfian' experience of others" (160).

The backbone for the argument of this paper is obtained from Murdoch's 1997 collection of philosophical and literary essays, *Existentialists and Mystics: Writings on Philosophy and Literature*, where she makes revolutionary contributions at the intersection of literary and philosophical scenes. On the solipsistic worldview of what she calls the existential and the mystical, she deftly explores how the mystical self fits into the shifting landscape and evolving ideologies of the modern age, offering insight into how the protagonist's journey mirrors Murdoch's own philosophical shift from harbouring an existential angst to a Platonist welcoming of connectivity, and eventually standing by the mystical texture of existence needed for the integration the individual self. In her article "Existentialists and Mystics," she states:

> Whereas the existentialist hero is an anxious man trying to impose or assert or find himself, the mystical hero is an anxious man trying to discipline or purge or diminish himself. The chief temptation of the former is egoism, of the latter masochism. . . . the existentialist thought that what was valuable was freedom, thought of as will-power. The mystic thought that what was valuable was spirit, magnetic and remote. (*Existentialists* 236–40)

This contrast of the existential and mystical standpoints for the self and its wider resonance in the greater scheme, *i.e.* the universe, offers a road map where the existentialist that asserts his sense of self in a state of anguish, anxiety, and self-interest finds his way to the mystic who, beyond the bounds of the ego, seeks to transcend it as well as gain spiritual insight, in connection and integration with something larger. In another essay titled "Against Dryness," she reiterates the "return from the self-centered concept of sincerity to the other-centered concept of truth" (*Existentialists* 300). She highlights the pursuit of freedom and truth in a world devoid of any intrinsic meaning or purpose that the existentialists have taken on to decipher, in a matter that is self-absorbed, and replaces it with all-encompassing attention and intention, the mystical unification achieved through the transcending of the mundane, along with the loss of the self as one is cognizant of it.

Answering the Call in Murdoch's Selected Works

Within this framework, archetypal and mythical tracing provides insights into the deeper and complex dynamics of the journeys taken by the characters in *The Bell* and *Under the Net* (1954). In *The Bell*, answering the call of the bell takes place as the narration points to the changes in the landscape, the surrounding world, and the autumnal decay (*TB* 175), hinting at the disclosure of the dark recesses of the resident members' psyches. As the

days advance, the narrator states that "the dusty illusions of late summer were giving place to the golden beauties of autumn, sharper and more poignantly ephemeral" (*TB* 292), all the same, heralding the treasures that are to be excavated from the bottom of a lake that had gone too long without stirring of some sort, and without a probing or in-depth inquiry into the internal workings of one's own inner landscape. The portrayal of the atmosphere and setting continues as the days are reported to be colder and accompanied by fog, with a "perpetual haze" (*TB* 311) lingering upon the surface of the lake. Deserted by all members belonging to society, a rather "curious, dream-like peace" (*TB* 312) descents on Imber Court, establishing the proper space for inquisition that, this time, is stripped of its dogmatic religious connotations and solely points to the personal responsibility of the individual. Peter Conradi mentions that the Court is a "*hortus conclusus*" that "is a Platonic map of degrees of unselfing" (147). Contributing to this process of unselfing, to be alluded to within the analysis of the hero's "night sea journey" from existential to a mystical framework, this environment offers the necessary space for the character's internal awakenings as well as the eventual integration.

In the novel, there is a tripartite journey of self-integration taking place at varying degrees through the narration of characters such as Dora, Toby, and Michael. Firchow touches on the novel's Bildungsroman aspect; on account of Dora and Toby, he puts forward that "both characters are young, attractive, and unformed; both are looking for answers . . . as to how to live their lives, which is why a good deal of the novel . . . reads like a Bildungsroman" (167). The multiplicity of voices in the novel calls for a common tracing of subjectivities and perspectives of otherwise distinct individuals. Firchow further traces an analogue to Mrs Ramsay in Woolf's *To the Lighthouse* (1927), and citing Auerbach, he states that the fundamental feature of the approach conveyed by Woolf is that instead of focusing on a single individual whose consciousness is voiced, we are presented with a multitude of characters, whose consciousnesses tend to be switched; this wide range of people indicates that, ultimately, we are faced with an attempt to investigate an objective reality and Dora is, in a sense, surrounded by the content of all the different consciousnesses that are centred around her (qtd. in Firchow 165). Through these narratives and discourses around the diverse forms of maturation occurring in the novel, the foundation for Michael's perspective is laid, and from a novelistic perspective, these two characters' function is to pave the way for the reader's encounter with Michael's consciousness (167–68). Thus, building up to the events that unravel in two-thirds of the novel, Michael's and Dora's journeys, especially that of the former, are singled out and analysed within the provided framework.

After losing Toby and bearing witness to Nick's suicide, Michael's timeline, the depth as well as the sincerity of his self-introspection escalate and unfold on another level. On the journey for self-maturation, the very call for self-knowledge, Jung underlines the importance of confession (*Modern Man* 35) and expands on the concept as a gateway through which the individual can become one with his/her shadow. In *The Bell*, after the old bell has been resurfaced and the community disbands due to a scandal that is

reflective of society, another scandal is yet to be disclosed until Michael talks to the Abbess finally and confesses. Joseph Campbell draws attention to the image of the bell stating that

> This is a supreme statement of the great paradox by which the wall of the pairs of opposites is shattered and the candidate admitted to the vision of the God, who when he created man in his own image created him male and female. In the male's right hand is held a thunderbolt that is the counterpart of himself, while in his left *he holds a bell, symbolizing the goddess*. The thunderbolt is both the method and eternity, *whereas the bell is "illumined mind*"; its note is the beautiful sound of eternity that is heard by the pure mind throughout creation, and therefore within itself. (158; italics added)

The individual is on trial for spiritual growth and expansion, eventually paving the way for one's individuation through the pursuit of harmony and balance between the feminine and masculine. The symbolic reading of the bell in line with the resurfacing of the old one promises the elimination of the social corruption that insidiously crept into Imber as well and the reconciliation with one's own internal compass. Characters like Dora and Michael in the novel deal with tensions arising from material aspirations as well as the call of the self. The symbol of the bell, then, can be read as a harbinger of a quest for deeper insight and truth mirroring Campbell's individuation journey of illumination. From this point on, Michael's quest, though side-by-side in narration with Dora's, is revealed to be more intricate than her evidently upscaling and flourishing journey. Quite contrary to what he would suggest to Dora on the account of her marriage with Paul in society, Michael finds his opinion in solitude and glimpses at the disastrous nature of the match: "his present views were perhaps heterodox, his vision distorted and his powers of judgement diseased" (*TB* 313–14). In another article titled "On God and Good" which deals with the authentically instructive influence of great art, Murdoch states that it

> teaches us how real things can be looked at and loved without being seized and used, without being appropriated into the greedy organism of the self. This exercise of detachment is difficult and valuable whether the thing contemplated is a human being or the root of a tree or the vibration of a colour or a sound. Unsentimental contemplation of nature exhibits the same quality of detachment: selfish concerns vanish, nothing exists except the things which are seen. (*Existentialists* 355)

Addressing the instructive nature of great art, Murdoch also draws attention to the level of detachment one experiences in the face of it; that detachment takes one away from self-serving intentions of greed and possession, and it places the focus on what is seen and therefore can be appreciated under unconditional terms and in connection with the outside world. Michael's situation in this particular instance is not different in terms of the level of detachment he attains in his journey; he goes through days of introspection and silence and eventually comes out on the other side: "it was indeed as if there was very little of him left now. He need not have feared to grow, to thrive upon disaster. He was diminished. Reflection, which justifies, which fabricates hopes, could not do so now for him" (*TB* 321). It is due to this newly acquired detachment and self-inquiry that he gets to review his life as a work of art, "almost as a spectator" (*TB* 322).

In relation to the hero's journey, Campbell underlines the importance of the concept of separation from one's familiar environment as well: "The first step, detachment or withdrawal, consists in a radical transfer of emphasis from the external to the internal world, macro- to microcosm, a retreat from the desperations of the waste land to the peace of the everlasting realm that is within" (16). The novel is rich in philosophical groundwork, and the Sartrean influence in Murdoch's writing often peeks through. Mirroring his basic tenet of existentialism, 'subjectivity,' the voices of the two philosophers, Sartre and Murdoch, are combined when the assertion is put forward that "the good man, therefore, is not the man who unthinkingly obeys the rules but the fallen, flawed man who uncertainly gropes his way toward acting rightly" (Firchow 175). It is the subjective account of Michael's journey and the transfiguration of the universal ideal into this very individuality that paves the way for his own evolution of consciousness into one that is integrated with the world around him (quite similar to the adoption of a Platonic panoramic view). The transition is affirmed by Jung in his *Man and His Symbols* as he states: "Every transformation demands as its precondition 'the ending of a world'—the collapse of an old philosophy of life" (295), and as it is expressed in Campbell's words in *The Hero with a Thousand Faces*, "one by one the resistances are broken. He must put aside his pride, his virtue, beauty and life and bow or submit to the absolutely intolerable" (99). The realisations and repentance of Michael ignite the flames of his old identity and end the world as he knows it, making his transition into the mystical hero that promises freedom and virtue over the allure of a robust, highly-esteemed religious identity in a community.

Tracing the same journey from the standpoint of the existential in Murdoch's fiction, the character of Jake Donaghue is an exemplary protagonist of her first novel *Under the Net.* Full of rather self-absorbed ideas, his perception of the things he encounters around himself resembles that of a peephole. Coming out of a series of events, the most influential of which could be his philosophical discussions with the character Hugo, Raymond J. Porter underlines that "Donaghue comes to realize, what he thought he understood, he did not understand at all. He discovers he really has not known his friends but has projected upon them his own inaccurate, subjective vision of reality" as objective reality as well as pointing to the "picaresque elements, the initiation theme, and the 'philosophies' of the various characters in their relation to" the protagonist's development (379–81). This development and change he goes through from the beginning to the end of the novel, as hinted, comes with an opening of his subjective perception to take in those on the peripheries. Furthermore, Porter draws on the water symbolism and connects the places where Jake spends time with elements that are catalysts of this awakening in the novel: "Water, with its associations of life and *renewal, and breaking and re-forming patterns are suitable elements for a novel of initiation*" (383; italics added). Jake starts the novel with hatred and detestation of contingency but soon develops into a man ready to face the chances and wonders that life might bring upon him. In a way, this water image

is an undercurrent tool that prepares the individual for the fluidity of life and the eternal renewal the self goes through in journeying it.

Familiar to Michael's process in *The Bell*, in *Under the Net,* during one of the Socratic dialogues taking place between Jake and Hugo, the latter states: "for most of us, for almost all of us, truth can be attained, if at all, only in silence. It is in silence that the human spirit touches the divine" (87). It is in this new state of being that Michael, too, can truly become the leader of a spiritual awakening, as he observes and guides Dora's own awakening and coming out of her cave of illusion into the light. In *Under the Net,* coming out on the other side of a realisation similar to Dora's, Jake makes the following remark:

> Events stream past us like these crowds and the face of each is seen only for a minute. What is urgent is not urgent forever but only ephemerally. All work and all love, the search for wealth and fame, the search for truth, like itself, are made up of moments which pass and become nothing. Yet through this shaft of nothings we drive onward with that miraculous vitality that creates our precarious habitations in the past and the future. So we live; a spirit that broods and hovers over the continual death of time, the lost meaning, the unrecaptured moment, the unremembered face, until the final chop that ends all our moments and plunges that spirit back into the void from which it came. (242)

Fittingly, resembling Woolf's *Moments of Being* (1976), the quotation above serves as a connecting link with the next part of the reading, with themes of transience and the ephemeral nature of moments in the face of the passing time. The reverberations of this point spotted by Murdoch are elaborated further in Woolf's aforementioned collection of essays:

> From this I reach what l might call a philosophy; at any rate it is a constant idea of mine; that behind the cotton wool is hidden a pattern; that we—I mean all human beings—are connected with this; that the whole world is a work of art; that we are parts of the work of art. Hamlet or a Beethoven quartet is the truth about this vast mass that we call the world. But there is no Shakespeare, there is no Beethoven; certainly and emphatically there is no God; we are the words; we are the music; we are the thing itself. (20–21)

At the junction of Woolf's statement of underlying patterns hidden in moments, which in Murdoch's case is mentioned as fleeting, there lies an analysis of how these two writers address the challenges that life presents, their reflections upon their art, and the pursuit of meaning in a world characterised by passing moments.

Peeking through the Net as an Enigma

Furthermore, there is a common imagery of the net scattered around the novels under study. In Campbell's aforementioned book, within the narration of a Hindu tale, the net is mentioned as the trap of the ego consciousness (181); the material and the worldly perspective that leads the protagonist to a solipsistic perception of reality. In Murdoch's fiction, the net is often a metaphor referring to something that ensnares or constricts the individual, often under the guise of religion and language. In *The Bell*, Dora encounters

Catherine and hears that she is soon to become a nun in Imber Court, and they converse and exchange smiles through a net. After the scene, it is mentioned that "Dora turned to take one last look at the figure under the net. At the news which she had just heard she felt a horrified surprise, a curious sort of relief, and a more obscure pain, compounded perhaps of pity and of some terror, as if something within herself were menaced with destruction" (*TB* 68). The net that has ensnared Catherine in tune with her complacent demeanour invokes horror and pity in Dora as it foretells a threat, an alarming dissolution of the self. In *Under the Net*, the seeking of truth is in the foreground of the novel and thus, the illusion is traced within the tool of language. An excerpt from "The Silencer," a novel written by Jake, recounting his philosophical dialogues with Hugo, is as follows: "We must be ruled by the situation itself and this is unutterably particular. Indeed it is something to which we can never get close enough, however hard we may try as it were to crawl under the net" (*UTN* 91). In "Iris Murdoch and the Net of Theory," very much in a manner of summarising the situation, George Watson states:

> The net of theory is to be escaped; and we can get out from under language, and its lust to conceptualize and theorize, if we try. We are only the slaves of theory if we choose to be so. After all, we learn other languages, so it cannot really be true to say that we are by necessity imprisoned by one. The world is known by looking as well as listening, in any case, and by a process in which language plays only one part among many; and Deconstruction and other post-structuralist notions were false dogma if only because they were hopelessly word-centered. (499)

Unless it is preceded or even embodied by silence, the truth cannot be obtained in the form of words, and the grim realisation of that leads to a sense of perplexity and ambivalence.

In *Between the Acts* by Virginia Woolf, the image of the net takes on a more literal reading, following a latent context often attributed to animals such as fish and butterflies caught under the net. In one of the evocations of the imagery under study, the nets are full of fish; the ordinary and practical aspects of life are contrasted by Isa's contemplations on the admiration of her natural environment: "They were bringing up nets full of fish from the sea; but Isa was seeing—the garden, variable as the forecast said, in the light breeze. Again, the children passed, and she tapped on the window and blew them a kiss. In the drone of the garden it went unheeded" (*BTA* 23). The latter usage of the imagery of the net as a tool for catching butterflies within the narrative implies an exploration and attainment of deeper insight into the natural world. In *The Waves* (1931), for instance, the discourse of the netted fin circulates throughout the novel. In the introduction of the novel, David Bradshaw touches on the autobiographical elements in Woolf's works and recounts one of the entries in her diaries dated February 1931, when she finished her final draft of the novel that she had netted that fin in the waste of waters that she experienced writing *To the Lighthouse* (xxxvii). Bradshaw continues to explain that with the novel, so much was thrown off balance; standards were turned around; ideas were blown out of proportion; a vast body of knowledge was blasted and was full of lethal holes; and there

was no authority to turn to for the guidance on even the most fundamental of questions (xxxviii). Thus, the net imagery within the framework of *The Waves* is symbolic of Woolf's writing process of the novel. In a novel with such great playfulness of experimentation, she felt like she had captured the key component or rather the essence of what she wanted to convey. Blurring the lines, breaking free from the established traditional structures within the literary realm, and playing with both play and poem together, there is an implication of plumbing into the depths of her unconscious through the reference to waves and the sea, and capturing something of core value that is deep and that breeds connectivity. The fin that was the call for expression was netted, thus it rings not with a constricting tune but with a liberating one involving the individual's journey of self-introspection.

Tracing the Hero: One and Many in Woolf's Fiction

To further highlight the interlacing nature of these writings, it seems fitting to include Jung's following words on the emerging of consciousness, or rather, the awakening within the framework of Woolf's novels:

> In order to characterize it, I must take for comparison the daily course of the sun—but a sun that is endowed with human feeling and man's limited consciousness. In the morning it arises from the nocturnal sea of unconsciousness and looks upon the wide, bright world which lies before it in an expanse that steadily widens the higher it climbs in the firmament. (*Modern Man* 106)

Campbell, too, points to the same reference point of nature as the mark for growth and traces this concept from Sigmund Freud to Jung stating:

> Freud stresses in his writings the passages and difficulties of the first half of the human cycle of life—those of our infancy and adolescence, when our sun is mounting toward its zenith. C. G. Jung, on the other hand, has emphasized the crises of the second portion—when, in order to advance, the shining sphere must submit to descend and disappear, at last, into the night-womb of the grave. (11)

The phases of human existence unfold as the challenges that one faces during the first half of one's life turn to internal confrontations and changes, the former emphasising a physical growth, the latter a spiritual one. The eternal awakening that is implied echoes Woolf's *The Waves* that traces six protagonists from childhood to maturation and the interludes that wrap the novel as a constant and imminent reminder of this potent image of the rising of the sun, as well as the eventual dusk that gives birth to dawn. In Bernard's last soliloquy, he too comes to the unsettling realisation that coming from the complex and many, all that remains is the fact of his "unselfing," the non-existent self, and the "eternal renewal, the incessant rise and fall and fall and rise again" (*TW* 177). In *Between the Acts*, the journey is presented as rather all-inclusive as with the thread of the-stream-of-consciousness narrative, one becomes all, and the compact form of plays that follow one another mimics the history and the ages that come to pass until the contemporary

period. In this case, the existential presents itself in fragments. After the performance of the play, questioning voices from the audience are heard:

> ". . . To return to the meaning—Are machines the devil, or do they introduce a discord … Ding dong, ding … by means of which we reach the final . . . Here's the car with the monkey … Hop in … And good-bye, Mrs. Parker … Ring us up. Next time we're down don't forget … Next time … Next time …"
>
> The wheels scrurred on the gravel. The cars drove off'. (*BTA* 144)

As audiences to Miss La Trobe's plays, individuals are prompted to search for a meaning, to remember the pursuit that seeps into their life, which when they later get distracted is shelved for another time.

The playwright, Miss La Trobe, is an interesting character indeed; she acts as a prompter, a stimulant for the collective awakening. La Trobe writes a historical play, not devoid of its anachronisms or inconsistencies per se, designates actors and décor, setting up the stage for the contemporary audience, and she watches their reactions that get more and more personal as the ages rapidly move onwards. The character herself displays one of the most crucial of roles which is the mirroring of reality in both literal and figurative senses for the audience to witness, the call to seek the truth of one's self in relation to others, even though she is on her knees, behind the bushes while doing so. Campbell claims that the "herald or announcer of the adventure, therefore, is often dark, loathly, or terrifying, judged evil by the world" and continues to state that the herald often takes the form of a beast "representative of the repressed instinctual fecundity within ourselves, or again a veiled mysterious figure—the unknown" (92–93). Here the analogy is figurative and in the twentieth-century pastoral landscape where the story takes place, the "theatre-fiction" with which Woolf once again blurs the lines of literary genres, the condemnation is of a more "civilized" one, often expressed in the form of otherisation and exclusion from society.

Following the same thread, Miss La Trobe's analysis of individual responsibility and society as a collective follows. By holding the mirror up in front of the audience, she challenges her own attempts to put criticism and judgment past her with the acknowledgement that, despite her protestations and ambitions for rebellion, she still conforms to social norms. It is the mirror that is held up to their faces, parts of their body that they are in dire need of integrating, after which the realisation follows that:

> We're all the same. Take myself now. Do I escape my own reprobation, simulating indignation, in the bush, among the leaves? . . . Look at ourselves, ladies and gentlemen! Then at the wall; and ask how's this wall, the great wall, which we call, perhaps miscall, civilization, to be built by (here the mirrors flicked and flashed) *orts, scraps and fragments* like ourselves? (*BTA* 135; italics added)

There the mystical hero, in its communal form, can come in and connect the past with the present, the other with the self in the pastoral setting of the novel. A possible interpretation of the play in the novel could follow, for example, as a ceremonial

performance that takes place outside of the surrounding world. Woolf weaves mystical themes through her reflection on time and the characters' thought processes regarding their history, current state, and their future. In her article "'Dispersed Are We': Mirroring and National Identity in Virginia Woolf's *Between the Acts*," Galia Benziman claims that in the novel "both individuals and society are on a quest for a sense of self" and goes on to state that "they keep telling and retelling themselves stories about the past that incorporate either a sense of unity (the prehistoric) or of separation (the historic)" (59). She further draws attention to the ongoing play, asserting that "the role of the pageant, its acts, and whatever happens between these acts, is a momentous one, supplying the site and the instrument for this collective process of forming the communal self" (59). Emblematic of Barry Stocker's remark that "the novel reaches a limit of some kind in the early twentieth century in works which take the absolute, that is the unity of history, ideas, experience, subjectivity and transcendence" (15), the pageant within the novel acts as a catalyst that dissolves the existential concerns of the fragmented individuals, transcending solipsistic spatial and temporal anxieties and faces them with their spiritual journeys of self-introspection and realisation.

Conclusion

In light of Iris Murdoch's philosophy, notably her collection of essays *Existentialists and Mystics: Writings on Philosophy and Literature*, the tracing of the modern hero from the existential and the fragmented to the mystical and the integrated has been explored within the Jungian framework of individuation. Murdoch's philosophical insight taken from her various works provided the foundation for what Jung calls the "night sea journey" of the hero and the exploration of change and transfiguration, the tracing of these characters' existential journeys as well as the completion of their journey where the descent into the unknown occurs and where they have fended off the challenges with resilience, integrated darker aspects of themselves that had previously been left in the shadows which are now the wings that provide agency for them in the new, integrated chapter of their experience. This leads the individual from solipsistic concerns and focalisation to a Platonic, broader range of understanding of the world. This understanding entails a spiritual or mystical epiphany that transcends egocentric concerns, beyond their intellectual grasp and points to being in a state of harmony with the fundamental truths in life, and existence with others. Murdoch's novels *Under the Net* and *The Bell* both include the weaving of this theme; in the former, it takes place through the character of Jake; whereas in the latter it is through Michael and Dora. As stated by Jung previously, the modern man must become "unhistorical" and must confront the emptiness at the edge of the known world, the void out of which all potential arises if he is to be genuinely modern. The similarities this evokes in Michael's journey aside, Dora, too, goes through an intense existential crisis of identity and meaning upon getting away from the constraints of Imber Court; her existential standpoint by these encounters with the mystical in the form of realisations and introspection is subverted, and she comes to

embrace a broader perspective of existence that goes beyond her own self. Through the characters explored, Murdoch skilfully interweaves mystical components with existentialist themes through symbolism, anchoring philosophical concepts into the narrative, and emphasising the intricate connection between these expounded concepts of existentialism and mysticism when navigating the complexity of human existence.

The expansion and the application of this scheme to Woolf's fiction, and the tracing of the journey of the modern individual as well as of the community, offer a more extensive understanding of the characterisations in her novels such as *The Waves* and *Between the Acts*. For Woolf, the fragmented orbs and pieces come together to make up the whole, as supported by her handling of consciousness through the usage of the stream-of-consciousness technique, where the account of the individual and the subjective comes to form the universal reality, an element common in Murdoch's writing as well. The exploration of the imagery of the net across the works of both novelists, often depicting the constricting experience emblematic of modern consciousness similar to the middle-aged man in T. S. Eliot's (1888–1965) "The Love Song of J. Alfred Prufrock" (1917) who feels like he is pinned down and squirming on the wall. Scrutinised by the eyes of the others, Prufrock is the epitome of society in full command of the modern individual. Woolf's use of this imagery, however, offers a sense of solace implying that in the face of these oppressive structures, through an experimental and nonconforming spirit, the individual can find some accomplishment, however obscure it may be. In Woolf's fiction this motif of becoming "unhistorical" can be observed as extending from the existential, individualistic unit to an acceptance of a communal body that lies in the unknown, the very edge of the world, the involuntary move towards a new unknown in the face of extreme global events, as a prompter into passing that threshold to the new. It points away from the estrangement of the communities that are stuck in the conventions of the past, of the complexities of the present to the potential that exists in the void, the negation, and the leap of faith from the extinguishing fire of the old to the new. Thus, through the exploration of these works, it is concluded that the modern individual can only exist on the other edge of the destruction of the past, of the history of self. This destruction is the only way for the existential individual with solipsistic anxieties to confront the void that awaits him, and away from the individual's limited perceptions and burden of the constraints of the past, it opens up a journey where the characters integrate their darker sides, gain insight through introspection and are in harmony with their surroundings. With the transition to the mystical, their consciousnesses evolve into one integrated with the world, and while they are probing into the meaning of the human soul, there emerges the call of the bell and the quest for individuation in a modernist framework.

Works Cited

Benziman, Galia. "'Dispersed Are We': Mirroring and National Identity in Virginia Woolf's *Between the Acts*." *Journal of Narrative Theory*, vol. 36, no. 1, 2006, pp. 53–71.

Bradshaw, David, editor. Introduction. *The Waves*, by Virginia Woolf. Oxford UP, 2015, pp. xi–xxxix.

Campbell, Joseph. *The Hero with a Thousand Faces.* Princeton UP, 2004.

Conradi, Peter. *The Saint and the Artist: A Study of the Fiction of Iris Murdoch.* HarperCollins, 1986.

Jung, G. Carl. *Man and His Symbols*. Anchor, 1964.

---. *Modern Man in Search of a Soul*. Harcourt Brace, 1933.

Firchow, Peter Edgerly. *Modern Utopian Fictions from H. G. Wells to Iris Murdoch.* The Catholic U of America P, 2007.

Murdoch, Iris. *The Bell.* Vintage Classics, 2004.

---. *Under the Net.* Vintage Classics, 2002.

---. *Existentialists and Mystics: Writings on Philosophy and Literature.* Penguin, 1999.

Porter, Raymond J. "*Leitmotiv* in Iris Murdoch's *Under the Net*." *Modern Fiction Studies,* vol. 15, no. 3, 1969, pp. 379–385.

Stocker, Barry. *Philosophy of the Novel.* Palgrave Macmillan, 2018.

Watson, George. "Iris Murdoch and the Net of Theory." *The Hudson Review*, vol. 51, no. 3, 1998, pp. 490–500. doi:10.2307/3852712.

Woolf, Virginia. *Between the Acts*. Karbon, 2019.

---. *Moments of Being.* Panther, 1978.

---. *The Waves*. Oxford UP, 2015.

Disclosure Statements

- The author of this article confirms that this research does not require a research ethics committee approval.
- The author of this article confirms that their work complies with the principles of research and publication ethics.
- No potential conflict of interest was reported by the author.
- This article was screened for potential plagiarism using a plagiarism screening program.
- Contribution rate: 1st author=100%.

IDEAS: JOURNAL OF ENGLISH LITERARY STUDIES
RESEARCH ARTICLE – ARAŞTIRMA MAKALESİ
DOI: 10.62352/ideas.1439136
2024, VOL. 4, NO. 1, 27–36

English Language and Literature
Research Association of Türkiye

Agency of Urban Space and David Greig's *San Diego* as Soft City

Ömer Kemal GÜLTEKİN

Mehmet Akif Ersoy University, Türkiye

Abstract: Agency of space is a phenomenon not to be ignored. Affecting every entity, it encloses and interacts with gives space a peculiar agency. Without doubt, urban space is a particular space where the interaction between human and space is the densest. Billions of people sustain their lives in urban containers and these containers surrounding them are shaping the lives of its inhabitants. This act of shaping is not only physical but also identity-related. Through the analysis of how the characters are shaped by the eponymous city in David Greig's *San Diego*, this article aims to demonstrate the special relationship between urban space and human beings. While some spatial theories and spatial agency are being stressed prior to reaching any conclusions about this relationship, the similarity between a playwright and an architect will be analysed to highlight that the setting of the play is not a random construction and to demonstrate how the playwright utilises space to shape his characters.

Keywords:

Urban space,
David Greig,
San Diego,
Soft city,
Agency

Article History:

Received:
18 Feb. 2024

Accepted:
05 May 2024

Kentsel Mekânın Eyleyiciliği ve Yumuşak Bir Şehir Olarak David Greig'in *San Diego*'su

Öz: Mekânın eyleyici kapasitesi göz ardı edilmemesi gereken bir olgudur. İçinde bulundurduğu ve etkileşime girdiği her bir varlığa etki etmesi, mekâna kendine has bir eyleyicilik vermektedir. Kentsel mekânlar da şüphesiz insan ve mekân arasındaki etkileşimin en yoğun yaşandığı yerlerdir. Milyarlarca insan artık kentsel konteynırlar içerisinde yaşamını sürdürmektedir ve içinde bulundukları bu konteynırlar onları şekillendirmektedir. Bu şekillendirme sadece fiziksel değil aynı zamanda kimlikseldir. Bu makale, İskoç yazar David Greig'in *San Diego* oyunundaki karakterlerin San Diego şehri tarafından nasıl şekillendirildiğini analiz ederek, kentsel mekân ve insan arasındaki özel ilişkiyi ortaya çıkarmayı amaçlamaktadır. Bu ilişkiye dair sonuçlar çıkarılmadan önce bazı mekânsal teoriler ile mekânın kendine özgü etkinliği vurgulanırken, oyun yazarı ve bir mimar arasındaki benzerlik oyunda şekillendirilen mekânın rastlantısal olmadığını ve yazarın karakterlerini şekillendirmede mekânı nasıl kullandığını vurgulamak icin incelenecektir.

Anahtar Sözcükler:

Kentsel mekân,
David Greig,
San Diego,
Yumuşak şehir,
Eyleyicilik

Makale Geçmişi:

Geliş Tarihi:
18 Şubat 2024

Kabul Tarihi:
05 Mayıs 2024

How to Cite: Gültekin, Ömer Kemal. "Agency of Urban Space and David Greig's *San Diego* as Soft City." *IDEAS: Journal of English Literary Studies*, vol. 4, no. 1, 2024, pp. 27–36.

CONTACT: Ömer Kemal Gültekin, Assist. Prof. Dr. (https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2438-0322)
Mehmet Akif Ersoy University, Department of English Language and Literature,
Burdur, Türkiye, omerkemalgultekin@maku.edu.tr

CC BY

Introduction

With the help of current studies underlining space as a form of reality that has the ability to change, space is stripped of its previous conceptualisation as passive, inert and without any agency. As a result, the interaction between the residents of a space and space itself is deemed to be reciprocal; that is, as individuals possess the ability to shape and structure their surrounding space, so is space endowed with the power to transform the human species. Being the most commonly revisited spaces of our world, and hosting the present bulk of the world population, cities, in this sense, serve as meeting points where urban space demonstrates its effect on its inhabitants' psychology and corporeality. Many modern playwrights employ urban space as the setting of their plays and investigate the relationship between cities and people, like Caryl Churchill (1938–…) in *Not Not Not Not Not Enough Oxygen* (1971) and *Top Girls* (1982), and Jez Butterworth's (1969–…) *Jerusalem* (2009) do. Scottish playwright David Greig (1969–…) is also among the contemporary playwrights sharing an interest in this dense interaction between people and their urban environment in his plays. Greig's dramatic style is heterogeneous, as Clare Wallace identifies, yet it carries certain tendencies like having "distant locations" and "imaginatively displaced" characters (492). One example is surely the urban spaces bringing about lots of complications. More often than not, Greig places his characters in a setting where they profoundly interact with their environment, and urban space usually has a special place in shaping his characters' behaviours and words. In *Europe* (1994), it is a border town hosting a group of refugees and natives, and the changing identity of the town redefines the identity of its short-term or long-term inhabitants. In general, as Verónica Rodríguez argues, "Greig is generally keen on using geographical locations to name his plays" (*David,* 166). Showing Greig's interest in urban space, it is never surprising to see Greig composing a title with the name of real cities like *Damascus* (2007), *Glasgow Girls* (2012), *Kyoto* (2010), *Miniskirts of Kabul* (2010), and the subject of this article, *San Diego* (2003).

In *San Diego* with his eponymous city, Greig creates a "soft city" (2) in Jonathan Raban's words, and his characters keep floating around in search of any kind of grounding experience; in the meantime, it is not only the city that is mapped by the characters in their own mental cosmos, but the characters are also re-identified by the agency of the city. Indeed, the urban setting of the play renounces the idea of being merely a backdrop to the actions of humans and makes itself evident through a series of radiant reflections. Although the relationship between place and characters in *San Diego* has been previously studied to some extent, the agency of urban space in creating identities must be further studied to put the spotlights particularly on the city. Thus, within the framework of theories about urban space developed by Raban, Bernard Tschumi and Teresa Brennan, this article investigates the entanglement of humans and their environment in a metropolitan city and aims to show how *San Diego* unravels the power of a city in remoulding the identity of human beings.

In contrast to the culturally constructed false assumptions, space is not a neutral passive container waiting for the intervention of other living beings. The relationship between bodies and space, as Tschumi contends, is symmetrical; it is not only bodies that "violate" space, space also "violates" bodies (123–26). Taking violence as a metaphor, Tschumi highlights "the intensity of a relationship between individuals and their surrounding spaces" (122). Following up on Tschumi's approach, Stephanie Riker underlines that "the static nature of architecture is severely threatened" (13). While wandering in or around spaces, human bodies leave some marks "by their very presence" as they "violate the balances of a precisely ordered geometry" (123). In other words, they do not have to literally violate the structure of an architecture; their corporeality, as it is, disturbs the equilibrium emerging out of the space. It can be likened to the ring of waves one causes after touching the surface of a pond or lake. In a similar way, space leaves its own impact on and builds an invisible cord with its visitors; and "the place your body inhabits is inscribed in your imagination, your unconscious, as a space of possible bliss. Or menace" (123). Tschumi extends his metaphor as follows: "What if you are forced to abandon your imaginary spatial markings? A torturer wants you, the victim, to regress, because he wants to demean his prey, to make you lose your identity as a subject" (123). Thus, space engulfing the material existence of other bodies functions as an identity marker. It extends beyond the corporeal boundaries of the human body and is involved in the process of identity formation. When one touches the surface of water and generates waves, it is also the water that touches the person's skin and generates visible and invisible effects. Likewise, emphasising the reverberations of space over human conscience and emotions, Brennan's theory of "the transmission of affect" conceives the human subject as a construction of its physical environment. Brennan denies the alleged notion of the human body as a "naturally contained" existence, and takes "physiology," besides "the social and psychological factors" into consideration, when she briefly states that "[t]he 'atmosphere' or the environment literally gets into the individual" (1–2). Affect for Brennan, as Dorian Stuber puts it, is "a force that gets inside us and influences our very bodily workings. Affects can enhance us, when we project them out on to others, or they can deplete us, when we introject them" (4). In a way, these theories offer a very egalitarian approach to the universe by rejecting the binary distinction between human and space/environment/city/architecture.

Soft City and *San Diego*

The city as a spatial formation occupies a unique place different from other smaller structures in the construction of human identity. For Raban, our relationship with the city is a distinct case because "Cities, unlike villages and small towns, are plastic by nature. We mould them in our images: they, in their turn, shape us by the resistance they offer when we try to impose our own personal form on them" (Raban 2). On the one hand, Raban's conceptualisation of the city as vibrant buttresses Brennan's definition of space as a vibrant identity marker "get[ting] into the individual" (Brennan 1) and highlights the

agency of the city shown in the form of resistance. With this regard, the transformation of people migrating into cities has always been a subject of investigation. On the other hand, this argument accentuates the dissimilitude of the imagined cityscape in someone's mind, which Raban refers to as "the soft city of illusion, myth, aspiration, nightmare," and the real object, "the hard city one can locate on maps in statistics, in monographs on urban sociology and demography and architecture" (2). In line with this, Greig's understanding of the material city calls for a coexistence with the fictional world to be complete. For him, "a place doesn't exist until it's written about in fiction," or "a city isn't somehow real until it's been written or made into a film, a novel, or a play" (Rodríguez, "Zāhir and Bātin" 88). While describing Greig's works, Dilek Inan accentuates that "literature provides the readers with richer and more extensive worlds than physical geography" and "David Greig's theater abounds in decoding both real and imaginary places" (107). *San Diego*, in this respect, can be considered an attempt to make the city more real because, as Greig himself puts forward: "despite being such a great place to live, San Diego has featured in almost no fictions, films, novels or plays, but it has . . . 'served as the un-named background for several episodes of *America's Missing Children*'" (7). As such, the city needed a fictional representation to complete its existence from Greig's point of view. The fictional representation Greig created to complete this puzzle is not an idealised form. It is a city of loss. It does not serve people as home and it is not a land of belonging but a place of disconnection and loneliness. Although it lures the characters into its own scope, it does not promise reconnection but it is a dead end.

In essence, the relationship between the city and its inhabitants does not merely consist of the latter constructing the former. It is much more complicated than that; that is, the city also has the power to shape or "get into" the citizens and determine their identity. To further this complication, the reality of the city is not only limited to the "hard" reality of its roads, walls, buildings, and so forth, but it also includes the imagined or the fictional version that can be called the "soft" version. Raban attracts attention to the conflict between these two versions of the city and its consequences on the citizen. From his argument, it can be deduced that the former city may simply be at odds with the latter, and that is why the concurrence of soft and hard from time to time alienates the person from the urban environment. He is transformed into "a balloonist adrift," and he needs "anchors to tether [him] down" (Raban 1). It is the city that provides these points of anchorage, thereby letting the citizens build their own identities. The reality of the city, therefore, cannot be reduced merely to maps or other representations; it is rather a co-existence of the "hard" and the "soft."

Considering the relationship between a human being and the surrounding culture in his famous book *Spaces of Capital: Towards a Critical Geography*, David Harvey attempts to answer a similar question, and the answer is helpful to understand the hard version of San Diego in Greig's play: "Does the collectivity shape the person or does the person shape the collectivity" (200)? Following that, Harvey puts the spotlight on the capitalist mindset:

> In the US, . . . private property and inheritance, market exchange, commodification and monetization, the organization of economic security and social power, all place a premium upon personalized private property vested in the self (understood as a bounded entity, a non-porous individual), as well as in house, land, money, means of production, and the like, as the elemental socio-spatial forms of political-economic life. (200)

This mindset promotes a unilateral approach to urban space and everything is based on human actors owning and shaping whatever is around them. Accordingly, the human self is deemed to be "a bounded" or "non-porous" object, which is totally against the understanding of theoreticians like Brennan, Tschumi and Harvey himself. It is against this capitalist culture that Greig sets his soft city and creates an eye-opening contrast. As it can also be understood from the play, San Diego stands for a sample reflection of capitalist urban culture. With its highways, skyscrapers and luxurious details, the city is the embodiment of what Harvey was listing: "market exchange, commodification and monetization" (200). Yet, the soft version of San Diego is composed by the playwright to seriously reduce the reputation of the capitalist idealisation.

Greig's understanding of city formation in his plays combines the 'soft' and 'hard' versions of urban reality. As mentioned before, he always attaches a representation to its material reality to make it complete. To further the interaction between the former and the latter, Greig adopts an architect-like attitude in his works. He finds maps "appealing" and goes beyond them to create his own personal maps through his plays; he says, "I'm quite interested in finding my way through worlds, and maps are good for that. I think that if we say that the process of making a play is a bit like making a journey into an unknown world, then a big part of that process is kind of making the map, of finding the map" (qtd. in Rodríguez, "Zāhir and Bātin" 88). This process of making/finding turns the playwright into an architect and endows Greig's settings with a special relationship with the characters. As such, the playwright has similar duties to an architect to mould the space of a building or a stage. This is why Tschumi's definition aligns the architect with a playwright: "The architect designs the set, writes the script, and directs the actors" as long as "architectural spaces and programs can become totally interdependent" (128). The architect does not only design the buildings but also intervenes in the actions of the residents. As a consequence of this entanglement, the "architectural decision" has the power to "determine the user's attitude" (Tschumi 128) as the playwright gives a direction to his character's identity with the journey they take through the maps of the playwright's creation. However, it is not within the scope of this paper to explore the power of the playwright or the architect, because once the process of creation is completed, it is no longer the architect or the playwright that interacts with the inhabitants, but it is the structure itself that cohabits the space with the people and actively determines the reality of the residents. Therefore, this paper will be scrutinising the interaction between the urban space of Greig's *San Diego* and the characters.

The play commences with a prologue of David, the playwright, travelling from Scotland to San Diego by plane and seeing a “greylag goose” (Greig 8) on the tailfin of another aeroplane. The image prompts an anecdote David recalls from a newspaper about “a flock of baby geese” saved by “a Quebecois biologist” (8). As the story unfolds, it is revealed that the geese do not know how to migrate because they have lost their mother; the biologist knows that their brain is designed to follow some sound patterns like their mother. He teaches them to follow “a rhythmical sound” and by producing the same sound in a small plane, he leads them to where they need to fly. With an inspiring analogy, David states that “*America’s Missing Children* are perhaps drawn to San Diego because it is sufficiently large and emits a rhythmical sound” (8). Many characters in the play are or were lost at some point in their lives and they end up populating the streets of the city. Greig scrutinises the journey of these characters and reveals the strength of the city which creates a vortex of attraction and engineers them like end products.

To begin with, Pilot, Kevin, is of pivotal importance in *San Diego* to further Greig’s analogy of the geese missing their mother. While he is on the plane to San Diego, David is soothed by the incoming self-confident voice of Pilot who seems to “[know] where he’s going” (9). Yet, this soothing sound of the pilot becomes a piece of the biggest ironies Greig creates during the play. Although Pilot seems to be a confident guide in his cockpit while flying the plane, ironically, he does not look like a good father to his own daughter. As soon as the first part of the play concludes with the screeching sound of the landing tyres of the plane, Pilot transforms into someone lost in the crowds of San Diego. The second part of the play starts with Laura, the daughter of Pilot who is in a hospital, searching for a signal and calling his father with a mobile phone. The Pilot’s prominent image of a guiding figure is dramatically shattered beyond this point. Right after missing his daughter’s call, he starts looking for the phone, yet it is not to call Laura back. He is rather calling an agency to invite a call girl. Obviously, Pilot is not the goose sending signals to his goslings, and shortly afterwards, it also becomes clear that he himself is lost in this city when he is stripped of the technology of his plane. He himself gets lost when he is asked to give directions to his apartment:

> **Pilot**: I’m sorry, I don’t know the city
> It’s called Pacific View.
> **Woman:** Can you see the Pacific there?
> **Pilot:** No at least I don’t know
> I can see the Hilton Hotel
> The top of the Hilton Hotel
> And, when I look out of the window, there’s a freeway
> And it intersects with another freeway
> It’s a complex, a complex of apartments. (18–19)

Even scanning through a map and going out of his apartment to look for the name of the street are to no avail; he cannot help the girl find his location. While defining the city as “non-place” in Marc Auge’s terms, Dan Rebellato makes it clear that Greig’s San Diego is “an anonymous complex of freeways and apartment blocks whose only distinguishing

marker is a Hilton International hotel that can be found in any major city across the world" (174). Revisiting Raban's theory, Pilot can be defined as "a balloonist adrift" without "anchors to tether [him] down" (Raban 1) and interestingly the city abstains from providing him proper anchorage to mitigate his search for his place. The only locators he could find around are the Hilton Hotel and the freeway, which can certainly be found in any other American metropolitan city. The hard version of Greig's San Diego does not collaborate with its residents by yielding locators for their identities, yet it rather generates an identity of loss. This basically stems from the conflict between the soft and hard versions of the city's reality. The characters rely on their soft version of the city, consisting of what they have got about the city. The name of Pilot's apartment, 'Pacific View' is highly related to this soft reality. The city is supposed to be positioned next to the ocean; nevertheless, the ocean is not visible from the apartments. The irony underlines the conflict between the soft and the hard city and clarifies why Pilot is lost. His expectations, springing from the soft map of San Diego, a mental map, does not comply with the hard reality of San Diego, just like Pacific View does not comply with the reality of the Pacific's absence. Exploring Greig's dramaturgy, Rebellato argues that "Greig leaves little solid ground for the audience as names, origins and identities continually slip and double and the audience is left to join the dots of this multi-perspectival work" (173). Yet, this is not true only for the audience. The characters themselves are in the same condition: The names, directions, maps and technological guidance do not help them find a foothold.

Reflecting the complexity of the reality experienced in this urban space, Greig organises overlapping action and dialogue during many scenes in the play. While Pilot is casually looking for his phone and later trying to find the directions to his apartment, David, the travelling playwright, is simultaneously lost on the stage:

> **David:** I've been in San Diego for six hours and already I'm lost
>
> The girl from the theatre who met me at the airport was called Amy, she gave me a car and a map. It was an automatic car, I set off on the freeway and I seemed to drive for hours just following everybody else. Then I was halfway to Mexico. I decided to stop and ask somebody. (15)

Recalling the playwright's interest in maps, and reminding the reader of the difference between the hard and soft realities of urban space, characters repeatedly wield maps to find their way or location. Yet, the vague urban architecture the playwright designs and creates on the stage, mirroring Greig's perception of big cities, does not let them meet by intention. The characters are only allowed to find each other when they are lost; in a sense, they are united in their lostness. First, asking for directions, David comes across Daniel, the stowaway who came to San Diego under the wings of David and Pilot's plane, and Daniel "is carrying a dead goose" (15) at that moment. Then, David, Pilot, and Amy, the girl looking for Pilot's apartment, are reunited by chance once Pilot and Amy find David bleeding to death next to the freeway. He has been stabbed by Daniel and left to die.

A few scenes later, when the narrative turns back to David and Pilot, it is Pilot who finds him first. The audience finds Pilot trying to keep David awake. At this moment, Pilot

hands over David a "Blue Guide" of San Diego and asks him to read some facts from the book out loud. The guide is highlighting some interesting facts like the city having "the highest quality of life in the whole of the United States" and its airport being "so close to the city centre" (34). The scene creates a dark contrast between what the characters go through in San Diego and the resplendent image created by the book's narrative. As Marilena Zaroulia puts it, "[t]he Pilot as well as other characters in San Diego do not experience the place in a way determined by tourist guides or other narratives that present a place only as a destination; instead, the image of San Diego appears as a multidimensional one depending on the way each character interacts with the place and the people inhabiting them" (72). The interaction between people and a city does not happen all at once; that is, every person inhabits and experiences different parts of a city. This makes the city "a multidimensional" entity. Moreover, every inhabitant has his own version of the soft city, which is independent of the hard reality experienced through the city but is based on the realities presented through details such as the "blue guide" in *San Diego*.

Diverse and tough as the experience characters have with the city is, there is a common ground on which these experiences are based. Through this common ground, Greig shows how "[t]he 'atmosphere' or the environment literally gets into the individual" in Brennan's words (1). The city gets its citizens lost, and being lost, searching for an anchoring point in life becomes a pivotal part of the character's identity. That is why, the theme of searching and calling are repeatedly iterated by the playwright. Later in the play, David, the stabbed mirroring persona of the playwright, – as the play consists of a dream-like setting – reappears and confesses how the city strips them of their feeling of belonging:

> A person needs to know where they are, where they're going and what time it is.
> . . .
> But in reality – time and place no longer exist in the world
> There is not time in the city
> There is no place on the high street
> The safety of the ground is an illusion
> . . .
> We want to be a part of the rhythm
> We want to belong
> . . . (88–89)

R. E. Pahl's critique of urban society underlines how the city itself is a confusion: "In an urbanized society, 'urban' is everywhere and nowhere: the city cannot be defined and neither, therefore, can urban sociology" (143). It is this confusion that penetrates into the citizens and leads them to an identity of lostness. The undefinable and inconsistent nature of the city seeps into the veins of its inhabitants, and their communication with the urban environment brings them loss and ambiguity. David searches for a theatre and ends up

dead next to a highway. Zaroulia contends that multiple Davids appearing after the first's death is a consequence of "disorientation—both in terms of location but also subsequent identity confusion" (76). In a similar vein, numerous characters with the same name like Amy are also a part of this confusion. Eventually, with or without the same name, every character goes through this sense of loss: Pilot calls Amy but can find her only by coincidence; Laura calls for her father but she can never find him; Daniel looks for his mother yet what he finds is not a mother to attach himself, and his journey concludes with disappointment; Marie "wander[s] round being scared all the time" for not being able to find comfort (Greig 60). In other words, the city, "gets into the individual" (Brennan 1) or into the characters.

Conclusion

All in all, the urban space Greig prepares for his characters in *San Diego* is not just a simple setting to nest the action and dialogue in the play. He constructs a 'soft' city with only a few markers for his characters to hold onto and lets them wander around in search of a place to belong. In the meantime, the city demonstrates that it is not a passive container box waiting to be engaged with by the living beings inhabiting it. The city has its own agency and vibrancy, which is to say, it is not only shaped by human beings but it also shapes them. While people engineer the city, the city penetrates into their identities. While the playwright is the constructor of this fictional city of San Diego, it is this same city that divides David into multiple identities all at loss. Greig's San Diego becomes a demonstration of the conflict between the hard and soft versions of the city. It navigates its inhabitants into loss, and being lost becomes a part of their identity; on the other hand, it denies the idealisation of the capitalist mindset and questions the social and psychological catastrophe the citizens go through. Despite wielding cutting-edge technology like mobile phones, navigation devices and aeroplanes, the characters lose communication with each other and lose track of their whereabouts. Even the sincerest form of connection between parents and their siblings is severed, and the families do not function as hubs of mutual understanding. To refer back to the metaphor of goslings, parents cannot guide their children because they are already lost in the city. The city no longer functions as a home to belong to: its members are living in the city but they cannot find attachment and belonging. They are in a constant search which testifies to their being lost. By projecting a soft version of the city, Greig completes the puzzle and reminds the co-existence of these versions.

Works Cited

Brennan, Teresa. *The Transmission of Affect*. Cornell UP, 2004.

Greig, David. *Selected Plays 1999–2009: San Diego; Outlying Islands; Pyrenees; the American Pilot; Being Norwegian; Kyoto; Brewers Fayre*. Faber and Faber, 2010.

Harvey, David. *Spaces of Capital: Towards a Critical Geography*. Edinburgh UP, 2001.

Inan, Dilek. "Un/Mapping Mindscapes in David Greig's Theater." *Borderlines: Essays on Mapping and The Logic of Place*, edited by Ruthie Abeliovich and Edwin Seroussi, Sciendo, 2019, pp. 106–16.

Pahl, R. E. "Urban Social Theory and Research." *Environment and Planning A: Economy and Space*, vol. 1, no. 2, 1969, pp. 143–53. doi:10.1068/a010143.

Raban, Jonathan. *Soft City*. Hamish Hamilton, 1974.

Rebellato, Dan, editor. *Modern British Playwriting: 2000-2009: Voices, Documents, New Interpretations*. A&C Black, 2013.

Riker, Stephanie. "Overcoming Limits." *Lehigh Preserve*, vol. 21, 2013, pp. 10–17. http://preserve.lehigh.edu/cas-lehighreview-vol-21.

Rodríguez, Verónica. *David Greig's Holed Theatre: Globalization, Ethics and the Spectator*. Palgrave Macmillan, 2019.

---. "Zāhir and Bātin: An Interview with David Greig." *Contemporary Theatre Review*, vol. 26, no. 1, 2016, pp. 88–96. doi:10.1080/10486801.2015.1123699.

Stuber, Dorian. "Review of Teresa Brennan, *The Transmission of Affect*." *Bryn Mawr Review of Comparative Literature*, vol. 5, no. 2, 2006, pp. 1–9.

Tschumi, Bernard. *Architecture and Disjunction*. MIT Press, 1996.

Wallace, Clare. "David Greig." *The Wiley Blackwell Companion to Contemporary British and Irish Literature*, Vol. II, Wiley, 2020, pp. 491–501.

Zaroulia, Marilena. "Travellers in Globalisation: From Near to Elsewhere and Back." *Contemporary Drama in English*, vol. 17, 2010, pp. 263–78.

Disclosure Statements

- The author of this article confirms that this research does not require a research ethics committee approval.
- The author of this article confirms that their work complies with the principles of research and publication ethics.
- No potential conflict of interest was reported by the author.
- This article was screened for potential plagiarism using a plagiarism screening program.
- Contribution rate: 1st author=100%.

IDEAS: JOURNAL OF ENGLISH LITERARY STUDIES
BOOK REVIEW – KİTAP İNCELEMESİ
DOI: 10.62352/ideas.1466022
2024, VOL. 4, NO. 1, 37–41

English Language and Literature
Research Association of Türkiye

***İklimkurgu: İklim Değişikliği, Antroposen'in Poetikası ve Ekoeleştirel İzler*, by Kerim Can Yazgünoğlu, Konya, Çizgi Kitabevi, 2022, pp. 192, ₺140,00 (paperback), ISBN: 9786051968391.**

Başak AĞIN

TED University, Türkiye

Review History:
Received: 06 Apr. 2024 / Accepted: 17 Apr. 2024

How to Cite: Ağın, Başak. Review of *İklimkurgu: İklim Değişikliği, Antroposen'in Poetikası ve Ekoeleştirel İzler*, by Kerim Can Yazgünoğlu. *IDEAS: Journal of English Literary Studies*, vol. 4, no. 1, 2024, pp. 37–41.

In an epoch when the large-scale effects of human actions on the planet's ecosystem are highly debated, Kerim Can Yazgünoğlu's *Climate Fiction: Climate Change, the Poetics of the Anthropocene, and Ecocritical Traces* (2022) is a timely response to the ways in which literary scholarship has recently turned towards a more environmentally conscious paradigm. While the start of the period of human-induced climate change is still not certain, with scholars and scientists being divided into two camps (one following the industrial view and the other the early-anthropogenic view) (Ruddiman 45), the literary impact of such palpable transformations on the world's climate has exposed itself in the form of climate fiction (also known as clifi). Yazgünoğlu's contribution is, therefore, both to the field of literary studies and to the environmental humanities. Thus, the author's wide scope of research, which has culminated in a to-the-point ecocritical analysis, bears a two-fold significance. The book does not only draw attention to the human and nonhuman needs that require addressing on ecological, social, and political grounds at once but also introduces to the Turkish academic and general audiences the main concepts related to the Anthropocene and to what he calls "its poetics," *i.e.* climate fiction.

In his brief preface to the book, Yazgünoğlu states that, in 2021, Türkiye faced one of the worst draughts in its history, leading to a shortage of crops and threatening both human and nonhuman lives, which indicates the rationale behind his monograph. In line with the aim of presenting his audience with a guide to turn to, he explains his choice of

CONTACT: Başak Ağın, Assoc. Prof. Dr. (https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4323-3686)
TED University, Department of English Language and Literature,
Ankara, Türkiye, basak.agin@tedu.edu.tr

CC BY

major works produced in Anglo-American climate fiction, familiarising the first-time readers of climate fiction with significant elements of the genre and offering a compilation of substantial ecocritical analyses of selected works for advanced researchers in the field.

Following from the need to highlight the importance of anthropogenic climate change, in the Introduction, the author mentions humans as a dominant species that has geologically altered ecosystems, thus acknowledging them as one of the geological forces of the earth. Pointing out how humanity has reached an irreversible ecological threshold, Yazgünoğlu refers to how *oikos* (home) has transformed with the global climate crisis (11), perhaps into a space of threats, a place of the uncanny. The book thus explores climate fiction as a subgenre in speculative fiction and a new trans-generic term for literary texts set in the future or present on Earth or on different planets, covering different temporal and spatial parameters, directly problematising climate change and its effects on humans and nonhumans. Noting that anthropogenic climate change signifies not just a cultural crisis, but also a crisis of imagination, Yazgünoğlu discusses how clifi writers describe the socio-cultural, economic, theological, technological, and ecological devastations spurred by the current global climate crisis (11). The Introduction also serves as a template for briefly summarising the intricate relations between ecocriticism and clifi. Borrowing ideas from leading ecocritics, such as Cheryll Glotfelty and Serpil Oppermann, Yazgünoğlu offers several definitions of ecocriticism and lists several related approaches ranging from nature writing, deep ecology, environmental justice, ecofeminism, ecopsychology, urban ecology, Marxist ecocriticism, and political ecology to postmodernist and posthumanist ecocriticisms as well as elemental and material ecocriticisms (14).

The author scrutinises, in the following chapters, selected literary works that deal with extreme heat, wildfires, floods, drying lakes and rivers, desertification, irregular weather changes, freezing climates, and extinct species, with a variety of (ecological, literary, or theoretical) attitudes and techniques that he categorises under several subheadings. For Yazgünoğlu, climate fiction writers create a new genre, in which the aforementioned crisis of imagination inevitably redefines the boundaries of contemporary literary texts. Deriving his framework from Mike Hulme's discussion in *Why We Disagree about Climate Change* (2009), Yazgünoğlu divides his monograph into four main chapters: "Lamenting Eden," "Presaging Apocalypse," "Constructing Babel," and "Celebrating Jubilee." In Hulme's understanding, these four categories, despite their Biblical underpinnings, represent "four myths about climate change," where the word myth refers to "the very specific anthropological and non-pejorative sense of revealing meanings and assumed truths," not speculations or fabricated narratives (340). Likewise, Yazgünoğlu's chapters revolve around solid literary examinations accompanied by scientific facts and scholarly theories concerning the Anthropocene, rather than a further mystification of the already unknown. As Hulme relates each of his four themes with "nostalgia," "fear," "pride," and "justice" (Yazgünoğlu 14), so does Yazgünoğlu in his ecocritical analyses of prominent examples of climate change novels.

The first chapter, "Climate Crisis and Literature: Climate Fiction," is "a theoretical intervention,"[1] in the author's own words (14). This chapter aims to locate climate fiction as the point of convergence for literature and climate crisis, and is divided into three subchapters, namely, "Climate and the Human," "Climate Crisis and the Anthropocene," and "the Poetics of the Anthropocene, the Anthropocene of Literature: Climate Fiction." Starting with the dynamic relations between climate and Anthropos, Yazgünoğlu looks into the etymological roots of the word climate, thus tracing climate and the weather as categories that define and explicate the relationship between humankind and the environment (18–19). Exploring various climate change narratives from myths to contemporary fiction, the author discusses the widespread themes that underlie the function of such narratives. Among these themes, as Yazgünoğlu argues, technocratic power, climate refugees, social separation and/or isolation, societal collapse, as well as lawlessness are mostly forefronted (43).

In the second chapter, Yazgünoğlu follows the theme of "Lamenting Eden: Metamorphosing Climates, Changing Natures" and seeks an answer to the fundamental question of what nature is in contemporary ecocritical debates, through his analysis of Julie Bertagna's *Exodus* (2002). The subchapter "Loss of Climate, the Lament of the Human" problematises the social construct of the dichotomy between human and nature as well as that between civilization and wilderness, mentioning how societies collapse when rivers and lakes grow toxic with pollution. The second subchapter, "Transforming Hyperclimates, Metamorphosing Natures and Humans: Julie Bertagna's *Exodus*," illuminates what Yazgünoğlu coins as "dark hyperclimates," inspired by Timothy Morton's concepts of dark ecology and hyperobjects. According to the author, dark hyperclimates and ecological disasters with fatal consequences deprive people of food, indicating that life itself will become composed of despair alone and the borders between life and death will erode eventually (73). As such, Yazgünoğlu, through his analysis of Bertagna's novel, points out the inseparability of hyperclimates or weather conditions from nature(s). Revealing the author's new materialist-posthumanist stance is the following idea: Hyperclimates, just like weather events, are simply actors of a network that play out a choreography in the wider scope of the planet where the false dichotomies of nature/culture, animate/inanimate, human/nonhuman, and life/death, contrary to what we have come to imagine, are intertwined, relational, and inextricable.

The third chapter, "Climate Apocalypse: End of the World, the Deluge, and Flood Fiction," is divided into two subchapters: "The World Is a Hell: The End and the Beginning" and "Flood Fiction and Megan Hunter's *The End We Start From*." This chapter focuses on the "end-of-the-world" thesis, brought about by the current climate crisis, which is seen as a sign of the Apocalypse. Exploring Megan Hunter's *The End We Start From* (2017) as an example of flood fiction, which can be categorised as a sub-branch of climate fiction,

[1] Translations from Turkish to English belong to the author.

the chapter discusses the temporal scale of the Anthropocene while de-mythologising the flood and relocating the theme as an omen of the current global climate crisis.

In the fourth chapter, "Constructing Babel: Anthropocentrism, Human as *Homo*, Ecomodernism, and Anthropocenic Recognition," where the author relates the human desire to dominate nature with the state of hubris and the resulting anthropogenic climate crisis, there are two subchapters titled "*Homo*, Anthropos, and Anthropocentrism" and "Human and Climate Crisis in Ian McEwan's *Solar*." Looking into the ways in which humans abuse climate crisis, Yazgünoğlu discusses various ideas from such scholars as Eileen Crist, who views the Anthropocene as the confirmation of *Homo sapiens*'s "Promethean" image (131) and Dipesh Chakrabarty, who respectively presents *Homo* and *Anthropos* as "homocentric" and "zoecentric" approaches to the concept of the human (141–160). Yazgünoğlu's interpretation of McEwan's novel as a satirical depiction of the selfish, greedy, and uncaring individuals created by consumer culture and global capitalism (128) is significant in this array. In this interpretation, Yazgünoğlu relies on Greg Garrard's evaluation that the novel is in fact a comic allegory of the destructive effects of selfishness (124).

The fifth chapter, "Celebrating Jubilee: Climate Justice, Climate Refugees, Global Climate Migration, and Immigrant Ecocriticism" covers three novels. With sub-chapters "Climate Justice and Climate Refugees" and "Climate Injustice and Climate Refugees in Clifi: Monique Roffey's *Archipelago*, Ray Hammond's *Extinction*, and John Lanchester's *The Wall*," this chapter revolves around the tensions between the individuals under threat and a world that is undergoing constant transformation without providing any stability for its citizens. The author then discusses the narratives of care, empathy, and ethics. By doing so, he links the function and purpose of ecological narratives, especially clifi, to an ethics of care. He argues that this kind of narratives has the capability of evoking such feelings as compassion and responsiveness, thus closing the gap between the privileged and the vulnerable in the face of the climate crisis, despite injustices triggered by the combined threats of poverty and political corruption.

The conclusion, "Clifi as the Literarisation of Climate Change," draws our attention to the insistence of climate fiction on the dynamic relations between humans and the environment, from the epic of *Gilgamesh* to the advent of the genre with J. G. Ballard's *The Drowned World* (1962) and to examples that are more contemporary. The author questions whether the global climate crisis condemns us to nothingness, extinction, or death. Highlighting once more the embeddedness of the human species in the nonhuman environment and the interconnectedness of the two in especially their susceptibility, Yazgünoğlu finalises his monograph with his remarkable words: "Climate fiction is the voice of the climate tragedy; it is a lament to the earth" (180).

Works Cited

Chakrabarty, Dipesh. *The Human Condition in the Anthropocene*. Lecture delivered at Yale University, February 18–19, 2015. tannerlectures.utah.edu.

Crist, Eileen. "On the Poverty of Our Nomenclature." *Environmental Humanities*, vol. 3, 2013, pp. 129–147. doi:10.1215/22011919-3611266.

Garrard, Greg. "Solar: Apocalypse Not." *Ian McEwan: Contemporary Critical Perspectives*, edited by Sebastian Groes, Bloomsbury Academic, 2013, pp. 123–136.

Hulme, Mike. *Why We Disagree About Climate Change: Understanding Controversy, Inaction and Opportunity*. Cambridge UP, 2009.

Ruddiman, William F. "The Anthropocene." *Annual Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences*, vol. 41, 2013, pp. 45–68. doi:10.1146/annurev-earth-050212-123944.

Yazgünoğlu, Kerim Can. *İklimkurgu: İklim Değişikliği, Antroposen'in Poetikası ve Ekoeleştirel İzler.* Çizgi Kitabevi, 2022.

Disclosure Statements

- The author of this review confirms that this research does not require a research ethics committee approval.
- The author of this review confirms that their work complies with the principles of research and publication ethics.
- No potential conflict of interest was reported by the author.
- This review was screened for potential plagiarism using a plagiarism screening program.
- Contribution rate: 1st author=100%.

IDEAS: JOURNAL OF ENGLISH LITERARY STUDIES
CORRIGENDUM – DÜZELTME YAZISI
2024, VOL. 4, NO. 1, 42

English Language and Literature
Research Association of Türkiye

Corrigendum to "A Critique of Exaggerated Libertinism in Thomas Shadwell's *The Libertine*" [*IDEAS: Journal of English Literary Studies*, vol. 3, no. 2, pp. 119–132]

Şafak HORZUM

Kütahya Dumlupınar University, Türkiye

Corrigendum History:
Received: 19 May 2024 / Accepted: 21 May 2024

The author states that he made a typing mistake about the performance year of Thomas Shadwell's play *The Libertine* in his article "A Critique of Exaggerated Libertinism in Thomas Shadwell's *The Libertine*" which was published in the previous issue (vol. 3, no. 2) of the journal in 2023. This *corrigendum* informs that the year "1975" as it was published in the first line of the last paragraph on page 121 should have been 1675.

Disclosure Statements

- The author of this corrigendum confirms that this research does not require a research ethics committee approval.
- The author of this corrigendum confirms that their work complies with the principles of research and publication ethics.
- No potential conflict of interest was reported by the author.
- This corrigendum was screened for potential plagiarism using a plagiarism screening program.
- Contribution rate: 1st author=100%.

CONTACT: Şafak Horzum, Assist. Prof. Dr. (https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4114-0387)
Kütahya Dumlupınar University, Department of English Translation and Interpreting,
Kütahya, Türkiye, safak.horzum@dpu.edu.tr

CC BY