



**İSTANBUL AYDIN UNIVERSITY  
INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF MEDIA, CULTURE AND LITERATURE**

**Volume 9 Issue 1 - June 2023**

GENEL DOI: 10.17932/IAU.IJMCL.2015.014

CİLT 9 SAYI 1 DOI: 10.17932/IAU.IJMCL.2015.014/2023.901

# ISTANBUL AYDIN UNIVERSITY

## INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF MEDIA, CULTURE AND LITERATURE

ISSN : 2149-5475 / E-ISSN 2667-8403

### Proprietor

Mustafa AYDIN, Assoc. Prof. (İstanbul Aydın University)

### Editor-in-Chief

Zeynep AKYAR (İstanbul Aydın University)

### Editors

Asst. Prof. Dr. Jale COŞKUN

### Journal Secretary

R.A. Buşra KAYA

### Language

English

### Publication Period

Published twice a year  
June and December

### Administrative Coordinator

Asst. Prof. Dr. Burak SÖNMEZER

### Turkish Redaction

Behcet Özgür ÇALIŞKAN

### English Redaction

Behcet Özgür ÇALIŞKAN

### Graphic Desing

Başak GÜNDÜZ

### Correspondence Address

Beşyol Mah, İnönü Cd, No 38 Sefaköy,  
34295 Küçükçekmece/İstanbul

**Tel:** 0212 4441428 - Fax: 0212 425 57 97

**Web:** <https://ijmcl.aydin.edu.tr/tr/ediorler-kurulu/>

**E-mail:** [ijmcl@aydin.edu.tr](mailto:ijmcl@aydin.edu.tr)

### Printed by

Levent Baskı Merkezi - **Sertifika No:** 35983

**Adres:** Emniyetevler Mahallesi Yeniçeri Sokak No:6/A  
4. Levent / İstanbul, Türkiye

**Tel:** 0212 270 80 70

**E-mail:** [info@leventbaskimerkezi.com](mailto:info@leventbaskimerkezi.com)

### Editorial Board

*Prof. Dr. Aysel ERGÜL KESKİN*

*Prof. Dr. Veysel KILIÇ*

*Prof. Dr. Türkay BULUT*

*Prof. Dr. Mine YAZICI*

*Prof. Dr. Alev BULUT*

*Prof. Dr. Aymil DOĞAN*

*Prof. Dr. Ayşe Fitnat ECE*

*Assoc. Dr Nur Emine KOÇ*

*Asst. Prof. Dr. Jale COŞKUN*

*Asst. Prof. Dr. İlkin BAŞAR*

*Asst. Prof. Dr Dr. Esmâ TEZCAN*

### Advisory Board

*Prof. Dr. Aysel ERGÜL KESKİN, İstanbul Aydın University*

*Prof. Dr. Veysel KILIÇ, İstanbul Aydın University*

*Prof. Dr. Türkay BULUT, İstanbul Aydın University*

*Prof. Dr. Saeed MEHPOUR, İstanbul Aydın University*

*Prof. Dr. Giamperio BELLINGERI, Ca' Foscari University of Venice*

*Prof. Dr. Türkan OLCAY, İstanbul University*

*Prof. Dr. Mine YAZICI, İstanbul University*

*Prof. Dr. Birsen TÛTÛNİŞ, Kültür University*

*Prof. Dr. Cemal DEMİRCİOĞLU, Okan University*

*Prof. Dr. Apollinaria AVRUTINA, St. Petersburg University*

**Prof. Dr. Loui Ali KHALIL**, QATAR University  
**Prof. Dr. Zemfira Ishakova**, Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration  
**Assoc. Prof. Dr. Rosaria Rossella PUGLIESE**, Università della Calabria  
**Asst. Prof. Dr. Jale COŞKUN**, Istanbul Aydın University  
**Asst. Prof. Dr. İlkin BAŞAR**, Istanbul Aydın University  
**Asst. Prof. Dr. Öz ÖKTEM**, Istanbul Aydın University  
**Asst. Prof. Dr. Esmâ TEZCAN**, Istanbul Aydın University  
**Asst. Prof. Dr. Eyass ALRASHED**, Istanbul Aydın University  
**Asst. Prof. Dr. Şafak NEDİCEYUVA**, İnönü University  
**Asst. Prof. Dr. Elizabeth A. Pallitto**, Rutgers University  
**Asst. Prof. Dr. Ahmad OMAR**, Istanbul University

### **Reviewers of This Issue**

**Prof. Dr. Okan ORMANLI**, Istanbul Aydın University  
**Asst. Prof. Dr. Murat Lüleci**, Istanbul Aydın University  
**Asst. Prof. Dr. Evrim ERSÖZ KOÇ**, Dokuz Eylül University  
**Asst. Prof. Dr. Leyla SAVSAR**, İstinye University  
**Asst. Prof. Dr. Öz ÖKTEM**, Istanbul Aydın University  
**Asst. Prof. Dr. Selin SÜAR ORAL**, Istanbul Aydın University  
**Asst. Prof. Dr. Fırat KARADAŞ**, Hatay Mustafa Kemal University  
**Asst. Prof. Dr. Osman SABUNCUOĞLU**, Istanbul Aydın University  
**Asst. Prof. Dr. Ayşe Betül TOPLU**, Istanbul Aydın University  
**Asst. Prof. Dr. Fatoş IŞIL BRITTEN**, Trakya University  
**Asst. Prof. Dr. Özlem ÇETİN ÖZTÜRK**, Istanbul Gelişim University  
**Lect. Dr. Erden EL**, Istanbul Aydın University  
**Lect. Dr. Laura FERNANDEZ ROMERO**, Pablo de Olavide University

# Contents

## Research Article

<b>Sturm Und Drang a Precursor to the Emergence of 'The Man of Agency' in English Romanticism</b> Berkay ÇELEBİ, Esmâ TEZCAN.....	1
<b>Shakespeare's Hamlet in Manga Form</b> Metin SAY.....	23
<b>Çağdaş Rusçada Türkçe Kökenli Kelimelerin Kullanımının Analizi</b> Buse KURUYER.....	49
<b>Exploring Traditional and Modern Gender Norms in Caryl Churchill's Owners through a Transformative Gender Perspective</b> Kanan AGHASIYEV.....	59
<b>The Genre Merge of Fiction and Dystopian Science Fiction: Suzanne Collins The Hunger Games and Catching Fire</b> Khadija ALMGHRABI.....	79

## ***DOI Numbers***

**Genel DOI:** 10.17932/IAU.IJMCL.2015.014

**IJMCL June 2023 Volume 9 Issue 1 DOI:** 10.17932/IAU.IJMCL.2015.014/2023.901

### **Sturm Und Drang a Precursor to the Emergence of 'The Man of Agency' in English Romanticism**

Berkay ÇELEBİ, Esmâ TEZCAN

10.17932/IAU.IJMCL.2015.014/ijmcl\_v09i1001

### **Shakespeare's Hamlet in Manga Form**

Metin SAY

10.17932/IAU.IJMCL.2015.014/ijmcl\_v09i1002

### **Çağdaş Rusçada Türkçe Kökenli Kelimelerin Kullanımının Analizi**

Buse KURUYER

10.17932/IAU.IJMCL.2015.014/ijmcl\_v09i1003

### **Exploring Traditional and Modern Gender Norms in Caryl Churchill's Owners through a Transformative Gender Perspective**

Kanan AGHASIYEV

10.17932/IAU.IJMCL.2015.014/ijmcl\_v09i1004

### **The Genre Merge of Fiction and Dystopian Science Fiction: Suzanne Collins The Hunger Games and Catching Fire**

Khadija ALMGHRABI

10.17932/IAU.IJMCL.2015.014/ijmcl\_v09i1005

## ***From The Editor***

*We're delighted to present to you Volume 9, Issue 1 of The International Journal of Media, Culture, and Literature (IJMCL).*

*IJMCL, published biannually (two volumes per year, June and December) by the School of Foreign Languages at Istanbul Aydın University, Istanbul, Turkey, is an international scholarly journal in Turkish, English, Arabic, Russian, Spanish and devoted in its entirety, media, culture, literature, language, and translation.*

*The International Journal of Media, Culture and Literature is committed to the principles of objective scholarship and critical analysis. Submissions and solicited articles are evaluated by international peer referees through a blind review process.*

*IJMCL publishes articles on Turkish, English, Arabic, Russian, Spanish language and linguistics, as well as on general and comparative literary studies including aspects of cultural and literary theory and translation studies. IJMCL also aims to create a critical, discursive space for the promotion and exploration of media, culture and their relations with literature.*

*We want to express our gratitude to everyone involved in bringing this issue to fruition, especially our authors and reviewers who provided invaluable contributions during the evaluation process. We hope the articles in this issue prove to be informative and enriching for our readers.*

***Asst.Prof.Dr. Jale COŞKUN***

## ***Sturm Und Drang a Precursor to the Emergence of 'The Man of Agency' In English Romanticism***

Berkay ÇELEBİ<sup>1</sup>

Esmat TEZCAN<sup>2</sup>

### **ABSTRACT**

The Romantic Movement in English Literature, literary scholars generally overlook the fact that English Romanticism takes its roots in German Literature, mostly from a specific movement deemed as anti-Rationalism and focused on the value of emotions to the point of irrationalism. This pre-romantic movement known as Sturm und Drang, similar to English Romanticism, urges society to go back to their nature and their human core by way of embracing their emotions. Within the scope of German Literature, specifically in Goethe's *The Sorrows of Young Werther*, one can see these elements of the Sturm und Drang yet related to another concept coined as *Kraftmensch*. English Romanticism, mostly, deals with the positive emotions of human nature whereas in the Sturm und Drang the focus of the authors is dealing with negative emotions of human nature. Furthermore, it is safe to say that both English and German literature's Romantic Movements, though by different methods, urge people to go back to their core as a way of reuniting with nature itself to experience the sublime (in terms of Edmund Burke and the Kantian *Sublime*) rather than lose their nature by being confined by pure science of the rationalist perspective and neglecting their emotional self. Namely, while the main focus of English Romanticism is love and beauty, Sturm und Drang focuses on chaos and death. Therefore, this paper aims to discuss and highlight the emergence of English Romanticism and place elements of the German Sturm und Drang Movement as its precursor whilst using the primary romantic novel of English literature: Mary Shelley's *Frankenstein* as an example.

***Keywords:*** *English Romanticism, Mary Shelley's Frankenstein, Sturm und Drang, Goethe's The Sorrows of Young Werther*

---

<sup>1</sup> Istanbul Aydın University, Istanbul, berkayc@stu.aydin.edu.tr; <https://orcid.org/0009-0001-8236-6924>

<sup>2</sup> Assist. Prof. Dr., Istanbul, Istanbul Aydın University esmtezc@aydin.edu.tr; ; <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5781-9119>

## ÖZ

Edebiyat bilimiyle uğraşan akademisyenlerin çoğu Mary Shelley'nin *Frankenstein*'ını İngiliz Edebiyatının Romantik Akım kategorisine yerleştirirken, İngiliz Romantizminin köklerini Alman Edebiyatının anti-Rasyonalizm olarak da adlandırılabilen ve irrasyonalizm noktasına değin duyguların önemine odaklanan özgül bir hareketinden aldığı gerçeğini genellikle göz ardı ederler. Sturm und Drang olarak da bilinen bu romantizm öncesi hareket, İngiliz Romantizmine benzer şekilde, toplumu duygularını kucaklamak suretiyle kendi doğalarına ve insani özlerine geri dönmeye davet eder. Alman Edebiyatı kapsamında, özellikle Goethe'nin *Genç Werther'in Acıları* adlı eserinde, Sturm und Drang'ın bu unsurları görülebilir, dahası doğrudan doğruya *Kraftmensch* olarak adlandırılan başka bir kavramla da sıkı sıkıya ilişkilidir. İngiliz Romantizmi çoğunlukla insan doğasının barındırdığı olumlu duygularla ilgilenirken, Sturm und Drang'da yazarların odak noktası daha ziyade insan doğasının taşıdığı olumsuz daha doğrusu karamsar duygularıdır. Ayrıca, hem İngiliz hem de Alman edebiyatının Romantik Akımlarının, farklı yöntemlerle de olsa, insanları duygusal benliklerini ihmal eden ve rasyonalist bakış açısının saf bilimine hapsolup doğalarını dahası özlerini kaybetmek yerine, yüce olanı (Edmund Burke ve Kantçı terminolojiyle *Yücelik*) deneyimlemek için doğanın kendisiyle özdeşleşmenin bir yolu olarak özlerine dönmeye teşvik ettiğini söylemek yanlış olmayacaktır. Diğer bir ifadeyle, İngiliz Romantizminin odağı aşk ve güzellik iken, Sturm und Drang kaos ve ölüme odaklanır. Bu bakış açısından hareketle, Alman Sturm und Drang akımı İngiliz Romantizminin ortaya çıkışına bir nevi öncü akım hatta pre-romantik olarak konumlandırılarak, Sturm und Drang akımının İngiliz Romantik akımına iz düşümü Shelley'nin *Frankenstein*'i üzerinden ele alınacaktır.

**Anahtar Kelimeler:** *İngiliz Romantizmi, Mary Shelley'nin Frankenstein'i, Sturm und Drang, Goethe'nin Genç Werther'in Acıları*

“Ironically, England was now to receive its stimulus from Germany, from ideas which had in fact originated on her shores and had been elaborated abroad while they were more or less ignored at home. ... in spite of the success of *Werther*...”

- Lilian R. Furst, 126



## INTRODUCTION

The Romantic Movement in literature is commonly and accurately attributed to “English Romanticism”. However, one might realize that this movement with all its glamour did not suddenly surface into the world of literature. When delving deeper into the origins of Romanticism and specifically the English Romantic Movement in literature, the initial literary work stands out as Mary Shelley’s *Frankenstein; or The Modern Prometheus*, highlighting most of the philosophical as well as the scientific issues present in its day and age. Though one might ask, how Romanticism emerged, and how it was triggered, in other words, one might consider there to be a precursor which one could claim as pre-romanticism.

The expression “Sturm und Drang” is generally and very loosely translated as “Storm and Stress” (Hill, 2003, p. 1) however for the sake of preventing misuse of the term, rather than utilizing the English translation, the original term is going to be used throughout this article. For the most part, it has been argued that Sturm und Drang emerged as a movement in Germany in the 18<sup>th</sup> century an opposing line of thought to the Enlightenment or rather its emphasis being put on reason. This emergence owing to the fact that with the ascend of rationalism in Europe general society had started to rely more and more on the concept of logos in line with reasoning and scientific thought based on empirical evidence. This in turn led to the emotions and the spiritual existence of humankind being neglected or even dismissed. Humanity seemed more and more concerned with rationality, dismissing a supposed “natural core” connected to whatever lay beyond reason and reasoning and was considered to be attached to the internal emotions of oneself (Hill, 2003, p. 5). Furthermore, the oppositional rise of the Sturm und Drang movement was meant to remind humanity of its actual being that could not or should not just be confined to an external world of reasoning but actually promoted irrationality as a way to find back to one’s core and origins again leading to another term strongly connected to the movement, namely the concept of *Kraftmensch*. In his article, A Titan in Extenuating Circumstances: Sturm und Drang and the *Kraftmensch*, Alan Leidner (1989) stated that toward the end of the 1700s, German playwrights and prominently Friederich Maximilian Klingler coined the term *Kraftmensch*. The violence attributed to this new man of action, as most likely Leidner puts it, “...seems to sum up the essence of Sturm und Drang” while also mentioning that this man of action poses “...an impulsive individuality that appears to need no authority beyond itself” (Leidner, 1989. p. 178).

As it will be further discussed this notion of violence will be associated with the terms of violation as an act of agency in accordance with Georges Bataille's argument which in turn is observable in the coining protagonists of the English Romantic narrative.

The most prominent author of the movement of Sturm und Drang, sometimes even considered the initial author to give life to the core teachings of the movement mirrored in literary works is Johann Wolfgang von Goethe (1749-1832) and on the level of stage plays it is Friedrich Maximilian Klingler (1752–1831). They, as the initiators of a thought put to word by creating protagonists who are or grow into becoming a *Kraftmensch* are commonly referred to as the '*Stürmer und Dränger*' (Hill, 2003, p. 2). Goethe's novel *The Sorrows of Young Werther*, which is going to be one of the focal points of this article, clarifies the German perspective of the Sturm und Drang movement as a precursor to the rise of English Romanticism.

In terms of literature in general, one can argue that different genres reflect the emergence of different protagonist types, the Sturm und Drang movement presenting the *Kraftmensch* whilst English Romanticism's most prominent protagonist, the Byronic Hero is born. The coining protagonist of English Romanticism known as Dr. Frankenstein seems to be based on the archetype of the Sturm und Drang protagonist, namely the *Kraftmensch*. Further, this undeniable relation is most easily observable when the protagonist that each movement produces is analyzed in comparison based on the degree of their agency. Therefore, the argumentation concerning the Emergence of English Romanticism based on a German movement is better emphasized when the gradual progression of the *Kraftmensch* in its anglicized counterpart is traced.

This progression showcases itself in the example of poetry categorized under English Romanticism in Lord Byron's 'Unfinished' *Hyperion*. On the other hand, when it comes to the category of prose, one can encounter Mary Shelley's *Frankenstein* within the same literary movement. This article aims to point out the fact that English Romanticism has taken its roots from an 18<sup>th</sup>-century German Movement called Sturm und Drang and substantiates this argument utilizing the adaption of the evolved, even perfected *Kraftmensch* within English Literature as reflected in Shelley's protagonist Dr. Frankenstein. Therefore, beginning with certain similarities linking Sturm und Drang and English Romanticism as diachronic literary

instances are going to be discussed based on the most prominent works that have coined the emergence of both movements which are selected as Goethe's *The Sorrows of Young Werther* and Mary Shelley's *Frankenstein* while also referring to Lord Byron's *Hyperion*. It is common knowledge that Lord Byron is known to be in admiration of J.W. Goethe and highly influenced by the German literary movement (Stokoe, 1963 p. 159), in turn influencing Shelley, leading up to the penning of *Frankenstein*.

## DISCUSSION

English Romanticism encompasses several prominent literary works both prose and poetic as previously mentioned which coin the movement as belonging to the Anglo-Saxon tradition. However, often – either intentionally or due to dismissal- the effects of other literary works and basic movements seem to be overlooked or dismissed as being the initiating source and precursor of English Romanticism. On this note, a German-originated movement known as Sturm und Drang can be distinctively singled out as being the precursor to English Romanticism both in style, aim, philosophy, and the construction of protagonists. This relation becomes only more plausible when Lord Byron's obvious admiration of Goethe and the trending German literary movement promoting irrationality and the experiencing of emotions in favor of rationalism is taken into consideration. It is not to say that the Sturm und Drang movement is a version of German Romanticism, but rather a forethought pointing towards a specific direction with the aim of favoring one's inner world and true human core being unified with nature that can only be experienced via letting free emotions reign to the point of irrationality and experiencing the sublime.

It is suggested that a human is not merely under the command of logos/ reason and should be reinvesting in getting in touch with one's divine origins which lies beyond the empirical universe of objects and scientific reason. This line of thought seems to be imported to the English tradition during Lord Byron's efforts of adopting an artistic style that tends to emphasize the promotion of emotional experience again in the attempts to reunite one's humanity with nature itself in search of transcendence. Going back to Byron's attempted *Hyperion*, it is arguably easy to see the connection to ancient Greek philosophy in which exactly this nature-mimetic wholeness with the universe as a form of existence is promoted. The same influence can be observed in Mary Shelley's *Frankenstein* as

the coining piece of literature for the English Romantic movement though, here, there is an equal emphasis on scientific progress as much as the free reign of emotions and the promotion of irrationality including the creation of the primary English *Kraftmensch* protagonist. In other words, the evolved and perfected man of agency. The importance of this now-anglicized protagonist rests in the undeniable reality that the *Kraftmensch* is a creation of the Sturm und Drang. Another common denominator seems to be this proposed introvertiveness via nature which can be then seen in English Romanticism just as much as in the German movement of the Sturm und Drang though with a higher degree of agency and violence in terms of being more fearless in violating standing rational norms, which can also be labeled as taboos. Hence, to be able to show these similarities the elements of Sturm und Drang are going to be pointed out using Goethe's *The Sorrows of Young Werther* which is the coining literary work of said movement and presenting the original *Kraftmensch* protagonist Werther. Retrospectively, discovered elements are going to be applied to Mary Shelley's *Frankenstein* to emphasize a direct connection between the two movements and the construction of protagonists.

Anthony Backes (1994) states that "Frankenstein has been seen as a critique of the Industrial Revolution, of value-free experimental science, and of romantic Prometheanism ..." (Backes, 1944, p. 34) due to the fact that with the emergence of the Industrial Revolution in Britain, the focus of society has been shifted towards the technological developments and scientific facts. During this period, steam engines started to be produced which eased transportation, Charles Darwin's (1809-1882) *On The Origins of Species* was published therefore the theory of Evolution, and also Charles Babbage (1791-1871) is regarded as the father of computer sciences since he designed the notion of the analytical engine (Greenblatt, 2006 p. 1538-1545). These technological developments are surely to be categorized as the milestones of a society thriving on science, empiricism, and the dominance of reason. An additional emphasis should be laid on the scientific discovery of Galvani known as Galvanism and due to its direct influence on Mary Shelley's work as the reason counterpart to the irrational emotions given free reign as encountered within her coining narrative.

David S. Hogsette's article *Metaphysical Intersections in Frankenstein: Mary Shelley's Theistic Investigation of Scientific Materialism and Transgressive Autonomy* where he states that "The novel is arguably

one of the most influential works in the conceptual practice of science and technology and Mary Shelley one of the most influential thinkers” (Hogsette, 2011 p. 532). In light of this, one can argue that the importance of Shelley’s work is not confined to literature but is considered a scientific inspiration in terms of the novelty of Galvanism. Furthermore, Galvani’s innovations and his later experiments have an impact not only on *Frankenstein* but also on other science-fiction novels, whereby one might consider Galvani as a real-life *Kraftmensch*. Mary (Wollstonecraft) Shelley’s encounter with this scientific novelty seems to be related to a journey undertaken with Percy Bysshe Shelley to Genova to meet Lord Byron. During this time, she was said to be already well-versed in the scientific arguments of Galvani and Volta and also in every detail that Aldini produced. It is also stated that during that time, especially in Switzerland and Italy, Galvanism and ‘reanimation’, which can be thought of as a direct reference to *Frankenstein*. Mary Shelley does not utilize the word Galvanism in her novel however she only mentions it in the preface of the second edition of the book published in 1831 (Kızıltan & Dalkılıç 2022, p. 256-258). This reference strongly indicates that the fantasy of defying mortality with reanimation is not a fictitious daydream taken out of a novel but on the contrary, it is the actual inspiration behind Shelley’s protagonist Dr. Frankenstein.

These scientific facts and technological developments also demonstrate themselves in Mary Shelley’s *Frankenstein* when Dr. Victor Frankenstein utilizes electricity to create a monster, which is also an indication that he becomes a man of agency or more accurately a *Kraftmensch* since he is no longer in need of a creator; himself becoming a creator of his monster. This again indicates a direct connection to the line of thought promoted by Sturm und Drang. The same notion also is indicative of the fact that with Galvanism, humankind no longer needs to be in awe of God (Hogsette, 2011 p. 532). Hence the subtitle of the novel refers to “... *the modern Prometheus*”. This indicates a distancing from the necessity of transcendence via the experiencing of the sublime since God is no longer held in awe. Whereas Nietzsche observes that “...*God is dead*” and in line presents his version of the evolved *Kraftmensch* which he labels “...*Übermensch*...” indicating that he is referring to a new relationship between humankind and nature (Nietzsche, 2006 p. 5). Hence, the age of reason has subdued the sublimity of a creating and omnipotent God since Nietzsche argues that “Human being is something that must be overcome”

meaning that the human limitations of being subservient to anything out of reach of the human limitations need overcoming (Nietzsche, 2006 p. 5). Following this thought, one is expected to overreach and transcend which seems to take its emergence from the notions of Burke and Kant merged with the later understanding of the German-originated *Kraftmensch* via experiencing the sublime. This transcendence and sublime experience being regarded as the divine or wholeness with the universe which can only be achieved via spiritual connection to nature and transcendence by way of sublimation for humanity to regain its human core which now, with the dominance of reason, has been alienated from its true purpose (Gardner, 1999), (Kant, 2007).

In other words, Kant argues that the experience of the sublime allows for transcendence and a metaphorical unification with one's core as summarized in Esma Tezcan's Ph.D. thesis focusing on love, sexuality, and death in Western tradition as argued:

According to Kant, the sublime lies in the human experience of nature. Through this experience, the limitation, mortality, and smallness of human beings in the face of the sublime, and thus, in fact, the divine, are pointed out. It is impossible for the human mind and imagination to comprehend these phenomena of nature, which challenge the human mind, in the face of their actional appearance and their terrifying motion. Therefore, the human soul feels pleasure mixed with terrible pain. In this respect Kant gives the example of the virtuous man's fear of God; the virtuous man fears God, but he fears God without actually being frightened by God. For example, in the face of natural phenomena, disasters or hurricanes, etc., man's ability to resist is reduced to insignificance and pettiness. On the other hand, the more frightening their appearance, the more attractive they will be perceived as, and they will be regarded as sublime, especially when they are witnessed from a safe distance. (Tezcan, 2018. p. 21-22)<sup>3</sup>

Again, the concept of sublimation stands out as a bridge between the German and English traditions which can be seen as yet a further link verifying the main argument of this article in placing the German Sturm und Drang tradition at the root of English Romanticism and the construction of protagonists with agency. The necessary effect of terror as an opening emotion toward the sublime and hence transcendence can be observed in both traditions. Kant, representing the German traditions' take on the matter is the latter one to propose this approximately 50 years after the initial statement was made by Edmund Burke representing the English tradition. Though Burke was the first to address the issue of the

---

<sup>3</sup> The block citation given above has obtained from a Ph.D. thesis for German Literature as can be found in the references and the original language is Turkish. Hence all translations have been done by the author of this article.

sublime, the notion as a philosophical approach was primarily adopted into the literary tradition of the German *Stürmer und Dränger* only later to be incorporated into English Romanticism. Nonetheless, both Kant and Burke are almost identical in their postulations though where the former's focus is on the link between sublimity and terror whereas the latter is more concerned with its relation to beauty.

Edmund Burke (1729) commences his postulations regarding the notion of the sublime in his book *A Philosophical Enquiry into the Origin of Our Ideas of the Sublime and Beautiful* arguing that there is a distinction between the beautiful and the sublime. Whereas the beautiful object with its gradual variation elicits feelings of love and tenderness, on the contrary, the sublime is the locus of awe and terror (Burke, 1764 p. 60). Fred Botting in his *Gothic*, whilst elaborating on Burke's take on the sublime states that "the terror was akin to the sense of wonderment and awe accompanying religious experience. Sublimity offered intimations of a great, if not divine, power" (Botting, 1999 p. 26). In other words, the sublime seems to be associated with a divine experience, or at least a realization of one's mortality as well as the perception of an existence beyond one's comprehension (Kant, 2007). This, in turn, can be singled out as one of the core obstacles trying to be overcome by humanity in terms of being absolved from inevitable mortality.

Following this comprehension as to the nature of the sublime, its association with the term terror needs elaboration. Both Burke and Kant insist that the key to experiencing the sublime lies solely in invoking the feeling of terror, hence opening a gateway towards a broader perception not limited by the confines of the rational mind. In complete agreement with Burke and Kant, Ann Radcliffe, an author very much in the vein of Mary Shelley, although focusing on the gothic element rather than on the Romantic movement, elaborates on the consequences of experiencing horror and terror and the distinction between these experiences shed light on what either of these feelings are capable of. In Ann Radcliffe's writings as well as in Botting's arguments on the subject referencing Radcliffe's notions of horror, it is deduced as a feeling that stuns, even freezes the faculties of the mind. On the other hand, however much like Edmund Burke and Immanuel Kant suggest, Ann Radcliffe places the feeling of terror as an *a priori* condition for experiencing the sublime in so far as she posits that "...objects of terror not only give it a sense of its own power but, in the appreciation of awful

sublimity, suggest the power of a divine order..." (Botting, 1999 p. 48).

After having emphasized the ever-stronger growing link between the Sturm und Drang movement as a precursor to English Romanticism including the construction of its protagonist, the notion of the sublime and its utilization within the narratives belonging to either movement can be analyzed as a verification of the model of the coining narratives namely Goethe's *The Sorrows of Young Werther*, which is considered one of the first literary works that transduces with the movement and Mary Shelley's *Frankenstein*.

Both selected narratives feature very specific common denominators inherent to English Romanticism though unmistakably taking its roots in German Sturm und Drang. An important distinction however is to understand the literary strands hailing from both traditions and how they affect one another. Lilian R. Furst in her article *Romanticism in Historical Perspective* boldly draws the battle lines between the two traditions by stating the following:

To suggest, however, that Romanticism should really be called 'Germanticism' on account of its essentially Germanic roots and spirit is an exaggeration, not to say a distortion in view of its early sources in England, although it is not without some element of truth, and high incidence of German words used in connection with Romanticism... in itself indicates Romanticism's deep entrenchment in Germany (Furst, 1968 p. 123).

As much as Furst's position on the relation between the two traditions seems counterproductive to the aim of this article when looked upon closely it is a verification of the initial suggestion regarding Sturm und Drang as a precursor to English Romanticism. Furst posits that English Pre-Romanticism has adopted the transcendentalism of the German philosophers of the Jena school, those who also gave rise to German Romanticism itself. This in turn emphasizes the fact that German Romanticism as a movement succeeds English Romanticism. In other words, the Romantic movement in Germany postdates English Romanticism which is not to say that both take their roots in German transcendental philosophy which is deemed rather the school of thought on which Sturm und Drang is the creative artistic expression. Hence again, though English Romanticism is certainly not to be considered Germanticism -in Furst's terminology-, it is evident that the philosophy, the aim, and the urge towards the sublime do emerge from the Sturm und Drang movement (Furst, 1968 p. 124). This is only more obvious when the selected narratives for this article are put side by



side in terms of analyzing the irrefutable markers that derive from the movement of Sturm und Drang such as the concept of the *Kraftmensch*, *Kraftnatur*, the experiencing of the sublime and the promotion of free reigning emotions to the point of irrationality and unification with nature. The notion of *Kraftmensch* is one of the most crucial notions in binding the two traditions with one another and showcasing the origins of English Romanticism in Sturm und Drang. *Kraftmensch* consists of two German words coined by Klinger, and it can also be referred to as *Kraftgenie* and/or *Machtmensch* meaning “...urkräftiger Mensch, Kraftnatur...”, ‘natively powerful person, one of powerful nature’ (Leidner, 1989 p. 179) which seems to be the definition of the protagonist constructions prominent in both traditions.

The protagonist of Mary Shelley’s *Frankenstein*, Doctor Victor Frankenstein, who by utilizing an electrical current revives a corpse and creates his monster. In becoming a creator, himself, now he contemplates his ‘beautiful’ creation by watching his lungs fill with air and lastly, its yellow eyes open. He goes on by not being able to explain his emotions (Shelley, 1999 p. 45). This incapability of not being able to express his awe -being petrified to utter a word- at his creation can be thought of as a reference to first what Radcliffe discusses as terror and then what Burke and Kant argue as the sublime.

In Mary Shelley’s narrative the title is already indicative of the notion in reference to Prometheus linking the ancient Greek myth of creation directly to the understanding of the agency emphasized in the *Kraftmensch*. Mary Shelley’s novel is not just *Frankenstein* but *Frankenstein: or The Modern Prometheus* and the ‘creator’ of humankind according to Greek mythology. According to the original myth, during the process of cosmogony Epimetheus, the brother of Prometheus is tasked with this duty by the Olympian Gods. Epimetheus, whose name etymologically means *afterthought* acts without thinking about the consequences of his actions thoroughly as his name obviously indicates. He commences by creating animals whereby giving them the best gifts to survive such as strength, swiftness, courage, and many more until no gifts remain to bestow upon humankind ensuring their survival. When Epimetheus realizes his shortcomings against humankind in adequately equipping them, he consults his brother, Prometheus, etymologically meaning *forethought* who is the wiser of the two. Hence the duty of compensating for this inadequacy falls

upon Prometheus the Wise who in his love for humankind violates the set taboo of the Olympian Gods to make humankind superior to all other creations by initially granting them divine knowledge and mobility. He makes them erect and upright like Gods whereafter he ascends to Olympus, to be more precise to the sun, and there, he lights a burning torch, which is interpreted not only as fire but as a metaphor for divine knowledge (Hamilton, 2017 p.101).

This interpretation, in turn, can be directly associated with the *Genesis* narrative of Adam and Eve's original sin of violating God's ordain and eating from the forbidden "...tree of the knowledge of good and evil" (New Living Translation, Holy Bible. 1996. Genesis 2:9). With this forbidden act, they can be seen as gaining agency by overreaching their human limitations and becoming akin to the divine again verifiable by God's statement "Then the LORD God said, 'The people have become as we are, knowing everything, both good and evil. What if they eat the fruit of the tree of life? Then they will live forever!'" (NLT, Holy Bible. 1996. Genesis 3:22). It can be argued that Adam and Eve do become the initial *Kraftmensch(-en)* in gaining divine knowledge and becoming like God by violation of the divine taboo. However, they are banned from the Garden of Eden to be prevented from complete agency by becoming immortal like God too, which is the exact obstacle Shelley's Dr. Frankenstein is adamant to overcome.

Adam and Eve are yet not fully divine since they are still mortal and the fact that they have violated the divine law will be further relevant as Georges Bataille makes use of the term in *Erotism: Death & Sensuality* whilst associating it with other terms such as death, taboos, and the suspension of taboos in alignment with sublimation and gaining agency. Furthermore, Bataille draws a parallel between the notion of work and thereby being cut off from violence where he again associates the term violence with the term violation, since he argues that violation is a violent act against the taboo in motion. He continues by positing that death in itself can be understood as the greatest and final violent act toward a human, violating the animate body of the being and rendering it inanimate since "...violence is always the cause of death. It may have acted through magical means, but someone is always responsible, someone is always a murderer" (Bataille, 1986 p. 47). This violation understood as an act of ultimate violence nonetheless necessitates a culprit, be it divine or human.

According to Bataille, this is also how taboos seem to have come into effect “The taboo which lays hold on the others at the side of a corpse is the distance they put between themselves and violence, by which they cut themselves off from violence” (Bataille, 1986 p. 45). Apparently, for Bataille, the relation between death, the uncanny sight of a corpse, and violence is evident due to the horror of death irking one away whilst the safe distance between one and death itself -since one merely gazes upon the corpse and is not yet dead- invokes terror setting one in awe. “The horror of the corpse as a symbol of violence and as a threat of the contagiousness of violence...” (Bataille, 1986 p. 45). This description of Bataille is directly relatable with the consequence of Radcliffe’s notion of terror whilst it points to Burke and Kant’s definition of the sublime. Whereby Kant’s labeling of the sublime can be considered as something divine and out of reach belonging to the noumenal universe which is beyond us, as opposed to the phenomenal universe humankind resides in. Much like Plato once suggested a distinction between the realm of Ideas and Kant’s noumenal versus phenomenal universe, Bataille sets an identical distinction between the sacred world beyond us which is the universe of the divine from which taboos hail, and the profane world in which humankind tries to distance itself from immanent death (Bataille, 1986 p. 44-45).

Following this line of thought, Shelley’s protagonist Dr. Frankenstein seems to have violated any and every primal taboo associated with the sacred and divine law. Even the fact that the animated creation of Dr. Frankenstein is an assembled corpse draws attention to the protagonist’s awkward position between the sacred and profane world. On the one hand, he creates, breathes life, and renders a corpse animate, rescuing it from its violated state. By doing so he assumes the role reserved for God and himself violates a taboo. Furthermore, in alignment with Bataille’s suggestion, Dr. Frankenstein, gazing at the monster’s corpse is horrifying. By rendering the corpse animate and assuming a divine role, the protagonist is on the one hand still horrified by the violent nature of his creation which can be considered more as un-dead rather than alive. Therefore, the protagonist Dr. Frankenstein needs to distance himself from the monster of his own creation. On the other hand, his horror gradually transforms into a feeling of being terrified and in awe of his own divine accomplishment. Dr. Frankenstein finds himself having finally overreached death itself and taken the second step towards divinity, not only by overcoming mortality via modern science and electricity quite like Nietzsche suggests hence,

indicating the agency of an *Übermensch* or in context with this article's assumptions the portrayal of the protagonist as an evolved *Kraftmensch*.

This can be again associated with the metaphor of ancient Greek mythological creation symbolized by Zeus' lightning bolt- since Dr. Frankenstein uses the same method to create. But also, his reaction in observance of his act of creation is identical to that of the God of the Old Testament. When Victor Frankenstein animated his monster, he could only utter the word 'beautiful'. This is almost a replica of the Genesis narrative where God creates humankind and the universe, "Then God said, "Let us make people in our image, to be like ourselves. They will be masters over all life ... and he saw that it was excellent in every way (NLT, Holy Bible. 1996. Genesis 1:26-31). Taking the quote from the Bible referring to God's creation of mankind, the initial emphasis should be laid on the fact that God, after the act of creating takes a step back, looks upon his creation, and contemplates its excellence much like Dr. Frankenstein contemplates his creation and deems it beautiful.

At this point Dr. Frankenstein's referring to his monstrous creation as beautiful is relevant since it is not the external beauty that is being referred to but the beauty of creation itself. Just like the God of the Old Testament adds to the end of each creational act where it is stated that: "...And God saw that it was good" (NLT, Holy Bible. 1996. Genesis 1:25). This connection efficiently showcases the agency of the *Kraftmensch* who creates beauty, an irrational beauty with a hideous exterior as a defiant act against God and the taboo regarding mortality. In this sense what *Kraftmensch(-en)* tried to accomplish is to complete what God has left unfinished, and imperfect, their aim being agency, becoming the man of action who in all irrationality has the courage to perfect creation and overcome being human. Moreover, in so doing imitating the divine act but also by violating the taboo associated with the reluctance of God to let people become immortal and divine like him by eating from the Tree of Life (NLT, Holy Bible. 1996. Genesis 3:22). Nevertheless, the un-dead creation is not a perfected human being but rather an animated corpse hence in alignment with Bataille's suggestion a distancing from it is necessary and inevitable -as also seen at the end of the narrative- because the corpse, even though it is dead/un-dead does not stop being a threat to the living. On the contrary "It constitutes a supernatural peril which can be 'caught' from the dead body ... If they had to bury the corpse it is less in order to keep it safe then to keep themselves safe from

its contagion” (Bataille, 1986 p. 46). Although it is important to point out that regardless of the condition of the created monster, the overreaching accomplishment of the protagonist remains a prominent example of agency. When the acts of Shelley’s protagonist are taken into consideration, Dr. Frankenstein can be labeled as a full-fledged *Kraftmensch*, although he commits all the possible divine taboo violations, he does come into the experience of the sublime via the feeling of terror exactly as Burke and Kant describe the experience. Moreover, the component that links any sublime experience is also present since the created monster is not one invoking horror – which according to Radcliffe stuns the senses- but he is one invoking terror, who again in Radcliffe’s terminology opens the senses, lifts the spirit, and enables the experience of the sublime (Botting, 1999 p. 26-27).

The portrayal of the *Kraftmensch* takes a different turn in Goethe’s *The Sorrows of Young Werther* mainly because the protagonist Werther is a precursor to its English counterpart Dr. Frankenstein which now is not the reflection of the Sturm und Drang’s more naïve and still not completely developed *Kraftmensch*. David Hill argues that the main argument of the Sturm und Drang is a mere individualism and/or reflection of the modern consciousness (Hill, 2003, p. 34). Therefore, in Goethe’s narrative, the readers find themselves going through Werther’s letters addressed to Wilhelm, where he generally talks about his affection for Charlotte, who is already engaged to Albert. The novel evolves around this love triangle apart from the criticism of social classes as one of the general markers of the movement. Even though Werther is aware that he cannot be with Lotte, which is the focal point of the plot, his feelings intensify day by day. Towards the end of the novel, Werther’s inner emotional turmoil can be considered as a direct implication of his self-demise and eventual suicide. In this sense this coining narrative of the Sturm und Drang does not emphasize the love story but the inner world and nature of a Sturm und Drang protagonist set on the internal evaluation within his self to gradually progress towards the experiencing of the sublime as cited by David Hill from Goethe’s Maifest: “Ich kehre in mich selbst zurück, und finde eine Welt!” (Hill, 2003, p.34), which can be loosely translated as “I turn within myself and find there a world!” (Hill, 2003, p.43). Hill continues to argue that Werther can be considered as the only character in the narrative who finds himself. With this notion of ‘finding oneself’ happy thus he realizes that choosing death -gaining agency over his own life- is always a possible

option (Hill, 2003, p. 34-35). As was discussed before since Werther can neither create nor overcome mortality -as Dr. Frankenstein is able to and play God- he gains the agency of his death at least in terms of when he is to die.

Committing suicide, therefore, can be thought of as the act of agency taken by Werther -usually reserved for God being the invisible culprit behind all human mortality. Now Goethe's protagonist, in a very naïve way, has violated the taboo of taking one's own life in the sense of playing God, hence experiencing a subtle version of the sublime though not as grandiose as Shelley's protagonist. Nonetheless as a result of this action, one can state that by violating God's taboo regarding suicide, Werther has successfully become a *Kraftmensch*. Though it is important to emphasize that Werther's journey is more focused on self-fulfillment and becoming one with nature and the experiencing of the sublime which is the reflection of the discourse of Sturm und Drang, Dr. Frankenstein's agency, in alignment with Romanticism is rather set on becoming the divine or rising above God in one's agency. In other words, as Nietzsche later posits, in overcoming being human. However, the utilization of nature is prominent as well as key to the aim of each narrative in regard to the experience of the sublime. The notion of nature and the condition of the weather in Goethe's *The Sorrows of Young Werther* is a vital tool to invoke the proper circumstances in reflecting the inner world of the protagonist's progression to *Kraftmensch* which is a direct genre marker of Sturm und Drang. Initially, the reader is greeted by the protagonist, Werther, where he can be found in complete harmony with nature itself, which can be an implication that he is content with the scenery where he is free from alienation (Hill, 2003, p. 34-35). Here, nature seems to be utilized as a metaphor of unity, of wholeness with oneself and the universe, hence the sublime. Joyce S. Walker stated in his article Sex, Suicide, and the Sublime: A Reading of Goethe's "Werther" that:

I contend that *Die Leiden des Jungen Werther* may be read in a way that emphasizes the dramatic interplay of beauty and sublimity in the hero's mind... The movement from the beautiful to the sublime is reflected in Werther's consciousness and projected onto nature... (Walker, 1999 p. 208-209).

On the other hand, what Werther feels in terms of his emotions also affects the weather around him, for example, when he meets Lotte for the first time, due to his extreme internal emotions, a storm interrupts their dance, reflecting Werther's own emotions and creating a real storm which affects

his life. This reversed reflection also indicates a unity wherein it is obvious that not just Werther's emotions are reflected in nature but in reversal, nature itself or the weather conditions change in accordance with the emotional state of the protagonist. In another example, Werther is in a small room in a country inn writing a letter to Lotte stating that he is only staying there due to a severe storm because he was looking for shelter (Goethe, 2021 p. 42). Here the emphasis is on nature having an immediate relationship with the protagonists' conscious and unconscious mind and emotions, which can be thought of as, yet again, an indicator of the Sturm und Drang Movement.

Mary Shelley, throughout her narrative of *Frankenstein*, depicts a clear scene in which she narrates the natural beauties and natural catastrophic phenomena. These forces of nature can be linked with the sublime, as Kant and Burke argued. As Radcliffe also suggests the only way of experiencing the sublime is through the notion of terror.

In a similar manner, during Shelley's narration, there are several depictions of the North Pole, the Alps, and the mountains of Jura. "Storms are one of the main sources of the sublime in nature, as they contain [...] the two main elements: danger, and therefore fear and terror, and vastness" (Román, 2014/2015 p. 3). Therefore, it is safe to assume that those natural phenomena are widely used throughout the narrative by Mary Shelley to construct metaphors of the sublime. In addition, said phenomena are perfect tools to draw a parallel with Burke and Kant's suggestions, in terms of Radcliffe's terror and horror notions. It is observable that the most crucial role nature demonstrates is that it leads to a state of awe again as described by Kant and Burke. In terms of the sense of nature, one can argue that the narrator is giving a visual representation of the condition of the weather by descriptions like the sky is full of clouds, or that it is about to start raining, or that a storm is rising and that he can hear it (Shelley, 1999 p. 59). Yet another worth mentioning example can be taken from Chapter 10 where it is stated that "The rain was pouring in torrents, and thick mists hid the summits of mountains..." (Shelley, 1999 p. 75). All these examples regarding the descriptions of nature and weather throughout the narrative are not just utilized as ambient components but very purposefully engaged as an essential reflection of the relationship between man and nature.

Romantic and Gothic markers such as the uncanny environment and again in line with its precursor Sturm und Drang are utilized to highlight the

experience of the sublime whilst constructing a protagonist engaged in inner unification and unified with the universe. However, this type of relation with nature and it being utilized as a gateway condition towards the sublime seems only reserved for humankind. In other words, one way or the other, whether the protagonist violates divine taboos in an effort to mimic God or is in awe of the divine within a transcendent mind state, human is human and confined by the laws of nature, hence is within the agency degree mirrored by Sturm und Drang's *Kraftmensch*. Any transgression- such as Dr. Frankenstein achieving the role of life creator or bringing an end to immortality is reflective of a higher degree of agency, more parallel with what Nietzsche will later refer to as overcoming being human. Though, in end effect, overcome by the force of nature itself either by causing fatal harm or by a guilty conscience, in regard to the non-human monster however "...the daemon can easily surpass these boundaries and abrupt territories, demonstrates the superiority of the monster not only over human race, but also over nature itself" (Román, 2014/2015 p. 6).

## **CONCLUSION**

The main argumentation of this article being to place Sturm und Drang as a precursor movement giving rise to English Romanticism, and whether this assumption can be verified with the construct of protagonists relevant to each movement has traced a diachrony of philosophical thought schools evidently affecting and transforming the succeeding approaches. As was argued previously, human nature and emotions have been neglected with the emergence of the Industrial Revolution with science and rationalism. Sturm und Drang, as a German-originated movement opposed this idea of rationalism and this led to Goethe penning *The Sorrows of Young Werther*, in which the author attempts to defy rationalism by giving reign to the irrationality of emotions and urges the individual to reunite with nature resulting in a unification with the universe whereas the English Romantic Movement takes this aim a step further to achieve overcoming human boundaries with a higher degree of defiance and violation.

Shelley's *Frankenstein* not only creates a similar atmosphere of narration but also goes beyond what the Stürmer und Dränger have done. Shelley utilizes the scientific developments of the era and defies God's taboo related to mortality in terms of overcoming the human boundaries of perpetual death. Therefore, it is evident that Shelley's protagonist Dr. Frankenstein exceeds Goethe's protagonist, Werther, in the degree of gaining agency.



Not only does Shelley's protagonist achieve the state of having an agency over death, but also Goethe's protagonist, therefore, with these violations both protagonists could experience the sublime, as first Burke and then Kant argued. This is what Nietzsche means by *Übermensch*, which can be thought of as overcoming being human. Yet it is important to keep in mind that, as Radcliffe posits, terror is the only way to experience the sublime, which is in both narratives Dr. Frankenstein and Werther experience.

It is, therefore, assumed that what Goethe started with Werther, who defies God's taboo and gains an agency over his own death, in contribution to the Movement of Sturm und Drang in terms of *Kraftmensch* was adopted by the Anglo-Saxon tradition and perfected by Mary Shelley. Shelley produces an anglicized, perfected, and full-fledged version of the *Kraftmensch*, namely Dr. Victor Frankenstein in other words as Furst states: “[into the Anglo-Saxon tradition] ... was now added to the transcendentalism of the German philosophers...” (Furst, 1968 p. 124). While Werther defies God's taboo by committing suicide Dr. Frankenstein takes a more grandiose step and animates a corpse, creating a monster, taking the role reserved for God. In both narratives, the protagonists' acts can be considered as the defiance of God's taboo, as Bataille argued, which eventually promotes them as *Kraftmensch(-en)*. Once more taking reference from Furst, “England with a galaxy of fine poets in Blake, Wordsworth, Coleridge, Shelley, Keats, and Byron assumed the primacy which has been Germany's. Not that there was ever a Romantic ‘school’ in England as there had been in Germany...” (Furst, 1968 p. 130). Hence, the interplay of German and English traditions in relation to Sturm und Drang being a precursor of English Romanticism can be verified by the construct of the German *Kraftmensch* and how its finalized portrayal as a man of complete agency overcoming being human can be placed within the coining narrative of the movement reflected by Dr. Victor Frankenstein.

## REFERENCES

Backes, A. (1994). Revisiting “Frankenstein”: A Study in Reading and Education. *The English Journal*, 83(4), 33–36. Retrieve Date: December 9, 2023. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.2307/821081>.

Bataille, G. (1986). *Erotism: Death and Sensuality*. (Dalwood, M. Trans.) Walker and Company, NY.

Botting, F. (1999) *Gothic*. Routledge. New York, NY, The USA, and Canada.

Burke, E. (1764). *A Philosophical Enquiry into the Origin of Our Ideas of the Sublime and Beautiful*. (4<sup>th</sup> Ed.). Library of the University of Michigan.

Furst, L. R. (1968). Romanticism in Historical Perspective. *Comparative Literature Studies*, 5(2), 115–143. Retrieve Date: January 2, 2024. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/40467744>.

Gardner, S. (1999). *Routledge Philosophy Guidebook To Kant and The Critique of Pure Reason*. Routledge.

Goethe, J.W. v. (2021) *The Sorrows of Young Werther*. (Dillon, B. R. Trans.) The U.S. The Project Gutenberg EBook. Retrieve Date: December 10, 2023. Retrieved from <https://www.gutenberg.org/>.

Greenblatt, S. (Ed.) (2006). *The Norton Anthology of English Literature* (8<sup>th</sup> Ed.). W.W. Norton Company.

Hamilton, E. (2017). *Mythology Timeless Tales of Gods and Heroes*. Hachette Book Group, Inc. New York, NY 10104.

Hill, D. (2003) *Introduction David Hill (Ed.) Volume 6 Literature of the Sturm und Drang*. Rochester, NY, The USA. Camden House.

Hogsette, D. S. (2011). Metaphysical Intersections in “Frankenstein”: Mary Shelley’s Theistic Investigation of Scientific Materialism and Transgressive Autonomy. *Christianity and Literature*, 60(4), 531–559. Retrieve Date: December 12, 2023. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/44314873>.

Kant, I. (2007) *Oxford World’s Classics: Immanuel Kant Critique of Judgement*. (Meredith, J. C. Trans.). Revised, Edited, and Introduced by Nicholas Walker.

KİZİLTAN, E., & DALKILIÇ, N. (2022). Elektrofizyolojinin Tarihsel Serüveni: Galvani Sonrası Galvanizm. *Mersin Üniversitesi Tıp Fakültesi Lokman Hekim Tıp Tarihi Ve Folklorik Tıp Dergisi*, 12(2), 247-261. Retrieve Date: December 12, 2023. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.31020/mutfd.1037800>.

Leidner, A. C. (1989). A Titan in Extenuating Circumstances: Sturm und Drang and the Kraftmensch. *PMLA*, 104(2), 178–189. Retrieve Date: December 12, 2023. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.2307/462503>.

*New Living Translation*. (1996). Tyndale House Publishers, Inc. Wheaton, Illinois.

Nietzsche, F. (2006) *Thus Spoke Zarathustra A Book for All and None*. (Caro, A. del Ed. &Trans.). Cambridge University Press. The UK.

Román, D. C. (2014/2015) *The role and significance of nature in the novel: Swiss Alps, Scotland and the Arctic, according to Romantic and Gothic tenets like “The Sublime*. Retrieve Date: January 12, 2024. Retrieved from [https://www.academia.edu/20853730/The\\_role\\_and\\_significance\\_of\\_nature\\_in\\_Frankenstein\\_Swiss\\_Alps\\_Scotland\\_and\\_the\\_Arctic\\_according\\_to\\_Romantic\\_and\\_Gothic\\_tenets\\_like\\_The\\_Sublime\\_](https://www.academia.edu/20853730/The_role_and_significance_of_nature_in_Frankenstein_Swiss_Alps_Scotland_and_the_Arctic_according_to_Romantic_and_Gothic_tenets_like_The_Sublime_).

Shelley, M. (1999) *Frankenstein: or The Modern Prometheus*. The U.S. The Project Gutenberg EBook. Retrieve Date: December 10, 2023. Retrieved from <https://www.gutenberg.org/>.

Stokoe, F. W. (1963). *German Influence In The English Romantic Period*. New York Russell & Russell.

Tezcan, E. (2018) *Batı Geleneğinde Aşk, Cinsellik ve Ölüm: Tristan ve İsolde* [Doctorate Dissertation, Istanbul University]. Yükseköğretim Kurumu Başkanlığı Tez Merkezi, Dissertation No: 514399. Retrieve Date: January 3, 2024. Retrieved from <https://tez.yok.gov.tr/UlusalTezMerkezi/tezSorguSonucYeni.jsp>.

Walker, J. S. (1999). Sex, Suicide, and the Sublime: A Reading of Goethe’s “Werther.” *Monatshefte*, 91(2), 208–223. Retrieve Date: January 2, 2024. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/30153789>



## *Shakespeare's Hamlet in Manga Form*

Metin SAY<sup>1</sup>

### **ABSTRACT**

This article explores the evolution of manga from its historical roots in Japan's Meiji Period to its global influence and differentiation from Western comics, particularly focusing on the role of manga adaptations of Shakespeare's works, like *Hamlet*. It delves into the cultural and technological factors that contributed to manga's rise, the unique characteristics that distinguish it from other comics, and the specific ways manga has embraced and adapted Shakespearean narratives to appeal to contemporary audiences globally. The analysis includes the impact of manga adaptations on understanding and engaging with Shakespeare's plays, highlighting the interplay between traditional literature and modern manga art forms in both educational and entertainment contexts. The text further examines the commercial success and cultural significance of manga adaptations of Shakespeare, underscoring the medium's flexibility and its role in globalizing Shakespeare's works.

**Keywords:** *Hamlet, Manga, Meiji Period, globalizing Shakespeare's works.*

---

<sup>1</sup> Istanbul Aydin University, Istanbul, metinsay@stu.aydin.edu.tr, <https://orcid.org/0009-0005-8305-5414>

## ÖZ

Bu makale, manga'nın tarihsel kökenlerinden Japonya'nın Meiji Dönemi'ne, Batı çizgi romanlarından farklılaşmasına ve küresel etkisine kadar olan evrimini incelemekte, özellikle Shakespeare'in *Hamlet* gibi eserlerinin manga adaptasyonlarının rolüne odaklanmaktadır. Manga'nın yükselişine katkıda bulunan kültürel ve teknolojik faktörleri, diğer çizgi romanlardan ayıran benzersiz özelliklerini ve Shakespeare'in anlatılarını çağdaş küresel izleyicilere hitap edecek şekilde benimseyip uyarladığı özel yolları içerir. Bu analiz, manga adaptasyonlarının Shakespeare'in oyunlarını anlama ve onlarla etkileşime girme üzerindeki etkisini inceyip ve geleneksel edebiyat ile modern manga sanat formları arasındaki etkileşimi hem eğitim hem de eğlence bağlamlarında vurgulamaktadır. Metin, ayrıca Shakespeare'in manga adaptasyonlarının ticari başarısını ve kültürel önemini incelemekte, ortamın esnekliğini ve Shakespeare'in eserlerini küreselleştirmedeki rolünü altını çizmektedir.

**Keywords:** *Hamlet, Manga, Meiji Dönemi, Shakespeare'in eserlerinin küreselleştirilmesi.*

## THE ART OF MANGA

*Manga* is an umbrella term to refer to graphic novels and comics in Japan. The meaning of the term is explained as “*Manga* (漫画 or まんが) is Japanese for ‘comics.’ Coined in the 1800s by the Japanese artist Hokusai to refer to doodles in his sketchbook, the term can be translated as “whimsical sketches” or “lighthearted pictures.” (Thompson, 2007, p. xii) The origin of the art style of manga in Japan is discussed to date back to the illustrations of Buddhist monks in the twelfth century. (Brenner, 2007, p. 1) The mass consumption of the art style came with the use of wooden block prints in the Tokugawa Era, “Although panels were not specifically used, the tradition of style and observation from life turned into stylized beauty is still an evident part of manga’s visuals,” which then developed further to become comics. (Brenner, 2007, p. 2) However, what is known and consumed as manga in comic book format today evolved after the 1960s with major Western influences.

The earlier influence of Western comics in Japan began during the Meiji Period (1862–1912), when “the rich tradition of Japanese graphic narration was to meet the Western one, and this encounter gave birth to what has been named — for the first time — manga.” (Boissou, 2010, p. 21) Since the

Meiji Period in Japan “brought about the modernization and Westernization of the country,” (Meiji Restoration), manga were consistently affected as well. During the Meiji Period, “The West introduced the technology — offset and lithography printing — that permitted the transformation of the graphic narration into a new type of low-cost mass media, and some Westerners provided the model for such a new media.” (Boissou, 2010, p. 21) With the technology, artists from the West started interacting with Japanese society as well, the most influential names being Briton Charles Wirgman and Frenchman Georges Bigot, though the main trigger for the American-like comics was due to political reasons. (Schodt, 1983, p. 38) For instance, in 1897, the *Marumaru Chimbun* published a series suggesting that the political cartoons from the newspapers had been influential in the victory of William McKinley in the U.S. election. (Boissou, 2010, p. 22)

This series, along with various discussions on politics and modernism in Japan, enabled Japanese reformists to incorporate comics into the everyday print of newspapers. “Several years later, two of Japan’s most famous cartoonists of this century, Rakuten Kitazawa (1876–1955) and Ipppei Okamoto (1886–1948), helped popularise and adapt American cartoons and comic strips.” This adaptation process, in awe of the popularity of comic strips in American newspapers, led Kitazawa to create the first serialised Japanese comic strip with regular characters. (Schodt, 1983, p. 42) However, the rise and commercial success of the art form came after World War II, with heavier influences from the West.

As stated, and explained with examples, before the 1960s, “manga are mostly children’s adventure stories and family newspaper strips.” (Thompson, 2007, p. xvii) The exception to that generalisation and the trigger for the modern version of manga would be the attempts of Osamu Tezuka, who tried his hand at creating science fiction and *Shōjo*<sup>2</sup> manga to tell stories. Later on, his attempts earned him the titles of “Grandfather of Manga” and “God of Manga,” since his first popular work, *Astro Boy*, started a revolution and, alongside Tezuka’s many other works, changed manga culture forever. Schodt even summarises his presence in the manga industry as “Tezuka is an example of how one talented individual, born at the right time, can profoundly change the field he decides to work in.” (Schodt, 1983, p. 63)

<sup>2</sup> “This term distinguishes the audience for girls, or *shōjo* manga. *Shōjo* manga is usually defined by a concentration on emotion and relationships.” (Brenner, 2007, p. 304)

The first modern manga as the world knows it today appeared in 1947 with the publication of *Shintakarajima* (The New Treasure Island) by Tezuka Osamu himself and reportedly sold 400,000 copies in a few months.” (Boissou, 2010, pp. 24-25) The 200 pages comic, with its “creative page layout, clever use of sound effects, and lavish spread of frames to depict a single action made reading *Shintakarajima* almost like watching a movie. The young readers were dazzled.” (Schodt, 1983, p. 62) Moreover, after the success of his first work, Tezuka kept working relentlessly, and his numerous works helped the art of manga reach its full potential in both the international and local markets immensely. The most apparent example of these great achievements is his most popular work, *Astro Boy*.

*Astro Boy*, or *Tetsuwan Atom* in Japanese, featured an atomic-empowered boy robot built by a scientist as a replacement for his own son, who died in a car accident. It first appeared as a serialised manga in 1951, ran for 18 years, and became the first successful globalised product of the manga industry after it “began syndication as Japan’s first television cartoon (which was successfully exported abroad, including to the US) in 1961 under the name *Astro Boy*.” (Allison, 2000, p. 73) Besides Tezuka’s brilliance, there were two major reasons behind *Astro Boy*’s international success. The incorporation of Western influences into the globally distributed media enabled consumers outside of Japan to feel somewhat familiar with a foreign work of art.

As mentioned earlier, modern manga as a form is considerably influenced by the West through technology, politics, and comic strips. Moreover, the art and artists themselves are influenced by the West as well. “Tezuka’s artistic style was primarily inspired not by other comics, but by cinema, particularly the works of animators like Walt Disney and Max Fleischer”. As manga’s popularity surged, Tezuka’s groundbreaking approach went on to inspire a growing community of manga artists (Schodt, 1983, p. 63-64).

On the other side, apart from the influence of Western comics, postwar manga stood out from American and Franco-Belgian comics with what Tezuka started. Much like the comic artists who contributed massively to the popularity of superhero franchises in American comic books during World War II. (Sanderson et al., 2023) Tezuka and the other first generations manga artists were teenagers during the war. They were not old enough to take part in the fight but were mature enough to feel the pressure of war, and it was reflected in their art. (Johnson-Woods, 2010, p. 25)



According to Johnson-Woods, the trauma of the war brought four main elements that differentiated manga from other comic books. The first element is the underlying adult failure, destruction of the world, and teenagers saving the world through the power of friendship to promote optimism. The occurrence of this element seems pretty fitting for the devastation the war brought about, and it works both as a promise and as an inspiration to future generations. The second one is the *mecha* genre, in which robots piloted by teenagers save Japan from others, due to a desire to win the war their fathers could not. The third one is the scientific adventure genre, just like Tezuka's *Astro Boy*, and the last element was "the fruit of the enforcement of new ideals imported by U.S. occupation (freedom, democracy) upon a nation whose traditional values had failed but not disappeared." (Johnson-Woods, 2010, p. 25)

After the 1960s, the popularity of manga skyrocketed when anime TV shows were produced for the first time. As Schodt writes in detail, "By the mid-1960s the industry had assumed its present configuration. It was predominantly located in Tokyo. Television and comics were firmly intertwined in a symbiotic relationship." (Schodt, 1983, p. 67). The anime enabled manga to reach out to a wider audience in and outside Japan, and this newly found popularity and globalisation allowed manga to differentiate itself from the original inspiration of the art form, American comics, which eventually fluctuated the success of manga outside of Japan.

Many things about Manga changed or stood out from other forms of comics thanks to the globalisation of the products. For instance, "While the development of comics in the United States faltered, and sales shrivelled, Japan gave birth to a Godzilla. But the explosion of the industry did not occur without a sacrifice. The colour printing which was so common before the war all but disappeared. Political and editorial cartoons were virtually destroyed by politics, ideology, and later, apathy." (Schodt, 1983, p. 67). As another example, unlike its Western counterparts, manga has various sub-categories that appeal to different target audiences, like *Shōjo* and *Josei*<sup>3</sup> manga, which were eventually owned by female creators, "displacing men with the convincing argument that they better understood female psychology." (Schodt, 1983, p. 67) since the genres were specifically

---

<sup>3</sup> "This term distinguishes the audience for manga aimed at women aged eighteen and up. Josei manga include many of the traditions of *Shōjo* titles, but the content is more mature in terms of explicitness and complexity," (Brenner, 2007, p. 298).

aimed at women and young girls. However, in the U.S. comic industry, which is largely dominated by superhero comics, *Shōjo* and *Josei* manga were deemed too unconventional and failed to reach a certain popularity until recently.

In 1993, Japan achieved great commercial success with a live-action show called *The Mighty Morphin Power Rangers* in Hollywood, whereas other Japanese productions did not do so well. The main reason behind the success of the show was attributed to its radical transformation to suit American taste better, contrary to the anime show called *Sailor Moon*. According to the business experts, the reason why *Sailor Moon* failed to achieve the same success as *The Mighty Morphin Power Rangers* was because the anime did not go through a similar change as the live action show and was not Americanized, so the American audience felt that it was too foreign to be enjoyed (Allison, 2000, p. 67-68). Although *Sailor Moon* became successful in other countries where it was launched, such as France, Spain, Italy, the Netherlands, Thailand, Hong Kong, and Canada, due to smart marketing campaigns in the local markets, the manga and anime industry, to prevent similar instances to the failure of marketing *Sailor Moon* in the U.S., took on a new marketing strategy.

During the mid-1990s, the local market for manga started to decline in Japan, and publishers began searching for a new market. The licencing process started first with the other Asian countries in the late 1980s, then proceeded with Europe. After successful licencing processes with Asia and Europe, Japanese publishers started to focus on the U.S. market as a last resort, due to the population of children in the U.S. being twice as large as Japan's. (Wong, 2006, p. 29) After entering the U.S. market, to appeal to the American audience, without repeating a similar marketing failure akin to *Sailor Moon*, publishers and artists decided to promote Japanese works as nationless and as general as they could. While studying this globalisation process of Japanese products in detail, Bainbridge and Norris categorised this marketing strategy as “denationalisation” and wrote,

Aside from positioning manga within this commercial flow, the more significant part of the influence of these commercial forces is in the growing denationalization of works of manga that can become standardized global icons, like *Astro Boy* or *Pokémon*. These products can be promoted by marketing campaigns and easily appropriated by audiences to become an appealing product in any market. Through this process, manga is placed within a familiar environment and becomes an everyday practice; just as you play

with *Naruto* action figures, build *Evangelion* model kits and wear *Death Note* hoodies, so too will you read the manga that preceded the anime. (Bainbridge & Norris, 2010, p. 247-248).

The consumption of manga merchandise in other industries boosted both the economic expansion and the cultural recognition of the art of manga. Furthermore, in the United States, manga sales have tripled from 2000 to 2002, a market value of US\$40–50 million with manga now accounting for one-third of the U.S. graphic novel market. (McCarthy, 2006, p. 15) Perhaps even more tellingly, this figure does not include OEL (original English-language) manga. (Bainbridge & Norris, 2010, p. 235). The market values provide an estimation of how many people started consuming manga in 2006 since the current number in 2023 is \$5.05 billion according to The All Japan Magazine and Book Publishers' and Editors' Association (AJPEA), and the immense increase in demand for manga, partly due to easier access via the internet and e-books, shows that in contemporary popular culture, manga is still a popular choice of entertainment. (Vendrell, 2023). However, the key piece of information here is the fact that manga in the original English language do exist. Western culture, after many years of consuming Japanese manga, decided to produce their own manga—not comic books or graphic novels, but specifically manga with unique Japanese artistic style—even after denationalisation of the art style became the most critical marketing strategy outside Japan. Just like Shakespeare's tragedies in manga forms, originally in English yet retold in the Japanese art of manga. So, in the following sections, this paper will examine the process of how *Hamlet* got turned into manga and how it affects the consumers of *Hamlet* in its manga form.

### ***Hamlet* in Japan**

*Hamlet* is one of the most popular Shakespeare plays in general and in Japan due to various reasons, and with a closer look, those reasons reveal unique takes on Shakespeare and the society of Japan through how Japanese artists and intellectuals interpreted Shakespeare. Just as the initial major influences from the West started affecting manga in the Meiji Restoration, Shakespeare and *Hamlet* were first introduced to Japan in the same modernisation period during the late 19th century. During this period, the effects of arts and culture were at their peak, and the interaction between the local culture and the Western culture became inevitable. While being exposed to Western literature, Shakespeare became a prominent figure in

this new, modernised, and intellectual era. Sato summarises the concept by writing, "Shakespeare, or *Hamlet* in particular, had a dramatic impact on the intellectual history of the Meiji period," then strengthens his argument by mentioning, "Drama specialist Kawatake Toshio goes so far as to say that the process of modernization in Japanese poetry, fiction, and drama can be traced through the successive ways in which *Hamlet* was accepted and emulated by Meiji intellectuals." (Sato, 1985, p. 23)

Furthermore, Sato divides the impact of *Hamlet* in Japan into three categories, with three different characters representing each category. "Crest of a utilitarian wave to provide practical advice on how to succeed," through Polonius, next, "with the emerging trend of soul-searching in literature to suggest a way of establishing self-identity," through Hamlet and lastly, "the tide of Romanticism to introduce fragile feminine beauty as a literary," through Ophelia. (Sato, 1985, p. 23) What is interesting in this categorization and about the appearance of *Hamlet* in Japan is that, even though Polonius is not a celebrated character in the canon, he is the first character to have a major presence, and his words affected the modern era of Japan greatly. On this exact subject, Sato starts out by writing, "Hamlet made its entrance in Japan with a mere three lines from Polonius's didactic speech: 'Neither a borrower nor a lender be;/ For loan oft loses both itself and friend, / And borrowing dulls the edge of husbandry'" then he goes on to mention how this epigram became a muse for the tenth chapter of a self-help book by Samuel Smiles, which has become one of the greatest three books of the Meiji period of Japan with its translation under the concept of tales from the West. (Sato, 1985, p. 23)

This fascination with Polonius and his take on money contributes to a very local, very Japanese take on *Hamlet*. The tenth chapter of the self-help book that Sato mentioned was about money and how to manage it, so before appreciating *Hamlet's* literary value and the tragedy the play entails, Japanese intellectuals during the Meiji Period, who were tired after a long history of war and calamity under the feudal regime, tried to prosper economically first in order to create a convenient space for the Japanese people to appreciate cultural modernisation and enrichment.

After the search for practical knowledge stopped between Meiji intellectuals, "in 1874, a Yokohama-based monthly magazine with an English title, *The Japan Punch*, printed his soliloquy starting with the famous question, "To be or not to be," in a Japanese translation transcribed in the Western

alphabet.” (Sato, 1985, p. 24) This monthly magazine called *The Japan Punch* was started by one of the names Schodt mentioned a lot in terms of influence while writing about the beginning of the modernisation period of manga, Charles Wingman. Furthermore, this print of Hamlet’s soliloquy was the earliest appearance of *Hamlet* in Japanese popular culture, which eventually became a major presence with the play’s manga adaptation and numerous references in the manga, anime, and television industries.

### **Shakespeare Adaptations in Japanese Popular Culture**

P. K Nayar argues that “Shakespeare as a product is differentiated along various lines to suit multiple markets,” and Shakespeare suits Japanese popular culture in its own, Japanified way. (Nayar, 2015, p.42) Shakespeare became an enormous figure in Japan, and as one of his most famous works, *Hamlet*, became extremely popular as well, even if people did not read *Hamlet* or any other works of Shakespeare directly. They simply became common knowledge due to regular exposure to entertainment media.

At a Zoom conference titled *Shakespeare in Japan* from Birmingham University, Ryuta Minami addresses this by saying,

Shakespeare is known to almost anyone because the number of people who go to the theatre is limited but Shakespeare appears on TV commercials, and mobile games and comics and what we call light novels and novels for young people. So, they’ve never read Shakespeare’s plays, so sometimes they refer to Shakespeare’s plays as ‘Shakespeare’s novels’ but they are familiar with some, a couple of Shakespeare’s plays, like *Romeo & Juliet* and *Hamlet*, and possibly, *Macbeth* as well. They are quite well known with younger people and older generations as well, I think. (Minami, 2016, 03:00-04:02).

Thus, it is not a far-fetched idea to say that Shakespeare is consumed in Japanese society due to its excellent marketing. But what would be the reason behind commercialising Shakespeare to this extent?

During the same Zoom conference, while talking about the wide use of Shakespeare in Japan, Yukari Yoshihara jokingly says, “And it is copyright-free.” (Yoshihara, 2022, 07:55-07:58) For economic purposes, it is indeed incredibly convenient to use copyright-free material, and it is a plausible contribution to the popularity of Shakespeare, yet there is much more. After her whimsical remark, Yoshihara goes on and explains her reasoning by saying,

I can go back about 100 years, 150 years ago to say that the first Japanese Shakespeare, *The Merchant of Venice*, was *No*<sup>4</sup>, *Kabuki*<sup>5</sup> adaptation. The story followed Shakespeare's *Merchant of Venice*, but the characters were turned into Japanese in kimono. In the first Japanese adaptations of Shakespeare's *Othello*, the story was set in Taiwan during Japanese colonisation. So these are the instances of how Shakespeare was adaptable in the context of Japanese history, politics, etc. And ever since, Shakespeare's works have been giving us really great occasions to adapt, to use, to utilise, to circulate, to reuse Shakespeare to produce something new, weird, and awesome. And, the most recent product of this history, the culture of adaptation is now appearing in popular culture, in manga, anime, cosplay... But they are sort of inheriting, the tradition or history of adapting Shakespeare through its copyright-free use. (Yoshihara, 2022, 08:10-09:53)

As Yoshihara explains in depth with historical context, Japanese popular culture items are, most naturally, reproduced in a way that attracts Japanese consumers. Popular images or symbols in Japan tend to have a dramatic or exaggerated flair to them. For instance, in English, what we perceive as simply cuteness translates to the term *kawaii* in Japanese. The closest translation of the term is cute, yet it has various meanings ranging from the cuteness of a baby to adult cuteness with a hint of sexiness to the cuteness of grotesque things that one seems to want to keep looking at. (Minami, 2016, p. 118) This depth of simple-looking, common themes is what makes Japanese cultural mediums open to interpretation.

The Japanese mainstream culture has many different ways of interpreting Shakespeare and his plays. There has been an abundance of quotes from Shakespearean works in different anime and video games that are widely consumed in Japan, which even led to inserting the author himself in these mediums. Shakespeare in Japan, much like Hello Kitty, has become adjusted to the previously mentioned *kawaii* term and has spread in popularity even back into Western culture without disturbing the root of what makes them Shakespearean. Ryuta Minami, one of the same scholars from the Birmingham University conference, has studied this commotion in-depth and commented on the same finding by writing, When Shakespeare is transferred onto popular media platforms such as anime,

---

4 "Derived from Buddhist traditions and Chinese influences, No started in the fourteenth century and is the oldest form of theater in Japan," (Brenner, 2007, p. 302)

5 "During the subsequent eras, kabuki actors were known to be the equivalent of geisha for female courtiers, their sexual favors bought once the performance was through. Kabuki today consists of three types of performance: elaborate historical plays, more realistic domestic plays, and dances," (Brenner, 2007, p. 298)

manga (graphic novels), and video games, references to Shakespeare's plays are fragmentary, heterogeneous, and obscure, yet still recognizably Shakespearean. This means that any alterations are acceptable or sometimes even preferable in the anime-manga imagination as long as the media object is recognizably Shakespearean. (Minami, 2016, p. 117)

There are various Shakespeare adaptations in Japan, varying in terms of quality, loyalty to the original work of Shakespeare, seriousness, popularity, and so on. Some of them are translated into English, and some of them remain only in Japanese. There are manga like *Requiem of the Rose King*, an experimental series that has "artistic experimentations with gender transgressions with powerful women and an intersexed Richard." (Yoshihara, 2016, p. 119) Then there are some other adaptations to purely ridicule and parody Shakespeare, such as "Othello, a farce of an old man trying to keep up with the latest fashion out of jealousy (New Othello [Shin Osero]: 1906)," (Yoshihara, 2013, p. 86). According to Yoshihara, these parodies are reactions to Japanese high culture and the authority of Shakespeare. (Yoshihara, 2013, p. 84).

Any topic, symbol, or figure that can receive prolonged attention and has ample available materials for reproduction, has the potential to elicit both positive and negative reactions. However, some media may be created to utilise various reactions, both favourable and unfavourable, in order to establish a common ground. For Shakespeare and Japanese popular culture, a similar medium with the intention of finding a middle ground is the use of Shakespeare in manga form. With a parallel mindset, Yoshihara writes, "To some people, making manga with Shakespearean motifs is seen as an insult to the writer, but I believe that the blending of Shakespeare and manga will open up new possibilities of encounter between classical culture and contemporary culture, high art and popular culture, and the global and the local." (Yoshihara, 2022, p.169)

### **Manga Adaptations of *Hamlet***

*Hamlet* has various adaptations and reinterpretations in Japanese popular culture. For instance, In April 2014, the Japan Broadcasting Company (NHK) broadcasted a 1-minute and 30-second animated film titled *Ophelia, not yet*. This animation playfully references John Everett Millais's 1852 painting of Ophelia. In this animated version, Ophelia resembles Millais's portrayal but doesn't meet the tragic fate of drowning since she's depicted as a national backstroke champion and can swim. (Yoshihara, 2016, p.

107-108). There are some manga, such as *The Blast of Tempest* and its anime adaptation with the same name. The manga and the show use a significant amount of *Hamlet* quotes and as the story unfolds, the three main characters resemble Hamlet, Laertes, and Ophelia. (Minami, 2016, p. 119-120)

Additionally, there are also diverse manga versions of *Hamlet* that illustrate the play in manga style, and two of them will be analysed in this paper. *Hamlet, The Manga Edition* by Adam Sexton and Tintin Pantoja, which maintains the original storyline and retells it in manga style, and *Manga Shakespeare Hamlet* published by SelfMadeHero, which presents Hamlet in a near-future dystopia with cybernetic elements. However, before delving into the chosen works, it's somewhat important to note that neither of the manga adaptations were created by Japanese artists or editors. This absence of Japanese manga artists in the development of these manga adaptations can be attributed to Japan's "nationless" marketing strategy, which had been mentioned earlier in this paper, and the widespread global popularity of manga.

Yoshihara celebrates the existence of non-Japanese manga artists and the combination of Shakespeare and manga by writing, "Likewise, *manga* originated in Japan but has become a global art form that is enjoyed by local and international audiences alike; *manga* artists today are no longer exclusively Japanese. It was a British publisher, SelfMadeHero (SMH), that made the combination of Shakespeare and *manga* globally current." (Yoshihara, 2022, p. 175) Much like how manga and Japanese popular culture were influenced by Western culture, the manga adaptations of Hamlet drew inspiration from Japan and the art style of manga. Therefore, the absence of Japanese artists does not separate them from Japan or its popular culture.

Firstly, *Hamlet, The Manga Edition* has an introduction written by the editor, Adam Sexton. In the introduction, he claims that manga is an ideal medium for Shakespeare's works since manga is inherently visual. (Sexton, 2008, p. 2). Then he compares manga to theatre adaptations and states, "Unbound by the physical realities of the theater, the graphic novel can depict any situation, no matter how fantastical or violent, that its creators are able to pencil, ink, and shade." (Sexton, 2008, p. 2) Though a comparison between art forms is not something that can be easily done,



having an easily accessible visual form of *Hamlet* in print may prove beneficial for experiencing the play.

To strengthen his argument and to explain why the medium is specifically based on *Hamlet*, Sexton writes,

Not one of Shakespeare's plays contains more internal material—thoughts, feelings, hopes, fears and ideas—than *Hamlet*. Hamlet himself delivers five soliloquies throughout the course of the tragedy named for him, and all are masterpieces of poetry and rhetoric, philosophy and wordplay. Though *Shakespeare's Hamlet: The Manga Edition* doesn't explain the soliloquies, it gives us the opportunity to read and reread them in the context of the visually-presented action described above. By means of dynamic new medium of manga, Shakespeare's timeless tragedy is thereby made new—again. (Sexton, 2008, p. 2)

All in all, *Hamlet* is a play that is filled with numerous tragic scenes and soliloquies, and experiencing such a play to its full extent requires certain delicacies. For instance, during a stage play, one can receive the power of emotion through the right tonation and the right gestures, and in a manga, it can be done with expressions.

Graphic novels and manga provide creators with the ability to guide readers' attention to specific aspects of a story. Through the use of space, fonts, and darker shading for emphasis, creators can easily highlight particular elements on a page. Visual narrative techniques compensate for the absence of audio and vocal enhancements in staged theatre plays. In pivotal scenes, static images with their own sequential dynamics, conveying highly expressive facial expressions, and the option to revisit the storyline by flipping through pages multiple times, offer valuable avenues for experiencing and analysing a tragedy.

Furthermore, this concept is excellent for teaching and learning as well. In an article, Schwarz studies how to expand literacies through visuals and graphic novels and writes, "To read and interpret graphic novels, students have to pay attention to the usual literary elements of character, plot, and dialogue, and they also have to consider visual elements such as color, shading, panel layout, perspective, and even the lettering style." (Schwarz, 2006, p. 59)

To clarify these arguments, a close-up reading of two selected scenes from *Hamlet, The Manga Edition*, can be provided. The first selected scene is on

page 169 of the manga, there is an illustration of a part of the duel between Hamlet and Laertes (see Fig. 1). Analysing this scene offers an opportunity to observe how manga's art style functions in scenes with minimal text and maximum action while still conveying subtle yet distinct details.

In a single illustrated page, readers can grasp more than just the highlighted fighting scene; they can analyse the entire duel from various perspectives. The upper panels of the page depict the varying moods of the two characters during the fight. The first two panels on the upper left indicate that Hamlet begins the duel with enthusiasm, seeing it as a contest between two individuals with a bond rather than an intent to kill. This is evident from his facial expressions and evasive moves. Instead of countering the incoming strikes, he adeptly dodges them until the third panel on the top right, where he retaliates and makes contact with his sword. In the fourth panel just below, there's a significant change in Hamlet's expression. The focus on his darkened eye with a dilated pupil suggests a shift towards a more serious and ominous demeanour.

Moving on to Laertes, within the same panels, he undergoes a transformation as well. In the first two panels at the top right, he acts purely on his fighting instincts, viewing Hamlet as a target and openly displaying his hostility. However, in the third panel, Hamlet strikes him down, and you can see the shock and slight panic on Laertes' face as he realises that his opponent is not to be underestimated. This realisation is depicted in even greater detail in the final bottom panel. Laertes' face is drenched in sweat, and somewhat reluctantly, he acknowledges that Hamlet has made contact.

The final panel reveals more, not just with Laertes alone but with the addition of combining the king and queen with Laertes' anxious expression. In this last panel, the queen and the king are shown as spectators observing the duel between Hamlet and Laertes. The king even comments, "Our son shall win." (Sexton, 2008, p.169) While this may simply seem to create a broader scene for the story, the fact that both spectators' faces are not illustrated is a form of foreshadowing. In manga, faceless background characters imply that those characters have dark or hidden deeds that will change the course of action in the near future.

In summary, manga can effectively portray action-packed scenes while allowing room for detailed character analysis. Also, manga can draw attention to specific details of wordless action scenes by focusing on the

mood of the characters and even including the background characters and their roles without disturbing the flow of a scene by using a sequence of multiple panels that vary in size and shape to compose a page. The readers can focus individually on each panel for specifics or look at the whole page for a compact understanding of the highlighted event of the story without getting sidetracked by the details.



**Fig. 1.** Sexton, Adam. *Shakespeare's Hamlet The Manga Edition*. Art by Tintin Pantoja. Wiley Publishing, Inc., 2008. Print.

The second selected scene is on page 34 (see Fig. 2). Unlike the first scene, here the delivery of lines has a heavier emphasis than the depicted actions. In scenes with similar settings, the flow of a scene and the dynamic range are still important, especially regarding facial expressions. However, rather than creating an atmosphere for the characters to interact with one another, the emphasis is placed on lines and how they are relayed to the viewer. On the last panels on the right side of the lower half of the page, one of the most well-known lines of the original play, "Something is rotten in the state of Denmark," is illustrated. (Shakespeare, 2012, p. 30), Combined with the prior panels on the left, everything that is drawn is to highlight this specific line.

The first panel on the lower left shows a confused but determined Hamlet after encountering the ghost. In the second panel, Hamlet declares that he will follow the ghost with his eyes closed, which indicates that his resolve is final despite the warnings of others, while the ghost is illustrated with bold and dark lines to show the seriousness of the situation and to darken the mood. On the third panel at the top right of the bottom half, a soldier in panic is trying to reach out to Hamlet, yet his attention is solely on the ghost that is holding his face in his hands. The much smaller panel right underneath it, shows Hamlet's single eye with an enlarged pupil, indicating his subtle terror and providing the contrast in Hamlet's mood from the previous panels. To complement the interaction and to create a mirror image, the fifth panel shows another single eye filled with a kind of despair and heaviness, yet this time, it belongs to the ghost. Lastly, the final panel of the page shows the closed eye of the ghost, indicating that he conveyed whatever he had to and is ready to go on.

So, scenes that demonstrate emotions and require words can also be illustrated vividly in manga. Perhaps with the lack of audio, there can be many artistic and emotional aspects missing since tonation, emphasis on certain words, or even the subtle breaking of a voice can have a great effect on the scene, yet every medium has its own advantages and disadvantages.



**Fig. 2.** Sexton, Adam. *Shakespeare's Hamlet The Manga Edition*. Art by Tintin Pantoja. Wiley Publishing, Inc., 2008. Print.

The second selected work, *Manga Shakespeare Hamlet*, offers a new perspective on the original *Hamlet* storyline with the text adaptation of Richard Appignanesi and the illustrations of Emma Vieceli. There are many creative takes on this manga adaptation. The first remarkable artistic choice, straight on the cover of the manga, is Hamlet's portrayal as a *Bishonen*<sup>6</sup> with white hair and a black streak, and it is a strategic choice.

<sup>6</sup> "Literally, "beautiful young men." Bishonen are male characters designed to appeal to girls, identified by fine features, tall and slender frames, and fine features. Bishonen are not always willowy and may sport a more muscled physique, but they are always beautiful," (Brenner, 2007, p. 294)

While writing about the creative struggles of creating *Manga Shakespeare Hamlet* and finding an audience, Emma Hayley, the publisher of the manga, states, “Many of Shakespeare’s plays do not easily fit into the conventional manga categories both because of the nature of the plays themselves and also because Shakespeare has a wide-reaching readership both in terms of age and gender. Take *Hamlet* for example: does it appeal more to male or to female readers?” (Hayley, 2010, p. 273)

This concern of hers stems from the fact that manga has many categories for many different target audience groups in terms of age and gender, and she writes, “our manga version of *Hamlet* possesses characteristics of shōjo manga, it is not typically shōjo because of the nature of the narrative. There is an unwritten code in shōjo manga that males cannot be protagonists, or at least, they are rare.” (Hayley, 2010, p. 274) So the production team finds the solution to this problem by turning *Hamlet* into a bishonen to appeal to both genders. A male lead character that the boys can relate to still exists while being pretty enough to capture the attention of girls.

Secondly, the story takes place in a dystopic cyberworld in the year 2107, after the world has been devastated by climate change, yet the language used is Shakespearean, not modern. Hayley explains this choice by writing, “We decided that keeping the original Shakespearean text was crucial, but in an abridged form. The reason Shakespeare is still the most widely read playwright today is because of many factors, but one is the beauty of the language he uses. To modernize the text would mean losing that element unnecessarily.” (Hayley, 2010, p. 269).

Though it is admittedly foreign to see *Hamlet* asking, “How chances it they travel?” before looking at a hologram coming out of his wristband to see the arrival of the players he hired to perform a play for his uncle/father, it is still pleasant to read the manga in the original Shakespearean language since it provides a crucial connection to the original play, and the abridgment of the text works very well with the illustrations and the nature of manga. (Appignanesi et al, 2022, p. 65) The intention behind the artistic choice, as Hayley explains, “The point of this beautiful medium is not to have pages of talking heads, but to “show” and not “tell,” combining visual poetry with textual poetry,” is conveyed successfully. (Hayley, 2010, p. 269) The positive reactions to the *Manga Shakespeare* support this claim as well.

*Manga Shakespeare* attracted worldwide attention when the first books were published in March 2007. Rather than only attaining reviews in the comic press, our manga received critical acclaim in influential mainstream newspapers such as the Financial Times, which wrote, ‘The manga versions are... visually appealing, intelligently adapted, and demonstrate that Shakespeare is a writer for every age. A cartoon version of Shakespeare is in some ways truer to the original than reading the text alone; the visual element was always supposed to be part of the experience’ (Hayley, 2010, p. 276-277).

So, a new medium that is a combination of *Hamlet* and manga, *Manga Shakespeare Hamlet*, along with other manga adaptations of Shakespeare’s plays, reached a large and global audience with the potential to captivate readers from diverse backgrounds and age groups who may not have been initially drawn to the original play through conventional means.

### **Attitudes Towards Manga and Potential of *Manga Hamlet***

Historically, manga did not always have the best reputation among the print media. In 1959, when the first manga consumers grew up and began high school, their parents believed that they had reached an age in which they should stop reading “children’s stories,” but by publishing the first weekly magazines for promoting manga, publishers disregarded such expectations. (Bouissou, 2010, p. 26) Instead of remaining as a children’s entertainment form, manga grew older and maturer with its audience and started illustrating various topics in life and adulthood. For instance, a long and brutal political student movement among collage students started in 1968, and manga reflected the same outrage its readers felt by breaking taboo after taboo and publishing series with themes such as violence, sex, death, and indecent behaviour even against the protests of parents and teacher’s associations. (Bouissou, 2010, p. 26-27)

The globalisation process of manga was risky and complicated before it eventually flourished. “The survival of manga in Asia outside Japan was not always a certainty; at times, it faced a Sisyphean task, dodging denouncements from high government officials, cartoonists, parents, and teachers and facing censorship and bannings.” (Lent, 2010, p. 297) For starters, Korea eventually developed a comic book format called manhwa, inspired by Japanese manga, yet the relationship between Korea and manga “was torn between being attracted to it and feeling obliged to boycott it.” (Lent, 2010, p. 301)

By the same token, “Among Western intelligentsia, educationalists, and parents, manga has long had a reputation for vulgarity, violence, and bad drawing.” (Bouissou, 2010, p. 17) When a new wave of anime and manga started becoming popular in France, it alarmed French parents and authorities, and “accordingly, the major French comics publishers boycotted manga until the demand became impossible to ignore.” (Malone, 2010, p. 323)

Moving on to more recent times, Kate Allen and John E. Ingulsrud published a study in 2003, called “Manga literacy: Popular culture and the reading habits of Japanese college students.” They started their study by writing, “Manga constitutes the most popular kind of reading material in Japan, However, these texts are not accepted in schools because many parents and teachers believe reading manga is too easy and may have adverse effects.” (Allen, K., & Ingulsrud, 2003, p.674) Later in the essay, they categorised the reasons why the students read manga according to their responses, and one of the categories was about learning something new. “Comments show that, contrary to those critics who claim that reading manga is detrimental, these readers are learning about language, format, and ideas. More important, they enjoy their learning.” (Allen, K., & Ingulsrud, 2003, p.677) Then, in the conclusion part of the story, they wrote, “There are various ways to use manga in the classroom. Rather than simply ban manga, teachers can explore the kinds of texts being read and also how readers engage with manga. Students may become more critical readers if teachers equip them with the necessary skills to understand the variety of messages that manga can represent.” (Allen, K., & Ingulsrud, 2003, p.681)

Even more recently, in 2019, a scholar named Allison P. Hobgood published her experience as a visiting scholar at Tokyo International University during the summer of 2016, and she did exactly what Allen and Ingulsrud suggested. She used a manga adaptation of *Macbeth* from SelfMadeHero, the same British publishing house that published *Manga Shakespeare Hamlet* as well. She explained her conclusion about using the material by writing, “These innovative adaptations, lambasted by some scholars as the ‘dumbing down’ of early modern literature, contrastingly provided me and my students with unique points of access to Shakespeare.” (Hobgood, 2019, p. 51)



What Hobgood did with her students by using the manga version of *Macbeth* is what the publisher, Emma Hayley, envisioned and worked for. She wrote, “We continue to see our series as having a global appeal, and in early 2008, I completed a tour of Malaysia, Singapore, and India (as a guest of the British Council), putting on Manga Shakespeare workshops and talks for teachers and students,” and quoted the very positive feedback from authorities responsible for education in the countries she toured. (Hayley, 2010, p. 278)

In light of these comments, this paper proposes that there is vast potential in manga adaptations of Shakespeare, specifically in *Manga Shakespeare Hamlet*. The version of *Manga Shakespeare Hamlet* used for this paper was printed in 2022, even though the work was first published in 2007. This goes on to show that there is still a demand for the manga and that it can be utilised further. Furthermore, the main advantage of reading a classic in its manga form is having a new perspective with visual narrative techniques, and *Hamlet* helps its manga version shine due to its dynamic and emotion filled story. The play is filled with heavy emotions and philosophical angst, which makes it best experienced with illustrated visuals, which can be looked at for a long time and many times. The Illustrator of the manga, Emma Viecelli, states, “In *Hamlet*, I focused less on what’s happening but more on who it’s happening to,” explains Viecelli, “for instance, I used lots of close-ups to express the emotions of the characters. It was important for getting a story as cerebral as *Hamlet* across effectively.” (Hayley, 2010, p. 271)

Every character in *Hamlet* demonstrates a wide range of emotions in their own way, and the visual representations of the *Shakespeare Manga Hamlet* make it easier to understand the characters and their mindsets through their visually portrayed reactions, even to the illustrator herself. Hayley writes, “Viecelli’s depiction of Ophelia started out as a spanner-wielding technician in an attempt to make her a dominant character, but this approach changed, and she developed into a more feminine figure, which showed that Ophelia’s strength as a character was her femininity.” The more Viecelli illustrated the characters, the more she understood their nature, as the readers of *Manga Shakespeare Hamlet* potentially did and will continue to do so. (Hayley, 2010, p. 279)

## **Conclusion**

Japan has a unique way of utilising numerous elements in its popular culture. For instance, “Warren Buffet, Cup O’ Noodles, and William Shakespeare all share a publishing format gestures to the wide variety of manga available and the global spread of manga and its commercial, aesthetic, and educational value.” (Johnson-Woods, 2010, p. 12) However, what Shakespeare does not have in common with Warren Buffet and Cup O’ Noodles is having a grand historical impact on Japanese culture.

During the Meiji Period, Japan began a modernization process and opened itself up to Western influences for the first time. With this process of broadening the country’s horizon, Japan encountered Shakespeare for the first time through *Hamlet* and developed the culture of manga through American comic strips and technological advancements in the printing industry. After the Meiji Period, Japan kept interacting with the rest of the world and produced modern manga after World War II.

With time, as modern manga began to be globally distributed, it became a product with immense presence, and even started to influence other countries to the point that combining Shakespeare and manga became possible outside of Japanese popular culture. Furthermore, manga adaptations of famous Shakespeare plays were published by a British publishing house by the name of SelfMadeHero with an all-British team since the publisher wanted to support the UK’s own emerging talents as manga artists. This is partly due to Japan’s nationless marketing strategies for manga, and partly to the “ever-increasing popularity of manga outside of Japan.” (Hayley, 2010, p. 270)

Additionally, the emergence of Manga Shakespeare is based on creativity and intellectualism that can surface from any talented individual who adore both manga and Shakespeare, or as Yoshihara writes, “The adaptation of Shakespeare into manga is a creative act in itself, based on deep knowledge of the cultural codes of original works, and such adaptations are nothing less than an act of love for the originals.” (Yoshihara, 2022, p. 180) The very existence of this new and experimental format is a celebration of Shakespeare on a global scale, with the intention of capturing the attention of new, especially young, readers to the literary genius behind the works of Shakespeare.

As a final note, though the benefits of manga adaptations of Shakespeare are discussed in general, the reason why this paper specifically chose to analyse *Hamlet's* manga adaptations is that, as a play, *Hamlet* is the most suitable tragedy to highlight the best features of its manga adaptation due to its grand effect in Japanese history and with its characters who are filled with a variety of emotions that can be displayed the best in the form of manga with visual narrative techniques.

## REFERENCES

- Allen, K., & Ingulsrud, J. E. (2003). Manga literacy: Popular culture and the reading habits of Japanese college students. *Journal of Adolescent & Adult Literacy*, 46(8), 674-683. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/40017172>
- Allison, A. (2000). A challenge to Hollywood? Japanese character goods hit the US. *Japanese Studies*, 20(1), 67-88. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10371390050009075>
- Appignanesi, R., et al. (2022). *Manga Shakespeare Hamlet*. SelfMadeHero.
- Bainbridge, J., & Norris, C. (2010). Hybrid manga: Implications for the global knowledge economy. In T. Johnson-Woods (Ed.), *Manga: An anthology of global and cultural perspectives* (pp. 253-266). The Continuum International Publishing Group.
- Boissou, J.-M. (2010). Manga: A historical overview. In T. Johnson-Woods (Ed.), *Manga: An anthology of global and cultural perspectives* (pp. 17-33). The Continuum International Publishing Group.
- Brenner, R. E. (2007). *Understanding manga and anime*. Libraries Unlimited.
- Encyclopaedia Britannica. (2023, August 18). Meiji Restoration *Encyclopedia Britannica*. [www.britannica.com/event/Meiji-Restoration](http://www.britannica.com/event/Meiji-Restoration)
- Hayley, E. (2010). Manga Shakespeare. In T. Johnson-Woods (Ed.), *Manga: An anthology of global and cultural perspectives* (pp. 267-280). The Continuum International Publishing Group.
- Hobgood, A. P. (2019). Shakespeare in Japan: Disability and a Pedagogy of Disorientation. In H. Eklund & W. B. Hyman (Eds.), *Teaching Social Justice Through Shakespeare: Why Renaissance Literature Matters*

Now (pp. 46–54). Edinburgh University Press. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.3366/j.ctvrs912p.8>

Johnson-Woods, T. (2010). Introduction. In T. Johnson-Woods (Ed.), *Manga: An anthology of global and cultural perspectives* (pp. 1-14). The Continuum International Publishing Group.

Lent, J. A. (2010). Manga in East Asia. In T. Johnson-Woods (Ed.), *Manga: An anthology of global and cultural perspectives* (pp. 297-314). The Continuum International Publishing Group.

Malone, P. M. (2010). The manga publishing scene in Europe. In T. Johnson-Woods (Ed.), *Manga: An anthology of global and cultural perspectives* (pp. 315-331). The Continuum International Publishing Group.

Minami, R., & Yoshihara, Y. (2022, August 18). Shakespeare in Japan [Video]. YouTube. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=A1HelKY4tE4&t=380s>

Minami, R. (2016). Hello Sha-kitty-peare?: Shakespeares Cutified in Japanese Anime Imagination. *Journal for Early Modern Cultural Studies*, 16(3), 116–137. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/jearlmodcultstud.16.3.116>

Nayar, P. K. (2015). Branding Bill: The Shakespearean Commons. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 50(12), 41–47. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/24481941>

Sanderson, P., et al. (2023, August 25). Superhero. Encyclopaedia Britannica. [www.britannica.com/art/superhero](http://www.britannica.com/art/superhero)

Sato, S. (1985). Hamlet, Polonius, and Ophelia in Meiji Japan. *Comparative Literature Studies*, 22(1), 23–33. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/40246513>

Schodt, F. L. (1983). *Manga! Manga!: The world of Japanese comics* (1st ed.). Kodansha International.

Schwarz, G. (2006). Expanding literacies through graphic novels. *The English Journal*, 95(6), 58-64. <https://doi.org/10.2307/30046629>

Sexton, A. (2008). *Shakespeare's Hamlet: The manga edition* (T. Pantoja, Illus.). Wiley Publishing, Inc.

Thompson, J. (2007). *Manga: The complete guide*. Ballantine Books/Del Rey.

Vendrell, D. (2023, April 26). An anime and manga boom is a boon for Japan. The Future Party. [www.futureparty.com/manga-anime-popular-japan-us/](http://www.futureparty.com/manga-anime-popular-japan-us/)

William, Shakespeare. *Hamlet*. 2nd ed., Dejavu Publication, 2012, Istanbul.

Wong, W. S. (2006). Globalizing manga: From Japan to Hong Kong and beyond. *Mechademia*, 1, 23-45. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/41510876>

Yoshihara, Y. (2022). Shakespeare in Japanese pop culture: Focusing on manga as an intercultural collaboration genre. *INContext: Studies in Translation and Interculturalism*, 2(1), 167-182.

Yoshihara, Y. (2013). Tacky ‘Shakespeares’ in Japan. *Multicultural Shakespeare: Translation, Appropriation and Performance*, 10(25), 83-97.

Yoshihara, Y. (2016). Toward ‘Reciprocal Legitimation’ between Shakespeare’s works and manga. *Multicultural Shakespeare: Translation, Appropriation and Performance*, 14(29), 107-122.



## ***Çağdaş Rusçada Türkçe Kökenli Kelimelerin Kullanımının Analizi***

Buse KURUYER <sup>1</sup>

### **ÖZ**

Bu makale, Rus dilinde Türkçe kökenli kelimelerin kullanımının analizine yöneliktir. Çağdaş Rus dilinde, Türkçe kökenli birçok kelime bulunmaktadır. Rus dilindeki Türkçe kökenli kelimeler, Kazakça, Türkçe, Tatarca, Özbekçe, Azerice, Kırgızca, Türkmence, Baştırtça, Karakalpaklı, Arapça ve diğer Türk dillerinden alıntılanmış kelimelerdir.

Türk Kökenli kelimelerin (Türkizmlerin) Rus dilinde ortaya çıkışı, Rusya'nın tarihinde belirli bir dönemle ve Türk halklarıyla olan ilişkileriyle ilişkilendirilebilecek birkaç aşamaya ayrılabilir. Makale, Rus ve Türk dilleri arasındaki etkileşimi ele almaktadır.

Araştırmaya dayanarak araştırma neticesinde, modern Rus dilinde, Türkçe kökenli birçok kelimenin varlığı tespit edilmiştir. Türkizmlerin Rus dilindeki yerleşimi, bir metaforlaştırma sürecine katkıda bulunmuştur. Bu süreç, iki farklı nesne arasındaki nesnel, niteliksel veya işlevsel benzerlik temelinde adlandırma seçimi sürecini içerir.

***Anahtar kelimeler:*** *Türkizm, Rus dili, Deyim, Metaforlaştırma*

---

<sup>1</sup> İstanbul Aydın Üniversitesi, Rusça Mütercim ve Tercümanlık Bölümü YL öğrencisi, buse.nisa33@hotmail.com, <https://orcid.org/0009-0003-5860-5643>

## **Analysis of the Usage of Turkish Loanwords in Modern Russian**

### **ABSTRACT**

This article is aimed at analyzing the usage of Turkish loanwords in the Russian. In Modern Russian, there are many words of Turkish origin. The Turkish-origin words in the Russian are borrowed from Kazakh, Turkish, Tatar, Uzbek, Azerbaijani, Kyrgyz, Turkmen, Bashkir, Karakalpak, Arabic, and other Turkic languages.

The emergence of Turkish loanwords in the Russian can be divided into several stages associated with a specific period in Russia's history and its relations with Turkic peoples. The article explores the interaction between the Russian and Turkish languages.

Based on the research, it has been identified that there are many Turkish-origin words in Modern Russian. The integration of Turkish loanwords in the Russian has contributed to a process of metaphorization. This process involves the selection of naming based on objective, qualitative, or functional similarities between two different objects.

**Keywords:** *Turkism, Russian language, Idioms, Metaphorization*



## Анализ Употребления Тюркских Заимствований в Современном Русском Языке

### Аннотация

Статья посвящена анализу употребления тюркских заимствований в русском языке. В современном русском языке существуют много слов, происхождение которых связано с тюркскими языками. Для русского языка тюркизмы – это заимствованные слова из тюркских языков, таких как казахский, турецкий, татарский, узбекский, азербайджанский, киргизский, туркменский, башкирский, каракалпакский, арабский и др.

Появление тюркских заимствований в русском языке можно разделить на несколько этапов, каждый из которых связан с определенным периодом истории России и ее связями с тюркскими народами. В статье рассматривается взаимодействие русского и тюркских языков.

На основании исследования было выявлено, в современном русском языке существуют много слов, происхождение которых связано с тюркскими языками. Закрепленности тюркизмов в русском языке способствовал процесс метафоризации, семантический процесс выбора наименования на основе предметного, признакового или функционального сходства двух разнородных объектов.

**Ключевые слова:** *Тюркизм, Русский язык, Фразеологизм, Метафоризация*

В современном мире существуют ряд русских фамилий тюркского происхождения. Тюркские слова, которые проникли в русский язык, можно изучить, распределив на следующие тематические группы:

а) предметы кочевого быта:

*арба*: 1) «длинная четырехколесная телега»; 2) «двухколесная повозка», заимствовано из тюркского, крымских татар, кыпчакского, азербайджанского;

*лачуга*: 1) «палатка, хижина», заимствовано из крымских татар, татарского; *сарай*: «дом, дворец, каравансарай, комната для жилья, стойло», заимствовано из кыпчакского, уйгурского, татарского;

б) предметы одежды и украшения: *армяк*: «женская одежда крестьянина», заимствовано из татарского – «одежда из верблюжьей шерсти»; из чагатайского – «ткань из верблюжьей шерсти»; *халат*: заимствовано из тюркского «кафтан», из арабского «почетное платье»; *бахрома*: заимствовано из крымских татар «вуаль для женщин»;

в) предметы вооружения и снаряжения: *кистень*: «гирька на ремне», из тюркского, крымских татар «дубина, палка»; *аркан*: «недоуздок, лассо», из крымских татар, казахского «толстая веревка, канат».

д) животных, птиц, растения: *бугай*: «не кладеный бык», заимствовано из тюркского «бык»; *кабан*: заимствовано из татарского, казахского, азербайджанского «свинья, дикая свинья».

е) названия кушаний и напитков: *лапша*: заимствовано из татарского «мелкие кусочки теста, сваренные в бульоне»; *коврига*: «ломоть хлеба, каравай», заимствовано из тюркского, чыгатайского «витой, закрученный»; *кавардак*: «кушанье, каша с рыбой», заимствовано из тюркского «жаркое».

ж) понятия из сферы общественного устройства и торговли: *чумак*: заимствовано из тюркского «булава, длинная палка», из уйгурского «сильный, крепкий»; *барыш*: «прибыль, доход», заимствовано из тюркского, крымских татар «мир, примирение»; *деньга*: «деньги», заимствовано из татарского, чагатайского «мелькая серебряная монета» (Журавлева: 2021, стр. 143).

Значительное место в лексике современного русского языка занимают тюркизмы или тюркские заимствования. Тюркизмы в русском языке – это слова, заимствованные из тюркских языков в русский язык (Баскаков: 1979, стр. 91). Хотя некоторые аспекты тюркизмов в русском языке в той или иной мере затронуты в научных статьях и монографиях различных исследователей, однако в целом тюркская лексика еще не подвергалась всестороннему монографическому исследованию (Жауыншиева, Киынова, Кыдырбай: 2019, стр.1663). Взаимодействие русского и тюркских языков началось в давние времена, ещё в период половецких разбоев и нашествий печенегов и монголо-татар на Русь, что нашло своеобразное отображение в письменных памятниках и русских народных говоров. Для русского языка тюркизмы – это заимствованные слова из тюркских языков, таких как казахский, турецкий, татарский, узбекский, азербайджанский,

киргизский, туркменский, башкирский, каракалпакский, арабский и др. Одни ученые считают, что тюркизмы входят в состав «экзотической лексики» (Л.А. Булаховский, Л.В. Щерба, А.А. Реформатский, А.Е. Супрун, Н.М. Шанский), другие учёные тюркизмы относят к «безэквивалентной лексике» (Е.М. Верещагин, В.Г. Костомаров), третьи – определяют тюркизмы в составе «этнографической лексики», характеризующей быт тюркских народов» (А.И. Гвоздев) (Каримуллина: 2006, стр. 124).

К широко известным в составе русской фразеологии тюркизмам, как и в других восточнославянских языках, относятся такие устоявшиеся единицы, как *базарная баба* (тюркизм *базар*), *брать на карандаш* (тюркизм *карандаш*), как *аршин проглотил* (тюркизм *аршин*), *не фунт изюму* (тюркизм *изюм*), *метать бисер перед свиньями* (тюркизм *бисер*) и целый ряд других. «Словарь тюркизмов в русском языке» А.Н. Шиповой содержит около 2000 слов тюркского происхождения, которые вступили в синонимические ряды с русскими словами, например: *рынок – базар, ворона – карга, метель – буран, канал – арык*. При соотношении подобной синонимии ученые подчёркивают: «Возможность дублетного использования слов ... говорит о том, что всегда имеет место смысловое противопоставление». Тюркизмы частотны в русских пословицах и поговорках, ср.: «Один балахон, да и тот из бани унесён», «Кому кистень, кому чётки», «Нашему болвану ни в чем нет талану», «Есть в амбаре, будет и в кармане», «Не корми калачом, да не бей в спину кирпичом», «Башка чиста, так и мошна пуста», «Аршин на кафтан да две на заплаты», «Без денег торговать, как без соли хлебать», «Аршин на сукно, а кувшин на вино», «Прости, колпак, а шапка и так». «Кто о барышах, а кто о магарычах (хлопочет)». Такие тюркские слова, как *колпак, башлык, шапка* говорят об их высокой жизнеспособности в русской среде, о чем свидетельствует русская поговорка, ср.: пословицы и поговорки: «Времена шатки, береги шапки», «По Сеньке шапка», «Шапку выиграл, а кафтан проиграл», «Тяжела ты, шапка Мономаха!». Отметим, что русских заимствований в тюркской фразеологии значительно меньше тюркских. Заметим, что такие употребления, как *тришкин кафтан*, *ни бельмеса*, *алмазная свадьба* относятся к сниженному стилистическому пласту. Обращают на себя внимание антропонимы тюркского происхождения, например, имя золотоордынского хана *Мамай* – *Мамаево нашествие* («неожиданное появление многочисленных и неприятных гостей, посетителей»); *Мамаево побоище* («крупная ссора, драка, беспорядок, разгром»), в русском языке *Млечный путь*

называют Мамаевой дорогой, или Батыевой дорогой (Султангареева: 2018, стр.520).

Закрепленности тюркизмов в русском языке способствует процесс метафоризации, при котором в большинстве своём активизируются определенные модели.

1. Модель «название животного» → наименование лица», ср.: ишак – осел; осёл – «человек, безропотно выполняющий самую тяжелую работу (работать как ишак)»;
2. Модель название предмета → наименование лица», ср.: фитиль – лента в осветительных приборах и худой и высокий человек (прозвище Пашка-«фитиль»);
3. Модель «название предмета → «что-либо похоже на него», ср.: шалаш – легкая постройка и о том, что напоминает такую постройку (с милым рай в шалаше).

Итак, изучение фразеологических единиц по степени усвояемости в казахской среде в условиях полилингвизма мы подразделим условно на 4 группы:

1. Фразеологизмы, значения которых довольно близки к семантике тюркских (казахских) слов. См.: Мамай (имя татаро-монгольского хана, совершившего в далеком прошлом разрушительный поход на Москву) – появились фразеологизмы «Мамаево побоище», «Мамай прошел».
2. Устойчивые единицы, тюркские компоненты которых обнаруживаются не сразу, компоненты этих фразеологизмов по происхождению восходят к тюркским языкам: баш на баш (равнозначный обмен, бартер); халиф (калиф) на час (т.е. временно, ненадолго) (Тарланов,2006,стр.74).
3. Наиболее распространенные фразеологизмы, в которых тюркизмы кажутся скрытыми. По этой причине усвоение подобных фразеологизмов осложняется. Для осознания их тюркского происхождения необходимы определенные навыки. Например, *башка* – тюрк. *баш* – голова, головной, главный – фразеологизмы *дубовая башка*; *курья башка*; *вбивать в башку*; *свернуть башку* и др.

Эта группа фразеологизмов считается многочисленной, и понимание подобных фразеологизмов значительно расширяет горизонты русской фразеологии. Следует отметить лексическое варьирование, когда тюркский компонент заменяется русским словом, например: хозяин – господин. В этом случае .... пополняется круг познаваемых устойчивых оборотов: шапка – шапочное знакомство, к шапочному разбору (Тарланов, 2006, стр. 72).

4. Фразеологизмы, в которых тюркизмы в настоящее время перешли в разряд устаревшей лексики: *каланча – каланча пожарная; набат – бить в набат* и др. Таким образом, степень усвоения рассмотренных фразеологизмов, на наш взгляд, напрямую зависит от стилистической выразительности тюркизмов.

Из вышеприведенных тематических групп видно, что в русском языке преобладают названия предметов домашнего обихода, которые имеют тюркское происхождение (Тюнтешева, Шагдурова, 2021, стр. 68).

Таким образом, можно сделать определенные выводы: в современном русском языке существуют много слов, происхождение которых связано с тюркскими языками, однако определить, каков процент тюркизмов в современном русском языке, практически невозможно. Это связано с тем, что некоторые ученые-лингвисты, изучающие тюркизмы в русском языке, в своих трудах не дают достоверную информацию. Изучение лексики любого языка, в том числе и русского, имеет не только лингвистический, но и исторический, этнографический интерес, так как именно в языке отражаются многие процессы, происходящие в обществе.

Исторические предпосылки появления тюркизмов в русском языке можно условно разделить на несколько этапов. В XIII веке на Русь произошло монгольское нашествие, которое привело к установлению монгольской власти на протяжении более двухсот лет. В это время на русский язык проникли такие тюркизмы, как: *баян, лайда, кумык, бурый, балык, ком, арык* и многие другие.

Средневековая Русь имела деловые и культурные связи с восточнотюркскими народами, такими как татары, кумыки, кипчаки и другие. Связи с этими народами привели к появлению в русском языке многих тюркизмов, например: *кара, чан, нарын, яма, кайма, кебек, кишлак, курай, кыска, мангал* и другие. В XV веке на территории

Крыма было создано Крымское ханство, которое имело культурные и экономические связи с другими тюркскими народами, в том числе со средней Азией. Эти связи привели к распространению в русском языке тюркизмов, таких как *буй, кюрдюм, кебиз, тандыр, чурек, чанак, чифтлик, балабан* и другие.

В результате реформ Петра I в русском языке появились тюркизмы, которые имели источником тюркские языки ближнего и среднего Востока, например: *караван, кум, таз, кишка, калым, амбар* и другие. Подытожим: появление тюркизмов в русском языке можно разделить на несколько этапов, каждый из которых связан с определенным периодом истории России и ее связями с тюркскими народами.

Первые связи между Россией и тюркскими народами появились еще в древности, когда на территории современной России обитали тюркские племена. В VIII веке на этих землях появились кочевники из Золотой Орды, которые оставили свой след в русской культуре и языке. Влияние тюркской культуры и языков на русскую лексику отмечено в разных сферах.

### **Библиография:**

1. Баскаков, Н.А. Русские фамилии тюркского происхождения / Н.А. Баскаков. – М.: Наука, 1979. – С. 91.
2. Жауыншиева Ж. Б., Киынова Ж. К., Кыдырбай Г. С. Социокультурная маркированность тюркизмов в русскоязычной прессе Казахстана // Русское слово в многоязычном мире. – 2019. – С. 1663.
3. Журавлева Е. А. К проблеме грамматического освоения заимствований в русском языке Казахстана // II Международный конгресс «Языковая политика стран Содружества Независимых Государств (СНГ)». – 2021. – С. 143.
4. Каримуллина Г.Н. Историко-этимологический параметр в толковых словарях русского языка XVIII - XX веков (на примере тюркских заимствований) // Русская и сопоставительная филология. - Казань: Казан. гос. ун-т, 2006. – С. 124.
5. Султангареева Р.А. Башкирский фольклор: семантика, функции и традиции. Т. 1. – Миф. Обряд. Танец. Сказительство. Шаманский, религиозный, музыкальный фольклор. Современные традиции. – Уфа: Башк. Энцикл., 2018. – С. 520

6. Тарланов, З.К. О евразийских заимствованиях в русском языке // Русская речь. 2006. № 5. –С.74.
7. Тарланов, З.К. О евразийских заимствованиях в русском языке // Русская речь. 2006. № 5. –С. 72.
8. Тюнтешева Е. В., Шагдурова О. Ю. Развитие семантики глаголов векторной характеристики движения в тюркских языках Сибири (в сравнении с другими тюркскими языками) //Северо-восточный гуманитарный вестник. – 2021. – №. 1 (34). – С. 68.





## ***Exploring Traditional and Modern Gender Norms in Caryl Churchill's Owners through a Transformative Gender Perspective***

Kanan AGHASIYEV <sup>1</sup>

### **ABSTRACT**

Caryl Churchill's "Owners" is a highly successful play, marking her debut in stage drama when it premiered at the Theatre Upstairs of the Royal Court in 1972. The play serves as a satirical exploration of Londoners' social lives, featuring two couples representing diverse social backgrounds. Marion and Clegg are property owners, while Lisa and Alec portray impoverished tenants dependent on Marion and Clegg's actions. Written during the transition between the first and second wave of feminism, the play introduces various female characters from traditional and modern perspectives. Marion, the central character, embodies extreme feminism, breaking away from traditional female norms and adopting a masculine demeanour. In contrast, Lisa, another female character, adheres to the traditional role of a domestic housewife, caring for her husband and children, making her and her newborn baby victims of Marion's schemes. The play also introduces three male characters who defy traditional male gender norms. This article delves into how gender norms have evolved through different waves of feminism, starting with an introduction to the playwright, Caryl Churchill. The focus then shifts to Marion's extreme female masculinity before exploring the unique male identities of the three male characters compared to traditional masculine standards, leading to a concluding section.

***Keywords:*** *Owners, Caryl Churchill, Gender Transformation, Gender Roles, Extreme Feminism, Traditional Feminism, Masculinity*

---

<sup>1</sup> Karabük University, Karabük, kaasiyev@gmail.com, <https://orcid.org/0009-0001-3969-1879>

## **ÖZET**

Caryl Churchill'ın "Owners" adlı oyunu, 1972'de Royal Court Tiyatrosu'nun Theatre Upstairs sahnesinde ilk kez sahnelendiğinde sahne dramalarına ilk adımını atan son derece başarılı bir eserdir. Oyun, Londralıların sosyal yaşamlarını hicveden bir keşif olarak hizmet eder ve farklı sosyal geçmişleri temsil eden iki çifti içerir. Marion ve Clegg gayrimenkul sahipleridir, Lisa ve Alec ise Marion ve Clegg'in eylemlerine bağımlı olan yoksul kiracıları canlandırır. Birinci ve ikinci dalga feminizmin geçiş döneminde yazılan oyun, geleneksel ve modern bakış açılarından çeşitli kadın karakterlerini tanıtır. Marion, merkezi karakter olarak aşırı feminizmi temsil eder, geleneksel kadın normlarından ayrılır ve maskülen bir tavır benimser. Buna karşılık, Lisa adlı diğer bir kadın karakter, kocasına ve çocuklarına bakma gibi geleneksel bir ev hanımı rolünü benimser ve bu da onu Marion'ın entrikalarının kurbanı yapar. Oyun, geleneksel erkek cinsiyet normlarını ihlal eden üç erkek karakteri de tanıtır. Bu makale, farklı feminizm dalgaları aracılığıyla cinsiyet normlarının nasıl evrildiğini incelemektedir ve Caryl Churchill'ı tanıtan bir girişle başlamaktadır. Ardından odak, Marion'ın aşırı kadın maskülenliğine kayar ve ardından üç erkek karakterin geleneksel erkek normlarına göre benzersiz erkek kimliklerini incelemeye devam eder ve bir sonuç bölümüne yol açar.

**Anahtar Kelimeler:** *Owners, Caryl Churchill, Cinsiyet Dönüşümü, Cinsiyet Roller, Aşırı Feminizm, Geleneksel Feminizm, Maskülenlik*

## INTRODUCTION

### *On Caryl Churchill as the Writer of Owners*

*People are not evil, and people are not good. They live how they can one day at a time. They come out of dust they go back to dust, dusty feet, no wings, and whose fault is that?*

- Caryl Churchill

Caryl Churchill is a British playwright known for her play *Owners*. She was born in 1938 in London. Both of her parents were artists. Her father was a political cartoonist while her mother was a fashion model and actress. As a result of the Second World War, her family had to move to Canada when she was not more than ten years old. In Canada, she attended a girl's school to continue her studies. Later, between 1956 and 1960, she studied BA of English Literature and got Richard Hillary Memorial Prize from Oxford. After the prize, she continued her career in writing there. Until *Owners*, she had written several literary pieces for different institutions. In her early works, she explored several different themes including femininity, masculinity, gender roles, sexuality, social norms, and social problems. In 1972, she got popular thanks to her play *Owners*. Apart from being a playwright, she is a political writer as she has been interested in the issue of Palestine. She is the head of *Palestine Solidarity Campaign*, and in 2009, she wrote a small play showing the Israeli attack on Gaza region. Churchill did not have a comfortable life after she got married in London. She got kids and had to live in the suburbs of London since living there was more affordable for her newly formed family. That is why, she experienced several problems in her marriage and social life. As a result, she wrote *Owners* after experiencing an event which happened in her rented apartment where she was living at an old landlady's flat: 'I was in an old woman's flat when a young man offering her money to move came round – he was my first image of Worsely and one of the starting points of the play.' (Churchill, 1985, p. 4). Even, she wrote *Owners* in three days after she had a miscarriage. Furthermore, she was considered to be a socialist feminist activist and. That is why, in her plays, including *Owners*, she wants(ed) to give a solution to the problems of the society by showing the issues existed in the capitalist environment. In one of her speeches, she says the following words:

What kind of society I would like: decentralized, non-authoritarian, communist, non-sexist – a society in which people can be in touch with their feelings and control of their lives. But it always sounds both ridiculous and unattainable when you put it into words. (Aston, 1997, p 3)

In many of her plays, including *Owners*, she discusses gender norms and standards. However, mostly, she focuses on socialist femininity and how it affected the lives of women who lived in the last century. In *Owners*, readers see two different female characters: Marion and Lisa. Marion is a character that is totally the opposite of ‘traditional’ female personality since she acts as if she is a man. While, on the other hand, Lisa is a traditional domestic housewife with several children who takes care of her household, husband, and house chores. Thus, in the play, Churchill explores femininity and female identity from two different aspects. Moreover, we can see three male characters who are supposedly represent masculinity from different perspectives: the two husbands Clegg, Alec, and Marion’s work partner Worsely. Each male character has his own masculinity including traditional masculinity and feminine masculinity.

### **Gender Roles and Their Transformation during Feminist Waves**

In order to understand the gender roles and how they get transformed in the play, it is necessary to have a look at the history of feminism since the play predominantly focuses on different types of femininity in female and male characters lives. Feminism is a movement that demands equal right for both men and women. At the same time, it fights for the demolition of stereotypes about women and tries to show that women can do as much as men can do anything. It believes that patriarchal standards have demolished women rights over the centuries and women have been forced to obey rules and dominancy of oppression led by men. While fighting against discrimination, it demands(ed) women’s education, health, right for vote and abortion, divorce and many more. Furthermore, it is necessary to mention that feminism has different types such as black feminism, postcolonial feminism, eastern feminism, etc. Each feminism claims that women of certain geography have their own problems and those problems are different than the problems that other women face in other part of the world in the same time frame. However, all these feminism types got influenced by the main western feminism that started in the late 18<sup>th</sup> century.

Feminism has different waves. Each wave is a new era of a different type of feminism. Until now, there has been three feminism waves. However, according to some feminist activists and critics, starting from 2012, feminism has entered its fourth wave. The first wave of feminism started in the late 19<sup>th</sup> and early 20<sup>th</sup> century in the Western World and the Russian Empire, and later in the Soviet Union. This wave mainly focused on women's right to vote. The term 'first wave feminism' was mentioned by Martha Lear for the first time in 1962 in one of her articles for the *New York Times*. This period was characterised as women's struggle to be in the political platforms alongside with social and economic equality for women. The first wave feminism continued until 1960s. Then, another form of feminism started: second wave feminism.

Like the first wave feminism, the second wave also started in the Western World and the Soviet Union as it was the continuousness of the first one and was built on the roots of the first wave feminism. Unlike the first wave, the second wave feminism focused on more issues that women experienced after 1960s. After achieving their rights for voting, property owning, divorce, etc, the feminist activists started to demand more rights for women including right for abortion, proper work in high positions and political spheres. Also, they focused on more detailed problems such as sexuality and gender roles, equality in domestic chores and children care, etc. Furthermore, second wave activist dragged people's attention to domestic violence against women. In the play *Owners* we can see many of such issues regarding gender and sexuality. According to some critics, the second wave ended in 1980s in America and Europe with the beginning of sexual freedom when the 'feminist sex wars' started. This period is popular for its excessive liberty of pornography and lesbianism in western female world. 'Feminist sex wars' refer to a period between 1970s and 1980s when feminist activists were divided into several groups based on their thoughts and perspectives regarding their sexuality and sexual performativity. Some feminists supported the idea of pornography and sexual monogamy while the rest did not like the idea of having many partners. Thus, the late second wave feminists and early third wave feminists got divided into two groups: anti-porn feminist and sex-positive feminist. Both groups argued on the topics such as lesbianism, pornography, transgenderism, etc.

Even though the play does not cover the third wave feminism, it is necessary to briefly shed light on both the third and the fourth waves. The third

wave started in the late 1980s and early 1990s in the Western Countries. The term 'third wave' was pointed out by Rebecca Walker in 1992. This wave dealt with more simpler topics than previous waves. The third wave, unlike the second feminist wave sex war activists, did not focus on such matters. Instead, they were more tolerant about the individuality and sexual orientation of women. Also, the third wave brought new movements with itself such as intersectionality<sup>2</sup>, ecofeminism, vegetarian feminism, postmodern feminism, etc. At the same time, the third wave gave support to some underground, feminist, queer, and non-feminist cultures. With the help of internet, the third wave feminists claimed having more equality and demanded the abolishment of existed gender roles.

Currently, we are in the fourth wave feminism. Some critics state that the third wave feminism is still on the stage while the rest believe that the fourth wave has already been around since 2012. This wave of feminism got its roots from the third wave. Or, it could be said that the fourth wave turned into a new shape by the help of internet. The fourth wave deals with almost the same issues. However, most of the claims are done online. Here, the activist fight against sexual harassment and domestic violence of women. Activist, freely share their stories about any type of difficulties that they faced without any embarrassment. Also, they are more tolerant than previous activists in terms of gender and sexuality matters. At the same time, they focus on intersectionality of women, trans women rights, the rights of coloured women in society.

As it seems, feminism in the past and feminism now are quite different. Each feminist wave had its own issues to deal with. From time to time, gender roles have changed with the emergence of different feminist movements. The main concern of feminism and non-western feminism movements is to give equal rights to women. When, feminism showed its first seeds, it simply demanded equal rights between men and women. At the same time, women's clothing fashion and the language style changed. In the first and second waves, women preferred wearing like men and smoke cigarette.

---

<sup>2</sup> The concept of intersectionality is an analytical framework for comprehending how a person's multiple social and political identities interact to produce diverse forms of privilege and discrimination. The concept of intersectionality reveals several advantages and disadvantages. Gender, caste, sex, race, ethnicity, class, sexual orientation, religion, ability, weight, and outward appearance are a few examples of these variables.

The first and second waves of feminism, which mostly concentrated on the experiences of white, middle-class, cisgender women, were widened by intersectionality to encompass the various perspectives of women of color, the underprivileged, immigrant women, and other groups. In order to distinguish oneself from white feminism, intersectional feminism takes into account the many experiences and identities of women.

However, they had the lack of understanding the fact that wearing like men, smoking, and demanding equal rights did not make women more feminine or make them any different than men. In *Owners*, we can see that the main character Marion acts like a man, wears like a man, and behaves like a man. She is a good representation of gender transformation in the first and second waves of feminism. One could say that Marion is an example of extreme, excessive, and perhaps toxic feminism. However, about it, we will talk a bit later.

### **On the Summary of the Play**

*Owners* was written in 1972. It has two acts, and the first act contains six scenes while the second one has eight scenes. Each scene starts in a different setting including Marion's house, Lisa and Alec's rented house, Clegg's butcher shop, and Marion and Worsely's real estate agency's office. Critics call *Owners* a socialist-feminist melodrama and black comedy.<sup>3</sup> Churchill's main goal was to show the social situation of people in England in the 1970s alongside gender roles and the way that they got transformed as that period had a lot of political, social, and cultural changes. At the same time, she does not forget to touch on the mental and psychological issues that people experienced after the First World War even though it had passed around 30 years since the war finished when she wrote *Owners*. Moreover, in the play, she talks about suicide attempts of Worsely, a male character [who probably represents the society's mental condition].

As the title suggests, there are two types of people: owners who own property and tenants who suffer economic crisis and live in poverty. There are two couples that could not be described happy enough: Clegg - Marion and Lisa - Alec. All the interpersonal relationships in the play are based on a materialistic approach. The most dominant character of the play is Marion who once had mental problems and had to stay in a hospital as a result of her mental disorder. However, now she is a successful businesswoman. She has a real estate agency. She does her best and whatever she can to achieve her goals even though she might hurt others. At one point, in the play she cannot hide her emotions and shouts saying: "We men of destiny get what we're after" (Churchill, 1972, p. 41). As we can see, she is a very dangerously passionate character who tries to fulfill her desires at any cost. Also, she is unable to provide a child to her husband Clegg. However, she

---

<sup>3</sup> Black comedy (known as black humor or dark comedy) is a literary genre that deals with social and mental issues by using comedy.

believes that she has everything in order for to be happy. The only thing is she need is a baby. She believes that a child would complete the missing parts in her life. Thus, in her mind having a baby would bring the perfect image of a family even though they would not be happy.

Another important detail about Marion is that her butcher husband does not really love her. He is angry and uncomfortable with her. Churchill shows Clegg as an angry lummoxy husband who secretly desires to kill his own wife as she does not provide him with a child: "Weedkiller in Marion's soup. In a garlic soup. Would it taste?" (Churchill, 1972, p. 44) he asks Worsely in Clegg's own kitchen. The way that Churchill describes the relationship between Clegg and Marion and how Clegg longs to kill his wife could be a reference to the death of Joe Orton<sup>4</sup> who was a literary figure in the 20<sup>th</sup> century in English literature. Clegg even imagines shooting Marion with a gun. And when he has sympathy for her, he does it only because he wants to have a violent sex with Marion. At the same time, Marion's colleague Worsely seems to have some affection for her. However, Churchill shows him as a very tricky character who confuses readers with his behaviours. Frist of all, he does have some feminine personality. Even though he does not say much about his sexuality, readers might guess that he is traditional straight man. Yet, he seems pacifist and a man who prefers men to women but does not talk about it.

Other two important characters in the play are Lisa and her careless husband Alec. In the play, there is a reference where the audience learn that seven years ago there was an emotional relationship between Alec and Marion: MARION: You were mine then and you always will be. ALEC: I've changed. Skin and all in seven years. (Churchill, 1972, p. 41). And then, for whatever reason we are not told but Marion and Alec got separated. Because they got broke up, Marion got very furious and now she is doing whatever she can in order to hurt Lisa, Alec's wife. Also, she has not forgotten her love for Alec, and she wants him back: 'ALEC: I'm not what you want. MARION: You are what I want. I want you badly now. (Churchill, 1972, p. 41). On the other hand, Alec's wife Lisa is a traditional housewife with two boys and at the beginning of the play she is pregnant for six months. Later, she gives birth to a boy and this boy is taken by Marion as Marion believes that having a child would solve everything and she would have her perfect family. However, none of it happens. The baby

---

<sup>4</sup> Joe Orton was killed by his own wife.



boy, who was brought to this Earth by Lisa and forced to live with Marion, brings more misery to both sides which results future conflicts that ends up with the death of Alec and a different person's baby in fire done by Worsely with Marion's desire:

MARION: Worsely, could you do something for me? Something to hurt Alec.

WORSELY: Like what?

MARION: Think of something.

WORSELY: Fatal?

MARION: I wouldn't mind. [Pause.]

WORSELY: Like set the house on fire? [Pause.]

MARION: What a good idea. What a very nice thought. ((Churchill, 1972, p. 73))

## Discussion

### *On the Extreme Masculine Femininity in Marion's Personality*

In order to talk about gender roles and the way that they transform in the play, it is necessary to focus on the characters and how they behave throughout the plot. At first, it is important to focus on the female characters of the play. There are two female characters: Marion and Lisa. While Churchill prefers to choose Lisa to be a traditional domestic housewife, she prefers to illustrate Marion as a modern, passionate, man-like woman. Marion is the representation of extreme feminism. At the same time, she behaves and acts like a man. Unlike Lisa, she does not care about anyone and anything. She is cold and only follows her dreams. However, all her dreams are material based. She sees people as her property. As if she owns people. She believes that she can have a made-up family by having someone's baby. Even, she tries to convince Alec and Lisa that their baby is just a baby and it not different than anyone else's baby. Even, at end of the play, she does not blink once when Worsely goes to burn Alec and Lisa's house. Furthermore, her relationship with her husband is quite strange. She acts as if she controls Clegg and as if he is her property. Even, she offers other women to her husband which is unimaginable to any other women, seeing their husbands with another woman. However, for Marion, that is not a problem. Clegg can do as he pleases. He can sleep with any woman and at the end of the day, Marion would not say anything. Thus, she is a woman

that acts more like a traditional careless man who only focuses on money and sees everything as his own property.

Marion has a real estate agency where she buys properties and sells them. When she wins in the auctions, she celebrates outside. At the beginning of the play, when Clegg and Worsely talk about suicide in Clegg's butcher shop, Marion suddenly enters and says that she made a deal with a customer, and they will go out and celebrate the occasion:

We shall celebrate. It stinks in here, Clegg. Does it always? No wonder you've no customers...I know very well it's a sad moment, I can't be a failure just to help. We will all go out together and celebrate. Commemorate. Make an occasion. (Churchill, 1972, p. 22)

She is happy since she made a good deal with a potential buyer. Without thinking a moment, she judges her husband and mocks her husband that he has no customers. And later compares her happiness with Clegg's failure and states that she should not lose just because her husband loses in his business. Such type of behaviour shows her carelessness and her selfishness towards others, even to her supposedly closest person, husband. Later, she adds that they should celebrate as she had a successful deal. However, imagining her in the shop and using the word *commemorate* instead of the word *celebrate* gives us an image of a man who would celebrate a military or a historic occasion since the word *commemorate* is mostly used in historical events' celebration<sup>5</sup>. This speech of hers is the first image that represents her extreme feminist personality and masculinity.

Her men-like behaviour depicts itself when we see her at the beginning of scene three in a strip club with her husband Clegg and work partner Worsely. As the scene describes, they all have had a lot of drinks. However, the most ironical twist happens when we learn that Clegg is looking at the stripper while the other two do not. (Churchill, 1972, p. 29). This gives us an odd image of a wife and husband relationship at first. It is difficult to imagine a normal wife to take her husband to a strip club and have him watch strippers dancing on the stage. Churchill describes Marion and Worsely being busy with their business talk while Clegg looking at the girls' movements. Later, Marion asks Clegg if he would like to have a girl, and continue saying that he wants, she would get one for him (Churchill, 1972, p. 30). Usually, such speech would happen among men. However,

---

<sup>5</sup> To read more about the word: <https://www.collinsdictionary.com/dictionary/english/commemorate-a-battle>

here audience get confused seeing a female character talking with her husband and asking him about his desire for another women. And, as if it is not enough, she offers another woman to her husband. Such image destroys the traditional concept of femininity and the gender roles that it has been representing for hundreds of years. Then, they start talking about the other two couple's, Lisa and Alec's rented place. And here, again the same situation happens, and the cycle continues. Marion, strangely, states that her husband Clegg liked Lisa once in the past. (Churchill, 1972, p. 32).

We see that in the past before all the events happened in the play, there had been a relationship between Lisa's husband Alec and Marion. Still, Marion is so keen on keeping Alec on her own side while she is married to Clegg. That is why she punishes Alec and his family by buying their rented house. While talking to Alec, she describes her personality and the way she was brought up:

But I want to hold on. Everything I was taught — be clean, be quick, be top, be best, you may not succeed, Marion, but what matters is to try your hardest. To push on. Onward Christian soldiers, marching as to war. That was my favourite song when I was seven. Fight the good fight. Where is your fight? (Churchill, 1972, p. 40)

As she explains, we understand she is too keen on holding what she wants and what is taught to be hers. She never accepts the concept of failure. As in the previous scene where she compered herself with her success with her husband's meat business and mocked his failure. Here, in the lines above, the same thing happens. She describes why she does not accept failure and why she wants to go further and only further. It is always good to want and have the best. However, in Marion's case, it is a bit strange as she calls herself 'men'. Also, she does not forget to sing the song *Onwards Christian Soldiers*.<sup>6</sup> By referring to the song, one could imagine that the person who talks is a man, but not a woman. That is what Marion does, she acts as if she is a man, as if she is a soldier fighting for the Crown and for Christ. For her, all her goals are to be fought as a soldier fight for his land. Interestingly, in his review paper, *The Feminist Church* James Nuechterlein<sup>7</sup>

---

<sup>6</sup> English hymn "Onward, Christian Soldiers" was written in the 19th century. Sabine Baring-Gould wrote the lyrics in 1865, and Arthur Sullivan wrote the music in 1871. After the wife of his friend Ernest Clay Ker Seymer, at whose country house he wrote the tune, Sullivan gave the song the name "St Gertrude." The hymn became the Salvation Army's preferred processional. The hymn became Sullivan's most well-known work. The idea of the hymn is derived from allusions in the *New Testament* that describe Christians as soldiers for Christ, such as II Timothy: "Thou therefore endure hardness, as a good soldier of Jesus Christ."

<sup>7</sup> At Indiana's Valparaiso University, James Nuechterlein teaches American studies and political philosophy. He

talks about the song *Onwards Christian Soldiers* alongside several other religious songs and hymns. He speaks about the song and says that when he was a child, he had to sing this song at the church and on Sunday schools (Nuechterlein, 1999, p.1). As we it is seen in the quotation above, it was the same case for Marion. She had to listen to the same song and grow with it. However, an ironical fact is that James Nuechterlein talks about Christianity being a feminine religion, thus, the song being feminine as well. He says that Christians have done a lot to destroy Christianity without being aware of what they are doing. Later, in the same review paper, he continues that while men escape from being present in the church, women tend to go to church more. The reason behind men liking church less is because of the fact that they feel insecure about their masculinity. In a traditional masculine concept, men would go out and fight or do the most difficult tasks. However, if a man goes to a church and ask for god's help, then this man would be considered [is considered] weak and feminine. However, for women, it is not the same case. They have always visited the church and even lived in it. While men went on fights, on their ways, they would enter churches and these churches, they would see women worshipers or nuns. Thus, Church and religion is feminine and the men who go to church are feminine. As a results, songs like *Onward Christian Soldiers* are feminine. (Nuechterlein, 1999, p.1-5). However, Marion does not know that if though she wants to compare herself to men and wants to act like men while singing *Onward Christian Soldiers*, she is being more feminine than being masculine. Yet, she does not realize it. Eventually, we can say that this act of hers is another reference to her extreme femininity which struggles with masculine desires, and yet, fail to perform fully.

In the same speech above she continues by giving examples from the most predominant scientists such as Columbus, Da Vinci, Scott of the Antarctic alongside Neil Armstrong and, perhaps, Yuri Gagarin<sup>8</sup> who laned on Moon [she does not mention the astronauts' names]. She says: 'Onward. Fight. How did man get to the moon? Not by sitting staring at an orange. Columbus, Leonardo de Vinci, Scott of the Antarctic.' (Churchill, 1972, p. 40). As it is seen, she does not stop with her masculine illustrations while

---

also serves as editor of *The Cresset*, the school's journal of ideas and opinions.

<sup>8</sup> The first person to travel into space was Yuri Gagarin, a Soviet pilot, and cosmonaut who lived from 9 March 1934 until 27 March 1968. On April 12, 1961, Gagarin made one orbit of the Earth in the Vostok 1 spacecraft. He received numerous decorations and honors, including the Hero of the Soviet Union, the highest honor bestowed by his country, for reaching this significant Space Race milestone. He also became an international celebrity.

leaving all the important female figures of the history. Furthermore, she continues in page 41: 'Empires have been lost for love. Worlds well lost. We men of destiny get what we're after even if we're destroyed by it. And everyone else with us. We split the atom. Onward. Love me.' (Churchill, 1972, p. 41). Marion forgets that she, herself, is a woman, she is a female figure. Again, she calls herself 'man' by saying 'we men of destiny'.

Marion's manly behaviour shows itself when Marion argues with Lisa about the baby as Lisa wants it back:

[...] you won't get the baby. I will keep what's mine. [...] Because I'm a woman, is it? I'm meant to be kind. I'm meant to understand a woman's feelings wanting her baby back. I don't. I won't. I can be as terrible as anyone. Soldiers have stuck swords through innocents. I can massacre too. [...] Why shouldn't I be Genghis Khan? (Churchill, 1972, p. 72)

Here, Marion breaks the traditional stereotypes about women being weak and fragile. She states that everyone would expect her to be soft and understanding. However, she is not though the person who wants her help is of her own sex. Furthermore, she continues and compares herself to Genghis Khan saying that she can be as bloody and cruel as the greatest and bloodiest worrier ever. She cannot be soft and gentle just because she is a woman. She confirms that she can be as bad as any man although she is not a man.

Another example of Marion's lack of femineity is related to the Alec and Lisa's new-born baby. Marion is not able to provide children since she is infertile as Clegg describes: 'And another satisfaction of my shame is the proof that it's she who is infertile.' (Churchill, 1972, p. 20). Because of her infertility, Marion and Clegg adopt Alec and Lisa's baby. At first, Marion believes that having the baby would solve all the gaps. However, things do not go as she expected because she lacks motherly affection for the baby. She does not care if the baby is hungry or needs of anything. However, it is only Worsely who understand that the real misery that the baby faces: 'If he [the baby] gets kidnapped any time and you have to go and identify him you can take me. Marion wouldn't know' (Churchill, 1972, p. 48) says Worsely when speaking with Clegg. Here, we can see that Marion is not able to look after the baby. She is not even able to recognize the baby's physical appearance. Another example of Marion's stone hearted behaviour regarding the matter of the baby is seen when Lisa cries in Marion's office:

Marion's office. MARION and LISA. MARION is walking about eating. LISA, no longer pregnant, hair a mess, face a wreck, baggy old dress, is sitting in a chair, crying.

LISA: I can't stop crying.

MARION: What about?

LISA: I don't know.

MARION: Then it doesn't matter. So long as you're not sad about anything. I should just cry.

LISA: It's the pills they give me.

MARION: There's plenty of tissues. (Churchill, 1972, p. 50)

The way that Churchill describes Marion is very evil. Speaking from traditional feminine perspective, Marion as a woman is supposed to understand the feeling of Lisa. However, she eats while Lisa is crying and trying to seek for her help. Instead, she simply offers her tissues as Lisa does not stop weeping. Later, when she talks with Alec, she says the following words: 'Wouldn't a different baby be just the same? Do you really mean you prefer your own baby?' (Churchill, 1972, p. 71). Reading this line above, we can see that she has no sense of motherhood. She does not understand the difference between one's own baby and others. She thinks that all babies are the same. This way of thinking would be because of the fact that she has never given birth to any child, and she does not have a real sense of motherhood like Lisa. At the end of the play, another sign of Marion's dysfunctionality as a mother shows itself when she forgets to feed the baby (Churchill, 1972, p. 74). Furthermore, Marion does not realize when Worsely takes the baby to Lisa and Marion only realizes after Worsely tells her (Churchill, 1972, p. 74).

### ***On the Femininity in Male Characters***

As it is obvious, Marion is a revolutionary female character who disobeys all the gender roles and concepts, the male characters of the play are also different than traditional masculinity that we are used to see. Churchill uses three unique and odd male characters with unique and odd personality in each. The most unusual male character of the play could be seen as Worsley. He does not hide the fact that he has committed suicide many times and he would like to commit it again. Speaking from a traditional masculine perspective, we hardly see a man who would say that he would

like to commit suicide, or he has thought about it before. Such kind of behaviour would be/is accepted as weakness and cowardness. Only the weak one would commit suicide. The strong one would stay and fight. Just like Marion. Yet, we see that Worsely does not have any intention of living and once he finds the opportunity, he will kill himself. However, if the person who commit suicide is a woman, people would not talk about her death a lot since they would accept that she was female, she was weak, she had not power to fight. Thus, the concept of suicide is feminine and strong males do not prefer to commit suicide as they do want to continue and fight for their goals. Although it takes a huge courage to commit suicide, and one can say that Worsley sees it from this perspective too, society would see only the cowardness in it, not bravery. Also, finally, it would be useful to state the fact that perhaps Churchill wanted to show the society's mental condition in 1970s and drag audiences' attention to the self-harms and suicides in the late 20<sup>th</sup> century.

Further we go to the play, we can see unmasculine or untraditional male identity of Worsely. As Marion, Worsely, and Clegg are in the strip club, everyone enjoys and looks at the strippers, Worsely does not seem to be very interested in looking at the dancers. He continues to ask questions about their business and Marion's past with Lisa and Alec. (Churchill, 1972, p. 30-32). This untraditional behaviour of Worsely would give us the hint about his hidden queer identity. Perhaps, Churchill wants to drag audience's attention to a gay man who pretends to be straight. Later, as we continue through the play, Lisa's description of Worsely is attractive. Lisa, while talking with Marion about Worsely, describes him as 'queer'. (Churchill, 1972, p. 34).

Lisa: He don't seem to notice Worsely at all. You know what he's like.  
MARION: Not really.

LISA: You don't, do you. Not now. You'd see a change. He's very queer.  
Oh Marion he is. (Churchill, 1972, p. 34).

Now, if we look at the dictionary, we can see that *queer* has many meanings. However, traditional meaning of the word is 'odd', 'strange', or 'something that is not right'.<sup>9</sup> However, starting from the mid-20<sup>th</sup> century, in America and then later in Europe, the word queer started to be welcomed

<sup>9</sup> To read more: <https://www.etymonline.com/word/queer>

by homosexual people. Thus, the word queer became an umbrella term to cover gay, lesbian, and transgender people who saw themselves in non-traditional homonormative frame. And 1970s was the period that same sex relationships were common and young generation would not hide it if they were sexually attracted to their own sex members.<sup>10</sup> Thus, Churchill leaves us two options in this speech between Marion and Lisa. Either Lisa refers to the traditional meaning of the word queer (meaning Worsely is a strange person) or she gives the audience a hint about Worsely's sexuality (meaning that he is gay or bisexual). Furthermore, Worsely is the only character in the play that understand the misery that the baby faces. He is more emotional than any other character in the play. He does not hide his feelings and thoughts regarding the baby's situation and Marion's craziness regarding the baby. Also, he is the one who takes the baby to his mother. Thus, we seem him being more different and softer than other male figures in the play. This fact could possibly bring us to the theory that gender norms could shape one's appearance and acts and Worsely, giving queer indications, is an example of a man that is different than usual males in many ways. (R. Thora Bjorn & Nicholas O. Rule, 2020).

Alec also acts strange and untraditional that does not match to the accepted heteronormative. In the second scene of the play, Alec and Lisa come from outside and they discover that their house was robbed, and Lisa's wedding ring was stolen. Lisa tries almost begs Alec to call the police, but Alec does not seem to care that his wife lost her wedding ring. He does not want to go to the police while Lisa is ready to go to the police. (Churchill, 1972, p. 23). Also, we learn that Alec has not been working for months. Traditionally speaking, we would expect Alec to go and run for the police. Also, he would be the breadwinner of the family. However, he seems like a very passive character who does not want to do anything as well as does not care about the protection of his family. Besides, wedding ring gives us a sign that Alec and Lisa's marriage is not very important for Alec. If he truly cared about their marriage, he would have run out to look for the thieves.

Marion's husband Clegg, who works as a butcher and wants his unborn son to be a butcher too, has his own view of women. At the beginning of act two, Clegg and Worsley talk about Clegg's 25 years of butchering history:

---

<sup>10</sup> To read more: <https://www.britannica.com/topic/queer-sexual-politics>



CLEGG: I have been a butcher twenty-five years. And my father was before me. [...] But you still don't see a lady butcher. Apart from the physical weakness a lady has a squeamishness which is very proper in the fair sex but shameful in a man. [...] My mother literally worshipped him. I've seen her on her knees. [...]. She knew how to give a man the right support. He had his chair. The tea was hot on the table when he came in. (Churchill, 1972, p. 19).

Clegg's speech depicts us his and as well as society's rooted gender roles for women back then in Clegg's father and in Clegg's own lifetime. At the same time, Clegg's shows us shameful standards for men of that time. However, even though women were being discriminated, still women were the advocates of men. In Clegg's mother's case, we can see that she was a wife that did everything she could in order to please her husband. She served him and at the same time she taught her kids to respect and serve their father. Here, we can see the traditional patriarchy that has been controlling women over the centuries. Clegg's speech (Churchill, 1972, p. 19) is the pure example of men dominative society and rooted gender roles in a society. However, what is funny and ironical is that Clegg's wife does the opposite as she does not respect any gender roles. Instead, she reframes gender roles. Marion asks Clegg to shut the shop, and so he does. (Churchill, 1972, p. 22). Later, Churchill illustrates Clegg as a houseman whereas traditionally Marion is supposed to be a housewife. Being a houseman would be shameful for Clegg if we go back to his speech with Worsley. (Churchill, 1972, p. 19). However, he himself becomes the de-facto victim of his gender stereotypes:

CLEGG: I thought I would drop in. I got a bit bored indoors. Sambo is excellent company for a dog. He does what he is told as if he is human. I pretended to be cross, just to see, and he lay down with eyes sad just like a member of the family... (Churchill, 1972, p. 35).

As we it is seen, Clegg is forced to stay at home and do nothing but playing with a dog while Marion works in her office.

## Conclusion

One of Caryl Churchill's most popular plays is *Owners* as it was her first professionally staged play. In 1972, Theatre Upstairs of the Royal Court's Theatre hosted the inaugural performance of the play. The play is regarded as satire that portrays the social life of Londoners. The play features two couples. Each couple in London exemplifies a particular type of social background. While Lisa and Alec symbolize the underprivileged renters

who rely on Marion and Clegg's efforts, Marion and Clegg are the owners of real estate properties. In addition, three male characters in the play disobey conventional male gender conventions. Since the play was created at a time when the first and second waves of feminism were merging. The play's protagonist, Marion, is shown as an extreme feminist who typifies the first and second waves of feminism's most radical adherents. Marion defies every stereotype of what it means to be a woman and acts like a man, much like in the feminist waves. Lisa, a different female character in the play, is portrayed as a classic domestic housewife at the same time. Lisa and her infant son are the targets of Marion's schemes. Perhaps, the writer wanted to say that neither Lisa, nor Marion's femineity is acceptable. Both of them have too much of everything. While Marion is extreme and to some level toxic feminine, who thinks that acting like a man would make her stronger, Lisa, on the other hand is a character that only does housework and dedicate her entire life to her husband and kids. Lisa has not life of her own. Thus, Churchill wanted to bring the attention of audience to a point that femininity should include the combination of both Lisa and Marion. A real feminine character should not be like Marion or Lisa but rather something in between.

## **References**

- Aston, E. (1997). Caryl Churchill, Northcote House, London.
- Billington, M. (2020, June 28). Forgotten plays: No 5 – Owners (1972) by Caryl Churchill. *The Guardian*. <https://www.theguardian.com/stage/2020/jun/29/forgotten-plays-no-5-owners-1972-by-caryl-churchill>
- Bjornsdottir, R. T., & Rule, N. O. (2020). Emotion and Gender Typicality Cue Sexual Orientation Differently in Women and Men. *Archives of Sexual Behavior*, 49(7), 2547–2560. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10508-020-01700-3>
- Churchill, C. (2013). *Churchill Plays: 1: Owners; Traps; Vinegar Tom; Light Shining in Buckinghamshire; Cloud Nine*. A&C Black.
- Erkan, Ü., & Ayça, B. (2018). TRANSGRESSING GENDER ROLES IN CARYL CHURCHILL'S PLAY OWNERS. *Pamukkale Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi*, 32, 59–68.
- Firat, S. (2005). CARYL CHURCHILL AND GENDER ROLES: OWNERS, CLOUD NINE, AND TOP GIRLS. *THE GRADUATE SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES OF MIDDLE EAST TECHNICAL*

UNIVERSITY. <https://etd.lib.metu.edu.tr/upload/12606786/index.pdf>

Hall J. (1989) Interviewed with Caryl Churchill, in “Close Up” The Guardian, 12 Dec. 1972. File on Churchill, (Comp. L. Fitzsimmons), Methuin Drama Book, London.

Khozaei, Z., & Aston, E. (2009). Gender Politics and Deconstruction of Patriarchy in Caryl Churchill’s Selected Plays. Semantic Scholar. <https://www.ukm.my/solls09/Proceeding/PDF/zahra.pdf>

Nuechterlein, J. (n.d.). *The Feminist Church?* National Affairs. [https://www.nationalaffairs.com/public\\_interest/detail/the-feminist-church](https://www.nationalaffairs.com/public_interest/detail/the-feminist-church)

Roberts, P. (2008). *About Churchill: The Playwright and the Work*, Faber and Faber, London.

Saeed, T., & Öztürk, E. (2021). A Woman of a New Era: A Feminist Reading of Caryl Churchill’s *Owners*. *Eurasian Journal of English Language and Literature*, 3(1), 280-292.

The United Methodist Church. (2019, August 16). *History of Hymns: “Onward, Christian Soldiers.”* Discipleship Ministries.



# ***The Genre Merge of Fiction and Dystopian Science Fiction: Suzanne Collins The Hunger Games and Catching Fire***

Khadija Al Moghrabi <sup>1</sup>  
Esma Tezcan <sup>2</sup>

## **ABSTRACT**

By examining elements of science fiction, utopian literature, and dystopian settings, this article sets out to explore whether *The Hunger Games* and *Catching Fire* can be well categorized as suggested by Peter Fitting in which he used Darko Suvin conclusion in the article “Utopia, dystopia and science fiction “ gathered by Gregory Claeys in the book *The Cambridge Companion of Utopian Literature* (2010) as wither it stands upon a certain genres or shifts towards a merge between genres. This article investigates the genre classification of Suzanne Collins’ famous series, *The Hunger Games* and *Catching Fire*, it starts by exploring the definitions of science fiction and fantastic literature, using Todorov’s book *Introduction la literature fantastique* attempting to draw a framework-specific genre such as Sifi, fantastic, etc. Science fiction offers speculative but conceivable ideas, fantastic literature usually presents the impossible, hence this article dives into the utopian literature genre, as *The Hunger Games* and *Catching Fire* novels present a clear divide between the utopian Capitol and the dystopian districts. It explains the characteristics of utopia, such as an idealized society, clarity of imagination, political influence, and reaction to the present, are considered since it seems problematic to define the genres on their own. Since they overlap between different commodities this creates the problem mentioned above as to how to categorize *The Hanger Games* and *Catching Fire*. By using several academic perspectives but mainly Todorov’s and Fitting’s explanation this results in the examination of the interaction between science fiction and utopian literature. Proposing that utopia may be a sub-genre of science fiction. It searches into the characteristics of science fiction, emphasizing its basis in factual research and technological possibilities. Thus, science fiction contrasts with fantasy literature, highlighting the balance between reality and fantasy within the former. Science fiction authors, such as Suzanne Collins, draw inspiration from contemporary issues to imagine future outcomes, and *The Hunger Games* and *Catching Fire* are a prime example of this practice.

**Keywords:** *literature, Todorov, English, Collions, Genre Classification, Article*

<sup>1</sup> Istanbul Aydın University, Istanbul, khadijabashirmg@gmail.com, <https://orcid.org/0009-0001-0128-3490>

<sup>2</sup> Assist. Prof. Dr., Istanbul Aydın University, Istanbul esmatezcan@aydin.edu.tr, <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5781-9119>

## Öz

Bu makale, bilimkurgu, ütöpik edebiyat ve distopik ortam unsurlarını inceleyerek, Peter Fitting'in Darko Suvin'in *Utopia, dystopia and science fiction* makalesinde vardığı sonucu kullandığı ve Gregory Claeys'in *The Cambridge Companion of Utopian Literature* (2010) kitabında bir araya getirdiği gibi, *Hunger Games* ve *Catching the Fire*'ın belirli bir tür üzerinde mi durduğu yoksa türler arasında bir birleşmeye doğru mu kaydığı şeklinde uygun bir şekilde sınıflandırılıp sınıflandırılmayacağını araştırmayı amaçlamaktadır. Suzanne Collins'in ünlü serisi *Hunger Games* ve *Catching the Fire*'ın tür sınıflandırmasını inceleyen bu makale, Todorov'un *Introduction la Literature Fantastique* kitabını kullanarak bilimkurgu ve fantastik edebiyat tanımlarını araştırmakla başlıyor ve bilimkurgu, fantastik vb. gibi türlere özgü bir çerçeve çizmeye çalışıyor. Bilimkurgu spekülâtif ama akla yatkın fikirler sunarken fantastik edebiyat genellikle imkânsız sunar, dolayısıyla bu makale *Hunger Games* ve *Catching the Fire* romanlarının ütöpik Capitol ile distopik mntıklar arasında net bir ayırım sunması nedeniyle ütöpik edebiyat türüne ayırmaktadır. Ütopyanın idealize edilmiş bir toplum, hayal gücünün netliği, siyasi etki ve günümüze tepki gibi özellikleri, türleri kendi başlarına tanımlamak sorunlu görüldüğü için ele alınmaktadır. Farklı elementler aralarında örtüşükleri için bu, yukarıda bahsedilen *Hunger Games* ve *Catching the Fire* 'ın nasıl kategorize edileceği sorununu ortaya çıkartmaktadır. Todorov ve Fitting'in açıklamaları başta olmak üzere çeşitli akademik perspektifler kullanılarak bilimkurgu ve ütöpik edebiyat arasındaki etkileşim incelenmiştir. Ütopyanın bilimkurgunun bir alt türü olabileceğini öne sürer. Bilim kurgunun özelliklerini araştırır, olgusal araştırmalara ve teknolojik olanaklara dayandığını vurgular. Böylece bilimkurgu, fantezi edebiyatı ile karşıtlık oluşturmakta ve ilkinde gerçeklik ve fantezi arasındaki dengeyi vurgulamaktadır. Suzanne Collins gibi bilim kurgu yazarları, gelecekteki sonuçları hayal etmek için çağdaş konulardan ilham alırlar ve *Hunger Games* ve *Catching the Fire* bu uygulamanın en iyi örnekleridir.

**Anahtar Kelimeler:** Edebiyat, Todorov, İngilizce, Collins, Tür Sınıflandırması, Makale

The science fiction genre is not the only genre one can classify *The Hunger Games and Catching Fire* given the fact that Suzanne Collins is well known for her genre merge within her literary work and although there is the Si-fi elements we cannot ignore the Dystopian elements as well and question the genres and its relationship with one another. In order to explore genres first by providing an analysis of the genres and the novels starting with Si-Fi or science fiction which can be classified as part of the fantastic literature genre, the literary work reflects reality or an era of society alongside fiction. Because of the common properties most would answer that Si-Fi stands under fantastic literature and both are connected, but it is still a case of discussion. In order to understand and conclude if it is a genre or a sub-genre, we need to define science fiction and fantastic literature along with providing an analysis for other sub-genres such as the dystopian genre as well. Todorov explains the fantastic as a mode in *Introduction la littérature fantastique* (1973) as a hesitation experienced by a human who is only familiar with the natural laws of nature but then is faced with a supernatural event. This leads us to the Todorov scale, however, alongside the Todorov explanation we cannot disregard the sub-genres for the Si-Fi itself if we ever proved that there is a genre on it, one of the possible sub- genres is Dystopian genre. Which drives our attention towards the bass of both genres and to question which one is demonstrated in *The Hunger Games and Catching Fire*.

Tzvetan Todorov demonstrated the fantastic definition in *Introduction la littérature fantastique* (1973), he explained the elements which creates the fantastic itself the uncanny and the marvelous as bordering on another and even overlapping in certain instances. Furthermore, these two elements and elements in between are related to the reader's hesitation period. Todorov explains the period between the uncanny (real) and the marvelous (fantastic) as the hesitation period which is created by the perception of the reader and sometimes the protagonist is included within this period of uncertainty. The text shifts between the Todorov scale as long as it is not determined by the readers imagination and wither it crosses the rules of nature law. Todorov argues that the fantastic requires three completed conditions, the text must allow the reader to consider the world in which the characters created as a living world then the reader should experience the theme of questioning (the hesitation). In other words, not being sure what is the reality of the text since it drafts between the real and fantastic and finally, the reader must decide on which side the text maintains.

Todorov then provided a closer definition between the two main elements mentioned earlier, he structured the Todorov scale which consists of four elements: primarily The uncanny which means the real, in other words, the real refers to the known world nature of rules, the kind of rules that are understandable and normal to the humankind and then follows the fantastic- uncanny. This refers to the explained fantastic, this means that during the hesitation period, the reader stops being unable to explain but once the fantastic element can be explained it shifts to be fantastic – uncanny. The shift occurs which leads to the fantastic being drifting to the supernatural theme and tends to be closer to the pure marvelous is called the fantastic – marvelous. Finally, when it's no longer questioned wither its real or completely fantastic and the themes tend to be pure supernatural is called the marvelous according to Todorov in *Introduction la literature fantastique* (1973).

Science fiction was classified by several categories, some academics analyzed it as a sub-genre and some called it a genre on its own but, according to Edward James and Farah Mendelsohn they defined and analyzed the science fiction as part of literature that is less than genre. In *The Cambridge Companion to Science Fiction* (2003), along with their explanation of the Fantasy literature *The Cambridge Companion to Fantasy Literature* (2012) it is argued that the plot elements which is an expected and the readers will be expecting what happens next rather than how it happens. In order for Si-fi to be recognized by the reader as a part of the genre, the reader can identify the main theme of the book, relying on the explanation presented in *The Cambridge Companion to Science Fiction* (2003). For example when reading one book which is a romance, and it will explain the plot under the scoop of the romantic genre, since it is known what a romantic story should be like. Hence, it will be easily identified but that is not always the case in the Si-Fi genre. Another element that changes in the Si-fi work is the metaphors. The meaning becomes literal Fantastic Literature which suggests that what was basically an imaginative idea and most likely to be impossible. For example the flying brooms in J.K Rolling Harry Potter series. The invention of a world that is also just a matter of any imaginary thought whereas Si- fi hints towards the fantasy of science but it is only a matter of research, time and technology that may lead to making that fantasy reality. On the other hand Si-fi is not the impossible, but rather a possibility. In relation to the discussion Walter Scott presented in his essay “On the supernatural in fictitious Composition



Mary Shelley ‘s *Frankenstein*” in the book *The Cambridge Companion to Science Fiction* (2003) stressing on the fantastic characteristics should be rare, brief, indistinct yet philosophical reasoning and moral truth. Science mainly means facts research and the ability of finding answers to these ideas in real life facts which lead us to technological fantasy, this theory was first connected with the utopian fantasy. The suggestion of the futuristic science development and if it is a matter of just a probability or a possibility. In early ages the utopian fantasies took scientific and technological evolution in consideration, yet the role was minor, and the center was focusing on social, political fantasy. As the first writer who suggested such aspect, *The Cambridge Companion to Science Fiction* (2003) includes Edgar Poe who wrote in his earliest poem “Sonnet - to Science” about the universe naturality through astronomical view which we can say that was the first look on the main idea of Si-Fi and the future inventions. *Frankenstein* written by Mary Shelley can also be considered as a great example of human nature and scientific development but into a new example *The Hunger Games* and *Catching Fire*.

So, what is the genre for Suzanne Collins novels *The Hunger Games* and *Catching Fire*, *The Hunger Games* and *Catching Fire* are written by Suzanne Collins in 2008, is a dystopian novel which is a sub-genre of science fiction portrays an oppressive society or other social control mechanisms. The story revolves around the narrators struggle for survival but playing a death game created by the government which concludes with the death of all the contributors except one character. Katniss, the protagonist, symbolizes hope and rebellion when she refuses to play by the setup rules, therefore this action reflects the theme of power. The novel according to Burke in her article “Reaping Environmental Justice through Compassion in *The Hunger Games*” (2015) explains the young adult literary movement, its characterized by its emphasis highly important issues written in a form of fiction that is suitable for young adult. Suzanne Collins wrote *The Hunger Games* projecting food and hunger issue by creating metaphors such as the protagonist Katniss which seems to be a metaphor, her way of survival and her district situation along with the main theme of the novel which is the games but within that Burke explores the genre it itself. In order to explore the meaning of some metaphors provided in both novels, one of the first metaphors used in *The Hunger Games* is the fence. The fence that separates the district and its horror life from the woods which are filled with life and greens and animals that

Katniss used to go and hunt trying to stay alive. This metaphor made the speculative fiction nature become obvious therefore, the uncanny between fiction and reality appeared. Collins states that she “strongly believe[s]” that the novel is in fact a speculative fiction genre even although we can see dystopian genre as well, but the question hunts the reads during the whole novel until the end.

From a different perspective Jen Scott Curwood adds a seminar discussing the relationship between the novel and its readers. He explains in his article “The Hunger Games”: Literature, Literacy, and Online Affinity Spaces” (2013) the effect that *The Hunger Games* and *Catching Fire* created among students and fan-fiction lovers. Curwood starts by explaining the reason behind young adults love towards science fiction which includes their connection towards the disbelief feeling and imaging a new different world also because science fiction provokes the readers reality but containing social conditions and personal struggles bonds the relationship between the text and the reader. Hence, allows young adults to own a personal meaningful contact with literature by advertising the development of comprehension abilities.

Curwood seminar consists of demonstrating several students action and reaction to the two novels *The Hunger Games* and *Catching Fire* , their explanation to the themes and metaphors along with the meaning of the used technology within *The Hanger Games*. The technological items and themes allowed students to own a new idea and relate their social reality with the novel, the televised games in *The Hunger Games* shed light on the food issue around the world in a technological form. This means while reading the novel we can understand that the districts were behind in terms of the technological improvements. Therefore , the Capitol which is the power center that includes all the luxury lifestyle and advancements only installs the huge projectors in every district just so they can see the games happening and watch their children trying to survive so they can win the games in the end and have a better life. The way of including technology in the novel within a society that knows nothing about it and in addition to the development of technology even our real world didn't reach yet creates the science fiction genre element.

As a part of exploring Young Adult fiction which contains a combination of elements similar to the elements found in the adult genre, Philip Stoner

offers an analysis of the characters in *The Hunger Games and Catching Fire* under the study of YA fiction. Stoner's article "Dystopian Literature: Evolution of Dystopian Literature from We to Dystopian Literature:

Evolution of Dystopian Literature from We to the Hunger Games the Hunger Games" (2017) demonstrates the "Self-Exploration" element, he suggests that this element contributes to creating YA fiction. The scene relayed in the book shows Katniss, as part of her trying to find her own identity such as the scene when she was projected to the sponsors of the games in *The Hunger Games*. This specific part includes all contributors to show their surviving skills and try to convince the sponsors that they can be the winner there for sponsors might help them during the games in a form of aid or food. Katniss continuously felt annoyed and disgusted by the need for her to be done in order to find a sponsor hence, this part projects the personal identity struggles in society that Collins tries to show.

The article "The Genre of Science Fiction" (1969) by Virginia F. Berit defines science fiction as a "Speculative Fiction" influenced by Robert A. Heinlein definition, which means whatever the results seem to be as part of the fantasy they are not and are facts rather than fiction. It is hard to form a very clear definition on Si-fi as the story elements like events and sittings might be realistic, but also never to forget the fancy and fanciful which refers to the fantastic events within the nature border so reality within unreality. *The Hanger Games and Catching Fire* includes the element of Dystopian Society which means the setting of Panem, a postapocalyptic North America, is a hallmark of dystopian science fiction. It portrays a future society that is oppressive, divided into districts, and ruled by the Capitol which is defined by many definitions that Berit divided it to, prophetic, descriptive of social impacts of science, set in a novel wither it was imaginative, possible fantastic and situation.

The main concept of Si- fi is the question of what if? That includes the future and the past as time travelers and the possibility to go back and change the past to create a better future, so it is in fact an imaginative idea and only remains an idea in real life. What really separates Si-fi literature from fantasy literature seems to be the structure of Si-fi which was a balance between the reality and fantasy the plot might be imaginative, on the other hand sittings and time most likely be holding the fact element. On the other hand, in fantasy literature the overall is based on the fanciful and requires no realistic factor. Berit states that authors such as Suzanne

Collins take their inspiration from knowledge and their understating of the present time and use fiction to include the future of the past, in *The Hunger Games and Catching Fire* Collins imagined the future outcome for the present issues.

This necessitates us to take a closer glance into Utopian literature aiming to investigate and understand what genre we can classify *The Hunger Games and Catching Fire* Gregory Claeys the editor of *The Cambridge Companion to Utopian Literature* (2010) book gathered several articles discussing the Utopian literature starting with Fatima Vieira's article "The Concept of Utopia". Vieira suggests four characteristics to define the idea of utopia. Claeys demonstrates four characteristics, initiating the imagined society first, meaning the good place which is a society created by a subjective ideology hence, the place which is filled with nothing but good and positivity and any part that is the opposite of that should be cut off. In example to that in *The Hunger Games and Catching Fire*, the Capitol is considered as the ideological place with a perfect community and great power far from the districts reality which is nothing but poorness and slavery therefore, the creation of the games comes in. The Second characteristic is the literary structure, in which the imagination element has been purified meaning that many texts including the utopian perspective have been cut out. The third characteristic the definition that takes into account only the political utopian which the function of utopia that takes into consideration the influence on the readers. Finally, the definition in which utopia is seen as a reaction towards a certain life and the desire for a better one and as result to these characteristics Vieira concludes that we can define utopia as a matter of reaction towards a specific present in an imaginative frame.

The element of imagination within utopian literature and how it connects with the Si-fi genre, taking into account the technological development as demonstrated above but adding to it the display of political and imaginative societies reflecting a hint of reality which creates the relationship between Si-fi genre and utopia genre. Claeys then presents in his selective articles collection the article by Peter Fitting "Utopia, dystopia and science fiction", he refers to a definition by Darko Suvin in which he stats that science fiction is "literature of cognitive estrangement" and suggests that Si-fi is in fact a genre since themes such as space travel and science development are the highlight of the genre. Suvin then demonstrates two sections to prose literature which are "Naturalistic" and "Estranged" and he states:

“SF is, then, a literary genre whose necessary and sufficient conditions are the presence and interaction of estrangement and cognition, and whose main formal device is an imaginative framework alternative to the author’s empirical environment” (p. 49).

Suvin describes utopia as a sub-genre of Si-fi, he adds that Science fiction is not just an instrument to predict what the future might be, but it is a form of literary work to present our world using an effective distorting scoop. Following this idea and the possibility of imagining a future world utopian fiction was born because if we can form of writing where we can imagine a future advanced world why not imagine a better future developed society using our real present pain. Fiction was born. When it is possibility to imagine a future advanced world and form a writing where that world is a possibility. Therefore, the relationship between science fiction and utopian fiction emerged and also that is why Suvin suggests that utopian genre is a sub-genre to science fiction genre.

Caroline E. Jones provides analysis to *The Hunger Games Trilogy* characters and what do symbolize for in *The Hunger Games* and *Catching Fire*, her article “Changing the World: Faces of Rebellion in Suzanne Collins’s Hunger Games Trilogy” (2016). She starts by explaining the complexity of Panem society and the definition to the word Panem means a piece or bit of bread in Latin language. Looking at the entertainment act which the Capitol forces calls it The hunger games each narrative and action in the games refer to its connection with the meaning of the dystopian sub-genre. For example the modes of hunger which Collins suggests two kinds of that triggers Katniss the main protagonist in the first novel *The Hunger Games*, first her “Hunger of Loss” as Jones refers to which reflects Katniss lack of father figure in her life, she is hungry for the person whom offered hope of a better life and added joyfulness element. She misses the ability to learn from him about nature and its creatures and also preventing her family from falling apart. The second hunger Katniss experience is the actual physical hunger, since her father’s death and her mother’s depression food was something extremely hard to find and therefore she realizes that she needs to find ways to keep her sister, her mother and herself alive and that’s when she starts the hunting process and improving her surviving skill which is shooting arrows.

Jones includes the main narrator’s analysis labeling characters with specific names as previously mentioned including Gale, Katniss friend which Jones

referred to Gale as “The Frustrated Rebel Hero”. The frustrated rebel-hero refers to the characters who show the heroes actions with words rather than actions, such heroes want to act because they understand the injustices of the system, but they also know that they are in the system to deep to the point they can’t act without suffering the consequences which they can’t undo in the future. Gale is presented through the lens of Katniss, she understands the system and its cruel unfairness yet she believes that she can’t do anything about it but then comes Gale who knows the possibilities of change and therefor, demonstrates the hope for Katniss as an example to that in *Catching Fire* which is the second novel in the Trilogy. After the rebellious have already been made he turns to Katniss on her: “That’s why we have to join the fight! ... What about the other families, Katniss? The ones who can’t run away? [...] It can’t be about just saving us anymore. Not if the rebellion’s begun” (p. 100) .

Caroline E. Jones also included a character analysis of Peeta, one of the protagonist, in which she suggests that he has his own way of rejecting the Capitol and that makes him “The Pacific Resistor”. The Pacific Resistor suggests the hope for the main character as a mode of resistance but in his own form and shape, which although he never wanted to be a part of the games when he found himself in it choose to play passed on his own terms and rather than killing the other contributors he choose to survive rather than harm, and duo to his self-integrity Peeta created his own philosophy to resist the Game makers without losing his integrity. The privileges in his life were the reasons which motivated him to see hope and finding hope which differentiates him from Katniss. He tries to explain this to Katniss the night before the Games begins in the first novel *The Hunger Games*:

“I don’t want them to change me in there. Turn me into some kind of monster that I’m not [... though] when the time comes, I’m sure I’ll kill just like everybody else. I can’t go down without a fight. Only I keep wishing I could think of a way to ... show the Capitol they don’t own me. That I’m more than just a piece in their Games.” “But you’re not,” I say. “None of us are. That’s how the Games work.” “Okay, but within that framework, there’s still you, there’s still me,” he insists. “Don’t you see?” (141142).

Jones concludes her article by explaining that although The Hunger Games Trilogy includes a dystopic structure it still contains the idea of hope, it starts with the hate that Katniss holds for her society and her rejection towards moving forward as well as being a mother at some point she ends up being the opposite of that. The hope that did not exist at the beginning

was there for her. These novels *The Hunger Games* and *Catching Fire* shows the meaning of power and its effect towards oppression and it entreats modern fantasy literature taking to consideration that it is the base for creating the literature of social unrest and such fiction also made the modern dystopian young adult fiction possible.

## Conclusion

Along this article several analyses have been demonstrated in aims to highlight and to investigate the genre of *The Hunger Games* and *Catching Fire* and despite the many elements which suggests that it is dystopian fiction and other elements prove otherwise which are presented within the articles discussed in the article such as the happy ending and hope in some scene for a better life. To separates dystopian fiction from science fiction can be tricky at some times and to state its completely YA fiction can also be misleading and so, looking into the structure the Suzanna Collins built her famous novels and looking into the metaphors within Katniss actions also including the themes and the plot itself which starts with the battle of needing to free and able to live a life better than provided until the end that concludes the real better life which is the self -exploring and identity discovery. *The Hunger Games* and *Catching Fire* lands under the Dystopian Science Fiction genre, also referring to the si-fi as a genre on its one and the dystopian genre is in fact a sub-genre for Si-Fi genre. Thus, putting in consideration the Tzvetan Todorov scale that according to the definition it provides all fiction goes under the fantastic literature shaping a form of a hierarchy, later on the Trilogy lands on the uncanny definition because of its elements which were real and understandable and that what also created the genre which we concluded.

## Bibliography

### Primary Sources:

Collins, S. (2008). *The Hunger Games*. Pp. 141-142.

Collins, S. (2009). *Catching Fire*. p. 100

Claeys, G. (Ed). (2010). *The Cambridge Companion of Utopian Literature*. Cambridge University Press. 5-157.

E. James, F. Mendlesohn. (Ed). (2003). *The Cambridge Companion to Science Fiction*. Cambridge University Press. 16-37.

E. James, F. Mendlesohn. (Ed). (2012) *The Cambridge Companion to Fantasy Literature*.

Cambridge University Press. Pp10:292.

Todorov, T. (1973). *Introduction la littérature fantastique*. The Press of Case Western Reserve University Cleveland, London.

### **Secondary Sources:**

Burke, B. (2015). “Reaping” Environmental Justice through Compassion in The Hunger Games. *Interdisciplinary Studies in Literature and Environment*, 22(3), 544–567. Retrieved 20, September 2023. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/26569584>

Bereit, V. F. (1969). The Genre of Science Fiction. *Elementary English*, 46(7), 895–900. Retrieved 29, September 2023. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/41386588>

Curwood, J. S. (2013). “The Hunger Games”: Literature, Literacy, and Online Affinity Spaces. *Language Arts*, 90(6), 417–427. Retrieved 20, September 2023. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/24575002>

Jones, C. E. (2016). Changing the World: Faces of Rebellion in Suzanne Collins’s Hunger Games Trilogy. *Journal of the Fantastic in the Arts*, 27(2 (96)), 225–247. Retrieved 26, September 2023. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/26321202>

Stoner, P. (2017). “Dystopian Literature: Evolution of Dystopian Literature From We to the Hunger Games”. *Merge The W’s Undergraduate Research Journal*. 1-30. Retrieved 24, September 2023. <https://athenacommons.muw.edu/merge/vol1/iss1/4/>

Suvin, D. (1979). *Metamorphoses of Science Fiction: On the Poetics and History of a Literary Genre*. *New Haven Yale University Press*. 49-567. Retrieved 20, September 2023.



